DISCURSIVE CONSTRUCTION OF LOCAL CULTURE IN SCHIMMEL’S ANALYSIS OF SUFI POETRY

By

Muhammad Ilyas Chishti

NATIONAL UNIVERSITY OF MODERN LANGUAGES
ISLAMABAD

August-2014
DISCURSIVE CONSTRUCTION OF LOCAL CULTURE IN SCHIMMEL’S ANALYSIS OF SUFI POETRY

By
Muhammad Ilyas Chishti

M.A (English), Bahauddin Zakariya University, Multan, 2003

A THESIS SUBMITTED IN PARTIAL FULFILMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

(English Linguistics)

To

FACULTY OF HIGHER STUDIES

NATIONAL UNIVERSITY OF MODERN LANGUAGES, ISLAMABAD

Muhammad Ilyas Chishti
© Muhammad Ilyas Chishti, 2014
THESIS AND DEFENSE APPROVAL FORM

The undersigned certify that they have read the following thesis, examined the defence, are satisfied with the overall exam performance, and recommend the thesis to the Faculty of Higher Studies for acceptance:

Thesis Title: **DISCURSIVE CONSTRUCTION OF LOCAL CULTURE IN SCHIMMEL’S ANALYSIS OF SUFI POETRY**

Submitted By: **Muhammad Ilyas Chishti**
Registration #: **361-MPhil/Ling/Aug2008**

**Doctor of Philosophy**
Name of Degree

**English Linguistics**
Name of Discipline

**Prof. Dr. Samina Amin Qadir**
Name of Research Supervisor
Signature of Research Supervisor

**Prof. Dr. Shazra Munnawer**
Name of Dean (FHS)
Signature of Dean (FHS)

**Maj. Gen. ® Masood Hasan**
Name of Rector
Signature of Rector

Date
CANDIDATE DECLARATION FORM

I, MUHAMMAD ILYAS CHISHTI

Son of ALTAF AHMED CHISHTI

Registration # 361-MPhil/Ling/Aug2008

Discipline ENGLISH LINGUISTICS

Candidate of Doctor of Philosophy at the National University of Modern Languages do hereby declare that the thesis DISCURSIVE CONSTRUCTION OF LOCAL CULTURE IN SCHIMMEL’S ANALYSIS OF SUFI POETRY submitted by me in partial fulfillment of PhD degree, is my original work, and has not been submitted or published earlier. I also solemnly declare that it shall not, in future, be submitted by me for obtaining any other degree from this or any other university or institution.

I also understand that if evidence of plagiarism is found in my thesis/dissertation at any stage, even after the award of a degree, the work may be cancelled and the degree revoked.

____________________________
August, 2014
Date of submission of thesis for evaluation

Signature of Candidate

Muhammad Ilyas Chishti
Name of Candidate
ABSTRACT

Thesis Title: DISCURSIVE CONSTRUCTION OF LOCAL CULTURE IN SCHIMMEL’S ANALYSIS OF SUFI POETRY

The study is an enquiry into construction of local culture within Schimmel’s interpretive discourse on Sufi poetry. Discursive construction acquires significance visibly noticed in research pursuits pertaining to construction of local culture, ideological perspectives embedded within interpretation of Sufi poetry and investigation of the level of adequacy in Schimmel’s reconstruction of local culture. The examination of Schimmel’s works through a critical discourse perspective is a distinct dimension of investigation within Sufi discourse. Further, investigation of a Western scholar’s profound understanding and evident inclination towards Sufi themes also acquires significance. Employment of research-based methods of enquiry for Sufi interpretive discourse, promotion of ‘Discourse Competence’, portrayal of various cultural aspects embedded within local cultural traditions, revival of various folk elements incorporated within Sufi interpretive discourse and formation of a positive and tolerant image of Islamic concept of Sufism through promotion of cultural values are some of the prominent aspects signifying my study. Seeking insights from CDA as the most preferred method of enquiry, Fairclough’s three-dimensional model with textual, discursive and social dimensions was applied on 15 selected texts from three core books of Schimmel: Pain and Grace, Mystical Dimensions of Islam and As through a Veil. The study reveals the evident instances of discursively constructed local culture through various indicators reflected through folk traditions, traditional love element, music, superstitions, Sufi beliefs and practices etc. The traces of Schimmel’s ideologies are evident through frequent ‘value assumptions’ through which she relates her beliefs with various Sufi, folk and cultural themes. Prominence of authorial voice reflected through maneuvering of intertextual references, relations of elaboration, additive relations, frequency of her subjective stance and grasp over the minutest cultural details are indicative of a considerably adequate reconstruction of local culture within her analysis of Sufi poetry.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>THESIS AND DEFENSE APPROVAL FORM</td>
<td>ii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CANDIDATE DECLARATION FORM</td>
<td>iii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABSTRACT</td>
<td>iv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TABLE OF CONTENTS</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DEDICATION</td>
<td>ix</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACKNOWLEDGEMENT</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## I  INTRODUCTION: 1

1.1 Background 1
1.1.1 Sufism 1
1.1.2 Sufi Poetry 3
1.2 Annemarie Schimmel 4
1.2.1 Schimmel’s Works 7
1.2.2 Schimmel’s Works under Study 8
1.3 Critical Discourse Analysis 13
1.4 Operational Definition of Local Culture 14
1.5 Statement of Problem 15
1.6 Research Questions 15
1.7 Significance of the Study 15
1.8 Chapter Division 16

## II  LITERATURE REVIEW 17

2.1 Discourse and Social Practices 17
2.1.1 Studying Discourse 21
2.2 Critical Discourse Analysis 22
2.2.1 Eight Principles of Theory for CDA Research 27
2.2.2 Content analysis Vs CDA 31
2.2.3 CDA and Systemic Functional Linguistics (SFL) 33
2.2.4 Ideology and CDA 35
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.2.5 Discourses are Historical: An approach in CDA</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.6 Intertextuality in CDA</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.7 Context in CDA</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.8 Language and society in CDA</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.9 The Case of Action, Representation and Identification in CDA</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.10 Text Analysis: A Relational Approach in CDA</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.11 Criticisms on CDA and the Defensive Stance</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.12 Tool-Kits for CDA</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.13 Validity of the Self-analyzed Data</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3 Culture</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4 Sufism: Various Perspectives</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.1 Sufism: Origin and Evolution</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.2 A Brief Review of Critical Works on Sufism and Sufi Thought</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.3 Prominent Sufi Doctrines</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.4 Key Concepts in Sufi Discourse</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5 Review of the Works on Schimmel</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III RESEARCH METHODOLOGY</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1 Rationale for Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA)</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2 Data: Core Texts for my Research Study</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.4 Rationale for Selection of Core Books/15 Selected Texts</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3 Data Analysis</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4 Strong Bondage between CDA and Systemic Functional Grammar</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5 Research Model- Fairclough’s Stance towards CDA</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.1 The Social Dimension</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.2 The Discursive Dimension</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.3 The Textual Dimension</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.4 Aspects of Three-Dimensional Model</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# CRITICAL DISCOURSE ANALYSIS OF SCHIMMEL’S UNDERSTANDING OF SUFI POETRY

4.1 The Research Paradigm and Methodology ........................................ 103
4.2 *Pain and Grace* – 5 Selected Texts ............................................... 104
  4.2.1 Social Events ................................................................. 105
  4.2.2 Genre ............................................................................ 105
  4.2.3 Intertextuality ................................................................. 106
  4.2.4 Semantic/Grammatical Relations between Sentences and Clauses 113
  4.2.5 Assumptions ................................................................. 126
  4.2.6 Modality ....................................................................... 129
  4.2.7 Styles ............................................................................ 133
  4.2.8 Exchanges, Speech Functions and Grammatical Mood .......... 138
  4.2.9 Discourses ................................................................. 139
  4.2.10 Representation of Social Events ...................................... 140
4.3 *Mystical Dimensions of Islam* – 5 Selected Texts ....................... 152
  4.3.1 Social Events ................................................................. 153
  4.3.2 Genre ............................................................................ 154
  4.3.3 Intertextuality ................................................................. 154
  4.3.4 Semantic/Grammatical Relations between Sentences and Clauses 161
  4.3.5 Modality ....................................................................... 173
  4.3.6 Assumptions ................................................................. 176
  4.3.7 Styles ............................................................................ 180
  4.3.8 Exchanges, Speech Functions and Grammatical Mood 184
  4.3.9 Discourses ................................................................. 185
  4.3.10 Social Representation of Events ...................................... 187
4.4 *As through a Veil* – 5 Selected Texts ........................................... 199
  4.4.1 Social Events ................................................................. 200
  4.4.2 Genre ............................................................................ 201
  4.4.3 Intertextuality ................................................................. 201
  4.4.4 Semantic/Grammatical Relations between Sentences and Clauses 207
4.4.5 Modality ......................................................... 215
4.4.6 Assumptions ..................................................... 218
4.4.7 Styles .............................................................. 221
4.4.8 Exchanges, Speech Functions and Grammatical Mood 225
4.4.9 Discourses .......................................................... 226
4.4.10 Representation of Social Events ......................... 228

V CONCLUSION ......................................................... 241

5.1 Summary of the Research Proceedings .................... 241
5.2 Findings and Conclusions ...................................... 246
5.3 Limitations of the Study ....................................... 266
5.4 Implications of the Study ...................................... 268
5.5 Recommendations ............................................... 270

REFERENCES........................................................... 273

APPENDICES .............................................................

Appendix No.1 .......................................................... i
Appendix No.2 ........................................................... iii
Appendix No.3 ........................................................... v
Appendix No.4 .......................................................... vii
Appendix No.5 ........................................................... ix
Appendix No.6 ............................................................ xi
Appendix No.7 .......................................................... xiii
Appendix No.8 ........................................................... xvi
Appendix No.9 ........................................................... xviii
Appendix No.10 ........................................................... xxi
Appendix No.11 ........................................................... xxiv
Appendix No.12 ........................................................... xxv
Appendix No.13 ........................................................... xxvii
Appendix No.14 ........................................................... xxx
Appendix No.15 ........................................................... xxiii
DEDICATION

TO MY PARENTS

the greatest people on earth, whose very presence gives me strength.

Kalam-i-Bahu dedicated to my Mother who is my Murshid, my Pir . . .

Were my whole body festooned with eyes, I would gaze at my Master with untiring zeal.
O’ how I wish that every pore of my body would turn into a million eyes – Then as some closed to blink others would open to see!
But even then my thirst to see him might remain unquenched. What else am I to do?
To me O’ Bahu, a glimpse of my Master is worth millions of pilgrimages to the Holy Ka’ba!

(Sultan Bahu)
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

Allah, my Lord, please accept my thanks for blessing me at every phase of my life. Thank You Allah, The All Hearing, The All Seeing and The All Knowing, for infusing the light of knowledge and insightful spirit which are destined only to the blessed souls.

This doctoral thesis is a rewarding outcome of a scholarly expedition that commenced in Fall 2008 at National University of Modern Languages, Islamabad and has since been a demanding and equally enjoyable venture. I owe very special thanks to my esteemed supervisor Prof. Dr. Samina Amin Qadir, the scholarly niece of a renowned intellectual and author, Qudratullah Shahab, whose contribution to literary genres are unrivaled. I am profoundly indebted to Dr. Samina for having provided insightful feedback and astute advice during the toughest hours of my academic journey. The sweet and affectionate smile on her face made me forget all the fatigue and exhaustion of the strenuous work and infused new energies. I owe a great debt to her generous concentration and precious time she always specified for me despite being extremely engaged in hectic responsibilities of vice chancellorship.

I am grateful to Rector NUML, Maj. Gen. ® Masood Hasan for his patronage during the entire research process. My special thanks to all my venerable teachers at NUML: Dr. Aziz Ahmed Khan (Ex Rector NUML), Dr. Riaz Hassan, Dr. Shazra Munnawer (Dean FHS NUML), Dr. Rubina Kamran, Dr. Sohaila Javed, Dr. Allah Bakhsh and Dr. Nighat Sultana for their encouragement and support. Thanks to Higher Education Commission for funding my research.

My profound gratitude goes to Lt. Gen. ® Israr Ahmed Ghumman and Brig. ® Mahmud Bashir Bajwa, the great human beings, for their selfless contribution in giving boost
to my professional career. I am deeply indebted to them and pray for their long and blessed life.

My special thanks to Dr. Safdar Ali Shah whose continuous encouragement and patronage provided me ample opportunities to benefit from his scholarly presence.

I owe a great debt to all the great teachers in my academic career especially the teachers during my school and college days: Mr. Gul Muhammad Chishti (who introduced me to Persian language at a very early age), Mr. Ameer Bakhsh (indebted to him for refining my debating skills), Mr. Abdul Hameed, Mr. Afzal Joya, Mr. Mutee Haider, Qazi Muhammad Ehsan (Late), Mr. Nazuk Shahzad (My Urdu teacher who actually promoted my love to literary genres); my teachers during Master’s in English: Mr. Naeem Khan (Late), Syed Imran Raza, Mr. Saeed Akhtar, Mr. Saleem Tangwani (Late), Mr. Ali Muhammad Siddiqui, Mr. Javed Kaukab and Mr. Musarrat Hussain.

I owe special thanks to Lt. Cdr. Jaleel Adnan (PN) for being my inspiration while I was in Pakistan Navy. He gave new dimensions to my thought process and helped me refine my literary expression. Special thanks to my closest friend, Mr. Ghulam Abbas Chishti, for all the love and support. Special thanks to all the respected officers and my friends at Pakistan Navy who were of a great support during my stay there.

I extend my warm gratitude to my sincere friend Dr. Muhammad Sheeraz who has been of a great support during my research proceedings. His affectionate presence always gives me strength. My gratitude to my dear and respected friend Mr. Muhammad Aslam (a PhD scholar in Linguistics) who helped me gain insights into CDA. The insightful conversations with him facilitated me in setting my research dimensions.

My special thanks to an all-time adorable friend Dr. Adnan Tahir Qureshi who is more than a friend. Our friendship cannot be encapsulated in words. I remain indebted to his affectionate and critical advice whether it was an academic riddle or a matter of personal inquiry. Special thanks to my dear friend, Mr. Ayaz Qadeer (a PhD Scholar in Linguistics)
for his loving companionship. Our common pursuits in CDA and research coordination would definitely be productive in the days to come, in sha Allah.

My warm gratitude to my respected friend Hakeem Muhammad Younus whose energizing cup of tea adds vigour to my life. Special thanks to my friend Mr. Fakhruddin Chishti for his warm friendship. I owe special thanks to the happiest couple ever, Mr. Anjum Iqbal and Ms. Rehana Rehman for their sweetest company within difficult days of my life. Thanks to my dearest friends Fareed Gopang and Siddique Hassan for their sweet friendship. Love to my dear friends Shafique Chishti and Imran Ali Chishti at my hometown, Sheru Jadid, Dera Ghazi Khan. May Allah bless me in extending whatever I can do within my humble capacity to uplift the educational standards of my native town and city!

Fauzia Chishti, my dear wife, deserves special and profound thanks as she was the one who prompted me in pursuing my PhD. I still remember the time when I used to reply casually to her insistence on continuing with my higher studies. I used to respond, “There is no need to be panic in life; one should be contented with what he possesses, both materialistically and intellectually.” But she pursued her case successfully in making me convinced and there was no end to her jubilation when she caught the news of my admission in PhD. Hope my humble contribution ultimately brings smile to her face. My love to my kids: Noor Fatima Chishti and Muhammad Mustafa Chishti. Hope their ilm-dost father becomes an inspiration for them.

We are in fact an education-loving family. My heartfelt gratitude goes to my younger brothers and sisters, who are in fact my pride. They never let me down during their academic pursuits and always came up to my expectations. Their success stories have always given me strength. My special thanks to my dearest brothers: Iftikhar Zeeshan Chishti (the successful Country Manager), Muhammad Anees Chishti (the flourishing Manager in Pharmaceuticals), Jalees Kamran Chishti (a Mechanical Engineer), Muhammad Abdullah Chishti (the youngest Youth Exchange Scholar who visited US on a scholarship at a very early age). Special love and thanks to my dearest sisters Samreen Kousar (a Telecom Engineer), Maria Sadaf (an
Architectural Engineer) for their love and prayers. Thanks Maria, for extending some typing assistance to your extremely ‘non-technical’ brother.

My special thanks to my dearest Mamun Zulfiquar Ali Chishti, the world tourist, whom I have always idealized and followed. In fact, he has been a source of great inspiration for me in various dimensions. My warm gratitude to the esteemed figures of our family: Ghulam Yaseen Chishti (my eldest uncle) and Dr. Muhammad Hashim Chishti, who despite being within the humble village circumstances, never wavered in their determination of introducing the common folk to the principles of humanity taught by the great Sufi saints.

Lastly, the tears of joy and reverence trickle down my eyes when I mention my great parents who have been anxiously waiting and praying for the great day of my success since long. Hope their son does not disappoint them at all. My warmest gratitude to my great father Altaf Ahmed Chishti, who consumed himself, physically and mentally, in bringing smile to our faces and my great mother, Perveen Kausar Chishti, who is the sweetest mother on earth. I do not find anyone matching her stature as a compassionate human being. I pray to Almighty Allah for their sound health and happy long life.
CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background

The long tradition of Sufism and the variety of practices adopted by its followers have been documented in the form of malfoozat of the Sufis, their poetry, biographies, correspondence etc by many of the followers of it. Some academic studies have also been carried out into this tradition of the East. Its widening and convincing scope has also interested and attracted various Western researchers and authors who produced a good bulk of work. However, these works whether by the authors from the East or the West have not been critically examined at an extensive level. Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) being the very comprehensive of the language-based analytical approaches could be applied to study these texts on Sufi traditions, practical as well as poetic, to investigate multitude of cultural and ideological underpinnings.

1.1.1 Sufism

Sufism is viewed as the Mystic explication of Islamic life within the ties of religious conventional beliefs which first got initiated by God fearing people of Perso-Arab world. One of their basic beliefs was the total rejection and renunciation of the world and they kept themselves thoroughly engrossed to His service. Directing all their endeavours towards Tawhid (Oneness of God), they played a key role in propagation of Islam through their mystic movement. To them intellectualization of Sunnah (The orthodox customs of Islamic world) was one of its fundamental codes to follow (Encyclopaedia of Islam as cited in Upadhyay, 2004). The devotees kept on ascribing them with metaphysical features under the guiding principles of Quran and Sunnah. Sufis were considered as icons of supernatural power. Their disciples followed their
footsteps which led towards peace or even got themselves inclined towards jehad for Shariatisation of the entire world as a special assignment of the sacred task. "Seekers of Tawhid should strive to dedicate themselves to the Prophet Mohammad (PBUH), so much so that their entire selves, including their hearts and their spirits, were free of thoughts other than of God" (Rizvi, 2004, p. 172).

Mysticism blesses the devotees with an extreme state of contentment which they seek through self realization. However the stage of self-realization is achieved after a long and repeated spiritual practice. After this stage is achieved, the Sufis show their disregard and spare themselves from the outward form of religion. Higher religious order of any faith aims at Sufism as their top most obligations and keeps itself away from any form of discord and contention resulting in conflict. Sufism may well be graded as a practical spiritual discipline which is entirely dependent on the insight of enlightened seekers after truth. The basic philosophy of Sufism is therefore, to guard the believers against the superficial doctrines of the religion and direct all their energies towards the spiritual dimensions of Islam (Upadhyay, 2004).

The tradition of studying Sufism and documenting its practices and orders is as old as Sufism itself. It began in Basra in modern Iraq and Al-Farabi, Al-Ghazali, Jalal-ud-Din Rumi were the key figures of it (Schimmel, 2003). Over the years, it evolved while travelling all around the world and penetrating into various cultures, though India, Iran, Central Asia and Turkey were its major centers (Rizvi, 2004, p.36). With the passage of time, various orders of Sufi thought emerged at various places of the world, namely Chishtia Order that came into existence at Chisht, Afghanistan, Qadria Order emerging in Iran, Suhrwardiya Order that was established in Baghdad, Iraq etc.

The history of Sufism in Indian Subcontinent is also quite diverse (Rizvi, 2004). The Sufi tradition, practices and poetry, here, have been studied by various scholars (e.g. Rizvi, 2004; Schimmel, 2003a, 2003b; Singh, 2002; Quddusi, 1962 etc). Some of the authors have focused on the various roles of Sufism including how it helped develop cultures through poetry, music, sittings etc (Krishna, 1973 etc).
The process of propagation of the great Sufi message was initiated through a medium of Sufi poetry. Sufi poets exploited this medium by innovative use of the native languages and through the discourse of this influential medium played a key role in bringing people of different religions and ethnic backgrounds close together. The impacts of Sufi poetry can be traced in the soils of Indus Valley to a great extent. Indus Valley was bestowed with cultural diversity because of the invasions and migrations of Aryans, Mongols, Greeks, Turks, Afghans, Arabs and Persians. Great scholars and Sufis who spent their lives in contemplation were allured and fascinated towards the culturally rich soil of the valley during the middle ages of Islam. This valley, indeed, strengthened the endeavours of Sufi poets for setting the rich tradition of Sufi poetry which later proved valuable in unifying the diversified cultural heritage of the valley. The message conveyed through this very effective medium is quite obvious that one cannot identify oneself or the reality of this universe without the strongest and purest element of love. ‘Love’ and ‘Peace’ become the core themes of the entire Sufi Poetry. It not only gives the true essence of the social values but also suggests remedies for the human beings who have got themselves secluded from their own ‘self’ and also from their surroundings. Though the universe witnessed the astonishing wonders in the fields of science and technology in the modern age, the insightful Sufi poets conveyed the recent modernized picture of the universe through their intuitive and contemplative Sufi poetry centuries ago (Gardezi, n.d.).

1.1.2 Sufi Poetry

Sufi poetry, emerging directly from the indigenous settings, carries a lot of cultural underpinnings in it. Apart from being vital in religious teachings, political developments, social reformations etc, the Sufi poetry has its central role in shaping and propagating a culture that is usually a blend of the local norms and those brought here with mystic traditions coming all the way from Arabia and Persia. This amalgam that the Sufi poetry is shaped with has attracted the attention of various critics and scholars (e.g. Christopher Shakel, Sajida Alvi) of the world. Annemarie Schimmel is one of the most prominent figures of the last century who have conducted profound studies in local Sufi poetry. These studies are appealing as they bring out an in-depth interpretation of the Sufi poetry. However, a careful study would reveal that these
interpretations sometimes go beyond mere studies and tend to construct some realities, culture being one of them. Thus, it sounds relevant to explore these studies.

It is remarkable here to mention that the message of Sufi Poems started spreading its fragrance in such an age where people had got themselves so much engrossed in their so-called ethnic and religious identities, discriminations and prejudices. The perils of globalization had placed the people in an extreme state of anxiety and turmoil. On the contrary, the essence of Sufi message lies in the religious tolerance, love of nature and mutual respect. The so-called age of enlightenment resulted in rising conflicts as it aimed at getting a complete control over nature whereas the Sufi message conveyed through Sufi poems emphasized on living in complete harmony with nature (Gardezi, n. d.).

1.2 Annemarie Schimmel

The major sources consulted for Schimmel’s life-history information were Gewertz, 2003; Asani et al. 2004 and Schimmel, 2007.

Annemarie Schimmel was born on April 7, 1922 in Erfurt, Germany. She was brought up in a cultured atmosphere though she belonged to a middle-class family (Schimmel, 2007). She was the only child of her parents who enriched her academics through flavour of literature and poetry. The teacher who played a leading role in her life and influenced her life completely was polymath, Hans Heinrich Schaeder (Asani et al. 2004). It was he who inspired her to study the Divan of Jalaluddin Rumi and it was his poetry which transformed her life completely. She developed a sound understanding of his poetry and got herself completely immersed in his ideas which resulted in a thorough transformation and a revolution in her thought process. In 1939, she commenced her academics at the University of Berlin when she was just 17 years old and received a doctorate in Islamic languages and civilizations at the age of nineteen. Her dissertation was on late medieval Egypt. Soon after that, she was appointed by the Foreign Office in a decoding unit. However, she kept on focusing on scholarly projects whenever she got any spare time. She was able to submit her Habilitationsschrift on March 31, 1945. The very next day, the whole decoding unit was placed on trucks and got evacuated. No one knew where they were being headed. As the convoy reached Saxony, they were captured by the Advancing
American Army and put behind the bars in Marburg. All the internees laid the foundation of a
camp university there. Schimmel used to sit on the top of a double-decker bunk and lectured on
Islam. In 1941, she lectured on "The Main Representatives of Islamic Mysticism" at the age of
23. The Faculty of Protestant Theology in Marburg awarded her second doctorate in 1951 in the
History of Religions. This time her thesis was on mystical love in Islam.

She served as a professor of Arabic at University of Marburg and also became the
professor of history of religions at the University of Ankara in Turkey. She kept on teaching
Turkish and started getting herself familiar with the culture and religion for a longer period
(1967-1992) and became part and parcel of the area. She stayed on the faculty of Harvard
University and was promoted to professor emeritus of Indo-Muslim culture after her retirement.

Schimmel worked on Islamic literature, mysticism and culture and published more than
one hundred books. She translated Persian, Urdu, Arabic, Sindhi and Turkish poetry to English
and German. She was awarded with the highest civil award ‘Hilal-e-Imtiaz’ in Pakistan. Other
awards bestowed upon her include the Peace Prize of the German Book Trade which she was
awarded in 1995. However, it proved contentious as she defended the Islamic World’s
indignation against Salman Rushdie. Remarking on Frithiof Schuon’s masterpiece
Understanding Islam in its foreword, Prof. Schimmel relates that the book depicts the true
essence of Islam, compares its worldview with that of Christianity and makes it elaborate by
providing examples from other religious traditions. Further commenting on his style, she is of the
view that the crystalline pure forms can easily be traced by the reader as he goes through the
book and such passages also exist which are really heart-touching.

Prof. Schimmel made frequent trips to Turkey in the early fifties where she delivered her
first Turkish lecture in 1953. Then she became the chair of the History of Religion in the Faculty
of Theology. During her five years stay (1954-59) in Turkey, she developed a sound
understanding and passionate love for Rumi’s works. She used to visit his mausoleum in Konia.
Another man whose influence can be witnessed in her writings is Dr. Muhammad Iqbal whose
works had a great fascination for Schimmel. Her Turkish friends urged her to translate Iqbal’s
famous book, the Jawednama. This work fascinated and compelled her to visit Pakistan. In 1958
she was invited to visit Pakistan and this was the very moment which transfused new energies into her veins and she continued thinking over a new research project.

Schimmel attended the 11th Congress of the International Association for the History of Religions in Claremont, California as she visited the United States of America in her very first visit in 1965. She was inspired by Harvard's Wilfred Cantwell Smith to translate the works of two great Urdu poets, Mir and Ghalib, into poetic English. A considerable amount had been given to Harvard for this task. She showed her disinterest towards the project saying that she did not consider herself appropriate person for the task as she had no specialization in Urdu. But the persistent pursuit of Smith and other fellows at Harvard got her persuaded towards the project.

She joined Harvard as a lecturer in 1967. There she started lecturing on Indo-Muslim Culture. Just three years after her appointment there, she was promoted as full professor. She used to teach there only in the spring term with double load. Her frequent visits to Pakistan were the evidence of her rising fame here within the intellectuals and the academic circles. She was so popular here that one of the avenues in Lahore has been named after her, Khayaban-e-Schimmel. Her students developed a special reverence towards her. She was so highly demanding from her students that they used to fear her. But as regards their complete trust in her, they even used to share their personal matters with her and always sought her wise counsel. She was considered an authority on Sufism and students flocked to attend her class on Sufism. Students even used to adore her style of delivery. She is reported to clasp her purse with both hands and during delivery closed her eyes. She had never exceeded the time allocated to her for lecture. She often used to relate that she could deliver her lecture without a manuscript in German, English and Turkish and even could articulate in French, Arabic, Persian and Urdu just looking at the paper.

Other than her two PhDs, she was also awarded with a great number of prizes, medals and honorary doctorates. The number of her works in English and German exceeds one hundred. She loved to translate Islamic poetry in which she really used to take delight. She had an obsession with Friedrich Ruckert, the late Romantic poet and orientalist, whose model she used to follow in poetry.
After her retirement from Harvard in 1992, she thoroughly directed her energies towards writing and lecturing. Keeping in view her services in developing East-West understanding, she was awarded with the esteemed Peace Prize of the German Book-Trade Association which bestowed her with the ultimate public recognition.

In 2003, she had to face some complications after her major surgery which she couldn’t bear and passed away on January 26, 2003. She remained a singular soul throughout her life and had no immediate living family. The family which she survived consists of a very small bunch of people including the son of her cousin, whom she loved a lot, and his family who are settled in California and New Jersey. Though she was a singular individual with a very small family, the number of her fans including her friends, colleagues, students and Muslim scholars throughout the world is really remarkable.

Throughout her life, she remained completely engrossed in understanding culture and Sufi phenomenon. However, she had almost zero inclination towards politics. She used to remark that it was not her world rather she was interested in culture, religion and the daily life of Islam that was indeed the foundation and had nothing to do with the politics of the day. Her fondness in investigating Islamic culture helped her develop friendship with some oppressive Muslim rulers which got her engaged in some public controversies. The major criticism which she had to face by some of the intellectuals was that she painted quite a gentle picture of Islam and therefore projected its softer image and had not pointed her finger towards the evils committed in its name. (Gewertz, 2003; Asani et al. 2004; Schimmel, 2007).

Schimmel, in her bulk of works, has studied Sufism from many angles. However, I, in the present study, have focused on the discursive construction of local culture in her interpretations of Sufi poetry which she has made in her works. e.g. Pain and Grace; Mystical Dimensions of Islam; As through a Veil, etc.

1.2.1 Schimmel’s Works

Schimmel published more than 50 books in the fields of Islamic literature, Sufism and culture. She extensively worked on Persian, Urdu, Arabic, Sindhi and Turkish poetry and translated them in English and German. Her major works include: As through A Veil : Mystical Poetry in Islam,
1.2.2 Schimmel’s Works under Study

Schimmel’s works relevant to the present study are: *Pain and Grace; Mystical Dimensions of Islam* and *As through a Veil*. The rationale behind selection of these three core texts out of many prominent works of Schimmel has been presented in Chapter 3. Brief insights into various themes developed within the books are given as under:

1.2.2.1 *Pain and Grace*

*Pain and Grace* is the first core book from where excerpts are taken for analysis. The title of the book is quite significant and refers to the two mystics: Dard, (Pain), and Abdul Latif, (The Servant of the Gracious). The book gives a gist of both of the mystics’ ideas and their approaches towards looking at life.

Schimmel’s *Pain and Grace* is an enquiry into the works of two eighteenth-century Sufi poets. Mir Dard, who got his poetical talents refined in the rich literary culture of Delhi. He was
considered to be adept in Persian poetry, but a bulk of his works can also be found in Urdu. He was known to give a certain level of prestige and refinement to Urdu language. On the other hand, Shah Abdul Latif Bhitai, contributed his Sufi poems in the culturally enriched rural settings of Sind. His poetry contained in it the spiritual relief for the depressed poor masses. Schimmel was able to convincingly convey her message that the role of mystics was far more effective than the theologians of religion in India. This book may well be considered an invaluable resource for the researchers who intend to explore this book beyond an historic account of Mughal India.

Both of the mystics had a firm belief that the Gracious bestows His Grace only on those who always remain cheerful, patient and calm even in the worst situations. They bear all the hardships of the journey and always aim at the city of God by the end of the road which has all the pleasures and comforts they aspire for. The remarkable aspect of the book is that Schimmel has relied largely upon the poets’ own words which she also states in the foreword of the book. It is significant here that comprehension and analysis of esoteric languages like Urdu, Sindhi and Persian was not an effortless task because superficial grasp and investigation of these languages could lead to fake conclusions. In spite of the fact, Schimmel not only grasped the languages to a great extent rather developed a critical approach on entire poetic work of these legendary Sufis.

Both these Sufis are the representatives of two corresponding features of Islamic Sufism and mystical poetry. One of them represents urban, civilized and cultured trends of Persian culture while the other constitutes rural, simple and unpretentious life of Sind without exploiting images with multitude of theoretical interpretations. The essence of this simple Sufi message was meant for ordinary people and provided them with some healing and consoling effects in their wretched lives. The propagation of this Sufi concept conveyed through Sufi poetry was quite prompt and rapid because the poetry got transformed into songs of ordinary ploughmen and fishermen. So, the message of Love of God and the Prophet (PBUH), and the faith in everlasting divine wisdom became a deep-seated feature of their daily lives. The reader may find the traces of sweet-scented roses in Dard’s poetry. Dard’s imagery, his music and his skilful treatment of Persian and Urdu languages was directed towards sophisticated culture of Mughal India. However, Shah Abdul Latif never got allured towards roses and nightingales. The reader may well find the traces of sweltering desert winds, melodious rain, grazing cattle, buffalo calves and
the lowly thatched huts in his poetry. His folk songs visualize the troubles of poor inhabitants of the rural Sind and are echoed with the shrieks of frantic lovers.

The perspective I have selected this book for the research study is that it is replete with local cultural references especially the Grace section (Shah Abdul Latif Bhitai) is more suited to my research pursuits. I am more concerned with critical discourse perspective which is to see how local culture was discursively constructed in Schimmel’s skilful treatment of Sufi Poetry. I have to also keep this angle into consideration that being a Western, how she was able to maintain a complete grasp over the local cultural settings, despite being thoroughly alienated to all the cultural norms. Ideological perspectives also acquire prominence within the enquiry of the local cultural evidences within the core book. Further, investigation into Schimmel’s subjective stance, her beliefs and ideologies attached with various themes merged within Sufi poetic discourse is also a prominent aspect worth enquiry.

1.2.2.2 Mystical Dimensions of Islam

*Mystical Dimensions of Islam* is another core book I have selected for my research study which though is an historical account of various Sufi dimensions and a journey of evolution of Sufism, its last section addresses my pursuits. My concern is thoroughly linguistic and critical investigating Schimmel’s analysis of Sufi poetry probing into discursive construction of the instances of local culture.

Divided into nine chapters, the book investigates the nature of mysticism not only as a religious category but also as a dimension of Islam. Poetic inclinations of the author are reflected through the elegant style of the book. It touches upon generic picture of Sufism, historical perspectives, the path of Islamic mysticism and Sufi orders with broader perspectives. Persian, Turkish, and Indo-Pak forms of Sufism, particularly Sufi poetry have also been brought into limelight. The historical developments in the mystical dimensions from the rise of Islam to the modern day have been artistically captured by the author. The reader may not only find ample commentary and phenomenological discussion on the subject matter but also the scholarly criticism which ranks this book amongst the authentic books on Sufism.
Schimmel’s grasp over Sufi works in Arabic, Persian and Turkish can be witnessed throughout the text. However, a reasonable bulk of materials has also been drawn in Western languages. Notes on European and especially German language scholarship give it a tinge of diversity. Technical terms and concepts have also been presented in a lucid style to make it more attractive for the reader. Close study of *Mystical Dimensions of Islam* facilitates teaching of Sufism in academic context which has often been considered as a cumbersome task. Schimmel’s profound feelings and deep-rooted comprehension for the mystical dimensions of Islam can be reflected through this book. Her ultimate aim seems to enrich the reader with the multifaceted richness of the subject matter sketching it from almost all angles. Literary expression of Sufi thought and practice have been explicated to an extent leaving no significant aspect ignored.

The book is a poised blend of various Sufi themes: Theosophical Sufism, Historical Outlines of Classical Sufism, Man and his Perfection, Sufi Orders and Fraternities and The Path. Schimmel’s endeavours in exploring eastern Islamic lands and unveiling complex Sufi notions can be witnessed in her work. Different schools of thought and opinions within various Sufi orders have also been given sufficient place. The book is equally useful for scholars belonging to different geographical boundaries.

The chapter namely “The Path” is an elaborate discussion on types of prayer and meditation. “Man and His Perfection” is specified for the admiration of Prophet Muhammad (PBUH) and the deep-rooted affection and love which Muslims have for him. “Sufi Orders and Fraternities”, a chapter which provides a detailed discourse about the terminology and describes the major early orders. “Theosophical Sufism” comprises discussion of the contribution of Ibn-e-Arabi. “The Rose and the Nightingale: Persian and Turkish Mystical Poetry” contains fascinating discussions about great Sufi literary figures as Ruzbihan Baqli of Shiraz, Sana’i, Attar, Rumi and the Turk, Younus Emre. “Sufism in Indo-Pakistan” gives insights into Indo-Pak territory which should be a territory of great significance for the West to explore new dimensions.

