Electoral Politics and Voting Behaviour in Pakistan: 
An Assessment of People’s Choice (2002-2013)

By
Ahmad Sabat

PKS-014-01
PhD
Pakistan Studies

Department of Pakistan Studies
Bahauddin Zakariya University
Multan- Pakistan

2021
Declaration

I hereby certify that this dissertation is the result of my individual research and that it has not been submitted concurrently to any other University for any other degree.

____________________
Ahmad Sabat
PhD Candidate
Roll No: PHDPS-14-01
Registration # 2005-gi-22
Department of Pakistan Studies
Bahauddin Zakariya University
Multan
Approval

The PhD dissertation “Electoral Politics and Voting Behaviour in Pakistan: An Assessment of People’s Choice (2002-2013)” by Ahmad Sabat has been written to my satisfaction, which meets the required of research for the award of PhD degree. Therefore, the thesis is approved for the external evaluation.

____________________

Supervisor
Dr. Muhammad Javed Akhtar
Professor
Department of Pakistan Studies
Bahauddin Zakariya University
Multan
# Contents

Acknowledgement ........................................................................................................... i
Abstract ........................................................................................................................... ii
Acronyms ......................................................................................................................... iv

**Chapter 1: Introduction** ................................................................................................. 1

1.1 Statement of the Problem ......................................................................................... 3
1.2 Research Question .................................................................................................... 5
1.3 Understanding of Term ............................................................................................. 5
  1.3.1 Politics ................................................................................................................ 5
  1.3.2 Electoral Politics ................................................................................................. 6
  1.3.3 Ethos of Local Political Culture ........................................................................ 7
  1.3.4 An Assessment of People's Choice ...................................................................... 8
1.4 Case Selection and Timeframe of Analysis .............................................................. 8
1.5 Theoretical Framework .............................................................................................. 9
1.6 Methodology and Sources ......................................................................................... 11
1.7 Literature Review ..................................................................................................... 13
  1.7.1 What to Review in the Literature? ...................................................................... 15
  1.7.2 Development of Political Narratives in Punjab .................................................. 16
  1.7.3 Theoretical Understanding of Voting Behaviour ................................................. 18
  1.7.4 Psephology of Pakistan ...................................................................................... 19

**Chapter 2: Political Narratives in Punjab: Historical Background** .............................. 24

2.1 Introduction ................................................................................................................ 24
2.2 Political Narratives in Ancient India .......................................................................... 25
2.3 Political Narratives under Muslims Empire in India .................................................. 26
2.4 Political Narratives in British India ............................................................................ 28
2.5 Post-Independence Phenomena and Political Narratives ......................................... 32
2.6 Early Political Turmoil after Independence ............................................................... 33
2.7 First National Elections and Extension in Political Turmoil ..................................... 39
2.8 Political Narratives in General Zia's Regime ............................................................ 44
Chapter 3: Political Geography of Punjab ........................................... 52

3.1 Introduction .................................................................................. 52

3.2 Electoral Geography of Punjab .................................................... 52

3.3 Electoral Politics in Punjab (2002-2013) ...................................... 54
    3.3.1 The 2002 National Elections ................................................ 55
    3.3.2 The 2008 National Elections ................................................ 59
    3.3.3 The 2013 National Elections ................................................ 64

3.4 Geographical and Electoral Distribution of Punjab ..................... 70

3.5 Northern Punjab .......................................................................... 70
    3.5.1 Economy of Northern Punjab ............................................. 71
    3.5.2 Electoral Politics in Northern Punjab (2002-13) ................. 72

3.6 Central Punjab ............................................................................ 74
    3.6.1 Economy of Central Punjab ............................................... 75
    3.6.2 Electoral Politics in Central Punjab (2002-13) .................... 76

3.7 Southern Punjab ........................................................................... 78
    3.7.1 Economy of Southern Punjab ............................................. 80
    3.7.2 Electoral Politics in Southern Punjab (2002-13) ................. 81

3.8 Western Punjab ............................................................................ 82
    3.8.1 Economy of Western Punjab ............................................... 84
    3.8.2 Electoral Politics in the Western Punjab (2002-13) .......... 85

Conclusion .......................................................................................... 87

Chapter 4: Partisan Voter in Pakistani Punjab .................................... 88

4.1 Introduction .................................................................................. 88

4.2 Party Identification Models .......................................................... 88

4.3 Partisanship in Punjab ................................................................. 90

4.4 Characteristics of Political Parties in Punjab ............................... 93
    4.4.1 Pakistan Peoples’ Party (PPP) ............................................. 94
    4.4.2 Pakistan Muslims League-Nawaz (PML-N) ......................... 96
    4.4.3 Pakistan Muslims League - Quaid-e-Azam (PML-Q) .......... 98
Chapter 4: Partisanship in Punjab

4.4.4 Pakistan Tehreek-i-Insaaf (PTI) ................................................................. 98

4.5 Political Culture and Partisanship in Punjab: Empirical Analysis .................. 100
4.6 Level of Partisanship in (Northern, Central, Southern, and Western) Punjab... 101
4.7 The Difference of Partisanship (on Constituencies’ level) ............................. 104
4.8 Level of Partisan in Urban and Rural Areas ................................................... 106
4.9 Electoral Strategies of Political Parties and their Impact on Partisanship....... 110
4.10 Electoral Strategies of Political Parties in Punjab ........................................ 113
4.11 Electoral Strategies of Political Parties in Punjab ....................................... 114
    4.11.1 Electoral Strategies of Pakistan People’s Party in Punjab...... 116
    4.11.2 Electoral Strategies of Pakistan Muslims League - Nawaz in Punjab 118

Conclusion ............................................................................................................ 120

Chapter 5: Candidate’s Evaluation in Punjab: Voters’ Perceptive .................... 121

5.1 Introduction .................................................................................................... 121
5.2 Models of Candidates’ Evaluation ................................................................. 122
5.3 Candidates’ Evaluation Model in Punjab .................................................... 125
5.4 Electoral Candidate’s Evaluation in Punjab .................................................. 128
5.5 Impact of Voter’s Socio-Political Ethos over Candidate’s Evaluation ............ 128
    5.5.1 Rawalpindi District .................................................................................. 129
    5.5.2 Gujrat District ....................................................................................... 132
    5.5.3 Vehari District ....................................................................................... 134
    5.5.5 Muzaffargarh District ............................................................................. 139

5.6 Questionnaires Analysis ................................................................................ 142
    5.6.1 NA-50 Rawalpindi -I .......................................................................... 144
    5.6.2 NA-105 Gujrat-II ................................................................................ 148
    5.6.2 NA-170 Vehari-IV ................................................................................ 151
    5.6.4 NA-17 Muzaffargarh-I ......................................................................... 155

Conclusion ............................................................................................................ 157

Questionnaire ....................................................................................................... 159

2018 National Elections ....................................................................................... 162

Conclusion ............................................................................................................ 165

Bibliography ......................................................................................................... 169
Acknowledgements

I am grateful to Allah, the most merciful and beneficent, who gave me courage to complete this dissertation. It was impossible for me to complete this work without the support, guidance, and invaluable contribution of my supervisor - Dr. Javed Akhtar -. I express my sincere gratitude to Dr. Javed. He nurtured my abilities to complete this work with his insightful suggestions, motivations, and comments. I am also thankful to the other faculty members of Department of Pakistan Studies, especially Dr. Farooq, for their support and guidance during my coursework.

For me, as a learner, this dissertation provides me a sense of completion. But I could not do that with the support of my teachers. I am indebted to my father and teacher - Mr. Shahid Ali -, who never missed a chance to support and guide me, since the start of my educational career. At National Institution of Pakistan Studies (NIPS), Dr. Azam Chaudhary’s guidance, to complete my M.Phil dissertation, was most useful asset of my academic career.

My stay at Department of Political Science, Columbia University in the city of New York, was most valuable time in my life. Prof. Robert Shapiro of Columbia University helped me to shape my approach regarding political culture and theories of voting behaviour. Prof. Shapiro read my immature PhD draft several times and his supervision helped me a lot to complete this task. He was one of best human being I ever had a chance to study under his guidance.

I owe my gratitude to my friend, Muhammad Shoaib, helped me to write the analytical approach of my work and revised my draft. I am also thankful to Abdul Qadir and Sohaib Khalid, who helped to find data on local political culture. My colleagues at COMSATS University made things easy for me during my PhD research.

I am thankful to my family for everything I have. My family is lifeline for me. They make my life colorful and happy. They give me sprit and courage which I need.
Abstract

People participate in politics to make government and modify the general rules for their personal welfare, good governance, and institutional reforms. In a country like Pakistan, people’s choice represents their cultural ethos. People’s social beliefs and evaluation shape their political decisions in electoral politics. This dissertation addresses that how did the ethos of political culture impact people’s political choices in Pakistani Punjab.

National elections are the way to measure such impact. The ethos of a political culture provides guidelines for political decisions and voting behaviour. Even in the heterogeneous society of Punjab, the ethos of political culture work as shared values. All the entities of electoral politics in Pakistani Punjab – voter, political party, and candidate – are in a state of clientelism. The voter – both party and candidate – considers his social location, family, patron-client relations in his/her political decisions. The utility of vote also urges the voter to cast his/her vote. In the case of party voter, he/she votes for a party that has maximum chances of winning and maximum capability to sever him/her well. Political parties in Punjab, according to available evidence, also work according to the ethos of local political culture. Their strategies focus the local needs; they are, virtually always, vote-maximizers. The well-born and well-connected electables are thus one of most obvious realities of electoral politics in Punjab, for the Punjabi voter prefers to vote for candidates who have strong vote banks and maximum chances of winning. The political parties also prefer electables as their candidates in national elections. The electables – as a vital actor of electoral politics – in turn follow the ethos of local political culture in their electoral strategies. A voter casts his/her for those electables who have strong patronage relations, ability to solve voter’s social problems, effective community-based network and valence in their constituencies.

Punjab’s electoral history is dominated by the above factors since the 2002 national elections. In the last three national elections (2002, 2008 and 2013), voter, political party, and electoral candidates have hyped personalized politics in the province. In different parts of the province, however, Punjabi voter have behaved differently. The level of partisanship is relatively
stable and high in urban belts of the province. The voter in rural and underdeveloped parts of the province prefers candidates with strong patronage relations and valence. Thus, as the evidence shows, the Punjabi voter thus stays in touch with his/her political culture and remains accommodative toward the political circumstances of the country.
## Acronyms

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AG</td>
<td>Attorney General</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AIML</td>
<td>All India Muslims League</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AL</td>
<td>Awami League</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANP</td>
<td>Awami National Party</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APDM</td>
<td>All Parties Democratic Movement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BD</td>
<td>Basic Democracy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEC</td>
<td>Chief Election Commissioner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C-in-C</td>
<td>Commander-in-Chief</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CJ</td>
<td>Chief Justice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CM</td>
<td>Chief Minister</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COAS</td>
<td>Chief of Army Staff</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CoD</td>
<td>Chapter of Democracy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COP</td>
<td>Combined Opposition Parties</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DCO</td>
<td>District Coordination Officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DPO</td>
<td>District Police Officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DRO</td>
<td>District Returning Officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EBDO</td>
<td>Elective Body Disqualification Order</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECP</td>
<td>Election Commission of Pakistan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abbreviation</td>
<td>Full Form</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EDO</td>
<td>Executive District Officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FATA</td>
<td>Federally Administrative Tribal Areas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FPTP</td>
<td>First Past The Post</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GHQ</td>
<td>General Headquarters</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GPO</td>
<td>General Post Office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ID</td>
<td>Identity Cards</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IDA</td>
<td>Islamic Democratic Alliance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IJI</td>
<td>Islami Jamhoori Ittehad</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ISI</td>
<td>Inter-Services Intelligence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IPRI</td>
<td>Islamabad Policy Research Institute</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JI</td>
<td>Jamaat-i-Islami</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JUI</td>
<td>Jamiat Ulema-e-Islam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JUI-F</td>
<td>Jamiat Ulema-e-Islam-Fazl-ur-Rehman</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KPK</td>
<td>Khyber Pakhtunkhwa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LFO</td>
<td>Legal Framework Order</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LG</td>
<td>Local Government</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ML</td>
<td>Muslim League</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MMA</td>
<td>Muttahida Majlis-e-Amal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MNA</td>
<td>Member of National Assembly</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MPA</td>
<td>Member of Provincial Assembly</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MQM</td>
<td>Muttahida Qaumi Movement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acronym</td>
<td>Description</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MRD</td>
<td>Movement for the Restoration of Democracy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NAB</td>
<td>National Accountability Bureau</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NADRA</td>
<td>National Database Registration Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NIHCR</td>
<td>National Institute of Historical and Cultural Research</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NRO</td>
<td>National Reconciliation Ordinance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NWFP</td>
<td>North West Frontier Province (Now Khyber Pakhtunkhwa)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NA</td>
<td>National Assembly</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PCO</td>
<td>Provincial Constitution Order</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PDA</td>
<td>Pakistan Democratic Alliance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PIF</td>
<td>Pakistan Islamic Front</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PM</td>
<td>Prime Minister</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PILDAT</td>
<td>Pakistan Institute of Legislative Development and Transparency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PML</td>
<td>Pakistan Muslims League</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PML-N</td>
<td>Pakistan Muslim League - Nawaz Sharif</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PML-Q</td>
<td>Pakistan Muslim League - Quaid-i-Azam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PML-Z</td>
<td>Pakistan Muslims League - Zia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PPP</td>
<td>Pakistan People’s Party</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PP</td>
<td>Punjab Assembly</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PPP-SB</td>
<td>Pakistan People’s Party - Shaheed Bhutto</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PPPPP</td>
<td>Pakistan People’s Party Parliamentarian</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PTI</td>
<td>Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
SHO  Station House Officer

UC  Union Council

ZA Bhutto  Zulfikar Ali Bhutto
Tables, Charts and Models

Chapter 3

Table 3.1: Area and Population of Punjab Province 53
Table 3.2: Literacy Rate in Punjab (1998 Census Report) 53
Table 3.3: Lingual Distribution in Punjab’s Households 54
Table 3.4: Political Parties Position 2002 National Elections- Punjab 58
Chart 3.1: Political Parties Votes- Share in the Punjab 58
Chart 3.2: Difference between Percentage of NA Seats and Votes (Punjab) 59
Table 3.5: Political Parties Position 2008 National Elections- Punjab 63
Chart 3.3: Political Parties Share in Votes (Punjab) 63
Chart 3.4: Difference between Percentage of NA Seats and of Votes 64
Table 3.6: Political Parties Position 2013 National Elections- Punjab 69
Chart 3.5: Political Parties Share in Votes -2013 National Elections 69
Chart 3.6: Difference between Percentage of NA Seats and of Votes 70
Table 3.7: Area and Population of Northern Punjab 71
Table 3.8: Literacy Rate in Northern Punjab (1998 Census Report) 71
Table 3.9: Elections Results of Districts – Northern Punjab 73
Table 3.10: Area and Population of Central Punjab 75
Table 3.11: Literacy Rate in Northern Punjab (1998 Census Report) 75
Table 3.12: Elections Results of Districts – Central Punjab 78
Table 3.13: Area and Population of Southern Punjab 80
Table 3.14 Literacy Rate in Southern Punjab (1998 Census Report) 80
Table 3.15: Elections Results of Districts – Southern Punjab 82
Table 3.15 Area and Population of Western Punjab 84
Table 3.16: Literacy Rate in Western Punjab (1998 Census Report) 84
Table 3.17 Elections Results of Districts – Southern Punjab 86
Chapter 4

4.1 Model of Partisan Voter in Punjab

Chart 4.1 2002 Elections: Percentage of PPP and PML-N NA Seats

Chart 4.2 2008 Elections: Percentage of PPP and PML-N NA Seats

Chart 4.3 2013 Elections: Percentage of PPP and PML-N NA Seats

Table 4.1: NA-54 Rawalpindi-V (Northern Punjab)

Table: 4.2 NA-125 Lahore-VIII (Central Punjab)

Table: 4.3 NA-151 Multan-IV (Southern Punjab)

Table: 4.4 NA-172 Dera Ghazi Khan-II (Western Punjab)

Chart 4.4: PML-N Voting Percentage in NA-51 and 52

Chart 4.5: PPP Votes Percentage in NA-51 and 51

Chart 4.6: PML-N Votes Percentage in NA-51 and 52

Chart 4.7: PPP Votes Percentage in NA-51 and 51

Chart 4.8: PML-N Votes Percentage in NA-169 and 170

Chart 4.9: PPP Votes Percentage in NA-169 and 170

Table: 4.5 Difference of NA Seats in two District

Chart 4.10: 2002 Elections: PPP and PML-N Voting Percentage in Lahore and Muzaffargarh

Chart 4.11: 2008 Elections: PPP and PML-N Voting Percentage in Lahore and Muzaffargarh

Chart 4.12: 2013 Elections: PPP and PML-N Voting Percentage in Lahore and Muzaffargarh

Chapter 5

5.1: Two-Steps Model of Candidate Voter
Chapter 1

Introduction

Politics is a behavioural aspect of human life and it belongs to the socialization of people.\(^1\) In this process, people try to amend or alter the general rules of society by participating in the electoral process, political recruitment, and decision making.\(^2\) Politics is associated with socialization of the society, and it gets a social sense when it is analyzed in the cultural domain of society. In a society like Pakistan, traditions and values of political culture impact political history. These traditions have their roots in socioeconomic background, historical experiences and cultural norms of the society. And mostly, if not always, people set their political discourse as per their cultural norms. Thus, the political culture and electoral politics in the country become localized, and personalized. In the Pakistani case, the ethos of political culture has guided the political trends and guide the voting behaviour of locals.

Pakistan emerged as a sovereign state under the leadership of Muhammad Ali Jinnah on 14 August 1947. Owing to the infant democracy,\(^3\) poor economy, dominant landed class, extension of pre-colonial and colonial policies\(^4\) and weak structure of political parties, the country waited long for its first constitution as well as [first] national elections. The landed autocracy and self-interested political class were interested in material gains, patronage politics and social prestige.\(^5\) Owing to all these anathemas, Pakistan’s politics was attached with tentative democracy and permanent autocracy of elected and non-elected interest groups.

The aforementioned problems had their roots in the pre-modern era when states were the personal estates of the rulers.\(^6\) In Mughals and pre-Mughals times, for instance, the monarchs ruled by exercising their effective power.\(^7\) Even the natives of sub-continent did not have equal share in the ruling cabinet of Delhi Sultanate, Turks, Persians, and Mughals.\(^8\) British era,
however, was a little different due to the start of political activities and some constitutional measures. Local administration was steadily improving and provinces and local governments received a fix proportion of taxes.\(^9\) These changes were vibrant and important in the political sphere of united India. The locals started to take part in political activities. Political parties were organized and selected people got the right to vote. This activism enhanced political consciousness of the Muslims of India and other minorities. The consequences of elections in 1937 and Congress’ rhetoric of one nation\(^10\) in the sub-continent India gave a strong ground to Muslims League stance for a separate state. After that, Muslims League’s sweeping victory in 1945 elections\(^11\) and the unsuccessful venture of 1946 Cabinet Mission Plan\(^12\) ended all efforts for united India and the League achieved its objective of a separate state for the Indian Muslims.\(^13\)

The creation of Pakistan gave hope of improved socioeconomic status and political renaissance for the masses. But communal massacres, mass migration, annexation of princely states, and armed conflicts of 1948 with India chocked these hopes in the formative years. The ruling class of Pakistan left the rhetoric of provincial autonomy and set a centralized set-up for the state.\(^14\) The provincial elections of 1954 in East Pakistan cautioned the League leaders about the people’s will\(^15\) and they chocked the way towards independent elections. Efforts to establish a democratic government without legitimate polls proved tentative and fruitless. However, in 1970, first national elections were held in both parts of the country. People of the western part voted for Zulfikar Ali Bhutto’s charisma and his popular slogan,\(^16\) while the majority in the

---

\(^9\) Niaz, “Provincial Administration in Pakistan,” 236.
\(^12\) In 1946, British Raj gave the idea of mutual governance of united India. Under the plan -Cabinet Mission Plan-, both Congress and Muslims League had right to rule their majority parts (Hindu majority zone would come under Congress while Muslims majority under Muslims League) under the supervision of British viceroy. Ayesha Jalal, *The Sole Spokesman: Jinnah, the Muslims League and Demand for Pakistan* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1985), 45-48.
\(^14\) Niaz, “Provincial Administration in Pakistan,” 240.
eastern part voted for the nationalist politics of Sheikh Mujibur Rahman. Results of the first national elections flared up the civil war in eastern wing and contributed to the traumatic creation of Bangladesh.

People went to vote twice (in 1977 and 1985) in Bhutto and Zia regimes respectively. They followed the dominant political trends of that time. The 1977 election results, for instance, initiated massive public protests against the Bhutto regime. Yet the people did not bother the political suppression of the Zia regime and participated in political activities. Zia’s accidental death in 1988 gave a chance to political parties for democratic rule in the country. Four national elections were held within the period of eight years (1988-96) for sustainable democracy. Throughout that political process, people voted for political parties and preferred to vote for the electable.

In 1999, Army chief Pervez Musharraf dismissed the Nawaz government, but he continued the political process. In fact, the continuation of political process was one of the most prominent features of the Musharraf regime. In political arena, grave changes occurred in the election mechanism during Musharraf times—for instance, amendments in electoral laws and emergence of new political parties on national level. In Musharraf regime, two national elections were held -2002 and 2008-. These elections changed the ruling class in the country, but the political trends of people remained intact with past. The national elections in 2013 neither weaken the elite political class nor voting trends of the people.

### 1.1 Statement of the Problem

Democratization in the late twentieth century witnessed the growing interest in institutional building, independent judiciary, and effective legislations to curb the non-

---

17 Realization of discrimately policies of west wing sparked the agitation on eastern side of the country. In that result, people supported the cause of Sheikh Mujibur Rehman’s Awami National Party. Khalid bin Sayeed, *The Political System of Pakistan* (Lahore: Peace Publisher, 2015), 60-69.
18 Ibid., 67.
19 In 1977 general elections, ZA Bhutto’s PPP won the elections overwhelming. While in 1985 non-parties elections won by the Zia’s supported group. Ibid., 113.
21 During discussion (the question asked, which era in best in history of Pakistan regarding development), locals recalled Zia’s regime decade as best in their memories. Dr. Shakeel Akhtar (medical officer in government hospital), and Zafar-u Khan (teacher in government college) in discussion with author, April 22-23, 2016.
democratic powers. Civil societies’ activism, strengthening the nongovernmental organizations and independent media became the priorities at societal level during the third wave of democracy. To achieve these goals, however, the endeavors to conduct free, fair, and competitive elections also attained significant attention. The selection of leaders through competitive elections became the central procedure, especially in the developing democracies. Samuel P. Huntington described the democratic method in the third wave of democracy as “the institutional arrangement for arriving at political decisions in which individuals acquire the power to decide by the means of competitive struggle for people’s vote.”

Free and fair elections were, therefore considered the vibrant and important tool for sustainable democracies.

Competitive elections are the minimal condition to start-up a democratic process. There are some vital features of competitive elections, which strengthen the democratic process. First, the electoral process should be free from violence, systematic malpractices, rigging, irregularities, and partisanship. Second, in a competitive electoral process, political parties should operate with freedom and elected government, emerging after the elections, should have supreme authority in the country. Third, the elected government should be accountable to voters. Last, the results of elections should be accepted by the opposition parties.

For a sustainable and legitimate democracy, it is important to strengthen the political institutions, enhancing the process of competitive elections and effective legislatures to counterbalance the executive powers. Thus, the elements of competitive elections have, become popular throughout the world. Ballot paper provides the people with an opportunity to elect their representatives. For the achievement of this goal, elections should be free from violence and systemic malpractices. Another important feature of free and fair elections is (regarding elections’ results) that the outcome of elections should be such as the parliamentary representatives should reflect the society from which they are drawn. These factors specifically become vital in the democratic process due to modern political developments in the third wave.

In Pakistan, on people’s level, the impact of cultural values over political trends is vibrant. Thus, to analyze the impact of a society’s norms and values over elected

24 Ibid., 3.
27 Akhtar, Dilemma of Political Culture, x.
representatives, and analysis of political attitudes and behaviour of voters become significant in the field of psephology. Explaining the question “how do voters decide” becomes important not only in the academic debates but also in promoting the democratic discourse.

Therefore, it is to analyze how far the political ethos are influencing the people’s choice in the national elections in Pakistan. Analyzing the impact of political culture on voting choice helps to understand the political discourse of Pakistani politics. The relationship between political discourses and culture can be analyzed through electoral results, historical data, semi-structured interviews, and participatory approach. To check the influence of political ethos on voting choice comes under different social indicators. Indicators like socioeconomic factors, patron-client relations, class differences, kinship, religion, parochial associations, and political atmosphere of the country are important to see the influence of political ethos on voting choice. This exercise helps to understand the dilemma of political culture in the country.28 The consequences of that dilemma beef up autocracy and weaken democracy in the country.

1.2 Research Question

Mainly, the question will deal with the voting behaviour of Punjabis in national elections. The Research will analyze how the social and cultural ethos of local Punjabis impact their voting decision in national elections of 2002, 2008 and 2013. To deal with this question, the study will discuss the role of socio-cultural ethos in the development of political culture in Punjab. On the other hand, how these culture ethos impact the electoral history and voting behaviour in the province.

- How did the ethos of local political culture of the people have had an impact on their voting behaviour in national elections of 2002, 2008 and 2013 in Pakistani Punjab?

1.3 Understanding of Terms

1.3.1 Politics

Bismarck defined politics as “politics is the art of the possible, the attainable.”29 In broader term, politics (for an individual) is the way to make something attainable, which is important for someone. The attainable must not be perfect or ideal but it may be the next best.

---

28 Ibid., 297.
Therefore, politics is the activity, where people or society work to amend the general rules. In other words, it is the art of governance, where interest groups compete with each other to take the control of government.\textsuperscript{30} In early Greek city states, Aristotle defined politics as to participate and understand the affairs of polis.\textsuperscript{31} In this scenario, the debate of cooperation and conflict emerges together. The inextricability of opposing opinions, different needs, and different interests make politics a competition. This competition makes politics a loaded term, where people talk about economic and social welfare, foreign and defence affairs, geographical sovereignty, environmental security and biological needs. Therefore, the politics is the name of competition of resources and power in a given society, to govern such society. Above all, politics is no more than a social activity.\textsuperscript{32} It is the activity, where people try to make their life better. In this activity, people work in two ways; one to become the part of government or to become the part to elect government (as a voter). In both ways, it is a social activity, where locals compete to live in a better way in the society.

\subsection*{1.3.2 Electoral Politics}

The electoral politics gives a mechanism to the people of the society to become the part of politics. In the mechanism of electoral politics, the interest groups of the society compete with each other to participate in the government. While the remaining segment of the society participates (in case of the adult franchise) to choose their representatives among these interest group. In electoral politics, the competition is known as ‘elections,’ competitors are called ‘political parties or electoral candidates’ and the participants (people) are called ‘electorates or voters.’ Therefore, two actors are the two main components of electoral politics, one is political parties/candidates and other is electorates. Political parties contest in elections and try to attract the voters through their policies. On the other hand, electorates analyze the policies of political parties and cast their votes for their respective political party. The political party with maximum popular votes, takes the rule and governs the society.

\begin{flushright}
\textsuperscript{31} Akhtar, Dilemma of Political Culture, 1.
\end{flushright}
1.3.3 Ethos of Local Political Culture

Democracy has made an ordinary man relevant in the political process. The democratic process gives an opportunity to the common person to take part in the political decision-making as an influential actor. Competitive elections are a vibrant activity, where an individual takes part. The analysis of individual’s decision in the electoral process gets the primal importance, because of his/her role in decision-making. The way to analyze the decision is also an important aspect of electoral history. Therefore, this study deals with the individual’s political culture and its impact on his/her voting decision in the national elections.

Political culture works at two levels: individual level and community level. At individual level the variables of political culture guide towards effective and rational political behaviour. While on the community level, political culture builds up rational considerations for the enhancement of political institutions. So in a society like Pakistan, people fix or build their political predisposition according to their political culture. Political culture determines the political behaviour of a society that can be visualized through the lens of cultural ethos, perceived fears, and social needs of the society. Cultural ethos, perceived fears and social needs shape the political culture in Pakistani society that leads towards voting behaviour in national elections.

To analyze this, it is important to define culture first. In a pluralistic society, culture is communication, persuasion, consensus, and diversity. The combination of all these factors describes a society’s culture. The culture becomes assertive when it comes in the realm of electoral politics. Thus, culture in electoral politics refers to a set of political orientations and ethos of an individual’s decision-making in national elections. The defining factors of political

34 Political culture is a set of beliefs, values, people’s socialization, and the defined norms in a society. Akhtar, *Dilemma of Political Culture*: 23.
36 Akhtar, *Dilemma of Political Culture*, 298.
37 Ibid., 9.
38 Perceived fears are the subjective feelings of a voter that helps him to calculate the cast of his/her vote. These fears in a political culture are directed an individual towards specific disposition in national elections. *Cambridge of Advance Learner Dictionary*, “Perceived Fear,”
40 Ibid., 6.
culture in this study are, the voter’s social location, social background, occupation, social needs and political orientations. The study focuses on the role of these factors in determining the political culture of a society and its impact on voting behaviour in national elections.

1.3.4 An Assessment of People’s Choice

In this dissertation, the assessment of people’s choice means to analyze or judge the people’s voting behaviour in national elections. This assessment covers the people’s choices in elections, via ethos their local political culture. The assessment is based on electoral data, primary and secondary resources, government reports, interviews, survey and participatory approach (in 2002, 2008 and 2013 national elections in Pakistan).

1.4 Case Selection and Timeframe of Analysis

This dissertation intends to cover the general elections of 2002, 2008, and 2013. This research is going to analyze political predisposition and people’s choice in general elections through [available] electoral data. This study explains the impact of political culture on the political choices in general elections and addresses the question that how the voting behaviour of locals was shaped in the political sphere under the impact of cultural ethos, social needs and perceived fears. The role of election mechanism and electoral rules under the constitution of Pakistan and their impact on the people’s inclinations in operational politics also come in the domain of the question. Timeframe of this study is interesting and vital in political history of Pakistan. After a long rehearsal of democracy (1988-99), the military took administrative control of the country in 1999. Chief of Army Staff (CoAS) Pervez Musharraf became the ruler of a country with a bundle of promises. Devolution of power was declared as the best way towards the real democracy. For the fulfilment of that exercise, the Musharraf regime held general elections of 2002 and 2008. People of Pakistan went for the poll in these two elections without the participation of the two most popular leaders-Nawaz Sharif and Benazir Bhutto- of the country. The timeframe of the study ends at 2013 general elections; this provides with sufficient space to analyze the political culture in Pakistan. That timeframe covers nine years rule.

---

of Pervez Musharraf and a five-year term of Pakistan People’s Party (PPP) under the leadership of Asif Ali Zardari.

As for locale, the Punjab province is one of best places to understand the political culture of Pakistan. The province is the most populated zone with more than half constituencies of the National Assembly (NA).\textsuperscript{42} Punjab, with its political culture and political entities, has central importance in the political sphere of Pakistan. Almost in all general elections, the winner of Punjab has vital role in the decision making of the country’s politics. Electoral data analysis of Punjab helps to understand the political determinants of Pakistani politics.

1.5 Theoretical Framework

Since the rise of democracy in the world, political scientists presented various theories to elaborate the reasons behind voting behaviour. They did pre and post-poll surveys, presented hypotheses and theoretical explanations of political attitudes and voting behaviour of the general public. However, in most of these theories, two things are common. First, the voter thinks politically as he/she is socially. Second, he wants maximum utility of his/her votes. The voter’s utility means that a voter wants maximum satisfaction through his/her vote. In these assumptions, the theorists (like Anthony Downs) consider that the voter is a rational actor\textsuperscript{43} who does calculation and cost-benefit analysis of his/her vote before casting it. These assumptions of political thinking show the impact of political culture and social atmosphere over the voting decision. These two assumptions are the common factors in most of the voting behaviour theories. And the theorists have tried to explain these phenomena with different angles and paradigms.

The research question of this dissertation — how did the ethos of local political culture of the people have had an impact on their voting behaviour in general elections of 2002, 2008 and 2013 in Pakistani Punjab? - needs an in-depth study of political culture in the Pakistani Punjab. As the question shows, the researcher would like to analyze the impact of political culture on people’s choice in the general elections. The research will do this with the theoretical models that are based on the above-mentioned assumptions. Therefore, long and vibrant history of voting


behaviour theories beefs up the approach regarding the political culture. In the light of these studies, the research is going to develop a theoretical framework to explain the Punjabi voter in Pakistan. In this framework, the research deals with the question “how does the voter decide in Pakistani Punjab?

“How will the voter decide whom to vote” is an important question in electoral studies. Answering this question will help to verify the impact of political ethos over the people’s voting decision. Through voting theories, the research will explain the impact of political attitude over voting decision in the elections at the national and provincial levels. With the help of assumptions (voter’s utility and the impact of political culture on voting decision) and voting behaviour theories, the research will answer the above-mentioned question in the context of Pakistani Punjab.

Fishbein argues in his model that “a personal attitude toward an object is a function of his/her belief about the object and his/her evaluation about the object.” Considering the voting decision as an object, this model explains the impact of voter’s belief and his evaluation about his voting decision. Thus, the mixture of belief and evaluation is the driving factor in understating the people’s choice in Punjab.

In Punjab, the voter’s belief can be derived from his/her local political culture. The set of attitudes, feelings, societal norms, and values determine the political culture of a voter in the province. The other factor of Fishbein’s model, voter’s evaluation, satisfies the voter’s utility and makes his voting decision rational. The voter evaluates the circumstance of a political party or candidate, measures the utility of his vote and decides whom to vote. The voter’s evaluation refers to his social needs and political perceptions about the national and local affairs. Another important feature of voter’s evaluation is the voter’s calculation about the probability of success of any political party/candidate. However, the voter knows that none of the political parties/candidates will be able to fulfil his utility completely, yet the voter calculates which party/candidate would do best for him (when party/candidate will be in power). Therefore, the combination of belief and evaluation marks two types (primarily) of voter in Punjab. The first type is the party voter and he second is candidate voter.

---

44 The research will use term ‘he, his and him’ for voter and candidate.
A party voter tends to vote for candidate whose political party has compatibility with the idea of his belief and evaluation. In Punjab, such compatibility hinges on the party leader’s charisma and his/her family background. The success of a political party depends on the leader’s personality (preferably), his/her performance as the ruler (if he/she was in power) and his/her contribution to the fields other than politics. The voter evaluates all these factors, finds the best combination and makes the decision to vote. Before getting impressed with the leader’s charisma, performance or social work, the voter in Punjab calculates the chances of winning of a political party.

At the same time, a political party’s electoral strategies also play an important role in influencing the voting decisions in the province. The electoral strategies of a political party have an affinity with the voter’s belief and with ethos of local political culture. Therefore, the party voter in the province first sees the probability of winning of a political party and, second, finds the compatibility (based on his belief) with the political leader before evaluating the cost of his decision. After these considerations, he casts his/her vote in the elections.

Candidate voter tends to vote for such candidate who has attractive electoral strategies, strong patronage relations with the natives, his valence in public offices, ticket from a popular political party and have good chances of winning. In this type, the voter analyses all above-mentioned aspects and make his voting decision in the province. Mostly the candidates also work according to the voter’s belief and his political culture. Candidate sets his/her campaign tactics according to electorate’s political culture. After this, the electorate does evaluate all contested candidates and casts his vote for a candidate who has maximum compatibility with the voter’s belief and stratifies his needs.

All these types of voters are present in the Punjab province. The research will analyze the approaches of these electorates in the national polls of 2002, 2008 and 2013 (via semi-structured interviews and electoral results) in the next chapters.

1.6 Methodology and Sources

The research applies an open-ended approach for the completion of this study. Although the study does not cover all the aspects of political culture, yet it analyzes the ethos of political culture through inductive and deductive approaches. Through the application of inductive approach, the research analyzes the subjective evidences (qualitative) on political and
administrative history of the region, political culture of Punjab, and electoral history of the region. The historical evidences give foundation for the research question and develop first part (chapter two) of the dissertation. The part covers the historical events (in pre-modern and post-modern era), nature of the state, dominant political trends and developments in the Punjab. The historical analysis of political developments -in Punjab- is important to understand the political culture of the region. Parochial politics, egotistic power structure, clientelistic approaches of ruling elite and accommodative attitude of the locals are vibrant in the political history of the province. These narratives draw a larger picture of ethos political culture in the area and the dominance of these cultural ethos over the governance and voting behaviour.

The next part of the dissertation (chapter three) covers the geographical features of the province. These features cover province’s development index, its demographical aspects and its history of electoral politics. This part helps and clarifies the dynamics of politics and trends in electoral politics in the province. In this part, the examination of electoral data and government reports on general elections help to find-out the political inclinations of the people in different part of the province. On the other hand, the analysis of the chapter find-out the similarities in local political culture throughout the province. Through participatory approach, semi-structured interviews, and focus group discussion, the research examines the dominant trends in political culture that are playing efficient role in electoral politics of Pakistan. The deductive and descriptive approaches to electoral data about politics of Punjab, correlate the current political trends of politics with the culture.

The next part of the dissertation (chapter four) deals with the partisanship. The chapter covers the impact of cultural ethos on partisanship. The party voter makes his beliefs (about a political party) through his family background, clan, area of residence and his social needs. On the other hand, voter evaluates political party on the bases of his utility. The chapter deals with partisan voter through a ‘partisan voter model. This model illustrates the role of voter’s belief and utility of his vote -ethos of political culture- over his partisanship. The chapter also covers the history of political parties, their policies agendas, their electoral strategies, their practices in government and electoral performance help to draw the trends of voter’s behaviour in national elections. The electoral data of different areas in the province and voter selection of different political parties in different time periods support the model of partisan voter in Punjab. Voter’s interviews also validate this model. The chapter also deals with electoral strategies of political
parties, where parties become voter-maximizer and try to attract maximum number of voter via these strategies.

The chapter fifth of the current dissertation analyzes the candidate voter in Punjab. The research develops a two-step model of candidate’s evaluation (which is also based on early assumption, the voter’s political culture guides his/her voting decision). The model describes the reasons for voter-candidate proximity. The elections results of last three national elections (2002, 2008, and 2013) support to elaborate the model. Later, the questionnaire survey in four districts (Rawalpindi, Gujrat, Vehari, and Muzaffargarh) of the Punjab, validate the steps-model. The research has utilized the electoral data of Punjab in two ways. This survey covers two factors of voting, candidate, and voter only. The questionnaire tries to address the impact of voter’s biradari, his patronage relations with candidate, and candidate’s personality over his voting behaviour. The questionnaire also covers the candidate’s electoral strategies, his valence, and his effective role to solve social problems of the voters. The other part of the questionnaire of investigates that why cultural ethos promotes personalized politics and candidate voter in Punjab.

This research work has three limitations. First, it covers only Punjab province instead of whole country. The multicultural society of Pakistan make it hard to cover all the provinces of the country. The travel towards the conflict-ridden areas (especially KPK and Baluchistan) and to get into touch with local people (to know about their political exposition) create hurdle to cover the whole country. Therefore, the focus of the research has been focused on the regions of Punjab to assess people’s voting behaviour. Second, the research covers the elections results of national assembly constituencies of Punjab. It is difficult to cover all the provincial and national assembly constituencies of the province in all three elections, because of large area and number (in last three national elections, the province had hundred and forty-eight national assembly, two hundred and ninety-seven [general] provincial assembly constituencies and more than forty-nine million voter). Third, the survey and semi-structure interviews during the research cover only male voters in the province. The female voters in Punjab are not -much- active in political realm. They did not participate in political activities and political gatherings in most part of the province. Thus, it is difficult to get opinion form female voters.

46 In this research, the last three elections are supposed as the national elections of 2002, 2008, and 2103.
1.7 Literature Review

Election process works in two dimensions; first, it helps to measure the political culture of a society. Second, it sets a pattern to elect a leadership in given society and legitimatize such leadership. In this process, voter casts his vote to choose their representatives. These representatives govern the society on behalf of people’s votes. This electoral process functions to represent the people’s choice and establishes relationship between the people and the government. This process also establishes a way for the transfer of power after a subsequent time period. The established nexus of voters, political parties/leaderships and elected government (in the electoral process) is vital for political process and democracy. Therefore, elections are still the only credible way to elect a government and the edifice of modern democracy. At the same time, democracy is the best method where people have a chance to choose their leaders and register their opinion in government’s affairs.

The elections results represent the political culture of a society. The analyses of these results help to understand the people’s choice and ethos of political culture. In psephology, the social system of a particular society and voter’s political context get central position. The electoral process is described as “elections are the formal act of collective decision that occurs in a stream of connected antecedents and subsequent behaviour.” Prof. Mackenzie described the electoral process as “the complicated political process, which is analyzed within the context of the political and social system.” Thus (on voter’s end), the external environment of the voter, ethos of his society and his own rationality develop his political predisposition and impact his voting behaviour in the elections.

One of the most important feature of electoral process is political parties. Political parties have a vital role in modern representative democracy. A competitive political system provides a venue for public participation, influences people’s voting choices, and connects political

48 The study of elections are called ‘Psephology.’ It is considered as the scientific study of elections. Psephology was coined from ancient Greek term ‘Psephos’. It was the mode of voting at that time. “Psephology,” Merriam-Webster.
50 Ibid., 455.
51 Representative democracy is a system of governance, where the public (eligible members only) have powers to elect representatives amongst themselves, for the sake of common interest and legislation. “What Is A Representative Democracy?” Worldatlas. https://www.worldatlas.com/what-is-a-representative-democracy.html
leaders and voters on common interest. Political parties do many potential functions to strengthen the democracy and enhance public participation. Political parties work for the mobilization of the people, formation of public policies, and organization of government. In mobilization of people, political parties influence the voting behaviour of local. Political parties set their communication strategies according to local political ethos. These strategies enhance party’s association with the public. However, these strategies are under the influence of local political culture.

In Pakistani political system, individuals have central position in electoral process. Political personalities/candidates are an important factor of political process. Political parties have popular personalities and get fame on the behalf of these personalities (especially in Punjab). Political personalities’ role is not much different than the political parties. Political personalities -like political parties- also mobilize the people and get support from them in elections. They also form strategies (according to local political culture) to attract public and maintain patronage relations with voters. The relationship between political personalities and voter is more assertive than the parties-voters relations (in case of Punjab). Political personalities have dominant role in political process and have strong vote bank in their own areas. These personalities are renowned as ‘electable’. The presence of these electable is vital for political party to win the elections.

The debate on political culture and factors that influence such culture, is vibrant in Punjab province. The question ‘how do the social and cultural values of a society impact the voting behaviour in a society?’ gets importance in every national elections of the province. Further, how the ethos of political culture impact the voting behaviour in national elections in the Punjab, are the part of discussion. Later, ‘how the voter in Punjab choose the political party or electoral candidate (and the influence of voter’s social and cultural ethos on this selection) come under discussion. Several scholars, social scientist, and physiologists around the world have attempted to reply above questions. They have focused on the ingredients of political culture, and impact of society’s culture on their voting behaviour. Many other scholars have also analyzed the question of Pakistan’s political culture via elections results.

---

53 Ibid., 10.
1.7.1 What to Review in the Literature?

This part of the dissertation is to analyze the government reports and academic views about the people’s voting behaviour in the elections. First, it focuses on the reports of Election Commission of Pakistan (ECP) on last three national elections. These government’s reports elaborate the voting trends, position of political parties and elections laws in the country. Second, the current part focuses on the general interpretations of renowned social scientists, theorists and writers on the trends of voting behaviour. The literature review theorizes the trends of voting and the general political perception of people in different parts of the world. This literature review also analyzes the details (motives and reasons) of voting behaviour. The review of such literature theorizes the trends of voting and examines these trends in the case (Pakistani Punjab).

In the next part, the research discusses the historical events and literature regarding political developments in Punjab. The research discusses only such historical literature which represents the development of political narratives in Punjab. The historical attitudes and social ethos of the locals design their political narratives and voting trends in the area. Therefore, it is important to see the political history of the area measuring the voting behaviour of the region.

This part of the dissertation also analyzes the academic literature on political parties and electoral candidates. This literature discusses that ‘how does a voter choose a political party or electoral candidate in the elections?’ The analysis examines voter’s cultural ethos and their impact on such voting decision. In this part, the research deals with prominent theories about partisan voter and candidate voter. Therefore, literature review of the dissertation has three parts. In first part covers the impact of historical events on the development of political narratives in Punjab. Analyzing the reasons behind these political narratives and trends in past. It is also important to see the political system of the country. In Pakistan, the developments in the political system and people’s responses to these developments have been vibrant throughout the history. The second part covers the different opinions about the electoral history of the province as well as of the country. The third part deals with various perceptive about partisan and candidate voter.

1.7.2 Development of Political Narratives in Punjab

The state and society’s structure in the subcontinent has important role in the development of political narratives in the region. On the societal level, its accommodative nature, its personalized thinking, and its patronage relations with ruling elites determine the political
discourse in the region. While on the state level, the policies of centralization, supremacy of rulers, assertive bureaucracy, weak political institution, and absence of provincial autonomy also impact the political history in Indian subcontinent.

In every successive government in ancient India, the rulers had specific style of governance. They have been involved in wars of succession to prolong their rule. Most of the rulers in India did whatever they could do to strengthen their dynastic governments. Sometimes they fought with their father, brothers, and relatives to get kingship. For the continuation of their rule, the rulers set assertive bureaucracy, strong military and extensive system of spying. The transfer of power from one ruler to another never had been a peaceful event in the Indian history. The kings in ancient India were concerned about the ill-intentions of their relatives. The governments maintained their rule through bureaucratization and militarism. The rulers in India beefed up the caste-based system to gain effective control over the people. The Indian society overall have been was accommodative with every ruler. People obeyed the rulers when their government were in strong position and revolted against them when they seemed weak.

The governance under British Raj was relatively organized than the kingship in ancient India. The post-colonial writers have different perception about the developments during British era. One group considers British’s development projects were just to strengthen their rule. On the other hand, the other group thinks that these developments did good work for political freedom and awareness in India. The British did many changes in political, social and economic system of India. They used landed magnates of India to control the population. The style of governance was not much different from ancient monarchs. The British had effective bureaucracy and political elites to continue their rule in India. The native political parties of India and their leaders showed their loyalty and accommodation with the Raj. Despite some political freedom, people were stuck with their ancient political norms. Locals were eager to join the

---

54 Niaz, *The Culture of Power and Governance of Pakistan*, 54.
government jobs and were ready to serve with the will of British Raj. On the other hand, local got some political freedom and participation in politics in colonial time.

The post-independence era was characterized with weak governance, feeble political party’s structure, undemocratic leadership, lack of political will, religious and ideological rhetoric, civil-military oligarchy and powerful landed class. These characteristics developed as new political narratives after independence in 1947. The founding fathers’ miscalculations and challenging circumstances in the new country generated political turmoil. Later, the new generation of political elites, military and bureaucracy grimed this turmoil. The military coup of 1958 delayed the conduct of first general elections. The results of the first general elections in 1970 worsened the power tussle between two parts (east and west) of the country. The separation of East Pakistan dominated the Punjabis elites over the rest of the country. The power game in remaining the Pakistan started revolving around some political personalities (as were in past). The Punjabis elites class got dominant position in country’s decision making as well in polices making. Due to the weak governance, the civil-military nexus played an important part in country’s decision making.

The ruling elites of the county have worked maximum to extend their rule at maximum. For this purpose, the rulers (both military and democratic) had took the maximum power in their hands, misused of their powers, and promoted unconstitutional norms in the country. The political leaders were involved in continuous power struggle with military and bureaucracy. On the other hand, military government focused on local body and non-party elections. This style of elections enhanced the personalized politics in the country. In post-independence era, both people and society followed their cultural norms in political domain. They followed their social and personal interests while voting. People have desired for maximum utility of their votes and they preferred electability of the political parties. People’s social beliefs and their rational

---


evaluation have set their political behaviour in every elections after partition. These political developments in the country have created self-centered leadership and interest-oriented society.

1.7.3 **Theoretical Understanding of Voting Behaviour**

The study of electoral pattern started in the 1940s and 50s in the United States. These studies developed some models/theories to discuss voting trends of people. These models elaborate –most of the time- the impact of social background, societal norms, economic conditions and local culture of the society on voting behaviour. On the other hand, these trends also measure the impact of electoral engineering, structure and strategies of political parties, role of candidates and election laws over people’s choice.

The history of electoral studies starts with the sociological model. This model shows people’s social and historical factors which have developed people’s political predisposition. Later, socio-psychological model discusses society’s issues, candidate and party’s orientation as the driving factors in voting behaviour. Rational choice theory measures the voting choices in term of economic needs. These models have good potential to explain the voting behaviour in different societies.

Later, Fishbein describes personal attitude as the combination of belief and evaluation. On this ground, the Punjabi voter in Pakistan has two major types. One is partisan voter and the other is candidate voter. A party voter votes for such political party which has compatibility with his belief and evaluation. Here, party’s leadership, its strategies and its electoral engineering attract the voter. On the other hand, the candidate voter selects the like mind candidates (may be more than one) on the first step. On the second step, the voter develops his proximity with one of these candidates and cast vote. Such proximate is also a blend of voter’s belief and evaluation.

1.7.4 **Psephology of Pakistan**

Elections have been important events in the history of Pakistan. Since the creation of the country in 1947, the electoral process has been shaping the political history. The electoral history

---


has not been smooth in Pakistan. Irregular interval of elections and their outcomes have influenced the political order and the social fabric of the country. This part covers the views of different writers/social scientists about electoral history and voting trends in Pakistan.

In 1884, the British introduced the local body election in India on limited scale. Later in early twentieth century (1909 and 1919) elections were held on provincial level. The Muslims League’s success (in Punjab, Sindh and Bengal) in 1945 elections paved the way of partition in India. After partition, elections have been becoming a controversial issue in Pakistan. The provincial elections results in East Pakistan (1954) weakened the state of Pakistan and the ruling Muslims League. The results of first national elections (1970) led the country in bloody civil war in East wing and resulted another partition in 1971 (formation of Bangladesh). After this episode, 1977 elections results suspended the elector democracy for next eleven years in General Zia’s regime (1977-88). While in nineties, four national elections were held in the time period of nine years (1988, 1990, 1993 and 1996 national elections). These elections’ results also deepened the social and economic uncertainty in the country. In twenty-first century, elections were held with relatively stable interval (2002, 2008 and 2013), but two out three national elections were held under the governorship of General Musharraf.

The psephology of Pakistan indicates the views of different writers about the electoral history and voting trends in the country. A number of local and foreign writers (From Prof. Shariful Mujahid to Andrew Wider studied different national elections and gave their observations about the electoral process) did their analysis about Pakistani elections. They did their work with different spectrums and ideas. In their analysis, these scholars did not adopt single theory or paradigm. They gave generalized views about the trends of electoral history. On the other hand, they did not analysis the voting behaviour in the country on qualitative lines.

---

64 In Pakistan national elections was not held with regular intervals. In first forty years (1947-1988) only three national were held in the country. From 1988 to 2002, five elections were conducted on national level. Since, 2002 national elections, elections were held after every five years, till 2013 national elections. But the uncertainty prevailed every monument regarding the schedule of elections. Hassan Askari Rizvi, and Ijaz Shafi Gilani, “The First 10 General Elections of Pakistan: A Story of Pakistan’s Transition from Democracy above Rule of Law from Democracy under Rule of Law 1970-2013,” PILDAT, (2013).


Professor Shariful Mujahid analyzed the early national elections (1970 and 1977) and presidential elections of 1965. In his writings, he describes the general trends in these elections. He also describes administrative setup of the country, electoral mechanism, and number of participants for national and provincial elections, political parties’ manifestos. In these writings, Prof. Shariful also covers the political context of the elections, and nature of political culture in the country. He adopts descriptive nature of study to explain the above-mentioned factors. On the other hand, his research does not explore the methodological links between these factors of political culture and people’s voting choices. He does not discuss the theoretical grounds, where a voter’s voting decision could be assimilated with the society’s political culture. In all his writings, Prof. Sharif judged the voter in context of nationalism. It is indeed a mature way to explain political culture but lacking empirical evidences.

Craig Baxter and Shahid Javed Burki explain the impact of education, urbanization, and industrialization on voting behaviour in Pakistan. They study of People’s Party’s voter at Tehsil level in Punjab and see the impact of socio-economic indicators on voting choice in 1970. In their research article, they measure the relationship between socio-economic indicators and partisanship. They analyze how the development in education, urbanization and industrialization guided the voter towards a political party. In 1970 elections, they observe the decline in the number of traditional voter and the rise of party voter, especially in urban zone of the Punjab.

Craig Baxter also examined the first national elections of the country. He capitalizes the strategies of political parties, their elections, and their way to attract the voters. He analyzed elections results and found the decline of ‘old guard’ and traditional norms in the country. He mentioned that people overtly supported People’s Party and Awami League, even before the 1970 elections. He discussed the people’s favorable opinion about these two political parties. The results of the elections showed the fall of traditional politics and the rise of popular political parties in the country. Although, that was the first national elections in the country and Baxter’s intake of elections was too early. However, the old guards of electoral politics in the country are still capable to rule the country.

---

The 1977 elections’ results showed the decline of popular politics and partisan voters in the country. M. G Weinbaum describes the 1977 elections as ‘where everyone lost.’ In these elections, the ruling party -PPP- relied on the support of ruler families of Punjab and Sindh to counter the opposition. PPP tried to mobilize the people and adopted the traditional way to attract the people. The writer described the voters in these elections were mature and politically conscious.

Rasul Baksh Rais analyzes the non-party elections of 1985 under General Zia. He described, owing to ban on political parties, were highlighted in the country. Rasul Baksh Rais mentioned the rise of traditional factors (such as personality, cast, and kinship) in 1985 elections. Another foreign expert on Pakistani politics -Lawrence Ziring- gives his views about two national elections (1977 and 1993) in his writings. He follows the research style of his other fellows (above-mentioned). He discusses the electoral issues, role of political parties, their leaders, and their elections plans, with reference to 1977 elections. In one of his articles, he describes political parties’ tussle in pre-elections scenario and their way to attract the masses. Like other writers, his readings about electoral politics lacks empirical evidences. Lawrence also studies the 1993 national elections with better methodological tools. He discusses institutional role, their crisis, and their impact on governance. He makes interesting observation about the popularity of political parties in 1993 elections. He observes that a voter does not vote for such political parties, which had ideological rhetoric or religious tune during elections campaign. He thinks that, two popular political parties –PPP and PML-N- got maximum share of votes in 1993 elections due to their attractive electoral agendas.

Mohammad Wassem also described the electoral politics in Pakistan, via political leaders, political parties, and their strength in elections. He considers elections as legitimate process of transfer of power. He also describes the historical role of institutions to determine the fate of democracy. He proclaims that the constitutional norms which are designs to protect public representation were in shamble. He studies the 1993 elections and argued that Pakistani voters did not follow national agenda but rather preferred their personal interests and prejudices

---

and group identities. Hierarchy of kinship and biradari, patron-client relationship and the influence of religious people were on the top to set the voting trends in Pakistani society. He also claims that the sociological approach of voting behaviour has greater explanatory value than the socio-psychological and economic approach to understand the voting trends in 1993 national elections. He also declares Pakistani voter as a passive and immobilized voter. In Pakistan, many factors have undermined the democratic process in the county. The feudal class, military, bureaucracy, and political elites all played their role to weaken the democracy. The political influence of the feudal is claimed as the major factor to undermine the democracy. Although, M. Waseem added another factor in this hierarchy. He thinks that, the ‘rightest middle class’ of the country plays vital role to weaken the democracy. He claimed that the rightest middle class is conservative into its outlook. This class has strong anti-Indian feelings, believes on Pan-Islamism, and has strong nationalist ideas. This class protects its ideas and supports military government (most of the time) in country.

Andrew Wilder did a good attempt to explain the political approach of Pakistani voter. He proclaims that the candidate and political party are the main influencing factors in electoral process in the Punjab. He did interviews to collect quantitative data to verify his hypothesis. He describes that the political party’s identification became visible component of voting in urban areas in 1997 elections. While in rural belt of the country, the patronage relations were still dominant factor in voting. He also observes that people voted for such party/candidate in 1997 elections who gave them tangible benefits in their social affairs.

Muhammad Javaid Akhtar did a good attempt to describe the dilemma of political culture in Pakistan. He manifests the political values in terms of political behaviour. He declared that the “the political culture is the manifestation of political values which are the outcome of political beliefs of a society.” He analyzes four national elections (1988, 1990, 1993, and 1997) in the whole country and called Pakistani voter a mature voter. Pakistani voter realizes his societal values and do a rational decision in national elections. He investigates that the political determinants, local society’s patterns, socio-economic issues, class differences, patron-client

---

74 Mohammad Waseem The 1993 Election in Pakistan (Lahor: Vanguard Publisher, 1994).
75 Iftikhar Haider Malik, State and Civil Society in Pakistan: Politics of Authority, Ideology and Ethnicity (Basingstoke: Macmillian, 1997).
77 Wilder, The Pakistani Voter:
78 Akhtar, Dilemma of Political Culture,
relations, and parochial association (between voter and party/candidate) were actively directed voting trends.
Chapter 2

Political Narratives in Punjab: Historical Background

2.1 Introduction

The nature of state in the Indian Civilization has historically relied on centralization. Devolution of power and provincial autonomy had rhetorical history, but in practice, these phenomena had a little role in governance. In ancient times, for instance, the local and foreigner kings had sole supremacy over state. Later, in the colonial era, the British Viceroys and Governors were the center of power. Marshall races and the local elite were only capable to grab power on behalf of the British Raj. In the post-colonial period, the governance model in Pakistan did not significantly change. Politicians, bureaucracy, and military became the hegemons. Thus, the people’s attitude toward the ruling elite remained same in both pre and postmodern times. Natives remained loyal to thrones, cooperated with the powerful ruling elite, and stayed connected with the ethos of local political culture. The nature of governance remained centralized and the people’s political culture remained accommodative toward powerful.

Parochial politics, egotistic power structure, clientelistic approaches of ruling elite and accommodative attitude of the inhabitants in today’s Pakistani Punjab are thus attached with the political culture of the region. Historical events, mass migrations, religious movements, foreign invasions, and colonization affected the life of the natives and the shaped the political culture of the region.

It is important to analyze the history of the province to understand the political culture of the region. The culture and history of the region continuously influence the contemporary politics of the Pakistani Punjab. Even Nicolas Martine proclaims that the current democracy in the province as well as the country or locally embedded despotism are the outcomes of events occurred in the past.79 This chapter deals with two factors, first the nature of state in pre-modern and modern era, and second with the nature of people’s political orientation. The historical and cultural phenomena of the area impacted political ethos in past also. Mainly, the chapter covers the political developments and their impact on the ethos of political culture. The last part of the chapter covers the post-independence period in Pakistani Punjab and nature of state. Punjab was an important province after Pakistan’s creation, but it became the most important province after

the separation of East Pakistan in 1971. The post-colonial period witnessed new political developments and cultural orientation, but the fundamentals of politics remained intact.

2.2 Political Narratives in Ancient India

Mauryan dynasty\(^{80}\) (320-185 BC) of the subcontinent held a highly centralized empire in the Indus Valley Civilization. For instance, the ruling elite had supreme authority over the affairs of the empire. Sustainability of the rule was their prime objective and an extraordinary focus was put on making strategies to counter the opponents of the regime. During the Chandragupta rule, his shrewd minister Chanakya Kautilya advised the king to remain cautious and pursue realist policies to protect his kingship. Kautilya even questioned the loyalty of the king’s children and wives and warned him to be careful about their bad intentions.\(^{81}\) He also informed to his king that the state’s efficiency was dependent on his vigilance and the performance of the empire’s servants.\(^{82}\) Spying was considered the best tool to control the state in an organized way. In the Mauryan dynasty, the king spent special time to review intelligence reports and met the spies on daily basis. Inspection of armed forces, management of secret services, appointments of spies and security related matters were the major concerns of the king’s court.\(^{83}\)

The empire was administratively divided into villages, sub-districts, and districts. Cities were divided into divisions and, further into various, wards. In the capital, the maintenance of law and order, tax collection and regulating trade and industry issues came under different ministries. These departments were further controlled by the empire’s bureaucracy. These paid bureaucrats were the privileged class of the society. They were selected through competitive exams.\(^{84}\) Service of the emperor was not an easy task. His disobedience made people’s life miserable. Kautilya mentioned that the service under king was like play with fire, the fire that could burn servants and their family.\(^{85}\)

During the Chandragupta regime, the state used most of its apparatus to curb the local rebellion. Deliberately, the society was divided into sub-political and caste-based units for efficient control. Peasants were kept unarmed to reduce the chance of rebellion. Society’s

---


\(^{82}\) Niaz, “Provincial Administration in Pakistan and the Crisis of Order and Development,” 235-236.

\(^{83}\) Niaz, *The Culture of Power and Governance of Pakistan*, 23.

\(^{84}\) Ibid., 25.

response to this arrangement was pragmatic and rational. People obeyed the kingship until it had the power to control the society. Weak administrative control meant leading the people toward revolt and violence and successful rebellion meant anarchy. In the case of failed rebellions, the bureaucracy had its harsh tools to punish the culprits. Therefore, India, under the Mauryan rule was a highly autocratic, centralized, and bureaucratic empire. Survival was the ultimate objective of the kingdom. People were accommodative with the kingdom. In case of a strong empire, people adopted the approach of compliance, but weak empires inevitably increased the chances of anarchy and rebellions.

2.3 Political Narratives under Muslims Empire in India

Arab invasion opened new ways for Muslims rulers in India. After the haphazard rule of the Arabs, the Turks and Afghan dynasties ruled the land for more than five centuries collectively (1205-1757). Politically and administratively, their rule was not much different from the previous ones. The Delhi Sultanate maintained its rule through bureaucratization, militarism, centralization and surveillance. The struggle for the kingship was sharp and the rulers were dethroned -on average- after every two generations. Law and order was established through an effective spying system, formidable military might, and a powerful bureaucracy. Sultans had absolute control over the revenues and resources of the state to manage the empire. The central council (more than half of the members of these high councils were not natives) of the empire controlled all the matters of kingship.

The stronghold of rulers and bureaucracy were the physical indicators of the empire to strengthen the rule. The inherited cultural values of the society helped the foreign rulers establish their arbitrary rule in India. The sultanate took full advantage of the accommodative nature of the locals. A caste-based system and religious divisions of the natives were some other supportive tools for the emperors to strengthen their rule. The successors were also not different.

86 Niaz, “Provincial Administration in Pakistan,” 236.
87 Niaz, The Culture of Power and Governance of Pakistan, 26.
88 The Delhi Sultanate (including Arabs and Turks) established its rule in India in 1206 to 1526. Later, Mughals set their rule in 1526 and remained powerful till 1707 but their rule continued till 1857 in same areas of India. “The Delhi Sultanate,” Encyclopedia of Britannica. https://www.britannica.com/place/Delhi-sultanate
89 Jackson, The Delhi Sultanate, 175-180.
90 Ibid., 124.
91 K. M. Ashraf, Life and Condition of the People of Hindustan, 77.
At the advent of the sixteenth century, the Mughal dynasty under King Babur wiped out the Turk rulers from India. In 1526, a unified force of the Mongols, Afghans, and some blood relatives of Delhi sultan, under the command of Babur, ousted the sultanate from the Indian soil. During the Mughal era (the Mughal ruled India from mid-sixteenth century to the mid of nineteenth century), the empire was the personal estate of the ruler and the dynasty was an appropriate example of continental bureaucracy, centralization, and militarism. Owing to these attributes, the Mughal Empire was considered one of the biggest empires under one king in the Indian history (King Akbar (1556-1605) ruled over Kashmir, Deccan, Kabul, and Bengal). Akbar’s three descendants Jahangir, Shahjahan, and Aurungzeb also maintained their hegemony more than hundred years.

The Mughal’s administrative division, warrior bureaucracy, and a strong military structure were probably the best tools to control such a vast estate. Administratively, the estate was divided into one hundred divisions and about three thousand districts in the early seventeenth century. The king himself made important appointments. The officers were selected, transferred, and promoted under the system of Mansabdari. The primary aim of these officers was to collect taxes, maintain law and order and help the king in maintaining a strong military. In 1647, the annual revenue of the empire was two hundred million, collected through official mansabdfs. The local Muslims, Rajputs and others had less than forty percent representation in the imperial court. Indigenous nobles of that time Zamindars, Chaudaries and Rajput princes were not allowed to take the ownership of the land. To some extent, these people also worked as mansabdras. But in the case of disobedience, the king could deprive these nobles of their posts and awarded lands.

A prominent feature of the Mughal dynasty was the wars of succession. All three great successors of King Akbar took the crown after feuds with their father or brothers. Killing, exiles

---

92Niaz, The Culture of Power and Governance of Pakistan, 31.
93“Mughal Empire,” New World Encyclopedia. http://www.newworldencyclopedia.org/entry/Mughal_Empire
94King Akbar took the rule in 1556 to 1605, Jahangir 1605 to 1627, Shahjahan 1628 to 1659 and Aurungzeb 1658 to 1707. “Moghul Empire,” History World. http://www.historyworld.net/default.asp?gtrack=mtop1
97Vikram Rana, “Role of Mansabdari and Jagirdari System during Mughal Empire,”
98Niaz, “Provincial Administration in Pakistan,” 238.
and the imprisonment of the former king and princes was a common story of every rule. In 1707, after the death of Aurungzeb, the dynasty failed to produce a competent ruler for the empire. During the eighteenth century, the central government was no more effective. Local officers and princes hijacked the kingdom and established their respective rules in different regions. After the invasion of East India Company, Mughal rule was dependent on the company until 1857.

Attitude, approach, and the reasons of Indian society were not different from the past during the Mughal era. Atomization, insularity, and apathy\(^99\) were the major characteristics of the locals. The rivalry of one group with the king provided opportunities to the other group to win the master’s courtesy. Overall, the society’s political narrative was based on engagement with the king in any condition, rather than conflict. Owing to the people’s accommodative nature, doors always remained open for the foreign occupation throughout the India history. After the Mughal’s long rule, the natives once again became accommodative to another foreign rule. This time, however, different European nations came to India and set their colonies.

### 2.4 Political Narratives in British India

In the mid of the eighteenth century, the East India Company of Britain grabbed the power from the Mughals. India came under the British Raj in the mid of nineteenth century after the failed mutiny (1857) against the company. Britain’s long rule gave new dimensions to India in the spheres of politics, and administration. Rule of law, tax collection and means of transportation improved under the Raj. Political dynamics were reinvented and got a new dimension. Terms like nationalism, nationality, socio-political renaissance, political agitation, lawful opposition, and self-government were introduced in the power culture. Political activism in India produced a new lot of leaders, both in Hindus and Muslims.

Post-colonial writers and scholars have analyzed the developments of British era with different lenses. One group attribute the era to reference to brutality and selfish rule. Scholars from this group consider famine of Bengal (1772), Delhi siege (1857), massacre in Jallianwalabagh (1919) and the policy of divide and rule as the examples of oppression and subjugation by the Raj.\(^100\) Scholars from the second group\(^101\) consider the British era was better

\(^{99}\) Niaz, *The Culture of Power and Governance of Pakistan*, 41.

\(^{100}\) Dr. Shashi Tharoor called British time as era of darkness and said the British Raj robbed the resources of India. Dr Shashi Tharoor, “Britain Does Owe Reparations,” *YouTube*. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=f7CW7S0zvx4
for the locals. They argue that the rule of law and a well-defined bureaucratic structure, the establishment of political parties, political awareness, the invention of elections and the idea of self-governance gave the natives awareness of modern political developments.

The view of first one is more popular than the second group. Even in movies and media debates, people criticize the Raj’s policies. Yet, the Raj left a deep impact on the society because the successors also adopted its strategies. For instance, it provided new governance pattern than its predecessors in India. For example, some Hindu writers have cited several events of brutality during the Muslim rule in India. During the Muslims rule, the Hindu literature cited many events of brutality by the Muslims in the subcontinent. Even in the age of colonization, the people living in British colonies were enjoying more internal freedom, political independence, and prosperity as compared to the other European colonies. Therefore, India under the Raj had a comparatively better way of governance.

In addition to the governance, permanent settlement of land and startup of political activities were the other two measures that shaped the political narratives of the natives in India under the Raj. In the pre-British era, for instance, all the agriculture land came under the control of the state. The ruler had sole supremacy over the ownership of land, and he had the authority to grant the lands on the base of loyalty, even if temporarily. Later, on the eve of eighteenth century, Lord Cornwallis (1739-1805) initiated the permanent ownership program. East India Company and the locals both took several advantages through these measures. The company used these measures for better economic outcomes and strengthening the colonial rule. Permanent settlement of land helped the British to strengthen their rule in India. Through this, they got the loyalty of the masses and thus minimized the chances of a rebellion. The establishment of canal colonies and villages created a new elite class ‘landed autocracy’ in the subcontinent. The division between agriculture and non-agriculture class further strengthened the class-system in the society. At the local level, the landed autocracy became the new ruling

---

101 Scholars like, Khalid Bin Sayeed (Pakistan: The Formative Phase 1857-1948) and Illah Niaz (The Culture of Power and Governance of Pakistan 1947-2008) proclaims that governance during British Raj in India was better than the past and other colonies of hat time.


104 Shandana Khan Mohmand, Patrons, Brothers and Landlords: Competing for the Vote in Rural Pakistan, Thesis submitted in Institution of Development Studies, University of Sussex, (2011), 44.
class on the behalf of the Raj. The Raj, in turn, used this class to pursue its imperial interests and the maintenance of law and order.

The start of political activities in India generated activism and thus contributed to creation of a new political class. The Indian Muslims were facing different circumstances in the political domain. To compete with the modern political developments, the Muslims took part in British-designed political system. At that time, politics was supposed to be just for the Muslim elites. Only Muslim intelligentsia took part in political activities and only these people were considered legitimate actors to participate in politics. Sir Syed Ahmad Khan, a well-known Muslims Leader, had encouraged the Muslim elites to join politics. Because the low-caste Muslim classes could not understand the Muslims interests. He also convinced Muslims to cooperate with their new masters (British). Sir Syed Ahmad Khan in his speech said:

It is essential for the Viceroy’s council to have members of high social standing. Would our autocracy like that man of the low caste or insignificant origin, though he may be BA or an MA, and have the requisite ability, be placed in a position of authority above them and have the power of making laws that affect their lives and property?106

Later, with the continuation of the proposed policy, a Muslims political organization (named as All India Muslims League) was established in in 1906 to address the Muslims’ grievances. The policy of loyalty with the Raj adopted by the Muslims Leagues (ML) was considered the best [available] solution for Muslims. The League got beneficial results from the Muslim masses due to the policy of cooperation with the British. The right of separate electorate made the Muslims a distinct identity in India. But until 1937 elections, ML had least popularity among the Indian Muslims. The 1937 elections results were disappointing and an awakening call for the League. In Muslims majority provinces, League won only one seat from the Punjab and none from Sindh. This result forced League’s leadership to change its policy. After that, League started popular politics and made alliances with powerful individuals in the Muslim-

105 Startup of political activities and the chance of upcoming elections in British era feared Muslims about the dominance of Hindu (due to their numerical majority) in social and administrative affairs. Sayeed, Pakistan: The Formative Phase 1857-1948, 5-10.
108 In Punjab, League won only one seat out of total 175, while Unionist party took majority from the province and won 95 seats. In Sindh League was nowhere and defeated miserable. Christophe Jaffrelot, The Pakistan Paradox: 86.
dominated provinces. It worked on several aspects to get the popular support. First, there was a transformation in Jinnah’s thought. This shift reflected in his thinking, posture, outlook, and political discourse. In public rallies (after 1937 elections), Jinnah adopted the cultural appearance. His English Saville Row suits were replaced with *Achkan*, tight *Pyjamas*, and *Karakulicap*. Second, the League adopted the policy of cooperation with the local powerful landlords and started the politics of masses. The local landed elite from Punjab and Sindh strengthened the party position in provinces. Former members of the Unionist party such as Hayats, Noons and Daultanas helped the party get popular votes. Ian Talbot explained the phenomena as “Punjabi landlord’s remarkable capacity for political accommodation, the history of which can be traced back to at least as far as the days of Ranjit Singh.” The League developed patriotic relations through the influential elite. In effect, its leadership was more interested in developing relations with landed autocracy rather than gaining popular support from the masses and establishing party’s branches.

Third, Islam and religious rituals got a central position in ML’s new political discourse. The League flag was declared as the flag of Islam. Many Pirs, Sajjada Nashins and other clerics joined the party and spread its message in their religious capacity. All these measures were useful to engage masses with the League. A separate Islamic state for the Muslims of the sub-continent thus became a popular slogan throughout India. This new state was thought to become a laboratory for the application of Islamic law. With these three changes in the political strategy, the League became one of the most successful political parties in a decade. (1937-1945).

The competitive strategies of Jinnah and poor performance of the Unionist Party in Punjab made 1946 elections a culmination point in the history of the ML. Under the leadership of Jinnah and with help of local elites, League swept the elections in the Punjab and Sindh. This electoral success opened the ways for the creation of the new state. Later, the after-effects of World War II significantly affected the British hegemony throughout the world. India got

---

110 Ibid.  
112 Ibid., 68.  
113 Unionist could not understand the new dynamics of politics in Punjab. Its poor performance in provincial government, high prices of commodities, less interest in religious and communal politics wiped out party from the Punjab politics. Ibid., 67.
freedom from the British rule. The League’s struggle for a separate homeland under the leadership of Jinnah also bore fruit and Pakistan came into being. Even so, Jinnah played vital role to win the case of Pakistan.\textsuperscript{114} According to the 3\textsuperscript{rd} June 1947 plan, Pakistan came into being in the mid of August in the same year. After the disappointing episode of 1937 elections, League took only ten years to convince the people of Punjab, Sindh, Baluchistan and NWFP in favor of its agenda.

At the societal level, the permanent allotment of land shaped a new political class. Permanent settlement of land was considered one of the most important developments that shaped the contemporary socio-political norms in the Pakistani society. Politics of landlords, accommodative nature of people, supremacy of patronage relations and the contemporary authoritarian regimes are all associated with the land settlement.\textsuperscript{115} The permanent ownership program made people politically self-oriented and beefed up the patronage culture and long-lasting dominance of the landed elites. It nonetheless, remains a fact that all these variables existed in the Indian society long before the British Raj came. Developments during the Raj beefed up these variables.

Until the creation of Pakistan, political narratives in the Punjab had not changed significantly. People were still stuck to their old norms and cultural values in the political domain. They remained accommodative, rational\textsuperscript{116} and loyal to the powerful ruling elites. In the political domain, they followed charismatic individuals, popular will and believed in patron-client relations.

2.5 Post-Independence Phenomena and Political Narratives

Arbitrariness had prevailed in India in the pre-partition era. The British did some efforts to establish a state that would be based on the rule of law, reason, and morality.\textsuperscript{117} At the same time, the Raj also strengthened the system of feudalism and patronized the landed autocracy.\textsuperscript{118}

\textsuperscript{114} Ayesha Jalal declared Jinnah as ‘Sole Spokesman Man’ in Muslims circle who played important role in the making of Pakistan. Ayesha Jalal, \textit{The Sole Spokesman}: 20-25.
\textsuperscript{115}Nicolas Martine, \textit{Politics Landlords, and Islam in Pakistan}, 68.
\textsuperscript{117}Niaz, \textit{The Culture of Power and Governance}, 38-39.
\textsuperscript{118}Javid, \textit{Class, Power, and Patronage}, 77-81.
The Punjab province was a special case in this regard, which inherited a strong class of landlords. Inherited feudalism, errors committed by its founding fathers\textsuperscript{119} and challenging circumstances\textsuperscript{120} (mostly inherited) in the [newborn] state shaped the political culture in the post-independence era. Nonetheless, the essence of political narratives in the state was not much different from the past. But the situation grew worse than the past because of mismanagement of the native ruling elites. The politics in the Punjab (as well as in Pakistan) in the post-independence era were structured as, undemocratic party structure, weak political leadership, ideological and religious conflicts, center-province issues, ethnic tussle between provinces, lack of political will, civil-military oligarchy, and powerful landed class. The political ethos of the province remained vital in the development of the political narratives in the post-independence era. The country’s political fate has been associated with the aforementioned factors in the contemporary times.

2.6 Early Political Turmoil after Independence

Lack of resources, the early demise of Jinnah and inexperienced leadership were responsible for the start of political turmoil in the country. Before the creation of Pakistan, the ML had no experience of governance in the united India. Jinnah, as the sole spokesman of the party, had supremacy over political and administrative affairs of the state. People considered him the only savior and looked the new government as the Quaid-i-Azam’s government.\textsuperscript{121} In most of the state affairs, his decisions were the final verdict. He thus became one of the most influential governor generals in the history of the world.\textsuperscript{122} He followed centralized constitutional policies under Government of India Act of 1935.\textsuperscript{123} The Parliamentary committees, with a dominant role of bureaucracy, were solely responsible for settling all important state affairs.\textsuperscript{124} Jinnah’s charisma was enough to control the bureaucracy during his life. After him, it became difficult for

\textsuperscript{119}Ilhan Niaz mentioned some errors did by Pakistan’s founding father that vanished the positive development effect did by British. He declared it as ‘the end of beginning. Niaz, The Culture of Power and Governance, 52.
\textsuperscript{120}Issues after partition with India made the situation worse for the new country. Dr. Hasan-Askari Rizvi, “Pakistan’s Foreign Policy,” 11.
\textsuperscript{121}Niaz, The Culture of power and Governance, 68.
\textsuperscript{122}Sayeed, Pakistan: The Formative Phase, 223.
\textsuperscript{123}Tahir Kamran, “Pakistan Main Jamhoriate: Aik Tarikhi Jaeza,” 6-10.
\textsuperscript{124}Ibid.
the rest of ML’s leadership to handle the military and bureaucracy. Later, Liquat Ali khan’s prejudiced behaviour and use of Public and Representative Offices Disqualification Act (PRODA) to undermine the opponents set a bad example for the future democrats.

In the 1950, the tussle between the political leadership of Muslims League reached its peak. After Liquat Ali Khan’s assassination, six prime ministers swore in until 1958. Issues between East and West Pakistan also damaged national harmony and the political process. The constitution assembly spent only 16 days per annum in the first seven years of its history on constitution making. On the other hand, the political leaders in public offices had no vision and objectives to serve people. Fazl-ul-Haq, a luminary from freedom movement, took the office of the governor in East Pakistan in the 1956. He believed in spontaneous relief for masses even if that might be temporary. He defended his corrupt ministers, as they were the true representatives of the people and capable of understanding the state morality of the locals. All these mistakes committed by the politicians gave an opportunity to the civil-military oligarchy to develop themselves. Both military and bureaucracy got their space in the political arena. They got the decisive role in the decision making. Another reason that strengthened military and bureaucracy, was the lack of popular support for the League’s leadership in Pakistan. Most of the new political leadership had their areas of influence in India, while they had less popular support in Pakistan. Therefore, the leadership had to depend on Punjab’s landlords to get electoral support and used bureaucracy and military to control the state’s affairs.