The extracts I selected from this book were also extracted from the last few chapters of the book.

Through two appendices, "Letter Symbolism in Sufi Literature" and "The Feminine Element in Sufism" author's special concern can be well noticed. The Qura’nic references
mentioned in indices and transcription give a specific validity to the work. Schimmel's special interest in calligraphy is evident through various illustration and titles.

However, I have viewed this book from somewhat different perspective which is to conduct critical discourse investigation of the selected excerpts from the book. Enquiry of how local culture was constructed through the discourse of Schimmel’s analysis of Sufi poetry is the major concern my research study centers around. So, the careful selection of the sample texts was made to make it really an apt analysis. As many as 5 texts were selected from various sections of the core text which were found closer to the research pursuits or in other words only those excerpts were carefully selected which were found more compatible with the research questions. The essence of cultural traces can be extracted from various mystical dimensions of Islam as Sufi poetry sprouts from the soil and forms a deeper association with the culture of that particular soil.

1.2.2.3 *As through a Veil*

*As through a Veil* is the third core book from which I have selected representative sample texts. The book comprises brief sections which give the reader an ample opportunity to have a brief encounter of the mystical traditions and the poetical expression. These chapters include: Flowers of the Desert: The Development of Arabic Mystical Poetry; Tiny Mirrors of Divine Beauty: Classical Persian Mystical Poetry; Sun Triumphant-Love Triumphant: Maulana Rumi and the Metaphors of Love; The Voice of Love: Mystical Poetry in the Vernaculars; God's Beloved and Intercessor for Man: Poetry in Honor of the Prophet. The book encapsulates five lectures delivered by Schimmel in which multitude of verses of poetry are cited which serve as a guideline for further investigation. The chapter Mystical Poetry in the Vernaculars evolves supreme significance within this study as the study has been intended to unveil how local culture was constructed through the discourse of Schimmel’s work on Sufi poetry. Vernaculars dealt in by the Sufi poets like Sindhi, Pashto, Saraiki, and Punjabi gained special significance for Schimmel. Being a Western scholar, her interest in these vernaculars is indeed a remarkable aspect.
The major objective which it encompasses is the elemental pursuits about mysticism and its poetical expression. Further, association between poetical expression and prophetic tradition was also presented to a reasonable extent. However, while elaborating the mystical traditions and historical perspectives, Schimmel heavily relies on her books *Mystical Dimensions of Islam* and *The Triumphant Sun: A Study of the Works of Jalaluddin Rumi*. Propagation of Sufi poetry into Turkish and the vernaculars of the Indian subcontinent were touched upon. Sufi traditions, poetical metaphors and symbols were deciphered and explicated which can be witnessed in Schimmel's translations. Only the doctrinal and devotional facets of Sufi poetry were presented while the complex critical commentary was deliberately avoided within the book. *As through a Veil* may be viewed as a true demonstration of Schimmel’s deep reverence for Sufism and Sufi poetry.

1.3 Critical Discourse Analysis

In order to conduct the study in a systematic way, I benefit from the theories and models offered by Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA). The key word of the topic “discursive” also comes from the same area. In discourse studies ‘discursive practices’ is repeatedly used referring to those practices through which texts are produced (created) and consumed (received and interpreted). These discursive practices contribute to the constitution of the social world including social identities and social relations (Jorgensen & Phillips, 2002). Fairclough (2003) is of the view that discourse is both constitutive and constituted. Discourse can also be viewed as a form of social practice which both constitutes (constructs) the social world and is constituted (constructed) by other social practices (Fairclough, 2003). Some of the key works in CDA from which I benefited are Wodak (2001), Van Dijk (1993; 1995; 2001) etc.

Thus building on all this literature and many other relevant works, in my research study, I tried to probe into the analytical work of Schimmel on Sufi poetry to further investigate how local culture is constructed through her analysis of Sufi poetry (text as discourse).
The data (texts/excerpts) for this study have been collected from the works *Pain and Grace; Mystical Dimensions of Islam; As through a Veil* of Schimmel. This qualitative data was analyzed by applying Fairclough's three dimensional model. (Fairclough, 2003).

The analysis will focus on:

- The linguistic features of the selected Sufi texts
- Processes relating to the production and consumption of the selected texts (discursive practice/genres of Sufi poetry)
- The wider social practice which the selected texts represent (social practice/aspects of local culture).

### 1.4 Operational Definition of Local Culture

One of the key words of my research topic is ‘local culture’. Therefore, the researcher devised an operational definition of ‘local culture’. This operational definition was made at specific and broader levels. At specific level, Linguistic Relativity Hypothesis (Whorf, 1956), was followed that denies existence of any universal culture. A culture can only be understood on its own terms. This means that the concepts of universal and local culture are no more rigid. Every culture is unique and independent. However, within a culture, difference is made between ‘high Culture’ (with capital ‘C’ that stands for literature and arts), and small culture (with small ‘c’ that refers to attitudes, values, beliefs, and everyday lifestyles). Combination of culture in this sense and language as embodiment of this sense is called Discourses.

Adopting the Relativity concept of culture, all the features embedded within Sufi interpretive discourse of Schimmel i.e. the selected texts, were seen as indicators of the culture with small and capital ‘c’ in my study. The selected texts were analyzed to identify these constructive indicators of the local culture.

According to Lyons (1981), the word ‘Culture’ has two senses. In one sense, it is opposite of barbarism. The other sense that is anthropological, defines culture as collective thought or distinctive national spirit of a community. The national culture is further sum total of
various sub-cultures. This second sense provided indicators of ‘local culture’ (with small ‘c’ and capital ‘C’) within this study which include family systems, faith systems, folklores, music, superstitions and various Sufi practices and literary aspects.

At a broader level, by ‘local culture’ I also mean the indigenous culture (with small and capital ‘c’) pertaining to the contexts of the selected texts which were presented within the Sufi interpretive discourse of Schimmel. At this level, it refers to the culture of the East in general and the culture of the subcontinent (Sind, Panjab), Persian culture and Arabian culture, in particular.

1.5 Statement of Problem

The basic assumption that this research deals with is that texts construct realities. Schimmel has produced quite a bulk of work on Sufism. It is imperative to investigate how her works present the discursive construction of local culture. The matter of basic concern is whether her works have constructed a positive and tolerant local culture. The study not only contributes to the applications of CDA (Critical Discourse Analysis) but also gives a better understanding of the Sufi poetry to literary genres.

1.6 Research Questions

The research questions that the present study deals with are:

1. What construction of local culture emerges out of Schimmel’s interpretation of Sufi poetry?
2. What ideological perspectives does Schimmel employ while interpreting Sufi Poetry?
3. How far do Schimmel’s interpretations adequately reconstruct local culture from Sufi Poetry?

1.7 Significance of the Study

The research study is significant in many ways. To begin with a simple rationale, it is imperative to bring into the limelight the great but so far unexplored bulk of Schimmel’s work, particularly
in linguistic and cultural terms. Applying the frameworks developed by the critical discourse analysts, these significant areas of Schimmel’s works would be highlighted.

Secondly, it would be interesting as well as purposeful to investigate the factors that led a Western scholar to critique Sufi poetry. Was it Sufi tradition that interested her? Was it Islamic culture that attracted her attention? Or were it only Sufi poetry and its inherent message that fascinated her? These and other such relevant questions need to be addressed by a systematic study like the present one.

Thirdly, the research explores the contribution of Schimmel’s work in constructing and representing local culture as derived from Sufi poetry. Her writings are the representation of this culture. The present study looks into how culture is constructed through Schimmel’s academic analysis of Sufi poetry.

Moreover, the study provides an interpretation of Schimmel’s work that would ultimately enhance its comprehension for ordinary readers.

1.8 Chapter Division

The chapter division is as follows:

**Introduction** gives a background to the Sufi poetry, the tradition of its analysis by various scholars and introduces the problem, objectives, key issues, and the subsequent parts related with the topic.

**Literature Review** reviews the available literature related with Schimmel’s works, CDA, Culture, Sufi poetry embedded within local culture including the latest developments in the areas under study and provides a theoretical framework for the research.

**Methodology** defines the core texts, methods of thematic analysis in CDA and the model applied i.e. Fairclough's three dimensional model.
Analysis offers a comprehensive investigation of the text from Schimmel’s works on Sufi poetry as well as a comprehensive discussion on it through critical discourse perspective.

Conclusion gives a summary of discussion, findings and conclusive insights, limitations of the study, implications and recommendations for the future researchers.
CHAPTER 2

LITERATURE REVIEW

The present chapter aims at reviewing the available literature relevant to the concepts of the central focus in the study. The works related to discourse and the interplay of the discourse and society have been given relatively more space as this study is oriented towards the same ideas. I would start the review with the debate on the definitions and scope of the areas central to the study i.e. discourse analysis, critical discourse analysis, discursive construction, etc and how they are related to social practices. However, the present study mainly relies on Critical Discourse Analysis as the methodological framework.

2.1 Discourse and Social Practices

Chouliaraki and Fairclough (1999) are of the opinion that the emphasis of discourse analysis is on examining the dialectical association between discourse and society. This very aspect creates a special link of the study of discourse with social science as both of them target the study of society. Fairclough (2000a) is of the view that the notion of social practices facilitates the analysis to attach social structures with the examination of social interaction which, in this case, is discourse. He further remarks that social life is known to be constituted of features which can be distributed into four main types: physical elements, sociological elements, cultural/psychological elements and text. All these features are meaningful. They are combined and constituted to form social practice. Discourse practice is one of the various social practices. Therefore, these elements also contribute in discourse construction and analysis. The elements of social life combine and constitute to form discursive practice. This configuration phenomenon is actually what determines discourse. Condor and Antaki (1997) assert that within this
phenomenon of configuration, human social cognition is formed in which the information about the social world is processed relating and signifying it in a discourse. Consequently, cognitive processes can be considered as the features that mediate discourse and society.

Various social scientists, as Bourdieu (1977) and Gidden (1991, 1993) argue, have an agreement on this fact that social practices have a reflexive element. Fairclough (2000a) opines that reflexive elements of practice refer to the constant generation of representation. He is of the view that people never simply act, they create the representations of their action as well. Bhaskar (1986) asserts that identities, identifications and social associations are constituted by social practices. If practices are reflexive in a way that their actions at the same time generate representations of such actions in that specific context, it shows that all practices naturally acquire meaningful semiotic features which can be viewed as discursive features. Subsequently, discourse analysis deals with both linguistic and non-linguistic data as discursive structures or texts. Leading deconstructionist, Derrida (1974) asserts that nothing is there outside the text. It means that all the discourse is representative of all the rest of the things. Foucault (1972) has similar views as he takes discourse as practices that constitute the very element which the discourse is about. Fairclough (2000a) is of the view that social life itself can be viewed as textually mediated in the same way as discourse is constituted by the articulation of elements of social life. Discourse can be considered to be a mediator of social constructions because everything gains its worth in discourse. Much has been said about the functions of language. Halliday (1994) goes a step further and presents three meta-functions of language, to which, Fairclough (2000a) approves later. These functions give a brief gist of reflexive construction of discourse. These three functions of language are:

1) Ideational
2) Interpersonal
3) Textual

Discourse has been seen differently in various disciplines. But, the linguistic perspectives have been summed up by Robert et al. (1992) as they cite five different sources to give five categories of discourse.

1) Language in its social context (Brown & Yule, 1983)
ii) Cohesive and coherent (Halliday & Hasan, 1976)

iii) Strategies for interpreting interactive signs and conventions (Gumperz, 1982)

iv) Linguistic unit larger than the level of sentence (Sinclair & Coulthard, 1975)

v) Language as a means for social, political and economic values (Foucault, 1972)

It is because of the varied discursive approaches and variable functions that result in the heterogeneity of discourse definitions. These notions can be graded into two categories: non-critical and critical approaches. Fairclough and Wodak (1997) remark that non-critical approaches focus on investigating different aspects of language including social interaction while critical approaches go beyond in pursuit of power and ideological effects the discourse has on society. So, both these approaches differ in the range of their investigation.

Discourse has been explicated from different angles keeping in view various approaches. Schiffrin et al. (2001) view discourse by getting it classified into three major categories:

i) anything beyond a sentence

ii) language use

iii) a broader range of social practice including non-linguistic and non-specific instances of language

In the early days of history of linguistics, Saussure (as cited in Laclau, 1993) had given one of the most authentic definitions of discourse that it is any linguistic series more extended than a sentence. Language cannot be viewed by exclusively taking grammatical rules into consideration. Van Dijk (1997) reinforces the opinion by affirming that discourse is seen by its functional features as part of the communicative event rather than probing into the grammatical details. So the nature of discourse is very complex. Laclau (1993) and Chouliaraki and Fairclough (1999) acknowledge the complex nature of discourse considering it as an open system that draws upon semiotic resources such as text and grammatical rules as well as other resources in its context.

The term ‘discourse’ is, of course, viewed by different researchers in their peculiar perspectives, and different academic cultures developed their own connotations of the term.
Wodak (1996) put forward insights regarding the comprehension of the term ‘discourse’. She relates that in the German and Central European cultures, ‘text’ and ‘discourse’ are viewed within a different perspective and rather a distinction is made between the two, referring to the tradition in text linguistics as well as to rhetoric. Contending, Schiffrin (1992) remarks that in English settings, ‘discourse’ develops a different connotation. It is often employed for both written and oral texts. According to various other researchers, distinction is made between different levels of abstractness. Lemke (1995) views ‘text’ as the concrete understanding of abstract structures of knowledge. According to sociocognitive theory of van Dijk (1984, 1993, 1998), ‘discourse’ is seen as a form of knowledge and memory. Adding, Reisigl and Wodak (2001) relate that text illustrates concrete oral utterances or written documents.

2.1.1 Studying Discourse

Discourse studies, according to Renkema (1993), are inclined towards studying of the connection between the form and function of language communication, where the matter of meaning has a significant value. De Beaugrande (1991) explicates the issue of discourse by commenting on how it is studied stating that it aims at investigating real language use or the function of language other than focusing on the conceptual or ideal language system or the form. Van Dijk (1997) remarks that the discourse has three facets: language use, communication of belief and interaction in society. Contextual reality gets prominence within the issue of discourse. Keeping in view Van Dijk’s analysis, discourse cannot be viewed in isolation and it would be impossible to examine discourse without taking context into consideration as it has its roots deep in society. Discourse theory is exclusively concerned with discourse by looking at its larger structures, putting the social life into limelight where actually the discourse originates, and also the social practices which are associated with it. Discourse theory studies the bondage between the two to explicate how the society affects discourse and otherwise. According to Laclau (1993), and Chouliaraki and Fairclough (1999) discourse is an open system. It implies that discourse analysis is linked with various approaches namely, pragmatics which examines the ‘acts’ of signs (discourse); psycholinguistics which investigates people’s cognitive processing; or sociolinguistics which discovers links between social aspects and discourse.
Phillips and Hardy (2002) opine that reality is formed, composed or constructed through language. Wood and Kroger (as cited in Phillips & Hardy, 2002) are of the view that language is considered as constitutive and constructive, rather than reflective and representative. Phillips and Hardy (2002), state that social reality cannot be thought of without discourse. They go as far as stating that no one is able to perceive his/her own reality and experience without getting familiar with discourse. It is obvious that discourses form individuals’ experience and reality, but at the same time these discourses also confine them because the individuals have to behave within the boundaries of discourses. Wodak (2001), de Cillia et al. (1999) and Fairclough (1989) believe that a dialectical association gets established between discourses and society in which they function.

Social researches aim at comprehending and analyzing socially produced meanings. Phillips and Hardy (2002) relate that the emphasis of discourse analysis is on the processes where the social world is created and maintained. Phillips and Hardy (2002), and Fairclough (1992) further add that discourse analysis investigates the associations between texts, discourse and context. Phillips and Hardy (2002) maintain that world cannot be viewed independently from discourse as the discourse aims at investigating the way the social reality is produced. Social life is a prominent factor in the methodology of discourse analysis. So discourse is not independent. It is conditioned by the texts and contexts.

2.2 Critical Discourse Analysis

Van Dijk (2007) presents the historical perspective of critical discourse studies. He is of the view that at the end of the 1970s, a new dimension of research emerged in the study of discourse namely Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA). Wodak and Meyer (2001) briefly present the introductory phase of the study. They further remark that this study was initially introduced in a book by Roger Fowler, Gunther Kress, Bob Hodge and Tony Trew. After having experienced the evolutionary phases, it was later developed by Norman Fairclough (1989) in the UK, Ruth Wodak (1989) in Austria and Teun A. Van Dijk (1993) in the Netherlands. Van Dijk (2007) states that Critical Discourse Analysis emerged to focus on issues of power, domination, and social inequality and the application of gender, race and class in the investigation of text and talk.
Wodak and Van Dijk exclusively focused on the reproduction of racism in discourse and worked on political and media discourse. The works of Van Dijk (1993), and Wodak and Van Dijk (2000) can be considered as the representative works in this regard. Then the study of discourse gained an easy access to humanities and social sciences. Van Dijk (2007), highlighting the issue further, remarks that it has now become an admitted fact that discourse is deeply embedded in society and culture and therefore, closely related to all kinds of power, power abuse and social inequality. It is therefore established that critical discourse analysis is specified for language and its relationship with some particular issues such as power, ideology and identity.

The roots of Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) can be traced within critique of structuralists’ stance of looking at language who never give a serious thought to contextual aspects thoroughly concentrating on abstract and theoretical features. Fairclough and Wodak (1997) are of the view that Critical Discourse Analysis gives first thought to partially linguistic character of social and cultural phenomena and structures and does not emphasize on language or the use of language in and for themselves. CDA must be viewed as one of the prominent facets of applied linguistics and social sciences as language and context become the core ideas of concern in CDA. It brings to limelight the functioning of language in social life.

The word ‘discourse’ gained currency in linguistics but at times obscure and vague treatment of this term created stumbling blocks for the researchers. Van Dijk (1997) opines that discourse should be seen as language in use or talk and text in context. It clearly signifies context in the process of construction and reception of language. Fairclough (2003) views discourse to depict a specific way of demonstrating aspects of the world, i.e. to describe processes, relations, structures of the material world as well as thoughts, feelings, beliefs and so on. Woodilla (as cited in Phillips & Hardy, 2002) remarks that discourse can be considered as the real practice of talking and writing while Parker (as cited in Phillips & Hardy, 2002) is of the view that discourse is also an interconnected set of texts and the practices of their production, propagation, and reception that bring an object into being. Fairclough (1989) explicates discourse by adding that it should be viewed as a component of social practice which has its input to the reproduction of social practice. Phillips and Hardy (2002) opine that it is constructed through time by the interconnection between texts, changes and new forms in texts, and new systems of distributing
texts. Fairclough (1989) employs the term discourse to refer to the entire phenomenon of social communication. He further relates that ‘process’ is actually the production of text (where text is the product) and the interpretation of text (where the text is the resource).

Many fields such as applied linguistics emphasize on ‘context’. Its importance has also been acknowledged in CDA where the context of every utterance is granted special attention. Phillips and Hardy (2002) are of the opinion that discourse cannot be stripped from its broader context. Meyer (2001) remarks that Critical Discourse Analysis is concerned with context. This aspect is obvious through social, psychological, political and ideological features of the context in which the texts are embedded and further require interdisciplinarity and intertextuality. Titscher et al. (2000) remark that interdisciplinarity and intertextuality are specific elements of CDA, implying that it is neither limited to one discipline nor is defined by one text. The former refers to the fact that every discipline is a component of a series of disciplines while the latter refers to the viewpoint that every text is a component of a series of texts to which it reacts and refers, and which it modifies. The practitioners of the CDA, therefore, are aware of and considerate of these contextualizing areas as they conduct their analyses.

It is remarkable here as Titscher et al. (2000) and Wodak (1997) state that Critical Discourse analysis views language as a type of social practice. Just as no social practice is independent of others, language is also never a complete entity as it draws upon other social practices prevailing in the society. Meyer (2001) is in favour of the supposition of mediation regarding association between language and society. On the basis of these statements it can be remarked that language, as a matter of fact, determines society but at the same time is also determined by the social reality. Fairclough (2006) further holds that a dialectical association exists between a specific discourse and the social structure. However, Titscher et al. (2000) suggest that language is analysed through texts examining their elucidation, reception and social influences.

Many critical discourse analysts such as Meyer (2001) and Titscher et al. (2000) agree on the point that all discourses are historical and can only be comprehended in their connection to context in historical times. While Jager (2001) adds that in Critical Discourse Analysis, the
examination should identify that the norms, values, rights, laws, and other critical aspects of discourse the researcher exploits are also historical impacts of discourse. Fairclough and Kress (as cited in Wodak 2001) state that CDA stresses on the social phenomena and structures encompassing the construction of texts. Individuals create meanings embedded in social processes and structures in their interaction with text. Titscher et al. (2000) state that discourses are intertextually connected to other discourses. Culture, history and ideology might act as the context of the discursive event.

Fairclough, Wodak and Van Dijk, differ in their approaches in looking at the relationship between language and society. According to Meyer (2001) Fairclough’s model stands at one side while Wodak’s and Van Dijk’s approach is on the other. Titscher et al. (2000) are of the opinion that Fairclough’s model is appropriate for the investigation of the contexts of social and discursive change while Wodak’s model seems appropriate for the examination of implicitly prejudiced utterances and decoding of allusions usually hidden in such expressions by referring to background knowledge.

Meyer (2001) suggests that CDA can be differentiated from other methods in terms of emphasis on certain linguistic categories. While other methods of analysis exploit linguistic categories, CDA focuses on features such as deixis (e.g. demonstratives, adverbs, pronouns) as they are quite significant for the critical approach and their examination would reflect the traces of cohesion and coherence in texts and discourse. He further argues that investigation of discourse relies on linguistic concept, such as actors, mode, time, tense, argumentation. Titscher et al. (2000) also grade these linguistic concepts as the primary working features forming texts and discourses.

Critical discourse analysts such as Fairclough and Wodak (1997), van Dijk (1996, 1993), Fairclough (1993) and Kress (1990) believe that discourse is socially constitutive as well as socially conditioned, and critical discourse analysis closely studies the association between discourse and power, and targets making obscurity of discourse more transparent. Fairclough (1993) relates that Critical Discourse Analysis analytically functions to investigate obscure relationships of causality and determination between i) discursive practices, events and texts ii)
wider social and cultural structures, relations and processes. It further investigates how such practices, proceedings and texts occur and are philosophically shaped by associations of authority and struggle over authority. It also aims at discovering how the obscurity of associations between discourse and society in itself is a factor achieving authority and domination.

Kress (1993) further remarks that one of the core objectives of CDA is to unveil the formation, location and impacts of domination whether to be found in the functions of discourses of race, or gender, or ethnicity or in the actions of authority at micro levels as in associations across the institutional/individual divide, or in the exchange of thoughts between socially positioned persons in day to day associations.

Van Dijk (1993) presents the essence of CDA by remarking that it might be seen as a comprehensive description, explication and evaluation of the ways powerful discourses indirectly impact knowledge in a social context, behaviours and beliefs. It also finds out how a particular discourse construction determines specific mental phenomena or makes the formation of particular social representations possible.

Extracting most of their theoretical implications out of the works of Kress (1990) and Fairclough and Wodak (1997) by putting forward the basic postulations of CDA remark that

i) language is a social event

ii) individuals, institutions and social alliances have particular meanings and value that are articulated in language in systematic ways

iii) texts are the relevant units of language in communication

iv) readers/hearers are not passive receivers in their association to texts

These postulations have so far proved the best defining principles of the field of critical discourse analysis and have yet remained uncontested as many other critical discourse analysts believe in the validity of any, some or all of them. Various experts in the area have presented models for best studies of discourse. One of the most famous models was offered by Fairclough.
Fairclough (1992a) presents a three dimensional model in CDA for analyzing discourse. He views:

i) discourse as text
ii) discourse as discursive practice
iii) discourse as social practice

The very first point refers to the linguistic aspects where the selection and pattern of words in vocabulary, grammar, and cohesion and text structure should be systematically analyzed. Discourse as discursive practice implies discourse as an entity that is produced, spread, disseminated and consumed in society, in the form of tangible particular texts. Vocabulary, grammar, cohesion and text structure are also analyzed here. Discourse as social practice examines the dogmatic influences and power processes in which discourse is one of the aspects. Fairclough (1995) is of the view that the relationship between language and social structure is dialectic. Texts are socioculturally shaped as well as socioculturally constitutive.

Fairclough and Wodak (1997) present eight principles of theory for CDA research. These principles are explicated as under:

### 2.2.1 Eight Principles of Theory for CDA Research

2.2.1.1 Concentration on social problems

Fairclough and Wodak (1997, p. 271) remark that Critical Discourse Analysis neither shows any serious concern towards language itself nor towards its use rather is inclined towards partially linguistic character of social and cultural phenomena and structures. It can be remarked that social issues are what CDA aims at and, of course, these social issues are the outcome of discourse. As a matter of fact language has been exploited as a powerful tool by the elite class of the society. Therefore, CDA creates critical consciousness of the discursive tactics among the folks.
2.2.1.2 Power relations are discursive
The second principle acknowledges the fact that language and power are the core areas of concern for CDA. Fairclough and Wodak (1997, p. 27) are of the opinion that it closely examines the power structures explicited in discourse. Hegemonic features in discourse and their impacts over discourse are the dimensions CDA examines. It also investigates how power is gained through controlling and changing the order of discourse and the principles of discursive practices.

2.2.1.3 Discourse constitutes society and culture
The third principle offered by Fairclough and Wodak (1997) acknowledges the constitutive function of discourse. Fairclough (1992) is of the view that society is divided into three major categories to witness the influence of discourse: representation of the world, social relations between people and social and personal identities of individuals. It is evident that the associations between discourse and culture are dialectical. Discourse constitutes society and culture and is also constituted by them.

2.2.1.4 Discourse does ideological work
Through discourse societies are represented and constituted and hence CDA does the ideological work. CDA investigates how texts are analysed, their interpretations and reception and the impact of social influences. Thus this principle suggests that discourse aims to determine ideological functioning of a particular discursive event and for that very purpose, a critical consciousness is required which is provided by CDA.

2.2.1.5 Discourse as historical
The principle places discourse in historical context suggesting that discourse cannot be viewed in isolation and without context. Discourse as historical refers to the associations discourses establish with one another. Discourses are linked to the ones produced earlier as well as with those produced afterwards. The phenomena of intertextuality have close links with context.

2.2.1.6 The link between text and society is mediated
CDA establishes links between social/cultural structures and phenomena and also attributes of text. This principle emphasizes that these relations are intricate and hence mediated. The reason is that the link between text and society is mediated by the order of discourse.

2.2.1.7 Discourse analysis is interpretive and explanatory
Fairclough and Wodak (1997, p. 227) are of the view that CDA advocates that the process of understanding takes place against the backdrop of sentiments, behaviour and knowledge. In the process, text is deconstructed and rooted in its social circumstances. This occurs when text is linked to the matter of ideologies and power. CDA gets thoroughly dependent on scientific procedures to spot this distinct phenomenon, to ‘denaturalize’ it. The analysis and elucidation are something vibrant and open to new context and information.

2.2.1.8 Discourse is a form of social action
Fairclough and Wodak (1997, p. 279) relate that CDA is a scientific theory with social commitments. Its key objective is to expose opaqueness and power associations. It considers discourse as a social action, which is created through the phenomenon of social cognition.

This particular research study takes insights from the above mentioned principles of CDA which encompass almost all the features pertaining to a critical discourse perspective. The principles of CDA provide a strong pedestal for the new researchers conducting their research employing critical discourse perspective as they provide insights into various dimensions of discourse.

Critical Discourse Analysis exists at two levels: micro events (verbal events) and macrostructures (society). In CDA macrostructures are the products as well as conditions for the micro events. Fairclough (1995a) is of the opinion that CDA suggests intertextual analysis as a crucial mediator between the micro and the macro: the text and its context.

Intertextual references form an essential part of this research study. In all the selected texts the increased frequency of directly and indirectly quoted intertextual references can be noticed.
Fairclough (1995a, p. 57) proposes a composition that facilitates in signifying the impact of discourse in society and vice versa. The framework, as stated above, comprises three features: text, text production/consumption and sociocultural practice. As regards ‘text’, it may be written or oral. ‘Discourse practice’ may refer to the processes of text production and text consumption and ‘sociocultural practice’ may point towards the social and cultural proceedings, which the communicative event is a part.

Van Dijk (2001) is of the view that critical research on discourse requires to meet a few conditions to convincingly realize its aims. As is mostly the case for more insignificant research traditions, CDA research has to be more effective than other research to get established. Further, it centers mainly around social and political issues, rather than on current models and fashions. A multidisciplinary and empirically adequate critical investigation of social problems can be observed. He further remarks that the research in critical discourse studies explicates discourse structures in terms of properties of social interaction and social structure and in particular it emphasizes on the ways discourse structures act out, substantiate, legitimate, reproduce, or challenge relations of power and domination in society. However, in this research study, ideological pursuits acquire the top most priority while investigation of hegemonic and power relations can be a matter of concern in a sense that Sufi discourse contains power relations through which it convincingly reaches the common folk.

Van Dijk (1995) while establishing the aims of critical discourse studies remarks that it is a problem-oriented or an issue-oriented research and is no more paradigm-oriented. As it is capable of investigating relevant social problems, any theoretical or methodological approach may suit it. He further asserts that critical discourse studies may not refer to a school, a field or sub-discipline of discourse analysis rather it should be viewed as an exclusive critical approach. Further, critical discourse studies are generally multi-disciplinary or interdisciplinary and an exclusive focus on discourse and society may well be investigated. CDA may fall within a broad spectrum of critical studies in the humanities and the social sciences. He further states that CDA may concentrate on all levels and dimensions of discourse including grammar, style and rhetoric. One of the major aims of CDA is to unveil what is implicit or hidden in ideologies. So CDA has
been contended as a separate, fully developed discipline which has its own strengths in comparison to other disciplines such as content analysis and Systemic Functional Grammar, etc.

Fairclough’s three-dimensional model employed for this study comprises the essence of all the levels and dimensions of CDA which make it more encompassing and preferred method of investigation.

It is also pertinent to explain how CDA is different from Content Analysis. Some of the major distinctions are as under:

2.2.2 Content analysis vs CDA

It is important here to comprehend the fine line between CDA and content analysis. Titscher et al. (2000, p. 227) are of the view that the major difference between CDA and content analysis lies on the nature of the object analyzed. CDA may well be declared as a linguistic method as it investigates coherence (meaning of the text) and cohesion (components of the textual surface, including the textual-syntactic connectedness. Titscher et al. (2000) further remark that the investigation of the link between these two dimensions is confined to linguistic method, while non-linguistic methods such as content analysis emphasize on coherence. They further opine that content analysis inquires about the content using rather precise and narrow research questions for the purpose of hypothesis formulation. Titscher et al. (2000) state that in CDA texts are a reflection of discourse, and are explicated through social structures and socio-historic contexts, which are known as macro-structures. CDA forms a link between the micro-elements of texts to the discourse and to macro-structures whereas content analysis is confined in its focus. Further, elaborating the same theme, Graber and Smith (2005) remark that content analysis is the most exploited method for the enquiry of political messages. Graber and Smith (2005, p. 491) are of the view that to trace clues for underlying political, social, and economic conditions, such as international conflicts, confidence in government, or panic about economic decline, researchers are more concerned with examining messages. Content analysis is more concerned with denotional dictionary meanings or connotations from extended meaning in the literal messages. Graber and Smith (2005) while critically evaluating the content analysis, state that a major
drawback of this analysis is its coding of only small portions of news stories, skipping many significant themes and nuances and limiting coding to meanings.

In the present study, CDA becomes the most appropriate method as it is more concerned not only with the textual and discursive dimensions but also with the social dimensions. It is pertinent here that all the research pursuits of this research study cannot be dealt with content analysis as it is confined only to a few dimensions stated above while CDA is an encompassing methodology capable of covering many research inquiries worth researching. Therefore, it is established that CDA becomes a preferred method of enquiry for investigation of discursive construction of local culture in Schimmel’s analysis of Sufi poetry.

Phillips and Hardy (2002, p. 20) are of the view that critical discourse analysis overtly encompasses the dynamics of power, knowledge and ideology that surround discursive processes. However, this study is more concerned with the ideological dimensions rather than knowledge and power dynamics.

Titscher et al. (2000, p. 146) state that critical discourse studies are not concerned in language per se, but in the linguistic character of social and cultural processes and structures. Van Leeuwen (1993, p. 193) is of the view that it is rather concerned with discourse as the instrument of power and control and also as the tool of the social construction of reality. De Cillia et al. (1999, p. 157) opine that the basic statement of CDA is that there is a dialectical relationship between discursive events and the context (situations, social structures, institutions, and so on) in which they are embedded. According to Wodak (2001, p. 66) discourses as linguistic social practices can be viewed as constructing non-discursive and discursive social practices and, similarly, as being constructed by them. De Cillia et al. (1999, p. 157) further state that through discourse social actors construct knowledge, situations, social roles as well as identities and interpersonal relations between social actors. Jager (2001) giving another dimension of CDA remarks that CDA claims that discourses are expressions of social practice while Wodak (2001) considers discourses as ideological.
Wodak (2001, p.9), while presenting a significant dimension of CDA, states that one of the aims of CDA is to ‘demystify’ discourses by deciphering ideologies. The major objective behind investigation of Schimmel’s analysis of Sufi poetry could not only be to comprehend, but also to depict how different ideologies have been constructed in the analysis of local culture.

Another issue worth enquiry can be the influence of the researcher on his research proceedings. Denzin and Lincoln (2000) opine that observer is the part of what is observed in all subjectivist research. Jager (2001, p. 34) is of the view that the researchers recognize their contribution in the constitution of social reality through the research process itself. Watson (1994) states that it is admitted in that research tradition that research is not value-free as the researchers unavoidably influence their findings and should for that reason make sure that the readers are aware of the authorial contribution. Meyer (2001, p. 17) puts forward a significant stance that value judgments in critical discourse studies are acceptable in the choice of object and questions of enquiry, but are prohibited in the context of justification. However, Titscher et al. (2000) remark that the process through which the researcher employing CDA arrives at the conclusions must be made comprehensible and identifiable.

Significant bondage between CDA and Systemic Functional Linguistics (SFL) is also necessary to be considered. CDA in pursuit of its textual dimensions is indebted to SFL to a great deal.

2.2.3 CDA and Systemic Functional Linguistics (SFL)

Wodak (2002, p. 8) states that comprehension of the basic tenets of Halliday's grammar and his perspective to linguistic analysis is necessary for a proper understanding of CDA. Gregory (2001) is of the viewpoint that SFL provides a solid methodology that can help defend CDA from ideological bias. Martin (2000) further relates that one of the strong points of SFL for CDA is to ground concerns with power and ideology in thorough analysis of texts in real contexts of language use, thus, making it likely for the analyst to be overt, transparent, and specific.
Young and Harrison (2004) while sharing the commonalities between researchers exploring Systemic Functional Linguistics (SFL) and Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA), remark that three common aspects can be highlighted between the two. First, they present language as a social construct, reviewing the contribution of language in society and at the ways in which society has constituted language. The second point corresponds to dialectical aspect of language in which specific discursive events affect the contexts in which they take place and the contexts are, also influenced by these discursive events. The third common feature between the two is that both assert the cultural and historical features of meaning. Similarly, Young and Harrison (2004) also mention the contrastive aspects between SFL and CDA. They are of the opinion that SFL is a functionally based theory which investigates the functions that language has established to serve in society. According to this very perspective, it involves the analysis of real language events to comprehend the objectives language serves in diverse contexts, and to be aware of the way language itself operates. They further remark that SFL investigates how meanings are established in different contexts. It also deals with discourse analysis of diverse discursive events. On the contrary, CDA according to Van Dijk (2001, p. 96) may be viewed as an analysis with an attitude. To him, it is an analysis of different public discursive events that discover the link between language and power and the ways in which language is being employed to produce, maintain, and reproduce positions of power through discursive means. Kress (1995) asserts that the aim of CDA is to shift the linguistic field into an area of social and political significance and, therefore, provides a social analysis by putting forward structures of inequality. He adds that the objective of CDA is to employ analysis not only to expose structures of domination, but also to effect change in the way power is exercised, maintained, and reproduced in social organizations and relationships.

Wodak (2002, p.12) is of the opinion that CDA is different from SFL because it is a perspective on the analysis of social problems exhibited discursively, that is, it is neither a methodology nor a theory of language. She further relates that a ‘mixed bag’ of linguistic theories has been employed in CDA without any specific grammatical theory. To reinforce this viewpoint, Meyer (2001, p. 18) asserts that there is no guiding theoretical perspective that is consistently employed within CDA, nor do the leading figures of CDA advance with a constant pace from the theory to the area of discourse and then back to theory.
Despite all these similarities and contrastive elements, significance of SFL within CDA cannot be underestimated. In Fairclough’s three-dimensional model employed within this study, many features of systemic functional linguistics have been incorporated. Therefore, Halliday’s perspective also leaves deep imprints on this particular study.

CDA, as stated above, considerably takes into account power, knowledge and ideology. The primary focus of this study, however, is ideology. In the subsequent section, conceptualization of ideology by critical discourse analysts has been reviewed in detail.

2.2.4 Ideology and CDA

Ideology takes a prominent position in critical discourse studies. Thompson (1990, p. 47) is of the opinion that the interest of CDA in ideology highlights the ways in which meaning is constructed and conveyed in a social context. According to Jager (2001), dominant discourses seem to provide a lucid and prudent set of assumed truths beyond doubt. He further remarks that CDA examines those discourses, exposes their disagreement and the means used to make those truths accepted.

Van Dijk (2006) defines ideology within a multidisciplinary perspective combining social, cognitive and discursive component. He views ideology as systems of ideas, in sociocognitive perspective and states that ideology is shared representations of social groups, and in particular, as the axiomatic principles of such representations. He further remarks that ideologies systematize its identity, actions, aims, norms and values, and resources as well as its link with other social groups maintaining a social group’s self-image. Van Dijk (2006) further adds that ideologies are communicated and generally reproduced in the social practices of their members, and specifically acquired, confirmed, changed and perpetuated through discourse. Structures and functions of underlying ideologies can be investigated through applying methods of discourse analysis.
Giving more insights into the cognitive and social functions of ideologies, Van Dijk (2006) states that ideologies systematize and ground the social representations shared by the members of ideological groups. He remarks that they are the ultimate basis of the discourses and other social practices of the members of social groups as group members. Moreover, they let members to systematize and organize their collective actions and interactions considering the objectives and concerns of the group collectively. Van Dijk (2006) is of the view that the role of ideologies is to be the part of the sociocognitive interface between social structures (conditions, etc.) of groups on the one hand, and their discourses and other social practices on the other. Putting forward the most significant point, he remarks that some ideologies may therefore work to legitimate domination, but also to clearly express conflict in relationships of power. Another function of ideologies, he further asserts, may be to serve as the basis of the guidelines of professional behaviour.

Eagleton (1991), Larrain (1979), Thompson (1984), and Van Dijk (1998) have put forward their insights on the core issue of ideology in CDA. According to them, ideological effects may be seen as causal impacts of texts which have been the center of great focus as per critical discourse perspective. They are also of the opinion that these effects of texts might be employed in inculcating and sustaining or changing ideologies. They assert that ideologies are the representation of aspects of the world which play a pivotal role in establishing, maintaining and changing social relations of power, domination and exploitation. Fairclough (2003) asserts that ideologies may also have durability and stability which transcend individual texts or bodies of texts in terms of various distinctions; they can be linked with discourses as representations, with genres as enactments and with styles as inculcations.

Thompson (1990) explicates the concepts of ideology and culture and the associations between these notions and specific features of mass communication. He is of the view that the concept of ideology first emerged in late eighteenth-century France and has therefore been in use for about two centuries. Ideology has been given various functions and meanings at different periods. According to him, ideology points to social forms and processes within which, and by means of which, symbolic structures travel in the social world. In critical discourse studies, it is viewed as a significant source of setting up and maintaining unequal power relations. Critical
discourse analysis is particularly concerned in the ways in which language intervenes ideology in diverse social institutions. Adding Eagleton (1994) comes up with a significant stance that the investigation of ideology has to keep into consideration diverse theories and theorists that have investigated the link between thought and social reality. He further relates that all the theories assume that there are certain historical reasons why people come to feel, reason, desire and imagine as they do.

In this study, ideologies gain supreme significance as many of the ideological traces are embedded in Schimmel’s interpretive Sufi discourse and further while investigating the local cultural features, analysis of various ideologies gives more insights into their functioning. The analysis chapter will probe into this very significant aspect of critical discourse studies.

Apart from its link with ideology, discourse has also been linked with and studied under the conceptual interventions of a couple of other areas by critical discourse analysts. History, intertextuality, context and society are some of these key areas. In the four of subsequent sections consecutively, the researcher reviews opinions of the critics on the relationship of CDA with these areas.

2.2.5 Discourses are Historical: An approach in CDA

Meyer (2001, p. 15) and Titscher et al. (2000, p. 146) state that all discourses are historical and can therefore only be comprehended in association with their context. Further, Jager (2001, p. 34) remarks that the analysis should trace that the values, norms, laws, rights, and other critical aspects of discourse that the researcher employs are also historical outcome of discourse in CDA tradition. Giving more comprehensive view of CDA, Fairclough and Kress (1993; in Wodak, 2001) add that while other paradigms in discourse analysis only highlight texts as objects of enquiry, CDA also concentrates on the social processes and structures surrounding the production of texts. Individuals create meanings in their interaction with texts within those processes and structures. According to Titscher et al. (2000, p. 146), discourses maintain an intertextual link to other discourses while culture, history and ideology characterize the context of the discursive event.
The texts the researcher has selected for analysis comprise cultural, historical, ideological and intertextual underpinnings which establish the notion that discourses are historical and are strongly connected with their context.

2.2.6 Intertextuality in CDA

Kristeva is known to have coined the term intertextuality while keeping into consideration Bakhtin’s work. Kristeva (1986) and Bakhtin (1986) are of the standpoint that every text (or utterance) is dialogical, in a way that it acquires its meaning keeping into perspective other texts. Thibault (1991) explicates the perspective of intertextuality by stating that all texts, spoken and written, are constructed and contain the meanings which text-users assign to them in and through their association with other texts in some social structure. Adding he remarks that the concept of intertextuality offers a standpoint of both reading and writing texts as a method of viewing interactions of a text with preceding texts, writers, readers, and conventions. Kristeva (1980, p.69) relates to texts keeping into consideration two axes: a horizontal axis which links the author and reader of a text, and a vertical axis, which joins the text to other texts. Thibault (1991) remarks that Kristeva, and Bakhtin view all texts as being constructed out of, and perceived in relation to, other texts in the same social structure.

Fairclough (1992a, b,1995b), while giving more insight on intertextuality relates that it indicates how texts can transform prior texts and reorganize existing principles (genres, discourses) to produce new ones. Adding, he is of the view that CDA is interested in how texts are produced in relation to preceding texts and how texts help constitute the existing principles in producing new texts. Fairclough (1995b) further asserts that intertextual analysis is an interpretative phenomenon, which heavily relies on the researcher’s personal opinion and understanding.

Lemke (1995a, p. 86) while putting forward his stance on intertextuality asserts that by investigating intertextuality, the relationship between a particular text and a genre could be exposed, or, the link between a text and its cultural context could be comprehended to some
extent. He further relates that it is through intertextuality that the text instantiates the context of culture. To him, intertextual investigation of meaning, therefore, is critical in exploring the meaning of a text. It acquires significance because all texts attain their meaning not only intratextually but also intertextually. Intertextual relations, he remarks, rise above the context of situation and rely mainly on the context of culture.

Intertextual analysis, thus, facilitates us in viewing a text with the perspective of what its meanings are and how they relate to other meanings established in the society as structuring a specific text. Within this study, the phenomenon of intertextuality acquires supreme prominence as investigation of how Schimmel incorporates other texts directly or indirectly is worth enquiry. It also becomes pertinent despite the increased frequency of direct intertextual references, how Schimmel’s voice still remains distinct.

2.2.7 Context in CDA

Hanks (1996, p. 140) gives a detailed definition of context. He relates that context is everything and at the same time it is nothing. Adding he remarks that it flees from those who try to flee from it, like a shadow. It evades the levels and categories of theory, and follows those who try to escape from it. It craftily establishes itself as the unseen ground upon which even the most overt statements thoroughly rely. He further relates that if one is influenced by the phenomenological idea of incompleteness, then context is limitless. The more one tries to identify it, the more blank spaces one projects, all need to be filled. He says that context is nothing less than the human world in which language use occurs and in connection to which language structure is structured.

Context acquires a special status in critical discourse studies. Van Dijk (2009) while elaborating the term ‘context’ relates that it is widely employed in academic and other genres of discourse, mainly in the abstract sense of environment or situation and related ideas. He further relates that in the language sciences, context is also employed as verbal context of some expression (word, sentence, etc.), that is, as co-text. In this study, context evolves greater
significance as it would really lend a helping hand in comprehending and further investigating the traces of local culture in the analysis of Sufi poetry in Schimmel’s works.

Discourse can never be isolated from its broader context. According to Phillips and Hardy (2002), the broader discourse, the location of individual texts in larger bodies of texts are significant to mention while analyzing a text under discourse analysis. Adding Meyer (2000, p. 15) states that CDA is even more interested in context and this very fact can be manifested by the relevance of social, psychological, political and ideological elements of the context in which the texts are embedded and by the ensuing calls for interdisciplinarity and intertextuality. Further elaborating the theme, Titscher et al (2000, p. 146) add that interdisciplinarity and intertextuality are particular features of CDA. Intertextuality refers to the standpoint that every text is part of a series of texts to which it reacts and refers, and which it modifies.

Van Dijk (2009) puts forward the theory of context which clearly explicates various functions of contexts. It is remarkable here that the theory has been presented keeping subjective mental models into consideration. This theory has many theoretical and analytical functions. According to van Dijk (2009) contexts explain the following features of discourse and language use. His conceptualization of the functions of contexts is postulated below:

1. Contexts may generally be seen as the sociocognitive interface between society and social circumstances on the one hand and discourse on the other, between the personal-subjective and the social-collective aspects of language use and communication.

2. Contexts also act as mediator between personal experiences and social knowledge and also between the discourses.

3. Contexts explicate how language users are capable of flexibly adjusting their text or discourse to the communicative and social situation.

4. Contexts describe why and how discourses at all levels may differ from situation to situation.
5. The notions of genre, style and register acquire their theoretical footings from contexts.

6. Contexts put together cognitive, social and cultural analysis of the social situations and communicative events.

This shows the significant placement of the context in discourse studies by critical discourse analysts. The second dimension of three-dimensional model pertains to the discursive dimension where context plays a pivotal role. Intertextuality specifies the context of any discourse which is a significant aspect of this research study.

2.2.8 Language and society in CDA

Fairclough and Wodak (1997) are of the view that a dialectical relation can be witnessed between a particular discourse and the social structure, institutions and contexts. Titscher et al. (2000) and Fairclough and Wodak (1997) add that CDA views language as a form of social practice while Meyer (2001) holds the assumption of mediation regarding the relationship between language and society. On the basis of this very assumption, it can be remarked that language determines society but is also determined by social reality. Titscher et al. (2000, p. 146) state that CDA analyses view language through texts to examine their interpretation, reception and social effects.

Fairclough (2003, p.8) remarks that texts may be seen as features of social events which have causal impacts. Our knowledge, beliefs, attitudes, values are directly affected by texts and texts may bring about changes in them. Adding, he remarks that texts may initiate wars, bring about changes in education, industrial relations and so forth.

Functions of discourse have been widely discussed by critical discourse analysts. The basic ones that are generally considered as agreed upon functions are action-oriented, representative and identifying nature of discourse. In the subsequent section, the researcher reviews these aspects as developed in the field of CDA.
Within this research study, the third dimension pertains to the social dimension. How knowledge, beliefs, attitudes, values of the people are affected by the Sufi discourse and, on the contrary, how Sufi discourse is affected by all these features, becomes a pertinent aspect of enquiry. It is also important here that the researcher is concerned with the analytical discourse of Schimmel and does not directly deal with the Sufi poetic discourse.

2.2.9 The Case of Action, Representation and Identification in CDA

Critical Discourse Analysis heavily relies on Systemic Functional Linguistics for text analysis put forward by Michael Halliday. Fairclough (2003) is of the view that SFL can be contrasted with Chomskyan tradition as the former is more interested in the association between language and other features of social life and it is always inclined towards the social character of texts while analyzing a text. Fairclough’s text analysis for CDA takes its insights from the works of Halliday (1978, 1994). Fowler et al. (1979) are of the view that SFL may be seen as a valuable resource and a major contributor for CDA. The same theme of contribution of SFL for CDA can be traced in the works of Hodge and Kress (1988, 1993); Kress (1985), Kress and Van Leeuwen (2001); Lemke (1995), and Thibault (1991).

Halliday (1978, 1994) asserts that stance of SFL is that texts have three functions namely: ideational, interpersonal and textual. It clearly indicates that texts represent aspects of the world including physical, social and mental world; they also enact social links between participants in social events and the attitudes, desires and attitudes of participants; at the same time they also link parts of texts together coherently and cohesively and link the text with the situational contexts.

Fairclough (2003) also takes the similar stance and adds that three elements namely genres, discourses and styles are the three ways in which discourse forms as a part of social practice. These three ways are: ways of acting, ways of representing and ways of being. He also places the same theme in a different way: the link of the text to the event, to the wider physical and social world and to the participants involved in the event. He further puts forward three types
of meanings namely: action, representation and identification. Fairclough (2003) relates representation to Halliday’s ideational function; action to interpersonal function and as regards identification he does not associate a separate function for identification rather places identification within interpersonal function.

Van Leeuwen (1993, 1995, 1996) further extending the representational point of view remarks that a text can be viewed as a representational perspective by investigating which features of events are included in the representation of those events and which ones have been skipped; also which included features are given prominence. The next major issue is that of concrete and abstract representation of events. Fairclough (2003, p. 138) states that social events can be represented at different levels of abstraction and generalization. Adding he puts forward three levels of concreteness/abstraction:

1. Most Concrete: representation of specific social events
2. More Abstract/generalized: abstraction over series and sets of social events
3. Most Abstract: representation at the level of social practices or social structures

While summing up the representational aspect, Fairclough (2003, p. 139) presents a few scales upon which representation of an event may well be investigated:

**Presence:** The researchers have to examine which elements of events or events in a chain of events are present/absent. They are also to see which aspect is given more prominence and which one has been backgrounded.

**Abstraction:** While investigating a text, the analyst has to trace the degree of abstraction/generalization from concrete events.

**Arrangements:** The order of all the events also becomes significant. Therefore, the analyst has also to be mindful of the arrangement of events.
Additions: Additions in the representation of events should also be carefully monitored. These additions might also include explications, legitimations (reasons, causes, purposes) and evaluative judgments.

Chapter 4 closely examines the phenomenon of action, representation and identification. Genres, discourses and styles explicated within the next chapter elaborate the theme given above to a considerable extent. The most important aspect of representation of social events has been elaborated through presence, abstraction, arrangements and additions. The issue of legitimation has also been elaborated in Chapter 4, through causal relations, additive relations and the relations of elaboration within the textual analysis.

Fairclough’s three-dimensional model has been discussed in detail above. His model holds key significance in the present study. He also introduced a relational approach in CDA as it is employed for text analysis. I have reviewed his ideas on this very aspect below.

2.2.10 Text Analysis: A Relational Approach in CDA

Fairclough (2003) employs a relational approach for the investigation of texts. He categorizes various levels of analysis and also designates a link between these levels. These levels include: Social Structures; Social Practices; Social Events (Actions and their social relations; Identifications of persons; Representations of the world); Discourses (genres, discourses, styles); Semantics; and Grammar and vocabulary.

Fairclough places these levels in external and internal relations. He further states that social practices and social structures may fall within external relations. Adding, he remarks that intertextuality is also an external dimension which takes into account the relation between a text and other external texts. Semantic and grammatical relations and vocabulary, to him, can be placed in internal relations.
Like all academic disciplines in social sciences, CDA also received criticism. The unfavorable critics question the validity of CDA’s methods and their applicability. The following section reviews ideas put forward by the critics of this discipline.

2.2.11 Criticisms on CDA and the Defensive Stance

Criticism of CDA arises from research scholars investigating conversation analysis and various other areas of text analysis. Schegloff is the one who initiated this discussion and discussed the issue in detail in his paper titled ‘Whose text? Whose context?’ (Schegloff, 1997). The researcher may also find a reaction to this paper by Wetherell (1998).

Scheglof (1997) is of the opinion that CDA is often short on comprehensive, systematic analysis of text or talk, for example as it is applied on conversation analysis. Wetherell (1998) admits that researchers in the area of conversational analysis are good in their investigation on talk in interaction, but this is also a fact that their work does not satisfy social analysis. Adding she relates that one may not find any conflict between Conversation Analysis and Critical Discourse Analysis though they are mismatched research areas to some extent. She further asserts that some good CDA studies employ conversations as data and examine them from a Conversational Analysis viewpoint. At the same time, works pertaining to Conversation Analysis go through societal, political and critical matters. CDA may be concerned more about social issues while CA may be more inclined to structure problems in the organization of conversation. She relates that these aspects could be viewed as complementary rather than contradictory.

Widdowson (1995, 1998) while pointing out a major objection against CDA asserts that the term ‘discourse’ as it is employed in CDA is vague. Adding he (1995) relates that everybody speaks of discourse but no one has the clear comprehension of the term. Another objection he raises is that no demarcation has been made in CDA between text and discourse. He is of the opinion that CDA may be seen as ideological interpretation but it should not be viewed as an analysis. Another charge against CDA is that of biasness. He says that it may be viewed as a biased interpretation on two levels: firstly it is prejudiced in terms of some ideological commitment, and also it selects for investigation such texts which support the ideal
interpretation. He relates that analysis should refer to the investigation of several interpretations but in CDA analysis it becomes impossible due to prior judgments made in CDA.

Toolan (1997, 2002) and Stubbs (1997) also strongly criticize CDA. They emphasize on strengthening of the theorization of CDA. Toolan (1997) asserts that some theoretical distinction in CDA, i.e., the difference between description and interpretative explication needs to be elaborated further. Secondly, CDA requires being more critical and more challenging of the text linguistics it employs. Third, detailed and powerful evidence should be collected for the arguments made during the analysis while simple presentation of the critical findings should be made.

According to Widdowson (1995; as cited in Meyer, 2001), CDA constructs a partial analysis and not a fair academic analysis. According to him, critical discourse analysis is based on ideological commitment, which unavoidably makes critical discourse analysts select texts that will support their preferred explications. Widdowson (1995) remarks that CDA is incapable of examining several interpretations which other research does or should do, especially because of ideological bias. However, it is unclear what type of ideological bias he is referring to.

Critical responses to critical discourse studies are mainly regarding interpretation and context. Widdowson (1995, 1996, 1998) has been the major critic of critical discourse studies. He criticizes CDA for giving vague impression in terms of significant distinctions between concepts, disciplines and methodologies. He seems more concerned about the blurred concepts about discourse, text, structure, practice and mode and further points towards the proof of their levels and functioning. The next major objection which he raises is that despite its theoretical claims, CDA interprets discourse under the guise of critical analysis and does not examine how actually a text can be read in many ways and at the same time does not investigate under which specific social circumstances its production and consumption has been made. Stubbs (1997) remarks that many questions can be raised against the interpretation part in CDA regarding representation, selectivity, partiality and prejudice. Widdowson while criticizing puts forward a very significant objection that texts are found to have certain ideological meaning which is forced upon the reader. Scheglof (1997) while raising a major objection to CDA is of the view
that analysts’ reflection can be seen in the analysis in terms of their own political biases and prejudices. He further states that patterns of power relations in CDA are sketchy and just a little social and political common sense has been employed and then projected into discourse.

However, Fairclough (1996) comes up with a solid stance by stating that such criticism does not consider that, within the CDA perspective, researchers are always open about their positions, contrary to other methods like content analysis. He further draws attention to the open-endedness of results required in CDA. He points out that CDA, unlike most other approaches, is always explicit about its own position and commitment. Titscher et al. (2000) is of the view that the underlying assumptions held by researchers in content analysis are often more implied, or simply not determined in advance. Wodak (2001, p. 65) remarks, contrary to other methods, in critical discourse studies, the researchers must always make transparent choices in the research process.

Keeping the entire criticism on CDA into perspective, the significance of pursuing research in CDA cannot be underestimated. It still is an effective investigation for the researches inclined to exposing hidden values, beliefs and prejudices merged within the texts. It still is the best study revealing the power structures, relations of identity and hegemonic structures. In the light of the review of a bulk of literature on CDA, it can be clearly asserted that CDA is the most useful analytical approach and the most comprehensive approach for investigating relationships between language use and social context.

As CDA is in a process of continuous evolution, the analysis made through CDA cannot be an exhaustive one. Therefore this research study may get affected by all these drawbacks of the methodology. Major criticism on validity of CDA’s methodology, its applicability and selection of sample raise questions on the study. But despite all this criticism, CDA still is a preferred method of critical enquiry.
Taking conceptual and theoretical discussion given above to a more grounded and practical aspect of the study, I will now review some of the tool-kits offered by different practitioners in the field of CDA. The purpose of reviewing these kits is to rationalize the researcher’s selection of Fairclough’s three-dimensional model as the most suitable model employed for this particular research study.

2.2.12 Tool-Kits for CDA: A Comparative Approach of Different CDA Practitioners

Though the researcher’s concern is employment of Fairclough’s three-dimensional model which is quite relevant to this study, it is also imperative for him to be mindful of other approaches falling within the area so that he may be able to develop a sound sense of the theoretical footings and methodological approaches. Most of the practitioners in CDA seem to be reliant on Tool-kits for CDA in their analyses which seem appropriate in discourse analysis. Tool-kits introduced by some of the major practitioners in CDA are presented here on the pages to follow.

Van Dijk’s (2001, p. 99) tools to investigate a text include: stress and intonation, word order, lexical style, coherence, local semantic moves such as disclaimers, topic choice, speech acts, schematic organization, rhetorical figures, syntactic structures, propositional structures, turn takings, repairs, and hesitation. From the inclusion of spoken discourse features, it seems that this tool-kit was prepared for conversational or, generally, spoken discourses. As the present study concerns written texts, the tool-kit in question sounds irrelevant. Fairclough (1989, p. 106) presents ‘mini reference manual’, in the form of questions and sub-questions which can also be of value for the researcher while analysing a text. They are: What experiential values do words have? What relational value do words have? What expressive value do words have? What metaphors are used? What experiential value do grammatical features have? What relational value do grammatical features have? What expressive values do grammatical features have? How are simple sentences linked together? What interactional conventions are used? What larger scale structures does the text have? A few more questions might also be formed keeping in view the above mentioned dimensions by Fairclough: What type of process and participant predominate? Is agency unclear? Are processes what they seem? Are nominalizations used? Are sentences active or passive? Are sentences positive or negative?
Huckin (2005) formulates a list of ‘Some useful tools and concepts for CDA’. His approach of looking at critical discourse analysis can also be compared to the others on so many facets presented by him. He categorizes them at four levels i.e., word/phrase level, sentence/utterance level, text level, and general level.

Word/phrase level has further classifications including names and labels, connotations and codewords, metaphor, lexical presupposition, modality, register including synthetic personalization, and politeness. Sentence/utterance level is studied through deletion/omission, through nominalization, through agentless passive, transitivity/agent-patient relations, topicalization/foregrounding, presupposition, insinuation and inferencing, heteroglossia. Text level includes genre conventions, discursive differences, coherence, framing, foregrounding/backgrounding, textual silences, presupposition, extended metaphor, and auxiliary embellishments. General level includes central vs. peripheral processing, use of heuristics, ideology, reading position, naturalization or common sense, reproduction-resistance-hegemony, cultural models and myths (master narratives), intertextuality, context (contrast effects), communicator ethos, vividness, repetition, face work, type of argument, interests, and agenda-setting.

Jager (2001, p. 55-56) puts forward a set of categories to which he refers as a ‘little toolbox’ for conducting analysis. It can also be observed that many of the features employed by various CDA practitioners are almost the same. His tool-kit comprises word/phrase level, sentence/utterance level and general level. Word/phrase level includes classification, including names, labels, connotation and code words, metaphor, lexical presupposition, modality, register including synthetic personalization, politeness, sentence/utterance level, deletion and omission, through nominalization, through agentless passive, transitivity/agent-patient relations, topicalization/foregrounding, presupposition, insinuation and inferencing, and heteroglossia. Sentence/utterance level includes genre conventions, discursive differences, coherence, framing, foregrounding/backgrounding, textual silences, presupposition, extended metaphor, and auxiliary embellishments. General level includes central vs. peripheral processing, use of heuristics, ideology, reading position, naturalization and common sense, reproduction-resistance-hegemony,
cultural models and myths (master narratives), intertextuality, context (contrast effects), communicator ethos, vividness, repetition, face work, type of argument, interests, and agenda-setting.

The question of the validity of the self-analysed data also becomes significant. To address the salient queries within this perspective, the researcher has also presented the review of literature made in this regard.

### 2.2.13 Validity of the Self-analyzed Data

It is indeed a big question to be given the due priority how to validate the analysis made in the research study. Potter and Wetherell (1987) are of the view that qualitative research is often criticized when compared with quantitative research to be less stringent and hence less valid. Adding they assert that it is not necessarily true as it cannot be commented with certainty that the criteria employed to validate qualitative research can always investigate whether the research is valid. But it is also pertinent to validation techniques within the natural sciences. Potter and Wetherell (1987, p.170) further remark that through focusing on coherence, validity of a discourse analysis can be determined. Analytical claims are believed to structure a coherent discourse; the features of the analysis that are not compatible with the discourse analytical description reduce the possibility of readers acknowledging the analysis. Pointing another way of determining validity Potter and Wetherell (1987, p. 171–172) assert that it was possible through evaluation of the fruitfulness of the analysis. The frequent employment of this technique has been witnessed across scientific paradigms. Explanatory potential of the analytical framework is emphasized while evaluating the fruitfulness of the analysis by validating its capacity to offer new explanations.

Further, Gee (2005, p. 110-113) describes components of an ideal discourse analysis. After the analysis is made, any discourse analysis can be evaluated on these components of an ideal discourse. These components have been presented in the form of questions. However, it is pertinent to mention that the researcher has put forward here only the relevant and significant
ones. It should also be very clear that these questions depict the ideal settings which are often extinct. The long list of questions is presented as under:

a) What are situated meanings of some of the words and phrases that seem important in the situation?
b) What situated meanings and values seem to be associated to places, times, bodies, people, objects, artifacts and institutions relevant in this situation?
c) What situated meanings and values are linked to other oral and written texts quoted or alluded to in the situation (intertextuality)?
d) What discourse models seem to be at play in joining these situated meanings to each other?
e) What institutions and/or discourses are being reproduced in this situation and how are they being stabilized or transformed in the act?
f) What is the larger or main activity (or set of activities) in process in the situation?
g) What identities (roles and positions), with their associated personal, social and cultural knowledge and beliefs (cognition), feelings (affect), and values seem to be relevant to, taken for granted in, or under construction in the situation?
h) How are these identities stabilized and transformed in the situation?
i) In terms of identities, activities and relationships, what discourses are relevant (and irrelevant) in the situation? How are they made relevant (and irrelevant), and in what ways?
j) What sorts of social relationships seem to be relevant to, taken for granted in, or under construction in the situation?
k) How are these social relationships stabilized and transformed in the situation?
l) How are other oral and written texts quoted or alluded to so as to set up certain relationships to other texts, people, or discourses?
m) In terms of identities, activities and relationships, what discourses are relevant (and irrelevant) in the situation? How are they made relevant (and irrelevant), and in what ways?
n) What social goods (e.g., status, power, aspects of gender, or more narrowly defined social networks and identities) are relevant (and irrelevant) in this situation? How are they made relevant (and irrelevant), and in what ways?

o) How are these social goods connected to the discourse models and discourses operative in the situation?

p) How is intertextuality used to create connections among the current situation and other ones or among different discourses?

q) What system of knowledge and ways of knowing are relevant (or irrelevant) in the situation? How are they made relevant (and irrelevant), and in what ways?

r) What social languages are relevant (and irrelevant) in this situation? How are they made relevant (and irrelevant), and in what ways?

Gee (2005, p. 113-115) asserts that validity for the discourse analysis relies on the four major elements. Any analysis can be investigated keeping into consideration these four elements which are described as under:

2.2.12.1 Convergence
Gee (2005, p. 113-115) is of the view that a discourse analysis may well be considered an ideal discourse if it responds well/offers compatible answers to all or many of the questions (components for an ideal discourse) mentioned above and they converge in the way to support the analysis, or put the matter the other way round.

2.2.12.2 Agreement
Answers to all the questions mentioned above in ‘components of an ideal discourse’ are more credible the more other discourse analysts or other sorts of researchers tend to support the conclusions.

2.2.12.2 Coverage
The more valid the analysis, the more it is applicable to related sorts of data. This includes being able to make sense of what has come before and after the situation being analyzed and being able to determine the sorts of things that might happen in related sorts of situations.
2.2.3 Linguistic details

The more valid the analysis, the more it is tightly tied to the details of linguistic structure. Despite all the measures of validating the data taken, as Gee (2005, p. 113) asserts, validity is never ‘once and for all’. All analyses are open for further argumentation and discussion and their status can be challenged at any time or later at any stage as more refined researches emerge in the field. Validity can be different in different analyses; some of them may be more valid than others.

After having put forward a detailed review of works on and in CDA, I will now review the opinions of theorists and critics about two other key issues of the present study i.e., culture and Sufism. The brief review of literature on culture leads to its conceptualization in the present study while relatively detailed review of the beliefs, practices, concepts and key terms of Sufism foregrounds its importance and relevance to the present study as linked and made explicit in Chapter 4 of this study.

2.3 Culture

Culture is a complicated concept and defining it has been an uphill task for many and since long ago. It is a constantly changing phenomenon that variably accepts influences of climate, ideologies, languages, religions, political developments, etc.

Cosgrove and Jackson (1987, p. 99) view culture as “the medium through which people transform the mundane phenomenon of the material world into a world of significant symbols to which they give meaning and attach value.” Williams (1982, p. 13) further adds that culture is “the signifying system through which necessarily (though among other means) a social order is communicated, reproduced, experienced, and explored” (cited in Duncan 1990, p. 15; Daniels, 1989). Jackson (1989, p. 2) with his broader view suggests that culture is, “the level at which social groups develop distinct patterns of life,” called cultures which themselves “are maps of meaning through which the world is made intelligible.”
According to Williams (1983, p. 87), culture is a term explicating the “tending of natural growth.” In this sense, culture is the human appropriation of nature. Williams (1983, p. 88) and Cosgrove (1983) relate culture to describe human development (tending to the mind) and consider it as “an abstract process or the product of such a process” with “definite class associations”: the cultured and the uncultured. This distinction is central to the idea of culture: from these earliest extensions, culture was an idea used to differentiate and to classify. According to Williams (1983, p. 90) the term “culture” had come to be used in three particular ways in scientific and common discourse:

(i) “. . . a general process of intellectual, spiritual and aesthetic development . . .”
(ii) “. . . a particular way of life, whether of a people, a period, a group, or humanity in general . . .”
(iii) “. . . the works and practices of intellectual and especially artistic activity.”

Williams (1983, p. 91) is of the view that “culture” indicates a complex argument about the relations between general human development and a particular way of life, and between both the works and practices of art and intelligence. Hence the idea of culture is meant to describe not three but at least five things:

(i) the actual, often unexamined, patterns and differentiations of a people
(ii) the processes by which these patterns developed
(iii) the markers of differentiation between one people and another
(iv) the way all these processes, patterns and markers are represented
(v) the hierarchical ordering of all these activities, processes, productions and ways of life

Nelson et al. (1992, p. 5) relate that culture is understood both as a way of life, encompassing ideas, attitudes, languages, practices, institutions, and structures of power and a whole range of cultural practices: artistic forms, texts, cannons, architecture, mass-produced commodities, and so forth.
According to Duncan (1990, p. 15-16), culture is a set of signifying systems, though of a “material and practical nature”, which can be seen also as texts “which lend themselves to multiple readings”. Duncan (1980) remarks that Culture, then, though material and practical, can be reduced, not to social interaction but to language and the politics of language which comprise “the larger, widely shared, cultural sphere”.

Zelinsky (1973) relates that discourse and symbolism are the essential aspects of either culture or cultural communication. It is quite evident from the views of Zelinsky and Duncan that culture is transmitted through symbolic means, substantially but not wholly through language. Jackson (1989, p. 180) is of the view that culture refers to everyday life, works of art, political resistance, economic formations, religious beliefs, styles of clothing, eating habits, ideologies, ideas, literature, music, popular media and so forth.

From the discussion above, it is evident that culture is not only manifesting in social practices but also is constructed by language. The researcher has devised an operational definition of ‘local culture’ (placed in Chapter 1 of the present study). I defined it on specific and broader levels. At specific level, the definition takes insights from Linguistic Relativity Hypothesis (Whorf, 1956). It favours the idea of denial of the existence of any universal culture and at the same time asserts that the concepts of universal and local culture are no more rigid. Every culture should be considered as unique and independent. According to the operational definition of ‘local culture’ all the features embedded within Sufi interpretive discourse of Schimmel were taken as indicators of the local culture. Seeking insights from Lyons (1981) who presents two senses of culture: One sense, views it as opposite of barbarism while the other sense considers it as anthropological, defining it as a collective thought or distinctive national spirit of a community. The national culture is seen as a sum total of various sub-cultures. Indicators of local culture were seen within the light of Lyon’s insights which include: family systems, faith systems, folklores, music, superstitions, various Sufi practices and literary aspects.

The broader level pertains to the indigenous culture depicted within the Sufi interpretive discourse of Schimmel. The culture of the East in general and the culture of the subcontinent
(Sind, Panjab), Persian culture and Arabian culture, in particular are included in the operational definition of local culture.

Brief review of Sufism, some of its major doctrines and the key terms employed within Sufism are necessary to be put forward as the texts under investigation pertain to Sufi interpretive discourse and employ many of the terms placed underneath.

2.4 **Sufism: Various Perspectives**

Nicholson (1979), after having examined various definitions of Sufism, remarks that the essence of most of the works shows that Sufism is ‘indefinable’. However, modern scholars of Sufism have put their efforts in defining the term. Titus (1930) is of the view that Sufism is an attitude of mind and heart towards God and the struggles of life. Tringham (1971) defines mysticism as a specific approach to reality by exploiting intuitive and emotional spiritual faculties. These powers are generally inactive but they can be activated through training under guidance.

Arberry (1979) opines that Sufism is the mystical movement within Islam, whereas a Sufi, the one who links himself with this movement, is a person who is faithful to an inner pursuit for mystical union with his Creator. It also develops a personal trafficking with God.

Schimmel (2006) defining the spiritual current, remarks that it is the realization of the one reality that can be called Wisdom, Light, Love or nothing. Mysticism is the love of the Absolute, for the power that makes true mysticism distinct from mere asceticism is love. According to Burckhardt (1983), it is an expression of the inward or internal (*batin*) and esoteric aspect of Islam, as distinguished from its outward or external (*zahir*) and exoteric aspect. In the words of Stoddart (1976), mysticism is the inward or supra-formal dimension contrary to the outward and formal expression of a religion.

Schuon (1994) categorizes Islam into three fundamental aspects: Islam (outward works of the religion), *iman* (faith), and *ihsan* (virtue and perfection). Adding, he remarks that the third facet of *ihsan*, which literally means embellishment, beautiful activity, right-acting or charitable
activity, is essentially an esoteric notion and it is quintessential esoterism. *Ihsan* is an operative virtue, which confers upon believing and doing the qualities that make them perfect, and intensify and deepen both faith and works.

Chittick (2008) extending Schuon’s stance also divides Islam into the above-mentioned three dimensions, and establishes that the third dimension of *ihsan* is connected with depth, or the inner attitudes that accompany activity and thought, with Sufism. He argues that the Quranic employment of the word *ihsan* makes clear that it is not only an external and ethical good, but also an internal, moral, and spiritual good.

All the above mentioned definitions are reflective of the fact that though the scholars have tried to comprehensively encompass ‘Sufism’ within various perspectives, it seems as if it is really difficult to define this term because of various broader attributes associated with it.