The 1951 provincial elections in Punjab gave a strong edge to the landed class. First provincial elections after the independence in the province became a wrangle between the two influential landlords: Nawab Iftikhar Hussain Khan Mamdot and Mian Mumtaz Muhammad

---

126 As a Prime Minister, Liquat Ali Khan did some hate speech against its rival from East Pakistan and used the act to disqualify the opponents in provincial elections. Ian Talbot, Pakistan: The Modern History, 14.
127 K. K. Aziz, Party Politics in Pakistan, 84.
128 Niaz, The Power of Culture and Governance of Pakistan, 246.
129 Malik Ghulam Muhammad (third Govern General of Pakistan), a civil bureaucratic dismissed the central government in 1953, and Ayub Khan enjoyed the power of Army Chief for the long time without any hurdle. Sayeed, Politics in Pakistan, 74.
130 League’s leadership had strong roots in India, after partition it was difficult for them to rule without popular support. Stephen Philip Cohen, The Idea of Pakistan (New Delhi: Oxford University Press, 2004), 9.
131 Before the participation, Nawab of Mamdot refused to establish the primary Muslims League branch in its area, Ferozepore. Talbot, “The 1946 Punjab Elections,” 68.
Khan Daultana. Both were keen to get the slot of the chief minister of the province.\(^{132}\) Nawab Mamdot (the biggest Muslim Landlord of East Punjab before the independence)\(^ {133}\) became the president of the League after his father (Nawab Shah Nawaz Khan) in 1943. He had a strong nexus with prominent officers of Indian Civil Service (ICS), influential Pirs, and journalists.\(^ {134}\)

On the other hand, Mumtaz Daultana, an Oxford graduate, landlord as well as a former Unionist stalwart, hailed from Vehari District, Punjab. As an influential landlord, he had strong roots in the political arena of the province.\(^ {135}\) He was the member of Nawab Mamdot’s cabinet after partition. His rivalry with chief minister (CM) Mamdot was an open secret at that time. Due to his close relations with the brother of PM Liquat Ali Khan (Nawab Sajjad Ali Khan), he was considered the PM’s protégé.\(^ {136}\) Also, his dominant role in the independence movement and strong background made him a potential candidate for CM especially when Premier Khan dismissed Mamdot’s government in 1949. After that, Mamdot left the presidency of ML and party later. He established a new political party, Jinnah Muslim League, with Husain Shaheed Suharwardy’s assistance.

In 1951, the first provincial elections were announced in the province. The real contest was between Muslims League (Mumtaz Daultana was among the top leadership from Punjab) and Mamdot’s Jinnah Muslims League. Due to efficient efforts of Daultana, Muslim League won the elections overwhelmingly. Strategies adopted by the ML’s leadership to win the elections were based on partisanship and patron-client relations. Daultana managed to get the support of landlords of Punjab such as the Nawabzadas of Gujrat, the Sayyids of Jhang, and the Sardars of Mazaffargarh and Dera Ghazi Khan.\(^ {137}\) Through religious rhetoric and slogans of land reforms, he countered both the religious and the leftist parties in the electoral process. In addition, Premier Khan’s support to Daultana was also the key factor in his electoral victory.\(^ {138}\) The electoral success put the ML and Daultana on the driving seat in elections. ML won 140 seats out of total

\(^ {133}\) Talbot, Pakistan: A Modern History, 428.
\(^ {137}\) Afzal, Political Parties in Pakistan: 1947-1958, 54-60.
197 with 52 percent of total polled votes.\textsuperscript{139} Mmadot’s League won 32 seats with 18.3 percent of total polled votes.\textsuperscript{140}

Surprisingly, the ML won almost all provincial elections except East Bengal, in 1950s. In East Bengal, the ML was defeated decisively as it got only 3 percent of total provincial seats.\textsuperscript{141} The differences between East Bengal and other provinces were clear and loud. In Punjab, Sindh and NWFP, League was depended on the support of local landlords, Pirs, and other elites. All these factors were absent in East Pakistan. The campaign of Bangla’s leaders against centralization, the rise of middle class in the province and feeble landed class had a vital role in ML’s defeat in the province.\textsuperscript{142} The above factors also made League unpopular in the biggest province of the country. To counter the situation (in rest of the country), League’s leadership started using undemocratic means to strengthen their rule. In 1954, under the one-unit scheme, the four provinces of West Pakistan combined into single entity, to balance the populous East Pakistan.\textsuperscript{143} It had the support of landed autocracy, top bureaucracy, and military. After that, they became most influential [domestic] actors in the decision making.\textsuperscript{144}

Struggle for power between politicians and weak democratic culture in the country helped both military and bureaucracy to become an “overdeveloped institutions” in the country. This overdevelopment reached its peak when this nexus toppled the political government without significant resistance in 1958. A long-awaited coup occurred in the country under General Ayub Khan.\textsuperscript{145} After a long political turmoil, his campaign against corruption, hoarding and black-marketing was widely welcomed throughout the country.\textsuperscript{146} Later, the economic developments of his era were remembered as ‘the golden sixties’\textsuperscript{147} in the history of Pakistan. Implemented with the help of advisors from Harvard University, Ayub Khan’s industrialization, development in

\textsuperscript{139} On 30\textsuperscript{th} March 1951, League won 140 seats and just after four months, it reached on 166. M. Rafique Afzal, \textit{Political Parties in Pakistan: 1947-1958} (Islamabad: NIHCR, 1986), 99.
\textsuperscript{140} Jinnah Muslims League won just 16 percent of total provincial seats. Ibid., 99.
\textsuperscript{141} League got 10 seats out of 297 while Suharwardy’s United Front got 223. Ibid., 107.
\textsuperscript{142} Sayeed, \textit{Politics in Pakistan: 37-39}.
\textsuperscript{143} Cohen, \textit{The Idea of Pakistan}, 7.
\textsuperscript{144} The rise of individuals from the feudal background, higher-ups of bureaucracy and military generals took the control over country’s affairs. Sayeed, \textit{Politics in Pakistan: 45-57}.
\textsuperscript{145} Ayub Khan was in the office of Army Chief since 1951, then he became defense minister in 1954. Till 1958, he was so strong in his office that he took the office of President Iskander Mirza. Rizvi, \textit{The Military and Politics in Pakistan} 119.
\textsuperscript{146} Sharif al-Mujahid, “Pakistan’s First Presidential Elections,” 280.
\textsuperscript{147} Husain, “The Role of Politics in Pakistan's Economy,” 2.
agriculture and modest land reforms were hailed even in the outside world.\textsuperscript{148} Economic calculation indicated the country as one of the best among developing countries.\textsuperscript{149}

At the societal level, that development brought some positive impact. In Urban zones of the country, a progressive society was perceived during nineteen sixties and seventies.\textsuperscript{150} The development strategies and the rise of income level weakened the emotional appeal of Islamic system to run the country.\textsuperscript{151} These prospects of progress were clear in the West Pakistan’s urban as well as the ruler zones. Conversely, the economic disparities and inequalities between the eastern and the western part of the country exposed the claims of countrywide development. The disparity increased the grievances and bitterness among the Bengali masses.\textsuperscript{152} Differences between per-capita incomes in the two wings were high and GPD growth was 42 percent in the Western part, while merely 17 percent in the Eastern part in the 1960s.\textsuperscript{153} Concentration of wealth in the Western part heightened the impact of ethnicity between the two parts. The politicians of East Bengal and masses perceived Ayub’s regime as foreign rule over them.\textsuperscript{154} The more disparities became serious and bitterness changed into hate against the Western part, especially Punjab. Anti-Punjabi perception was seriously damaging harmony in the country and shedding off the positive effects of the development.

Nonetheless, the concentration of wealth and power in the hands of Punjabi stakeholders was a prominent feature of Ayub regime. He strove to become the absolute actor in the political domain through presidential referendum in 1960.\textsuperscript{155} His authoritative nature was clear from the

\begin{itemize}
\item[\textsuperscript{148}] Samuel P. Huntington praised Ayub’s policies of development via institutionalism. Huntington, \textit{Political Order in Changing Societies}, 252.
\item[\textsuperscript{149}] Gross Development Progress (GDP) jumped from 3 to 6 percent annually. Manufacturing sector developed by 9 percent annually and agriculture grew with 4 percent in the 1950s. Husain, “The Role of Politics in Pakistan's Economy,” 3.
\item[\textsuperscript{150}] Progressive society means, there was political awareness and activism in the society. Education level was improved, people from other developing countries came here for study. Cinema industry reached at its peak during the 1960s. Religious extremism was low, and people had a moderate opinion regarding religious affairs. Muhammad Shoaib (Lecturer CIT Vehari) in discussion with author (The question was asked regarding the political developments and electoral politics during 1960s), August 27, 2016.
\item[\textsuperscript{151}] Sayeed, \textit{Politics in Pakistan}: 62.
\item[\textsuperscript{152}] Ibid., 36.
\item[\textsuperscript{154}] People of East Pakistan called Ayub’s times as continuation of British Colonial Raj for them. Even the politicians of that side perceived western part as foreign land. Sayeed, \textit{Politics in Pakistan}: 56.
\item[\textsuperscript{155}] After seizing the power in 1958, Ayub disregarded the idea of Western-style democracy. He introduced the system of Basic Democracy (BD) and divided the country into tiny eighty thousand constituencies. After the local government elections via BD system, a presidential referendum held in February 1960s. Khan remained in power
\end{itemize}
The first presidential elections in 1965. He thought that parliamentary democracy and political activities of the parties would create rifts in the society and could make the situation worse. His ambition for grabbing more and more power continued and he introduced a new Presidential constitution in 1962. Under this constitution, president was the real source of power. He was so confident about his political development once he said, “I may be right, I may be wrong, but I have no doubts.” Later, for the pursuit of political legitimacy, he established Pakistan Conventional Muslims League (PCML) and became the president of the party.

In the pursuit of his ends, Khan announced first presidential elections in 1965. Unexpectedly, he faced strong opposition and harsh reaction from urban zones of the country. The opposition political parties’ united front put Fatima Jinnah, sister of Jinnah, as presidential candidate against him. She was a respected woman and was renowned as the mother of nation. She was probably the only leader who could give a tough challenge to General Khan. Indirect presidential election of 1965 was held according to Ayub Khan’s doctrine (Basic Democracy System), which authorized eight thousand, Members of Electoral College (MECs), to vote for the president’s election.

The result of election was conducive to analyze the political behaviour of the country. Despite overwhelming favor of the people for Fatima Jinnah, she lost the election. Fatima Jinnah did not win even a single district from the West Pakistan, except Karachi. She got only 26 percent votes of MECs from Western side of the country, while Khan swept the election with 76 percent votes. Although there were electoral malpractices in presidential elections, but the
MECs voted for themselves.\textsuperscript{164} Results proved the accommodative nature and self-centered rationalism of the people in the politics of Punjab. These elections deepened the culture of accommodative politics quasi-democracy in the province. The impressive campaign of combined opposition parties (COP) did not weaken Khan’s dominance over administrative affairs and people followed the tendency ‘to support the powerful’. Khan enjoyed the power until 1969 when another military General Yahya Khan forced him to resign because of widespread agitation of the people against his unpopular government. In the last year of his rule, massive riots, protest, and political agitation broke out throughout the country.

The mass agitation movement against Ayub was exceptional in the political history of the country. This was the first mass movement after independence that forced Field Marshal to step down. Industrialization and good economic conditions made people aware of the political issues and socio-economic inequalities in the society.\textsuperscript{165} Politicians took advantage of disparities by making fiery speeches, which accelerated the pace of the movement. Participation of student organizations and labor unions peaked up the unrest throughout the country. High prices of basic commodities, hoarding, black-marketing, and corruption made the situation serious for the regime. Therefore, it seems reasonable to argue that the successful agitation of the masses and effective tactics from politicians forced Ayub Khan to leave.

2.7 First General Elections and Extension in Political Turmoil

In the post-military regime, it was difficult to establish a coherent political atmosphere and curtail the power of undemocratic institutions. Military regime of Ayub Khan was mostly anti-political and it imposed restrictions on political activities.\textsuperscript{166} His own political party and political system of Basic Democracy did not do any change in the political culture of the country.\textsuperscript{167} Therefore, Ayub’s protégé became politicians in West Pakistan started to rule the

\textsuperscript{164}The stories of pre-poll and post-polling rigging were common. During research, the discussion with the grandson of an old man. The old man was elected as MECs rural belt in district Vehari. He said, his grandfather was not allowed to vote in polling stations, but administration grabbed their ID card and ordered him to leave. Abdul Qadir (Ph. D scholar) discussed the political development of Ayub era with author, July 27, 2016.
\textsuperscript{165}Voted for themselves means that MECs voted to Ayub for the sake of their personal interests. Sharif al-Mujahid. “Pakistan’s First Presidential Elections,” 293.
\textsuperscript{166}The rise of 22 families and their dominance over country industries surged the difference between ‘have and have not.’ That difference gave chance to politicians to highlight that issue. Sayeed. Politics in Pakistan, 146.
\textsuperscript{166}Ibid., 260.
country. Political turmoil and conflict for power did not disappear even after Ayub’s regime. Differences of the provinces and regional interests continued to grow. General Yahya Khan took the government with the promise of first general elections in the country. The political activities set off in both wings. Many political parties came to contest the upcoming elections with the manifesto of economic revival, provincial autonomy, and establishment of democracy in the country. The rise of political movement and social mobilization had not weakened the hegemony of bourgeoisies, landed classes, bureaucracy, and military in the new episode.

Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto (ZA Bhutto) was the real benefactor during the military regime of Ayub Khan. His entire political career was Ayub specific.\(^{168}\) He was the most vibrant supporter of Khan as his foreign minister. Later, he was among the one who took maximum advantage of Khan’s weakness.\(^{169}\) His newly created political party, Pakistan People’s Party (PPP), became famous during the massive protest against Khan’s government.\(^{170}\) Bhutto’s attractive party manifesto, impressive election campaign\(^{171}\) and exciting speeches\(^{172}\) in public rallies made him one of the most popular and charismatic political personalities in the West Pakistan. His political tactics and charisma attracted the masses and he secured electoral victory in 1970 general elections (in the Western wing).

The results of 1970 elections widened the gap between the Eastern and Westerns parts of the country. The election results from the East wing delivered a fatal blow to the unity of the country. Supporters of provincial autonomy—later the promoters of East Pakistan as a separate state—Awami League (AL) swept the elections in national as well as provincial assemblies.\(^{173}\) AL was on top in the national assembly of the country, but the party was nowhere in Western part. In West wing, Bhutto s’ PPP was in a commanding position. The party got 81

\(^{168}\) Ibid., 252.

\(^{169}\) Bhutto exploited the class difference of Ayub’s era. After 1965 war pact in Tashkent, he highlighted the table talk between Ayub Khan and Indian PM Lal Bahadur Shastri as the failure of Pakistan’s foreign policy. He also used the religious rhetoric to defame Khan’s government. Sayeed, Politics in Pakistan, 85.


\(^{172}\) Bhutto covered the weakness of his speech trough acting, mimicry, or ridicule to his opponents. Khalid B. Sayeed, “How Radical is the Pakistan People’s Party?” Pacific Affairs 48, No. 1 (1975): 52.

\(^{173}\) AL got 160 seats out of 300 in national assembly of the country with highest percentage of votes (39%) and got 288 seats in the provincial assembly of East Pakistan out of 300. While the party showed no interest in the electoral politics of West Pakistan and did not participate actively in elections in West Pakistan. Rizvi and Gilani, “The First 10 General Elections of Pakistan: 40.
national assembly seats and stood second in the country. PPP’s fortune was not different in Eastern part of the country as AL had in West wing.

ZA Bhutto’s party performed well in Punjab and Sindh provinces but met disappointments in the NWFP and Baluchistan.\(^{174}\) ZA Bhutto hailed from Sindh and his electoral success was not a surprise from the province.\(^{175}\) His success in Punjab was not predictable, but not a surprise due to his popularity in the province. PPP managed to get almost 41 percent of votes and got 62 seats out of total 82 from the Punjab province.\(^{176}\) Electoral success from Punjab and Sindh was important and enough for the party to rule in the west wing. The overall electoral numbers of the AL made the situation complex in the post-election scenario. Both the military and political establishments of the West wing were not ready to accept the AL rule over the entire country. Military’s attempt to stage a coup against the elected government of AL failed and eventually led to a civil war. In the wake of India’s aggression against East Pakistan, the Eastern part became a separate county, Bangladesh, in 1971.

Separation of the East wing changed the nature of the state\(^{177}\) in the remaining Pakistan and gave the Punjab province supremacy over national affairs. Because it was the hub of high profile landed magnates,\(^{178}\) the province’s role was decisive in the decisions making.\(^{179}\) The other important development in the post 1971 era was the rise of ZA Bhutto as one of the most popular political leaders in Pakistan. Owing to his political gimmickry, he succeeded in appeasing the opposition and other important segments of the society (both the rightists and leftist).\(^{180}\) Bhutto’s political charisma and his people centric policies made him popular throughout the country. His rhetoric of 'Rotee', 'Kapra' and 'Makan' [bread, clothing, and shelter for those, who have not] is even still working for his party and family. After his death in a dubious judicial trial, his daughter Benazir Bhutto enjoyed the premiership of the country twice.

---

\(^{174}\) From Punjab PPP won 62 national assembly seats out of 82 and got 18 from Sindh out of 27. But from NWFP party got just one seat out of 25 and none from Baluchistan. Ibid., 41-42.

\(^{175}\) In 1970 elections, in Sindh PPP enlisted many Waderas and Pir in the party and that was the real cause of PPP’s victory from the province. Karachi and urban zones stood aloof from the province. In the heart of the city of Karachi PPP lost all the five NA seats and won two from suburban areas. Baxter, “Pakistan Votes-1970,” 214.

\(^{176}\) Rizvi and Gilani, “The First 10 General Elections of Pakistan,” 41-42.

\(^{177}\) Cohen, The Idea of Pakistan, 9.


\(^{179}\) During the Ayub ear concentration of the whole progress and agriculture revolution was Punjab. More than 90 percent of the agriculture-related tools (Tube wells& Tractors) was insulted in Punjab only. That agriculture revolution strengthened the landed magnates of Punjab. Hamza Alavi. “Bangla Desh and the Crises of Pakistan,” The Socialist Register, 301. http://socialistregister.com/index.php/srv/article/view/5341/2242#.WThNKGiGOM8

\(^{180}\) Cohen, The Idea of Pakistan, 9.
and his son in Law Asif Ali Zardari ruled the country as president for five years. It was all due to Bhutto’s fame, probably. Even in contemporary politics, his party, and his grandson Bilawal Bhutto Zardari have a dominant role in electoral politics of the country.

However, the historians have analyzed ZA Bhutto’s era critically. Hamza Alavi declared his policies as misguided popular one. Stephen Philip Cohen mentioned him as an autocratic ruler and Ilhan Niaz called his era as the worst authoritarian rule in the history of Pakistan. Bhutto’s personality was the true imprint of the Pakistan’s political culture. His background, rich landlord from Sindh, dominated his way of governance. He rarely encouraged democracy inside the party, (intra-party elections never occurred during his time) and he proudly declared, “I am People’s Party and they all are my creatures.” His structural changes in bureaucracy strengthened his personal rule over the government affairs. He challenged the autonomy of almost every organ of the state. Tahir Amin calls his government a highly personalized system in practice.

K. B. Sayeed maintains that Pakistan under Bhutto was ‘The Bonapartist State’ where leaders controlled the institutions and economy of the country. According to Gerald Heeger, Bhutto adopted the policy of patrimonialism and deliberately promoted demobilization in the country. Under patrimonialism, he got full personal control of the key institutions of the country. He organized political groups in an undemocratic way and used them as his loyal servants. Through them, he snubbed his opponents within and outside the party. He dismissed the governments of National Awami Party (NAP) and Jamiat Ulama-i- Islam (JUI) in North West Frontier Province (NWFP) and Baluchistan provinces respectively and forced them to resign from NWFP in 1973. In Punjab, his tussle with loyal party members was obvious. While in Sindh, he settled his rule with the help of his cousin Mumtaz Bhutto. Later, he shaped

---

183 Niaz, The Culture of Power and governance of Pakistan, 257.
185 Niaz, The Culture of Power and governance of Pakistan, 279.
187 Sayeed, Politics in Pakistan, 89.
188 Patrimonialism means personal governance by an elite to get control over the political structure through personality. Heeger, “Politics in the Post-Military State,” 261.
189 Ibid.
190 Sayeed, “How Radical is the Pakistan People’s Party?,“52-56.
PPP as a highly personalized and minister-focused party. Heeger explains these phenomena as a common factor in the post-military era, where political parties and political leaders were purposely undermined.

In Pakistan after 1971, Bhutto also tried to control the military generals. He said (Before the 1977 coup), “I wanted to see how Hitler controlled his generals and how I could not control mine.” In this struggle, however, his handpicked chief of Army staff General Zia ousted him. Malpractices of the ruling party in the general elections of 1977 and the subsequent mass protests of the opposition parties paved the way for the military to get control over the country’s affairs. The results of the election widened the polarization and socioeconomic division in the country. The electoral success of PPP in the election put the country in another political turmoil. Lack of institutionalization, less social mobilization among the people, low economic development, and zealous military generals made the situation ripe for another coup in the country.

In the post-election era, the urban unrest against Bhutto was vibrant. But it was important in the political history of Pakistan. Despite the suspicious role of the military establishment and electoral rigging, the unrest in the country was a popular campaign of the opposition political parties. Pakistan National Alliance (PNA) got support throughout the country. Both the religious and rightist parties were the part of such alliance. The political parties in the alliance got the support of the majority in the society. Middle-class traders and landlords also took part in the movement under the flag of different political parties. As stated above, the election rigging was probably not the only reason of unrest. The economic sufferings in big business (due to nationalization), decline in private investments and dwindling job opportunities also had a vital role in that movement. Later, Nizam-e-Mustafa movement made the situation more difficult for Bhutto.

---

192 Ibid., 262.
194 Rizvi and Gilani, “The First 10 General Elections of Pakistan,” 44.
196 PNA was the alliance of nine political parties. Rizvi and Gilani. “The First 10 General Elections of Pakistan,” 15.
Despite all the unrest, the opposition and Bhutto signed an agreement for new elections and were on the way to settle things, but the military’s activism put the elected prime minister behind the bars and chief of army staff General Zia imposed third marshal in the country. Bhutto’s execution in a murder case made him martyr and an unforgettable personality in the political history of Pakistan. The sympathy factor for Bhutto’s family increased the popularity of his party. The popularity of PPP is an orientation of political culture in the country. Because of popular people-centric approach, sympathy factor and presence of the electables, party made stable position in the electoral politics of the country.

2.8 Political Narratives in General Zia’s Regime

In Pakistan, General Zia is considered the promoter of sectarianism and Kalashnikov culture, importer of trans-national Jihad, inventor of extremist Islam and the founder of fundamentalist Pakistan. Most of the historians, writers and intellectuals of Pakistan affairs mentioned Zia’s regime as the dark time in the history of the country and declared his policies solely responsible for the current wave of terrorism and extremism in the country (after 9/11). Zia’s strategies regarding the foreign and defense policy of the country were based on his shortsightedness only to legitimize himself.

Zia’s legacy still affects the defense and foreign policy making in Pakistan. His political protégés and legacy have also affected the political ethos of the country, even more than defense and foreign policy. Nawaz Sharif’s Muslim League (PML-N) and Altaf Husain’s Muttahida Qaumi Movement (MQM) were two major products of the Zia regime. Nawaz Sharif (MNS) was a diehard supporter of Zia (called Zia’s protégé) and came to politics on his behalf (MNS is the only politician in Pakistani politics who became prime minister for three terms). His party is ruling the country for a long time.

---

201 Sayeed, Politics in Pakistan: The Nature and Direction of Change, 164.
203 Husain Haqqani, Pakistan between Mosque and Military, 94-97.
204 Ayesha Jalal, Democracy Authoritarianism in South Asia, 55-65.
205 Ibid.
Conversely, the MQM emerged on the ethnic bases in urban zones of Sindh and dominated the general and local body elections of the two major cities. Its ethnic politics reached its peak in the first decade of the 21st century. The party and its leader Altaf Husain were found guilty in anti-state activities. The armed operation started against the party in 2015. According to government sources, party and its members were involved in criminal activities in the city of Karachi. The control of these two parties (PMLN and MQM) in the political life of the country is a troubling contribution of Zia’s legacy.

As mentioned earlier, the impact of Zia’s Islamization on the political scenario of the country has not necessarily changed the people’s voting choice, especially in Punjab. Despite his radical Islamist policies, no single Islamic political party got electoral success in the province in the general elections. Even the religious political parties performed poorly in almost every general election and never secured more than three percent votes out of the total polled votes.

Secondly, Zia is considered the importer of sectarianism and Sunni Islam, but this factor also did not have any substantial impact on people’s choice in general elections. Therefore, one may argue that Zia’s policies of Islamization damaged Pakistan’s image in the world more than changing the choices of the people.

The electoral scenario of Zia’s era was also interesting. In this era, the political activities were at their lowest ebb, almost all political parties were banned, and general elections held only once in eleven years (1977 to 1988). In 1984, General Zia announced general elections and promised to transfer power to elected representatives. Later, he decided to share the power rather than simply transferring it. He maintained his position as the president through national referendum. In the 1985 general election, due to ban, the political parties did not take part. However, many candidates participated in the elections. More than 1400 nomination papers were

---


211 According to official results, almost 97 percent gave the votes in favor of Zia’s presidency. Ibid., 27.
filed for 207 national assembly seats, and more than 4000 for 460 provincial assembly seats.\textsuperscript{212} In this non-party election, many new faces from urban and rural areas contested in the Punjab province.\textsuperscript{213} A feudal from Sindh Muhammad Khan Junejo got the slot of PM. But in 1988 the PM and the President developed conflicts and Zia dismissed Junejo from his office. Zia remained in his office, president, and chief of army staff, until his accidental death. Despite his self-centered policies and his long rule over the country, the state did not witness any mass protests as were seen in the past against General Ayub and Bhutto.

2.9 Pakistan’s Way toward Electoral Democracy (1988-99)

The 1988 party-based general elections after the death of General Zia created a hope for the restoration of democracy in Pakistan. But both the popular political leaders of 1990s, Benazir, and Nawaz Sharif, missed the opportunity to enhance democracy in the country as well as in their parties. They consciously politicized the state institutions as well.\textsuperscript{214} When in power, they both used authoritative means to snub the opponents and tried to please the people through false slogans. Therefore, the outcomes of the said democratic interlude were tainted by financial kickbacks, political infighting,\textsuperscript{215} high rate of poverty and four general elections in eleven years.

Politicians and the political parties of the 1990s were not singly responsible for this debacle. The indigenous burden of history, zealous military generals, security agencies\textsuperscript{216} and states’ relations in international domain were the other factors that made that decade ‘the muddling nineties.’\textsuperscript{217} The developments and policies of Zia’s regime were teasing his heirs in many domains, especially the tense relations with India\textsuperscript{218} and domestic, sectarian, and religious violence. Even liberals argued that democracy failed due to conflicting ideologies, legacy of intolerance and the absence of political awareness during Zia’s regime.\textsuperscript{219}

Another important factor of that era was military’s enthusiasm to control the country according to its own planning. Its role in the electoral politics that led to manipulation in the


\textsuperscript{213} Rizvi and Gilani, “The First 10 General Elections of Pakistan,” 17.

\textsuperscript{214} Talbot, Pakistan: A New History, 154.

\textsuperscript{215} Ibid., 152.

\textsuperscript{216} Niaz, The Culture of Power and Governance, 280.

\textsuperscript{217} Husain, “The Role of Politics in Pakistan’s Economy,”


\textsuperscript{219} Talbot, Pakistan: A New History, 154.
election results was obvious during the 1990s. Its reaction against PPP and Bhutto’s family was partial and prejudiced. Therefore, the weak political leadership, military activism, poor condition of law and order and international pressure such as sanctions made the decade (1990-99) problematic and difficult for the state as well as for the people of Pakistan.

The electoral episodes of the nineties were also unique in the history of the country. Four general elections were held in a decade and the politicians struggled hard for their legitimacy in people’s circle. The electoral season started in 1988 when PPP under the leadership of Benazir Bhutto clinched a tough victory in post-dictatorship era. The charisma of ZA Bhutto, popularity of Benazir and sympathy factor for his family was at the peak. Tolerating PPP’s popular support was hard for the military establishment. To minimize PPP’s political edge, a military-sponsored ‘political alliance’ Islami Jamhoori Ittehad (IJI) was formed to counterbalance the situation. PPP contested the elections with an emotional agenda of victimization by the military and ZA Bhutto’s popular policies. On the other hand, IJI went for the poll for the betterment of socioeconomic condition through implementation of Islamic law.

Elections results in 1988 proved another factor of electoral politics in the country that the malpractices, rigging, and unconstitutional means could not diminish the popular support for any political party. The heavyweights in IJI could not stop PPP to take simple majority in the elections. PPP got 94 national assembly (NA) seats out of 206 and became the largest party in the assembly. Its opponent IJI stood second in the NA with 55 seats. With the help of small parties and independents, Benazir Bhutto formed her government in the center and became the first female Premier in Pakistan’s history. Even after her victory in the elections, Benazir had to make some commitments with the military high-ups before taking the office. The first one was the continuation of acting President Ghulam Ishaq Khan as permanent President, while the others were related to the effective role of military in foreign and defense policymaking.

221 Military elites got intelligence information that PPP could get majority in 1988 general elections if its political opponents remained divided. To minimize the PPP’s majority, military established the alliance (IJI) of nine right wing political parties. The group of politicians from Punjab was the major stakeholder in that alliance and on driving seat to run the elections. The remaining eight parties were the religious political parties. Ibid., 20-22.
In Punjab assembly (PA), PPP had the majority and it got 53 seats out of 115. IJI stood second with 45 seats. IJI were in commanding position in Punjab assembly (PA) to make the government. With the popularity of Nawaz Sharif and the presence of the electable, IJI secured 37 percent votes in the provincial assembly. A good number of independent candidates also won in PA and joined Nawaz Sharif to make him Chief Minister (CM) in the province. The elections results did not record any major change in the voting behaviour of people. People followed the popular will, electable, and personal charisma of leaders.

In 1990, Benazir’s government got problems with the military establishment. Situation became worse when the military-installed president dismissed the government over the charges of corruption, mismanagement, and poor condition of law and order. The removal of PPP was not different from a military coup because the military personals had taken control over important buildings, including the PM house and national assembly. Opposition parties of that time joined hands with the establishment and welcomed the whole operation. They expelled government of PPP and the president announced new general elections. Partiality of the authorities started in the formation of caretaker government when ex-opposition leader Ghulam Mustfa Joati was selected as the caretaker PM. Partiality against PPP reached its peak when ISI financed IJI candidates and its leaders. Before elections, PPP made electoral alliance, Pakistan Democratic Alliance (PDA), with some other political parties.

IJI came to contest the elections with the same alliance and gave a tough time to PPP-PDA. At that time, however, the situation was different from 1988 elections. Due to bad governance, PPP lost its charisma and popular support, especially in Punjab. On the other hand, Nawaz Sharif became a suitable candidate for the military establishment. The results of 1990 elections were not surprise. With the help of military establishment and some small political parties, IJI got the simple majority in the NA. With 37 percent of votes, the party got 104 out of 207 NA seats. On the other hand, PPP-PDA performed poorly and only managed to get 44 seats in the assembly. In Punjab, IJI was in the commanding position, with 49 percent votes, and the

---

224 Government of Pakistan, Election Commission of Pakistan, *Details Results of Elections to the Provincial Assembly of the Punjab 1988-1997*.
227 From last elections, the rise in IJI votes for 7% but the rise of seats was massive. In 1988 elections, IJI had just 55 seats and in 1990 the party got more than 50% seats of national assembly. On the other hand, PPP/PDA had the
party got 80 percent seats in PA. While PPP got a good number of votes (38%) but obtained just 14 seats out of 115. Due to partiality of military and unfair means, the PPP declared the election a fraud. Yet its claims did not create any unrest in the country. People accepted the results and Nawaz Sharif as new Prime Minister (PM) of the country.

Political tussle among PM Sharif, President and military leadership was a dominant factor in the nineties. This time in 1993, establishment favorite Nawaz Sharif got problems with President Ishaq and Army Chief Asif Nawaz over the governance issues (all the actors of decision making in the country wanted maximum power. Most of the cases during 1990s these actors crossed their limits). Tussle became vibrant after the sudden death of Army Chief Asif Nawaz. President Ishaq used his power and appointed a new Army Chief, Abdul Waheed Kaker, without any consultation with PM Sharif. The decision perturbed PM and he decided to curtail the power of president. Before he could take any action, President Ishaq dissolved the national assembly and set a caretaker government in the country. Later, the Supreme Court overruled Ishaq’s decision and restored PM Sharif. During the whole drama, a rift started inside PML in Punjab. That rift ended when Army Chief forced both PM and President to leave their respective offices. Once again, new general elections were announced (Third time in last five years) and all the provincial and national assembly were dissolved by the President.

In 1993 general elections, both PPP and PML-N went for poll without any political alliance (PPP and PML-J had an agreement not to contest against each other). These two parties were the main rival in upcoming elections. Jamaat-i-Islami formed a political alliance named as Pakistan Islamic Front (PIF) and got popularity during the electoral campaign. That alliance led by Qazi Husain Ahmad did not win a single seat in national assembly.

In 1993 elections, PPP was on driving seat and got 88 seats (out of 206) in NA. This time it performed better in the Punjab with the help of independents and PML-J. This alliance

---

228 One group of the party was in favor of President Ishaq and other was loyal to PM Sharif. Both the group wanted to take control in Punjab Assembly. Once President’s group took the control and elected their own CM in assembly. Later, Nawaz Sharif got control via constitutional bill from national assembly and appointed an administrative in the province rather than CM. Rizvi and Gilani, “The First 10 General Elections of Pakistan,” 24.


worked for PPP and the party made its government in the Punjab first time after ZA Bhutto’s government. Benazir became PM for second time and her party made government in all four provinces. PML-N stood second in the NA and the PA. Nawaz League got 73 seats in national assembly and 53 (out of 116) in Punjab assembly. Voting trends were no different from the past. People voted for charisma of political leaders, their political parties, and electables. People followed their patronage relations with candidates, in these elections also.

Misfortune for electoral democracy and PPP’s government continued, even after 1993 elections. In 1996, its own President, Farooq Laghari, dismissed Benazir’s government from the center as well as from provinces. Charges of corruption, bad governance, poor condition of law and order and destroying the independent judiciary via accountability bill on PPP’s government were not different from the past. It was the third time when an elected government did not complete its term and new general elections were announced. Both military and Supreme Court upheld the President’s decision. In February 1997, people went for polls third time during the nineties.

In the 1997 elections, the main contenders were same. PML-N was looking for a commanding position even before the elections. Cricketer turned politician Imran Khan also took part in elections with great enthusiasm. He formed his party, Pakistan Tehrik-i-Insaf (PTI), an alternative to PPP and PML-N. The story of PTI and Khan is interesting and is a relevant case to analyze the voting trends in Pakistan. In 1996, when Mr. Khan launched his party the response was encouraging from people in his political gathering. But in general elections of 1997, the party did not get a single seat and even Imran Khan was defeated badly even form its own hometown, Mianwali. PTI ‘s defeat showed people’s rationale approach in polls. The role of electable and importance of organized political party at grass root level was still decisive.

The result of the elections was a setback for the PPP. It lost all the seats of national assembly from Punjab and won just 18 seats of NA, all from Sindh. Party got only 22 percent of total votes in NA contest, 12 percent less than the last elections. On the other hand, the PML-N got 136 seats of NA (out of 206) with 46 percent of total votes. This increase was massive and helped the party dominate the federal government. Punjab totally turned in the favor of Nawaz Sharif. His party got 109 seats out of 115 in the provincial assembly. With the help of this majority, Nawaz Sharif did amendments in 1973 constitution and curtailed the presidential

---

power to dissolve the assembly. Elections result gave Nawaz Sharif full authority over country’s affairs and he enjoyed maximum power. His dominance ended when the people of Pakistan welcomed another military coup orchestrated by General Parvez Musharraf. In 1999, when Nawaz Sharif tried to overturn the army chief, military foiled his attempt and staged another coup in the country. Despite massive popularity in 1997 national elections, loyalists to Nawaz and party did not go for protest against the coup. Musharraf became the new martial law administrator, and condemned Nawaz’s government a sham democracy.\textsuperscript{232} After that, the military took over almost all the state’s institutions and stated introduced in its own style.

**Conclusion**

In the long historical perspective of political narratives in Pakistani Punjab political culture of the province has obvious impact. Political narratives of the people are influenced by the culture of their areas. Local norms, values, socio-economic factors, and cultural ethos are the proximal variables that are shaping the political culture in the area. All the variables of culture shaped the ethos of local political culture (these ethos later political narratives of the masses or their impact their voting behaviour). People of Punjab from ancient times have been following the approaches of accommodativeness, clientelism and rationale behaviour in the domain of political narrative. Even in the modern political setup, when competitive elections are introduced, these approaches are still vibrant and obvious in the political culture of the province.

Oligarchy, authoritarianism, and arbitrariness were the main characteristics of the ruling elites in Punjab. Rulers’ ultimate objective was survival of their government and rule. People were toeing with their old patterns and act according to these patterns in elections. They obeyed the ruler until he/she had hegemony over state’s affair and revolted when he/she appeared weak. After partition in 1947, the administrative situation became poor especially in the initial years of Pakistan. Nexus of politicians, military and civil bureaucracy did not deliver good governance in new state. People voted in every elections/referendum to their favorites willingly and reiterated their accommodative approach. People cast their votes according to their own likes and dislikes, which based on their self-interest and social needs.

\textsuperscript{232}Ian Talbot, Pakistan: A New History, 154.
Chapter 3  
Political Geography of Punjab  

3.1 Introduction  
The current chapter deals with the political and electoral geography of Punjab province. To map out the electoral geography is a helping tool to understand the social dynamics and political characteristics of the province. The analysis of political geography with reference to elections is important to understand voting trends, behaviour and people’s inclination in the political domain. The study divides the Punjab province into four regions: Northern, Central, Southern and Western Punjab. In first part of the current chapter, the research discusses the electoral politics of the province from 2002 national polls to 2013 polls. Further, it analyzes the elections results, new electoral laws, pre and post-elections scenario, formations of political parties and emerging trends in electoral politics in the province. In the second half of the chapter, it covers the electoral geography of the province. This part explains the overall electoral politics of the province, its geographical boundaries, economy of the different regions, population, and lingual distribution and electoral results. Importantly, the elections results in different parts of the province examine the impact of cultural ethos over voting behaviour.

3.2 Electoral Geography of Punjab  
The Punjab is the second largest and most populous province of the country. The province covers almost fifty-two percent of country’s population, as well as maximum industrial resources of the country. Punjab shares its border with remaining three provinces (Sindh, Baluchistan and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa) of the country as well as with Indian state of Jammu and Kashmir, Indian Punjab, and Rajasthan. Lahore is the political, cultural and economic hub of the country and the capital of the province as well.

233 Political geography deals with human government, boundaries, political units and the demography of the area. While electoral geography deals with methods, behaviour and results of elections with reference to geography. “Political Geography,” Merriam-Webster.
234 The division of the Punjab into four regions helps to understand the different voting behaviour and political ethos of the people in different regions. Andrew Wilder divided the province also in four parts. Andrew R. Wilder, The Pakistani Voter: 34.
In 322 BC, Chandragupta Maurya -head of Mauryan empire- merged Punjab in his existing state of India. In 712 CE, Muslims conquered the lower part of the Punjab and the rest was captured by Mahmud Ghazanavi between 1007-27 CE. After that, the area was ruled by different Muslims rulers of Turks and Afghans till 1526. After that, Punjab came under Mughals’ Raj. In 1747, after the decline of Mughals, Punjab was conquered by Afghan rulers (that time was marked as a period of lawlessness). In mid-nineteen century, before British occupation, native ruler–Ranjit Sigh- ruled Punjab. From 1849 to 1947, British were dominant in the Punjab. After that, according to partition plan envisaged by the British, the Punjab was divided between India and Pakistan, and the western part of Punjab became the part of Pakistan.

After partition, the area was known as Pakistani Punjab and it soon became most developed, urbanized, industrialized and populous part of the country. Its five rivers and canal system made the region rich for agriculture growth. (Information are given below).

Table 3.1: Area and Population of Punjab Province

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Area (Sq. K.M)</th>
<th>% of Area</th>
<th>Population</th>
<th>% of Population</th>
<th>% of Population</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1998 Census (000)</td>
<td>2013 Estimated (000)</td>
<td>Urban Population</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>205345</td>
<td>25.8%</td>
<td>73621</td>
<td>97446</td>
<td>53.7%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Percentage of Area: Percentage of area is calculated to overall area of Pakistan.
Percentage of Population: Percentage of population is calculated to overall population of Pakistan in 1998 and 2013.

Table 3.2: Literacy Rate in Punjab (1998 Census Report)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Literacy</th>
<th>Male Literacy</th>
<th>Female Literacy</th>
<th>Urban Literacy</th>
<th>Rural Literacy</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Percentage</td>
<td>57.2%</td>
<td>35.1%</td>
<td>64.5%</td>
<td>38%</td>
<td>46.6%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Table 3.3: Lingual Distribution in Punjab’s Households

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Punjabi Speaking</th>
<th>Siraiki Speaking</th>
<th>Urdu Speaking</th>
<th>Other Languages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>78.5%</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>4.3%</td>
<td>2.2%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


3.3 Electoral Politics in Punjab (2002-2013)

On the eve of the 20th century, Nawaz Sharif’s government in Pakistan was in full authority. As a Prime Minister, Nawaz Sharif was enjoying the full powers of his office. He forced one Army Chief (Jehangir Karamat), one Chief Justice of Supreme Court (Sajjad Ali Shah) and one President (Farooq Ahmad Leghari) to leave their respective offices. With two-third majority in the National Assembly, he was near to pass the Shariat Bill in 1998.236

In October 1999, when Nawaz Sharif tried to remove army chief General Musharraf, top brass of military retaliated and the country witnessed another military coup. General Musharraf became Chief Executive of the country and all the provincial, national Assemblies and the senate were held in abeyances. Later, he secured the president-ship through uncontested referendum237 and would remain in uniform till 2002.238 To get control in political domain- like his predecessors- he announced local government elections in 2001.239 Later, in October 2002 before the national elections, General Musharraf introduced another amendment -named as Legal


238 Musharraf’s referendum was marked with stories of malpractices and rigging. Even many under-age locals were also cast their vote in favor of General Musharraf while they were in voting age at that time. Author discussion with a presiding officer in the referendum in district Vehari. The question was asked regarding the fairness on referendum in Musharraf regime. June 15, 2016; Rory McCarthy, “Flawed Referendum Gives Musharraf Victory,” The Guardian, May 2, 2002. https://www.theguardian.com/world/2002/may/02/pakistan.rorymccarthy

239 Via Local government elections, Musharraf strengthened his political standing in the country. Offices holders of the local government were helpful for candidates in national elections of 2002. In many cities of Punjab (like, Vehari, Faisalabad, Gujrat, and others), relatives of the office holders in local government contested the national elections of 2002 and 2008. Author’s discussion with an office holders (Anwar Ali, Rafiq Aham, Jamil Gujar) in 2000 local body elections, from Vehari and Rawalpindi district. During the discussion, the question was asked about the role of local government in 2002 national elections. 19-21 March, 2015.
Framework Order (LFO) - for the sake of regimes’ stability. According to the LFO, he would quit the office of chief executive but would remain in the president office. Another part of LFO was that he would continue as chief of army staff and president also. To control the parliament, he reinforced president’s power to dissolve the legislation houses under 58 2(b). Therefore, due to favorable local governments, along with the power of military uniform and presidency, General Musharraf grabbed all the major stakes of the state machinery.

3.1.1 The 2002 National Elections

Weak structure and accommodative attitude of the political parties also helped General Musharraf to strengthen his rule. Most of the Nawaz League’s loyalists left his party and joined the ‘King’s Party’ Pakistan Muslims League Quaid-i-Azam (PML-Q). The shifting of the heavyweights and electables from Nawaz League to PML-Q, weaken the former party in political arena. Nawaz Sharif –who was behind the bar after Musharraf’s coup signed agreement with the military establishment (with the help of Royal family of Saudi Arab) and left the country. According to the agreement, he promised not to come to Pakistan and to participate in politics for the next ten years. This move weakened his political standing in the country and also damaged the popular support of his party. On the other hand, Benazir Bhutto was also in self-exile since 1996. Therefore, the upcoming national elections of 2002 were conducted without these two popular leaders.

241 After 1999 coup, electables of Nawaz League left the party and made the new political party with the PML-Q. That formation was useful for General Musharraf and the party set close relation with the military establishment. Later, PML-Q was supposed as the protégé of General Musharraf. Marco Mezzera, Safiya Aftab, and Sariah Yusuf, “Devolution Row: An Assessment of Pakistan’s 2001 Local Government Ordinance,” Conflict Research Unit, Netherland Institution of International Relations, (2010): 34.
243 After the Musharraf Coup, Nawaz Sharif was arrested in the criminal case of plane high jacking (General Musharraf was in this plan). He was convicted by the court by in that plot and ordered of the life sentence. “Sharif sentenced to life for Musharraf plot.” ‘The Guardian’ April 7, 2007. https://www.theguardian.com/world/2000/apr/07/pakistan.lukeharding
The absence of popular leadership resulted in new political formations and alliances in the country. Before 2002 elections, PML-Q emerged as the strongest political party under the leadership of Mian Azhar and Chaudhry Shujaat Hussain (a senior political figure hailing from Punjab’s rich business family and was the interior minister in Nawaz Sharif’s government). With the support of the electables and military, party got strong hold, especially in Punjab. On the other hand, to protect itself from legal hazards from the establishment- People’s Party (PPP) registered itself as a new political party with the name of Pakistan People’s Party Parliamentarian (PPPPP). Another important alliance of 2002 elections, with the collaboration of religious parties (Mutahida Majlis-e-Amal (MMA), was formed dominated by the Jammat-i-Islami and Jamiat Ulema-e-Islam Fazl-ur-Rehman (JUI-F).

Before 2002 national elections, General Musharraf took some vital steps in the domain of electoral engineering, and he introduced new laws in the electoral politics of the country. Systematic changes in election laws impacted the formation of political parties, numbers of electoral constituencies, numbers of registered voters and the qualifications of candidates (at the time of 2002 national elections –under General Musharraf- 1973 constitution of was suspended). Elections were conducted under Legal Framework Order of 2002 (Chief Executive Order 7, 2002), that had given the legal cover to Elections Commission of Pakistan (ECP). Other systematic changes in elections laws were:

- Law of joint electorates (Joint electorates means both Muslims and non-Muslims can cost vote for the same set of candidates. The law was the part of 1973 constitution, but General Zia disbanded that one during his rule) under the 1973 Constitution was reverted.
- Age for voting was reduced from 21 to 18 years.
- The number of constituencies in national assembly was increased from 207 to 272.

---


248 Under the new legal framework order of 2002, the national assembly seats reached at 272 and total 342 (70 reserved seats). The increase was done according to 1998 census report and one national assembly seat was devoted to the total population of 485,561 in 2002. Church World Service, *The Pakistan Election Compendium*, 37.
To increase the number of women and minorities seats, a new chapter (V-A) was added in the Representation of People Act 1976. Reserved seats for women reached at sixty and ten seats for minorities in national assembly.

No one could take the office of PM or CM for the third term.

Candidates’ qualification to contest the elections should not be less than bachelor’s degree.249

Under these rules, first national elections were held in October 2002. The results were expected, Kings’ Party -PML-Q- was on the driving seat. The party got twenty-six percent votes and seventy-eight national assembly seats, PPPP stood second and got sixty-three NA seats.250 Nawaz League performance was unforeseen. It got just thirteen NA seats and that was the worst party performance in its electoral history. MMA victory surprised the whole country. The alliance of religious parties got 45 seats in the national assembly. A good number of the independent candidates also got success and they were 30 in NA.251

In Punjab province, the situation was in favor of PML-Q, the party got seventy seats out of hundred and forty-eight. The party had also the highest share of the votes in the province that was thirty-four percent (as shown in Chart 2.1). In Punjab, after longtime PPPP performed better in the province and got thirty-five NA seats. The winner of the last national elections (1997), PML-N got just thirteen NA seats (8.7% of the total), while in 1997 party had ninety-five percent of the total NA seats of the province. Independent candidates had also good share in the province and got 15 seats. On the other hand, alliance of small parties, National Alliance (NA was the collation of small political parties, from Punjab ex-President Farooq Leghari’s party was prominent in that alliance) got seven NA seats. Some other small political parties like Zia League also got three seats and Imran Khan’s PTI won a single seat in NA. The details are given below:

---

249 The most obvious change in 2002 elections was educational criteria for candidates. Only Pakistani graduate contested the 2002 elections (Bachelor or equivalent degree according to University Grant Commission Act of 1974). Government of Pakistan, The Conduct of General Elections Order, 2002.


251 Church World Service, The Pakistan Election Compendium, 54.
Table 3.4: Political Parties Position 2002 National Elections- Punjab

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Party Name</th>
<th>Total number of Seats Won</th>
<th>Percentage of Seats</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pakistan People’s Party Parliamentarians (PPPP)</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>24 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pakistan Muslims League Quaid-e-Azam (PML-Q)</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>47%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pakistan Muslims League Nawaz (PML-N)</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>8.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Muttahida Majlis-e-Amal Pakistan (MMA)</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>28= 15 Independent, 13 other Political Parties</td>
<td>19%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>148</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Chart 3.1: Political Parties Votes- Share in the Punjab

2002 general elections

- PML-Q 34%
- PPPP 26%
- PML-N 17%
- Independent 9%
- Others 14%

Source: The Report on 2002 General Elections, ECP.

In Pakistan, the results of the elections are decided on the base of the winner-takes-all system. According to that system, the candidate who takes majority votes of the total in the constituency wins the seat. The system is in favor of popular parties, as in 2002 elections PML-Q got thirty-four percent votes and forty-seven percent of total seats. On the other hand, PML-N had eight percent seats with seventeen percent votes (as shown in chart 2.1).

---

Changes in the elections laws were done for the sake of stable and purposeful electoral democracy in the country. In General Musharraf's view, democratic process practiced in the country was not delivering positive results and was doing nothing for the welfare of the people. But in 2002 elections, the people’s voting choices remained unchanged. Electable, heavyweights and patronage relations with candidates remained dominant in people’s choice. The results of 2002 elections also proved the past trends of people’s choice in the province. They voted into power the same leaders who were the custodians of the status-quo in the country.

3.3.2 The 2008 National Elections

From 2002 to 2008, all political settlements, constitutional amendments, exercise of electoral laws and curtailing the powers of the higher judiciary were done just to strengthen General Musharraf's regime. General Musharraf did everything for his survival what he could. He supported his favorite political parties in 2002 elections, forced elected members to change their loyalties, sought agreements both with the rightists and leftists political parties and used all means to get favorable objectives. Most of the political parties, their leaders and members of legislation houses were keen to cooperate with Musharraf as per their interests.

---

253 Many candidates, who left Nawaz League and joined PML-Q won the elections from their respective seats. Elections Commission of Pakistan, Reports on General Elections 2002.

254 The poor performance of Nawaz League was the exact example of that trend. The results of 2002 elections were worse in the political history of the party. Ibid.
The story of political settlements and constitutional breaches started just after the arrival of General Musharraf as Chief Executive. Almost every political party, its leaders and judiciary played their respective role to prolong Musharraf’s rule. First, higher courts allowed him to rule the country for three years (1999 to 2002). After that, ex-PM Nawaz Sharif and his family made an agreement with Musharraf’s government and preferred exile rather than life imprisonment in the Pakistani jail. Just after Nawaz Sharif demise, members of his party sought shelter near military establishment. PML-Q provided them the stage from where they could sustain their political strength.

In 2002 presidential referendum, almost every political party was with him. After 2002 national elections, many elected political figures from different groups gave full support to Musharraf which enabled him to form the government of his own choice in the country. A split group from PPP (a group of ten elected members from national assembly helped Q-League to make government in center). MQM and National Alliance joined hand with PML-Q and supported the party to get required votes in national and provincial assemblies. The move helped PML-Q to have its PM – Zafairullah Khan Jamali- in the national assembly, and its Chief Minister-Pervaiz Ilahi- in the Punjab as well. The party was also having clear majority in other provinces. In 2003, the alliance of religious parties -MMA- facilitated his rule and helped passing the 17th Constitutional Amendment from NA and Senate. This amendment provided a constitutional cover to 2002 LFO and made it the part of the constitution. Under this agreement, Musharraf took the vote of confidence from all legislation houses successfully. Musharraf’s whole career in the presidency was due to his shrewd advisors and lawmakers. Almost every year during his presidency, he had to do some amendments and changes in country’s law.

Musharraf’s promise of democracy at grassroots level and accountability across-the-board was not different from past’s sham democracy and accountability. In his regime, the personalized politics reached its peak, Musharraf’s reforms in electoral politics, localized the national politics and politicized the administration. His political reforms and constitutional

257 Talbot, Pakistan: A New History, 180.
258 Ibid., 193.
amendments made the country ‘graveyards of institutions’ and encouraged clientelism. His National Accountability Bureau (NAB) investigated corrupt politicians, bureaucrats and businessmen. But his loyal corrupt politicians were never investigated under the bureau. The NAB was also used as a tool to get favor for the regime.

His attempts to prolong his rule created problems for himself and forced him to join the hands with others. His second attempt to become president (from elected assembly in 2002 elections) had a lot of constitutional hurdles. The biggest one was Supreme Court and its chief justice (CJ) Iftikhar Chaudhary. To get rid of him and his colleagues, he forced CJ Chaudhary to reign. That action caused mass protest and a strong ‘Lawyers Movement’ started throughout the country. After this, the popularity of Musharraf started falling and his government became weak day by day. Another thing that weakened his rule was his retirement from the office of chief of army staff. The step weakened his grip over government’s affairs.

But the biggest unwise step that Musharraf did during his time was National Reconciliation Ordinance (NRO) of 2007. The agreement was signed among Musharraf, PPP, and MQM. The ordinance bound the government “to withdraw from the prosecution of any person, including an absconding accused, who is found to be falsely involved for political reasons or through political victimization in any case initiated between 1st day of January 1986 to 12th day of October 1999.” Biggest beneficiaries of that ordinance were Benazir Bhutto, her spouse Asif Ali Zardari and MQM as a party. Even the thousands of criminal cases against the political workers of MQM were withdrawn. NRO of 2007 provided a chance to criminals and corrupt politicians of the past to rule the country.

---

264 During PPP’s government, PM Benazir’s husband Zardari was famous as ‘Mr. Ten Percent’ due to his corruption and after National Reconciliation Ordinance (NRO) with Musharraf he became the President of Pakistan for five years (2008-13). MQA and its leadership were the other beneficiaries of this NRO. More than three thousands criminal cases were withdrawn against top leadership of the party. “3576 criminal cases against Altaf, others were withdrawn.” *The Nation*, November 14, 2009. http://nation.com.pk/politics/14-Nov-2009/3576-criminal-cases-against-Altaf-others-withdrawn
indirectly a cause of the current wave of corruption in the country and violence in Karachi (in the post-Musharraf era, 2008 onward). The people as well as democratic process in the country are still suffering from that ordinance. That ordinance did no good to Musharraf as he had to resign in 2008 after national elections.

On societal level, people remained accommodative and the ethos of political culture remained intact with social norms. They not only welcomed the coup but also there was no protest in the country. People overwhelmingly participated in the political activities. People participated in the 2001 local government elections and other political activities of that time. Both the voters and candidates got benefits and were enthusiastic about the new system in local governments.\textsuperscript{265} The voting turnout was also good in 2002 national elections (42%). Owing to economic stability, people were satisfied to a great extent. Almost twelve million new job opportunities were created till 2008 and unemployment rate reached 6.5 percent from 8.4 percent.\textsuperscript{266}

People were satisfied with economic performance of Musharraf’s era.\textsuperscript{267} People’s accommodativeness with Musharraf’s regime continued till he remained in power. People stood against him massively in lawyers' movement which was initiated to support CJ Ifthikar Chaudry. Musharraf was in deep water due to constitutional problems (In lawyer movement, people came out to restore the CJ Chaudhary). Besides the popularity of lawyer movement, the arrival of Nawaz Sharif and Benazir Bhutto and NRO also damaged the Musharraf’s popularity, in on time. At that time massive load shedding of electricity and natural gas- for domestic use- fueled the situation and became a reason of people’s popular agitation. Later, in December 2007, unfortunate assassination of Benazir Bhutto made the situation worse and people, especially from Sindh province saw, Musharraf and his government responsible for the incident. After all these happenings, people voted against his regime in 2008 national elections.

\textsuperscript{265} In Vehari people’s interest and conscious in local government elections of 2000 and 2005 were high. Author did interviews with elected people in this set-up. They called Musharraf’s local government was best to serve the common the people and they elected members have enough resources and rights under this system. Author’s discussion with the elected Nazim (Tariq Akhtar) of union council (UC) in 2005 local government elections (the questions was asked regarding impact of political developments of Musharraf era on local politics). March 22, 2015.

\textsuperscript{266} Poverty was also reduced, GDP and foreign exchange reserve were also got good number. Husain, “The Role of Politics in Pakistan’s Economy,”

\textsuperscript{267} Author’s discussion with Safdar Sahi (ex-nazim from Rawalpindi district), Saqib Iqbal (A local business from Gujranwala district) on September 2016. In this discussion, author asked the questions regarding the best era in the history of Pakistan.
The results of 2008 national elections were shocking for Musharraf’s regime and his political ally PML-Q. The Party (PML-Q) performed bad in the elections. Most of its heavyweights lost the elections badly, (party chairman Chaudhry Shujaat Hussain lost his home seat from Gujrat district) and the party got just forty-one NA seats. Due to Benazir’s assassination, sympathy factor favored PPPP and it got ninety-five NA seats that reached hundred and twenty-two after the addition of reserve seats. PML-N performed better than the last elections and won seventy-two seats and reached on ninety-two in the house of three hundred and forty-two.

In Punjab province, PML-N got its old electoral glory, the party got forty-two percent of total province’s seats of NA and twenty-nine percent total votes. PPPP was also in good position and got forty-three national assembly seats out of hundred and forty-eight with twenty-eight percent votes. PML had good percentage of total votes, twenty-nine percent, highest in the province. But it could bag only nineteen seats from the province. Independents got potential number in the province and won thirteen seats.

Table 3.5: Political Parties Position 2008 National Elections- Punjab

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Party Name</th>
<th>Total number of Seats Won</th>
<th>Percentage of Seats</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pakistan People’s Party Parliamentarians (PPPP)</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>29%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pakistan Muslims League (PML)</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>19.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pakistan Muslims League Nawaz (PML-N)</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>42%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>9.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>148</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Chart 3.3: Political Parties Share in Votes (Punjab)
In 2008 national polls, Nawaz League was in driving seats. Party got twenty-nine percent votes and forty-two percent seats, while PML-Q and its allies had greater share in votes but got just nineteen percent of seats and stood third in the province. PPPP had 29 percent of votes and approximately same percentage of seats.

**Chart 3.4: Difference between Percentage of NA Seats and Percentage of Votes (Punjab)**

Source: Report on 2008 General Elections, ECP.

3.3.3 The 2013 National Elections

The results of national polls in 2008 had created some hope for good governance and democratic rule in the country. There were several indicators of optimism in the post-elections scenario; first one was the defeat of Musharraf’s allies by popular political parties and decline of
President Musharraf (who later he resigned from his post after 2008 elections). Second, the mainstream political parties – PPP & PML-N - were on the same page and ready to cooperate with each other to strengthen the democratic norms in the country (the party signed charter of democracy). The third one was brighter than the other two, the positivity of the lawyer’s movement and activism of civil society made people hopeful about the rule of justice in the country.

Unfortunately, all these hopes faded soon. Democratic rule, good governance, and rule of justice were in shamble, when PPP’s set its government in the center. The coalition between PPP and Nawaz League was short-lived, and tussle became open. The controversial widower of Benazir Bhutto – Asif Ali Zardari became the president and PPP-led government created the new history of corruption and mismanagement. Due to poor economic management, inflation peaked at twenty-five percent, foreign reserves declined and reached on $3.4 billion and fear of default was in sight. The power shortage became so serious that mass protest against load shedding became violent in some cities of the country.

The episode of lawyers’ activism became problematic in the country. Unfortunately, lawyers' movement could not deliver any useful service to democracy after removing Musharraf. After the restoration of Iftikhar Chaudhary as CJ (due to the efforts of lawyers), the lawyers’ movement converted into a violent chapter in the history of the country. The bullying of lawyers (famously known as Wakheel Gardi), fighting with police and horrifying of judges became a harsh reality. The flop episode of lawyers’ movement was really disappointing because the country had a short history of such social uprising and activism. The slogan of that movement

---

269 Talbot, Pakistan: A New History, 213.
270 Poor economy, massive power shortage, and corruption scandals were the main features of PPP’s government in 2008 to 2013. PM Yousaif Raza Gallaine was dismissed by the Supreme Court due to his non-cooperation in the corruption cases against Asif Ali Zardari. Dr Niaz Murtaza, “The Worst Era Ever?” Dawn, April 9, 2013. https://www.dawn.com/news/801357
272 The researcher witnessed a mass protest in the Vehari city against load shedding in May 2012. People burnt the local office WAPDA, other public properties and public offices of MNAs and MPAs.
274 The leaders of the movement gave the slogan of this movement, Riyasat Hogi MAA Kay Jaisai [State Would be Act Like Mother]. YouTube. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Om5n4ck-wnI

66
was much attractive and common people had pinned high hopes upon the lawyers’ movement, but their hopes dashed to ground.

In post-2008 elections, major political parties were still the personal property of the party leaders and were still away from true democratic norms. Members of legislation assemblies continued to work as sycophants of powerful political figures and assumed as rent-seeking attitude. In that whole situation, hopes of true democracy and good governance just remained dreams of the state of Pakistan.

The wave of terrorism in the country reached its peak in 2008. Terrorist attacks, counter-insurgency operations and the US sponsored drone strike were frequent. During 2008 to 2103, the death casualties of civilians and armed personnel were higher since 9/11. Almost seventy percent of fatal and tragic blasts were executed from 2008-13. Owing to high wave of terrorism, USA raid on OBL and diplomatic crisis, the civil-military relations were tense most of the time during PPPP’s regime.

Despite all the poor performance of PPPP government, its amendments in the constitution of 1973 were remarkable and (during 2008 to 2013). Especially the 18th amendment in 1973 constitution was exceptional in the constitutional history of the country. In 2010, PPPP’s government curtailed the powers of the president and abolished the extra-constitutional powers that Musharraf enjoyed during his regime- via eighteen, nineteen and twenty amendments in the 1973 Constitution. Other salient features of these amendments were that it bounded the PM to seek the consent of opposition in the selections of caretaker PM and Chief Election Commissioner (CEC). Under these amendments, PM became the head of Council of Common Interest and provinces got greater share in decisions making. No doubt, these were good

---

275 Talbot, Pakistan: A New History, 213.
276 From 2003 to 2017, more than sixty thousand people were died in terrorist attacks or in counter-insurgency operations in the country. From 2008 to 2013 the toll was more that forty-three thousand, “Fatalities in Terrorist Violence in Pakistan 2003-2017,” South Asian Terrorism Portal (SATP). http://www.satp.org/satporgtp/countries/pakistan/database/casualties.htm
measures to control the authoritarianism in the country and gave more autonomy to the provinces.

During Zardari’s era, the rise of Imran Khan and Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf (PTI) was also exceptional in the electoral history of the country. In 2011, the traditional stakeholders of Pakistan’s electoral politics faced a challenge in shape of Imran Khan’s PTI. After fifteen years of party’s birth, the rise of PTI was not an ordinary phenomenon in the political discourse of the country.\textsuperscript{279} The huge political rally of the party in Lahore- October 2011- created a serious challenge for traditional political parties. The rise of Khan and its party in 2013 elections -as potential actor in the electoral politics- challenged the political elites and electoral status quo in the country.\textsuperscript{280} That rise of PTI attracted the people of the country and politician as well. Within days, PTI became the third prominent political party after PPPP and Nawaz League. The factors behind that rise are interesting and not different from the past traditions.\textsuperscript{281} Since his cricket career, Khan has a charismatic personality, and even before the 2011 rise, he was a popular figure in the country. He was popular among cricket lovers and young generation, but not yet in electoral scenario.\textsuperscript{282} Khan’s defeat in national elections showed that how much Pakistani voters were attached with personal patronage, clientelism, and rationality. Even the Khan’s rise in post-2011 era was not too much diversion from traditional political discourse. People supported Khan due to his personal charisma and due to poor performance and governance of PPPP’s led government. Later, the participation of opportunist politicians and electable made Khan’s PTI a strong contender in upcoming national elections of 2013. The rise of Kahn’s PTI was not

\textsuperscript{280} Electoral status quo means that since the start of electoral activities in 1970, only two political parties (PPPP and Muslims League) had dominated the national politics till 2008 national elections. Even in Musharraf regime, the rise of Q-League was also not a different because the party was grouped due to split members of Nawaz league. Imran Khan’s PTI first time emerged as the third political power in the country. Government of Pakistan, Elections Commission of Pakistan, \textit{General Elections 2013, Report Volume II}, (Islamabad: ECP, 2013), 41-111.
\textsuperscript{282} Imran Khan’s political party (PTI) defeated in national elections of 1997 and 2002 badly. Elections Commission of Pakistan, \textit{Reports of General Elections 1997 and 2002}. 68
different from the PPP in ZA Bhutto’s era. Personality charisma is a common factor between both the parties. As PPP is spineless without Bhutto, so is PTI without Imran Khan.

Regarding above-mentioned factors, the national polls of 2013 became interesting and important for the country. On the national level, three political parties came to contest. PML-N seemed powerful in Punjab and PPPP in Sindh, even before the elections. PTI was in a position to challenge the hegemony of these parties, especially in the Punjab. After a gap of sixteen years, Nawaz Sharif came to contest the elections and proved himself as the most popular leader in the country. But PTI’s campaign tactics and its massive electoral rallies were the real threat to Nawaz League’s electoral hegemony in Punjab province. The youth of the country was skillfully mobilized by Imran Khan which also proved a valuable asset for Khan.

Nawaz Sharif got clearance to contest the elections boosted the morale of the party. The presence of electable, good electoral strategies and party’s government in Punjab gave a potential edge to Nawaz League even before the elections. The pre-poll surveys also predicted the Nawaz’s League success in upcoming elections. The results of 2013 gave a big surprise to PTI’s voters and even to the political pundits. Nawaz League won hundred and twenty-nine NA seats out of two hundred and seventy-two (reached hundred and eighty-three in the house of three hundred and forty-two). It was its best performance after 1997 national elections. PPPP got just thirty-six NA seats. PTI’s performance was not according to electoral predictions as party performed poorly and got twenty-six NA seats. PTI stood third according to numbers of seats, but the party got more than seven million votes and stood second.

On the provincial level (in Punjab), all top three parties had different areas of influence. Out of hundred and twenty-nine NA seats, Nawaz League got hundred and eighteen seats only.

283 ZA Bhutto said, “I am People’s Party and they all are my creatures.” Tahir Amin, “1977 Coup D’état in Pakistan.”
284 PTI started its electoral campaign in new style. Party’s songs and slogans became very popular among the people. The gathering was massive in its rallies even the people of every age were the part of these political rallies. The Author witnessed many old age men and women were the part of political gathering during 2013 elections campaign in Rawalpindi and Vehari district. March 2013.
286 Nawaz Sharif and his party workers are considered experienced and old players in the electoral politics of Pakistan. They know, how to contest the elections. Even the surveys before the 2013 elections predicted Nawaz League electoral success. Author’s discussion with some political workers of Nawaz League in Lahore, Multan, and Rawalpindi. The question was asked about the reasons of Nawaz League success in 2013 national elections. August, 2016.
288 Nawaz League was on top with more than 14.9 million votes and PPPP on third with almost seven million (6911218) votes. Ibid.
from Punjab – that was the eighty percent of total province’s NA seats - and remaining seats were from the rest of the country. PPPP won just two seats from Punjab and all the remaining from Sindh province. While KPK proved the strong zone of PTI and the party got seventeen seats from the province, and only eight from Punjab. The winner of 2002 national polls – Q-League cum PML- had just two NA seats from the Punjab.

Table 3.6: Political Parties Position 2013 National Elections- Punjab

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Party Name</th>
<th>Total number of Seats Won</th>
<th>Percentage of Seats</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pakistan People’s Party Parliamentarians (PPPP)</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pakistan Muslims League (PML)</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pakistan Muslims League Nawaz (PML-N)</td>
<td>118</td>
<td>80%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf (PTI)</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>17 (15 Independents)</td>
<td>11.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>147</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Report on 2013 General Elections, ECP.

Chart 3.5: Political Parties Share in Votes -2013 National Elections (Punjab)

---

289 Nawaz-League got one seat each from Sindh, Baluchistan, Fata and Capital and won four seats from Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KPK). Ibid.
Chart 3.6: Difference between Percentage of NA Seats and Percentage of Votes (Punjab)

Source: Report on 2013 General Elections, ECP.
The above charts show the difference between percentage of votes and percentage of seats in 2013 national elections. As a political party, N-League was the biggest beneficiary of winner-take-all system. Party had eighty percent of NA seats from province with forty percent of votes. On the other hand, both PPPP and PTI suffered these elections. PPPP had just two percent seats with eight percent votes while PTI got eighteen percent votes and just five percent seats.

**3.4 Geographical and Electoral Distribution of Punjab**

**3.5 Northern Punjab**

Northern Punjab is the smallest unit of the Punjab province, consisting of Rawalpindi division only. The division covers Attock, Chakwal, Jhelum and Rawalpindi districts. Northern Punjab is in sub-montane Indus region and dominated by Potohar plateau. Jhelum River and Salt range are on the southern side of the region and separates it from the rest of the Punjab. On the Western side, Indus River separates the Punjab province from Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KPK) province. Margalla hills are on the northern side of the region and in Northeast Himalayan foothills bordered the region from Azad Kashmir.

Northern Punjab covers 10.8 percent area of the province with 8.66 million population in 2013. According to the statistic in 2013, almost 63 percent population live in rural parts and remaining thirty-seven percent are in the urban zones of the region; and this ratio of urban population is the highest in Punjab (Table 2.7). According to 1998 census, Northern Punjab has also highest literacy rate in the province which was 61 percent (Table 2.7 and 2.8). Even according to 1982 census report, the region had double literacy rate than the western and southern part of the province.

The reasons behind high urbanization and literacy rate in northern Punjab have been historical as well as modern. First, because of developed railway and road network in British era, the region got an edge over the other parts of the province. Secondly, the high ratio of inhabitants of this area serving in military and other services groups bettered people's lot much in socio-economic fields. Quite a good number of people of Northern Punjab have been working for years in Middle East and in European countries. This factor has also played an effective role in bettering the socio-economic and political culture of this area of the province.

---

290 The geographical distribution of Punjab, as per the elections results and political trends. Wilder, *The Pakistani Voter*, 50-56.
### Table 3.7: Area and Population of Northern Punjab

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Region</th>
<th>Area (Sq. K.M)</th>
<th>% of Area</th>
<th>Population</th>
<th>% of Urban Population</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1998 Census (000)</td>
<td>2013 Estimated (000)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Northern Punjab</td>
<td>22253</td>
<td>10.8%</td>
<td>6660</td>
<td>9.04%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


### Table 3.8: Literacy Rate in Northern Punjab (1998 Census Report)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Literacy</th>
<th>Male Literacy</th>
<th>Female Literacy</th>
<th>Urban Literacy</th>
<th>Rural Literacy</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>% of literacy</td>
<td>75.5%</td>
<td>46.5%</td>
<td>70%</td>
<td>56%</td>
<td>61.3%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


#### 3.5.1 Economy of Northern Punjab

Demography of the Northern Punjab has a vital impact on the economy of the region. Hilly and mountainous terrain made the area difficult for agriculture cultivation. The region has less than one percent of irrigated land of total Punjab, which is the lowest than the other part of the province. The agriculture sector had nearly forty percent of the total labor force which was fewer in 1981 census report. The agriculture sector of the region has only six percent share of wheat and none in rice and sugarcane crops. Apart from poor agriculture production, northern side of the Punjab has also low number of industrial units. According to development statistics of 2013, northern Punjab has only 133 working factories out of total 3590 in the province.

Poor agriculture conditions and low number of industrial units forced the inhabitants to join the service sector. The region has the highest share of government servants which was nearly eighteen percent in 1981. In urban areas of the region, one-third of the entire labor force is government employees. Since the British Raj, the region was considered as the best recruiting ground for government servants.

---

293 According to 1998 census report, 11% of the total population in the Punjab province was government’s employees. In Northern Punjab, 19.8% of the total labor force were employed by the government. Government of Punjab, *Handbook of Population Census Data 1998.*
center for the military. In World War I, nearly forty percent of male’s population of the northern Punjab was the part of the British army. Even now Pakistan army has a good number of soldiers and officers from the northern Punjab. The other major source of economy of the region is migrant’s labor force. The districts of the northern Punjab provide big amount of the labor force to Gulf and European countries. The remittances of these workers boomed the economy as well as other development sectors of the region. Despite poor agriculture and industrial development, the region plays an important role in the political economy of the country due to a high number of service personnel in the Pakistan Army and other government’s sectors.

3.5.2 Electoral Politics in Northern Punjab (2002-13)

Northern Punjab has been a strong zone of Nawaz League in almost every national election. Since the formation of the party in 1993, it performed exceptionally well in this zone, except 2002. In 2002, when Nawaz Sharif and family were exiled and the party was facing Musharraf’s ire, the party had just two seats from the region out of fourteen. Despite 2002 elections, PML-N had seventy percent of total seats from the region. In 1993 and 1997 national elections, party got more than ninety percent of NA seats of the region. In 2002 elections, even Nawaz League had a bad time as most ex-members of the party won the elections from the platform of different political parties, like PML-Q, or as independent candidates. 2002 election was the only elections when PPPP performed well in the northern Punjab (except 1970) by bagging 3 seats. Even in 1998, 1993 and 2008 national elections when PPPP formed its government in the center-party never got good numbers of NA seats from the region (which is adjacent to capital). In 2013, PPPP did not win a single seat out of fourteen from the region, while the last PM of the party- Raja Pervez Ashraf- hailed from Rawalpindi district of Northern Punjab (as shown in Table). In 2013, Imran Khan’s PTI challenged Nawaz League in the urban zones of Northern Punjab. Imran Khan won two seats from Rawalpindi

---

296 Most of Q-League’s elected members were the part of Nawaz’s party and people like Sheikh Rasheed-Nawaz Sharif ex-stalwart- won the two seats as an independent candidate. Election Commission of Pakistan, *Report on General Elections 2002*.
district.\textsuperscript{298} Even in the urban zones of North Punjab PTI gave a tough challenge to Nawaz League and remained runner-up.\textsuperscript{299}

### Table 3.9: Elections Results of Districts – Northern Punjab

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Political Parties</td>
<td>Political Parties</td>
<td>Political Parties</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>PPP P</td>
<td>PML -Q</td>
<td>PML -N</td>
<td>Other s</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rawalpindi</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attock</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jhelum</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chakwal</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>14</strong></td>
<td><strong>3</strong></td>
<td><strong>5</strong></td>
<td><strong>2</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


### 3.6 Central Punjab

Geographically, central Punjab lies in the central of the province. It is not only the geographical center of the province, but it has pivotal importance in province’s politics, economy and social life. It is most urbanized, populated, industrialized and agriculturally rich zone of the province. Central Punjab comprises more than half national assembly seats of the province (since 2002 national elections, central Punjab has seventy-eight NA seats out of the province’s hundred and forty-eight total seats). All these factors made this region a game changer in the decision making of the province as well as of the country.

Central Punjab has 57155 sq. Km of area (that covers 27.8 percent of the total area of Punjab province) and consists of fifteen districts and five divisions of the province.\textsuperscript{300} The zone

---

\textsuperscript{298} Imran Khan won elections from NA-55 and Ghulam Sarwar Khan won from NA-53. Party’s close ally Sheikh Rasheed also won its seat from NA-56 with the assistance of the party. Election Commission of Pakistan, Reports on the General Elections 2013.

\textsuperscript{299} PTI’s candidates remained runner-up in seven constituencies out of ten where Nawaz League’s candidates stood first in 2013 national elections. Ibid.

\textsuperscript{300} This research excluded Bhakkar, Khushab, and Mianwali from Sargodha division, Jhang from Faisalabad division and Pakpattan from Sahiwal division and included these cities in Southern and Western part of the province.
comprises Lahore, Sheikhpura, Kasur, Nankana Sahib are the districts of Lahore Division. Faisalabad, Chiniot, Toba Tek Singh are the districts of Faisalabad Division. Sahiwal and Okara are districts of Sahiwal Division, and Sargodha and Khushab are the districts of Sargodha Division. Gujranwala Division is the biggest division of Central Punjab and consists of Gujranwala, Gujrat, Hafizabad, Mandi Baha-ud-Din, Narowal, and Sialkot districts. Central Punjab is the home of five rivers that fertilizes the rich land of the zone. The Jhelum Rivers is located on the boundary of northern and central Punjab, the Sutlej River is on the boundary of central and southern Punjab. Between these two rivers, the Chenab and the Ravi River flow in the region. The rich agriculture land alongside these rivers and the finest canal system of the world in central Punjab has made the region most prosperous in the whole province.

Fertile agriculture land made central Punjab most populated zone in the province. According to 1998 census report, the population of the region was approximately 38.7 million and reached 50.8 million in 2013. The region covers more than 52 percent of the total population with the highest urban population of 34.6 percent (as shown in Tables 2.11 & 2.12). More that 95 percent of the regions’ inhabitants speak the Punjabi language while 3.6 percent speak Urdu. The literacy rate of Central Punjab (46.9 percent according 1998 census report) is quite higher than the literacy rate of the southern and western part of the province.

Table 3.10: Area and Population of Central Punjab

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Region</th>
<th>Area (Sq. K.M)</th>
<th>% of Area</th>
<th>Population</th>
<th>% of Urban Population</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1998 Census (000)</td>
<td>% of Population</td>
<td>2013 Estimated (000)</td>
<td>% of Population</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Central Punjab</td>
<td>57155</td>
<td>27.8%</td>
<td>38695</td>
<td>52.5%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Table 3.11: Literacy Rate in Northern Punjab (1998 Census Report)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Literacy</th>
<th>Male Literacy</th>
<th>Female Literacy</th>
<th>Urban Literacy</th>
<th>Rural Literacy</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Male Literacy</td>
<td>57%</td>
<td>36.5%</td>
<td>60.9%</td>
<td>40%</td>
<td>46.9%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
3.6.1 Economy of Central Punjab

In a society like Punjab, the political power and social status of people are closely related\textsuperscript{301}. The higher in social status means higher in political status. The electables of the region have owned big jageerrs [agriculture lands]. These electables have been influential and dominant in settling social matters of their areas and successful in electoral politics as well. Canal colonies developed by the British made central Punjab rich and prosperous in agriculture and hegemonic in the political sphere of the province. Lands granted in Lyallpur (Faisalabad), Shahpur (Sargodha) and Chenab colonies were earmarked according to the status of the people. For example, in the canal colony of Lyallpur, 27.8 acres (one square miles) land was granted to peasants of the area in Lyallpur while 55.6 acres (two square miles) in Shahpur colony.\textsuperscript{302} Further, five to six square miles were given to yeoman farmers for the development of colony. While huge acres of land were given to landed elites for the sake of political benefits for strengthening the British Raj.\textsuperscript{303}

After the partition, the agriculture of central Punjab remained thriving. In post-partition era, the region has more than forty-five percent of province’s agriculture land and forty-seven percent of its agriculture labor force. With the help of rich massive land, efficient labor force and fine irrigation system, central Punjab cultivated (in 1991-92) forty-six percent of province wheat, sixty-eight percent of its sugarcane and eighty-two percent of its rice.\textsuperscript{304}

With the passage of time, central Punjab did great progress in the field of industry after partition in 1947. According to 2013 statistical report of Government of Punjab, the region had two-third industrial/manufacturing units of the province (that was more than twenty-six hundred out of thirty-five hundred) and seventy percent of industrial labor force of the province hailed from the region.\textsuperscript{305} Most of the regions’ industrial units are established along with Grand Trunk Road. Faisalabad division is popular due to its textile industries and the city of Sialkot is world-

\textsuperscript{301}Wilder, The Pakistani Voter, 39.
\textsuperscript{303} Wilder, The Pakistani Voter, 39.
\textsuperscript{304} Government of the Punjab, Punjab Development Statistics 2013, 94.
\textsuperscript{305} Ibid.,
renowned due its sports goods and surgical instruments. The richest industrialists of the country (like PM Nawaz Sharif and family) and business tycoons (like Mian Mansha and Malik Riaz) have their strength in central part of the Punjab province. Therefore, rich agricultural land, highest number of industrial units, business giants and powerful politicians made the region prominent and vital in country’s decision making.