2.4.1 Sufism: Origin and Evolution

Krishna (1938) while giving a brief overview of the origin and evolution of Sufism states that Sufism established soon after the Prophet Muhammad passed away and then advanced in conventional way. In the early phases, its practitioners had ascetic inclinations; strictly followed the principles put forward by the Quran to the letter and spirit and led quite laborious lives. But after passing through an evolutionary stage, this asceticism transformed into mysticism, and after a very short span of time before the end of the second century A.H. (A.D. 815), these ascetics acquired their new names as Sufis. The name was quite significant as they put on woolen garments. The term, *labisa’l-suf*, which previously meant ‘he clad himself in wool’, and was employed for a person who rejected the worldly pleasures and became an ascetic; at later stages became a Sufi.

He further remarks that the path from *Tareeqa* to *Haqeeqa* comprises seven stages: repentance, abstinence, renunciation, poverty, patience, trust in God, and satisfaction. Followers of Bayazid School were forbearing towards all and were least concerned about Islamic
principles. On the basis of these attributes they were known to be heretics and were resultantly hanged or banished.

This study does not require extensive investigation of the evolutionary phases of Sufism. Therefore, I have deliberately not gone into details of various phases of Sufi evolution and its historical perspectives and tried to remain specific to my research pursuits. In this connection, I have touched upon only those dimensions of Sufism and Sufi thought which directly or indirectly address my research inquiries to a considerable extent.

I have further presented a brief review of the investigative works on Sufism and Sufi thought which is given as under:

2.4.2 A Brief Review of Critical Works on Sufism and Sufi Thought

Scholarly insights and refined level of perception is required to probe into Sufi thought as profundity of the theme requires greater scholarly attitude. Scholarly writers with refined critical faculties from across the globe have tried their potential on various themes associated with Sufism which have acquired greater acclaim within the readers. All of these scholastic and critical works are written by renowned writers who are well-equipped in dealing with Sufism and its various practices and manifestations. Some of the major writers who have contributed in this field along with their major works are presented here. The basic objective behind placement of these writers and their works within my study is to create a certain level of familiarity with some of the major works which have been contributed by the erudite writers other than Schimmel.

The last two decades have witnessed a remarkable interest of the readers in the Sufi themes especially this trend has been on the increase and Sufism gained more acclaim within the world. Scholars get fascinated towards the profundity of diverse themes of Sufism which give sufficient food for thought to the budding researchers. The researchers may find plenty of themes associated with philosophical, linguistic, and cultural analysis within the Sufi discourse. However, one has to be mindful of the fact that no work, comprehensive it may be, can be seen as an exhaustive study on that very theme. It can only provide relevant directions and dimensions
and may contain relevant clues for the researchers to conduct their research proceedings independently.

*Sufism: A Beginner's Guide* (2008) is a remarkable contribution by Chittick which provides its reader with a hands-on knowledge about Sufism, historical perspectives, stages of evolution, and the special bondage which associates it with Islam. Furthermore, the mystical and spiritual aspects of music and dance have also been touched upon to a reasonable extent. Chittick’s mastery over the subjects seems to be evident when he encompasses the beliefs, practice and philosophies of Sufism reviewed by renowned figures, and the impression about Sufism in the modern world. Major sources through which the writer owes a great deal are the *Qura’n* and the *Hadith*. These are the major contributors from where he was able to develop his Sufi perspective. Sufi practice and its foundation have also been briefly reviewed. The concept of *ihsan* has also been skillfully portrayed within the book. The writer of the book himself defines the term as “doing the beautiful”. As *Ihsan* is followed by two basic dimensions namely the *Islam* (submission), and the *Iman* (faith), it may well be considered as the thoughtful and sincere realization of both the terms. *Ihsan* acquires the significant statues in Islam. The issue elaborated becomes more comprehensible through the indices placed at the end which provide the reader various references to grasp the issue in a better way.

*An Introduction to Sufi Doctrine* (1988) by Burckhardt is another contribution in explicating the Sufi themes to a reasonable extent. Burckhardt’s endeavours in comprehending the most significant aspect of Sufi thought may well be noticed throughout the book. He views Sufism as a Divine Revelation meant for the diverse aptitudes of human beings. The core theme of the book which acquires greater significance in terms of the nature of the theme is the chapter ‘The Doctrinal Foundation’ which highlights metaphysics of Sufism. The author is of the view that this aspect forms the basis of everything. The reader may not find any traces of the history of this serene aspect. Ibn-e-Arabi is the renowned Sufi and his works have also been briefly touched upon. Arabic terms have been explicated in the glossary using a lucid technique.

In *What is Sufism*, Lings (1975) rightly declares the Quran as the foundation of Sufism and doctrinal developments. This very aspect occupies a prominent place in the book. Nine chapters of the book have been set exploring the answer of the most significant question which
gives a clear dimension to his work. ‘The Originality of Sufism’ and ‘The Universality of Sufism’ highlight the specific nature of Sufism. One of the chapters ‘The Messenger’, specific to Prophet Muhammad (PBUH) elaborates how he was an embodiment of the Quran. The writer reaches the conclusion that roots of Sufism may well be traced in his personality. The next chapter ‘The Exclusiveness of Sufism’ describes a comparative analysis between the spiritual paths which are the most sacred and sanctified path and the profane one. In other words Sufism has been contrasted with the atheism and the agnosticism and the results have been left for the reader to extract. The religious references with their inclination to worldliness have also been put forward comparing them with the true Sufi spirit. The last chapter has been exclusively dedicated to the historical perspectives with a special focus on the legendary figures in Sufism who have been the torchbearers within the gloomy worldliness.

Nasr wrote *Sufi Essays* (1991). Nasr has been a renowned Islamic scholar whose contribution in Sufi themes has been well-acknowledged. Spiritual significance of Sufism in the recent times has been emphasized within this volume. Further, historical perspectives and the doctrinal growth of Sufism have also been skillfully touched upon. The writer has been quite instrumental in his approach while elaborating Islamic and Sufi teachings. To him, the remedy of the current problematic situation lies within the Sufi teachings. Adding he remarks that comparative study of the religion could also lead to comprehend such themes to a great extent. He further asserts that moral and spiritual poverty of the recent times may also be overcome through acquiring a keen sense of spirituality. He seems to develop a firm belief that Sufism and Islamic essence are indeed inseparable. He looks quite convinced that Sufism encompasses every dimension of spiritual life. Nasr was an advocate of the fact that the modern times were blessed in a sense that one of the sanctified traditions in the form of Sufism still survives. He further adds that through the revival of this tradition, the modern man can find relief from the gigantic problems of the day.

*The Mystic of Islam* (2007) is another work of significant value in this area written by Nicholson. Nicholson is the most prominent writer who has shown his mastery on Sufi discourse. His contributions are quite significant enough to grade him as an erudite scholar of Sufism in the 20th century. The Mystic of Islam may well be considered as a standard introduction to Sufism from a scholarly pen. The author seems quite convinced that Sufism merges the two ways of
Love and Knowledge and its foundations may well be traced in the Quran, as well as the Hadith. However, he also admits the partial impacts of other religions on Sufism. Major themes in Sufism merged in chapters including Sufi Path, Gnosis (or Knowledge), Divine Love, and the Unitive State have been skillfully presented. Nicholson seems to heavily rely on his own translations which he made of quotations on Sufi poems written in Arabic and Persian. Nicholson’s translations, indeed, are a great asset for the researchers pursuing their research in Sufism, Sufi thought and Sufi poetry.

*Understanding Islam* (1994) by Schuon is another text on Sufism. Schuon is a Sufi Scholar whose insightful works on Sufi discourse have achieved acclaim. He was a great advocate and a representative of the Perennial Philosophy. Rene Guenon, the French philosopher in the twenties is known to have established this school of thought. Schuon has also elaborated the issue to a great extent. The book encompasses various themes on Sufism which have been presented in various chapters including Islam, the Quran, the Prophet, and the Way (the Sufi path). The most significant aspect is that within the book every major thought is given its essential and universal meaning.

*Sufism: Veil and Quintessence* (2006) is a new translation with selected letters by Schuon. This book has been written to comprehensively grasp diversified themes on Sufism with a new approach. Significant themes in Sufism with quintessential truth have been separated from the accidental ones. He has also touched upon those factors which serve as a veil and hinder the true comprehension of the Sufi themes. He keeps on analyzing and outlayering those veils which function as linguistic distinctiveness of Arab language, ethnic and psychological aspectss, confessional attitudes, and other cultural factors. The last two chapters have been specified in explaining the essence of “Sufism: The Quintessential Esoterism of Islam” and “Hypostatic Dimension of Unity”. This book is a considerable contribution in looking at Sufism with a unique angle and may well be considered as a valuable edition for the scholars who remain in pursuit of unveiling unique dimensions.

Sedgwick (2000) also seems to be quite convinced that Sufism and Islam are closely bonded together. In *Sufism: The Essentials* (2000), he is of the view that no clash can be traced between the objectives of Sufism and the objectives of Islam. However, the level of emphasis on
various themes can be slightly different. Some of the major objectives can be categorized at the top of the list namely submission to the will of God, and preparation for the Final Day. He further remarks that in order to gain a deeper comprehension of Sufism, one should develop a profound sense of Islamic principles. The book is an excellent effort in understanding Sufism through the lens of Islamic thought.

*Sufism: The Mystical Doctrines and Method of Islam* (1976) by Stoddart is a sort of confession clearly suggesting that Sufism cannot be thought of without Islam. As regards the overall thematic presence of the book, it is quite simple in putting forth various Sufi conceptions in a lucid and comprehensible way. Stoddart is of the view that no spiritual path can be disintegrated from the fundamental framework of the religion, therefore, Sufism also acts as an integral part of the religion. Most of the Western scholars also endorsed this viewpoint. Stoddart rightly ranks Sufism as the inward or supra-formal dimension of Islam, which provides an outward strength to the religion which is the major function of spirituality. He further encompasses three dimensions in three chapters: The Religion of Islam, *Shariah* or The Law, which the author compared to a circle. The Islamic Esoterism, *Haqiqa*, the Inner Truth, which he declares as the center of the circle and in his opinion is responsible for forming Sufi principles. The last chapter: The Mystical Path, *Tariqah*, the ray emitting out from the circumference to the center, to which he thinks as the Sufi method leading from the external form to the internal realization. The book, though, is quite simple in its approach but carries deeper meanings for the scholars of the Sufi tradition. This book may well be considered as an excellent endeavour on the part of the author in bridging the gap by providing the reader the sufficient sources in comprehending the fundamental concepts of Sufism.

The very idea behind presenting the brief review of the critical works on Sufism and Sufi thought was to establish the point that though a bulk of work has been conducted within this field, the critical discourse perspective which I have employed within this study has not been employed yet. My research work may not be viewed as an exclusive enquiry into Sufism, its belief systems and evolution stages rather it should be seen as a critical enquiry-an endeavour towards investigating the textual and discursive dimensions of Sufi interpretive discourse which investigates how local culture was discursively constructed in Schimmel’s Sufi interpretive discourse.
However, as many of the Sufi beliefs and the terminologies were embedded within Schimmel’s Sufi interpretive discourse, therefore, it is pertinent to develop understanding of the major Sufi doctrines. In some of the pages to follow, I have presented the review of literature encompassing the major Sufi doctrines.

2.4.3 Prominent Sufi Doctrines

The major source consulted for brief description of prominent Sufi doctrines was Anjum (2006).

As regards the doctrinal evolution of Sufism, they remained in developmental stages for centuries. Experiential aspects gained more attention than theorizing Sufi beliefs at the initial stages. Simplicity was one of the major attributes of this phase. Investigating the doctrinal growth seems beyond the scope of this research study. However, it would definitely be pertinent to highlight a very brief description of some of the prominent Sufi doctrines.

As the research study is inclined towards the cultural aspects, those fundamental Sufi doctrines would not be explicated in detail which concern the attributes of God or the ones which are regarding the description of gnosis rather those doctrines would be highlighted which have the direct link with the social attitudes of Sufis. Moreover, the impact of these doctrines on the ethical ideals and moral values of Sufis would also be worth studying. It is also important here that the Sufi beliefs within the study were not extensively covered rather they were given just a passing reference because the study is more inclined towards the linguistic and critical discourse dimensions. But the familiarity with these beliefs is also significant as the essence of many of the beliefs could be traced within the core books of the study.

Smith (1935) suggests that the notion of gnosis or intuitive knowledge (ma’arifah or hikmah) as a way of understanding God encompasses intuitive or mysterious knowledge contrary to the knowledge acquired through the five senses and reason which results in understanding of the Absolute. In other words (as cited in Anjum, 2006) it is super-intellectual knowledge of God. As the concept of ma’arifah or intuitive knowledge had some sort of resemblance with revelation to the Prophet (PBUH), the religious scholars with knowledge of Islamic law or Shari’ah, came
up with strong criticism on Sufis. It were the charges regarding the claim of intuitive knowledge, Sufis even had to surrender their lives.

Al kalbadhi; Al Hajveri; Suhrwardi in Sharif (2004) relate that the conception of *fana* (the annihilation of the mortal self) was central to the thinking of the Persian Sufi Abu Yazid al-Bistami. In spiritual annihilation in God, the dichotomy and distinction between *I* and *Thou* ceases to exist. *Fana* signifies the death of self-will and self-consciousness. A parallel idea is found in Hinduism and Buddhism as well.

Another associated doctrine is that of subsistence or permanence (*baqa*). Love for God in the Sufis’ life holds the hope that beyond personal annihilation there will be divine restoration or permanence. According to al-Hujweri (Trans. Nicholson, 1911) Abu Sayyad Kharraz was the first to explain the states of *fana* and *baqa*. As for the doctrine of *baqa*, Sharif (2004) remarks that it signifies actual permanence in the Real; it represents the stage when a person loses his status in the attributes of the Real and achieves a vision of God Himself.

Al Hajveri; Hameeduddin in Sharif (2004) assert that according to the doctrine of unity (*Tauheed*), God is the only reality and He is unique in His timelessness. He is incomparable, and nothing is like Him. It signifies the negation of God's temporality, and the affirmation that God is eternal.

Schimmel (as cited in Anjum, 2006) remarks that the early Sufis such as Hasan al Basri believed in and propagated the concept of fear (*khawf*), signifying the fear of God's wrath, of the Day of Judgment and that of punishment of hell fire.

Smith (1984) is of the view that Love for God (*mahabbah*), however, emerged as a central idea in a Sufi’s life, which requires exertion, discipline and patience, but it is Sufi belief that he may be blessed with love inspired by God, love satisfied with nothing less than God Himself. The notion of disinterested love of God was clearly articulated perhaps for the first time with overpowering force by Rabi’ah al-Basri. Because of her advocacy for disinterested love of God, she became the model of selfless love among the Sufi circles. She urged the worship of
God out of love, instead of owing to fear of hell or desire for paradise. She taught that a Sufi must love God for His Own sake.

Al Kalabadhi (Edited by Arberry 1934; Al Hajveri Trans. Nicholson 1911) explicated the principle of sobriety. He further remark that Junayd al-Baghdadi advocated the principle of sobriety (sahw) in Sufi practices and behaviour. His apparent behaviour, actions, and utterances were in consonance with the Shari'ah (the Islamic law), and for this reason his Sufi doctrines and practices were generally approved by his contemporary theologians. The principle opposed to sahw is that of intoxication or ‘drunkenness’ (sukr), characterized by loss of self control because of an excess of longing and extreme love. It was propagated by the early Sufis such as Abu Yazid al-Bistami and al-Hallaj.

Melchert (as cited in Anjum, 2006) asserts that historians and scholars of Sufism have pointed out that the ascetic impulse, based on otherworldliness and utter renunciation of worldly pleasures, was a part of the Sufi tradition from the very beginning. He further added that one of the foremost Sufi doctrines was the doctrine of voluntary poverty (faqr) which was characterized by a denial of material needs. The lifestyles of Sufis exhibited indifference to wealth, and that was why they came to be referred to as faqir (poor or destitute). The manifestations of poverty included extreme simplicity of living, lack of worldly possessions, wearing of coarse clothes, having very simple food such as herbs, and even continual fasting. The early Sufi texts are full of exaltation of poverty, since it was treated as a celebrated virtue practiced by the Prophet (PBUH) himself.

Arberry (as cited in Anjum, 2006) states that one of the earliest Sufis, Hasan al-Basri, cherished the values of hunger and poverty while branding wealth as an evil which distracts people from their righteous goal. Sharif (as cited in Anjum, 2006) is of the view that one also comes across a few exceptions such as Harith al Muhssibi, who preferred wealth (ghina) to poverty.

The Encyclopedia of Islam New Edition, p. 1018-1019 (as cited in Anjum, 2006) gives us insight into the Sufi belief that hearing the recitation of the Quran, chanting of poetry or music
may induce ecstasy in an individual. For this reason, devotional music or *sama* is considered by a large number of Sufis to be a source of ecstasy and a method of spiritual realization, and hence, permissible. Devotional music and ecstatic dance were meant to arouse spiritual ecstasy and rapture, and many Sufis are said to have died from the heightened emotions caused by it. Michon (as cited in Anjum, 2006) further relates that the formal practice of *sama* was supplemented by ritualistic ecstatic dance or *raqs*, which was intended to plunge the dancer into a state of concentration on Allah. The practices of *sama* and *raqs* became especially popular in the Middle Period with the Sufis in Persia, India and Anatolia. The practice of *sama* found its highest expression among the Sufis associated with the *Mawlviyyah Silsilah*, whose founder, Jalal al-Din Rumi of Konya, the famous Persian Sufi poet, practiced it along with his disciples and associates. Many Sufi scholars have also expressed reservations about it, and have approved of it with some conditions for the listeners.

Al-Hujweri (Trans. Nicholson 1911, as cited in Anjum, 2006) is, for instance, among those who have approved it with some conditions. He has devoted an entire section to it in Kashf al-Mahjub, and has dealt in detail with its various principles, functions, conditions of performance, and aspects such as dancing and rending of garments. Similarly, Imam al-Ghazzali, (Trans. Kareem, 1981) who approved of it in principle, required certain conditions to be met before listening to it.

Another important Sufi doctrine is that of companionship (*suhbah*), which specifically refers to a Sufi's return from seclusion, as well as the company of the Sufi master for the disciple (*murid*). Al- Hajveri (Trans. Nicholson 1911) has elaborated *suhbah* to a great extent.

Another doctrine is that of retirement (*khalwah*). Al Suhurwardi (Trans. Clarke 1891, as cited in Anjum 2006) has dealt the issue of *khalwah* in detail. Adherence to the Sufi way of life did not necessarily involve continuous seclusion or solitude, breaking ties with the people at large, though the Sufis used to retreat from the worldly life for some period of time for spiritual gains. This is known as *khalwah*. The early Sufis, while practicing it, retired to forests, deserts or wilderness. In some cases it lasted for months, while in others it stretched over years and even decades. Nevertheless, it should not lead one into thinking that the Sufis generally led quietist
and secluded lives. It is essential to bear in mind that the practice of *khalwah* was a temporary phase after which the Sufis used to resume living among the people. It is important to note that all Sufis stressed the principle of service to humanity, which was, of course, not possible while in retirement.

Other important doctrine is the concept of sincerity (*ikhlas*). Al kalabadhi (Edited by Arberry 1934, as cited in Anjum, 2006)) asserts that it required that only God be sought in every act of obedience to Him, and also implied sincerity in every thought and action.

Al-Hajveri (Trans. Nicholson 1911) explicates the concept of repentance (*tawbah*) which includes repentance from sin as well as from forgetfulness and distraction from God.

Schimmel (2006) brings the concept of heightened or concentrated piety (*zuhd*) into limelight that signifies the avoidance of even the permitted pleasures of worldly life, and eventually giving up of everything that distracts the heart and mind from God.

Al-kalabadhi (Edited by Arberry 1934) is of the view that the concept of trust in, or reliance on, God *tawakkul* was developed by Shaqiq al-Balkhi, a pupil of Ibrahim ibn Adham. Later on, it was further developed by Dhul-Nun al-Misri and Junayd al-Baghdadi.

Hodgson (as cited in Anjum, 2006) while pointing towards another essential Sufi value *tolerance* in social behaviour and universalism in approach is of the view that the Sufis had an inclusive approach towards people belonging to different sects, juristic schools, racial or ethnic groups, and even religions. They displayed more tolerance towards all, including non-Muslims, as compared to the theologians. He further remarks that Sufism served as a junction for the mystically-inclined adherents of different religious traditions. The Sufis held discourses with Christian priests, Jewish rabbis, and Buddhist and Zoroastrian sages. Sufism left an indelible mark on the life of the Muslims, as the Sufis often rose above sectarian affiliations, despite the fact that most of them were Sunnis by orientation.
Cornel (as cited in Anjum, 2006) explicating two complementary Sufi doctrines: the doctrine of *wilayat* or *wilayah* (spiritual territory or domain) and the doctrine of hierarchy of Sufis remarks that these have significant political linkages. According to the doctrine of *wilayat*, various geographical territories are considered to be under the spiritual jurisdiction of different Sufi *shaykhs*. Webner and Basu (as cited in in Anjum, 2006) further relate that the entire world is considered to be divided into various ‘geographical regions’ like different units of administration, each one of which is believed to be spiritually ruled by a Sufi *shaykh*. The heads of various *silsilahs* used to dispatch their *khulafa* (deputies) to these *wilayats*, and these *khuluфа* in turn used to appoint their subordinate *khulafa* for towns and small cities. In this way, one main Sufi centre used to control a whole network of *khanqahs* in various regions. As for the doctrine of hierarchy of Sufis, it was clearly articulated by Shaykh Ibn al-'Arabi for the first time. He argued that there are different hierarchies among the Sufis. On the top of it is *qutб*, the spiritual ruler of the entire world, who is coexistent with the temporal sultan or the king. The *qутб* is assisted by two *imams*, under whom work four *awтads*, and seven *abdals*.

### 2.4.4 Key Concepts in Sufi Discourse

Khanam (2006) provides a list of key terms often employed in Sufi discourse. For a deeper insight of these terms, Khanam predominantly relies on the works of the renowned writers of Sufism including al-Kalabadhi, al-Suherwardi and al-Hujweri. Schimmel’s *Mystical Dimensions of Islam* (2006) also contains many of the terms elaborated there. The very objective of presenting these key terms employed in Sufi discourse is to get the budding scholars of Sufi studies familiarized with the major themes and terms commonly used in Sufi settings. However, only some of the major terms have been presented here with the brief notes.

#### 2.4.4.1 Abdal

Its literal meaning is ‘the substitutes’. Sufi principle relates that there exists a set of seventy saints. When an *abdal* passes away, another replaces him and carries on his duties. Out of them a specific number are the *siddiqun* or The Truthful Ones. Out of those *siddiqun*, one Truthful or *Siddiq* is the *qutб* (axis or pole), who is actually the center of the human activity on earth.
2.4.4.2 Arif
It literally means ‘the knower’, ‘the knowing one’, ‘gnostic’. A person who has an access to the direct knowledge of God; a mystic who identifies God through personal spiritual experience and insights; one who has acquired gnosis or ‘ma’arifah’ and thus attains the uppermost stage in the spiritual path.

2.4.4.3 Baqa
Its literal meaning is ‘remaining’, ‘subsisting’. For a mystic who has been annihilated in God and lives in Him or through Him or has acquired fana, it is the final stage for him.

2.4.4.4 Chilla
It is a period of 40 days spent in constant fasting and religious/spiritual exercises.

2.4.4.5 Darwish
This term literally means a mendicant; the term is employed in the sense of a member of a religious group. Its alternative in Arabic word is faqir.

2.4.4.6 Dhikr
It refers to remembrance of God where an invocation is made of God’s name. Dhikr sets the decorum for meditation and is one of the fundamental obligations of every mystic. To achieve spiritual realization, greater significance is linked with dhikr. Dhikr Jali refers to loud repetition; Dhikr qalbi means silent repetition within the heart whereas Dhikr aini points to the state when the dhikr pervades into man’s whole being.

2.4.4.7 Fana
It literally means ‘extinction’. It refers to die to the world and to subsist in God alone.

2.4.4.8 Faqr
Its literal meaning is ‘poverty’. It refers to vacating the soul of the ego’s false ‘reality’ to give way to the realization of God.
2.4.4.9 Faqir
Literally it refers to ‘the poor’; a Sufi mendicant, a disciple who embraces the way of poverty as a source of realizing God.

2.4.4.10 Farz
It means ‘that which is obligatory’, ‘a duty’. A term employed for those rules of religion, which are enjoined by God.

2.4.4.11 Fiqh
It literally means Jurisprudence, Islamic Law. The system of *fiqh* deals with the laws regulating the ritual and the religious observances (*ibadat*). Four Sunni schools of *fiqh* can be witnessed: Hanafi, Maliki, Shafii, Hambali. The most prominent amongst the Shiite schools of *fiqh* is the *Jafari* school of jurisprudence founded by Jafar-as-Sadiq (699-765).

2.4.4.12 Hal
It refers to ecstasy and an ecstatic state.

2.4.4.13 Haqiqa
Literally it refers to ‘the truth’, ‘the reality’; the ultimate truth, which rises above human confines. The *haqiqa* is also called ‘the kernel’ or the quintessence. The Sufis firmly believe that to reach the quintessence level, one has to break the shell and reach the inner spirit to discover God.

2.4.4.14 Ihsan
Literally it means ‘to do well’ or ‘to do everything as magnificently as possible’. It is the level at which the devotee thoroughly gets engrossed in prayer to God. It may also refer to the attainment of that level of attachment at which one begins to feel the existence of God.

2.4.4.15 Ilm-i-safina
It may refer to the knowledge acquired through the books; the revealed books.
2.4.4.16 Ilm-i-sina
It means the knowledge of the heart, or the understanding attained from the spiritual leaders.

2.4.4.17 Iman
It literally means ‘to know’, ‘to believe’, ‘to establish one’s trust in something or someone’. Usually, it is translated as ‘belief’. In Islam, it refers to putting one’s trust in and having complete belief in God, His Prophets, His angels, His books, and the Day of Judgment.

2.4.4.18 Ishq-e-majazi
Love of a human being is the Ishq-e-majazi contrary to ishq-i-haqiqi or the true love.

2.4.4.19 Ishq-i-haqiqi
It is the true love or the love of God.

2.4.4.20 Jamaaat Khana
It refers to a Sufi hospice, a khanqah.

2.4.4.21 Khalwat
Literally it refers to private or solitary spiritual retreat.

2.4.4.22 Khanqah
It means a meeting place of dervishes or the Sufis, a Sufi hospice. The terms zawiyyah or ribat are employed as alternatives.

2.4.4.23 Khirqa
It literally refers to ‘a rag’; ‘a patched cloak’ put on by some Sufi orders. The khirqa is a symbol of poverty and rejection of the world. Dervishes did not replace the cloaks when torn but continually patched until the whole garment was reduced to patches.
2.4.4.24 *Kufr*
Literally it means a ‘covering’, ‘hiding’ and ‘denial of God’. It is the only sin which God will not pardon as it rejects Him and His Mercy.

2.4.4.25 *Langar*
It refers to free food disseminated in the Sufi hospices to the devotees.

2.4.4.26 *Ma‘arifah*
It literally refers to ‘knowledge’ or ‘gnosis’. In Sufi studies, it means the mystical knowledge of God. It is the ultimate stage when a Sufi’s heart is filled with the insight and the realization of the truth.

2.4.4.27 *Mahabbah*
Literally it means ‘love’. It refers to the affection and love for God satisfying the soul of the mystic. In Sufism *makhafah* or ‘fear of God’ paves the way for *mahabbah* or ‘love of God’; this consequently culminates in ma’arifah or ‘the realization of God’.

2.4.4.28 *Majlis*
It is an assembly, a meeting; a formal *dhikr* or *sama* session.

2.4.4.29 *Makhafah*
Literally it refers to ‘fear’. In Sufi discourse, it refers to the state of being in fear of God. It also means purification.

2.4.4.30 *Malfuzaat*
It refers to ‘discourse’, ‘conversations’, meaning the conversations of the Sufi mystics recorded by the disciples and compiled in the form of a book.
2.4.4.31 Maqaam
Literally it means ‘a halting place’, ‘a stage in the journey’, ‘a station’; a salik must experience a number of stations to reach his destination.

2.4.4.32 Masnavi
It is a long narrative poem, often employed by the Sufi poets.

2.4.4.33 Mendicant
This term refers to members of religious orders dependent on alms.

2.4.4.34 Mujaddid
In Sufi discourse, this term refers to ‘The reviver of Islam”; a title bestowed on Ahmad Sirhindi who was hailed as Mujaddid Alf-i Sani or the reviver of the second millennium.

2.4.4.35 Majzub
Literally it refers to being ‘attracted’. According to Sufis, this term is used for a person whom God has chosen for Himself, to manifest His love. A majzub is therefore capable of acquiring the highest stages of the Sufi knowledge effortlessly.

2.4.4.36 Muraqaba
It means ‘vigilance’. In Sufism it is employed for a permanent state of awareness and to the act of meditation. It also involves an introspection of the self, which has to be performed regularly.

2.4.4.37 Murid
It refers to a Sufi disciple, one who follows the spiritual path under the supervision of a mentor. Murid is of the same kind in meaning to faqir and dervish as well as salik.

2.4.4.38 Murshid
It is a spiritual guide, a mentor, a teacher. Pir and Sheikh are other terms employed as alternatives for Murshid.
2.4.4.39 *Nafs*
It refers to the animal soul, ego, or the baser self, liable for all the evil. According to Sufi beliefs, this baser self in human beings can be controlled only by spiritual exercises, worship and meditation.

2.4.4.40 *Pas-i-anfas*
It means controlling the breathing; the essence of the Sufi discipline practiced during meditation. The Sufis are of the standpoint that when breathing is controlled, thoughts are not diffused, and time is properly utilized.

2.4.4.41 *Pir*
It refers to a spiritual master, a teacher, a mentor, also called *murshid* (guide), *sheikh* (leader).

2.4.4.42 *Qabz*
Literally it means ‘a contraction’. In Sufism, this term refers to contraction or depression of the soul; the state when the soul feels its confines and then, the heart is depressed.

2.4.4.43 *Qurb*
Literally it means “nearness”. It refers to the state of ‘the nearness to God’.

2.4.4.44 *Qutb*
It literally refers to ‘an axis’, ‘a pole’; it is believed that the role of the spiritual center can be traced in a human being called *qutb* who is the highest of the saints.

2.4.4.45 *Salik*
It literally refers to ‘a traveler’, ‘a wayfarer’; a Sufi disciple who has commenced the journey towards God. The *salik*, other than being on a spiritual journey, frequently undertakes actual travel and wanders from place to place looking for spiritual masters and spiritual awareness.
2.4.4.46 Sama
Literally it refers to ‘a hearing’, ‘an audition’. According to Sufi beliefs, it is a musical assembly considered as a source of inducing a mystical state of ecstasy. Chishtia order was the only order in India which practiced Sama on frequent basis for which they were criticized by religious scholars but they refused to abandon this practice.

2.4.4.47 Shahadah
Literally it means to ‘to observe’, ‘to witness’, ‘to testify’. It is the first and the chief of the five pillars of Islam. It constitutes two parts– the negation and the affirmation: “There is no god but Allah, and Muhammad (PBUH) is His messenger.”

2.4.4.48 Shariah
It is the revealed law; the canonical law of Islam inferred from the Qur’an and the Sunnah.

2.4.4.49 Sheikh
Literally, it refers to ‘a spiritual master’, ‘a teacher’, ‘a mentor’ and a ‘mystic guide’

2.4.4.50 Shirk:
Literally it refers to ‘an association’, ‘a partnership’; the act of associating something with God, who is One.

2.4.4.51 Silsila
It refers to ‘the chain’, ‘the lineage’; the chain of transmission where the spiritual message, originating with the Prophet Muhammad (PBUH) and his companions, is transferred from one master to another. All Sufi orders are interconnected with such chains.

2.4.4.52 Suf
It literally means ‘wool’. The early ascetics used to put on rough, woolen clothing representing their rejection of the world. Sufism has also been inferred from Suf.
2.4.4.53 *Sufism*

It may well be considered as the mystic trend within Islam. *Tasawwuf* is another term employed for Sufism.

2.4.4.54 *Tajalli*

It literally means ‘revealing’. This term is employed describing the discharge of inward light, and the presentation of Divine secrets. The heart of the devotee gets enlightened with this light.

2.4.4.55 *Tajrid*

It literally means ‘solitude’; complete separation from all worldly pleasures. The Sufis believe that there are two facets of seclusion: the external separation from the world; the other was an internal separation in which the heart was purified of any consideration other than that of God.

2.4.4.56 *Tariqa*

Its literal meaning is ‘the way’ or ‘the path’. It is employed in two contexts: it either represents the spiritual way a Sufi has to travel to acquire the realization of God or a congregation around a Sufi master and afterwards, a Sufi order, which acquired its spiritual power through a chain of transmission or *silsila* back to the Prophet (PBUH)

2.4.4.57 *Tasawwuf*

Sufi remains in pursuit of *Tasawwuf* as it is the mystic trend in Islam. Sufism is another name given to *tasawwuf*.

2.4.4.58 *Tawakkul*

It may well be considered as an absolute trust in God.

2.4.4.59 *Tawba*

Its literal meaning is ‘repentance.’ It provides a safeguard against future sins if it comes from a sincere heart. It may bring a drastic and revolutionary change in one’s life.
2.4.4.60 Tawhid
Literally it refers to the ‘Oneness of God’. This very concept may well be graded as the ultimate realization of the oneness of God.

2.4.4.61 Tawiz
Literally it means, ‘to flee for refuge.’ It may well be considered as an amulet or charm to defend against different ills, both physical and spiritual, by seeking refuge in God. Sealed in a leather case, worn around the neck and tied to the arm, the amulets are most often the passages of the Qur’an or the hadith.

2.4.4.62 Tazkiya
It literally means: “purifying”. It refers to the purification of the soul through earnest attachment to God. To acquire the divine approval, purification of the heart and soul are pertinent.

2.4.4.63 Wahdat al Shahud
It literally means ‘Unity of Witness’, ‘Unity of Consciousness’, ‘Unity of Vision’; the notion developed by Sheikh Ahmed Sirhindi contrary to the theory of wahdat-ul-wujud of Ibn ‘Arabi. This notion relates that the experience of union or oneness with God is linked with vision rather than reality.

2.4.4.64 Wahdat-ul-Wujud
It means ‘Unity of Being’, ‘Oneness of Being’. It is a notion established by Ibn-e-Arabi and followed by all Sufis of the subcontinent. Only the Naqshbandi followers of Ahmad Sirhindi do not follow this tradition.

2.4.4.65 Wird
It is a set litany recited by the devout many times a day constituting Quranic formulas.

2.4.4.66 Zawiya
Its literal meaning is ‘a corner’. It may also be considered as a place of religious retreat, or a Sufi meeting place where the Sufis get together for prayer and dhikr.
To the best knowledge of the researcher, Schimmel’s interpretive Sufi discourse has not been reviewed at an extensive scale. What is available is in the form of very short reviews on her different works which indeed cannot be viewed as an encompassing and an exhaustive investigative work. In some of the pages to follow, the researcher has presented a brief review of the works made on some of the prominent books of Schimmel.

2.5 Review of the Works on Schimmel

Martin (1978) while reviewing Schimmel’s *Pain and Grace* evaluates the book as a valuable contribution to the study of religion emphasizing on a poignant moment in the turbulent association between Islam and Hinduism in northern India. He further considers the book as a valuable resource for the students of Sufism and Islam in India by asserting that it should not be viewed as mere an historic account of the Mughal India, rather a document beyond that.

Librande (2006) comments on Schimmel’s *Deciphering the Signs of God* that Schimmel was convincing in her approach while explicating the value of phenomenological approach to Islam and suitability of pursuing its goals further. He further remarks that the enquiry relating to the language in which a Muslim is capable of expressing self and faith was well elaborated in the respectful, tolerant and compassionate tones of this phenomenologist. Adding he remarks that the descriptions of Schimmel challenge scholars of the History of Religions to make a more appropriate and deserved place of Islam in their studies.