3.6.2 Electoral Politics in Central Punjab (2002-13)

Owing to big population and maximum number of electoral constituencies (central Punjab has 52% of electoral NA seats of Punjab province and 28% from whole country), central Punjab plays key role in the electoral politics of the province as well as of the country. Since 1970 national polls, the winner party from this region has been successful in forming government in the center as well.\textsuperscript{306} In 1970, 1988, 1993 PPP got maximum seats from the region, while in 2002 Q-League was on the top.\textsuperscript{307}

The electoral record reveals that since 1990s to onward, the region belongs to Nawaz League. Even in 2002, when the party could not perform well in the center, it proved its worth in the zone. In 2002 elections, the party (PMN-L) elections, when party’s leadership was in exile, the party could bag just thirteen seats from the whole province, ten from central Punjab (as shown in table 2.13). In 2008, and 2013 national elections, PMN-N won the region overwhelmingly, having 39 NA seats in 2008, and 73 (out of total 78) in 2013 national polls. The heavyweights of the party, other than Sharif family, also hailed from central Punjab. The important cabinet members (after 2013 national polls) also have their constituencies in the region.\textsuperscript{308} Due to strong hold in the region, party gave special focus to the region in development budget. In 2016-17 development budget of the whole province, the Lahore district had fifty-eight percent share.\textsuperscript{309} Even during electoral campaign, the region was the center of party’s activities.

### Table 3.12: Elections Results of Districts – Central Punjab

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Political Parties</td>
<td></td>
<td>Political Parties</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>PPP P</td>
<td>PML -Q</td>
<td>PML -N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sargodha</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gujranwala</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MandiBah a-ud-Din</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Narowal</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sialkot</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hafizabad</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gujrat</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lahore</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sheikhpura</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kasur</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Faisalabad</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chiniot</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toba Tek Singh</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sahiwal</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Okara</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


### 3.7 Southern Punjab

South Punjab is less developed, less urbanized and less industrialized zone than the north and the center zones. South Punjab covers Multan, Vehari, Khanewal and Lodhran districts of Multan division, Pakpattan of Sahiwal Dision, Bahawalpur, Bahawalnagar, and Rahim Yar Khan
districts of Bahawalpur division. On the western side of south Punjab, Chenab River flows and meets with Ravi at Khanewal district. The Ravi and the Sutlej rivers separate the S. Punjab from the central Punjab. On the eastern side of the region it touches Indian border and in South meets with Sindh province. The famous ‘Thar Desert’ covers most part of Bahawalpur division and across it, the Rajasthan province of India is located.

According to 1998 census report, the Southern Punjab had a population of sixteen million, about twenty-two percent of the whole province and covered nearly thirty percent of province’s area. In 2013, the population reached twenty-one million, having urban population just twenty-four percent. Literacy rate remains very poor and lowest in whole Punjab (shown in Tables 2.14 & 2.15).

The region has a good number of Siraiki speaking people (40.7%), Punjabi speaking population is however still dominant (51.4%) zone. Siraiki speaking people are in majority in cities like Multan, Lodhran, Bahawalpur and Rahim Yar Khan and especially in the rural areas of these cities. On the other hand, Khanewal, Vehari, and Bahawalnagar have more than eighty percent of Punjabi speaking people and especially in the urban part of the southern Punjab. Urdu is the third largest language (6.5%) of south Punjab and Urdu speaking people are greater in number than the central Punjab.

The movement for separate Siraiki province got energies in the region when PPPP was in government (2008-13) and a Siraiki speaking PM -Yousaf Raza Gillani- took the office. The demand of the movement was a separate province for Siraiki speaking people. 310 The South Punjab is a deprived zone in the Punjab, and the development budget of whole region was less than Lahore district in 2106. The leaders of the movement think that discrimination with Siraiki speaking people is due to Punjabis dominance in political and administrative sphere of the province. Apart from the language issue, Siraiki province is a genuine need of the local people. As maximum administrative powers are concentrated in the capital of the Province, Lahore, the people of Siraiki belt have to make long and expensive travels for the solution of their pressing problems. But unfortunately, the movement became weak when PPPP lost the 2013 national poll from the Southern Punjab.

Table 3.13: Area and Population of Southern Punjab

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Region</th>
<th>Area (Sq. K.M)</th>
<th>% of Area</th>
<th>Population</th>
<th>% of Urban Population</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>South Punjab</td>
<td>60799</td>
<td>29.6%</td>
<td>16082</td>
<td>21.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2013</td>
<td>22.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Estimated</td>
<td>23.9%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Table 3.14 Literacy Rate in Southern Punjab (1998 Census Report)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Literacy</th>
<th>Male Literacy</th>
<th>Female Literacy</th>
<th>Urban Literacy</th>
<th>Rural Literacy</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>48%</td>
<td>23.5%</td>
<td>56%</td>
<td>28%</td>
<td>36.5%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


3.7.1 Economy of Southern Punjab

The Southern Punjab has been the worst victim of feudal lords' injustices. They have been suffering from economic and social exploitation since the British Raj. The canal colonies and settlement of lands under British rule affected the life of the poor people of this region miserably. After partition, dominance of the feudocracy played decisive role in shaping political-economy of the Southern Punjab (due to lands settlement of British). On the other hand, landed class seemed feeble in the current politics of central Punjab.

People of the Southern Punjab are highly dependent on the agriculture sector. More than fifty percent of the population is directly related to the agriculture. The agriculture class of the region benefited much from cotton cultivation, and the area produced sixty-five percent of the total cotton of Punjab province. According to the statistics in 1998, the region shared twenty-six percent of province’s wheat, sixteen percent of sugarcane and seven percent of rice (with more than thirty percent of Punjab’s irrigated land). Sometimes natural calamities, as massive

---

312 Javid, *Class, Power, and Patronage*, 77-81.
313 The cotton crop was considered as a capital crop of south Punjab till a few years back. But now due to viruses attack on cotton is creating problems for local small farmers. The output of cotton became very low in recent years. Rana Abid, M. Abdullah, Anjum Pervaiz (formers from district Vehari and Khanawal) discussion with author regarding the social indicators of the district, February 21-28, 2016.
floods or hailstorms and windstorms, have been devastating for the agriculture class. During last five years the small farmers have suffered much because of unfavorable weathers.

In Punjab’s total labor force, only fifteen percent of the Southern regions’ labor forces were in government service and thirteen percent were in the manufacturing sector in 1998. Out of thirty-five hundred manufacturing units in Punjab, the region had nearly five hundred. In recent times, the development in the region is improving. Some cities of southern Punjab -like Multan, Bahawalpur and Rahim Yar Khan- became metropolitan and urbanized. During the PPPP’s government in 2008, the region got good development budgets, especially Multan district. Anyhow, the region is still far behind in urbanization, industrialization, and political awareness than the central and the northern Punjab.

3.7.2 Electoral Politics in Southern Punjab (2002-13)

Electoral politics of the Southern Punjab has some interesting features. First, Pakistan People’s Party has relatively stable vote bank in the region than the other part of Punjab. In 1970 national elections, PPP’s majority in the region put the party on driving seat on national level. In 1970, 1998, 1993 and 2008 national elections, the party was on the top and succeeded in forming government in the Center. Second, the patron-client relations, candidate voter and to follow the popular political party in national elections, was a common feature in electoral politics of the region. Most of the time, individuals won the elections, no matter which party ticket they had. In 2008 elections, Q-League performed poor in the Punjab province (won 29 total NA seats) from the Punjab, but won three NA seats out of four from Khanawal district because the party had strong candidates in the district.

Third, the language factor is also important in electoral politics of the South Punjab. Nawaz League or other Muslims Leagues have a strong vote bank in urban and Punjabi speaking

---

318 Q-League won total 17 seats out of 29 from south and west Punjab. Raza Hayat Hiraj won 2002 elections of NA (from Khanawal district) with PPPP ticket, 2008 with Q-League and as an independent candidate in 2013 from the same constituency. Ibid.
areas of the region, while PPPP has its influence in Siraiki speaking. In 2002 and 2008 national elections, PPPP won twelve and fourteen NA seats, respectively. Out of twelve seats in 2002 elections, eight were from Siraiki speaking areas (Multan, Lodhran, Bahawalpur and Rahim Yar Khan) and in 2008, party had nine out of fourteen seats from these districts. Therefore, all these factors have decisive impact on the politics of south Punjab.

Table 3.15: Elections Results of Districts – Southern Punjab

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Political Parties</td>
<td></td>
<td>Political Parties</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>PPP P</td>
<td>PM L-Q</td>
<td>PM L-N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Multan</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lodhran</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pakpattan</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bahawalpur</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bahawalnagar</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rahim Yar Khan</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vehari</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Khanawal</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


3.8 Western Punjab

In 1999, Andrew Wilder in his book “The Pakistani Voter” called western Punjab the most backward area in Punjab. Till 2017 (after eighteen years of Wilder’s opinion), the area is still least urbanized, least economically developed and least literate zone of the Punjab. This

\[^{319}\]Wilder, The Pakistani Voter, 60.
Western zone of Punjab is also socially and politically underdeveloped. The tribal leaders, landed autocracy and feudal social structure of the area still prevail and remain a big hurdle in the way of development.

Western Punjab encompasses Bhakkar, Khushab and Mianwali districts of Sargodha division, Dera Ghazi Khan (DG Khan), Layyah, Muzaffargarh and Rajanpur districts of Dera Ghazi Khan division and Jhang from Faisalabad division. The land lies between Indus, Jhelum, Chenab and Ravi rivers. On the northern side of the region, salt range separates western Punjab from the northern side of the province. In the west, the Indus River shares the border between western Punjab and KPK province. In far-south, Sulaiman Mountain Range splits the zone from Baluchistan province. In the south of the region lies Sindh province and Indus River separates the area from southern and central part of the province.

Geographically Western Punjab is the largest zone in Punjab and covers 31.7 percent area of the province with 16.8 percent of the population. In 1998, it had more than twelve million population and reached sixteen million in 2013. It is the least urbanized area of Punjab and 81 percent of its population lives in villages in 2013 (as shown in Tables 2.17 & 2.18). According to 1998 census report, only thirty-five percent of the people were literate which was also lowest in whole Punjab. Muzaffargarh district and other districts of the Western Punjab had lowest Human Development Indus (HDI is the statistical report of the area taking factors like education, life standard, and per-capita income of inhabitants) than the whole Punjab. These districts are on the bottom in development index in Punjab.

The movement of Siraiki province was also vibrant in this zone because of Siraiki speaking areas. Almost fifty percent of area’s inhabitants are Siraiki speaking and DG Khan division has more than seventy-five percent Siraiki speaking people. Even the proposed map of Siraiki province by local leaders covers whole western part of Punjab in Siraiki province.

Table 3.15 Area and Population of Western Punjab

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Region</th>
<th>Area (Sq. K.M)</th>
<th>% of Area</th>
<th>% of Population</th>
<th>2013 Estimated (000)</th>
<th>% of Population</th>
<th>% of Urban Population</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Western Punjab</td>
<td>65138</td>
<td>31.7%</td>
<td>12184</td>
<td>16.5%</td>
<td>16370</td>
<td>16.8%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Literacy</th>
<th>Male Literacy</th>
<th>Female Literacy</th>
<th>Urban Literacy</th>
<th>Rural Literacy</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Percentage</td>
<td>47%</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>51%</td>
<td>27%</td>
<td>35.5%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


### 3.8.1 Economy of Western Punjab

Poverty-stricken and less urbanized population of the region’s reliance is on agriculture. In 1998, more than sixty percent of area’s labor force was directly related to agriculture sector. Western Punjab has 21 percent of Punjab’s irrigated land and produces sixteen percent of sugarcane, twenty-two percent of wheat and ten percent of rice. The industrial sector of the region is also in pathetic condition. In 2013 out of 3590 manufacturing units of the province, western Punjab had just 240 (6.70 percent). Major dependency on agriculture and poor industrialization made region poorest and under-develop in the province.

Important factors of the poverty of western Punjab are its landed elites and their dominance over the political sphere. Legharis, Khosas, Ghrchanis, Mazarirs and Dreshaks of western Punjab are the well-established landlords and have strong political control. All these landlords have thousands of acres land and flourishing business in other areas of the country.

---

On the other hand, the people of these areas are very poor, politically unaware and totally dependent upon these elites.\(^{325}\)

### 3.8.2 Electoral Politics in the Western Punjab (2002-13)

Electoral politics in western Punjab is based on strong candidate, its tribe and the tribal heads of the region. Most of the time, the electable and candidates with strong tribal background joined the popular political parties and left when the party was in hot water. A female candidate from Khushab 1 (NA-69), Sumera Malik\(^{326}\) won last three national elections from the same constituency, but from different political parties. In 2002 elections, she had the ticket of National Alliance (NA), in 2008, she contested the elections on the ticket of PML (a joint venture of Q-League with other parties) and in 2013 she won the elections with Nawaz League ticket. Another lady Ghulam Bibi Bharwana from Jhang districts also won last three elections with Q-League and Nawaz League tickets. She has also strong political background in the area.

Legharis and Khosas of DG Khan district are big landlords and strong political personalities of the areas. Leghari family had at least one NA seat in every election since 1993. The family also switched the parties (PPPP to Q-League and now in Nawaz League) almost in every election and according to electoral needs.\(^{327}\) Another important political actor – Jamshed Dasti from Mazaffargarh (from western Punjab), does not belong to any big tribe and never had strong vote bank in past. He came to politics in 2008 national elections and won the seat (NA-178) on PPPP ticket. Later, he was disqualified by ECP due to the fake degree but was allowed to participate in by-elections. He retained his seat again. In 2013, he participated in elections as an independent candidate from two NA seats (NA-177 & 178) and won the both seats. He defeated big guns of the area in that election.\(^{328}\)

The other important feature of areas’ electoral politics is a good ratio of winners as independent candidates. In last three elections, ratio of winning independent candidates is higher

\(^{325}\) Mohsin Liquat (M. Phil Student in public university, hails Rajanpur district) discussion with the author regarding development in his area. June 20, 2015.

\(^{326}\) A lady belongs to inflectional family of the area and she is granddaughter of Malik Amir Muhammad Khan (Nawab of Kalabagh and Governor of West Pakistan during the 1960s). Elections Commission of Pakistan, *Reports of General Elections 2002, 2008 and 2013*.

\(^{327}\) Strong political families switch the parties and to see the popular wave and people’s mood in favor of the political party. Ibid.

\(^{328}\) He won the elections against the landlord and tribal heads of the area, like Qureshis, Khars and Gurmanis. He was very popular in his area due to political stunts and those stunts were the real reason behind his victory. Ibid.
than the other parts of the country (as shown in Table 2.19). Regarding political parties’ position, the region has also different factors of electoral politics than the rest of the province. In 2008, when PML (Q-League) was in poor position throughout the country, the party won 9 NA seats out of 22 from western Punjab. In 2008, all the big names of the areas were with Q-League and despite the lack of popular support, party showed good results. In 2013, when these big names got other potential platform, the party (Nawaz League) did not get a single seat. Therefore electable have significant importance in electoral politics of the area.

Table 3.17 Elections Results of Districts – Southern Punjab

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>PPP P</td>
<td>PML -Q</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Khushab</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mianwali</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bhakkar</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jhang</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Layyah</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mazaffargarh</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DG Khan</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rajanpur</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Conclusion

Political geography of the Punjab and electoral politics of its regions describe many important things. First, the area and people’s locality impact their political culture and voting decision. In Punjab province, people of different localities act differently in national elections, due to different ethos of local political culture. Secondly, different approach to people's choices according to their areas, force political parties and candidates to form different electoral strategies to get popular support. Third, the voting behaviour in the province is impacted due to changes on national level. These happenings may be the national crises, bad governance or military dictatorship. Fourth, the winner political parties, and electables use campaign tactics according to the ethos of local political culture of the area and these tactics close them to locals. Therefore, all these factors are decisive and important in the political culture of the province and shape people’s voting behaviour in the national elections.
Chapter 4
Partisan Voter in Punjab

Introduction

Power and influence in a democratic process are gained through competition among different political groups. These groups are called political parties, which compete with one another to attract public support and subsequently to get government. Political parties get central importance in the democratic process. Political parties also maintain a linkage between members of society and democratic leadership. The parties frame electoral strategies to strengthen these linkages, especially during elections season.

This chapter deals with a partisan voter - an important type of Punjabi voter and as also an indicator to measure the impact of cultural ethos over voting behaviour in Pakistani Punjab. It discusses ‘how the socio-political culture of a voter develops his partisanship in Punjab.’ The research develops a theoretical framework to answer the after-mentioned question. For the development of this framework, the research examines the background and the identification models with reference to the province. On the other hand, this research also examines the development of political parties, their strategies and their relationship with ethos of local political culture. The study argues that the voter’s predisposition is the primal factor of the partisanship in the province. A political party’s strategies, its leadership, and its electoral agenda work as an intervening variable to strengthen such partisanship.

4.2 Party Identification Models

People’s relationship with political parties influences their voting behaviour in elections. This relation (party identification) determines people’s loyalty with major political parties. To measure this identification, efforts started in 1952 when Angus Campbell and George Belknap did their work in Michigan University. Michigan Party Identification Model considers political party as “a sort of group which works for some definite ends and people maintain their loyalties with such a group.” According to them, “individual’s perceptions, evaluations, and

---

332 Michigan model gives the idea of reference-group. Reference-group refers individual’s affiliation with a group - that based on individual’s evaluation and believe- that he uses such affiliation to his political decision. Ibid., 135.
behaviour determine the values of groups, and person’s identification.”\textsuperscript{*333} Their model mentions political party as a group, where an individual identifies himself with the group and his identification is based on his perception, belief, and evaluation.

Later, in 1960, Michigan authors (Angus Campbell and George Belknap) used the idea of ‘standing decisions,’ where a voter supports one party or the other. They explain that an “individual develops identification with some group (political party) and the group affects the way in which individual behaves.”\textsuperscript{*334} In this way, the Michigan model explains social-psychological reasons of party identification and the voter’s social background determines his voting behaviour. The model considers the socioeconomic status of the voter, his values, his attitudes, and his approach toward a party work as factors of political culture in the province. Electoral campaign of political parties and political-economic issues of the country are the driving factors of voting behaviour.

With the passage of time, the psychological factors also became vibrant and important in explaining the partisanship. But the basic concept remained intact with early Michigan models of 1950s and 60s.\textsuperscript{*335} The development of psychological factors of party identification opened new avenues in the discipline of psephology. For instance, the intergroup relations of individuals plays an important role in defining partisanship. The impact of the in-group\textsuperscript{*336} politics and biases with the out-group\textsuperscript{*337} are considered the driving factors of human behaviour, while power and persistence of group-centrism get importance in public opinion.\textsuperscript{*338} According to the intergroup relation theory, the positive impact of the in-group, differences of the out-group and social competition inside the intergroup are independent factors in the realm of electoral politics and driving forces of public opinion.\textsuperscript{*339} However, an individual’s preferences about his in-group are


\textsuperscript{*335} Ibid., 113.

\textsuperscript{*336} A small and exclusive group of people, who works for shared interest. In social-psychology, in-group is a social bonding of person with some other members of the group. “In-group,” \textit{Glossary of Psychology}. https://www.alleydog.com/glossary/definition.php?term=Ingroup

\textsuperscript{*337} Out-group is also a social group, from which an individual does not have share identities. “Out-group,” \textit{Merriam Webster Dictionary}.


\textsuperscript{*339} Weisberg and Greene, The Political Psychology of Party Identification, 87.
universal. An individual inside an in-group identifies himself according to race, religion, caste, color, creed, and occupation. Identifications of the individual depend upon his social background, personal contexts, and local culture ethos. The in-group identifications may associate him with any political party and strengthen his partisanship. The reasons for this development may be biological, social, economic and cultural; at times, all these reasons work together to shape in-group identities.

In other words, an individual’s identity in an in-group is his social identity that depends on his personal identity and self-concept. Social identity of an individual is defined as “the part of an individual’s self-concept which is derived from his knowledge of his membership of a group together with the value and emotional significance attached to the membership.” Thus, the values and ethos of an in-group, which an individual belongs to, drive his social identity. This social identity of an individual ultimately defines his political identity and then he develops social identifications with a political party (or group), based on his self-identity.

Intergroup relations theory states that values, norms, and cultural ethos of an in-group drive an individual’s social identity. Social Identity determines his identification with any political group and strengthens his partisanship.

4.3 Partisanship in Punjab

The central argument of this chapter has two parts. First, voter’s predisposition shapes voter’s partisanship. The predisposition of a voter is based on the ethos of local political culture and his social-identity. An individual takes both culture and identity from his in-group. Thus, partisanship in Punjab has same grounds that the Michigan models and intergroup relations theory explain.

Primary ingredients of individual’s predisposition that determine his public opinion are relevant to his social group. These ingredients may vary from group to group. In Punjab, the

341 In the realm of Pakistani Punjab, an individual’s in-group may be explained as “a man might consider himself as a Punjabi speaking Muslims, migrated from Indian Punjab, hail from Sahi clan of Jatt caste, currently leaving in central Punjab, belong to a business family and a supporter of Nawaz League.
342 Self-concept is individual’s beliefs and evaluations about himself, and responses –especially in political domain– to other according to such beliefs and evaluations. Saul McLeod, “Self-Concept,” Simple Psychology. https://www.simplypsychology.org/self-concept.html
common ingredients of the individual’s predisposition are his personality’s traits, area of residence, family, biradari values and norms, religious ideology, and material interests. These factors shape his inclination toward any political party in the province.

The second part of argument is related to a political party’s strategies. The party leadership and its electoral agenda work as intervening factors in partisanship in the context of Punjab. The relationship between ingredients of predisposition and intervening factors is developed when the individual sends meaningful signals toward policymakers of political parties about his preferences and the parties, in turn, the parties set their strategies according to these preferences. Thomas J. Leeper and Rune Slothuus explain this relationship in a comprehensive manner. According to them, people do not make political decisions in a vacuum. They are born with a socialized predisposition, but not with political information. They use their socialized predisposition in the political realm, do their political decision. Thus, in Punjab, the political predisposition of individual works as an independent factor to develop partisanship, while political parties (strategies, leadership, agenda, and winning chances) work as an intervening factor.

It is important to discuss the role of voter’s belief and evaluation (the research considers that a voter’s belief and evaluation are dominant factors in voting decision in Punjab and explained in the introductory chapter) to manifest partisanship in Punjab. The voter’s belief and evaluation also influence the partisanship in the province. The ingredients of individual’s predisposition develop his belief about partisanship. To get maximum benefit, the voter evaluates political position of the party in the field. In this evaluation, he analyzes strategies of parties, their leadership, electoral agendas, and chances of electability. The voter is also influenced by upright strategies of parties, charismatic leadership, attractive political agendas and better probabilities of winning. Therefore, the partisanship in the province stems from voter’s belief and evaluation, and the electoral strategies of a political party also have a vital impact on his voting behaviour.

4.1 Model of Partisan Voter in Punjab

The research has used inductive and deductive approaches to analyze the above-mentioned model of partisanship in Punjab. Inductive analysis of electoral data of last three national elections (2002, 2008 & 2013) is used to show the electoral behaviour of the voter in the province. This exercise identifies three factors regarding partisanship in the province.

1. Different levels of partisanship in urban and rural constituencies of the province (even in the same district).
2. Difference of partisanship in big cities (developed cities/Metropolitans) and small cities (less developed or underdeveloped).
3. People in different geographical zones of the province (northern, central, southern and western parts of the province) behave differently toward different political parties. Deductive approach (after participating in electoral process) and semi-structured interviews with the locals, the study analyzed the impact of voter’s utility over partisanship and influence of parties’ strategies over voter’s utility. This exercise also explores the reasons of partisanship in the province.

1. Bridging and bounding strategies of political parties in Punjab and their impact on people’s partisanship.

2. Effective electoral agenda of a party creates different results for them in national elections.

3. Charismatic personality of leaders makes a difference and influences partisanship in the province.

4. The chances of electability of a political party and its impact on partisanship.

In the following part, the study analyzes the aforementioned factors with empirical evidences. Before analysis, however, it is important to discuss the history of political parties and their formation in Punjab.

4.4 Characteristics of Political Parties in Punjab

A political party is defined as a distinct form of social organization that struggles to get public offices through duly constituted elections. Political party expresses the public’s expectations and their social, political, cultural, and economic demands in the political arena. To fulfill these requirements, the party contests elections and gets public offices after winning the elections. Through this political process (in democratic societies), public mandate is the only way to get power. The aim of any political party in a political system is to get public support for victory in elections. Anthony Downs expresses, “A political party formulates policies in order to win elections, rather than win elections in order to formulate policies.” Therefore, to win elections, political parties formulate policies according to social requirements of the society, transform themselves into social organizations and make accommodative (as per the needs of society) electoral strategies.

---


Philip E. Jones describes the political parties of Pakistan as episodic, unstable, intermittent combination of socio-economic interest groups and much open to outsider’s manipulation.\(^{349}\) All popular political parties (PPP, PML-N, PML-Q and PTI) of the province and the country emerged due to some events, incidents or political rivalries (among different interest groups) on the national level. They got popularity due to their dynasties, or clan-based politics. They had strong patronage relations and have support of the rural or urban elites.

This conjunction of factors has a significant impact on the characteristics of political parties and on their electoral success. The rise of popular political parties in Punjab started during the sixties (1967 to 69), after the mass protests against General Ayub Khan. Later, the fall of Dhaka in 1971 paved the ways for new political parties in electoral politics of the province. In 1979, the execution of ZA Bhutto strengthened his legacy in the political arena. Similarly, Zia’s military regime (1978-88) and his policies made his protégés strong in Punjab’s politics. In 2000, another military dictator General Musharraf used political parties for the legitimization of his rule. Therefore, unfortunate happenings, legacies of dictators and politicians, patron-client relations with elites and locals are characteristics of political parties in the province as well in the country even in contemporary times. Next part of the chapter briefly describes the history of four political parties in Punjab, their features, their organizational structures and the role of individuals in the parties.

### 4.4.1 Pakistan Peoples’ Party (PPP)

PPP is one of the oldest political parties in Punjab. In the post-1965 war scenario, Ayub Khan’s foreign minister ZA Bhutto became an important political figure in the country due to his disagreements with the regime. These disagreements led him toward formation of a new political party. Most of the progressive, intellectual, liberal, and socialist class of the era supported ZA Bhutto to create a new party.\(^{350}\) Protests of students and trade unions against Ayub also paved the way for a new political party. The PPP held its first convention in Lahore, Punjab in December 1967. The motto of the party was “to launch a constitutional struggle for restoration of

---


\(^{350}\) Impetus of new political party came from Jalaluddin Akbar Rahim (J.A Rahim). J.A Rahim was an ex-ICS officer, a man with high intellect, an affirm Marxist and Cambridge graduate. Other prominent members of PPP at that time were, Tariq Ali (a central figure in Cambridge Student Movement of 1968), Taj Muhammad Langah (active member of Pakistan Socialist Society and legal advisor in the ministry of housing under Richard Crossman) and Haneef Ramay (a renowned intellectual, writer, journalist, and painter). Ibid., 100-109.
democracy and fundamental rights in the country.” 351 Adult suffrage and socio-economic justices were also on the agenda. ‘Islamic Socialism’ was the popular slogan of the party. 352 Anti-Ayub movement, absence of popular political parties (due to ban on political activities during the Ayub reign), results of first national elections in 1970 and civil war in East Pakistan made PPP popular in West Pakistan.

Jones has used term ‘Fuhrerist type of political party’ to define the organizational structure of PPP. Fuhrerist type of political party is a party “in which organization and ideology are subordinated to particular proclivities and vision of the supreme leader.” 353 ZA Bhutto’s way of governance after 1970 elections and party organization in later years were similar to Fuhrerist. Popularity of the party depended on Bhutto family and inclination of the followers relied on patron-client relations with local and national elites. Even during the Benazir Bhutto’s government (1988-90), she and other leaders of the party ensured that power should remain in the hands of Bhutto family. 354 Ahmed Rashid points out, “It is a historical fact that PPP has always been factionalized, and very personalized.” 355 In post-ZA Bhutto period (PPP was in government from 1988-90, 1993-96 and 2008-13) the party set stable vote bank in the country.

Nonetheless, the legacy of Bhutto family has an indisputable impact on organizational structure of the party. None other than Bhutto family has kept the decisive position in the party since its formation in 1967. After unfortunate deaths of ZA Bhutto’s male heirs 356 and the assassination of ex-PM Benazir, ZA Bhutto’s grandson Bilawal Bhutto Zardari (son of Benazir Bhutto) became the chairperson of the party (the only important post of the party lies outside Punjab province). Other three members of central executive committee of the party are from Punjab. 357 Inside Punjab, the party has two wings: central and southern wings. Members of both

353 Ibid., 98.
355 Ibid., 137.
357 Syed Nayer Hussain Bukhari (Secretary General), Mr. Haider Zaman Qureshi (Secretary Finance), and Ch. Manzoor Ahmad (Information Secretary) all three hail from Punjab. “Party Structure,” Pakistan Peoples’ Party https://www.ppp.org.pk/party-structure/
wings are influential landlords or businessmen. Yet the hegemony of Bhutto family is still a prevailing factor in the popularity of the party. The party tries to remain popular by cashing the execution of ZA Bhutto and assassination of Benazir. Even time party did well with these strategies and maintained strong vote bank in Sindh and countryside of Punjab.

4.4.2 Pakistan Muslims League-Nawaz (PML-N)

All India Muslims League (AIML) divided into different factions (in Pakistan) after the death of Muhammad Ali Jinnah. All these factions of league claim themselves as true heirs of AIML (which was the founding party of the country) and legitimate successors of Quaid-e-Azam. Other significant features of these leagues are that most of them came into being for catering the interests of the establishment. These leagues, in general, have weak organizational set-up and poor democratic culture. They are generally patronized by feudal lords and urban bourgeois, who, in return, work to see their personal interests being served by the parties.

Among all the leagues, Pakistan Muslims League Nawaz (PML-N) is one of a few parties after partition which has a long history of governance and popularity in the country, especially in Punjab. Since its formation in 1993, the party has enjoyed the longest period of governance (among all political parties) in the province. Party and its leaders are popular in the province and it considers the most popular party in the province (according to electoral data of national elections). Despite the governance history and popularity, the characteristics of the PML-N are not much different from that of PPP. Both parties are personality oriented.

PML-N leaders are famous for infrastructure development that may attract quick appreciation of the masses. In each of its turns, PML-N focused on developing infrastructure and

---

358 The members from central Punjab Mr. Qamar Zaman Kaira (President), Mr. Nadeem Afzal Chan (General Secretary), Mr. Mustafa Nawaz Khokhar (Information Secretary), all are landlords or influential businessman of their areas. Same as the southern Punjab, members are Makhdoom Ahmad Mahmood (President), Ms. Natasha Daultana (General Secretary), and Mr. Shaukat Mahmood Basra (Information Secretary). Ibid.

359 Both Ayub Khan and Musharraf used political parties named with Muslims League to legitimate their rule. Ayub Khan made Convention Muslims League and became the president of the party. While Pakistan Muslims League Quaid-e-Azam (PML-Q) was organized under the patronage of General Musharraf. Zia preferred non-party politics in the country, but his supporters were also members of different ML in the past. Zia’s supporter created new parties with the name of Muslims League, after Zia’s rule. His own son Ijaz-ul-Hqua made party with name Muslims League- Zai (PML-Z). Sayeed, Politics in Pakistan; “About Us,” Pakistan Muslims League-Zia, http://pmlzia.com/

other showcase projects that might show quick results and provide immediate relief to the people. For the same reason, the party leadership feels proud of its projects and considers these projects did vital role in party’s electoral success. Speaking before a public gathering, PML-N president Nawaz Sharif (PM of the country until June 2017) highlighted the importance of roads. He stated, if we do not construct roads, would we build schools or hospitals through helicopter?361

It is a common opinion about PML-N (based on information collected from semi-structural interviews with both supporters and opponents of the party from Vehari, Multan, Lahore, Sargodha, and Rawalpindi districts) that party focuses on developing roads, bridges, underpasses, and some mega-projects. Other projects of the party are laptop scheme (for students), Sassti Roti (cheap bread) for the poor, and yellow cab scheme. People of Punjab province (especially supporters of the party) consider these projects to be the landmarks of progress. For them, this progress is probably the only reason to follow the party leadership. Conversely, the opponents of party call these projects as a sheer wastage of [public] money. Apart from a commitment to development projects, the charismatic leadership, anti-PPP rhetoric, efficiency in assembling the electables, efficacious strong patron-client relations with natives and Punjab-specific politics also contribute to the success of PML-N in Punjab.362

Like PPP, PML-N is also a Fuhrerist type of political party. Since its formation, Sharif family has full command over affairs of the party and Nawaz Sharif is its president since the formation. It was formed after the split of Islami Jamhoori Ittehad (IJI) -an alliance of political parties that won the 1990 national elections. Nawaz had problems with some members of the alliance and he decided to have a different electoral agenda for upcoming national elections of 1993. In 1993, he contested elections under the banner of PML-N. In 2017, after Nawaz Sharif’s disqualification from Supreme Court, he became Tahayat Quaid [Quaid for life]363 and his brother- Shahbaz Sharif- nominated as party’s president of party.

362 All these reasons work in a good way for the party, but the party’s strategy to just focus on Punjab is vital behind its electoral success. Party did maximum development works in central and northern Punjab, because both regions have 92 national assembly seats out of 272. Government of Pakistan, Election Commission of Pakistan, Re-description of National “Assembly and Provincial Assemblies” (Islamabad: ECP, 2002). https://www.ecp.gov.pk/PrintDocument.aspx?PressId=10365&type=Text
Another similarity of the party with PPP is that the party has weak organizational structure and its lower wings (on divisions and districts level) become operational when the party is in power. For instance, after the 2002 ouster of Sharif family from politics, most of the party loyalist left the party to join the PML-Q. Unsurprisingly, PML-N performed poor in the 2002 national elections. In this way, even after a long rule and having formidable popularity, the party still has poor organizational structure, weak democratic norms, elections-specific development strategies and cultural-based popular politics.\textsuperscript{364}

4.4.3 Pakistan Muslims League - Quaid-e-Azam (PML-Q)

PML-Q is another important political character in the province, which rose to ranks of power in 2002 (formation year: 2002). The rise of the party was short-lived, and its popularity ended in 2008 national elections (just after a half decade of its formation). Q-League was the split group of the electables of PML-N, who gathered under the patronage of Musharraf. In 2002, when general Musharraf had to start electoral politics at national level, he needed a political party, which could legitimize his dictatorship. For this purpose, several stalwarts of PML-N, under the leadership of Chaudhary Shujaat Hussain, were ready to facilitate Musharraf.

The electables of PML-N joined the [new] king’s party, following the vision of Musharraf. The electoral success of the party in 2002 elections was thus not a surprise. PML-Q supported Musharraf repeatedly and managed to prolong his rule until 2008. The 2008 national elections results were damaging for the party. The assassination of Benazir Bhutto, lawyers’ movement, power shortage and a long rule of Musharraf were the causes of party’s defeat.

Q- League was Musharraf’s party. He changed the premiership of party when he needed it. He used it for favorable constitutional amendments. The success and failure of Q-League are compatible with the variables of political culture of Punjab. The party got electoral success when it seemed powerful and had good chances of winning in 2002 elections. It performed poorly when the popular leaders (Nawaz Sharif and Benazir Bhutto) came back and Musharraf seemed weak in his office.

4.4.4 Pakistan Tehreek-i-Insaf (PTI)

\textsuperscript{364} Author met with one of the supporters of the district committee (Lodhran) of PML-N, who became active with the party when Sharif family came back to Pakistan and got a hope of electoral success in 2013 national elections. He said, he joined the party now because it got potential and would be beneficial for me in future. November 22, 2016: “146 get PML-N tickets, though they quit party after coup,” The News, April 30, 2013, https://www.thenews.com.pk/archive/print/427308-146-get-pml-n-tickets-though-they-quit-party-after-coup
In 2011, the epic rise of PTI, after fifteen years of its creation, was not a unique episode in the political history of Pakistan. Imran is also a populist as ZA Bhutto was. Khan has charisma, popular support (specific segment of the society) and became popular in crisis. In 1996, Pakistani cricketer and a leading philanthropist Imran Khan took an initiative to improve the socio-political and justice system of Pakistan. For that purpose, he became the first chairperson of the party, which he had formed on the slogans of justice, humanity, and self-esteem. Party’s electoral history started in 1997 national elections. It could not manage to win even a single seat in either national assembly or provincial assembly. In 2002, PTI had one seat of its chairperson in the national assembly.

In 2011, with a massive gathering in Lahore, the rise of PTI was an unexpected phenomenon. In the presence of two popular political parties (PPP & PML-N), PTI emerged as a strong political contender in political arena. The rise of PTI is an important case study to understand the political culture and electoral politics of Punjab. Imran Khan is a famous and charismatic personality in present political scenario. Since its formation, PTI took fifteen years to become a potential political power in the electoral politics of the Punjab. The rise of the party shows the rationality of voter and electables in Punjab. The massive gathering of Lahore attracted the people throughout the province and they analyzed the bright chances of electoral success of the party. The participation of renowned politicians from the province beefed up people’s evaluation about the party.

The performance of PPP government in the center and PML-N in Punjab after 2008 elections created a chance for Khan to attract people. On the other hand, the rise of social media

---

in the country also paved the way for PTI’s popularity. These two elements heightened Khan’s charisma who managed to benefit from the prevailing situation. The voter and electables speculated well the bright future of the party and joined it. PTI contested national elections with a better strategy and effective street power first time in 2013. It became the second largest party of the country as well as Punjab (according to the numbers of votes). However, the party could not compete with PML-N due to the former’s effective electoral strategies, resources, and numbers of electables.

The rise of PTI and its organizational structure is not different than Punjab’s political culture. Khan has been leading the party single-handedly since its formation. The vision and wisdom of Khan are considered the manifesto of the party and party would be nowhere in electoral politics without Khan.\(^{371}\) In addition to poor organizational structure, especially in the Punjab, the party is also suffering from status rivalries inside the party.\(^{372}\) Another important factor that puts hurdles in its way toward electoral success -despite the popularity in urban zones of the province- is Khan’s limitations in understanding the needs of voters and variables of political culture in the province (Punjabi voter wants quick relief of his social needs and maximum utility of his vote).\(^{373}\) Therefore, PTI is one of the most popular parties in the country (due to Khan’s personality), and develop strong vote bank in the province due Khan’s charisma and presence of electable.

4.5 Political Culture and Partisanship in Punjab: Empirical Analysis

The variables of political culture drive partisanship in Punjab. The different ethos of of political culture create different level of partisanship not throughout the province but also in the country. Even on national level, the standard of difference is obvious and vibrant.

\(^{371}\) Author’s discussion with die-hard supports of PTI -Hafiz Subul (a young student from Multan District) and M. Imran (employee at government organization in Rawalpindi district). The question was asked about the importance of Imran Khan’s vision for the success of PTI in elections. January 05, 2017.

\(^{372}\) The research analyzed the by-poll elections in Lahore and Mandi Bahuddin districts, where PTI candidate lost the elections with little margin. In interviews with PTI supporters (Arsanal Ahmad, Shahzain Jatt, and Nomeer Anjum). The respondents mentioned that the district leadership of the party and political rivalries among different groups were the real causes of party’s defeat. March 13, 2017.

\(^{373}\) Author interview with Prof. Javaid Akhtar (Professor of political culture and electoral politics in BZU Multan). He proclaimed that, without understanding the ingredients of local political culture of Punjab, no political party can get electoral success in the province. The question was asked regarding the impact of political culture in party’s electoral success. March 27, 2017.
The trend (that people from different provinces vote for different political parties) has been visible throughout the electoral history of Pakistan. National elections during the nineties (1988-96) also widened that electoral gap among the provinces. Voters in Punjab and Sindh voted for PPP or PML-N in these elections. People from NWFP mostly voted for Awami National Party (ANP) and Jamiat Ulema-e Islam Fazal-ur-Rehman (JUI-F), while voters in Baluchistan had slightly different electoral trends from rest of the country. In Baluchistan, during the nineties, no single political party had the majority and some nationalist parties (Baloachistan National Party, and Jamhoori Wattan Party) had a good share of votes in the province. One may argue that the results of four national elections (1988, 1990, 1993, and 1997) help us elaborate that how the people from different political cultures have different levels of partisanship.

The results of by-elections are another electoral fact that illustrates the rationality and utility of the voters in the country. In most of the by-poll elections, the party in government takes the lead (In by-elections in the country, there are bright chances of winning of a party, who is ruling in the province). For instance, after 2002 national elections, by-poll elections were held on twelve NA seats in Punjab. Ruling party (Q-League) won nine seats. Similarly, after 2008 national elections, by-elections were held on nineteen NA seats in Punjab. Seventeen were won by parties in government (Nawaz League had provincial government of Punjab and PPP had federal government). Immediately after 2013 national elections, by-poll elections were held on sixteen NA seats (These by-poll elections were held due to vacant seats of the candidates. Who won the elections for more than one seats).\footnote{Elections Commission of Pakistan, 2013.} Six were in Punjab where Nawaz League won five.\footnote{Elections Commission of Pakistan, 2002, 2008 and 2013 general Elections.}

The by-poll elections (after national elections) highlight impact of political culture over partisanship. The voter in Pakistan, especially in Punjab, analyzes the higher probability of winning of ruling political party and sees maximum utility of their votes. Unsurprisingly, the voter votes for the ruling party. And in most of the cases, the party in government wins the contest. The influence of residential area over voter’s partisanship was more obvious and vibrant in by-elections than national elections. In Punjab by-elections (after 2013 national election), Nawaz League won eleven seats out fifteen. The variables of political culture were thus the main driving force of the partisanship in the country.

\footnote{Elections Commission of Pakistan, 2013.} \footnote{Elections Commission of Pakistan, 2002, 2008 and 2013 general Elections.}
4.6 Level of Partisanship in (Northern, Central, Southern, and Western) Punjab

People in Punjab as well as in Pakistan adopt cultural-based partisanship in national elections. People’s cultural-based partisanship works in two ways, especially in Punjab. First, it makes people rational and sane about their votes and they decide for a party, which has the maximum chances of winning in upcoming elections. In this way, ethos of local political culture (area of residence, socioeconomic background, occupation, education institution, and kinship) help a voter to analyze the electability of a party. Second, cultural-based partisanship assists voter to vote for such political party which can serve them better. In this way of analysis, a voter wants maximum utility of his vote and sees maximum fulfillment of his socioeconomic problems through his vote.

The mixture of these two factors -belief and evaluation- culture- based assumptions develops partisanship in Punjab. In last three national elections, these two assumptions worked for almost all political parties in the province. The probability of winning of a political party was the main factor of partisanship in Punjab. In urban areas, this trend was vibrant in all four parts (Northern, Central, Southern, and Western) of the province. Chances of winning of a political party, its performance in last tenure, and probability to serve better in upcoming elections guided people’s partisanship. The combination of these factors gave different results and level of partisanship for every political party in every national election.

Due to different cultural norms of different areas of Punjab, political parties performed differently in all parts of the province. In 2002, Nawaz League won two seats of NA from North Punjab and PPP won three from the region (out of total 14). Nawaz League won ten and PPP won fifteen from central parts of the province (out of total 78). In Southern and Western parts, the gap between these parties was high in 2002 elections. Nawaz League won one NA seat from Southern (out of total 34) and none from western Punjab. Conversely, PPP won twelve from south and five from western parts of the province respectively (as shown in Chart 4.1).

Chart 4.1 2002 Elections: Percentage of PPP and PML-N National Assembly Seats

In 2008, there was another change in the results. Owing favorable political atmosphere for Nawaz League, the party’s political show in elections was impressive. In north and central parts of the province, it got more than fifty percent of total NA seats. At the same time, its electoral success also improved in south and north parts of the province as compared to last elections (shown in Chart 4.2).

**Chart 4.2 2008 Elections: Percentage of PPP and PML-N National Assembly Seats**


The 2013 national election was one of most upsetting episodes in the electoral history of PPP. It won only two NA seats (from south Punjab) in the whole province. On the other hand, Nawaz League’s electoral success was once again impressive (shown in chart 4.3) and thus it successfully formulated government in the center.

**Chart 4.3 2013 Elections: Percentage of PPP and PML-N National Assembly Seats**
Chart 4.3: The Report of Elections Commission of Pakistan 2013, ECP.
4.7 The Difference of Partisanship (on Constituencies’ level)

This part of the chapter analyzes the level of cultural-based partisanship in different constituencies of all four parts of the province (analyzed the level of partisanship in four different constituencies from all four parts of the province). NA-54 is fairly urban and developed zone of Rawalpindi district in Northern Punjab (the results of the constituency in last three national elections are illustrated in Table 4.1). The results explain a higher difference of votes between two political parties in these elections. In 2008, the performance of Q-League in the last tenure and the return of Sharif family had increased the winning chances of Nawaz League. In 2013, poor governance of PPP worked in Nawaz League in favor.376

Table 4.1: NA-54 Rawalpindi-V (Northern Punjab)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total Votes</td>
<td>Percentage of Votes</td>
<td>Total Votes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nawaz League</td>
<td>28805</td>
<td>34.3%</td>
<td>58228 (W)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PPPP</td>
<td>31491 (W)</td>
<td>37.5%</td>
<td>33749</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: The reports on 2002, 2008 and2013 general Elections, ECP. Percentage of Votes: Percentage of votes means, party s’ vote out of total polled votes. And ‘W’ stands for winner in the elections.

NA-125 is an urban and developed zone of Lahore that is considered the strongest area of Nawaz League (Even that in 2002 national elections, party contested only on eight NA seats out of thirteen in Lahore district (supporters and members of Nawaz League called Lahore a fort of the party). In NA-125 (Table 2 describes the partisanship in Lahore district), the party had less than thirty percent votes in 2002 elections (lost the seat also) but it jumped to sixty-four percent in 2008 (when the party was in a good position even before the elections). In 2013, party took the seat from consistency with more than fifty percent votes. On the other hand, PPP’s vote bank reached two percent from twenty-two between 2008 and 2013 (as shown in Table 4.2).

376 The rise of PTI was another important factor in this consistency. PTI’s candidate stood runner-up in this area. Elections Commission of Pakistan, Report on General Elections 2013 Vol. II,
The level of partisanship becomes slightly different when it comes in southern and western parts of Punjab. Both South and West parts of Punjab are underdeveloped areas as compared to North and South. The electables get more importance than other parts of the province. The trends of partisanship were not much different from other parts of the province. And in these areas, PPP performed better than it did in the central Punjab (as shown in table 4.3).

NA-151 is an urban constituency of Multan district. In 2002, PPP took a good ratio of votes but lost the elections. In 2008, it won the seat. PPP’s PM in 2008 Yousef Raza Gillani won the seat from NA-151 (when Supreme Court of Pakistan disqualified Gillani, his son successfully contested the elections). But his party was not in a favorable position before the 2013 elections. Despite those development works, PPP lost all district Multan seats and both the former PM’s sons lost elections in 2013.

### Table: 4.2 NA-125 Lahore-VIII (Central Punjab)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total Votes</td>
<td>Percentage of Votes</td>
<td>Total Votes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nawaz League</td>
<td>21186</td>
<td>27.6%</td>
<td>70752 (W)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PPPP</td>
<td>21152</td>
<td>27.5%</td>
<td>24592</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: The reports on 2002, 2008 and 2013 general Elections, ECP.

Western Punjab is probably the most under-developed part of the province. Electoral politics revolves around landlords of the area. Here the candidates are an influential part of partisanship, but electable rarely go against set cultural norms of the area. The electable choose a

---

377 The huge development works in Multan district. During Gillani’s government. While the load shading was serious problem in whole country, but according to some natives (M. Ikram, Mansoor Akhtar, and Akmal Ahmad from Multan district), load shading schedule was quite relaxed in Multan than the nearing areas of Southern Punjab. March 15, 2017.

political party after analyzing local trends of the area and probability of winning of the party. Table 4.4 illustrates continuous poor performance of PPP in the area. In 2013, the party got less than one percent votes from NA-172. On the other hand, in 2008 elections, when Q-League lost the elections in whole province, it won nine NA seats from western Punjab out of total twenty-two (won all three NA seats of Dera Ghazi Khan). Nawaz League’s performance in western Punjab describes electoral politics of area well. In 2002, PML-N was not able to win a single seat from western part of the province (even the party did not contest the elections in many consistencies of the area). In 2008, its score reached two out of total twenty-two NA seats, while, in 2013, Nawaz League got thirteen seats from the area (In 2002 and 2008, Q-League was winner from the area).

Table: 4.4 NA-172 Dera Ghazi Khan-II (Western Punjab)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total Votes</td>
<td>Percentage of Votes</td>
<td>Total Votes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nawaz League</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>----</td>
<td>41894</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PPPP</td>
<td>6850</td>
<td>6.0%</td>
<td>36401</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: The reports on 2002, 2008 and 2013 general Elections, ECP.*

4.8 **Level of Partisan in Urban and Rural Areas**

The political norms in urban and rural areas of Punjab have a significant difference. In urban areas, political parties have a greater impact than the rural areas. People are less attached with their kin in urban side of the province. In rural areas, caste and kinship have an obvious impact over partisanship. The difference is apparent almost in every district of Punjab.

In Rawalpindi district (North Punjab) NA- 51 is the ruler belt of the district (Gujar Khan). In this constituency, PPP has stable vote bank, and the party has weak standing in adjust constituency NA-52. On the other hand, Nawaz League has stable vote bank in NA-52 and relatively weak position in NA-51 (especially in 2002 and 2008, in 2013 PPP had no candidate in NA-52). The difference of partisanship is shown in Chart 4.4 and 4.5.
In Lahore district (Center Punjab) NA-130 is less urban area of the district and NA-122 is relatively urbanized part. In all three national elections, NA-122 was the strong hub of Nawaz League and NA-130 had stable vote bank of PPP. In 2002, Nawaz League had no candidate in NA-130. In 2013, when PPPP had just four percent of polled votes in Lahore district the party
had nearly twenty percent of polled votes in NA-130. While in 2002, when Nawaz League had thirty-seven percent of polled votes, it had forty percent in NA-122 (the different level of partisanship in district is shown in chart 4.6 and 4.7).

**Chart 4.6: PML-N Votes Percentage in NA-51 and 52**

![Chart 4.6](image)

*Chart 4.6: Percentage of votes is party’s votes out of total polled votes. The Reports on General Elections 2002, 2008 and 2013.*

**Chart 4.7: PPP Votes Percentage in NA-51 and 51**

![Chart 4.7](image)

*Chart: 4.7 Percentage of votes is party’s votes out of total polled votes. The Reports on General Elections 2002, 2008 and 2013.*

In Vehari district (South Punjab) has four constituencies of national assembly since 2002 national elections. In these constituencies, urban areas have different partisanship than the rural areas have. NA-169 and 170 are two adjutant constituencies of the district. NA-169 covers the neighboring areas of Vehari city, while NA-170 covers the rural belt and less developed parts of
In last three national elections, the level of partisanship is different in these two constituencies. In NA-169, Nawaz League performed well in all three elections, while its performance has been surprisingly depressing in NA-170, except in 2013 (as shown in Figure: 4.8). On the other hand, PPP got good votes from NA-170 but lost the elections from NA-169 since 1988 (before 2002, both 169 & 170 marked differently). In 170, PPP contested the last three elections with the same candidate (Azhar Ahmad Khan), but the vote count was different in every election. Different results of these constituencies illustrate the impact of ethos of political culture on partisanship differently (as shown in Figure: 4.8).

Chart 4.8: PML-N Votes Percentage in NA-169 and 170

![Chart 4.8: PML-N Votes Percentage in NA-169 and 170](image)

*Chart 4.8: Percentage of votes is party’s votes out of total polled votes. The Reports on General Elections 2002, 2008 and 2013, ECP.*

---

379 A visible difference in the development of these two constituencies NA-69 and NA-170. The infrastructure of NA-169 is quite better than NA-170. The areas that covers NA-170 has poor infrastructure and bad health facilities. For example, district has total 260 beds government hospitals for nearly three million population. In which 260, only sixty lies in NA-170 and 140 lies in NA-169. *Government of Punjab: Bureau of Statistics Lahore, Punjab Development Statistics 2013, 217.*
The difference of partisanship is clear in the whole province. Given the evidence, one may argue that in developed parts of the province, Nawaz League has strong hold than other political parties. PPP does relatively better in rural/under-develop areas.

In 2002 national elections, when PML-N was in trouble and split, it won only thirteen NA seats from Punjab. All these seats won by the party were from urban and developed areas of the province. In Lahore (one of the most developed districts of Punjab), the party contested on eight NA seats out of thirteen in 2002. It won four of total eight. In these elections, the party had attracted only seventeen percent of total polled votes from Punjab, but, in Lahore, its vote share was thirty-six percent of total polled votes.

4.9 Partisanship in Developed and Underdeveloped Areas

The difference of partisanship in Lahore district and Muzaffargarh district is visible in all three elections. Lahore district is the provincial capital and one of the most developed districts of the province, on the other hand Muzaffargarh district is most underdeveloped and poor zone in the province. Table 4.5 shows a big difference of NA seats in two the districts. In Lahore, Nawaz

---

381 In these 13 seats, PML-N won 4 from Lahore, 4 from Faisalabad, one each from Rawalpindi, Multan, Sialkot and Jhelum. Ibid.
382 The Party contested the elections on eight seats from district (the voting percentage was calculated only on such seats). Ibid.
s’ popularity was palpable but the same was not true in the case of Muzaffargarh district. On the other hand, PPP was popular in Muzaffargarh but unfortunate in Lahore.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Political Party</th>
<th>Lahore District</th>
<th>Muzaffargarh District</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PML-N</td>
<td>4 out of 13</td>
<td>11 out of 13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PPP</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: The Reports on General 2002, 2008 and 2013, ECP.

In 2002 elections, Nawaz League had thirty-seven of polled votes and thirty percent of NA seats. While it had five percent votes in Muzaffargarh and no NA seat. In same elections, PPP had twenty-five percent of polled votes and twenty-three of NA seats in Lahore. On the other hand, the party had thirty-four percent of polled votes and forty percent of NA seats from Muzaffargarh (as shown in Figure: 4.9).

**Chart 4.10: 2002 Elections: PPP and PML-N Voting Percentage in Lahore and Muzaffargarh**

![Chart 4.9 Percentage of votes are calculated, through the total votes of political parties by total polled votes. The percentage is calculated in which constituencies only, where political parties have its candidate. Source: The Reports on General 2002, ECP.](image)

The electoral results of 2008 national elections also illustrate the same trend. In these elections, Nawaz League had eighty-four percent of NA seats and fifty-eight percent of polled votes from Lahore. While the party got eight percent votes and no seat from Muzaffargarh. On the other hand, PPP had just two seats from Lahore and twenty-four percent votes. Yet, in
Muzaffargarh, it had hundred percent of NA seats and forty-seven percent votes (shown in Figure: 4.10).

**Chart 4.11: 2008 Elections: PPP and PML-N Voting Percentage in Lahore and Muzaffargarh**

![Chart 4.11](image)

*Chart 4.10: Percentages of votes are calculated, through the total votes of political parties by total polled votes. The percentage is calculated in which constituencies only, where political parties have its candidate. Source: the Reports on General 2002, ECP.*

In 2013, when PPP lost the elections throughout Punjab, it had twenty percent of polled votes in Muzaffargarh and just four percent in Lahore. Nawaz League, who dominated the whole province, it had sixty percent of polled votes and ninety-two percent NA seats from Lahore. While in Muzaffargarh, Nawaz League had thirty-four percent of polled votes and forty percent of NA seats (as shown in Figure: 4.11).
Chart 4.12: 2013 Elections: PPP and PML-N Voting Percentage in Lahore and Muzaffargarh

Chart: 4.11 Percentages of votes are calculated, through the total votes of political parties by total polled votes. The percentage is calculated in which constituencies only, where political parties have its candidate. Source: The Reports on General 2002, ECP.

Therefore, there are certain features of local political cultural and electoral politics that develop partisanship in the province. Cultural norms, the area of residence, socioeconomic factors, the occupation, and kinship are significant features in shaping the development of partisanship in the province. In the realm of electoral politics, the probability of winning of a political party in upcoming elections, its performance in last [ruling] tenure and its chance to serve better play an important role in partisanship.

4.10 Electoral Strategies of Political Parties and their Impact on Partisanship

Electoral strategies of political parties work as an intervening variable of partisanship in Pakistani Punjab. The single objective (of the political parties) of these strategies is to maximize their votes. Political parties are always voter-maximizing organization, which are the master of their own fate. Pippa Norris describes the vote-maximizing as “the Darwinian theory predicts that politicians who are not vote-maximizers … will gradually become less common because, in general, they will be less successful in gaining elections or re-elections.”

Political actors in democratic process seek public support and popularity through their policies, manifesto, and

---

electoral strategies. To gain the public support and popularity, survival for such political actors who are the fittest in this realm.

For the survival political actors/parties in Punjab, needs to do many things, especially in the electoral seasons. In the province, political actors get popularity through effective electoral strategies, charismatic leadership, electable, and the political dynasties. A political party, who has maximum ingredients for popularity -above mentioned-, maintains its survival in the political realm. In all these ingredients of popularity, efficient electoral or vote-maximizing strategies have central importance.

A political party which knows how to contest the elections, has the asset of charismatic leadership, the electable and political dynasties, and maximum chances of popularity in the masses. Therefore, in Punjab, the fittest political party (which sustains its popularity) makes good electoral strategies, uses charisma of leadership and their dynasties, and get maximum support of electable in national elections. However, the part of the chapter analyzes the relationship of these ingredients with local political culture and their impact on partisanship.

4.11 Electoral Strategies of Political Parties in Punjab

The strategies of political parties, whatever they may be, to win the elections in Punjab, have a high degree of harmoniousness with local political culture. In Punjab, the compatibility of electoral strategies with local political norms is the essential part of electoral campaign. Maximum level of compatibility of these strategies with local political ethos has better chances for party to win the contest. In the province, parties use different ways (according to demographic situation) to convince people of different political norms. In this way, parties adopt different tactics and strategies to meet the ends.

In electoral realm of Pakistan, political parties mostly adopt two types of strategies - Bridging and Bonding- to get popular support of the masses. In bridging strategies, a political party tries to design the electoral agenda for heterogeneous population. A political party plans to appeal votes indiscriminately from all segments of the electorates. It adopts uncontroversial middle way to convince people across the social groups. On the other hand, in bonding strategies, a political party postulates its electoral agenda for specific segment of the electorates. It works to attract homogenous population of the society.\textsuperscript{384} Under bonding strategies, a political

\textsuperscript{384} Ibid., 11.
parties frame their agenda to highlight narrow, locality-based issues and present possible solutions for local issues. Both strategies have impact on the voter’s choice/partisanship in Pakistani national elections. These strategies become effective when they are according to voter’s political culture.

Political parties in Punjab use both these strategies to gain popular support. Parties use both bridging and bonding strategies as per need and according to local cultural norms. Parties make bridging strategies to attract voters on national level. Through these strategies, parties express their plans (after winning the national elections) about national and international matters, like foreign, defense, and economic policies, constitutional, and ideological issues. Voters, who give weight to these issues, evaluate each party’s policies, and develop their partisanship. Partisanship (that a voter develops due to bridging strategies or above-mentioned issues) is losing affiliation of voters with a party. Such voters can shift their alliance and this partisanship is not based on lifetime loyalties.385

In the domain of bonding strategies, a party deals with community-based issues. Party puts solution for regional, provincial, or ethnic matters of the people. Political Party develops enduring affiliation with the voters and try to seek out voter’s problems related to their areas (provincial issues), profession, sectarian and ethnicity (in their electoral speeches, political parties’ leadership -under bonding strategies- attract particular segment of the electorates. For example, in Punjab province, parties’ leadership used cultural based slogans to attract the people. Leadership of political parties often wore the cultural icons or spoke local language of the areas (when they attended some public meeting in some specific area). Partisanship -that develops due to bonding strategies- is relatively long-lasting. Electorates maintain strong ties with parties and develop enduring loyalties. Therefore, in Punjab political parties use both -bridging and bonding-strategies to gain popular support but the use of bonding strategies is more effective. Parties who are using bonding strategies have bright chances of electoral success in national elections.386

Owing to highest share of electorates, Punjab province has vital importance in national elections. Popular political party of the province has bright chances to rule the whole country.387

385 Ibid., 10.
386 Author’s interviews with local Punjabi politicians from Multan, Lahore, Vehari, and Rawalpindi districts of the province. The question was asked regarding the role of political parties in their electoral success. July 22, 2017.
Therefore, all the political parties gave special attention to the province in electoral season. Popular political parties of the province (PPP, PML-N, PML-Q, and PTI) use both bridging and bonding strategies to remain popular in the province.

4.11.1 Electoral Strategies of Pakistan People’s Party (PPP) in Punjab

The 2002 and 2008 national elections results were good for PPP in Punjab (after the defeat in 1997 elections). Party’s comeback in these elections opened some ways of success in the province. In 2002, PPP took the advantages of the absence of Sharif family. While during 2008 national elections campaign, presences of Benazir Bhutto in the country strengthened the party, later her assassination beefed up the political strength of the party sympathy votes for the party. While in 2013 national elections party performed badly.

Since people’s party (PPP) formation in 1967, party adopted both bridging and bonding strategies to gain the support of people. In the domain of bridging strategies, party used traditional (religious, social and political) rhetoric to attract the people from ZA Bhutto times. In his era, ZA Bhutto utilized his personality and religiopolitical/sociopolitical rhetoric well to attract the people (especially during the 1970 elections campaign). Since 1970 elections, most of the party’s electoral strategies remained same. In the domain of bridging strategies party focused on religious ideology for the country (after ZA Bhutto, party has softened its religious rhetoric), democratic norms in the country, and criticize the military regime. The party feel proud of making of the 1973 constitution, starting nuclear program and development works during ZA and Benazir Bhutto times. The last elections speech of Benazir Bhutto in 2007 should the electoral strategies of party. She said in her speech that “Quaid-i-Awam Shaheed Bhutto formed PPP for the sake of poor, helpless and oppressed masses of the country… he made the defense of Pakistan inviolable and worked for the respect and honor of the country on the international level.” In the same speech, she admired the support of native for democratic government and their struggle against the autocratic regime of Zia. Another important and vibrant aspect of

---

388 During 1970 elections campaign, one of PPP’s campaign poster showed the focus of its electoral policies. The poster showed party’s tactics to use religion and local religio-cultural norms to attract the locals. Jones, The Pakistan People’s Party, 301.
PPP’s electoral strategies is to get sympathies of the people for the wrongdoing against the Bhutto family in the past.  390

In the domain of bonding strategies, primarily, PPP tries to attract the poor class of the country. Its slogan of the 1970s -Islam is our Religion; Democracy is our Politics; Socialism is our Economy; Power lies with the People- still have attraction in specific class of the masses. 391 To attract the small farmers, PPP’s government adopts agriculture friendly policies. 392 On the other hand, through some labor-friendly policies, party also got potential support in less developed areas of the province. 393

In the realm of bonding strategies, political parties of the Punjab also focus on the electables. Political Parties in Pakistan choose candidates who have strong socioeconomic background and have compatibility with local political norms. These candidates are used to fulfil the parties’ electoral ends (which are come under bonding strategies). PPP also uses the wrongdoings committed against Bhutto as bonding strategy, especially in Sindh. In Sindh PPP leadership mentioned these wrongdoings as conspiracy against Sindhi PMs (ZA and Benazir Bhutto). PPP utilized this card well in all last two national elections in the country, epically in the Sindh province (2008 & 2013). 394

Therefore, both strategies work well for PPP in national elections. Its leaderships’ efforts for democratic regime have substantial importance in the political realm of the country (left and

390 In almost every electoral speech of PPP’s leadership, they mentioned the capital punishment of ZA Bhutto, murder of his sons and assassination of Benazir Bhutto. They mentioned Bhutto family became victim because of their struggle for parliament democracy. Party famous elections slogans – like, Zinda Ha Bhutto Zinda Ha [Bhutto is alive and internal] and Tum Kitnay Bhutto Maro Gay? Har ghar say Bhutto Niklay ga! [You cannot defeat Bhutto, everyone in the country is Bhutto] - are also portray importance of Bhutto family in electoral strategies of the party. Ibid., 87.
391 In ZA Bhutto era, he did well to comply its’ party slogan. In several semi-structured interviews with the PPP voters in different parts of the province, they praise the ZA Bhutto’s policy of housing for poor people and it is the cause of party’s support. Zafar Jameel (native of Muzaffargarh), Rana Sajjad (native of people’s colony Vehari), Zaheer Ahmad (native of Faisalabad district) discussion with author. During the discussion, the question was asked regarding reasons of their attachments with PPP. March 2017.
392 In agriculture belt of the Punjab province (elections results of 2002 and 2008 in South Punjab, party performed better in the region than other parts of the province) PPP performed better than industrial areas of the province. Even the local farmers got good rates of their products during 2008-13. The land settlement of ZA Bhutto era was also party’s step to facilitate the small farmers of the country. Sohail Jehangir Malik, “Agriculture Policy in Pakistan – What it is and what it should be,” Pakistan Institution of Development Economic (PIDE) (2016). http://www.pide.org.pk/pdf/Seminar/AgriculturePolicyPakistan.pdf.
393 Wilder, The Pakistani Voter.
394 Since 2008 national elections PPP successfully set its provincial government in Sindh. Elections Commission of Pakistan, Reports on General Elections 2008 and 2013,
liberal classes of the country support the party). Sympathies for Bhutto family and use of Sindh card work best for party, epically in 2008 national elections. On the other hand, clientist policies of party also benefit the party in rural belt of the Punjab and Sindh provinces.

4.11.2 Electoral Strategies of Pakistan Muslims League - Nawaz (PML-N) in Punjab

Since 1985, the Nawaz family has clear hegemony over the electoral politics of Punjab. Nawaz Sharif and his family/party have deep political routes in the province and remain fittest (in electoral politics of the province). There are a lot of reasons behind party’s good performance. Party uses both bridging and bonding strategies efficiently in the province and gets popular support of the masses. In the domain of bridging strategies, party utilizes its ideological orientation, its associations with All India Muslims League (AIML), its decision to conduct nuclear tests in 1998, and its mega projects on national level. The party manipulates all three tasks well and gets potential support in the province.

Party adopts right-wing ideology and attracts religious class of the country. PML-N has large support of in hard-core religious circles. In this realm, party takes advantages because of liberal outlook of PPP and portrays party’s strong affliction with Islamic ideology through some constitutional acts. On the other hand, party called itself as the true heirs of Quaid-e-Azam’s Muslims League. The party traces its history since the start of independent movement in India in 1906. This strategy works well for the party in national elections and especially, the migrants of 1947 vote for party in the Punjab province.

---

396 In Punjab, people who have rigid religious thought are the support of PML-N. During the survey, the author met with people who are attending mosque regularly were the support of Nawaz League (till 2013 national elections). M. Ishan, Abdullah Hafeez, M. Kashif’s (in district Vehari and Muzaffargarh) discussion with author. The question was asked to these people, whom did you cast your vote in 2013 elections. March, 2017.
397 The party enjoyed the more support of religious people of the county as compared to other political parties. Nawaz Sharif stated its political career under the guidance of General Zia (renowned as a military ruler with radical Islamic ideas). In 1988 elections, he was also the part of an alliance of religious party IJI. In 1991, when Nawaz Sharif reached in PM office, his party passed *Sharait* Bill (which declared Quran and Sunnah as the source of law in the country) form the national assembly. After got the two-third majority in 1997 national elections, Nawaz Sharif did an unsuccessful attempt to introduce the Fifteenth Amendment Bill – a bill of dogmatic Islamic law. Ishtiq Ahmed, “Forthcoming Pakistan Elections: A Profile of Nawaz Sharif,” *Institute of South Asian Studies (ISAS)* 37 (2007).
In 1998, when India tested its nuclear arsenal, Nawaz government also decided to do the same. According to the party official sources, the decision of Nawaz government (to test the nuclear weapons), enhanced the Pakistani defense capabilities and maintained deterrence against India’s adventurism. The step of nuclear test had strengthened the party’s partisanship and Nawaz Sharif popularity. In elections campaign in 2013 (after the fifteen years of nuclear tests), party tried to attract the voters on the ground of these tests. The party leaders proclaimed that the brave decision of Nawaz Sharif made country undefeated against India.

The other important element of Nawaz League’s bridging strategies is the publicity of its development works. Throughout its government tenure, PML-N focuses on the development of roads, underpasses, overhead bridges, and to improve transportation system of the country. The making of motorway from Lahore to Islamabad (1997) is proclaimed as a big project of the party. The yellow cab scheme, cheap bread (Sasst Roti), and motorbus system made Nawaz-League popular in the whole Punjab.

PML-N also uses these tactics as bonding strategy and prefers only big cities of the Punjab. Most of the development budget of the Punjab during Nawaz League government is used in Lahore and other big cities of northern and central Punjab. These tactics work best for the party as compared to others. In last two national elections (2008 and 2013), party won eighty percent of the urban seats from Northern and Central Punjab.

While in the office of prime minister, Nawaz Sharif tries to combine dogmatic Islamic ideas with liberal economy. His government works for free market, trader’s interests, and to enhance the business activities in the country. His government introduces easy loan for youth,

---

401 Ahmed, “Forthcoming Pakistan Elections,”
402 Ibid.,
406 Nawaz Sharif is a right of center politician who enjoys a good name within the rightwing Islamist parties and organizations and he is also firmly committed to the free market and globalization. Ahmed, “Forthcoming Pakistan Elections,”
traders and works for rapid industrialization. These strategies develop strong bonding between the party and voters having business or trade background. Another important reason behind Nawaz League’s popularity is, its bounding strategies with local elites/electable. The party (like PPP) attracts voters from small cities or rural belt through electable or local leaders. Therefore, the blend of all these strategies makes Nawaz League one of the most successful party in the electoral realm of Punjab.

Another political party, which has potential to become popular party in Punjab, is Imran Khan’s Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf (PTI). The results of 2013 national elections made his party a potential contender in the provincial politics. Party’s electoral strategies is leadership based and mostly come under the domain of bridging strategies. Party attracts the voters on bases of corruption, bad governance and mismanagement of the ruling parties (PPP Nawaz League). Due to these strategies, Khan and its party remained successful to attract educated and young class of throughout the province.

Conclusion
The partisan voter is an important factor of electoral politics in Punjab province. The province has substantial number of votes, especially in the urban belt. Throughout the electoral history, such voters do their role in the success or failure of any political party. The partisan voter is a devoted support of his political party. In Punjab, the bad governance of the political party or poor electoral strategies also affect the partisanship, but political parties still are important actor in the Punjab’s politics. The ethos of local political culture influences the partisan voter in Punjab province, in many ways. The voter’s political culture (voter’s belief and evaluation) guides him to select a political party. This ethos of local political culture deigns the voter’s orientation and

---

407 During interviews with the voters in Lahore and Gujranwala district, most of the people who have small industries or trade business are the supporters of Nawaz League, because of party’s business-friendly policies. Rana Sabhat (factory owner in Lahore), and Iqbal Bhatti (A factory owner in Gujranwala) talked with author, the question was asked regarding the reasons behind t support for Nawaz League. February 13-15, 2017.


409 The researcher observed the phenomena that, during the interviews with voters in Vehari, Lahore and Rawalpindi districts, that young students and relatively educated class of these areas cast their votes for PTI. Sohaib Khalid, Bilal Khalid (student from NUST Islamabad) talked with author. The question was asked regarding their votes in 2013 general elections. February 22, 2017.
set his choices about political parties. On the other hand, the strategies of political parties (bounding and bridging strategies) strengthen the relationship between voter and political party.
Chapter 5
Candidate Voter in Punjab

5.1 Introduction

Since the first national elections in 1970, the trilateral relationship -among the voter, political parties, and the contesting candidates- personalized the electoral politics in the country. The individual personality of the Punjabi voter, his social needs, his family, his personality, his cultural ethos, and his external environment design his political culture. These voting trends -trends of personalized politics also- got vital position and became important ingredients in individual’s voting behaviour. The success of the political parties (second actor of the trilateral relationship) in the province has been revolving around some political families or some individuals. The diversity and distinctiveness of political parties are declining. The political parties (in Punjab province) do electoral politics on ethic, regional, and patronage bases. While the contesting candidates (third actor of trilateral relationship), in the province develop their campaign strategies to attract a specific segment of the society. They develop patron-client relations with voters and try to enhance their valence and utility in their areas. The combination these factors make electoral candidate effective in the province.

The current chapter of the dissertation deals with the question that ‘how does the ethos of local political culture of Punjabi voter impact his candidate’s evaluation (how a voter in Punjab province evaluates an electoral candidate) in last three national elections. The research discusses the candidate’s campaign tactics, his personality traits, and their impact on the voting behaviour of local Punjabis. In present chapter, the study discusses the role of local political culture, its impact on candidate’s evaluation and the rise of personalized politics in Punjab. Further the research also explains the impact of candidate’s campaign tactics and his personality, traits, and valence as intervening variables in voting action in the province.

The chapter deals with two factors of voting behaviour; first, the research focuses on the question that how the Punjabi voter evaluates the candidate in national elections. The current study also discusses only the variables of local political culture and their impact upon Pakistani voter. For this purpose, the research explains the existing models of candidate’s evaluation and

---

410Personalize means, to make something specific for an individual, and to mark something as the property of some particular person. Personalized politics is the type of politics, in which an individual’s personality (voter) has vital impact in his political decision making. “Personalized,” Merriam-Webster.
then with the help of these models, develops a model of candidates’ evaluation for Punjabi voter. Later in that part, the current part of the dissertation analyses the model with empirical examples from national elections in Punjab.

The second part of the chapter deals with candidates’ campaign tactics, his valence, and his patronage relations with the voter. The part focuses on the compatibility of above-mentioned factors with the local political culture of the voter. Here, the research examines the assumption that the maximum compatibility of candidate’s campaign with local political culture also maximizes his probabilities of winning in national elections.

5.2 Models of Candidates’ Evaluation

Most of the models of candidate’s evaluation (the sociological models, the socio-psychological model, rational choice theory, black-box model, and impression-driven model) cover three aspects of candidate voter. First, these models discuss the cultural norms, social value and external environment of the society and their impact on his behaviour. In this step, these models also measure the influence of voter’s memories, their past experiences, and their needs on their voting behaviour. Second, these models analyze the political situation, economic condition, institutional set-up and electoral engineering in the country and their relations with voter’s behaviour. Third, these models measure the impact of the candidate’s personality and his electoral strategies over voting behaviour.

Milton Lodge calls the models of candidate’s evaluation as ‘memory-based models.’ According to him, in most of memory-based models of candidate’s evaluation (the sociological models, the socio-psychological model and rational choice theory) the voter’s memory has a central role in his decision of voting. He further explains the positive relation exists between voter’s memory and his evaluation of a candidate (according to memory-based models).

The ‘impression-driven model of candidate evaluation’ tries to cover the limitations of memory-based models. According to the model, “voter takes the effect from stimuli upon exposure and immediately integrates it into an evaluation, without having to remember the specific evidence that originally led to their evaluation.”

---

412 The data of memory-based models are predicted the voter’s behaviour (in approximately ninety-five present of cases). Ibid., 12.
413 Ibid., 11.
414 Ibid., 12.
is established, voter becomes cognitive miser. He just stores the summary of the evaluation and uses this summary to evaluate the candidate. Therefore, according to the model, voter’s stimuli from the environment, his rationalization, and his stereotypes work to vote for candidate, rather than his memory.

With the development of Columbia and Michigan models of voting, psychologically based research takes the central position in candidates’ evaluation. The S-O-R chain\(^{415}\) (Stimulus, Organism and Response chain) explains the voting behaviour as the voter’s response depends upon the stimuli and organism. Voter takes action after taking the stimuli from external environment and then his organism (with certain characteristics and capabilities) directs the voter’s response in the favor of any candidate.\(^{416}\) Later, Edward C. Tolman replaces the S-O-R chain with independent, dependent and intervening variables of voting behaviour. Tolman declares, voter’s social, cultural, physical factors and his psychological condition are the independent variables of voting. While, personal needs and non-cognitive things, work as intervening variables in in voting persuasion.\(^{417}\)

Lazarsfeld has explained the role of needs and external occasions in human action and how the subjective reality of an individual drives these factors (external needs and external occasions). These tendencies guide voter’s behaviour. In this case of voting, the mental, sensory, and motoric capabilities\(^{418}\) (that a voter has) direct the voting behaviour. While, the attributes of voter’s social and physical environment\(^{419}\) (family, extended family, friends) design his political disposition.

The cognitive models explain voting action as; ‘the voter may have hundreds of schemata to analyze the (in given) political situation. These schemata become activated according to voter’s perception of the social context and his relationship with the context.\(^{420}\) These models also explain the five cognitive categories to underline the personality traits of the candidate.

---


\(^{419}\) Ibid., 395-398.

\(^{420}\) Visser, *Five Theories of Voting Action*, 51.
According to Miller, these categories are the competence, personal traits, charisma, integrity, and reliability of the candidate. These personality traits of a candidate help voter in cognitive reasoning.\(^{421}\) Thus the cognitive theories of voting action explain the voter’s perception as, voter social context, his past experience, and the personality traits of the candidates (directs a voter about his voting behaviour).

Maslow’s hierarchy of human’s needs and their correlation with voting action gives a new direction to see the voting behaviour of people. Maslow defines the fivefold hierarchy of human needs. He puts physiological needs on the top, where a human desire to satisfy his somatic based needs such as bodily maintenance. On the second step, he puts safety needs, where a human desire to protect himself from suffering, pains, and difficult situations. On the third step, he mentions belongingness and love needs. In the needs of belongingness and love needs, a man wishes social relationship, affection, love, and belongingness. On the fourth level, he ranks esteem needs, where a human wishes self-respect from the others. After the fulfillment of above-mentioned needs, a human realizes the needs of self-actualization (in the fifth step), where he wants to know himself and works for self-actualization.\(^{422}\)

Later, Inglehart has connected these needs with voting behaviour or candidate’s evaluation. According to him, the voter who prefers material needs or his subjective benefits, votes for the rightist parties or candidate. While the voter who thinks about environmental hazards, green energy, self-esteem and self-actualization, vote for liberal or leftist candidates/political parties.\(^{423}\) Therefore, hierarchy of needs also focuses on the social context, economic needs and political situation of the country and their impact on voting behaviour.