Metcalf (1983) seems more critical in her approach while evaluating Schimmel’s *Islam in the Indian Subcontinent*. According to her, nothing within the books deepens one’s interpretations of Islamic culture in this setting beyond what is available in other works. She finds the arguments of this book based on secondary works. Metcalf is of the view that some of the information placed within the book is based on mere generalizations to which she provides necessary evidences and instances. Further, she also raises objections to the quality of analysis of the personalities.
Reviewing Schimmel’s book *The Mystery of Numbers*, Figueira (1998) considers the book as a straightforward introduction to an endlessly fascinating human phenomenon. According to her, the excessive details and theoretical speculations are not stuffed by Schimmel into the minds of the reader to create fatigue and exhaustion rather vast significance of numbers in cultures and the attractive variations contained therein were demonstrated through ample information given by the author. She further asserts that the bibliography of the book is well designed as a resource for further inquiries and studies for those scholars who are ambitious of more extensive information.

Critically evaluating Schimmel’s *My Soul is a Woman*, Hermansen (1998) considers the breadth of Schimmel’s knowledge of the literatures as one of the strengths of the book. Commenting on her methodology, she opines that the methodology within the book as elsewhere comprised choosing a number of thematic categories which are then illustrated by textual citations. While remarking on the presentation, she is of the view that it is descriptive and thematic rather than analytical or literary critical. Encompassing Schimmel’s broader purpose within the book, Hermansen further relates that it is to make available the richness of the understandings of the feminine in the Islamic literary heritage, especially the extensive mystical and poetic imagery which has celebrated the female as lover, mother, soul yearning for mystical union and so forth.

Khalid (1970) while reviewing Schimmel’s *Muhammad Iqbal* remarks that Schimmel hardly needed any introduction as an Iqbalist. He further asserts that many a Muslim had to admit that they were capable of comprehending Iqbal fully after having studied Prof Schimmel’s German rendering of the works of the Pakistani thinker. While presenting an analogy, Khalid further remarks that Schimmel is to Germany what Arberry is to English-speaking world, although the former is not confined to her home country.

Commenting on *Calligraphy and Islamic Culture* by Schimmel, Bier (1985) commends Schimmel by stating that her command of the requisite languages was extraordinary. He further asserts that it combined with her sensitivity enabled her to penetrate skillfully calligraphic
imagery, both verbal and visual, throughout the Islamic world. He further adds that her style of writing transforms exotic esoterica into digestible nougats.

Peters (1976) in his review on Schimmel’s most prominent book *Mystical Dimensions of Islam* states that Schimmel accessed Sufism from its literary aspect rather than through its facet of theology and has managed to produce an affective history of the phenomenon, full of savor and sensibility. He further says that Schimmel is quite comfortable with the literary exposition of Sufism but seems less concerned when the biography or theology is involved. Criticizing her scanty treatment of biographical material, he regrets by remarking that it can be found within the sources in plenty.

Hamori (1983) reviews Schimmel’s *As through a Veil* and commends Schimmel’s scholarly stature. He asserts that few people could equal her knowledge both on the subject and of the scholarly work related to it. He further emphasizes that the geographic, chronological and linguistic reach of her analysis, from Rabica to Iqbal, from Persian to Sindhi and Bengali is amazing. He considers the approach of the book historical and cumulative where Schimmel does not seem much concerned about analysis. Adding he asserts that there is no attempt at the intellectual mapping of the mystical concepts within the book, and it seems as if close reading of the poems has not been made. To Hamori, *As through a Veil* is a grand tour, no more systematic than a grand tour must be.

It is pertinent here to mention that though short reviews were made on Schimmel’s work but no work was observed to the best knowledge of the researcher which could extensively explore the discursive dimensions of Schimmel’s works. Moreover, no work on Schimmel even matches the research pursuits employed in this study. Application of critical discourse perspective is indeed a new dimension applied on Schimmel’s works. Further, enquiry of discursive construction of local culture and investigation of ideological perspectives are indeed significant aspects worth enquiry.

This review of literature establishes that there is no dearth of scholarly works in the areas of critical discourse analysis, study of culture, and Sufism. However, no study is available on the
discursive construction of local culture in Schimmel’s analysis of Sufi poetry. This is the niche in available body of research that rationalizes the need of the present research.
CHAPTER 3

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

Before the researcher formally proceeds with the description of the research methodology adopted for the research study, it would be appropriate to elaborate the rationale behind choosing CDA as methodology for this particular study. The significant points in this connection are as under:

3.1 Rationale for Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA)

It is significant to mention here the rationale behind CDA becoming an appropriate method of investigation of the discursive construction of local culture in Schimmel’s analysis of Sufi Poetry, which is the core target of the research study. Here the researcher would put forward a couple of reasons. First, CDA offers such relevant analytical tools that can be employed in the close reading of texts depicting culture. Second, CDA views a text on numerous levels, including word, sentence, and text levels, and further a detailed analysis of an entire text. Moreover, as McGregor (2003) relates, CDA aims at uniting and investigating the relationship among three levels of analysis: (a) the actual text; (b) the discursive practices (that is the process involved in creating, writing, speaking, reading, and hearing); and (c) the larger social context that bears upon the text and the discursive practices. Finding the traces of local culture in the research study, context develops as an important consideration. Further, as Huckin (2008) states that CDA probes into elements like metaphor, modality, register, foregrounding, insinuation, intertextuality, politeness, deletion, transitivity, coherence, framing, and omission, most of them can be applied to both textual and contextual elements of a discourse.
Another factor for considering CDA as a suitable framework for my research investigation is that it views not only the text but also keeps context into complete consideration. Looking at Schimmel’s analysis of Sufi Poetry, her subjectivity, source of inspiration, construction of the culture within her interpretive discourse and vice versa, become extremely significant. Analyzing context in this way may help the researcher gain a deeper insight into how this discourse exhibits ways in which the powerful Sufi discourse gets influential within cultural settings. This approach fits appropriate with one of the aims of CDA, which as Huckin’s (2008) remarks is to attend to contemporary societal issues, seeking to show how people are manipulated by powerful interests through the medium of public discourse. Huckin (2008) further adds that CDA investigates omissions, implicatures, presuppositions, ambiguities, and other covert but powerful aspects of discourse which all get significant when exploring how discourse constructs culture and vice versa. In this connection, the researcher will employ only those tools which really become pertinent for this research study.

3.2 Data: Core Texts for my Research Study

Out of various books of Schimmel on Sufism, I have selected her three books as core texts for my research study, namely:

1) *Pain and Grace*
2) *Mystical Dimensions of Islam*
3) *As through a Veil*

I have further selected 15 sample texts related to the local culture (as operationally defined in Chapter 1) from all these three core books to apply Fairclough’s three dimensional model (Critical Discourse Analysis). As many as five texts have been selected from each book. The selected texts which have been specified for critical discourse analysis are as under:
3.2.1 *Pain and Grace – 5 Selected Texts*

**Text 1:**
“Sur Asa belongs to the sweetest chapters………………most difficult one to appreciate for a non-Sindhi reader.”
*Pain and Grace* (Schimmel, 2003, P.159-161, see appendix 1)

**Text 2:**
“There is no end to the sighs of deserted woman………………………that is my happiness.”
*Pain and Grace* (Schimmel, 2003, P.176-178, see appendix 2)

**Text 3:**
“In Shah  Latif’s poetry…………………………have been devoured know that!”
*Pain and Grace* (Schimmel, 2003, P.182-184, see appendix 3)

**Text 4:**
“The topic of the sea…………………………after years of yearning in the desert.”
*Pain and Grace* (Schimmel, 2003, P.155-157, see appendix 4)

**Text 5:**
“The following Sur has again a traditional story………………. that had killed his six brothers.”
*Pain and Grace* (Schimmel, 2003, P.157-158, see appendix 5)

3.2.2 *Mystical Dimensions of Islam–5 Selected Texts*

**Text 6:**
“The term shahid ‘witness’ is used for beautiful beloved……… ladder of created souls.”
*Mystical Dimensions of Islam* (Schimmel, 2006, P.291-292, see appendix 6)

**Text 7:**
“The unsurpassable master of love and passion……………… concept of absolute love.”
*Mystical Dimensions of Islam* (Schimmel, 2006, P.292-294, see appendix 7)

**Text 8:**
“The imagery of the birds was elaborated……………………..the tresses of the beloved.”
*Mystical Dimensions of Islam* (Schimmel, 2006, P.307-309, see appendix 8)

**Text 9:**
“The Panjab and Sind show close similarities……………….. typical Hindu love for the guru.”
*Mystical Dimensions of Islam* (Schimmel, 2006, P.385-387, see appendix 9)
Some of the surs are related to folk ballads……………. have not done full justice to him."
*Mystical Dimensions of Islam* (Schimmel, 2006, P.391-393, see appendix 10)

### 3.2.3 As through a Veil-5 Selected Texts

**Text 11:**
“The mystery of a rejuvenating death……………. Friedrich Ruckert in his *ghazals*.”
*As through a Veil* (Schimmel, 1982, 2001, P.132-133, see appendix 11)

**Text 12:**
“It should not be overlooked……………. visible as in high poetry.”
*As through a Veil* (Schimmel, 1982, 2001, P.140-142, see appendix 12)

**Text 13:**
“One enjoys these poems best ………………. to quicken the dead hearts.”
*As through a Veil* (Schimmel, 1982, 2001, P.145-146, see appendix 13)

**Text 14:**
“Hir Ranjha in Panjabi is the best known example ………………. I had not known it before.”
*As through a Veil* (Schimmel, 1982, 2001, P.152-155, see appendix 14)

**Text 15:**
“Folk poetry, as we mentioned developed ………………. *assalamu alaik mere Gesudaraz*.”
*As through a Veil* (Schimmel, 1982, 2001, P.160-161, see appendix 15)

### 3.2.4 Rationale for Selection of Core Books/15 Selected Texts

Schimmel has more than 50 books to her credit and most of them are on Sufi thought. Why the researcher selected these three books is a question worth responding. Firstly, the researcher intends to make it quite clear that this study may not be considered as an exclusive work investigating Sufism and Sufi thought. To some extent, it would definitely touch upon the Sufi themes explicated in Sufi poetry. But the bulk of the study is concerned with the critical discourse perspective of how local culture has been constructed in Schimmel’s analysis of Sufi poetry. If it had been an enquiry into Sufism, I would have presented a diversified and more
enriched perspective of Sufi thought including its historical dimensions. But my work may not penetrate into such inquiries rather it is more of a linguistic and critical discourse perspective.

Secondly, coming to the question regarding the selection of books, the researcher comprehensively read Schimmel’s works and found these three books responding to the research inquiries. *Pain and Grace* is replete with analysis of poetical sections and especially the second part which is the ‘Grace’ part and encompasses Shah Abdul Latif Bhitai and his renowned *Shah Ju Risalo*, which comprises plenty of folk and cultural aspects representing Sindhi culture. Many of the folklores have been skillfully merged within ‘Grace’ section of *Pain and Grace* which make it culturally enriched work more suited to my research pursuits. *Mystical Dimensions of Islam*, though, is more of a historical work on mysticism but cannot be skipped as it is one of the major works of Schimmel on Sufi themes. Many of its sections especially the last half responds to the research pursuits and contains cultural and folk traces. The third core book *As through a Veil* is an exclusive book on mystical poetry of Jalaluddin Rumi where hundreds of couplets have been translated and briefly analyzed by Schimmel. Though the analysis in this book may not be considered as the one penetrating deeper into the Sufi themes but still can be graded as a comprehensive work on mystical poetry. Further, its relevance with the research pursuits is sufficient to select it as a core text for the current study.

The next enquiry can be of the selection of 15 texts, 5 each from the three core books. The 15 texts which the researcher has selected from three core books have been very carefully selected keeping into perspective their relevance with the research investigation. These 15 texts contain many of Sufi, social and cultural themes which have a complete conformity with the research objectives. They contain enough thematic value through which results can be drawn worth enquiry. At the same time, their meticulous selection has been made so that it may respond to critical discourse perspective which has certain requirements. The selected excerpts are neither unnecessarily too large to encompass nor are they too short to be investigated comprehensively. The size of the sample texts is quite reasonably balanced.
3.3 Data Analysis

As the research study chiefly aims at exploring Schimmel’s analysis of Sufi poetry, it is quite pragmatic to probe the validity of her analysis. The very object behind investigating her analysis of Sufi poetry is to validate her analysis. In other words, it would be an endeavour to get to know how far she has been successful in analyzing Sufi Poetry in its relevant milieu.

3.4 Strong Bondage between CDA and Systemic Functional Grammar

CDA practitioners seem thoroughly inclined towards Systemic Functional Grammar and many of them view it as a preferred method. Fowler (1996a, p.12) supports simplified model of Hallidayan Grammar. Fairclough (2003, p.5-6) also employs the similar approach by pointing out the possible use of pragmatics, conversation analysis and corpus linguistics. Wodak (2001, p.8) is of the view that in most of the studies the traces and references of Hallidayan Systemic Functional Grammar can be found whether analysts with a critical approach concentrate on micro linguistic features, macro linguistic features, textual, discursive or contextual features or whether their approach is philosophical, sociological or historical. This factor clearly suggests that it is essential for a thorough comprehension of CDA to develop understanding of the basic arguments of Halliday’s grammar and his approach to linguistic analysis. Renkema (1993) states that endeavours are being made in grounding analysis and interpretations of power relations on systemic description of discourse.

According to Halliday’s (1994) systemic functional linguistics any utterance will concurrently convey meanings in accordance with three macro functions: the ideational function (individual’s experience of the world expressed through language); the interpersonal function (the way individuals relate to each other exploiting language at the social level) and the textual function (the way linguistic forms are exploited to relate to each other and to the situational context).
Martin and Wodak (2003) state that technical language for talking about is provided to CDA through systemic functional linguistics making it convenient to concentrate on meanings and being overt and precise in terms shared by others.

As CDA is strongly bonded with Systemic Functional Linguistics and most of its interpretations and analyses mainly rely on it, so in the current study, the researcher has also employed most of its tenets in the research study.

3.5 Research Model- Fairclough’s Stance towards CDA

The researcher has employed Fairclough’s three-dimensional model for this particular research study which is indeed a suitable method for this specific enquiry. Fairclough’s approach to CDA needs to be closely monitored in this regard.

Fairclough (2001, p.19) is of the opinion that a dialectical relationship exists between language and society. ‘Dialectic’ may be seen as the way in which two different forces or ideas exist together or affect each other. Therefore, Fairclough remarks that language and society exist together and have an impact on each other. Jorgensen et al. (2002, p. 65) further validate the stance by stating that discourse is an important form of social practice. According to Fairclough (2001: p. 16; Jorgensen et al. (2002, p. 66-67), ‘discourse’ may have various interpretations. On one hand it is viewed as language and other semiosis as elements of social life, and on the other hand particular ways of representing part of the world are also known as discourse.

Fairclough (2003, p. 25) elaborates ‘social practice’ as articulations of different types of social elements which are associated with particular areas of social life, i.e. the context. However, according to Jorgensen et al. (2002, p. 61), discourse not only has an impact on social practice; social practice also affects discursive practice. Discursive practice as a matter of fact involves processes of text production and consumption. Fairclough (2001: p. 19) explicating the same influence is of the view that linguistic phenomena are social in a way that speaking or listening or writing or reading activities of the people are socially determined and influence socially and at the same time social phenomena are linguistic in the sense that the language
activity in social contexts is not just an indication or expression of social processes and practices rather it is a part of those processes and practices.

Jorgensen et al. (2002, p.67) assert that the communicative event and order of discourse are the prime areas of consideration in discourse analysis where communicative event is an instance of language use. Fairclough (2001, p.14) views the ‘order of discourse’ as sets of conventions associated with social institutions. To Fairclough, a communicative event and an order of discourse are like that of language and society in a dialectical relationship, having an impact on each other.

According to Fairclough, a communicative event comprises three dimensions: a social dimension, a discursive dimension and a textual dimension (Jorgensen et al. 2002, p. 69). Fairclough (2001, p. 21) states that these dimensions are in a dialectical relationship, and therefore, just analyzing a text does not serve the purpose rather it is important for a complete examination to investigate the relationship among texts, interactions, and contexts.

This research study exclusively aims at investigating how local culture as a social practice constructs discourse i.e., analysis of Sufi poetry made by Schimmel and at the same time how discourse constitutes social practices, the local culture. This dimension would help in investigating the problem statement to a great extent.

3.5.1 The Social Dimension

The social dimension as perceived through Fairclough’s model is the context. According to Fairclough (2001, p. 21), the social dimension comprises social conditions of interpretation and production, i.e. socially accepted rules for how a text is produced and interpreted.

According to Jorgensen et al. (2002, p. 69), the social dimension consists of discursive and non-discursive elements, and with Fairclough one cannot find any justification of analysis for the non-discursive elements. However, Jorgensen et al. (2002, p. 69) states that the use of other theories to supplement the analysis of social practice is supported by Fairclough.
Fairclough (1992, p. 86) establishes the concepts of ‘ideology’ and ‘hegemony’ concerning social practice. Jorgensen et al. (2002, p. 75) remarks that Fairclough delineates ‘ideology’ as “meaning in the service of power” and to him a discourse can be more or less ideological, and can play its part in producing, reproducing and transforming power relations (Jorgensen et al. 2002, p. 27). Fairclough (2001, p.2) emphasizes on ideologies in a text analysis, as they are closely bonded with language and further because using language is the commonest form of social behaviour. Fairclough (2001, p. 71) further asserts that an ideology is most effective when its functioning is least visible i.e., when people are not conscious of the ideologies. Adding Fairclough remarks that it happens when a discourse containing the ideology, is neutralized and becomes common sense, then the conception of ideology becomes an ‘implicit philosophy’ in the practical activities of social life, backgrounded and taken for granted (Fairclough 2001, p. 70).

Fairclough (2001, p. 20) is of the view that ideologies and power have a close bondage and thus the notion of hegemony has a close association with ideology. According to Fairclough (2003, p. 45) Hegemony is “a particular way of conceptualizing power which amongst other things emphasizing how power depends upon achieving consent or at least acquiescence rather than just having the resources to use force”. Fairclough (2001, p. 27-28) asserts that power can be exercised through two ways: coercion (force/violence) or consent (permission).

3.5.2 The Discursive Dimension

Fairclough (2001, p. 21) is of the view that discursive dimension consists of process of production and process of interpretation. According to Jorgensen et al. (2002, p. 69), the analysis of discursive practice focuses on how authors of texts exploit already existing discourses and genres to create text, and on how receivers of texts also apply available discourses and genres in the consumption and interpretation of the texts.
3.5.3 The Textual Dimension

According to Fairclough (2001, p. 20), a text is a product rather than a process – a product of the process of text production. He further relates that in this process a text is both a product and a resource. It is a product of the process of production, and a resource to the process of interpretation.

Fairclough (2003: p. 5) is of the viewpoint that the major theoretical framework behind this textual dimension is Halliday’s approach to Systemic Functional Linguistics (SFL) and the textual dimension relies on grammar, metaphors, wording and ethos. Jorgensen et al. (2002, p. 83) states that two of the main concepts within this dimension are ‘transitivity’ and ‘modality’. Jorgensen et al. (2002, p.83) while explicating transitivity remark that it is how events and processes are connected (or not connected) with subjects and object, keeping this into consideration it is likely to find out the agent of the action, or if there is an agent at all. Adding they relate that responsibility for an action can be removed by omitting an action by presenting the action as socially accepted phenomenon. Describing ‘modality’, Jorgensen et al. (2002, p. 83) are of the view that it is focus on the speaker’s degree of affinity with or affiliation to her or his statement i.e. the degree to which the speaker commits to a statement. According to Jorgensen et al. (2002, p. 84) truth is one form of modality in which the speaker commits himself completely to the statement. Contrary to the truth is hedges i.e., expression of low affinity to the statement by the speaker. Jorgensen et al. (2002, p. 83) further add that the receivers’ interpretation of the text are influenced by the way transitivity and modality are employed, and it also has an impact on activation of discourses.

Three dimensions of Fairclough’s model were further divided into subcategories. The researcher’s analysis is based on these subcategories of Fairclough’s three-dimensional model.

3.5.4 Aspects of Three-Dimensional Model

The analysis would try to meet certain aspects sketched by Fairclough (2003). They may be termed as subcategories of the three-dimensional model given above. These aspects are:
3.5.4.1 Social Events

Fairclough (2003) has given a bulk of detail on this issue. He is of the view that this aspect of the analytical model considers ‘social events’, ‘chain of social events’ that the text is a part of. It also takes into account the ‘social practice’ or ‘network of social practices’ referred or seen as framed within. The other point that the analysis considers is the association of the text with a chain or network of texts. In this particular study, the researcher has also traced the above mentioned features within the selected texts and has further tried to investigate the link of the selected texts with a chain or networks of texts if they are the part of any.

It is important here to comprehend the fine line between three terms: social structure, social practice and social event. Fairclough further states that languages can be viewed as the social structures as they define specific potential, certain possibilities and reject others. Further elaborating the social practice, he considers it as articulations of various sorts of social elements linked with particular features of social life. In this regard, various orders of discourse may be seen as instances of social practices. According to him, texts can be viewed as examples of social events which definitely may fall within various social practices following a specific social structure.

3.5.4.2 Genre

The foremost aspect while analyzing a text is to investigate the genre within which the text falls. This term is mostly employed in cultural studies, media studies and film theory. Fiske (1987) has elaborated the process of genre to a great extent. Silverstone (1999) has also touched upon the phenomenon of genre. This concept is not confined to just one discipline rather it is an issue of interdisciplinary and cross-disciplinary studies. Fairclough (2003) views genres as the exclusive discoursal feature of ways of acting and interacting in the course of social events.

According to him, while analyzing a text, it is to be sorted within a specific ‘genre chain’ if it is a part of any. A chain of events may entail a chain of various interrelated and interconnected texts which may exhibit a chain of different genres. ‘Mix of genres’ is another
facet which needs to be explored at an early stage of enquiry. The genres that the text draws upon and their characteristics are also considered in this phase of analysis. The researcher has applied the same inquiries to the research study investigating these pertinent aspects. Though the study is based on Sufi interpretive discourse which is descriptive in nature, all these queries need to be addressed which have been discussed in chapter 4 while exclusively analyzing all the selected texts.

3.5.4.3 Intertextuality

The significance of intertextual references is supreme in critical discourse studies. Insights from the works of Kristeva (1986a) lent a helping hand in comprehending the issue of intertextuality to a greater extent. Intertextuality may be seen as the presence of features of other texts within a text. Voices other than the authorial voice can well be traced. Bakhtin (1981) has also reasonably elaborated intertextuality. While analyzing a specific text, one has to be mindful of the fact which relevant other texts/voices have been incorporated/included or significantly excluded. The placement of included voices within the text and their specific and nonspecific attribution are also to be taken into consideration. Another most important aspect is that of direct or indirect reporting of the voices. It may also happen that reported speech may or may not be attributed to a specific voice. Fairclough (1995b) also explicates the process of intertextuality. He is of the view that a prominent aspect is to sort out whether the authorial voice still occupies a prominent place by texturing and manipulating other voices. The authorial interventions in intertextuality are closely monitored.

Investigation of intertextual references in three major works of Schimmel would definitely be interesting as the selected texts are rich in historical and intertextual references. Moreover, enquiry into whether the authorial voice still gets prominent in spite of influx of many of the intertextual references would indeed be worth investigating. How tactfully those intertextual references have been merged within the text may also be significant for the researcher. Here the issue of intertextuality is more inclined towards ideological aspects than those of hegemonic ones as the enquiry of ideological aspects is more suited for the research study. Power relations, the most significant aspects in critical discourse perspectives, are worth
enquiry in a way that the Sufi discourse in itself comprises power relations through which it gains prominence within the common folk.

One of the powerful instances of intertextual references was extracted from Appendix 15 (As through a Veil) where the intertextual reference of ‘the first geographical poem in Sindhi’ was skillfully merged within the text. The poem enumerates dozens of cities and countries as ‘Abdul Qadir’s Domain’.

3.5.4.4 Assumptions

Levinson (1983) has dealt in the issue of ‘assumptions’ to a great deal grading it to a linguistic feature of a text. He has further categorized assumptions to subcategories. Blakemore (1992) has also discussed various dimension of the issue. Sufficient elaborations on this aspect can also be traced in the works of Mey (1993) and Grice (1981). Fairclough (2003) is of the view that implicitness is one of the invasive attributes of texts. This term is also referred to as presupposition in some contexts including pragmatics. Assumption becomes a significant issue in terms of ideology. Existential, propositional and value assumptions in the text are considered through this aspect of the analysis.

Levinson (1983) further explicates that ‘Existential Assumptions’ are the assumptions about what exists. They may be triggered by definite articles and demonstratives. One of the significant instances of Existential Assumptions extracted from Appendix 13 (As through a Veil) is as under:

The act of spinning could be easily compared to dhikr . . . ”

Definite article in the above mentioned instance is indicative of the existential assumption.

Propositional assumptions are about what is, or can be or will be in the case. They are triggered by specific (factive) verbs like realize, forget.
‘Value Assumptions’ are about what is desirable or undesirable. The question whether any of these assumptions carry any ideological association becomes quite significant in critical discourse studies. A prominent instance of ‘Value Assumptions’ traced from Appendix 1 (Pain and Grace) is as under:

“Sur Ripa, a short song, describes in impressive images the longings of the lonely wife for her husband.”

‘Impressive images’ is indicative of value assumption on the part of the author demonstrating her subjective stance and her ideologies attached with the statement.

3.5.4.5 Semantic/ Grammatical Relations between Sentences and Clauses

In textual analysis, semantic/grammatical relations between sentences and clauses are taken into account to further explore the underlying meanings of the text. These relations may be causal i.e., reason, purpose, conditional, temporal, additive, elaborative, and contrastive/concessive. A researcher is more concerned with the higher level semantic relations over larger stretches of the text i.e., to see whether problem solution relations are embedded within those stretches of texts. Moreover, investigation of paratactic and hypotactic relations within sentences and clauses also carry meanings. By investigating all these parameters, a researcher investigates the significant relations of equivalence and difference sketched by the author.

Eggins (1994) has touched upon the grammatical relations in detail. Insights into works of Martin (1992) help the researcher a great deal in comprehending all these relations. (Quirk et al. 1995) also comprehensively explicate the grammatical issues.

According to the insights from all these works paratactically related clauses have the equal grammatical position. They are neither subordinate nor superordinate to the other. For instance:

“When he walks out of his house earth and heaven are delighted, and houris stand in silent admiration and confusion….” (See appendix 2, Pain and Grace)
Two independent clauses in the above mentioned instance are separated by a conjunction. Hypotactic relations between clauses can be witnessed in a superordinate-subordinate relation. For instance:

“Rumi compares it to the “wooden sword that the hero gives his child” so that the child may learn the technique of fighting.” (See Appendix 6 Mystical Dimensions of Islam)

A clause serves as an element of other clause in case of Embedded Relations. For example

“Nuri, the fishermaid who wins the heart of Prince Tamachi by her obedience and sweetness . . .” (See Appendix 10, Mystical Dimensions of Islam)

Similarly, Causal/Contrastive Relations between clauses can be traced through the presence of respective conjunctions. Cause and effect relations can be investigated within Causal Relations while contrastive difference is demonstrated through Contrastive Relations. The instance of Causal Relations is as under:

“. . . Sultan Bahu (who got his surname because each line of his Siharfi, “Golden Alphabet” ends with the exclamation hu, “He”)”

(See Appendix 9, Mystical Dimensions of Islam)

The instance of Contrastive Relations showing contrastive difference is as under:

“. . . a mystic like Rumi often used everyday imagery to express lofty thoughts and deep mystical experience, but most Persian-writing mystics composed their verse in the precious style . . .” (See Appendix 12 As through a Veil)

To investigate Additive Relations and Relations of Elaboration conjunctions may not be required. In these cases one sentence/clause acts as an elaboration or an added feature to the previous one. The most important objective of ‘legitimation’ explicated by Fairclough (2003) can be achieved through these relations where one clause rationalizes and legitimates the other. The prominent instance of ‘additive relations’ is as under:

“. . . mystics in all religious traditions have seen in their visions the dance of the soul (Susu) or the cosmic dance. They saw the lilies dancing at Love’s music . . .”
A significant instance of ‘relations of elaboration’ is as under:

“Sur Dahar gives in its first chapter a fine description of the dried-up tree, a common sight in the valley of the ever-shifting Indus and its tributaries.”

All these grammatical relations have their own significance within the text and therefore owe a significant status in critical discourse studies.

**3.5.4.6 Exchanges, Speech Functions and Grammatical Mood**

According to Fairclough (2003), the presence of various types of exchange (activity exchange or knowledge exchange) and speech functions (statement, question, demand, offer) as a matter fact set the tone and specify the mood of the text. A text may entail various types of statements, namely statements of fact, predictions, hypotheticals, evaluations, which place the text into a particular category on the basis of which its speech functions and essence can be interpreted. Declarative, interrogative, and imperative expressions are also identified in the text to be read which point out their specific grammatical mood.

As the research study is a descriptive work and may not involve any of the interactional features, therefore, many of these features under this aspect of analysis may not be pertinent and relevant to my research study. However, it still requires commenting on the speech functions and grammatical mood of the discourse to investigate the prominent aspects of the authorial voice which is a matter worth enquiry in critical discourse studies.

**3.5.4.7 Discourses**

Fairclough (2003) views discourse as ways of representing aspects of the world. The world may entail the processes, relations and structures of the material world, the mental world of thoughts, feelings, beliefs and so forth and also the social world. Different discourses may be different perceptions on the world and they are linked with different association people form with the
world which is also dependent on various positions, social and personal identities people enjoy in the world. Discourses may be reflective of the world as it is rather they may also demonstrate possible world different from the real world. So the researcher has to trace the main parts of the world (inclusive of social life) represented. These representations may be in the form of main themes within the text. Also, the specific angle is also to be highlighted from which those main themes are represented.

Identification of discourses within the text is significant for the researcher. Discourse can be representation of a particular part of the world. At the same time, it may be representing it from a different perspective. Fairclough further asserts that while probing into the phenomena of discourses, a researcher is to see what types of discourses have been merged within the text and how they have been textured to give a peculiar essence. Significant ‘mixing of discourses’ further gives the reader an insight into a wide range of themes merged together. For instance in Text 5, the discourses of the culturally loaded folktales of ‘Lila and Chanesar’, ‘Mumal and Rano’, ‘Marui and Omar’, ‘Nuri and Jam Tamachi’ and the brave ‘Morirro’ have been drawn upon the text in the form of various discourses.

Similarly, enquiry of a few more facets of discourses, namely semantic relations between words, collocations, metaphors, assumptions, and grammatical features, lends the researcher a helping hand in critically evaluating the text. I would also benefit from the insights of Fairclough in examining various discourses merged within the text.

3.5.4.8 Representation of Social Events

This is the third and the most significant dimension of Fairclough’s three-dimensional model. Fairclough (2003) is of the view that three types of meanings i.e., action, representation and identification function within clauses. Looking at representational meanings, clauses can be viewed as having three types of features: processes, participants and circumstances. Processes are generally verbs; participants can be subjects, objects or indirect objects of verbs and various kinds of adverbials can be placed in the circumstances category.
Fairclough (2003) is of the view that social events may entail the following elements which need to be extensively investigated:

Forms of Activity
Persons (with beliefs/desires/values . . . histories)
Social relations, institutional forms
Objects
Means (technologies)
Times and places
Language and other types of semiosis)

Van Leeuwen (1993, 1995, 1996) is of the view that while investigating representation of social events, the researcher is more concerned about what elements of represented social events are included or excluded, and which included elements are most prominent. This aspect can be worth investigating in critical discourse studies.

Another enquiry worth investigation is to find out how abstractly or concretely are social events represented. Both types of representations may have different connotation and impact. Representation of the processes and their types i.e., material, mental, verbal, relational, and existential, are also identified.

The presence of instances of grammatical metaphor in the representation of processes contains a significant value in critical discourse studies. Further, representation of social actors, activated/passivated, personal/ impersonal, named/ classified, specific/generic, gives more insights while evaluating the social perspectives. The representation of the issue of time, space and space-times also acquires greater significance within the study.

While analyzing Schimmel’s analysis of Sufi poetry and the representation of social events within the selected texts, some of the above mentioned facets may not be applicable to the study. Therefore, the researcher would exploit the relevant features pertaining to this particular aspect of enquiry, applicable to the nature of texts.
Evidences of ‘ballads of Indus valley’ represented in some Surs of Shah Ju Risalo in Text 10, (See Appendix 10, Mystical Dimension of Islam), ‘longings of the lonely wife for her husband’ in Text 1 (See Appendix 1, Pain and Grace) and ‘sighs of the deserted woman’ in Text 2 (See Appendix 2, Pain and Grace) are relevant examples of the representation of social events.

3.5.4.9 Styles

Fairclough (2003) explicating ‘style’ is of the view that styles are the discoursal aspect of ways of being, identities. A person is identified partly through their speech and writings. At the same time it is also a matter of embodiment: how a person looks like, how he holds himself, how he moves and so forth. Identification has also been employed for one of the three major types of meaning in texts. Various linguistic features exhibit style namely phonological features, pronunciation, intonation, stress, rhythm. Specialized vocabulary and metaphors may also depict various styles in which authorial voice can well be traced. Specialized vocabulary may include intensifying adverbials which may exhibit various stylistic variations.

Investigating styles and how they have been textured and embedded within the text is also a matter of interest for the researcher. The significance or the rationale of mixing of styles is also considered. Salient features such as specialized vocabulary, metaphor, modality, or evaluation, of various styles give a specific stylistic dimension to a text. All these facets would complement enquiry at textual level.

In the research study, style gains greater significance as it is sheer manifestation of identification. Schimmel can well be identified through the specialized vocabulary and metaphors she employs while conveying her message more convincingly. The way local culture has been constructed through her peculiar style is a matter of utmost concern for the researcher.

For instance, the employment of special vocabulary ‘enrapturing rhythms’ can be linked with Qawwali, most significant aspect of Sufi settings. Qawwali is sung in enrapturing rhythms at the shrines of the Sufi mystics in which special reverence is attached to the Sufi saint and his order. (See Appendix 15, As through a Veil)
In Text 5, fishermaid ‘Nuri’ was metaphorically exploited as the ‘nafs mutma’inna’, ‘the soul at peace’ pointing to her highest level of obedience and surrender to her beloved Jam Tamachi becoming more elevated as compared to the other queens.

(See Appendix 5, Pain and Grace)

3.5.4.10 Modality

Halliday (1994) views modality as a speaker’s judgment of the possibilities, or the obligations, associated in his words. To Verschueren (1999) modality involves the many ways in which approaches can be expressed towards the ‘pure’ reference-and-predication content of an utterance indicating factuality, levels of conviction or doubt. However, Hodge and Kress (1988) take a different perspective by referring to the speaker’s or writer’s stance towards representation, their level of affinity with them.

According to Fairclough (2003), while tracing epistemic modality, a researcher is to investigate what do authors commit themselves to in terms of truth whereas in deontic modalities, author’s commitment towards obligation and necessity is further examined. Seeing to what extent modalities are categorical (assertion, denial etc.) and to which degree they are modalized is also quite significant. The researcher is to highlight the explicit ‘markers of modality’. ‘High, median and low levels of commitment’ within modalities contain significant meanings. Modal verbs and adverbs are various markers of modalization which also need to be specified within the analysis.

An instance of Epistemic Modality observed in Text 14 is as under:

“Sassui is the perfect embodiment of all those qualities which were expected from someone who enters the difficult mystical path.”

(See Appendix 14, As through a Veil)

A prominent example of Deontic Modality traced in Text 9 is as under:

“... the hairsplitting mollas—might attain a higher level of spiritual life through surrender in love.”

(See Appendix 9, Mystical Dimension of Islam)
All the selected 15 texts have been analyzed in the following chapter, keeping into perspective these aspects of Fairclough’s three-dimensional model. It is pertinent here that the frequency of employment of these subcategories of the three-dimensional model may vary within different texts.
Chapter 4

CRITICAL DISCOURSE ANALYSIS OF SCHIMMEL’S UNDERSTANDING OF SUFI POETRY

4.1 The Research Paradigm and Methodology

The philosophy of research that underpins this study is based on interpretivism and critical theory. The extension of critical theory can be found in Critical Discourse Analysis. To achieve objectives of this research, Fairclough’s Critical Discourse Analysis was used. The micro analysis (textual/language), the meso analysis (production and interpretation) and the macro analysis (contextual and social) were employed for the critical analysis. This was an apt model for the investigation aiming at exploring the implicit as well as explicit facets of the text.