Primarily, the models/theories of candidate’s evaluation work in two ways. First group of theorist focuses on the candidate’s personality, his character, values, campaign tactics, and charisma. They consider candidate’s traits are the dominant factors in voting decisions. Theorists from this group consider candidate’s qualities (like campaign strategies, personal quality, and performance in office) influence the voter in elections.\(^{424}\) James Adams and Samuel Merrill divide the candidate’s qualities into two parts: namely strategic valence and character valence. In

\(^{421}\) Ibid., 52.
\(^{422}\) Ibid., 75-76.
strategic valence of a candidate, James Adams and Samuel Merrill put factors such as recognition of a candidate, his fundraising ability, and his campaign skills. While, the character valence is composed of candidate s’ diligence, competence, and integrity.425

The second group (of candidate’s evaluation models) has focused on the voter’s personality, his social location, and his rational utility. They think, voter and his character are the driving factors in voting action. In this domain the proximity and directional theories give a new pattern to evaluate a candidate. According to proximity theory, voter prefers to vote for such candidate, who has the closest proximity to the voter. While the directional theory offers two hypotheses related to voter’s evaluation about candidate. First, the voter chooses a candidates (may be more than one) of his own side, among all the contesting candidates. The voter’s choice is based on his social location, some political issues, or his patron relations with candidate. On the second step, the voter adopts proximity theory and votes for such candidate, who has closest proximity with him.426 Therefore the debate on candidate’s evaluation has two dimensions; one considers candidate valence and character as dominant factors to attract the voter. While the other, prefers voter’s predisposition and his socio-political needs to evaluate a candidate.

5.2 Candidates’ Evaluation Model in Punjab

Candidate voter –a voter who votes for individual candidate, rather than a political party-behaves not too much different from the partisan voter in Punjab province. Dominance of belief and evaluation (the basic assumption of this research that the voter’s believe and subjective utility drive their voting behaviour in national elections in Punjab) remains intact the case of candidate voter, as it is vibrant in partisan voter. Candidate voter -same as the partisan voter in the province- follows his inclination, his social location, and the ethos of local political culture. Although, there are some potential differences between them in the province. The candidate voter in the Punjab has different parameters of subjective utility (evaluation) from the party’s voter. He is more concerned about the costs and benefits of his vote. His caste, kin, social location, and past experiences work vibrantly in the case of voting behaviour Candidate voter is

more personalized and prefers individualism rather than the collectivism. Candidate voter has relatively weak bounding with candidate as compared to party voter.\textsuperscript{427}

Models of candidate’s evaluation of voting behaviour cover two dominating aspects. First, the impact of electorate’s personality, his location, and his ethos of local culture affects voting decision. Second, the influence of candidate valance, his traits, and his campaign tactics on electorate’s decision. In electoral scenario of the Punjab, voter’s ethos of political culture and his own personality traits and more importantly his cultural ethos have the central impact on voting decision. On the other hand, candidate’s traits influence the voter’s decision indirectly. Electoral candidates develop their strategies according to political culture and social atmosphere of the voter. The maximum compatibility of candidate’s electoral strategies with socio-political culture of the voter maximizes his chances of winning in national elections.\textsuperscript{428}

The model for the evaluation of candidate voter in Punjab province gets the direction from all above-mentioned models and sets assumptions. The first assumption of the model is, ‘the candidate voter in Punjab chooses the candidates – may be more than one- of his own side in the national elections (step one).’ The assumption covers the aspects of voter’s believe, and such things help him to select candidates of voter’s side (candidates’ compatibility with voter political culture/ethos and socioeconomic background)

- Voter’s personal traits
- Voter’s social location
- Voter’s local cultural trends

In step one, voter’s biological and social needs have dominant impact on his choice. His social location, local cultural trends and his personal needs influence his decision to choose electoral candidates on his own side. For example, in this step, voter prefers the candidate from his kin, or caste. The social location and culture ethos have vibrant impact on voter’s choice in this step. The combination of these two develop voter’s political predisposition and he selects candidates from his own side.

\textsuperscript{427} These observations are based on interviews with locals in different districts of the province. M. Shoaib (Sargodha district), Rasheed Hafeez (Khushab district), Zohaib Khan (DG Khan district), Imran Liquat (Rajanpur district), dissuasion with author. The questions were asked, what did influence your voting decision most in national elections. February- March 2017.

\textsuperscript{428} The model of candidate’s evaluation has an assumption that, the compatibility of candidate’s electoral strategies with local ethos increase his chances of winning.
In second step (second assumption), after the compilation of first step, the voter evaluates the candidates and finds the proximity with one of these candidates. Following things work to develop voter’s proximity with the candidate,

- Subjective utility of the voter – cost benefit analysis of his vote
- Voter’s past experiences and patronage relationship with the candidate
- Candidate’s performance/valence in the office – if candidate won last elections
- Candidate’s political party
- Compatibility of candidate’s electoral strategies with voter’s ethos
- Candidate’s electability

In this step, subjective utility of the voter becomes vibrant, where voter sees maximum benefits of his vote and measures possible cost. In subjective utility, voter’s internal fears also guide him towards a specific candidate. His patronage relations with the candidate and candidate’s chances of winning also help the voter to find proximity with one among the candidates. Proximity between voter’s need and candidate valence (his effectiveness in solving voter’s social problems) help voter in decision making.

5.1: Two-Steps Model of Candidate Voter

The two-steps model works effectively in the Punjab province national elections. The results of last three national elections have revealed that the rise of personalized politics, valence
of candidates and the importance of electable are the important features of electoral history in the Punjab province. The following part covers the analysis of aforementioned factors with empirical evidences from the personal accounts and electoral data.

5.4 **Electoral Candidate’s Evaluation in Punjab**

The two-steps model of candidate’s evaluation helps to find out the basic criteria for candidates’ electability\(^{429}\) in the Punjab province. Both the steps of the model illustrate the guidelines for the voter to elect a candidate. The socio-political trends of the voter help him to find out the candidate of his liking. On the other hand, his subjective utility sets his proximity with one the candidate.

5.5 **Impact of Voter’s Socio-Political Ethos over Candidate’s Evaluation**

The step-one of the model covers the socio-political traits of the voter. Where voter’s family, his social location, and local cultural norms design (model’s first step) of voting behaviour. In Punjab, voter has strong bounding with electoral candidates. In last three national elections, in many districts of the province, the factors of two-steps model have been vibrant. To analyze the model, the research covers four districts (namely as, Rawalpindi, Gujrat, Vehari, and Muzaffargarh) of the Punjab as sample to analyze the –above-mentioned- framework. The research picks these four districts- first- because of geographical reason. These four district cover all three parts -north, center, south and- of the province (Rawalpindi district form the northern part of the Punjab province, second (Gujrat) form central/upper part of the province, third (Vehari) form southern part and last (Muzaffargarh) form southern/western part of the province). Second reason of choosing these districts is different level of development in these areas. The first district (Rawalpindi) is developed and urbanized part of the province, the second (Vehari) is semi-developed and less-urbanized, the third one (Muzaffargarh) least-developed or poorly developed and the fourth one (Gujrat) is relatively more developed than Vehari but less than Rawalpindi.\(^{430}\) Third reason of taking these districts as sample to analyze the two-steps model of Candidate voter is the sustainability of dynastic politics, voting trends and

\(^{429}\) Electability means, a person’s ability or chances of being elected in any public office. “Electability,” *Merriam-Webster*.


132
valence of political families/individuals in the electoral politics of these areas. These powerful elite have strong routes and stable vote bank in these districts. Therefore, the candidate voter is visible reality in the electoral politics of the province. The following part of the chapter covers,

- Electoral history of Rawalpindi, Gujrat, Vehari, and Muzaffargarh districts since 2002 national elections.
- Influential political families and individuals in these districts.
- Voting trends in these areas via electoral data

5.5.1 Rawalpindi District

The politicians of Rawalpindi district have central importance in the electoral politics of the Punjab. Politicians –winners in the national elections- form the district have vibrant role decision making in the country and gain important portfolios in central and provincial cabinet. The prominent politicians of the area – Ch. Nisar Ali Khan, Shaikh Rashid Ahmad, Shahid Khaqan Abbasi, and Raja Pervaiz Ashraf- have played vital role in government making throughout the electoral history of the country. All these individuals have strong vote bank and valence in their areas. Most of them have stable clan’s votes and long history of success in their constituencies.

431 Ch. Nisar Ali Khan is an influential figure in the politics of Pakistan as well as in Nawaz League. He is only living politician in the country, who won last eight national elections in a row. In every government of Nawaz League in the center, Ch. Nisar took important portfolio in central cabinet. During 1990s, in two terms of Nawaz League, he had the portfolio as minister of petroleum and natural resources. In 2008, he was the opposition leader and in 2013 he took the post of federal minister of Interior and Narcotics. “Chaudhry Nisar Ali Khan,” Pakistrani Leader Online. https://www.pakistanileaders.com.pk/profile/Chaudhry_Nisar_Ali_Khan
432 Shaikh Rashid Ahmad –hails from Rawalpindi- is also an important political figure of the country. He also won seven national elections from the district since 1985 elections. He worked on several portfolio in federal cabinet as minister of ‘Railways, Information and Broadcasting.’ In 2008 – after lost the elections badly- he left Q-League and launched his own party named as Awami Muslims League Pakistan (AMLP). “Sheikh Rasheed Ahmad,” Dawn, April 28, 2013. https://www.dawn.com/news/1025642
433 Shahid Khaqan Abbasi is another famous political figure of the area, he won seven national elections from the same area. He also worked on several posts in federal cabinet as well. During 1990s, he worked as parliamentary security of defense, Chairman of Standing Committee of National Assembly and Chairman Pakistan International Airline (PIA). In 2008, he had the portfolio of minister of Commerce and defense production in federal cabinet. In 2013, he took the oath of minister of Petroleum and Natural Resources. After Nawaz Sharif’s disqualification in July 2017, he became PM of the country. “Profile of Shahid Khaqan Abbasi: Pakistan’s Interim Prime Minister,” The News, July 30, 2017. https://www.thenews.com.pk/latest/220079-Profile-of-Shahid-Khaqan-Abbasi-Pakistans-interim-prime-minister
The district has seven national assembly constituencies (NA-50 to NA-56) since 2002 national elections. In 2002 national elections, Ghulam Murtaza Satti (PPP) was the winner with forty-three percent of the polled votes form NA-50. While Shahid Khaqan Abbasi (N-League) was runner-up with thirty-seven percent of the polled votes. In 2008, Shahid Khaqan Abbasi (N-League) won the elections with forty-seven percent of polled votes and Ghulam Murtaza Satti (PPP) lost the elections with thirty-seven percent of polled votes. In 2013, Shahid Khaqan Abbasi (N-League) won the elections once again with more than fifty percent of the polled votes. In 2013 elections, Ghulam Murtaza Satti lost the contest and he got seventeen percent of the polled votes.

In all three last national elections form NA-51, Raja Pervaiz Ashraf was the PPP’s candidate. He won 2002 elections (forty-six percent of the polled votes) and 2008 elections (thirty-eight percent of the polled votes) and lost the elections in 2013 (with 28 percent of the polled votes). In this constituency, Nawaz league changed its candidates in every elections, the runner-up of 2008 elections Raja Qasim Javed Ikhlas (Q-League, got thirty-three percent of the polled votes) and winner of 2013 Raja Javed Ikhlas- father of Qasim Javed Ikhlas- (N-League, got forty-nine percent of polled votes) hails from the same clan. Even the winners of all three elections in that constituency have same surname (Raja).

Ch. Nisar Ali Khan – a prominent political personality of the area as well as of the Punjab- won all three national elections from NA-52.\(^{435}\) Since 2002 national elections, he won the election on Nawaz-League tickets.\(^{436}\) The contenders of Nisar Ali Khan changed in every election. In 2002, and 2008 elections Nasir Raja (Q-League) gave a tough competition to Ch. Nisar. He got thirty-eight percent votes in 2002 elections, and twenty-eight percent of the polled votes in 2008 elections. In 2013, Basharat Raja (PML-Q) and Ajmal Shabir Raja (hailing from the same clan of Raja, on PTI ticket) took substantial votes from the area.

Ch. Nisar Ali Khan has dominant role in NA-53 also. He won the 2008 elections (got forty percent the polled votes) and remained runner-up in 2002 (thirty-eight percent of the polled votes). In 2013 elections, he got forty-three percent of polled votes and lost the elections. In all three national elections, the area remained battle ground between Ch. Nisar and Ghulam Sarwar.

---


\(^{436}\) He had 49% of polled votes in 2002 elections, approximately 50% in 2008 elections and 52 % in 2013 elections. Election Commission of Pakistan, *Reports on national elections 2002, 2008 and 2013.*
Ghulam Sarwar won the 2002 and 2013 elections (with forty-five percent of the polled votes in 2002, with forty-six percent of the polled votes in 2013). He remained runner-up on PML-Q ticket in 2008 elections (with twenty-seven percent of the polled votes). From NA-54, two candidates – Malik Abrar Ahmad and Zumurd Khan- had potential vote bank in last three national elections. In 2002, Zumurd Khan won the seat (with thirty-eight percent of polled votes), remained runner-up in 2008 (with thirty-two percent of polled votes) and got third position in 2013 from PPP ticket. On the other hand, Malik Abrar participated in 2008 and 2013 national elections and won both the elections with high percentage of polled votes.

NA- 55 and NA- 56 are two relatively urban parts of Rawalpindi district. These areas are only part of the district where the candidates from outside the district (candidates, not hails from the district in local language of the areas, people called locals ‘Pindi Wal’ [people live in Rawalpindi district]) have won the seats. In 2008 national elections, Javed Hashmi (Nawaz League) won the elections from NA-55 and in 2013, Imran Khan (chairman PTI) won the elections from NA-56. In 2002, a prominent political personality from the Rawalpindi district, Sheikh Rasheed Ahmad won both the seats of NA-55 & 56 (with forty-one percent of polled votes in NA-55 and thirty-six percent from NA-56) as independent candidate. He also regained the seat of NA-55 in 2013 (with approximately fifty percent the polled votes). The detail results analysis of last three national elections of the district illustrates such factors,

- In most of the areas of district the contest remained between two candidates.
- Approximately in sixty percent of the constituencies of the district, the winner and runner-ups have been the same for fifteen years.
- The popular political parties of the province (PPP, PML-N, and PML) never changed their winning candidates from any constituency of the district.
- People voted for those candidates who had strong valence with good patron-client relations with voters.

---

437 Since 2002 elections, both these candidates have been winner or runner up. Elections Commission of Pakistan, Reports on national elections 2002, 2008 and 2013.
438 He had 58% of polled votes in 2008 and 46% in 2013 national elections. Elections Commission of Pakistan, Reports on General Elections 2013.
440 During the interviews with the local people, they have mentioned that, candidate’s patron-client relations with voter, his influence in government offices –especially in police stations- and their valence in the area, make him
5.5.2 Gujrat District

The analysis of voters and electoral candidates in Gujrat district is supportive to understand the credibility of the two-steps model of candidate’s evaluation. The voters and their commitments with local candidates, based on social location, local political norms, patron-client relations, and the electability of candidates. Since the advent of electoral politics in the country, certain local families have been ruling the district. The political families in the district have strong financial background. Their stable economic and social status have made Gujrat district prominent in the electoral politics of the province.

Political families of Gujrat have important positions in the decision-making on provincial and national level governance. Chaudhary Zahoor Elahi’s family is among the few influential actors in the political decision-making of the country. Ch. Zahoor Elahi was in active politics since 1958 and became the opposition leader in first elected national assembly (after 1970 elections) of the country. Later, one of his sons- Ch. Shujat Hussain- worked as federal minister (1985-88, 1990-93, 2002-07) on different portfolios, and became PM in 2004. The other son of Zahoor Elahi -Ch. Wajahat Hussain- won the provincial assembly elections four times (in 1998, 1993, 1996 and 2002 form Gujrat), national assembly elections two times (2002 and 2008) and served as federal minister during 2002 to 2007. Third son of Zahoor Elahi - Ch. Shafat Hussain- had the position of district chairman (1997-99) and district nazim twice (2001-05 and 2005 to 08). The dynasty of late Zahoor Elahi had worked in almost all the important public/political offices in the country. His nephew -Ch. Pervaiz Elahi- enjoyed the portfolios of provincial minister (1985-88, 1990-93), speaker Punjab assembly (1997-99), opposition leader in Punjab assembly (1993-96), chief minister of Punjab (2002-07), deputy-PM of the country (2012-13), and member of national assembly (2013). Now, the third generation of the family is the part of the constitution assemblies. Moonis Elahi -son of Pervaiz Elahi and grandson of Zahoor Elahi- has been in the Punjab assembly since 2008 elections.

---


In 2000, the Chaudharies’ of Gujrat (Zahoor Elahi’s family) and the other stalwarts of Nawaz-League separated their ways from Nawaz Sharif. They formed – under the patronage of General Musharraf- their own political party, named as PML-Q. The Chaudhary family dominated the party after electoral success in 2002 national elections and Ch. Shujat Hussain became the president of the party in 2003. In 2002 elections, two national assembly seats of Gujrat district (NA -104 & 105) and one in provincial assembly (PP- 110) won by the Chaudhary family. Pervaiz Elahi vacated the seats of PP-110 were (due to winning another seat of the Punjab assembly). By-elections were held in January 2003. Close associate of Chaudhary family – Basharat Raja, not hailing form Gujrat district- contested the elections and got ninety-seven percent of polled votes. In national elections 2002, runner-up from –Tariq Javed- the PP-110 had more than twenty thousand votes (twenty-seven percent of polled votes). While in by-election the same candidate had one thousand votes (one and half percent of polled votes) approximately. Chaudharies’ political party (PML-Q) was not in good position in 2008 elections, although the family secured good number of seats from the district. In 2013 elections, PML-Q had two seats of national assembly in the Punjab, one from Gujrat (Pervaiz Elahi won the seat of NA-105).

Other prominent political personalities of Gujrat are Ch. Ahmad Mukhtar and Ch. Qamar Zaman Karia. Ch. Ahmad Mukhtar is among the top businessman of the country and had been the chairman of Pakistan International Airlines (PIA). He won the 2008 elections (NA-105) and became the defence minister of the country. Qamar Zaman Karia is a stalwart of PPP and won 2002 and 2008 elections from the Gujrat (NA-106). He was minister of information during PPP government in 2008-13. His cousin -Tanveen Asharf Karia- also won two elections (2002 & 08) of provincial assembly (PP-112) from the district.


\[\text{444 Pakistan Muslim League – Quaid,” Dawn.}\]

\[\text{445 Ch. Shujat, Ch. Wajahat, won the seats of national assembly and Pervaiz Elahi won the seats of provincial assembly. Church World Service, The Pakistan Elections Compendium, 175.}\]

\[\text{446 Ibid., 80.}\]

\[\text{447 Ch. Wajahat won the seat from NA-104, but Ch. Shujat was runner-up in NA-105(later he became the member in the upper-house of legislation). Moonis Elehi – Pervaiz Elahi’s son- the provincial assembly seat from PP-110. Election Commission of Pakistan, Report on General Elections 2008.}\]

Nawabzada family of Gujrat has also been active in the electoral politics of Gujrat. In pre-partition era (1921), Nawab Sir Fazal Ali became the first chairman of district board of Gujrat, and the member of Punjab legislative assembly (1937-42). His brother – Nawabzada Asghar Ali- was also the member of Punjab legislative assembly in 1942-47 and 1951-55. The family had been contesting for the provincial assembly seat since 1977 to 2013 elections, and won six times, and remained runner-up in rest of the national elections. In 1977 elections, Nawabzada Zafar Mehdi, in 1985 elections, Nawabzada Mehar Ali, in 1990 and in 1993 elections Nawabzada Ghazanfar Ali, and in 2013 elections Haider Mehdi won their seats. The detail results analysis of last three national elections of the district illustrates such factors,

- Political families of the district have dominant influence over the politics of the district.
- People of the district are closely associated with such family.
- Clan politics have vibrant role in national elections.
- Candidate’s patronage relations maximize his electability

5.5.3 Vehari District

Vehari district lies in the southern part of the Punjab province. Many prominent names in country’s politics, –Mumtaz Daultana (second Chief Minister of Punjab), Tehmina Daultana (ex-minister of education, science and technology in federal cabinet), Ishaq Khan Khakwani (ex-minister of state for information technology, telecommunication, and railways, senior vice-president of PTI) - hail from Vehari.

In the all four national assembly constituencies (NA -167 to 170) of the district, electables and personalized politics play decisive role. The few elite clans/families -Daultanas, Khichis, Mians, Shahs, and Manains - of the district have influencing impact over the electoral politics of the area since it has been started in 1970s. The members of these political families have strong hold in the local government, provincial and national assembly constituencies of the district. In most of the electoral competitions in the district, these families have been active players in the electoral competitions. In the last three elections - 2002, 2008, and 2013- at least one member from these family reached provincial assembly or national assembly in each elections.

In 2002 elections, Tehmina Daultana (NA-169) and her cousin Shahida Daultana (NA-168) were runner-up in two national assembly constituencies of the district. Later, Tehmina Daultana reached in national assembly on reserved seats for women (on Nawaz League ticket). The 2008 elections were good for the Daultanas, two members of the family reached in national assembly. Tehmina Daultana won the elections from NA-169 and her nephew Azeem Khan Daultana won the elections from NA-168. In 2013 national elections, Tehmina contested the elections fifth time consecutively from Vehari city (NA-169 and NA-130), but lost the elections (got thirty-seven of the polled votes, approximately).\footnote{Before 2002 elections, the constituency marked as NA-130 and later as NA-167. Tehmina Daultana contested the elections from areas since 1993 national elections. She won the seat in 1993, 1997, and 2008. Elections Commission of Pakistan, \textit{Reports of General Elections 1988-1997, 2002, 2008 and 2013}.} Although, she reached the assembly once again on reserved quota for women. However, her son Irfan Aqeel Daultana won the provincial assembly seat (PP-234). Another member of the family – Natasha Daultana- also contested the elections from NA-167, got twenty-three percent of polled votes and lost the elections.

Politically, Kichis are also among the prominent political family of the district. They have influencing impact over the electoral politics of the district.\footnote{During 1990s, Dilwar Khan Kichi and Ghulam Haider Kichi were influential candidates of the family Dilwar Khan won two national elections 1990 and 1997 from NA-129 and remained runner-up in 1993 elections. While Ghulam Haider Kichi won the four elections of provincial assembly (PP-194) in row from 1998 to 1997 elections. Elections Commission of Pakistan, \textit{Reports on General Elections 1988-97}.} In last three elections (2002, 2008 and 2013), they remained prominent in the district. In 2002 elections, Aftab Khan Kichi won the national assembly elections (with approximately forty-five percent of polled votes in NA-169) from the constituency of Vehari city. At the same time, his father – Mumtaz Khan Kichi- was the district nazim of the area (2001-2006). Aftab Kichi s’ cousin – Aurangzeb Kichi- remained runner-up from NA-170. Another member of the clan – Javed Iqbal Kichi- won the province assembly seat (PP-237), in the same elections.\footnote{The runner-up candidate from the area was hailed from same clan, Mahmood Khan Kichi. Both the candidates of the clan had 85% of total polled votes and had a difference of just 743 votes. Elections Commission of Pakistan, \textit{Report on General Elections 2002}.}

In 2008, Aftab Kichi lost the elections (with a margin of three thousand of votes and getting approximately thirty percent of polled votes) from NA-169, and Aurangzeb Kichi remained runner-up from NA-170. The member of the clan – Saradr Khan Kichi- won the provincial assembly seats from PP-239. In 2013, Aftab Kichi once again contested from same constituency but lost and got thirteen percent of polled votes. His cousin- Aurangzeb Kichi- remained runner-up third time from another area of district and got forty-one percent of polled votes. Jahanzaib
Kichi- brother of Aurangzeb Kichi- won the provincial assembly from PP-239 (only PTI’s seat in the district). Therefore, the family is still influential, dominant, and active in the electoral politics of district.

Other politically significant families of the district Vehari are, Shahs of Burewala, Arains of Burewala and Vehari Tehsils, and Manais of Mailsi tehsil. Shahid Mehdi of Shah Family remained popular in the Burewala, and had won three elections (1988, 1990 and 1996 from NA-131). The family did not participate in 2002 elections and Sajid Mehdi – brother of Shahid Mehdi- was runner-up in 2008 elections. In 2013, Sajid Mehdi won the elections from NA-168. The family is also active in local government politics and Shahid Mehdi was the district Nazim from 2006 to 2010.

Arains of Burewala and Vehari (tehsils) are significant in provincial assembly of the district. In Burewala tehsil, Ch. Nazeer Arain contested the elections from PP-233 in 2008 and 2013 and was runner-up in both elections. He won the elections of national assembly in 2013 from NA-167. In Vehari tehsil, Arains are also influential in PP-236 (PP-195 before 2002 elections). Main Saqib Khurshid won every contested elections of his political tenure. He won the provincial assembly elections of 1993, 1996 and 2013 from Vehari and secured the seat of tehsil nazim in 2001 and 2006.

The Manais of Malisi are one of the most successful families in the electoral politics of the district. Saeed Ahmad Manais won the three elections in 1988, 1990 and 1996 from PP-193 and had runner-up in 1993. Later, his son –Asif Saeed- won the elections of 2002, 2008 and 2013 from same area (PP-238).\(^{453}\) Another son of Saeed Ahamd –Asim Saeed- won two consecutive terms of tehsil nazim of Malsi (2001-05 & 2005-10) and worked as Vice-chairman of district Vehari. In 2008 elections, Saeed Ahmad switched to national assembly and contested the elections on two seats (NA-169 & 170) and lost the elections. He won the 2013 elections from NA-170.\(^{454}\)

In the electoral politics of the district, two candidates – Nazir Ahmad Jutt and Ch. Tahir Iqbal-, have emerged without political background and backing of political parties. They entered


\(^{454}\) After, 2015 local bodies’ elections in district Vehari, Saeed Ahmad Manais family has its members in every house of the country. Saeed Ahamd was MNA, one of his Asif Saeed had a seat of MPA and member provincial assembly committee, and another son –Asim sadeed- had elected as vice-chairman in local government. Elections Commission of Pakistan, \textit{Report on General Elections and Local Body Elections}. 

140
in the electoral politics in 2002 and attained significant position in the district. Both of them have won more than one elections with different political parties. They have strong patron-client relations, valence in the area, and supported their voters/supporters in every case. Nazir Jutt contested the first national elections in 2002 from NA-167 (on PML-Q ticket) and won the elections (with more than fifty percent of polled votes). In 2008, he won the elections from the same constituency against the big names of the area. In these elections, he was the only winner of the district with Q-League (PML) ticket. In 2010, he resigned from his position due to the fake degree. His nephew – Asghar Ali Jutt- contested the elections with PPP ticket and secured the seat once again (with the margin of more than twenty-two thousands votes, against the big names of the area). In 2013 elections, Nazir Jutt did a surprise move. Four women (Two of his daughters and two spouses) of his family contested the elections (he himself did not participate the elections due to disqualification on the account of fake degree). Two of his daughters - Aysha Nazir Jutt (NA-167) & Arifa Nazir Jutt (NA-168) - and one of his wife - Abida Jutt (NA-169) - participated in national assembly elections and the other wife - Hajra Nazir Jutt- took part in provincial assembly elections from PP-233. They lost the elections. However, Nazir Jutt’s family is still influential in the district. In August 2016, Aysha Nazir contested the by-poll election against Nawaz-government candidate – Yousaf Kaselia- form PP-232. She got forty-eight percent of polled votes and lost the elections with a margin of one thousand votes. Tahir Iqbal a prominent politician of Vehari Tehsil and has been successful in the last three national elections. He defeated the big political names and families in every election. In 2002 and 2008, he contested the elections of provincial assembly (PP-236), and in 2013 of national assembly (NA-169). In 2002, he had the ticket of Nawaz-League. The party was in the bad

455 During the interviews with locals, the research found die-hard supporters of these two candidates (almost in every existing caste/clans) in their respective areas. Many Supporters of these two candidates cast their votes in almost every elections, due to their relations with locals, and valence in the district. Rahmat Ali Rana, Amir Ali, Irfan Mirza, Zeesha Doghar talked with author, the question was asked, why did you cast your votes for some specific candidate in national elections. March 5, 2017.
457, Church World Service, The Pakistan Election Compendium, 376.
459 Nazir Jutt s’ family lost all the seats badly and did not get more than ten percent of polled votes in any constituency, except NA-167. In NA- 167, Assha Nazir got twenty-two percent of polled votes. Elections Commission of Pakistan, Report on General Elections 2013.
position in whole district as well as in the province, but Tahir Iqbal won (with approximately fifty percent of the polled votes)\textsuperscript{461} the elections against Mian family of Vehari. In 2008, he had a ticket of Q-League (PML), the party lost the elections throughout the district but Mr. Tahir won once again with thirty-eight percent of polled votes.\textsuperscript{462} In 2013 elections, he switched from provincial assembly to national assembly, and won (with approximately ninety thousand votes)\textsuperscript{463} the seat as an independent candidate (by defeating the stalwart of Nawaz League – Tehmina Daultana).\textsuperscript{464} Despite the quick change of political parties, he is popular political entity in the district. His voters are committed with him due to his presence, valence, and interaction with the people.

Since 2002 national elections, the analysis of electoral results illustrates the impact of political families and patronage relations in the district. In Vehari, the competition remains among a few influential families or individuals. Since the advent of national elections in twenty-first century, ruling elites of the district are unchanged.

- More than eighty percent of winners or runner-ups in the areas have been same.
- The voters in the district are personalized and strongly committed with candidates (like rest of the voters in Punjab).
- The effectiveness of political parties (vote bank) is less important in ruler belt of the district than the urban areas.
- The performance of candidates in office is closely measured by locals. The ineffective candidates\textsuperscript{465} have also faced damage to their vote bank. Valence of the candidates especially in public offices strength their vote bank and maximize their chances of winning.
- The effective electoral campaign according to local political culture enhances the electability of any candidates.

\textsuperscript{461} Church World Service, \textit{The Pakistan Election Compendium}, 204.
\textsuperscript{462} Ibid., 495.
\textsuperscript{463} \textit{Elections Commission of Pakistan}, Reports of General Election 2013.
\textsuperscript{464} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{465} Ineffective means, unable to give the desirable results. Ineffective candidate who has weak patron-client relations with voter after winning the elections or after electoral season. “Ineffective,” \textit{Cambridge Advance Learner Dictionary}. 
5.5.5 Muzaffargarh District

Muzaffargarh district has many popular and influential names in the politics of the province as well as of the country. Since after the partition in 1947, several prominent politicians of the district have been active in national/provincial level from the district. Nawabzada Nasrullah Khan (late) and Ghulam Mustafa Khar have vital role in the country’s politics. Nawabzada Nasrullah (1918-2003) had been active in student politics before the creation of Pakistan. He opposed the British Raj and joined platform of ‘Majlis-e-Ihrar.’ After the partition, he made his marks in national politics during Ayub Khan’s regime due to his affects against dictatorship. He was known as a true supporter of democracy and a critic on military rule.\(^\text{466}\) He did struggle for the formation of constitutional regime in the country.

Ghulam Mustafa Khar is a renowned politician of the district. His association with PPP was strong during ZA Bhutto’s era. He was elected the chief minister of Punjab after the first national elections in 1970.\(^\text{467}\) He has strong political legacy in the area of Muzaffargarh and his family member have secured the seats of national/provincial assembly in every (last three national 2002, 08 and 13) elections. In 2002, his niece -Hina Rabani Khar- won the national assembly elections from NA-177. In the same elections, another member of the Khar’s family -Malik Javed Khar- won the provincial assembly seat from PP-255. In 2008, Hina Rabani switched from Q-league to PPP and once again took the seat from NA-177. In 2010, she became the first woman as foreign minister of the country. In provincial assembly elections of 2008, two members of Khar’s family -Bilal Ahamd Khar and Malik Javed Khar- won the seats from PP-252 & 255. In 2013 elections, Ghulam Mustafa Khar contested elections on the ticket of Pakistan Muslims League- Functional (PML-F) from NA-176 but remained unsuccessful. His brother and father of Hina Rabani –Ghulam Rabani Khar- also lost the elections from NA-177 on PPP ticket.

Other politically influential families of the district are, Bokharis, Qureshis, Hanjras, Gopangs and Jatois. These are the rich feudal lords of the areas and have stronghold on the electoral politics for long time. Bokharis are the one of the successful families of the district.


Qureshis are also a successful political family of the district. In 2002 elections, the Qureshis clan got two seats of national assembly. In NA- 176, Khalid Mohsin Qureshi won the seat on Q-League ticket, and Shahid Jamil Qureshi won from NA-178 on PPP ticket. In 2008, Mohsin Qureshi switched the party –joined PPP- and won the seat once again. In this constituency, Hinjra are the opponents of the Qureshis. In 2002 and 2008 Ghulam Qasim Hinjra remained runner-up. In 2013, Malik Sultan Mehmood Hanjra won the seat from NA-176. The Hanjra family of Muzaffargarh has successful electoral record in provincial assembly of the district. Ahmad Yar Hanjra – nephew of Malik Sultan Hanjra- won the elections of PP-251 consecutively, since 2002 elections.\textsuperscript{469}

Both Gopangs and Jatois are the rival and have influential role in the electoral politics of the district. In NA-180, both the clans were in struggles to win. In 2002 and 2008, Abdul Qayoom Jaoti won the elections and Ashiq Hussain Gopang was second place. In 2013, Ashiq Hussain Gopang won the seat as independent candidate and Jaoti was on the third place.

One of the most interesting, vocal, and attention-seeking politician –Jamshed Dasti- of the district Muzaffargarh does not hail from landowning elites of the district. Jamshed Dasti came from poor and humble background and he challenged the patronage politicians of the area.\textsuperscript{470} In electoral politics of the Punjab province, there are a few success stories, like Jamshed Dasti. He started his career as local councilor and challenged the elites of the area. His strategy to help the needy and to work for poor classes has helped him to win last two national elections.

\textsuperscript{469} The Hinjra family have been winning the seat since 1988 national. Before, Ahmad Yar Hinjra, his uncle Malik Sultan won the seat four time before 2002 national elections (even after switching the political parties) . “Member Profile,” Government of Punjab: Provincial Assembly of the Punjab. http://www.pap.gov.pk/index.php/members/profile/en/20/1092
\textsuperscript{470} Jamshed Dasti is son of poor laborer, who launched his parliamentary politics on the back of donkey cart. He challenged the Khar dynasty in Muzaffargarh. He attracted the poor voters of the area and remained successful in two national elections. “Jamshed Dasti - Pakistan's own 'Robin Hood,” Dawn, April 28, 2013. https://www.dawn.com/news/1025644
In 2008, he contested the elections on PPP ticket and won the first parliamentary elections. He was disqualified due to fake degree in 2010. He ran and won second time from NA-178. His contest in 2013 was interesting than previous elections in 2008. He ran the elections as an independent candidate from two constituencies (NA-177 & 178) of the area. He won both seats and defeated Khar, Qureshi, and Dogar with high margin.\footnote{Jamshed Dasti had more than one lakh votes in NA-177 and his closest opponent – Ghulman Rabbani Khar- had less than fifty thousand. In NA- 178, he defeated Abad Doger with the margin of ten thousand votes. Elections Commission of Pakistan, \textit{Reports on General Elections 2013.}}

However, the political arena of the district is effectively dominated by the feudal lords.

- The voters are committed to these families. Political parties have to depend on these electable. The people of –above mentioned- political families switched political parties on frequent bases and members of same family often contested elections with different political parties.

- The political parties are ineffective throughout the district, especially in ruler belt. Same as the other district of the province, winners and runner-ups were same in last three elections (in most of the cases).

- Voters’ affiliation with the candidates is based on, candidates’ patronage relations, their role to solve the domestic/social problems of the area and their valence in public offices.

The illustration of electoral politics of the four districts (Rawalpindi, Gujrat, Vehari, and Muzaffargarh) describes the dominance of personal traits, social location, local political cultural norms, and subjective utility of the voters, voter-candidates relations, and electability of candidates over the voting behaviour of the locals. These factors are vocal and vibrant in all these areas. Due to these factors, in most of the consistencies of these districts, the winners and runner-ups have been the same since 2002 elections. Later, the electability of the candidates, patron-client relations of voter with the candidate, past experience and the utility of his vote guide him towards final decision. These factors strengthen voter-candidate relations, maximize the chances of candidate’s electability, strengthen the patron-client relations and beef-up the candidate’s dynastic in local/provincial politics. This political culture is a common characteristic of the Punjab politics. Politics is generally personality-oriented, and interest based. Voters are bothered about caste, and regional politics, rather than national. The candidates are also least bothered about policies of political parties and their welfare works. They consider local preferences for the affiliation of political party.
5.6 Questionnaires Analysis

In order to complement the results deduced from election data and previous researches, the researcher has adopted quantitative approach. For this purpose, a questionnaire adapted from Akhtar\(^{472}\) (2009) and Alsamydee\(^{473}\) (2013) was initially distributed to the participants for pilot testing. In pilot phase responses of thirty participants were obtained and data was fed into SPSS version20 for windows. Reliability analysis was performed with the help of Chronbach alfa coefficient statistics and a satisfactory figure of 0.78 showed that the questionnaire was ready to be used for data collection. Data was collected from four constituencies i.e. NA-50, Rawalpindi; NA-105, Gujranwala; NA-170 Vehari and NA-176, Muzaffargarh. After getting responses of participants only those participants were selected who had cast their vote in at least two elections and who were just voter and not active political workers. Voters from urban areas were selected to respond to the questionnaire. The data was collected from male voter only because the female voters were not much active in the political activities in these constituencies. Obtained data was fed into SPSS for further analysis.

In this research, the selection of the constituencies (NA-50, Rawalpindi; NA-105, Gujranwala; NA-170, Vehari and NA-176, Muzaffargarh) is because of unanimous reasons. First, in all these constituencies, a single or few political families are strong enough in electoral politics and have participated in all three national elections (2002, 2008 and 2103). Second, the participants –especially winners or runner-ups- in national elections from these constituencies are unchanged (most of the time).

During the research, I picked two hundred and sixty (260) questionnaires in all four constituencies. During the research seventy-five questionnaires picked from NA-50, sixty-three from NA-105, fifty-five from NA-170, and sixty-seven in NA-178. The distribution was done on the base of registered voters (in 2013 national elections) in these constituencies. A formula was designed for distribution of questionnaires. In all four constituencies, NA-50 (register voters 442458) had 29% of total registered voters. NA-105 had (register voters 394060) 24% of total voters. NA-170 had (register voter 319983) 21% of total registered votes and NA-178 (register voter 349646) had 26% of total registered voters. The maximum number of questionnaires (75, 472 Akhtar, *Dilemma of Political Culture*, 76.
29% of total 1506147 registered votes in all constituencies) was distributed in NA-50, because the constituency had largest number of registered voters (among all these four constituencies) in 2013. The minimum number of questionnaires (55) were distributed in NA-170, because lowest number of registered voters. 474

The questionnaire has three parts, first part deals with the questions about biodata of the voter. In this part, the research took the information regarding voter’s social location, his membership with any political parties, how many times did he cast the votes in national elections and in which elections. This part also covers the impact of candidate’s personality, his patronage relations, his electoral strategies, and his valence on local voting behaviour. In second part of the questionnaire, the research took the information regarding voter’s choice, that why he cast his vote in last elections. This part also covers the questions about utility and social benefit of his vote and impact of social needs over voting behaviour. All the questions objective is to measure the impact of cultural ethos over voting behaviour in these constituencies (the research covers part II and III of the questionnaires, mentioned below).

474 Register voter as per 2013 national elections. The Report on General Elections 2013, ECP
5.6.1 NA-50 Rawalpindi-I

During the research, seventy-five questionnaires picked NA-50. The analysis of questionnaires distributed in NA-50 are given below.