As regards the text analysis, the external and the internal relations of the text were of a major concern. External relations included analysis of the relation of the text with other social elements i.e., social practice and social structure. Here I would be more concerned with three major aspects of text meaning, i.e., actions, identification and representations. Another dimension of the external relation was ‘intertextuality’ which investigates how features of other texts are intertextually incorporated and further how the voices of others are incorporated. Analysis of internal relations of text involved semantic relations (meaning relations between words and longer expressions, between elements of clauses, between clauses and between sentences and across larger stretches of the text), grammatical relations (paratactic and hypotactic relations between clauses, lexical relations (relations of collocations, hyponymy, synonymy, antonymy). Another facet worth investigating was the level of discourse (relations
between genres, discourses and styles). All these levels develop the link between the internal and external relations of the text which in turn answer the research questions set for this study.

I have selected 5 texts from each core text and analyzed them collectively under various aspects of Fairclough’s three-dimensional model. The first five texts selected from Schimmel’s *Pain and Grace* are as under:

### 4.2 *Pain and Grace* – 5 Selected Texts

**Text 1:**
“*Sur Asa* belongs to the sweetest chapters………………most difficult one to appreciate for a non-Sindhi reader.”
*Pain and Grace* (Schimmel, 2003, P.159-161, see appendix 1)

**Text 2:**
“There is no end to the sighs of deserted woman………………………that is my happiness.”
*Pain and Grace* (Schimmel, 2003, P.176-178, see appendix 2)

**Text 3:**
“In Shah  Latif’s poetry………………………have been devoured know that!”
*Pain and Grace* (Schimmel, 2003, P.182-184, see appendix 3)

**Text 4:**
“The topic of the sea………………………after years of yearning in the desert.”
*Pain and Grace* (Schimmel, 2003, P.155-157, see appendix 4)

**Text 5:**
“The following *Sur* has again a traditional story……………. that had killed his six brothers.”
*Pain and Grace* (Schimmel, 2003, P.157-158, see appendix 5)

I begin my analysis investigating the aspects pertaining to ‘social events’ within the five texts of *Pain and Grace*. 
4.2.1 Social Events

The five texts under analysis have been extracted from Shah Abdul Latif Bhitai’s ‘Grace’ Section of *Pain and Grace*. The texts may well be considered as ‘Sufi Discourse’ rich in cultural underpinnings which require to be revealed. Schimmel has brought into limelight various cultural traces and analyzed them one by one. Those cultural traces were investigated and highlighted through various aspects of Fairclough’s three-dimensional model. The 5 texts under analysis are a part of ‘chain of social events’ already deliberated within the book where the chapters of Shah Latif’s book *Risalo* were elaborated by Schimmel. However, all the 5 selected texts are ‘descriptive’ in nature with ‘analytical tone’ and do not belong to the chain or network of texts as they just go in continuation of the thought process set prior to the texts and apparently do not have their links with the texts other than this book. It does not imply that no intertextual references were merged rather the significant point is that as regards the term ‘chain or networks of texts’, no clues were found establishing the link of the five selected texts with other texts forming them the part of the chain or network of social events. The representation of social events has been presented in detail in the last section of the analysis.

‘Genre’, is another dimension worth investigating within CDA. I also gained insights into this particular perspective.

4.2.2 Genre

The five texts under study belong to ‘Sufi Discourse’ with their own peculiar and descriptive analytical tone. They are analytical work of Schimmel whose aim was to unleash the Sufi and cultural underpinnings through her analytical faculties. The texts are descriptive with no traces of evident ‘genre mixing’. The researcher witnessed throughout the five texts that the same type of genre in terms of Sufi discourse in descriptive text has been developed and no other genre was seen merged within it. All the five descriptive texts do not form their association with any other genre of discourse. All the five texts of *Pain and Grace* are an interpretive work of Schimmel who shares insights from Shah Abul Latif Bhitai’s poetic discourse by analyzing various aspects employing her critical faculties.
Investigating how other voices are merged within the texts and significant aspects of their attribution are some of the major inquiries of my work. I explored significant instances of intertextual references within the five selected texts which are as under:

4.2.3 Intertextuality

Intertextual traces seem to be evident throughout the five texts of Pain and Grace. However, most of the references are indirectly quoted and seem to be merged in texts in a good proportion. Direct quotations were also witnessed but their frequency was observed lesser as compared to the indirect references.

In Text 1, the researcher witnessed the references of ‘theme of Sassui’-a folktale character with deep rooted impacts on Sindhi local culture. I further observed the influx of this theme over the entire Sindhi local culture. The way this very theme was constructed within the text is representative of Schimmel’s grasp over the cultural norms of Sind. The ideological perspectives are also significant within this construction of Sindhi local culture as this very theme has deep imprints on the soil of Sind. Therefore, ‘theme of Sassui’ has been the center of focus in the cultural studies. A very powerful intertextual reference that is ‘Quranic Imagery of God’ sets the tone and dimension of the text and makes it more valid and reliable. Again, the religious perspective which is deeply embedded in the culture of Sind has been touched upon by Schimmel. Religion and culture both have strong connections within the cultural norms especially this connection gets stronger when it comes to Sindhi local culture. Schimmel has merged this reference within the text being mindful of the prominence of religious themes within local culture. The reference of ‘pigeon in high Persian poetry’ is another example which takes us back to the times when the source of conveying messages and letters was pigeon/kang (crow), an attribute of the rich Sindhi local culture. This very theme has gained greater acclaim within common folk; therefore, the writers belonging to the soil gave this very theme significant space in their works especially the poets frequently referred to this theme. ‘Sindhi folk songs’ and mystical poetry have also been highlighted. The researcher witnessed that this text is rich in cultural traces as many of the themes employed within the text are very close to the masses and therefore, become integral part of local culture. Powerful intertextual references of ‘Prophet’s
(PBUH) kindness’, ‘Muhammad’s (PBUH) grace’ and ‘powerful rulers of Sind’ have been incorporated within the text. Reverence with the Prophet (PBUH) though is an integral part of the faith of every Muslim and this theme is a universal one but the level of esteem can be witnessed in Sindhi local culture to a great extent. Therefore, insights into Bhitai’s poetry and Schimmel’s analytical work reflect such references. The reference to grace of the Holy Prophet (PBUH), though is a religious perspective but it is significant here that the love of the Prophet (PBUH) becomes inseparable from the local cultural values and reference to this very theme can be traced in all the Sufi works. Sufi works were very close within the masses, thus becoming inseparable from local culture. Schimmel while employing these powerful intertextual references, which have a great impact on the ideologies and beliefs of the people, tries to give more validity to her work.

As regards the construction of these themes, ideological and cultural aspects are more prominent but power relations also become significant in a sense that the Sufi beliefs and themes constructed through Sufi poetry also directly affect the beliefs of the folk through powerful appeal of a very strong poetic discourse. Further, Schimmel’s employment of intertextual references within her analytical discourse which she did of Sufi poetry, also exploits the power relations. This strategy was employed to make her discourse more convincing.

The issue of attribution of these intertextual references within Text 1 becomes significant as they are not attributed to a specific person rather unspecifically attributed. However, authorial voice seems to be more powerful as she integrates the entire intertextual references reporting them indirectly. It is also pertinent here to mention that being a Western scholar; she develops a keen sense of the religious and cultural themes which are deeply embedded within the culture. The author seems to have acquired reasonable skills in merging and texturing the references with her own influx over them. The element of subjectivity, though is quite dominant here but with the inclusion of the powerful intertextual references, she is able to form somewhat objective impression as well, clearly conveying that not only she is convinced of the prominence of the themes rather many other writers have also given a considerable space to these significant issues in their works.
Text 2 is also rich in intertextual references. Powerful intertextual references of the prominent saints of the early Sufism ‘Dhu‘n-Nun’ and ‘Abu Hamid Ghazali’ set the tone of the text. It is significant here that the works of these great Sufi Scholars are widely quoted and their stature within Sufi settings is also widely accepted. So, it is quite obvious that the voice of such great scholars reached the masses and had an influx on the local culture through their disciples who further conveyed their message of love and peace. Further, standing of the ‘houris’ in full etiquette (a beautiful feminine creature promised by Almighty Allah to be rewarded to the pious ones) is another strong intertextual reference which adds more validity to the text and contains attribution of many of the beliefs of the believers attached with houris in paradise. Again the ideological perspectives were exploited by Schimmel to strongly convey her message. Inclusion of this theme also refers to the local culture as it is directly attached with ideological perspective pertaining to the common folk. At the same time, the writer, developing a thorough grasp over the theme handles it tactfully. Direct quotation of a hadith (saying of the Holy Prophet (PBUH) ‘Verily God is beautiful and loves beauty’ enriches the text exponentially. Schimmel is aware of maneuvering the religious scriptures to effectively convey her discourse. Again, it is remarkable that being a Western scholar, she not only develops the sound sense of Islamic beliefs rather skillfully embeds the religious themes and constructs culture through her discourse. ‘Marui’, ‘Marus’ and ‘Omar’s Castle’ do contain plenty of historical and cultural underpinnings traced through Sindhi folklores which constitute Sindhi culture with all its historical profundity. The ideological perspectives she is able to construct though her discourse reflect the imprints of these widely told and retold folk stories on local masses. Intertextual references of ‘Sassui’ and her beloved who was carried away by the ‘Balochis’ also take one back to the times when the folklore of ‘Sassui and Punhun’ sprouted in the soil of Sind. The intertextual references of Sassui and Punhun again have deep imprints on local cultural settings and therefore, their mention gives the text strength in terms of its validity. ‘Kech’ and ‘Attar’s successors’ again are the references which are the reminiscent of rich cultural and mystical traditions. Kech is the reference which can be found within folk poetic traditions and has great relevance in terms of the ideologies of the masses. Even, many a times this very word has been employed as a metaphor by poets and writers. The common folk have a clear comprehension of this term. Attar’s name is a powerful reference from Sufi settings and the Sufis were very close to the masses, therefore, the reflection of their message can be traced within the local cultural norms. ‘Mantiq ut-tair’ of ‘Attar’ and
Pilgrim’s Progress of ‘J. Bunyan’ are few more strong intertextual references which add more strength to the text. Schimmel, not only employs references from the Islamic religious and Sufi settings to effectively convey her message, rather inclusion of the reference of a Western scholar gives more strength and diversity to her work.

It is pertinent to mention here that the attribution of most of these references is not at a specific level rather they are unspecifically attributed. Here, again the authorial voice seems to be more influential despite the presence of plenty of indirect references. The appropriate placement of these intertextual references is indicative of Schimmel’s technique and skill. Author’s control over the text can well be witnessed through the finesse she creates in integrating the references in a good proportion.

Text 3 is also rich in powerful intertextual references. Strong intertextual reference of ‘Indo-Persian mystical and profane poetry’ signifies the influx of such poetry over the local culture and Sufi poetry. Though the impacts of mysticism were universally acknowledged but their special effects can well be investigated within Indo-Pak Sufi traditions and also within Persian culture. Both soils produced leading Sufi figures and Sufi poetry also sprouted from these places. Therefore, the impacts of this poetry can well be investigated though the culture. ‘Court poets of India during the 17th and 18th centuries’ and ‘Ghalib’s verse’ clearly suggest their impact on poetic themes merged in cultural settings. Strengthening the theme of ‘qurbani’, (sacrifice) the intertextual references of ‘Blut-und-Wunden poetry of the Christian Church’ and ‘Indian temples and shrines’ have been employed. Furthermore, ‘Rumi’s verse’ and ‘Persian and Turkish poetry’ also highlight the same theme. Again, through inclusion of the powerful intertextual references, not only from Islamic Sufi settings but also from other religions’ concept of Sufism, the writer’s diverse approach while investigating Sufi themes and her command over the Sufi discourse was also investigated. The intertextual references of ‘crows and dogs of Kech’ are few other culturally enriched references often found in the folklores signifying their deep rooted traces. These references have been widely quoted among the folk-writers and therefore they are deeply embedded within local culture and the common folk develop a sound sense and close association with these terms. Again, these references have a strong association with the ideological perspectives. A very powerful intertextual reference of the ‘legends of Husain ibn
Mansur al-Hallaj’ and his words which have been directly quoted: ‘Kindness is from Him, but suffering is He Himself’ sets the tone of the text to another level. Hallaj’s presence in ‘Indus Valley in 905’, his words ‘Ana’l haqq’ and his fame in ‘Persian tradition’ was also witnessed as dominant intertextual references within the text. The intertextual reference of Hallaj is so powerful that it has grabbed the attention of various Sufis and the reference to his widely quoted ‘Ana’l haqq’ can be found within many writers from Sufi and non-Sufi traditions. The cultural reference to this theme is also supreme as the common folk develop understanding of this very theme through the teachings of the legendary Sufis. Intertextual reference of ‘Sindhi folk poetry’ also emphasizes the same aspect of sacrifice which has already been brought into limelight throughout the text.

So, exploitation of intertextual references by Schimmel creates an authorial intervention. Despite many of the intertextual references have been placed together, the authorial voice is still discernible and quite prominent; the reason being the appropriate placement of the references. Power relations, the most significant aspect in CDA were inferred through the skilful exploitation of intertextual references within the analytical discourse to make Schimmel’s discourse effective and prominent.

In Text 4, the intertextual references of the tragic love story of ‘Sohni and Mehar’, a famous folktale with diverse cultural underpinnings, set the tone of the text. Association of these references with the common folk is stronger, therefore, these references establish deep cultural impacts. Deep familiarity of Schimmel with these prominent figures of the Sindhi folktales is also significant here for the researcher as being a Western scholar, her deep understanding of the local cultural themes is indeed remarkable. So, the authorial voice becomes more powerful as she constructs these local cultural aspects through her Sufi discourse. Powerful intertextual references of ‘Bhambhore’ and ‘Kech’ attach deeper meanings with plenty of historical and cultural footings. The historical label attached with these two significant places which acquired greater acclaim within the masses, is also important here. The references of the folktales of ‘Sassui Punhun’ and ‘Laila Majnun’ sprouting from the soil of Sind have been incorporated within the text giving the text more strength in terms of its validity. The characters of these widely read, told and retold stories have deeper imprints on the local culture rather these
folktales acquired universal acclaim. Again these intertextual references comprise ideological perspectives which establish a link with the beliefs of the people. The references of ‘Persian and Turkish traditions’ were incorporated to convincingly portray the character of Majnun—a character whose passionate love has been idealized by many among the masses and, therefore, has emerged to be an iconic figure within local culture.

The indirect reporting of the references is indicative of the prominence of the authorial voice as she maneuvers these intertextual references with the impact of her own subjectivity. Power relations in discursively constructing the powerful and convincing themes of Sufi poetic discourse are also significant aspects of enquiry. Schimmel’s peculiar style is evident through merging of the intertextual references. Again the placement and merging of the intertextual references becomes significant as the researcher may well trace the prominence of the authorial voice. The frequency of indirect references is greater than the direct ones clearly suggesting the maneuvering of the concepts with the authorial influx on them. Significant aspect is to investigate that despite being thoroughly alienated to the cultural norms, Schimmel not only developed a fair sense of the Sufi themes but also through extensive studies developed a comprehensive idea about the poetic styles and traditions.

Text 5 is also rich in intertextual references which give a greater strength to the Sufi discourse making it more valid. The powerful intertextual reference of the famous folktale of ‘Lila Chanesar’ takes us back to the 14th century referring to one of the Summa Rulers ‘Jam Chanesar’ and her ‘spoiled and pleasure loving wife, Lila’. The traces of this folktale may well be investigated within local culture and their impacts are evident through the beliefs and ideologies of the masses. The characters of this folktale form a deeper association within the masses, thus becoming an integral part of the local cultural settings. Powerful references of ‘Sindhi and Persian’ languages support the assertion of the popularity of the folktale across various cultures. Leading Sufi figures from Sindhi and Persian languages have acquired universal acclaim and the essence of the language through which they conveyed their message was felt within the Persian and Sindhi traditions. Another significant reference to ‘Mumal Rano’—a famous folktale which originated in ‘15th century’ ‘Lower Sind’, conveys deeper historical and cultural perspectives. The next significant intertextual reference takes the reader
back to the ‘14th century’ and reminds him of the ‘Marui’ of ‘Thar desert’ and ‘mighty Omar of Omarkot’ where another celebrated folktale of ‘Omar Marui’ gained acclaim among the folk. Again the essence of these tales and their impacts can be investigated through the ideological perspectives. The common folk develop a close association with the all-time adorable characters of these folktales which are embedded in the local cultural norms. Intertextual references of ‘Nuri Jam Tamachi’-another famous folktale of ‘15th century’ and Quranic reference of ‘nafs mutma’inna’ attributed to Nuri’s peace of mind, contain strong historical, religious, mystic and cultural insights. It is important here that in order to strongly convey her message, Schimmel not only heavily relies on the historical references but also on the religious concepts. Intertextual reference of the brave ‘Morirro’ who slayed the whale that had killed his six brothers again refers to another folktale deeply enriched in Sindhi culture. The researcher also investigated the direct quoting of the translation of the poetic discourse referring to the ‘shark of desire’ which gives more strength to the text.

The authorial interventions are worth investigating as despite the placement of other voices, Schimmel’s voice still remains distinctive. This is indicative of the skill which she employs in merging all the intertextual references within the text and tries to achieve the desired targets. The construction of local culture through inclusion of intertextual references is also important. She merges other voices within the text to give prominence to the text but her own voice can still be differentiated from others. CDA’s concerns towards power and ideological aspects were skillfully constructed within Schimmel’s convincing analytical and interpretive discourse and through the inclusion of powerful intertextual references.

I further probed into semantic and grammatical relations between sentences and clauses which is one of the prominent aspects of textual analysis extracted from Fairclough’s three dimensional model. It is pertinent here that within ‘micro analysis’, all the instances of various grammatical relations were extracted and highlighted but the interpretation of their presence may not require explication. Fairclough (2003) while providing a model of analysis does not go into details of micro analysis rather just highlights the grammatical relations. The micro analysis is presented as under:
4.2.4 Semantic/Grammatical Relations between Sentences and Clauses

Many of the semantic and grammatical relations were witnessed within the texts which may be significant as regards different social issues like ‘legitimation’ and relations of ‘equivalence’ and ‘difference’ (as explicated in Fairclough 2003). Evidences/examples for Embedded Relations, Causal Relations, Contrastive Relations, Additive Relations, Relations of Elaboration, Paratactical and Hypotactical Relations were found within the five texts under study.

4.2.4.1 Embedded Relations

I begin by quoting the examples of Embedded Relations in Text 1. As many as seven evidences of Embedded Relations traced in Text 1 are given below:

i) “. . . . the Yogis who walk from the village of Ganji Takar . . .”
ii) “. . . . A topic which is not rarely found in the poetry of Sind . . .”
iii) “. . . . feelings of the loving woman who sends out the crow . . .”
iv) “. . . . the song of the swan who is admonished not to fly . . .”
v) “. . . . man’s soul is seen as wandering minstrel who is kindly treated by the ruler of Las Bela . . .”
vi) “. . . . powerful rulers of Sind who in the end appear to be symbols of Muhammad’s (PBUH) grace . . .”
vii) “. . . . the soul which is busy with the constant recollections of God is obvious . . .”

Text 2 comprises as many as five examples of Embedded Relations:

i) “. . . . a favorite hadith with the Sufis, which may also be intended when Marui, after months of imprisonment in Omar’s castle complains . . .”
ii) “. . . . and dares not go back to the Marus, who are so beautiful that only the lovely ones are acceptable in their presence.”
iii) “. . . . the divine Beloved’s dialogues, which cannot be properly translated into human words.”
v) “Bhambore, where the beloved had once appeared to her . . .”
v) “Only those who are completely naked . . .”
Text 3 comprises as many as three examples of Embedded Relations:

i) “. . . an idea often repeated by the court poets of India during the 17th and 18th centuries, **who** indulged in the description of this kind . . .”

ii) “Indeed we may assume that the image of Hallaj, **who** had wandered through the Indus valley in 905 . . .”

iii) “. . . made him also the model case of the lover **who** divulged the secret of love . . .”

In Text 4, as many as seven examples of Embedded Relations were found out:

i) “The topic of the sea, or river, with its whirlpools and sandbanks forms also the center of the next Sur, **which** bears the name of Sohni . . .”

ii) “. . . swims every night to the island **where** her beloved Mehar grazes the buffalos.”

iii) “One night her sister-in-law replaces the jar, **which** she uses as a sort of swimming vest . . .”

iv) “But even more famous is the story **which** Shah Latif has made the subject of the following five Surs . . .”

v) “. . . she runs in despair through desert and forests **where** blue snakes and other frightening creatures live.”

vi) “This tragic story becomes for Shah the parable of the seeker on the mystical path **who** undergoes all kinds of tribulations in the quest of God . . .”

vii) “. . . the Arabic Majnun **who** demented by his longing for Laila, is taken by the mystics of the Persian and Turkish traditions . . .”

Text 5 comprises the following four examples of Embedded Relations:

i) “. . . united with the beloved **whose** light she knows and recognizes everywhere.

ii) “. . . Thar desert, **where** the mighty Omar of Omarkot kidnapped her.”

iii) “. . . the image of the dangerous, merciless sea with its monsters **which** swallow the fishermen . . .”

iv) “. . . Sindhi reader will remember the story of brave Morirro **who** slayed the whale that had killed his six brothers.”
Embedded Relation is a significant attribute of grammatical relations in which one clause is embedded within the other and it functions as an element of another. In all the above instances demonstrating embedded relations, the author has employed this tool to be more effective in conveying her message with brevity. All the above cited examples are significant in terms of containing local cultural and ideological clues embedded together to collectively portray a strong impact.

Further, instances of additive relations, as an effective tool of enquiry in CDA, were highlighted. Instances extracted from all the five texts are as under:

4.2.4.2 Additive Relations
There are three evidences of Additive Relations in Text 1:

i) “. . . . does not rely as much on folk tradition as some other Surs, whereas Sur Ripa, a short song, describes in impressive images . . .”

ii) “. . . . spinning of cotton, one of the most important occupations of women. This is the theme of Kapa’iti . . .”

iii) “In Sur Purab, ‘East’, the poet describes the feelings of the loving woman who sends out the crow to find out how the beloved is; the crow, kang, is the typical messenger bird in Sind.”

Through employment of Additive Relations within clauses and sentences, Schimmel gives more strength to the first clause by giving it further extension. In the first example, description of Sur Ripa is an extension of the first clause. In the second example also, the second clause adds further to the first clause which mentions theme of spinning of cotton. In third example, description of the messenger bird kang, was seen as an added aspect in the first clause where the researcher just found the passing reference of kang.
Text 2 contains as many as two examples of Additive Relations:

i) “Why then, spend the few nights of life in sleep instead of enjoying the friend’s sweet discourse? This constant admonition to remain awake is derived from the classical Sufi tradition.”

ii) “. . . every moment of slumber can cause damage to the boat. And will there not be enough lonely nights in the lonely graves?”

In the first example, the concept of remaining awake in the first clause is further supported by the additional feature in the clause to follow where this concept is further linked with classical Sufi tradition. In the second instance, the same concept has further been discussed where slumber was mentioned as a damaging factor. In the clause to follow, a striking question has been raised which also strengthens the Sufi theme of remaining awake.

Text 3 comprises as many as two examples of Additive Relations:

i) “. . . so that he feels the friend’s hand a bit longer—a idea often repeated by the court poets of India . . .”

ii) “. . . that the beloved is a butcher dealing in lover’s hearts and livers, not to mention the innumerable verses in Persian and Turkish poetry . . .”

The first instance is an obvious example of the Additive Relations where the second clause acts as an extension of the previous one extending the theme set prior to it. In the second example, the mention of the references from Persian and Turkish poetry further adds to the cruel aspect of the beloved discussed in the previous clause.

Only one instance of Additive Relations was traced in Text 4:

i) “. . . she runs in despair through desert and forests where blue snakes and other frightening creatures live:-snakes are here, as in traditional religious imagery, symbols of the devil . . .”
In this sole example, the description of one of the frightening creature in the second clause is an added aspect in the previous clause.

As many as two examples of Additive Relations were found out in Text 5:

i) “Another folktale of similar character is that of Mumal Rano which forms the basis of following Sur; it originated in Lower Sind sometime in the 15th century . . .”

ii) “Sur Marui goes back to an historical event in the 14th century; the home of the heroine is located in Thar desert . . .”

In the first example, further description of the folktale of Mumal Rano was traced in the second clause where through employment of Additive Relations more valid information was added within the sentence. Likewise in the second example, the second clause is an additional aspect attached to the previous clause.

The researcher witnessed that Schimmel, through employment of Additive Relations, is capable of conveying her message strongly. Further, this technique also gives the discourse a tinge of brevity and comprehensiveness which are very effective tools in bringing about desired results and giving strength to the entire discourse. Moreover, within the instances taken from all the five texts, the entire local cultural and ideological underpinnings were further strengthened and explored through employment of this effective tool of enquiry which may also be seen as a semantic tool of enquiry.

After highlighting the instances of additive relations, I proceed towards another very effective tool of enquiry employed in CDA i.e., Relations of Elaboration. All the significant instances of the ‘Relations of Elaboration’ are given as under:

### 4.2.4.3 Relations of Elaboration

**Text 1** contains two examples of Relations of Elaboration:

i) “. . . . and suffer every possible discomfort. They are further described in detail.”

ii) “Sur Dahar gives in its first chapter a fine description of the dried up tree, a common sight in the valley of the ever-shifting Indus and its tributaries.”
The researcher witnessed that the very objective of the Relations of Elaboration is to justify and further explicate the first part of the sentence. Most of the writers employ this technique to legitimize the statement they put forward in the first part of the sentence or within the first sentence; the second clause or sentence serves to justify or legitimize the earlier one. Within the above mentioned sentences, the writer creates a kind of assertion to effectively convey her message.

As many as three instances of Relations of Elaboration in Text 2 are mentioned below:

i) “. . . . and to remember the Lord, by performing the nightly prayers or constant dhikr, as it was Sufi custom from the very beginning of Islamic mystical life.”

ii) “. . . . the tariqa, the path to perform the pilgrimage, as it has been described by so many mystical poets in East and West . . .”

iii) “The Sindhi poet stands here in the line of Attar’s successors-similar to the birds in Mantiq ut-tair . . .”

Again the Relations of Elaboration were employed by Schimmel to facilitate the reader and also create a certain level of assertion within the sentence. In the first example the practice of dhikr in the first clause of the sentence has been further justified in the second clause with an argument that this practice has been a custom since long. In the second example, the path to perform pilgrimage was justified with the assertion that many mystical poets from the East and the West explicated the tariqa. A very effective way of elaboration was witnessed in the third instance where the Sindhi poets who are declared as Attar’s successors have been compared to birds in Mantiq ut-tair.

Text 3 comprises as many as three examples of Relations of Elaboration:

i) “In Shah Latif’s poetry, however this emphasis on suffering leads to most cruel descriptions of the fate of the lover, faithful to the tradition of Indo-Persian mystical and profane poetry.”

ii) “. . . . how heads and limbs are being cooked in a kettle; one is reminded of Rumi’s verse . . .”
iii) “The gallows are, as Shah Latif says, the bridal bed for the lover, the place where he can enjoy union with the beloved . . .”

In the first example, the fate of the lover mentioned in Shah Latif’s poetry has been further elaborated in the second part of the clause. In the second example, also the phenomenon of cooking of heads and limbs was briefly summed up in the second clause where Rumi’s depiction of the same theme was also highlighted. The phase of gallows in the third example is further explicated in the second part of the clause where gallows were declared as the place of union with the beloved; referring to Almighty Allah.

**Text 4** comprises only one instance of Relations of Elaboration:

i) “Shah’s chapters deal with her search for the beloved: following the tracks of Punhun’s camels, she runs in despair through deserts and forests . . .”

Sassui’s longings and her search in the first part of sentence were further portrayed in the second part of the sentence where the description of this search has been further elaborated. Schimmel employed this technique to acquire a certain level of assertion and command within the text.

**Text 5** also contains only one example of Relations of Elaboration:

i) “Nuri makes the prince happy by her perfect surrender and obedience which causes him to raise her above all the other queens: she is the nafs mutma’inna, ‘the soul at peace’, returning to her Lord.”

Nuri’s status portrayed in the first part of the sentence was further comprehensively sketched and elaborated within the second part of the sentence where she has been described as ‘the soul at peace’ which is the outcome of perfect surrender before her Lord. Schimmel through employing the Relations of Elaboration tries to comprehensively convey the theme to the reader. At the same time, her grasp over the entire Sufi theme was also traced from these established Relations of Elaboration.

It is significant that within all the instances through employment of relations of elaboration, the most significant object of ‘legitimation’ was tried to acquire. In this regard, ‘legitimation’ was created through ‘rationalization’ and the relations of elaboration were found the most
effective tool to legitimate and rationalize various cultural and ideological relations present within the instances.

Evident traces of the next tool of enquiry i.e., ‘contrastive relations’ were also observed within the selected five texts which are presented as under:

**4.2.4.4 Contrastive Relations**

As many as two instances of Contrastive Relations were seen in **Text 1**:

i) “It is filled with mystical wisdom and poetical imagery, but does not rely as much on folk tradition as some other Surs.”

ii) “Its importance has often been underlined in Sindhi folk songs and mystical poetry. But out of this first touching verse Shah turns once more to the Yogis . . .”

**Text 2** has the following one instance of Contrastive Relations:

i) “Had Sassui not slept comfortably, how would the Balochis have carried away her beloved? But the same warning can be applied to the seafaring merchants as well . . .”

Two instances of Contrastive Relations were witnessed in **Text 3**:

i) “She wishes that the crows of Kech, where her beloved dwells, may pluck and eat her flesh, or else that the dogs of Kech should eat her, an image which leads the poet to the idea of soul-dog. But the lover has other wishes, too, in order to suffer even more.”

ii) “Did he not ecstatically say: Ana’l-haqq, ‘I am the absolute Truth’? But this word (which was not, as legend has it, an enthusiastic cry but the quintessence of his thinking and feeling) made him also the model case of the lover . . .”

**Text 4** comprises as many as two instances of Contrastive Relations:

i) “Sohni is one of the favorite folktales in both Sind and the Panjab. But even more famous is the story which Shah Latif has made the subject of the following five Surs . . .”
ii) “At the end of numerous complicated adventures he stayed with Sassui, but his relatives came one night, made the couple drunk . . .”

Only one example of Contrastive Relations was traced in Text 5:

i) “. . . the home of the heroine is located in Thar desert, where the mighty Omar of Omarkot kidnapped her. But the lovely maiden refuses to become the nobleman’s wife . . .”

It is important here that through contrastive relations, relations of ‘difference’ were highlighted. Two contrastive aspects present within two clauses and sentences were separated through a connector ‘but’ in which two contrastive and different themes were joined together asserting the element of their contrast and difference. It is also significant that all the cultural and ideological perspectives embedded within this instance, extracted from folk settings, were highlighted demonstrating the relevant contrastive features.

After investigating the contrastive relations, I further proceed to ‘Causal Relations’—a significant tool of enquiry within CDA focusing on micro analysis which involves textual inquiries. The instances of causal relations witnessed within five selected texts of Pain and Grace are presented as under:

4.2.4.5 Causal Relations

One example of Causal Relations was found within Text 1:

i) “The heart has to be refined and prepared with utmost care so that the spinning soul will not be rejected by the merchant.”

Causal Relations of Purpose is an effective technique to maintain the relations of cause and effect and also the problem-solution relations. In the above mentioned example, the same relation was established.
Text 2 comprises following three instances of Causal Relations.

i) “There is no end to true love, because there is no end to the beauty of beloved . . .”
ii) “. . . . they have lost their husbands because they stretched out their feet in their beds.”
iii) “The nightly vigils were always considered a great boon for the lovers, for in these lonely hours they could continue spiritual conversations with the divine Beloved . . .”

In all the three examples presented above, the clauses have been connected through connectors i.e., ‘because’ and ‘for’, establishing a causal relation within them.

Text 3 comprises following two instances of Causal Relations:

i) “The knife with which the beloved cuts his throat should be blunt so that he feels the friend’s hand a bit longer.”
ii) “The beloved kills poor Sassui ‘like a little goat’, and her designation as qaribani, ‘the near one’, may well be intended as a pun on qurbani, ‘a sacrifice,’ for all lovers are sacrificed like animals slaughtered at the festival of pilgrimage.”

In the first example, the reason for suggestion of keeping the beloved’s knife blunt was established within the second clause maintaining a causal relation among them. While in the second example, the reason for the sacrifice of Sassui was maintained through a solid justification in the clause to follow.

No instance of Causal Relations was traced in Text 4.

Text 5 comprises only one example of Causal Relations of Purpose:

i) “. . . . describes how the queen has to become a slave in order to be accepted by the Lord.”

In this sole example, a solution has been presented in the first clause. Complete surrender has been suggested to develop closeness with the Lord.
All the embedded aspects pertaining to local culture and ideological perspectives were presented within all the five selected texts through causal relations. Their role was pertinent in exploring the ‘problem-solution’ and ‘cause and effect’ relations within the texts.

The next phase of enquiry pertains to the enquiry of the significant paratactical relations within the text which pertains to the micro analysis involving textual dimensions. The significant paratactical relations are given as under:

4.2.4.6 Paratactical Relations

One instance of Paratactical Relations was observed in Text 1:

i) “. . . . its importance has often been underlined in Sindhi folk songs and mystical poetry. But out of the first touching verse, Shah turns once more to the Yogis.”

Text 2 comprises following two examples of Paratactical Relations:

i) “When he walks out of his house earth and heaven are delighted, and houris stand in silent admiration and confusion . . .”

ii) “. . . . the world can serve, for a short while, as the place of Divine manifestations, but once the soul is deprived of this vision due to her own laziness and heedlessness, it is impossible to find the beloved in this place . . .”

Text 3 has three evident instances of Paratactical Relations:

i) “. . . . an image which leads the poet to the idea of the soul-dog. But the lover has other wishes, too . . .”

ii) “Did he not ecstatically say: Ana’l-haqq, ‘I am the absolute Truth’? But this word (which was not, as legend has it, an enthusiastic cry but the quintessence of his thinking and feeling) made him also the model case of the lover . . .”

iii) “The beloved kills poor Sassui ‘like a little goat’, and her designation as qaribani, ‘the near one,’ may well be intended as a pun on qurbani . . .”
Text 4 comprises as many as four instances of Paratactic Relations:

i) “. . . the jar, which she uses as a sort of a swimming vest, by a vessel of unbaked clay, and she dies in the whirling waves.”

ii) “. . . when the vessel of her body breaks and she, faithful to her pre-eternal love-covenant with Mehar, will be forever united with the friend through death.”

iii) “The fame of her beauty spread widely, and eventually even Punhun, the Baloch prince of Kech, decided to see her.”

iv) “. . . in the quest of God whom he will find, at the end of the road, in his own heart, and Sassui, roaming in the wilderness and talking to the beasts, becomes something like a feminine counterpart of the Arabic Majnun . . .”

Two examples of Paratactic Relations can be traced in Text 5:

i) “Furious that he had been ‘sold’ Chanesar divorces Lila, and she has to undergo a long process of purification until she is once more acceptable in her husband’s presence.”

ii) “The home of the heroine is located in Thar desert, where the mighty Omar of Omarkot kidnapped her. But the lovely maiden refuses to become the nobleman’s wife . . .”

In all the above cited instances extracted from the five selected texts, grammatically equal or coordinate clauses are indicative of paratactical relations present within them. The underlined coordinating conjunction is separating both the independent clauses with no element of subordination traced within them. All the prominent aspects pertaining to local culture and ideological underpinnings have been merged within these independent clauses.

Enquiry of hypotactic relations is also a significant dimension within ‘micro analysis’ of Fairclough’s three dimensional model. This aspect also is a significant dimension of textual analysis. The significant instances of hypotactic relations within the five selected texts are as under:
4.2.4.7 Hypotactic Relations

Only one instance of Hypotactic Relations is evident between sentences and clauses of **Text 1**:

i) “The heart has to be refined and prepared with utmost care so that the spinning soul will not be rejected by the merchant.”

**Text 2** contains three instances of Hypotactic Relations.

i) “There is no end to true love, because there is no end to the beauty of beloved . . .”

ii) “. . . they have lost their husbands because they stretched out their feet in their beds.”

iii) “The nightly vigils were always considered a great boon for the lovers, for in these lonely hours they could continue spiritual conversations with the divine Beloved . . .”

**Text 3** comprises following two examples of Hypotactic Relations:

i) “The knife with which the beloved cuts his throat should be blunt so that he feels the friend’s hand a bit longer.”

ii) “The beloved kills poor Sassui ‘like a little goat’, and her designation as qaribani, ‘the near one’, may well be intended as a pun on qurbani, ‘a sacrifice,’ for all lovers are sacrificed like animals slaughtered at the festival of pilgrimage.”

No instance of Hypotactic Relations was traced in **Text 4**.

**Text 5** comprises only one example of Hypotactic Relations:

i) “. . . describes how the queen has to become a slave in order to be accepted by the Lord.”

Within the above cited instances of Hypotactical Relations, one clause acted as a subordinate to another, the main clause. Within these instances, all the prominent instances pertaining to ideological and cultural dimensions were found embedded within one independent and another subordinate clause.
In order to expose ideological underpinnings, ‘assumptions’ were the appropriate tools of enquiry. Prominent instances of assumptions traced within five selected texts are as under:

4.2.5 Assumptions

The close study of all the five selected texts of *Pain and Grace* shows that the Existential and Value Assumptions were common while Propositional Assumptions were nowhere found.

4.2.5.1 Value Assumptions

As many as three examples of ‘Value Assumptions’ pointing towards what is desirable were witnessed in Text 1. ‘Evaluation’ is another term for them in CDA. Value Assumptions found within Text 1 are:

i) “Sur Ripa, a short song, describes in **impressive images** the longings of the lonely wife for her husband.”

ii) “Inserted between the two songs in praise of the Yogis as ‘perfect men’ in *Sur Barvo Sindhi*.”

iii) “. . . . which expresses the deep veneration of the poet for his **beautiful and mysterious, powerful and mild, divine Lord**.”

In the first example, the authorial voice with her beliefs and ideologies was investigated. ‘Impressive images’ is indicative of the value judgment on the part of the author which she expresses after having examined *Sur Ripa* extensively. At the same time, the subjectivity of the author may well be seen through this value assumption. Again, in the second example, another’s value assumption clearly showing the ideologies of the author attached with the theme of Yogis by declaring them as ‘perfect men’ was observed. Obvious clues of the belief system of the author attached with the divine Lord were witnessed in the third example which is a value judgment on the part of the author.

Two examples of Value assumptions stating what is desirable were traced in Text 2:
i) “. . . . and the houris stand in silent admiration and confusion *in full etiquette*.”

ii) “. . . . the soul sullied by the dirt and dust of this world, has to undergo thorough purification before she is allowed to return into the presence of the *eternally beautiful Lord*.”

The researcher inferred the presence of ‘Value Assumption’ through the phrase ‘in full etiquette’ explicating the ideological attachment of the author with the concept of houris. The second example also gives the clue about the ideologies of the author associated with the concept of Lord whom she describes as ‘eternally beautiful Lord’ clearly extending a value assumption.

**Text 3** comprises one instance of Value Assumption:

i) “In *Kalyan*, the most purely mystical song in the Risalo, the initiate is told to roast his flesh over the skewer.”

After having extensively investigated *Kalyan*, the author attaches her value judgment with the song to be the most pure once again adding subjectivity with the theme.

As many as two instances of Value Assumptions were found out in **Text 4**:

i) “. . . . she, faithful to her *pre-eternal love-covenant* with Mehar, will be forever united with the friend through death.”

ii) “It is the *intriguing story* of Sassui . . .”

Again after having investigated the love story of Mehar, Schimmel attaches her ideologies with the statement in the form of a value assumption declaring it as pre-eternal love-covenant. It is pertinent here that the folktale of Mehar has deeper impacts on local cultural settings. In the second example, value assumption may well be traced when Schimmel describes Sassui’s story as the intriguing story as she could trace underhand schemes and plots merged within the story of Sassui. Again, Schimmel is subjective in giving her value judgments and expresses her ideologies related with the story.

**Text 5** also comprises two examples of Value Assumptions:
Schimmel gives vent to her ideologies attached with the story of Chanesar and Lila after having probed into it. The value assumption creates a complete image of Lila whom Schimmel declares as spoiled and pleasure loving person. The cultural aspects can also be investigated within the story of Chanesar and Lila as the links of this story may well be found within Sindhi local cultural settings. In the second example, after having analyzed the story of Nuri and Prince Jam Tamachi, the author forms a clear image of Nuri and refers to her ‘perfect surrender and obedience’ before the Prince through her value assumption. The cultural and ideological perspectives are both important within this example. The deep impacts of the folktale of ‘Nuri Jam Tamachi’ are quite evident in Sindhi local cultural settings where its impacts can be examined through the ideologies and beliefs of the common folk. At the same time, subjective value judgment of the author was also clearly noticed.

4.2.5.2 Existential Assumptions

No evident traces of Existential Assumptions were traced in Text 1 while Text 2 comprises two Existential Assumptions marked by the demonstratives and definite articles.

i) “This constant admonition to remain awake is derived from the classical Sufi tradition.

ii) . . . . The nightly vigils were always considered a great boon for the lovers . . .”

In the first example, the author seems to be convinced of the concept of remaining awake to be the part of classical Sufi tradition. Existential assumptions are indicative of the existing values while in the second example, the existing concept of nightly vigils and the association of the author with this particular theme was traced.

No evident instances of Existential Assumptions were found in Text 3.
However, **Text 4** comprises only one example of Existential Assumption marked by a demonstrative:

i) “**This** tragic story becomes for Shah the parable of the seeker on the mystical path . . .”

Here the presence of the demonstrative ‘this’ refers to the existing tragic story. At the same time, she seems to be convinced of the tragedy associated with the story.

The researcher could not trace any evident example of Existential Assumptions in **Text 5**.

In all the above cited instances of assumptions, it was proven that the subjective stance of the author, her beliefs and ideological attachments with various themes were the prominent aspects of enquiry and lent a helping hand to the researcher in finding the relevant dimensions of enquiry for his research study.

Modality, another significant tool of enquiry, was one of the significant dimensions of the aspects of the three-dimensional model put forward by Fairclough. Evident instances reflecting author’s commitment to truth, obligation and necessity were presented in the form of epistemic and deontic modalities which are as under:

### 4.2.6 Modality

A blend of both Epistemic and Deontic Modalities was investigated within all the five selected texts of *Pain and Grace*.

#### 4.2.6.1 Epistemic Modalities

Epistemic modalities seem to be dominant throughout **Text 1**.

i) “It *is* filled with mystical wisdom and poetical imagery.”

ii) “*Sur Khahori* *is* written in praise of the poet.”

iii) “A topic which is not *rarely* found in the poetry of Sind and the Panjab is the spinning of the cotton.”

iv) “*Sur Bilawal* *is probably* the most difficult one to appreciate for a non-Sindhi reader.”
In the first two examples, commitment to truth is quite normal with no modal adverbs and with the use of an unmodalized verb. However, example (iii) contains a modal adverb ‘rarely’ with a denial statement, making the commitment towards truth more firm. In example (iv), the use of ‘probably’ as a modal adverb suggests the ‘median level of commitment’ towards truth.

Epistemic modalities found in Text 2 are as under:

i) “There is no end to true love . . .”

ii) “His beauty is alike to the green garment of the soil . . .”

iii) “The topic of Khwab-i-gh HALF ‘sleep of negligence’ is central in Shah’s poetry . . .”

iv) “Is there any meaning in staying in one’s shabby hut or in the deserted village?”

In the first three examples, commitment to truth was witnessed which is quite normal with no modal adverbs and use of an unmodalized verb. Example (iv) is an interrogative form.

Text 3 comprises one instance of Epistemic Modality:

i) “Shah Abdul Latif is only one of the numerous poets in Sind and the Panjab who have alluded to his sayings and, even more, to his sufferings . . .”

Here the author’s commitment to truth is quite normal with the use of an unmodalized verb. However no modal adverb was seen.

Text 4 comprises as many as four instances of Epistemic Modalities:

i) “This is a tragic love story which reverts the classical motif of Hero and Leander . . .”

ii) “The whole chapter is merely an extension of this dreadful and yet hoped for moment . . .”

iii) “Sohni is one of the favorite folktales in both Sind and the Panjab.”

iv) “It is the intriguing story of Sassui . . .”

In example i), iii) and iv), commitment to truth is quite normal with no modal adverbs and use of an unmodalized verb. However, example (ii) comprises a modal adverb ‘merely’, making the commitment towards truth stronger.
**Text 5** contains as many as two instances of Epistemic Modalities:

i) “Another folktale of similar character is that of Mumal Rano . . .”

ii) “It is the only *Sur* that sings of fulfilled love and happiness . . .”

Commitment to truth is quite normal here with no modal adverbs noticed and an unmodalized verb can be traced.

### 4.2.6.2 Deontic Modalities

Deontic modalities were nowhere seen in **Text 1**. However, following Deontic Modalities were traced in **Text 2**.

i) “One *may* detect here an allusion to the Prophetic allusion . . .”

ii) “‘Verily God is beautiful and loves beauty,’ a favorite hadith with the Sufis, which *may* also be intended . . .”

iii) “But the same warning *can* be applied to the sea-faring merchants as well . . .”

iv) “. . . every moment of slumber *can* cause damage to the boat . . .”

v) “. . . the world *can* serve for a short while, as the place of Divine manifestations . . .”

In the first two examples, ‘*may*’ was employed as a modal verb while in the last three examples ‘*can*’ acts as a modal verb. However no modal adverb was seen in all the examples. The author’s commitment to obligation and necessity can be well traced in all the five examples. As many as four traces of Deontic Modalities can be witnessed in **Text 3**:

i) “. . . and her designation as qaribani, ‘the near one’, *may* well be intended as a pun on *qurbani*, ‘a sacrifice’ . . .”

ii) “She wishes that the crows of *Kech*, where her beloved dwells, *may* pluck and eat her flesh . . .”

iii) “Indeed, we *may* assume that the image of Hallaj, who had wandered through the Indus Valley in 905, has impressed the poets of this part of the Islamic world even more than elsewhere.”
iv) “. . . wherever in this poetry the gallows are mentioned, we can see the shadow of Hallaj, for whom the gallows were the final station on his way to the divine beloved.”

In the first three instances, ‘may’ has been employed as a modal verb while ‘can’ acts as a modal verb in example (iv). However, no modal adverb is witnessed. Author’s commitment to obligation and necessity can well be traced in all the four examples.

**Text 4** comprises two instances of Deontic Modalities.

i) “She, faithful to her pre-eternal love-covenant with Mehar, will be forever united with the friend through death.”

ii) “. . . the parable of the seeker on the mystical path who undergoes all kinds of tribulations in the quest of God whom he will find, at the end of the road, in his own heart . . .”

Here ‘will’ and ‘will be’ have been employed as auxiliary verbs. However no traces of modal adverb can be seen. The author’s commitment to obligation and necessity can well be traced.

As many as two instances of Deontic Modalities were witnessed in **Text 5**:

i) “The following Sur has again a traditional story as its background, e.g., that of Lila Chanesar, which can be dated back to the time of Jam Chanesar . . .”

ii) “. . . the Sindhi reader will remember the story of brave Morirro . . .”

Here ‘will’ and ‘can be’ have been employed as auxiliary/modal verbs. However modal adverb was not witnessed. Again, the author’s commitment to obligation and necessity was noticed.

Though modality is a significant tool of investigation within ‘conversational analysis’, its importance cannot be denied within descriptive texts as finding out author’s commitment to truth, obligation and necessity still is important aspect of enquiry. However, this tool becomes more effective within conversational analysis. A mix of epistemic and deontic modalities were traced within the five selected texts of **Pain and Grace** conveying various ‘levels of commitment’ demonstrated through different ‘markers of modalization’. Schimmel’s subjective
stance and her assertiveness while conveying various cultural and ideological dimensions were traced through this significant tool of enquiry.

Style is another prominent feature of enquiry and while exploring Schimmel’s texts, it becomes more significant as her peculiar style is indicative of various prominent aspects worth enquiry. The investigation conducted on five selected texts of Schimmel is as under:

4.2.7 Styles

In terms of investigating style in Schimmel’s texts, vocabulary and metaphor seem to be most significant. As style is an exclusive matter of ideology, it becomes more significant in the study. While investigating Schimmel’s style, I began by tracing the instances of specific vocabulary employed by her.

4.2.7.1 Specific Vocabulary

Text 1 is marked with the exploitation of specific vocabulary. The authorial voice can well be investigated through the employment of the specific vocabulary. Inclusion of the vocabulary ‘mystical wisdom’ and ‘poetical imagery’ are indicative of the fact that the Sufi themes are worth studying and carry deeper meanings full of wisdom which need to be explored. Similarly, Sufi poetic themes are inclusive of poetic imageries which develop their close association with the common folk. The poetical imageries are also embedded in local cultural settings as many of the folk even learn the poetic discourse by heart and keep on reciting them. Another use of vocabulary ‘folk tradition’ gives a unique dimension to the text as its peculiar structure characterizes author’s style. ‘Impressive images’ shows the affinity of the author with the subject and she becomes judgmental in expressing a value judgment. ‘The longing of the lonely wife’ is a culturally embedded aspect representing the traditional house-wife who desperately longs for her husband quite away from her. These longings of the lonely wife can be reflected in mystical and folk literature especially in poetry. ‘Long winded chapters’ is another beautiful employment of vocabulary which could have been described in a different way but the peculiar style of Schimmel and her subjectivity may well be traced through this special use of vocabulary. The
idea of ‘wandering minstrel’ has further been presented which carries plenty of cultural aspects. Minstrels were the poets and musicians who used to carry a stringed instrument along with them and narrated Sufi themes wandering place to place. ‘Ever shifting Indus’ is another peculiar way of presenting a certain vocabulary. The author may well be reflected through the employment of specific vocabulary. ‘Muhammad’s (PBUH) grace and munificence’ carries plenty of cultural enriched references as the reverence with the Holy Prophet (PBUH) though is thoroughly a religious perspective, yet it has sufficient cultural relevance. This theme is embedded within the local cultural settings.

In Text 2, the use of vocabulary ‘deserted women’ and ‘the soul sullied by dirt and dust’ have been employed representing the culture of the desert as many of the folktales sprouted within the deserts, so the poets while representing them also employed such a language which really was the true representative of the characters employed within those folktales. The essence of the same languages can be traced within Schimmel’s analysis who has been very careful while choosing the appropriate vocabulary. The use of ‘the lonely wives’ has again been employed referring to the longings of the wives when they are parted with their husbands. ‘Boon for the lovers’ is another peculiar usage of vocabulary from where Schimmel’s unique style was traced. ‘Spiritual conversations’ refer to the Sufi thought where such conversation with the divine Beloved carries greater significance. Another peculiar employment of vocabulary was found within ‘Divine manifestations’ which contain deeper meanings for the Sufis. They look for their divine beloved through divine manifestations. ‘Heedlessness’ is another usage of specific vocabulary which characterizes the author’s style to a great extent.

Many facets of identity and cultural traces were found within the special vocabulary employed in Text 3. ‘Wretched lovers’ refer to the desolate loving souls. The stylistic presentation of the miserable condition of the loving souls has been summed up within the specific choice of vocabulary employed by Schimmel. Through ‘corporeal pain’ referring again to the deplorable state of the miserable and wretched souls, Schimmel also attaches her ideological beliefs with the choice of the words. ‘Ecstatic longing’ and ‘sighs of burning passion’ are again the appropriate choices of vocabulary through which authorial voice may well be witnessed. The poetic traditions are reflective of the miserable conditions of the loving souls.
This very theme has been the subject matter of many poetic themes. The researcher inferred sufficient cultural traces from the choice of vocabulary as these themes have been touched upon by the Sufi scholars and folktale writers and are therefore very close to the common masses. ‘Cypher’, ‘quintessence’ and ‘touching variations’ are few other choices of vocabulary Schimmel employs within the text to convincingly convey her message. Her choice of vocabulary also matches with the sanctified Sufi themes.

Through the specialized vocabulary employed in Text 4, implied traces of culture and identity were explored. ‘Whirlpools’ refers to the story of Sohni and Mehar which has a special relevance with sea and whirlpools. Again, the cultural relevance of the specific vocabulary with the local cultural aspects was witnessed. ‘The most dramatic moment’ has been employed referring to the tragic and dramatic moment upon which the story of Sohni and Mehar begins; the time when the young woman is attacked by the crocodiles. ‘Tribulations’ refer to the sufferings of the journey when Sassui goes out in search of her beloved. At the same time, it also refers to the sufferings of the seeker of the divine Beloved on the mystical path. ‘Demented’ refers to the extreme state of dementia and distress through which Majnun had to undergo in his longing for Laila. ‘Years of yearning’ also refers to the patience of Majnun when he spent years of yearning in the desert and finally experienced his unity with Laila. Schimmel’s subjectivity and style was traced from this specific use of vocabulary. At the same time, many cultural aspects were also found within them.

The author was well traced through the specialized vocabulary employed in Text 5. Many cultural facets were also explored. ‘Courtesanlike woman’ refers to Mumal in the famous folktale of ‘Mumal Rano’. She later experiences a constant process of purification to meet her beloved Rano. Through the employment of this specific vocabulary Schimmel tries to portray the true character of Mumal. ‘Sindhi swinging bed’ is another word which contains deeper meanings in the local cultural settings of Sind where while dozing on the Sindhi swinging bed, Sur Kamod is enjoyed early afternoon. ‘Fulfilled love’ is another employment of the vocabulary through which not only the reflection of rich Sindhi culture can be traced rather Schimmel’s subjectivity is also evident from it. It refers to Sur Kamod which is sung early afternoon depicting fulfilled love. Few other instances of specialized vocabulary employed by Schimmel include ‘burning
love’ and ‘hopeless search’ which according to the author are never portrayed through *Sur Kamod*.

In terms of investigating style, ‘metaphor’ is the most pertinent dimension which gives an access into various cultural dimensions. The most significant instances of metaphor extracted from the five texts of *Pain and Grace* are as under:

### 4.2.7.2 Metaphor

*Kang* – the messenger bird is the most significant metaphor employed within **Text 1**. This very metaphor comprises cultural relevance associated with it. ‘Spinning woman’ has been presented as a metaphor for ‘the soul busy with the constant recollections of God’. The theme of ‘spinning woman’ is very close to the common folk and forms an integral part of local cultural settings. The connection between the ‘Yogis’ and the ‘perfect men’ may also be attributed as an example of metaphor where ‘Yogis’ have been presented as ‘perfect men’. Again Yogis establish their unique significance within local culture as people develop special association with them. Association between the ‘wandering minstrel’ and the ‘man’s soul’ is another example of metaphor.

In **Text 2**, ‘green garment of the soil’ has been metaphorically employed pointing to ‘His beauty’ referring to the beauty of the beloved. ‘*khwab-i-ghaflat*’ or ‘sleep of negligence’ is another metaphor referring to the ‘Slumber of the seafaring merchants’. It is pertinent here that in Sufi discourse, significance of remaining awake has been given more prominence. ‘Divine Beloved’ has been metaphorically employed referring to God. Further, metaphors of ‘shabby hut’ or ‘deserted village’ have been used referring to the world. In Sufi discourse, the same representation can be found for the world. ‘Bhambhore’ has been employed as another metaphor for the ‘world’ which is of no use without the beloved. ‘Nails of love’ is also a metaphorical representation referring to the cruel and harsh aspect of love. ‘Seafaring merchants’ and ‘nightly vigils’ are few other metaphors which contain plenty of cultural relevance.

Through the inclusion of all these metaphors, author’s style was investigated. Further, her subjectivity seems to be another area which may give insights regarding the subjective impact
she creates on the entire discourse. Issues regarding the local culture were also investigated through these metaphors.

In **Text 3**, ‘hearts and livers of the ‘wretched lovers’ have been metaphorically represented as ‘roast meat’ (‘kabab’) depicting the miserable state of the lovers. ‘Crows of Kech’ and ‘Dogs of Kech’ have been presented as metaphors for the ‘soul dog’. In Sufi discourse, ‘the soul dog’ has strongly been condemned. The metaphor of ‘martyr of love’ has been used for ‘Husain ibn Mansur al-Hallaj’ referring to the well known legend of Hallaj whose ecstatic *Ana’l haqq* has become an asset for the true lovers. The concept of *Ana’l haqq* acquires special acclaim in Sufi settings where the explication of this very theme can be witnessed. ‘Bridal bed for the lovers’ is another metaphor representing ‘Gallows’ where Hallaj was hanged. The metaphor of ‘the roaming lover’ has been employed referring to Sassui which takes the reader way back to *Kech* where the great legend of ‘Sassui Punhun’ sprouted. The metaphor of ‘butcher’ was employed for the Beloved referring to the ruthless aspect of the beloved, mostly found in the folklores rich in cultural traditions.

In **Text 4**, ‘snakes’ have been employed as ‘symbols of the devil’ which are considered as a bad omen. Further ‘Yogis’ have been metaphorically presented as ‘peacock-like ‘Yogis’ where sanctity of the Yogis has been asserted. Both these instances refer to the famous folktale of ‘Sassui and Punhun’ which is deeply embedded and has a greater significance in Sindhi culture. ‘Paragon of the true lover’ has been metaphorically exploited to portray Majnun elaborating the longing and yearning of Majnun for Laila. Majnun’s love has often been idealized as an exemplary love and his impact on local cultural settings is deeper. Further, few other metaphors have also been embedded within the text: ‘Abri’, ‘the weak one’, ‘Ma’dhuri, ‘the helpless one’, ‘Desi’, ‘the native one’, ‘Kohayari’, ‘the mountaineer’ and ‘Husaini’ in the tragic melody of the dirges in Muharram. These metaphors have been employed for Sassui for her various attributes.

In **Text 5**, fishermaid ‘Nuri’ has been metaphorically presented as the ‘*nafs mutma’inna*’, ‘the soul at peace’ referring to her highest level of obedience and surrender to her beloved Jam Tamachi making her status elevated as compared to the other queens. The famous folktale of
Nuri and Jam Tamachi’ has deeper cultural underpinnings as the tale has become a living legend within the local culture. Further, the metaphor of ‘the dangerous merciless sea’ has been exploited for ‘world’ or ‘nafs’ referring to the trials and tribulations which one confronts because of the unending longings of ‘nafs’ or the ‘world’. Again the rich cultural reference to the famous and heroic folktale of the brave Morirro was highlighted who killed the colossal whale that killed his six brothers. The ‘shark of desire’ is another metaphor pointing towards the unending desires produced within *nafs*.

After investigating stylistic aspects, an enquiry into exchanges, speech functions and grammatical mood was made. Details of enquiry into these aspects are as under:

**4.2.8 Exchanges, Speech Functions and Grammatical Mood**

Though investigation of exchanges, speech functions and grammatical mood becomes more significant within ‘conversational analysis, identifying these aspects within descriptive texts is also necessary to be investigated. The most predominant type of exchange employed throughout the five selected texts is ‘knowledge exchange’ and speech function has been mostly ‘statement’ as these texts are descriptive and analytical Sufi texts. As regards the ‘types of statement’, ‘statement of fact’ and ‘evaluation’ (explicated within ‘assumptions’) were frequent within the texts as most of the analysis is based on factual and evaluative work. However, ‘prediction’ and ‘hypothetical statements’ are not obvious as most of the Schimmel’s work is not based on any sort of predictions and hypothesis. Grammatical mood throughout the texts is ‘declarative’ with no traces of interrogative and imperative essence. Interrogative and imperative mood is mostly witnessed within interactional and conversational analysis.

Enquiry into significant discourses merged within the texts was the most significant task within the study. The details of the major investigation into discourses and other attributes attached with them are as under:
4.2.9 Discourses

The discourses of cultural diversity and richness of Sind and mystical beliefs were drawn upon within Text 1. The researcher investigated a reasonable ‘mixing of discourses’ of ‘Yogidom’, ‘veneration of the poet for the Lord’, ‘the symbolic theme of spinning of cotton and its various associations’, ‘the concept of the messenger bird kang’ and ‘the traditional Sassui imagery’. All these themes are textured and merged within the text with a reasonable proportion. The link from one theme to another is quite natural. Value assumption which is also a matter of discourses has also been discussed.

Text 2 comprises the discourses of various mystical beliefs merged in cultural underpinnings. However, the ‘mixing of discourses’ of ‘beauty of the beloved’, enriched cultural discourses of the folktales of ‘Sassui Pannhun’, ‘Marui and Omar’, ‘sleep of negligence’, cultural and mystic concept of ‘nightly vigils’, ‘dhikr’ or spiritual conversation with the beloved employed by the mystics and ‘detachment from the worldly pleasures’ were also traced.

Most part of Text 3 comprises the discourses of ‘suffering’ and ‘qurbani’. However, ‘the mixing of discourse’ of ‘Ana’l haqq ‘I’m the absolute Truth’ gives a unique dimension to the text which indeed carries deep rooted cultural traces merged in Sufi traditions. The same theme of sacrifice or ‘qurbani’ has also been attributed to Sassui, the roaming lover.

In Text 4, the researcher witnessed the culturally enriched discourses merged within the traditional folktales of ‘Sohni and Mehar’, Sassui and Punhun’ and ‘Laila and Majnun’. However, the ‘mixing of discourses’ of ‘traditional religious imagery’ and ‘Persian and Turkish tradition’ were also observed to a reasonable degree which add an element of diversity to the text and make it more valid. All the three folktales which are deeply rooted are well-linked within the text and their transition from the one to another is quite natural.

In Text 5, the discourses of the culturally enriched folktales of ‘Lila and Chanesar’, ‘Mumal and Rano’, ‘Marui and Omar’, ‘Nuri and Jam Tamachi’ and the brave ‘Morirro’ have been drawn upon. These folktales have a great impact on local cultural norms of Sind. The
discourses of the folktales have been well-merged within the text to a reasonable proportion which give an adequate level of poise to the text. The researcher, further found ‘mixing of discourses’ in terms of the various terms employed within these folktales. The connection from one theme of the folktale to another is naturally developed.

The most important and the third dimension of Fairclough’s three-dimensional model pertaining to ‘representation of social events’ gives insight into the social dimensions which is a significant mode of enquiry in CDA. The detailed analysis inquiring representation of social events within the five selected texts of Schimmel is as under:

4.2.10 Representation of Social Events

In Text 1, the researcher traced the brief description of various Surs (chapters) of Risalo, in which representation of various social events was witnessed. In terms of social representation, the researcher came across in Sur Ripa’s description, ‘the longings of the lonely wife for her husband’. The social representation of the husband-wife relation is quite significant in local cultural settings. The ups and downs in the matrimonial relation have been touched upon in the folk traditions. It is pertinent here that the event is abstractly represented. Another social representation is that of ‘Yogis’ in Sur Khahori who walk from place to place and ‘suffer every possible discomfort’. In the local cultural settings, Yogis have a significant role to play. These ascetic practitioners of meditation are revered figures in the cultural settings. Again the social representation is abstract within this very example. Another social representation is that of the traditional theme of ‘spinning of cotton’ expressed in Sur Kapaiti with various connotations attached to it. This very theme has been discussed by many of the Sufi poets of Sind and Panjab and is an important aspect of the rural settings which contains social and cultural underpinnings. Here the event involving a concrete entity has been abstractly represented. The next social representation is that of the concept of kang, the messenger bird (discussed in Sur Purab) who was considered as a major source of conveying messages in the past. The mention of this very theme may well be traced within Sindhi and Panjabi folk songs and mystical poetry developing a very close association with the common folk as the Sufi poetry and the folk songs are deeply embedded within local cultural settings. Again the entire event was abstractly represented. In Sur
Pirbhati (Early Morning), the social representation of man’s soul seen as ‘wandering minstrel’ was traced. This very term has historical and cultural significance attached to it. The minstrels (usually poets and musicians) used to visit place to place carrying a stringed instrument and narrated mystic themes while the common folk used to flock around. Abstract representation of the event again was witnessed. The researcher also found the historical allusions of ‘powerful rulers of Sind’ appearing to be symbols of ‘Muhammad’s (PBUH) grace and munificence’ mentioned in Sur Bilawal. In the local cultural settings especially that of Sind, level of reverence and esteem with the Prophet Muhammad (PBUH) can be witnessed. Special Mahafil (meetings) are organized in which Prophet Muhammad’s (PBUH) special attributes are narrated in Na’at (admiration of Prophet Muhammad’s (PBUH) special attributes). These Mahafil have a great significance in local cultural settings especially that of Sind and Panjab. In this instance also, the event is abstractly presented.

The researcher is more interested in knowing which aspects are given more prominence. It is important that wherever the cultural instances are found, the theme is presented giving it more prominence while other trivial aspects were deliberately given less space and the researcher noticed just a passing reference. For instance the reference to the ‘song of the swan’ was not given more prominence within the text.

Most of the ‘processes’ involved within Text 1 are verbal and existential processes. The frequency of activated and passivated processes is almost equally balanced.

**Processes**

Various ‘processes’ mostly ‘existential’ and ‘verbal’ were traced within Text 1: fill, describe, express, utilize, find, point, buy, extend, underline, warn, admonish, dive, see, contain etc.

All the Processes involved are indicative of the cultural and ideological references attached with them within the context.
Participants

The researcher also found various ‘participants’ serving as subjects and objects in the social representation performing various ‘forms of activity’:

poet, Yogis, loving woman, crow, beloved, kang-the messenger bird, Pigeon in the high Persian poetry, Shah, wandering minstrel, powerful rulers of Sind etc.

All the Participants were taken from the Sufi discourse; therefore, they refer to various cultural and ideological dimensions associated with them within their particular context.

Circumstances

Some of the ‘circumstances’ mentioned in Text 1 include:

a fine description of the dried-up tree, rose water-like company of the master etc.

The Circumstances above mentioned added more meanings to the Process involved within the text under study and are therefore indicative of various local cultural, Sufi and ideological dimensions linked with them.

Text 2 is marked with the social representation of ‘sighs of the deserted women’. Again, this theme acquires prominence in folktales where the folk poets have portrayed the pangs of the deserted women who undergo all the troubles and tribulations on their journey to the beloved which later is transformed into divine Love. The folktales amplifying the character of village women are deeply embedded in local cultural settings and hence are very close to the common folk. Another social representation is that of the ‘beauty of the beloved’-a theme which has always been a great fascination for the poets especially for the folk poets. Folk poetry tries to encompass the beauty of the beloved from all the angles. These tales and poetry contain every ingredient in it to captivate the common folk who learn this poetic discourse by heart and are often found reciting it. This very theme has further been strengthened with the Prophetic tradition ‘Verily God is beautiful and loves beauty’. This tradition asserts the value of the concept of beauty often narrated in the folk or Sufi tradition. Another prominent social
representation is that of the very famous tale of Marui who was kidnapped by Omer of Omerkot. The most prominent theme socially represented through this folktale is the ‘purification of the soul before the presence of the ‘eternally beautiful Lord’. This theme often employed by the Sufi poets asserts that the soul undergoes a purification process before it is finally presented before the eternally beautiful Lord. Same was the case with Marui who experienced constant phases of miseries at Omer’s castle but ultimately found her union with the beloved when her soul was purely refined. Through the portrayal of of the folktale of ‘Sassui’, ‘the theme of the lonely wives’ and ‘seafaring merchants’, the social representation of the most significant theme of Khwab-i-ghaflat ‘sleep of negligence’ was highlighted. Sleep of negligence causes a great havoc for all the above mentioned characters. In Sufi traditions, Khwab-i-ghaflat ‘sleep of negligence’ has strongly been condemned and on the contrary ‘mystic tradition of remaining awake’ has been asserted. Through this practice, Sufis believe that they are able to conduct conversation with the divine Beloved. The extension of the same theme can be traced in the social representation of the theme of ‘nightly vigils’ which are considered to be ‘great boon for the lovers’. Within these nightly vigils, ‘spiritual conversation with the divine Beloved’ is conducted. The representation of this theme is common within the Sufi poetic discourse; therefore, the reflection of this theme can also be traced within local cultural settings. The social representation of the theme of ‘the worldly attachments are of no value without the beloved’ can be found within most of the Sufi poetic discourse in which the beloved is given special esteem.

Again, abstract social representation of the concrete elements was noticed throughout the text under study.

It is important here that the themes of beauty, sleep of negligence, mystic tradition of remaining awake and nightly vigils were given greater space within the text and all these themes seem to acquire more prominence within the text under study while the ‘sighs of the deserted women’ had been given lesser prominence as compared to other themes merged within the text under study.

Though the number of activated processes is greater than the passivated ones but still the frequency of passivated processes is also reasonable within the text.
Processes
Following Processes of varied types were observed within Text 2 performing various ‘forms of activity’:

fix, walk, stand, detect, intend, complain, lose, dare, undergo, allow, return, scold, stretch, sleep, apply, cause, spend, enjoy, remain, derive, call, remember, perform, consider, continue, translate, stay, leave, enter, describe, burst, express, forget, appear, serve, deprive, find, cut off, carry, cross, reach, enter etc.

The above mentioned Processes performing various forms of activity were extracted from their particular culturally and ideologically loaded context; therefore, they contain the essence of those particular themes.

Participants
Participants observed in Text 2 are as under:
deserted women, lonely souls, nails of love, beloved, true lover, Dhu’n Nun, Abu Hamid Ghazzali, beauty, God, Sufis, Marui, Omar, Marus, soul, eternally beautiful Lord, Shah, Sassui, lonely wives, Balochis, nightly vigils, lovers, divine Beloved, mystical poets, Attar, J. Bunyan, Bhambore, world, Kech, Sindhi poet, Attar’s successors etc.

Participants within Text 2, which have been extracted from various folktales merged within the text, are reflective of various cultural, Sufi and folk dimensions they have been the integral part of.

Circumstances
Circumstances witnessed in Text 2 are as under:
in full etiquette, by performing the nightly prayers, in a fitting symbol, for a short while etc.
As Circumstances give more detailed meanings to the Processes and act as adverbials, therefore, these Circumstances are also indicative of culturally loaded forms of activity which were further elaborated through Circumstances.

**Text 3** is marked with the social representation of the most significant theme of ‘the fate of the lover’ which finds sufficient space within the folk tradition. The miseries of the ‘wretched lovers’ and ‘pangs and sufferings on the way to love’ become the major themes in Sufi and folk traditions. The representation of these themes was also examined within the text under study. Another social representation of the theme of ‘ruthless beloved’ also gives the text a distinctive touch. In most of the poetic discourse, the beloved was portrayed as a ruthless character while the lover was often depicted as a ‘wretched soul’ who confronts trials and tribulations on the way to form union with the beloved. Another most prominent social representation is that of the theme of *Qurbani* (sacrifice) - a Quranic theme which also gains prominence within Sufi settings. ‘Importance of shedding blood to make the divine Lord happy’ has often been preached by the Sufis. The social representation of the most significant historic reference of ‘Mansur Al-Hallaj as martyr of love’ gives the text more strength. This very theme is the extension of the theme of *Qurbani* (sacrifice) already elucidated within the text. ‘Mansur’s name is significant in a sense that it still is considered as ‘a cipher for the claim of having attained union’ with the divine Beloved. It is also important that the blood sacrifice is the best medium to have union with the divine Beloved. The most renowned and famous words of Hallaj *Ana’l Haqq* ‘I’m the absolute Truth’ were also represented within the text. In Sufi settings, these words were given greater significance. He was hanged on gallows as he articulated these words and finally gallows became ‘the final station on the way to the divine Beloved’. Gallows became ‘bridal bed for the lover, a place to enjoy union with the beloved’. It is important here that the sacrifice is the exclusive medium to form union with the divine Beloved which was earnestly desired by Hallaj. The last portion of the text is marked with the concept of ‘the arena of love’ *mahabbah*- a place for seekers to prove their spiritual maturity. This very concept also gains prominence within Sufi discourse and is considered to be one of the most significant Sufi doctrines. The imprints of this theme can also be traced in local cultural settings where this theme penetrates through folktales and Sufi discourse in the form of Sufi poetry.
Throughout the text, the miseries, sufferings and sacrifices offered by the wretched lovers have been given more prominence. At the same time, Mansur al Hallaj’s reference and his historic words *Ana’l Haqq* ‘I’m the absolute Truth’ acquire greater space and prominence and seem prevalent throughout the text while the concept of ‘the arena of love’ has been given lesser space as compared to other themes.