Part-II

First two questions of the questionnaire (in Part-II), dealt with the ratio of winners and runner-ups/losers in the constituency. Voters replied – in answer of the first question- that how many times their candidate/candidates won the elections. In reply, fifty-three percent of respondents’ candidates won elections twice, and forty-two percent s’ once. Five percent voters’ candidates did not win any elections. The reply of the second question also seconded the first one. Almost fifty percent of voters’ candidate lost or remained runner-up in the elections once, and more than forty percent s’ lost twice.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions: 1 &amp; 2</th>
<th>Options</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>How many times, your electoral candidates have won the national elections (2002-13)?</td>
<td>0 (5%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>For how many times, you electoral candidates remained runner-up/looser in national elections (2002-13)?</td>
<td>0 (Nil)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The third question dealt with the influence of social location (area of residence) on voting choices. The statistics showed that the area of residence was an influencing factor in NA-50. Sixty-nine percent of the respondents considered their ‘social location and its dynamics’ as influencing factor in voting choice.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question: 3</th>
<th>Options</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Did your social location influence your voting choice?</td>
<td>Yes (69%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The next five questions (4, 5, 6, and 7) surveyed the influence of voters’ family/extended family and clan over their voting choices. The fourth question dealt with the influence of voters’ family and extended family over their choice. Almost seventy-four percent of the respondents from NA-50 answered in favor of family’s effect over their voting choice. The fifth question was related to overall clan effect over voting decision and sixty-six percent of the respondents responded ‘yes’ in the reply of this question. The sixth question was to analyze the influence of
candidate’s clan over voting choices. Twenty-three percent of the respondents replied ‘yes’. The seventh question was about the influence of candidate’s clan over voting decision of locals. Thirty-six percent of the respondents thought that candidate’s clan influenced their voting decision.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions: 4, 5, 6 &amp; 7</th>
<th>Options</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4 Did you family/extended family impact your voting choice?</td>
<td>Yes (74%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Did your clan impact your voting choice?</td>
<td>Yes (66%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Did you cast your vote for candidate because he belonged to your caste?</td>
<td>Yes (21%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 Did the electoral candidate’s clan/ caste influence your voting choices?</td>
<td>Yes (36%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The eighth question was related to the influence of candidate’s personality and its influence over voting decision. Sixty-one percent of the respondents’ voting decisions in NA-50 was affecting by the candidate’s personality. While, forty-nine percent of the respondents had no effect of candidate’s personality over their voting decisions. The ninth question was about candidate’s campaign strategies’ and their effect over voting. Sixty-five percent of the voters thought that the candidate’s campaign strategies affected their voting decisions. The tenth question of the questionnaire was about the candidate valence in public offices and its effectiveness in elections. Seventy-one percent of the respondents were agreed to the candidate valence help them to do their voting decisions.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions: 8, 9 &amp; 10</th>
<th>Options</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8 Did the electoral candidate’s personality influence your voting choices?</td>
<td>Yes (61%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9 Did the electoral candidate’s election campaign strategies influence your voting choices?</td>
<td>Yes (65%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 Did the valence of the electoral candidate in public offices, impact your voting choice?</td>
<td>Yes (71%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The next three questions (11, 12 and 13) were about the impact of candidate-voter personal relations, candidate’s political party and his/her reputation in the area. The question eleven was to see the voter’s personal relations with candidate and influence of these relations on voting choice. Almost seventy-two percent of the voters felt that their patronage relations with candidate helped them to select the candidate. The twelfth question was about candidate’s affiliation with political party and impact of this affiliation on voter’s choice. Forty percent of the
respondents responded that the candidate’s political party had impacted their voting decisions. The fourteenth question of part-II was about the reputation of candidate in their area. Seventy-nine percent of the voters thought that their candidate had good reputation in the area. In last of the question of the part, sixty-six percent of the respondent thought that their voting choices in national elections are appropriate and they have done right decision.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions 11, 12, 13, &amp; 14</th>
<th>Options</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>11 Did you cast your vote because of your personal relations with the candidate?</td>
<td>Yes (72%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12 Did the candidate’s political party, impact your voting decision?</td>
<td>Yes (40%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13 Did your candidate have good reputation in your area?</td>
<td>Yes (79%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14 Do you think your voting choices were appropriate in past elections?</td>
<td>Yes (67%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The questionnaire results of part-II validate the finding of two-steps model in NA-50. Voter’s social location, his/her family candidate’s valence in public office, and voter personal relations, are the influencing factors in voting decisions. On the other hand, candidate’s clan, his personality, and his political party work moderately in voting decisions. Most of the voters of the area were confident about their choice and sure about the good reputation of their candidate in the area.

**Part-III**

The part-III of the questionnaire was to deal candidate’s effectiveness to solve voter’s social problems and his chances of winning. This part started to survey the percentage of voters’ contact with their electoral candidates. The first question (of the part) dealt with the probabilities of meeting of locals with the candidate during elections campaign. In reply, sixty-eight percent of the respondents answered positive that they had easy access to see the candidates before elections. Although the ratio drops after elections and only forty-seven had contact with the candidates after elections.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions: 1 &amp; 2</th>
<th>Options</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Did the people of your area have easy access to winner/runner-up candidates before elections?</td>
<td>Yes (68%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Did the people of your area have easy access to winner/runner-up candidates after elections?</td>
<td>Yes (47%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The next three questions analyzed the nature of meetings between voter and candidate. Third question was about the number of meetings between voters and candidates. Eight percent of the respondents never met with their electoral candidates after elections, thirty-one percent met once, twenty-one percent twice, fifteen percent thrice and remaining met more than three times.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question: 3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>For how many times (since last national elections), did you meet your electoral candidate after 2013 elections?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The next question was about “where did you meet your electoral candidate last time?” In reply, forty-three percent of the respondents met the candidate at wedding or death ceremonies. Fifteen percent met at public meetings, eleven percent met on above all places, and remaining met nowhere.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question: 4</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Where did you meet your electoral candidate last time?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a) In Death Ceremony</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) In Wedding Ceremony</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c) In Public Meeting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d) Candidate s’ Public office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e) All above Place</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>f) No where</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The next three questions (5, and 6) were to analyze the types of benefits/support for the local voters after casting their votes. Fifth question was related to see the benefits of vote for the voters in their daily life. Sixty-nine of the respondents agreed that their voting choice helped them in daily life. The sixth question was to see the ‘what types of help an electoral candidate did? Seventy-six percent of the respondents said that their candidates helped them in police station, in local courts, and in job hiring affairs.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question: 6</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Which type of help, he did for you?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a) No Where</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) In Police Station</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c) In Local Courts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d) In Job hiring Affairs</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The last question of the questionnaire was about the performance of the candidate in their area. Sixty-one percent of the respondents were satisfied with the performance of their candidate.

| 7 | Are you satisfied with the performance of your candidate in office (in case of winning elections)? | Yes (61%) | No (39%) |

The analysis of the party also supports the two-steps model. People of the area measure the utilization of their votes and expect some tangible benefits from their candidates. A good number of respondents got some benefits by casting their votes. The other important feature of the analysis is people’s social or domestic reasons and norms were the guiding factors in their voting decision.

5.6.2 NA-105 Gujrat-II

During the survey sixty-three questionnaires picked from the constituency. The outcomes of the questionnaires from NA-105 are given below:

Part-II

In NA-105, fifty-nine percent of the respondents’ candidates won the elections twice, thirty-eight percent once and three percent respondents did not win a single election. In the second question ratio was the same as first question.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions: 1 &amp; 2</th>
<th>Options</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>How many times, your electoral candidates have won the national elections (2002-13)?</td>
<td>0 (3%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>For how many times, you electoral candidates remained runner-up/looser in national elections (2002-13)?</td>
<td>0 (Nil)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The impact of social location of the voter (on voting decision) in NA-105 (Gujrat) was higher than NA-50 (Rawalpindi). Seventy-three percent of the respondents in NA-50 thought that their area influenced them to choose the candidate in national elections.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question: 3</th>
<th>Options</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Did your social location impact your voting choice?</td>
<td>Yes (73%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The questions about the effect of family over voting choice were also effective in this area. Seventy-three percent of the respondents’ family or extended family (question 4) and sixty-nine percent of the respondents’ clan guided their voting pattern in national elections (question 5). In this constituency (NA-105), respondents cast their votes in higher number because of their identical clan with candidates. Almost forty-seven percent of respondents cast their votes for candidates, who had same clan (question 6) and forty-seven percent of the respondents were influenced because of candidate’s clan (question 7).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions: 4, 5, 6 &amp;7</th>
<th>Options</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4 Did you family/extended family impact your voting choice?</td>
<td>Yes (73%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Did your clan impact your voting choice?</td>
<td>Yes (69%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Did you cast your vote for candidate because he belonged to your caste?</td>
<td>Yes (43%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 Did the candidate’s caste impact you voting choices?</td>
<td>Yes (47%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Candidate’s personality, his campaign strategies and his valence had been vital in the voting trends of the constituency. Nearly, sixty-nine percent of the respondents thought that the candidate’s personality influenced their voting choices (question 8). Fifty-six percent of the respondents influenced because of candidates’ campaign strategies (question 9), and approximately eighty percent of the respondents cast their vote because of candidate’s valence in public offices (question 10).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions: 8, 9 &amp; 10</th>
<th>Options</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8 Did the electoral candidate’s personality influence your voting choice?</td>
<td>Yes (69%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9 Did the electoral candidate’s election campaign strategies influence your voting choice?</td>
<td>Yes (65%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 Did the valence of the electoral candidate in public offices, impact your voting choice?</td>
<td>Yes (81%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Personalized politics was higher in the area and more than seventy percent voters cast their vote because of their personal relations with the candidates (question 11). Eighty percent of the voters supposed that their candidates had good reputation in the area (question 13) and seventy percent of the respondents were confident about their choices in national elections (question 14). On the other hand, the political parties have weak control in the area and twenty-eight percent of the respondents were influenced due candidate’s political party.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions 11, 12, 13, &amp; 14</th>
<th>Options</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>11 Did you cast your vote because of your personal relations with the</td>
<td>Yes (73%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
12 Did the candidate’s political party impact your voting decision?
Yes (28%) No (72%)

13 Did your candidate have good reputation in your area?
Yes (83%) No (17%)

14 Do you think your voting choices were appropriate in past elections?
Yes (71%) No (29%)

Part-III

The part-III covers the proportion, where the survey measures the impact of voter’s social needs over their voting behaviour in NA-105. In first question, more than sixty percent of the respondents had access to see with the candidates before elections and nearly sixty percent (question 2) of respondents also had access to see candidates after elections.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions: 1 &amp; 2</th>
<th>Options</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Did the people of your area have easy access to winner/runner-up candidates before elections?</td>
<td>Yes (64%) No (34%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Did the people of your area have easy access to winner/runner-up candidates after elections?</td>
<td>Yes (59%) No (41%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Third question was about the probabilities of meeting between the voters and candidate after 2013 elections. Thirty-five percent of the respondents met once with the candidate, nearly twenty percent twice, nineteen percent thrice, and seventeen percent met more than three times. In this area the frequency of meeting between candidates and voters is higher than Rawalpindi and voters had relatively easy access.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question: 3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>For how many times (since last national elections), did you meet your electoral candidate after 2013 elections?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Never</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. 4 &amp; more</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Questions four was to discuss the nature of meeting places between voters and candidates. Twenty-three percent of the respondents met candidates in wedding or death ceremonies, more than twenty percent at public meetings and more than forty percent met at candidates’ public offices.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question: 4</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Where did you meet your electoral candidate last time?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Questions five, six and seven of the part-III dealt with social benefits of the voters. Seventy percent of the voters got some benefits in return of their voting choices and seventy-five percent got benefits from their candidates. Voters of the area considered these benefits in their social life as payback of their votes. Although, nearly thirty percent of the respondents got benefits from their candidates at police station and in other public offices, and nearly twenty-five percent got in job hiring affairs. On the other hand, more than seventy percent of the respondents were satisfied with the performance of their candidates.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question: 5</th>
<th>Did your voting choices benefit you in your daily life?</th>
<th>Yes (71%)</th>
<th>No (29%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Question: 6</td>
<td>Which type of help, he did for you?</td>
<td>29%</td>
<td>17%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. No Where</td>
<td>b. In Police Station</td>
<td>c. In Local Courts</td>
<td>d. In Job hiring Affairs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Question: 7</td>
<td>Are you satisfied with the performance of your candidate in office (in case of winning elections)?</td>
<td>Yes (73%)</td>
<td>No (27%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

5.6.2 NA-170 Vehari-IV

In NA-170, fifty-five questionnaires were picked for analysis. The outcome of the questionnaires was not different from other districts. Families, clans, personalities, and local ethos are equally effective here like other districts.

Part-II

In NA-170, a popular candidate – Jhanzab Khan Kichi- lost the three elections with small margin. On the other hand, winner –Saeed Ahmad- of the 2013 elections, did not participate in 2002 elections.
In reply to question three, approximately seventy percent of the respondents felt that their area of residences has impacted their voting decisions.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question: 3</th>
<th>Options</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Did your social location influence your voting choice?</td>
<td>Yes (71%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Owing to less-developed zone of NA-170 –than the Rawalpindi and Gujrat-, voter’s family and his clans became important factors in voting decisions. Nearly, eighty percent of the respondents considered the role of their families an important factor, and more than seventy percent of the respondents thought their clan as influencing factor in voting. Owing to the participation of elite families in the electoral politics of area, only twenty-seven percent of the voters cast their votes because of same candidate-voter (question 6). While nearly sixty percent of the respondents cast their votes due to candidates’ clan or family background (questions 7).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions: 4, 5,6 &amp;7</th>
<th>Options</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4 Did you family/extended family influence your voting choice?</td>
<td>Yes (79%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Did your clan influence your voting choice?</td>
<td>Yes (72%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Did you cast your vote for candidate because he belonged to your clan?</td>
<td>Yes (27%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 Did the electoral candidate’s clan influence you voting choice?</td>
<td>Yes (59%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Regarding the candidate’s personality, their campaign strategies and their valence in public offices are also the influencing factors in the voting choices of the locals. Sixty-four percent of the respondents considered candidate’s personality and their campaign strategies as influencing factor. Sixty-nine percent of the respondents’ voting choice were influenced due to candidates’ effective electoral strategies. The valence of the candidates in public offices remained vital in NA-170 and seventy-eight percent of the total votes cast their votes because of this factor.
Patronage relations between voters and candidates are also a vital factor of voting in NA-170. Seventy-one percent of the respondents weighted their personal relations with candidates in voting choice and seventy-four percent of the respondents considered their choices were appropriate in national elections. On the other hand, political party voters had less ratio in NA-170 than the other districts (NA-50 and 105) of the province, and twenty-four percent were influenced due to candidate’s political party.

Part-III

In NA-170, people of area had less access to their candidates – in comparison to other districts-, nearly sixty percent of the respondents had a chance to meet candidates before elections and the ratio had dropped to fifty-six percent after elections.

In NA-170, nearly twenty percent of the respondents did not meet candidates after 2013 national elections, more than thirty percent met once, approximately twenty percent met twice, and twenty-four percent met more than thrice.
Question: 3
For how many times (since last national elections), did you meet your electoral candidate after 2013 elections?

<p>| | | | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a) Never</td>
<td></td>
<td>a) 21%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) 1</td>
<td></td>
<td>b) 33%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c) 2</td>
<td></td>
<td>c) 22%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d) 3</td>
<td></td>
<td>d) 13%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e) 4 &amp; more</td>
<td></td>
<td>e) 11%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In NA-170, nearly thirty percent of the respondent met candidates last time in wedding or death ceremonies, more than forty percent met at some public meetings or at candidates’ public offices. The probabilities of meetings between voters and candidates since last elections were also not much different from above. Approximately twenty-six percent of the respondents met at wedding and death ceremonies, nearly forty percent met at some public places and seventeen percent did not meet since last election.

Question: 4
Where did you meet your electoral candidate last time?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a) In Death Ceremony</td>
<td>17%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) In Wedding Ceremony</td>
<td>12%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c) In Public Meeting</td>
<td>19%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d) Candidate’s Public office</td>
<td>23%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e) All above Place</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>f) No where</td>
<td>21%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In more than seventy percent of the cases, local candidates in NA-170 had been helpful for their voters and supported them in their daily affairs. Forty percent of the respondents got benefits from the candidate’s in police and in local courts. Fifteen percent of the respondents got benefits in job hiring affairs, and sixteen percent of the respondents got benefits in other daily matters. On the other hand, almost sixty-seven percent of the respondents are satisfied with the performance of their candidates.

5 Did your voting choices benefit you in your daily life? | Yes (69%) | No (31%)

Question: 6
Which type of help, he did for you?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a) No Where</td>
<td>29%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) In Police Station</td>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c) In Local Courts</td>
<td>21%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d) In Job hiring Affairs</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e) All Above</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
During the research, sixty-one questionnaires were picked from constituency to analyze the voter’s choice. The indicators of NA-176 are not different from other districts and validate the two-steps model. Primarily, seventy-nine percent respondents from of the area cast their votes due their social location (question 3), seventy-four percent due to their family (question 4), sixty-one percent cast their votes due candidate’s clan (question 7). Sixty-one percent of the respondents were influenced due to candidate’s personality (question 8), sixty-three percent due to candidate’s electoral strategies (question 9) and seventy-two percent due to candidate’ valence in public offices. On the other hand, political parties had less representation in the area and twenty-four percent of the respondents cast their votes due to parties’ affiliations (question 12).

### Questions: 1 & 2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Options</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>How many times, your electoral candidates have won the national elections (2002-13)?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0 (33%)</td>
<td>1 (22%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 (45%)</td>
<td>3 (Nil)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>For how many times, you electoral candidates remained runner-up/looser in national elections (2002-13)?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0 (Nil)</td>
<td>1 (32%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 (35%)</td>
<td>3 (23%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Question: 3

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Options</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Did your social location influence your voting choice?</td>
<td>Yes (79%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Questions: 4, 5, 6, and 7

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Options</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4 Did you family/extended family influence your voting choice?</td>
<td>Yes (74%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Did your clan influence your voting choice?</td>
<td>Yes (64%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Did you cast your vote for candidate because he belonged to your clan?</td>
<td>Yes (26%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 Did the electoral candidate’s caste influence you voting choices?</td>
<td>Yes (61%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Questions: 8, 9 &amp; 10</td>
<td>Options</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 Did the electoral candidate’s personality influence your voting choice?</td>
<td>Yes (61%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9 Did the electoral candidate’s election campaign strategies influence your voting choice?</td>
<td>Yes (63%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 Did the valence of the electoral candidate in public offices, impact your voting choice?</td>
<td>Yes (72%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions 11, 12, 13, &amp; 14</th>
<th>Options</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>11 Did you cast your vote because of your personal relations with the candidate?</td>
<td>Yes (65%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12 Did the candidate’s political party, impact your voting decision?</td>
<td>Yes (24%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13 Did your candidate have good reputation in your area?</td>
<td>Yes (62%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14 Do you think your voting choices were appropriate in past elections?</td>
<td>Yes (61%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Part- III**

In NA-176, sixty percent of the respondents had easy access to meet the candidates before elections and the ratio decreased after elections and reached fifty-three percent. Nearly twenty-six percent of the respondents did not see their candidates after elections and thirty percent once (question 3).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions: 1 &amp; 2</th>
<th>Options</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Did the people of your area have easy access to winner/runner-up candidates before elections?</td>
<td>Yes (60%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Did the people of your area have easy access to winner/runner-up candidates after elections?</td>
<td>Yes (53%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question: 3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>For how many times (since last national elections), did you meet your electoral candidate after 2013 elections?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>f) Never</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>g) 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>h) 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>i) 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>j) 4 &amp; more</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Many of the respondents (nearly seventy percent) met their candidates at wedding/death ceremonies or at public places last time (question 4). Since the last elections in 2013, nearly twenty-six percent of the respondents met their candidates at death and wedding ceremonies, twenty percent at public meetings, and twenty-three percent met at candidates; public offices (question 5).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question: 4</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Where did you meet your electoral candidate last time?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a) In Death Ceremony</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) In Wedding Ceremony</td>
<td>12%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c) In Public Meeting</td>
<td>21%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d) Candidate s’ Public office</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e) All above Places</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>g) No where</td>
<td>26%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Approximately, seventy percent of the respondents were the beneficiaries of their votes and got some type of support from their candidates in their daily life. Forty percent of the respondents got benefits from their candidates in police station, courts or other public offices and fifteen percent got support in hiring a job (question 6). Although, sixty-seven percent of the respondents are satisfied with the performance of their candidates (question 7).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>5</th>
<th>Did your voting choices benefit you in your daily life?</th>
<th>Yes (75%)</th>
<th>No (25%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Question: 6</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Which type of help, he did for you?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No Where</td>
<td></td>
<td>29%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In Police Station</td>
<td></td>
<td>26%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In Local Courts</td>
<td></td>
<td>22%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In Job hiring Affairs</td>
<td></td>
<td>18%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All Above</td>
<td></td>
<td>5%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Conclusion

The indicators of two-steps model and the analysis of electoral data of the Punjab province establish the dominance of cultural ethos over voting behaviour. The Punjabi inhabitants follow their political cultural values in their political decisions. Such political decisions strengthen the personalized politics in the area. The local cultural ethos in the province are based on individualism, family needs, social location, patron-client relations, and subjective utility of the voter. All these factors work to develop the personalized politics, dominance of elite politicians/family and need-based (personal) voting culture. On the other hand, both the electoral candidates and political parties also design their policies, manifesto, and campaign strategies according to these socio-political needs.

The analysis of electoral data of four districts (Rawalpindi, Gujrat, Vehari and Muzaffargarh) and questionnaires survey of four constituencies (NA-50,105,170, & 176) of these districts validate the two-step models and show the importance of local political ethos over voting decisions. There are some visible differences among the four constituencies of the province. Developed areas of the province have better numbers of political party voters as compared to less-developed area. The Rawalpindi district has the highest number of party voters while Muzaffargarh has lowest. The access to meet the candidates also varies in four consistencies. It is hard for the people to meet with prominent political figures (on national) of the area. The impact of candidates’ clan over voting also varies. Candidates hail from elite background or renowned family/clan.

On the other hand, there are significant similarities in the voting behaviour of all constituencies. The voter’s family, his personal relations, candidates’ reputation, and his valence are the vibrant factors of voting in all four constituencies. Patron-client relations between voters and candidates and subjective utility of the voters are the guiding factors of voting. The basics of patron-client relations and subjective utility are voters’ needs in their social/daily life. The voters’ needs in police stations, local courts or job hiring affairs direct the utility of his vote and clientism relation with candidates. While, the candidates’ campaign strategies are also strengthening the voters-candidates relationship.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>7</th>
<th>Are you satisfied with the performance of your candidate in office (in case of winning elections)?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Yes (67%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Questionnaire

City: ------------------ Age: ------------------
Constituency: ------------ Social Position: ------------
Residence: Urban/Ruler

Note: Please fill the questionnaire to keep the national assembly elections in mind only.

Part –I
1. Are you a member of any political party?
   a) Yes
   b) No

2. Have you ever cast your vote in national elections from 2002-2013?
   a) Yes
   b) No

3. How many times did you cast your vote in national elections in last thirteen years (2002-13)?
   a) 1
   b) 2
   c) 3

4. In which elections did you cast your vote?
   a) 2013 only
   b) 2008 only
   c) 2002 only
   d) 2013 & 2008 only
   e) 2002 & 2008 only
   f) 2013, 2008, & 2002

5. Who did you cast your vote for in 2013 national elections?
   a) Candidate Name: ------------------

6. Who did you cast your vote for in 2008 national elections?
   a) Candidate Name: ------------------

7. Who did you cast your vote for in 2002 national elections?
   a) Candidate Name: ------------------

Part-II
1. How many times, your electoral candidates\(^{475}\) have won the national elections (2002-13)?
   a. 0
   b. 1
   c. 2
   d. 3

2. For how many times, you electoral candidates remained runner-up in national elections (2002-13)?
   a. 0
   b. 1
   c. 2
   d. 3

3. Did your social location impact your voting choice?

\(^{475}\)Electoral candidate means, the voter s’ vote for some specific candidate.
4. Did you family/extended family impact your voting choice?
   a. Yes
   b. No
5. Did your clan impact your voting choice?
   a. Yes
   b. No
6. Did you cast your vote for candidate because he belonged to your clan?
   a. Yes
   b. No
7. Did the electoral candidate’s clan impact you voting choice?
   a. Yes
   b. No
8. Did the electoral candidate’s personality impact your voting choice?
   a. Yes
   b. No
9. Did the electoral candidate’s election campaign strategies impact your voting choice?
   a. Yes
   b. No
10. Did the valence of the electoral candidate in public offices, impact your voting choice?
    a. Yes
    b. No
11. Did you cast your vote because of your personal relations with the candidate?
    a. Yes
    b. No
12. Did the candidate’s political party, impact your voting choice?
    a. Yes
    b. No
13. Did your candidate have good reputation in your area?
    a. Yes
    b. No
14. Do you think your voting choices were appropriate in past elections?
    a) Yes
    b) No

Part-III
1. Did the people of your area have easy access to winner/runner-up candidates before elections?
   a) Yes
   b) No
2. Did the people of your area have easy access to winner/runner-up candidates after elections?
   a) Yes
   b) No
3. For how many times (since last national elections), did you meet your electoral candidate after 2013 elections?
   Never
   a) 1

165
4. Where did you meet your electoral candidate, last time?
   a) In Death Ceremony
   b) In Wedding Ceremony
   c) In Public Meeting
   d) At His/hers’ Office
   e) All above
   f) No Where
   a)

5. Did your voting choices benefit you in your daily life?
   a) Yes
   b) No

6. Which type of help, he did for you?
   a) No Where
   b) In Police Station
   c) In Local Courts
   d) In Job Hiring Affairs
   e) All above

7. Are you satisfied with the performance of your candidate in office (in case of winning elections)?
   a) Yes
   b) No

8. Did your candidate fulfill the promises made during his electoral campaign?
   a) Yes
   b) No
2018 National Elections in Punjab

On 25 July 2018, eleventh national elections were held. As per predications, PTI was on top with in national assembly and reminded second in the provincial assembly of Punjab. On the other hand, Nawaz League was second in national assembly but on top in Punjab assembly. In Pakistan politics, the results of 2018 elections were a shift in ruling elites. Since 1988 elections, Nawaz League and PPP had major share in governance. It was first time that both political parties did not establish its government in the center. PTI set its government in center, Punjab, KPK and in collation in Baluchistan. Despite these shifts in ruling elite, many electables and influential families are still of past are also in current PTI’s government. On the other hand, all the ethos of local political culture remained intact with local’s voting behaviour. The partisan voter and candidate voter worked on same lines in 2018 as they were in last three elections. The political parties remained popular in their specific pockets, due to their specific agenda. In 2018, the personality of political leaders was also the main cause of attraction for partisan voter. In case of candidate voter in Punjab, his family, social location, patronage relations and social needs remained intact with his -candidate voter- voting behaviour.

The campaign, politics, and the developments in 2018 elections were not much different from the history, in the especially in the Punjab province. In pre-elections scenario, Nawaz League had a bad time. Its leader –Nawaz Sharif-, his daughter- Mariam Nawaz, and his son in law – Muhammad Safdar Awan- was abducted in jail due to corruption charges. Nawaz Sharif’s both sons- Hassain and Husain Nawaz- decaled offenders by the accountability court. Nawaz’s party was also in shamble. Many electables, loyal works left the part. The party faced hard time to elect their candidates in some parts of the Punjab. The real beneficiaries of the whole situations were, Imran Khan’s PTI. Nawaz League’s fall benefited Khan’s PTI. The loyal workers of party and other electable joined PTI for 2018 national elections. In overall situation before elections, PTI got the popularity and had good chance to win the elections. The different media persons and experts predicted PTI’s electoral success. On the other hand, despite all bad happenings, Nawaz League still had strong vote bank in central and upper Punjab. In 2018 elections, candidates with stable vote bank, effective valence, and strong patronage relations had fair chances to win the elections, as it was in past. Despite the popularity of PTI and fall of Nawaz League, only electables of both parties won the elections. Therefore, the results of 2018
national elections were once again influenced by the local political norms and not a clear change in the electoral ethos of the Punjab province.

The survey, interviews and electoral analysis covered the political development from 2002 to 2013 national elections. During research locale- Rawalpindi, Gujrat, Vehari, and Muzaffargarh districts- got major administrative, political, and legislative changes for 2018 elections. The past government of Nawaz Sharif reduced the share of Punjab province in national assembly. Elections commission of Pakistan (ECP) did delimitation again for provincial and national assemblies for these elections. In political domain- in my research locale- many electables left the Nawaz League and became the part of PTI. In Rawalpindi, Ch. Nisar Ali Khan (interior minister of Nawaz government) did not contested the elections on party ticket. In Gujrat, some members of Chaudhary family- Ch. Zaheer-u-din- joined PTI. In Vehari, Tahir Iqbal, Manis family (Asif Saeed was minister in Punjab cabinet), Naeem Akhtar (minister in Punjab) left Nawaz League. In Muzaffargarh, Khar and Qureshi family also left Nawaz’s party. Due to all these setups, the results of 2018 national elections in my research locale were predictable. In all constituencies of these districts (Rawalpindi-I became NA- 57, Gujrat-II became NA-69, Vehari-IV became NA-165, and Muzaffargarh-I became NA-18) candidates with stable vote bank and effective campaign won the elections.

The NA-57 remained the hub of Abbasi family. Both winner and runner-up – Sadaqat Ali Abbasi and Shahid Khaqan Abbasi- hailed from same clan. Both the candidates had more than eighty-one percent of total valid votes. Both the candidates had close contest, got more than more than one lakh votes. Shahiad Khqan (124703 votes) lost the elections with the difference of less than twelve thousand. In Rawalpindi district, the old guard of the district won the 2018 elections. Raja Pervez Ashraf, Ghulam Sarwar Khan, and Shaikh Rasheed Ahmad won the elections from their areas.

The Gujrat district remained the hum of Chaudhary family. The Chaudhary family won two seats of national assembly out of four from the district. In NA-68, Hussain Elahi- grandson of Ch. Zahoor Elahi- won the elections and in NA-69 Ch. Pervaiz Elahi won the comfortably. In NA- 69, Pervaiz Elahi won the elections with more than seventy thousand votes. His cousin- Ch. Mubshair Hussian stood second in the contest. Both the candidates had eighty percent of total valid votes.
In 2018 elections, in Vehari district, three out of four national assembly seats won by the same candidates, who won 2013 elections. In 2013, Ch. Nazir Arain, Syed Sajad Mehdi and Tahir Iqbal won the elections. While, in 2018, Ch. Faqir Arain (brother of Nazir Arain, because he was disqualified), Syed Sajad Mehdi (NA-163) and Tahir Iqbal (NA-164) won the elections one again. In fourth constituency (NA-165), the runner-up of 2013 elections – Aurangzaib Khan Khichi (with the margin less than three thousand) won the 2018 elections. In this constituency, winner of 2013 elections – Saeed Ahamd Manis- stood second. Both the candidates had more than seventy-seven percent of total valid votes.

The elections results of Muzaffargarh district were surprise regarding party position, but not in term of candidates. PPP won six NA seats throughout Punjab province, three hailed from Muzaffargarh. In terms of candidates, the NA seats were equally distributed between Qureshi, Khar, Bukhari, Gopang, and Nawabzada families. In NA-181, all the big lord -Muhammad Shabir Qureshi, Sultan Mehmood Hanjra, and Malik Ghulam Mustafa Khar- were in contest. All these were in close contest and Shabir Qureshi won the seat as an independent candidate. All three candidates had eighty-five percent of total valid votes. In Muzaffargarh district elections of 2018 became interesting in NA-185 and PP-272. Syed Basit Ahmed Sultan won both these seats as independent candidate and left provincial assembly seat (he defeated his brother -Syed Haroon Ahmed Sultan- on this seat). In by-elections mother of Haroon Sultan and Basit Sultan -Zahra Batool- was candidate against one of her sons, Haroon Sultan (Zahra Batool won the elections).
Conclusion

This study has attempted to analyze the impact of cultural values of a society on its political values. It is generally believed that each society has its own specific culture, norms, and values. These cultural values of the society enrich its political values. Political values are thus a manifestation of cultural values, and these values set guidelines for the local political culture. These norms of political culture and political experiences further guide the political activities in a society. To gauge the impact of cultural values on a political culture, this study has analyzed the electoral politics in Pakistani Punjab. It has covered three national elections—2002, 2008, and 2013—and has attempted to see ‘how people’s voting decisions in national elections are influenced by the norms of their local political culture. In this regard, the social indicators of society in Punjab (cultural values) are taken as the variables to analyze the impact on the voting decision. To measure these variables, this study has covered three aspects—voter, political party, and candidate—of electoral politics. And it sees how social location, family, kinship, patronage relations, and social needs of people drive their voting decisions in the province. (People want the maximum utility of their votes and vote for a party/candidate that can solve their social issues). It also sees the impact of historical events on the development of political narratives, types of voters in Punjab and how the political parties and candidates set their electoral strategies in alliance with political culture.

Historical events have had a vital impact on the political culture of Punjab. History of the pre-modern era and its development shaped the political culture in the subcontinent. On the other hand, people’s values shaped the policies of rulers and the political development. The native Indians were accommodative with both foreign and local rulers. They welcomed and obeyed every strong ruler and revolted against the weaker ones. Rulers used assertive means to control the populace and maintained their position through militarization and setting up bureaucratic structures. Political activities first started in the twentieth century during the British Raj. Once again, the local elite of the state were accommodative with the ruling class. After the partition of the subcontinent and consequent creation of Pakistan in 1947, the political narratives did not change significantly; they were not much different from the past. People followed the elite and the ruling elite tried to control the people rather than serving them. The national election results since 1970 strengthened the oligarchy in the country with the passage of time. Voters in all
national elections in Punjab mostly preferred powerful individuals or dominant political parties.

Social location of Punjabis influenced their political decisions. Area of residence and social surroundings determined the voting behaviour in Punjab. The results of the last three national elections highlighted different political trends in different areas of the province. The Political party, like Nawaz League, had stable vote bank in the north and central parts of province, while PPP had relatively better vote bank in the southern part. Uneven development in different parts of the province also affected people’s voting behaviour. Nawaz League had its stronghold in the developed part of Punjab than underdeveloped parts. In all three national elections, political parties—Nawaz League, PPP, and PML-Q—had different success ratios in Punjab (North, Centre, South, and West). In 2008 elections, Nawaz League won fifty percent of NA seats from central Punjab and less than thirty percent from the south. Similarly, in 2013, it won ninety-five of NA seats from central Punjab and sixty-four percent from the south. In 2008 elections, when PPP set government in the center, it had forty-one percent of NA seats form south (out of total NA seats of the region) and twelve percent from central Punjab.

The study of the last three elections shows that two types of voters exist in Punjab approximately with the same equation of beliefs and evaluation. Both party and candidate voters have the same approaches to voting. Both have the same equation of beliefs and evaluation. Family and social location play a vital role in partisanship. Party voter develops his/her loyalties with party leadership, their family, or their charisma. Partisanship in Punjab relies on popular development works of the parties. In the last three national elections, people voted for political parties that were popular, strong, and had maximum chances of electability. In 2002 national elections, for instance, Nawaz League, also the winner of 1997 elections, was in a weak position. It probably had its worst election in 2002. But in 2008, winner of the 2002 election (PML-Q) lost to Nawaz League in Punjab. In 2013, the winner of 2008 elections (PPP) also lost its position (in national and Punjab assembly) to Nawaz League. People of Punjab probably evaluated the utility of their votes in all three elections and voted for a political party that had the maximum chances of winning. The supporters of Nawaz League propagated motorways, metro-bus project, laptop scheme, and yellow cab scheme as their party’s flagship projects. And on corruption charges against Nawaz Sharif, many of his supports took a plea that he did remarkable development
works. “It did not matter even if he did corruption” because he had also spent money on different projects (khata hai to lagata bhi hai). On the other hand, PPP’s supporters continued their associations with Bhutto family.

Conversely, candidate voters are the most visible reality of Punjab’s political culture. People prefer individual candidates. In electoral process, the voters set proximity with some candidates and then evaluate the best among these candidates. They evaluate the candidates on the bases of their patronage relations with candidates. Candidates’ active presence in the area, eagerness to solve voters’ problems, valence in public offices and effective electoral strategies do the rest. On the other hand, candidates devise certain electoral strategies that are close to the local political culture. An electable in Punjab has strong relations with the local elite and police/bureaucracy. He needs a stable political group, constant activities, loyal and diehard workers, stable and sound bridari votes, and, more importantly, stable financial background. Candidates having above characteristics prevails in the electoral politics of Punjab. Their position is intact in electoral politics and electables have become important. The success of political parties can be related (in pre-election times) to the electables. A political party with maximum numbers of electables has maximum chances of winning. The absence of electables can maximize the chances of defeat.

In the last three elections, political parties and electables have relied on each other. Electables have a strong vote bank in their areas. They need popular party votes to win elections. Party votes strengthen their position and [often] lead them to victory. Electables thus analyze the popularity of political parties on the national level and try to switch their loyalties according to the situation. In 2002, several electables of Nawaz League left the party and joined Q-League. From 2002 to 2013 elections, almost all the electables, who had left Nawaz League in 2002, rejoined the League. On the other hand, the winner of 2002 elections (PML-Q) had to contest the 2013 election without electables. In 2002, Imran Khan’s PTI won a single seat of the national assembly. In 2013, when many electables joined the party, the party gave a hard time to Nawaz League. It attracted a significant chunk of voters and stood second in the electoral race. Therefore, in Punjab, especially in southern and western parts of the province, electoral analysts predicted the success of a political party based on electables it has.

The survey research conducted for this study validates the impact of cultural norms on political behaviour in Punjab. The respondents of the survey cast their votes due to family’s
influence, personal relations, and social location. They were influenced by candidates’ electoral strategies, valence in public offices, role in solving voters’ social issues, presence in the constituencies, and patronage relations. Many respondents often meet candidates on social events such as weddings and funerals. A good number of respondents take personal benefits from candidates in quest of jobs, police stations, local courts, or other offices. Only a small percentage of the respondents cast their votes due to candidates’ party affiliation.

The patterns emerged from the last three elections were multidimensional. And they held water when were applied to the 2018 election, held during the course of research. The old guard of electoral politics remained active. People with strong financial and political background were on the driving seat in political parties. Several electables gauged their options before the election. Electables in Nawaz League and PPP joined PTI (due to favorable conditions for the latter). Owing to high numbers of electables, PTI was in a good position before the election. Elections results of 2018 proved the importance of the electables. PTI formed its government in Punjab as well as in the center. PTI’s cabinet in Punjab mostly includes electables, newcomers, and candidates who won as independents. Put simply, the eleventh national election in the county as well as in the province did not reduce the importance of electables and candidate voters.

The study has discussed the norms of local political culture that drive the voting behaviour in Punjab. Voter in Punjab prefers to vote according to his cultural norms and social needs. His/her beliefs and utility of the vote impacted his/her voting decision in the elections. Other aspects of this research are associated with the norms of local political culture. First, the historical developments, both in modern and pre-modern, in the province have shaped the political narratives in the area. People were inclined to strong rulers in the past and they still are. The second aspect of this study is the partisanship that has a substantial space in the province. Party voters have a close affiliation with their political leaders but mostly on social or emotional bases, rather than political. Third, voter’s utility, his/her social needs, and the norms of political culture associate the voter with the candidate. Owing to social needs, candidate voters rely on patron-client relations, candidate’s valence, and his help in daily affairs.
Bibliography

Books


Journal Articles


https://www.jstor.org/stable/pdf/41341616.pdf?refreqid=excelsior%3A8fc3bd65c82fd2a4aa8a7010b28897c9


181


182


Official Sources/Notifications and Other Reports


Government of Punjab, Provincial Assembly of the Punjab. Member Profile.

Government of Punjab, Provincial Assembly of the Punjab. Member Profile.


**Newspapers, Websites, and Electronic and Sources**

“Aitzaz Ahsan - Duniya Ki Tareekh Gawah Hai.” YouTube, https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Om5n4ck-wn1


Tharoor, Shashi. “Britain Does Owe Reparations.” YouTube. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=f7CW7S0zxv4