Again, representation of social events is abstractly portrayed throughout the text under study. Concrete features have been abstractly represented.

Number of activated processes is evidently visible within the text under study while the number of passivated processes is lesser than the former.

**Processes**

Following ‘Processes’ of various types can be noticed within the text under study:
lead, tell, roast, cut, feel, repeat, indulge, remain, kill, intend, slaughter, permeate, think, prefer, turn, describe, hesitate, cook, deal, mention, wish, dwell, pluck, eat, suffer, remind, call out, say, assume, wander, impress, know, become, attain, make, divulge, punish, allude, enjoy, climb, belong etc.

A mix of ‘Processes’ of multiple types are evident, indicating various ‘forms of activity’ within the rich cultural references they have been extracted from. They are also representative of various Sufi, folk and ideological aspects merged within the text under study.

**Participants**

Participants mentioned in Text 3 under study are as under:
Shah Latif’s poetry, lover, friend, court poets of India, Ghalib’s Urdu verse, beloved, Sassui, goat, animals, divine Lord, Blut-und-Wunden poetry, Christian Church, Indian temples, shrines, Rumi’s verse, Persian and Turkish poetry, butcher, wretched lovers, crows of Kech, dogs of Kech, soul-dog, woman, legends of Husain ibn Mansur al-Hallaj, Indus Valley, Sind, Panjab, Sindhi folk poetry, wayfarer etc
Various historical, folk, Sufi, cultural and ideological references are evident from the Participants merged within the text under study.

**Circumstances**

a bit longer, at the festival of pilgrimage, in ecstatic longing, in touching variations etc

Circumstances added to the Processes worked as adverbials and added more meanings to the existing Processes. They are also reflective of the essence of the Sufi and cultural context from where they were extracted.

**Text 4** is significant in a sense that the researcher investigated the brief description of the famous folktales merged within the text. Therefore, all the major and minor themes attached with these folktales also left their deep impacts on the text. The text is marked with social representations of the concise narrative of the folktales in *Shah Jo Risalo* of Shah Abdul Latif Bhitai. The first social representation is that of the most significant character of Sohni and Mehar where Sohni acquires ‘forever union with the friend through death’. This theme finds special acclaim within Sufi discourse, therefore, acquires indirect access with the common folk through the poetic discourse and folktales. Another social representation is that of the theme of Sassui and Punhun which acquires universal acclaim and at the same time the essence of this folktale can be traced within the soil of Sind establishing deep impacts on the local cultural settings. Through this folktale ‘miseries faced on the way to find beloved’ have been highlighted which is the most discussed theme in Sufi discourse where the miseries of the ‘wretched lovers’ can clearly be seen. Sassui confronts all the deadly tribulations but does not retreat. Extension of the same theme can be traced within another social representation of the theme of the ‘parable of the seeker on the mystical path’. The last section of the text is marked with another significant folktale of Laila and Majnun which also gains greater acclaim within the common folk as this tale also forms its access to the common folk through the folk and Sufi traditions. Mystics of Persian and Turkish tradition have portrayed the character of Majnun as ‘a paragon of the true lover’ whose love for Laila has been presented as an ideal love for a lover for his beloved. The theme which has been encompassed through this significant folktale is ‘union with the beloved after years of yearning on the way to love’. The researcher found that the themes represented
within the folktales become an integral feature of the Sufi discourse and their essence can be traced within the Sufi poetic discourse.

It is important here that the social representations to the themes of folktales of Sohni and Mehar and Sassui and Punhun encompasses the entire text and appears to acquire more prominence while the researcher examined just a passing reference to the theme of the folktale of Laila and Majnun. The concept of ‘forever union with the divine Beloved through death’ seems to gain more strength throughout the text.

Social themes merged within the text have been given abstract representation. It is significant here that the concrete elements were employed for their abstract representation.

A blend of both activated and passivated Processes was seen throughout the text but still the frequency of activated processes is greater than the passivated ones.

**Processes**

Text 4 is marked with following Processes which indicate various ‘forms of activity’ representative of various social events:

Form, bear, revert, despise, swim, graze, replace, die, begin, cry, attack, break, make, allude, find, adopt, spread, decide, see, stay, come, carry away, deal, follow, live, kill, run, say, perish, become, roam, take, experience etc.

Processes mentioned in Text 4 are indicative of various cultural and ideological settings they were employed from. These Processes are of various types and point towards the wider social context from where they were exploited.

**Participants**

Participants mentioned in Text 4 under study are as under:
the topic of the sea, Sur, Sohni, tragic love story, island, Mehar, buffalos, sister-in-law, jar, Shah, young woman, crocodiles, friend, Sind, Panjab, Sassui, washerman, Punhun, relatives, couple, speedy camels, beloved, blue snakes, other frightening creatures, devil, peacock-like Yogis, wild animals, trees, birds, Majnun, Laila, mystics of the Persian and Turkish tradition, beasts etc.

The nature of various Participants employed within the text under study is suggestive of various powerful historical and folk references they become the subject and object of. Each one of them is loaded with cultural and ideological insights.

Circumstances

Circumstances contributing to the Processes in the text under study are given below: in the most dramatic moment, in the cold river, through death, through deserts and forests, in despair, at the end of the road, after years of yearning etc.

All the Circumstances attached to various Processes added substantial meanings to the Processes where they acted as adverbials and therefore are rich in terms of local cultural and ideological perspectives.

Text 5 is also linked with Text 4 and may well be seen as an extension of the theme set prior to the text. Same like that of the previous text, brief description of few other folktales and their themes were traced within the text under study. The first social representation is that of the famous folktale of Lila and Chanesar which is very close to the common folk. Through this folktale, ‘process of purification in order to be acceptable to the Lord’ was highlighted. The essence of this very theme was also investigated in many of the folktales which center on this text. Another social representation is that of the renowned folktale of Mumal and Rano where Mumal was represented as ‘dangerous, courtesanlike woman’ who is finally purified to acquire her union with the beloved. Again, ‘purification and union with the beloved’ becomes the major theme of the folktale—a theme which has been deeply embedded in Sufi discourse. Another social representation is that of the folktale of Marui who had been kidnapped by Omer of Omerkot. The theme which has been incorporated within the folktale is to ‘remain faithful to the beloved under
the heaviest pressures’. This very theme becomes the subject matter of many of the folktales and therefore gains prominence in Sufi and cultural settings. Another social representation of ‘perfect surrender and obedience’ is the most famous folktale of Nuri and Jam Tamachi where Nuri was the perfect example of *Nafs* *mutma’inna* ‘soul at peace’. Perfect surrender is the theme which has also been propagated within Sufi settings. Social representation of ‘fulfilled love and happiness’ was traced in ‘peaceful *Sur Kamod*’ which is sung early afternoon. The reference to Sindhi swinging bed is important here which also becomes the center of the cultural activity within Sindhi culture where while dozing on the bed at the early afternoon, the people may witness the glory of *Sur Kamod* which sings the melody of fulfilled love and happiness. The researcher found very brief reference to the folktale of brave *Morirro* in which the social representation of the theme of ‘world or *nafs* under the image of the dangerous merciless sea’ was investigated. The extension of the same theme can be found when the brave Morirro kills the ‘shark of desire’. Symbolic significance of this theme can also be traced in Sufi settings where *nafs* with its various dimensions has frequently been mentioned. The brave are those who control all the vehement desires by killing the shark of desire to successfully sail through the ‘dangerous merciless sea’ of the world.

It is significant here that the themes of the most famous and renowned stories were given more space and prominence like Lila Chanesar, Mumal Rano, Omer Marui and Nuri Jam Tamachi while the mention of *Sur Kamod* and *Sur Ghatu* is indicative of the fact that these themes and their social representation acquired lesser prominence.

A blend of both activated and passivated processes are evident throughout the text under study with activated processes frequent than the latter ones. But a visible frequency of passivated processes was also observed within the text.

Concrete elements within various folktales merged in the text seem to be abstractly represented.
Processes

Following Processes of various types depicting different ‘forms of activity’ and representing varied social events were seen within the text under study:

retold, entice, allow, spend, sell, divorce, undergo, tell, form, originate, assume, cheat, leave, purify, unite, know, recognize, go, locate, kidnap, refuse, become, torture, send, remain, fall in love, rely, make, cause, raise, return, sing, doze, take up, swallow, remember, slay, kill etc.

Processes employed for the social representation of various events within Text 5, are significant within their particular context where they were employed within various folktales and strengthened their context with the local cultural and ideological meanings embedded within them.

Participants

Participants serving as the subjects or the objects of various ‘forms of activity’ are as under:

Sur, Lila, Chanesar, Summa rulers, Sindhi, Persian, another woman, Shah, Lord, Mumal, Rano, Lower Sind, loving woman, Sur Marui, heroine, Thar desert, mighty Omar, Marui, lovely maiden, nobleman’s wife, beloved, Sur Kamod, Nuri, Prince Jam Tamachi, queens, Sur Ghatu, nafs, fishermen, Sindhi reader, brave Morirro, whale, six brothers, shark of desire etc.

The above mentioned Participants are culturally loaded as most of them were employed within different folktales being the subject or object of various forms of activity. These folktales carried deeper meanings in terms of depicting ideological underpinnings and were found culturally loaded worth investigating.

Circumstances

Evident Circumstances further elucidating various processes employed within the text under study are as under:

after a long time of waiting, under the heaviest pressures, by her perfect surrender and obedience, under the image of dangerous merciless sea etc.
Most of the Circumstances employed within Text 5 which were exploited as adverbials, gave strength to the text by adding more substantial meanings to the Processes employed. At the same time, they were found indicative of various interpretations associated with the Processes they were attached.

Plenty of insights were traced through a critical discourse perspective of Schimmel’s *Pain and Grace*. Five representative texts selected from the Grace section i.e., Shah Abdul Latif Bhitai’s section of Schimmel’s book, were investigated applying Fairclough’s three-dimensional model based on CDA. An internal and external analysis was conducted involving various aspects of three-dimensional model and answers to the research inquiries were tried to acquire. Local cultural and ideological pursuits remained the top most priority while investigating various texts.

The next core book I have selected for my research study is Schimmel’s *Mystical Dimensions of Islam* which is in fact an historical account of the Sufi traditions in Islam. But my concern was towards exploring the local cultural and ideological perspectives employed by Schimmel while analyzing Sufi poetry. Therefore, I extracted only those texts which were thoroughly relevant to my research pursuits. The brief outline and gist of the book was also given in Chapter 1. The five texts were selected and the same procedure was employed that was conducted within analysis of *Pain and Grace*. All the five texts were investigated keeping into perspective the ‘aspects of Fairclough’s three-dimensional model’. The five selected texts (Text 6-10) along with their analysis based on Critical Discourse Analysis are as under:

### 4.3 Mystical Dimensions of Islam–5 Selected Texts

**Text 6:**
“The term *shahid* ‘witness’ is used for beautiful beloved………. ladder of created souls.”
*Mystical Dimensions of Islam* (Schimmel, 2006, P.291-292, see appendix 6)

**Text 7:**
“The unsurpassable master of love and passion………………. concept of absolute love.”
*Mystical Dimensions of Islam* (Schimmel, 2006, P.292-294, see appendix 7)

**Text 8:**
“The imagery of the birds was elaborated……………………….the tresses of the beloved.”
**Mystical Dimensions of Islam** (Schimmel, 2006, P.307-309, see appendix 8)

**Text 9:**

“The Panjab and Sind show close similarities………………. typical Hindu love for the guru.”

**Mystical Dimensions of Islam** (Schimmel, 2006, P.385-387, see appendix 9)

**Text 10:**

“No of the surs are related to folk ballads…………….. have not done full justice to him.”

**Mystical Dimensions of Islam** (Schimmel, 2006, P.391-393, see appendix 10)

I proceeded to my investigation of the second core book by first exploring the issues pertaining to ‘social events’.

### 4.3.1 Social Events

The five texts under study were extracted from ‘The Rose and the Nightingale’ and ‘Sufism in Indo-Pakistan’ chapters of *Mystical Dimensions of Islam*. The texts under investigation were selected because of the rich cultural and mystic underpinnings inherent in them and they may well be graded as ‘Sufi Discourse’. Cultural traces were brought into limelight by the writer to a considerable degree. As regards the ‘chain of social events’, the texts also seem to be the integral part of the chain where Schimmel went deeper into the mystical and cultural dimensions elaborated in various chapters of Mystical Dimensions of Islam. Analytical tone of all the five texts was witnessed in every line and the texts were found thoroughly descriptive in their approach like those of *Pain and Grace*. However, the texts do not seem to belong apparently to the ‘chain or network of texts’ as their connection could not be found with texts other than this book and they seemed to be an extension of the conceptual framework already established within various chapters of the book. It is important here that ‘intertextuality’ may not be confused within the perspective because plenty of intertextual references were incorporated within the texts under study rather the issue of ‘chain or network of texts’ here refers to the chain of other texts established within this book.

Within this core book also, I investigated the aspects pertaining to ‘genre’, one of the significant aspects of enquiry within CDA.
4.3.2 Genre
As regards the core issue of investigation of genre, the texts under study establish their deeper association with ‘Sufi Discourse’ which contain their own atypical tone. However, Schimmel’s analytical faculties give them a tinge of descriptive and analytical essence. Here the critical faculties of Schimmel are more concerned with examining the Sufi and cultural traces. The researcher could not find any traces of evident ‘genre mixing’ throughout the five texts selected from the book as the Sufi discourse was established within the entire texts under study and no other genre was merged or mixed into Sufi interpretive discourse. The researcher witnessed evident traces of critical examination of various poetic discourses of Persian, Turkish and Indo-Pakistan traditions through the interpretive faculties of Schimmel.

Investigation of ‘intertextual’ dimensions was also prioritized within this book. Significant intertextual perspectives and some of its important dimensions within the five selected texts are as under:

4.3.3 Intertextuality

Intertextuality again seems to be a prominent aspect in all the five texts under study extracted from *Mystical Dimensions of Islam*. Indirect quoting is again obvious, however, direct quotations were also traced but their frequency as compared to the indirect ones was found lesser. Schimmel has skillfully merged the entire intertextual references giving a reasonable level of strength to the texts.

In Text 6, increased frequency of direct quotations was observed. The traditional and symbolic intertextual reference of *husn u-ishq* gives the text a unique dimension. The same theme has been the most striking issue in most of the poetic traditions; especially this theme has evolved a greater significance in Sindhi culture where many of the folktales revolve round this very theme. Apart from this, this very theme was also employed by many story-tellers in the villages who used to grab the attention of listeners by adding more flavor to the stories. So, the prominence of this theme in local cultural settings is indeed remarkable. Schimmel has merged this theme skillfully within the text to give it more strength. Another intertextual reference is that
of a ‘late Indo-Persian poet’ whose name is deliberately or unconsciously not mentioned by Schimmel. However his lines have been directly quoted which make it more powerful. Another strong intertextual reference which has been directly quoted is that of a very famous hadith mostly employed by the poets while adoring their beloved: “God is beautiful and loves Beauty’. The mention of this hadith may have different connotations but poets while admiring the physical beauty of their beloved often heavily rely on it.

Powerful intertextual references of the great masters of love mysticism, like Ahmad Ghazzali, Jalal-uddin Rumi and Fakhruddin Iraqi who establish a greater historical significance were also merged within the text. Mystical and cultural traditions borrow plenty of rich themes from their poetry. In literary settings, these leading figures are widely quoted and acclaimed. Thematic essence of their messages is deeply embedded within their respective local cultural settings. The common folk not only relate them but follow the essence of their Sufi thought. Direct quotation from Baqli’s book elaborating the universal theme of love and its rivalry forces from satanic and base insinuations add strength to the text. Rivalry in love has been the most quoted aspect in the literary settings and contains greater cultural significance as the common folk develop a sound sense of this very term. The comprehension of this term by the common folk is mostly indebted to the folk poetic traditions which establish frequent mention of this very theme. The author here, through merging this powerful intertextual reference makes the text more valid. Powerful intertextual references of Mahmud of Ghazna, the warrior king of Afghanistan, and his slave Ayaz, the symbol of a complete surrender for his master, enrich the text with a considerable strength. The glimpses of the same love and veneration can well be traced in the soil and culture of Sind. Reverence and complete surrender before the spiritual leader are the themes which are embedded within Sindhi local cultural settings. The disposition and mannerism of their common folk is indicative of this attitude. The reference of Huma bird also has intertextual perspectives as it has widely been quoted by most of the poets in Persian tradition as a good omen which brings kingdom. It is pertinent to mention here that superstitions also have a pivotal role to play in local cultural settings. The concepts of good and bad omen are deeply embedded in local cultural settings. Being a Western scholar Schimmel develops a sound sense of such cultural indicators. Intertextual reference of Majnun, the hero of the old Arabic tale and his love Laila have widely been quoted in many of the folk traditions establishing this love
theme an integral part of Sufi and cultural settings. This story also gains greater acclaim within local cultural settings. Another intertextual reference of Ruzbihan Baqli’s conception of love of human beings as a ladder towards the love of Lord has often been quoted by most of the Sufi poets and thus becomes quite significant in many of the folktales which contain cultural underpinnings. The same theme of ‘ishq-i majazi’ or ‘metaphorical love’ which has been the centre of a great attention in Persian tradition is another intertextual reference which was further strengthened by Jami’s direct quotation. The significant aspect is the attribution of the references towards the persons of great stature to which they belong.

Despite the fact that the frequency of Direct quotations in Text 6 is greater than the indirect ones, authorial voice still seems to be more dominant as Schimmel has incorporated the entire intertextual references with the impact of her critical faculties. Her grasp over the entire state of affairs seems to be more effective.

Text 7 starts with a direct confession declaring Jalaluddin Rumi as ‘the unsurpassable master of love and passion in the highest sense’. This very intertextual reference bestows the text with a considerable strength. However, this intertextual reference is not attributed to any specific person but is generally put forward. But in literary and Sufi circles, the prominence of Jalaluddin Rumi and his works is acclaimed. Similarly, his message has a universal acclaim which reaches the common folk through various Sufi scholars who frequently quote his Sufi poetic themes. So, the cultural significance of his poetic discourse is also widely acknowledged. Another significant intertextual reference is that of Avicenna and his Risala fi’l-ishq where the most discussed theme of love was elaborated. This love theme travels a greater distance through folktales and thus becomes an integral part of the cultural traditions. Direct poetic references of the romantic Nizami and his Khosrau Shirin add a peculiar flavour to the text. Here proper attribution of this intertextual reference makes Schimmel’s discourse more effective. Further, Rumi’s assertions directly intertextualized elaborating the depth and dynamic character of love strengthen the sanctified theme of love already established within the text. The theme of love was further emphasized through another powerful intertextual reference of ‘Zulaykha’s love for Joseph’ which becomes a core theme in Rumi’s poetry. The Quranic theme of ‘Yusuf and Zulaykha’ acquires greater significance in cultural settings and it has been widely told in the form of stories.
So, the common folk develop a specific association with this story. Further, as this story has been extracted from the most authentic book on earth, so it becomes more valid. Schimmel through placing this reference within the text tries to achieve the desired target which is to make her message more effective. The metaphorical love or ‘ishq-i majazi’ further evolves and transforms into divine love or ‘ishq-i haqiqi’. In Sufi and cultural settings, both these terms have a great relevance. Poets across the globe have tried their poetic faculties to further explore these terms. Also, these terms become the main theme of many of the folktales which are embedded in local cultural settings. Another intertextual reference of ‘tauhid’ or ‘extinguishing everything that is other than God’ also elaborates the same theme which has been a subject of a great interest in Persian, Turkish or Urdu traditions. This thoroughly religious perspective has great significance as this theme has been the core theme employed by leading Sufi scholars. Intertextual reference of Ghalib-nineteenth-century Urdu poet further elaborates the fire symbol of love and its status of being an absolute entity. Schimmel makes the text more effective through inclusion of the name of a leading poet of the nineteenth century.

Again, the presence of direct references and their proper attribution to the poets or writers carries a greater significance. As Schimmel merges even the direct intertextual references with her analytical influence, the authorial voice can still be distinguished within the text. Apart from ideological and local cultural aspects, the issue of power relations constructed by Schimmel’s interpretive discourse also becomes a pertinent aspect of enquiry within CDA as she exploits all the intertextual references to attach more power to her analytical discourse being more convincing and forceful.

Text 8 is marked with the imageries of birds. Intertextual reference of renowned Sufi poet Attar and his Mantiq ut-tayr-one of the famous story books in Persian literature give the text a tinge of beauty. Through inclusion of Attar’s book, the author again is well-targeted in creating a specific impact. Attar is another Sufi from the Persian traditions whose name acquires esteem and acclaim in Sufi traditions. Intertextual reference of ‘Ruzbihan’s definition of the yearning of the nightingale’ and ‘Iqbal’s interpretation of the song of the nightingale’ make the text more significant. The nightingale’s imagery has often been employed within poetic traditions where it was symbolically presented in many odes and Sufi poems. Falcon’s description in Attar’s
Ushtur-name and Rumi’s favorite symbols are also the significant intertextual references. The specific attribution of these intertextual references is indicative of author’s skill of acquiring acclaim through appropriate placement of the reference. Intertextual references of Sinai’s invention of Litani of the Birds, and Arabic language references of al-mulk lak, al-amr lak, al-hamd lak, demonstrating the complete submission to the Almighty are also the powerful instances. The message of complete submission and surrender before God can be traced in Sufi themes. These manifestations of reverence can also be traced within Sindhi local cultural settings. Quranic reference of ‘Seven Sleepers’ and further referring to their purification process gives the text a unique dimension. One Sura in the Holy Quran Sura Al-Kahaf has exclusively been specified for this theme of ‘Seven Sleepers’. Other than the religious settings, the story has often been narrated in Sufi settings from where the message reaches the common folk and becomes embedded in local cultural settings. The story of References of the finest images of the elephant dreaming of India employed in Persian poetry by Khaqani, Nizami and Attar in the late twelfth century establish their cultural significance. Through employment of imageries birds and animals, the great Sufi Scholars conveyed their message more effectively to the common folk. Direct quote from Kipling’s ‘The Captive’s Dream’ further asserts the very idea of mystic’s soul in the midst of worldly entanglements. Here, Schimmel merged the reference of a Western scholar and created an impression that she not only acquired sufficient command over Islamic Sufi themes but also presented the comparative analysis of various Sufi themes wherever she deemed it suitable.

Again, the attribution of specific references is on the increase but along with that, her own voice can also be well differentiated with her own peculiar tone. The placement and appropriate merging of the references is quite significant here. Quranic reference of (Sura 41:53) referring to manifestations of the universe for man to ponder upon them is the most significant one making the text more valid. As the religion is one of the significant facet merged within local cultural settings, therefore, the common folk are directly influenced by the essence of these religious references. Again the authorial voice seems prominent here as Schimmel’s influx was witnessed in every line. Despite the presence of frequent direct references, Schimmel’s voice is not suppressed rather emerged to be a more prominent voice as she inculcated these intertextual references within the text with her grasp over them. Schimmel’s reconstruction of local culture
through her analysis of Sufi poetry and through employment of various powerful intertextual references are indicative of the power relations which consciously or unconsciously establish their impact on the common folk through its powerful appeal.

**Text 9** demonstrates the traces of mystical literature. Intertextual reference of Indian tradition pointing towards indigenous musical modes in the form of *kafis, dohras, ways* are quite significant in the text. The researcher witnessed that these poetic forms acquire special approval among the masses. These forms developed close association with the people resulting which many of the folks learnt them by heart. Schimmel had an extensive study of all these poetic and musical forms which develop a clear cultural relevance. References of Persian and Turkish mystical and quasi-mystical poetry indicating standard theme of the mystical poetry against the narrow-minded theologians or *mollas* again gives the text a reasonable prominence. The message of religion acquired access to the masses more effectively through Sufi settings than that of the strict theologians. Common folks were directly impressed by the Sufi Scholars as they spread the message of God and divinity by being closer to the people. Direct quote from eighteenth-century Panjabi poet is another intertextual reference. Here the author seemed to deliberately hide the name of the poet. Further, direct quote from first great Panjabi mystical poet, Sultan Bahu, is another intertextual reference which carries a greater significance. Sultan Bahu’s contribution in propagating the divine message is indeed significant. His poetic couplet with every line ending in ‘*Hu*’ culturally embedded within local cultural settings is very popular within masses. Quranic reference of Sura 50:16 was presented in accordance with the plant life discussed by Sultan Bahu which bestows the text a distinctive touch. Not only the Quranic intertextual reference was employed by Schimmel, rather through merging the Sufi discourse and reference of a leading Sufi scholar, she effectively conveyed her discourse and created a peculiar impact which characterizes her. Moreover, intertextual references of Abdul Qadir Gilani, whose glorious deeds are often celebrated in mystic settings and Mansur Hallaj, whose fate was commonly discussed with mystic traditions, contain a greater impact in cultural settings. The name of Abdul Qadir Gilani is viewed with a great esteem and reverence within the masses. Among the common folk, many of his disciples and followers continue propagating his message. Hallaj and his famous, *Ana’l Haq* developed a deeper association within Sufi settings and through Sufis their message reached the common folk. Sufi poetry is significant in a sense that it developed a rapid access to
the people and poetic themes got deeply embedded within the local culture. Intertextual references of Indo-Muslim religious life and Indian *advaita* mysticism are quite significant in local cultural settings. Again, Schimmel not only portrayed the Islamic Sufi themes rather created diversity through inclusion of themes from mystic concepts of other religions.

**Text 10** is replete with powerful intertextual references. It commences with intertextual reference of ‘folk ballads of the Indus valley’ which forms deep significance in local cultural settings of the Indus valley where some of the *Surs of Shah Jo Risalo* find their association with the ballads of Sassui Punhun, Sohni Mehanwal, Umar Marui and Lila Chanesar. Intertextual reference of Koranic verses (without a specific mention) applied by the poet to the Yogis and further reference to ‘Mount Sinai’ as a place of revelation depicting the knees of the Yogis become significant intertextual references. Yogis occupy a special stature within local cultural settings. Intertextual references of the ‘praise of the Prophet (PBUH)’ in *Sur Sarang* and ‘bitter laments for Husayn’s death in Kerbela’ are powerful references because of their religious connotations. Deep veneration with the Prophet Muhammad (PBUH) and his grandson Husayn can be traced within Muslims but especially within Sufi settings the reverence attached with them is exemplary and Sufi poetic discourse gives a sufficient and prominent place to the tragedy of Kerbela. Another intertextual reference of ‘*Kech in Balochistan*’ contains historical and cultural significance as Punhun, the prominent character of the folktale of Sassui and Punhun belonged to *Kech*. Powerful intertextual reference attached with ‘Arabo-Persian tradition’ signifies the character of Majnun who acquires acclaim within ‘Arabo-Persian tradition’. Further, another significant reference to the folktale of Nuri and Prince Jam Tamachi in late 15th century was also traced which signifies the element of obedience and submission which characterize the local cultural aspects of Sindhi culture. Intertextual reference to the ‘Indian tale of the maid with the fish-smell’ was merged stating that the folktale of Nuri Jam Tamachi contained the distinct flavor of this tale. Intertextual reference to Hindi tale of *Sorathi* referred to the king who after being enthralled by captivating verses about divine love and surrender sung by the minstrel, offered him his head. This reference was further strengthened by the direct reference from Rumi regarding beheading:

“*What is beheading? Slaying the carnal soul in the Holy War*” (M 3: 2525)
Another direct quoting of the couplet translated from Rumi’s *Mathnawi* explicating Sassui’s deplorable condition on her way to the beloved and later the discovery of the beloved is quite significant aspect within local culture as the impact of the folktale is deeply embedded within masses:

“Not only the thirsty seek the water,
But the water seeks the thirsty as well.” (M 1:1741)

It is significant that the critics of Sufism and *Shah Jo Risalo* were also given a considerable space. Intertextual reference of Trumpp who thoroughly disliked Sufism is also significant in this perspective. Intertextual references of ‘Hindu interpreters’ and ‘British Scholar Herbert Tower Sorley’ were also incorporated within text demonstrating the limitation in their works.

Schimmel’s technique in merging the intertextual references indirectly quoting most of the references within the text was evident. The authorial voice remained distinct and prominent as merging of the references was skillfully and tactfully made. Power structures were also evident through the employment of powerful intertextual references. Schimmel’s construction of culture and ideology equipped with the power relations of her powerful interpretive discourse made on already powerful Sufi poetic discourse become prominent aspects within the study based on critical discourse perspective.

Then I proceed to the investigation of the textual dimensions exploring the semantic and grammatical relations. The insights of the investigation made within this perspective are as under:

4.3.4 Semantic/Grammatical Relations between Sentences and Clauses

Again, the presence of semantic and grammatical relations becomes a significant aspect as dimensions of ‘legitimation’ were deduced through these relations. Instances of Embedded Relations, Causal Relations, Contrastive Relations, Additive Relations, Relations of Elaboration,
Paratactical and Hypotactical Relations were investigated within the five texts of *Mystical Dimensions of Islam* under study.

I proceed by highlighting the instances of Embedded Relations found within the five texts under analysis from Text 6-10.

### 4.3.4.1 Embedded Relations

**Text 6** comprises following six instances of Embedded Relations:

i) “. . . a sensual image of the divine, which is hidden by its very brightness.”

ii) “. . . the concept of God as the hidden treasure who wanted to be known . . .”

iii) “. . . results in perfect love of the king, who becomes, in a wonderful transformation, the slave of his slave.”

iv) “. . . *Huma*’s shade, which in Persian tradition, conveys kingdom.”

v) “Majnun, the hero of the old Arabic tale, who lost his senses in his love of Laila.”

vi) “This woman, who was not even particularly beautiful, was for him the paragon of beauty . . .”

As many as three examples of Embedded Relations were examined in **Text 7**:

i) “. . . Jalaluddin Rumi, whose work will be discussed later.”

ii) “In the great hymn on love in Khosrau Shirin, to which these lines belong . . .”

iii) “Carried away by this love that manifests God’s beauty as well as His majesty . . .”

**Text 8** comprises as many as five examples of Embedded Relations:

i) “Everyone who has read Persian poetry, if only in translation knows of the nightingale . . .”

ii) “. . . the nightingale who yearns for the rose . . .”

iii) “. . . the falcon, the white royal bird who longs to return to his master’s fist.”

iv) “. . . elephant who dreamed of India . . .”

v) “. . . the mystic’s soul, which, in the midst of worldly entanglements, is blessed with the vision of its eternal homeland . . .”

**Text 9** contains following seven instances of Embedded Relations:
i) “. . . theologians, the *molla, which* form a standard motif of Persian and Turkish mystical and quasi-mystical poetry, were taken up again by the mystics . . .”

ii) “Such verses appealed particularly to the peasants and illiterate, *who* understood that even they—though not learned like the hairsplitting *mollas* . . .”

iii) “Sultan Bahu (*who* got his surname because each line of his *Siharfi, “Golden Alphabet”* ends with the exclamation *hu, “He”)”

iv) “. . . fine, precious thread, *which* God will buy at Doomsday for a good price.”

v) “. . . Abdu’l-Qadir Gilani *whose* glorious deeds are often celebrated.”

vi) “. . . eventually Hallaj and the judge *who* condemned him . . .”

vii) “. . . the Hindus *who* studied this aspect of Indo-Muslim religious life . . .”

As many as four instances of Embedded Relations were seen in Text 10:

i) “. . . Sohni *whose* beloved Mehanwal grazes cattle . . .”

ii) “. . . Sassui, a washerman’s daughter *whose* beauty attracts people from all parts of the country . . .”

iii) “Nuri, the fisher-maid *who* wins the heart of Prince Tamachi by her obedience and sweetness . . .”

iv) “. . . the king offers even his head to the minstrel *who* enthralls him with heartrending verses about divine love and surrender.”

It was quite evident within all the five texts under analysis that one clause was embedded within the other functioning as an element of another. The author has employed this tool in convincingly conveying her message by being comprehensive in her approach. It is important here that within all the above mentioned examples, aspects of local cultural settings, folk elements and ideology seem to be embedded within each instance which resultantly leave a convincing impact on the reader.

Further, enquiry into ‘additive relations’ was made. This tool of enquiry is a useful medium in investigating the points where the author becomes more assertive and justifies her point established earlier. Examples of Additive Relations from all the five texts are as under:
4.3.4.2 Additive Relations

Text 6 comprises as many as two examples of Additive Relations:

i) “Beauty would be meaningless if there were no love to contemplate it—we may think, once more, of the concept of God as the hidden treasure . . .”

ii) “. . . he alludes to the classical Arabic saying that the metaphor is the bridge toward reality—hence human love is generally called, in the Persian tradition, ishq-i majazi, metaphorical love.”

In the first instance ‘the concept of God as the hidden treasure’ mentioned in the second part of the sentence is an extension to the ideas of beauty and love. In the second example ‘ishq-e-majazi’ is an extension of the theme of the metaphor which was considered as a connector and a bridge toward reality. The theme is an extension of Ruzbihan Baqli’s concept of ishq-e-haqiqi as a ladder towards ishq-e-haqiqi.

As many as two examples of Additive Relations can be found within Text 7:

i) “For him, as for many of his predecessors and followers, love was the power innate in everything, working through everything and directing all things toward unification. Avicenna has expressed ideas of this kind in his Risala fi ’l ishq . . .”

ii) “Carried away by this love that manifests God’s beauty as well as His majesty—since it is fascinating and frightening, killing and reviving at the same time . . .”

The second part of the sentence in the first example works as a necessary addition to the theme of love put forward by Maulana Jalaluddin Rumi and many of his predecessors and followers. In the second instance also, the mystics’ attitude towards love was further extended in the second part of the sentence.

Text 8 contains following two examples of Additive Relations:

i) “. . . returning at the sound of the falcon’s drum from his earthly exile; he perches on his master’s forearm . . .”

ii) “The lily praises God, silently, with ten tongues; the violet sits modestly in its dark blue Sufi garb . . .”
In the first instance, Rumi’s pun on the word *baz* employed for falcon was elaborated. It is important here that the second clause was added to the first clause in further justifying the case of falcon put forward in the first clause. While in the second example, various imageries of flowers have been exploited. Violet’s Sufi demeanour is an extension to lily’s commendation for the Lord.

Only one instance of Additive Relations was traced in **Text 9**:

i) “. . . a natural propensity in a cotton-growing country; the dhikr could therefore be compared to the act of spinning . . .”

In the first clause, the concept of spinning and weaving was put forward which was further extended within the second clause where its association seemed to be established with the Sufi concept of *dhikr*.

**Text 10** comprises two instances of Additive Relations:

i) “. . . the poet did not need to dwell on the preliminaries; he could begin his poems with the most dramatic moment . . .”

ii) “Shah Adul Latif did use the inherited language of the Sufis; he himself acknowledged his indebtedness to Rumi . . .”

The extension of the theme of the style of the poems of Shah Abdul Latif Bhitai was witnessed within the second clause of the first instance where a preface was established within the first clause. In the second example, Shah Abdul Latif’s indebtedness to the Sufis was further strengthened where he admitted that he owed a great deal to Jalaluddin Rumi.

I observed that Schimmel was able to give more comprehensiveness to her discourse and produced desired outcomes through employment of additive relations. Local cultural and ideological perspectives were further supported and investigated through this tool of enquiry.

After having explored the instances of additive relations, I employ another tool of enquiry i.e., relations of elaboration. All the prominent examples of the ‘Relations of Elaboration’ extracted from the five selected texts of *Mystical Dimensions of Islam* are given as under:
4.3.4.3 Relations of Elaboration

Following two instances of Relations of Elaboration were witnessed in Text 6:

i) “Lover and beloved are unthinkable without each other---the lover’s actions consist completely of niyaz ‘asking and petitioning’. . .”

ii) “Only Ayaz went into Mahmud’s shade for here was his true kingdom: he is like the faithful, who does not seek glory and power . . .”

Within the first instance, a clear relation of elaboration was witnessed where lover’s state of affairs in the second clause is mere an elaboration of the strong ties between the lover and the beloved within the first clause. In example ii), Ayaz’s complete submission to Mahmud of Ghazna was witnessed elaborated within the second clause where the reference to an incident within the folk tradition was just given a passing reference.

Text 7 contains following two examples of Relations of Elaboration:

i) “More than any other poet, Rumi stresses the dynamic character of love—it makes the ocean boil like a kettle . . .”

ii) “. . . it is fascinating and frightening, killing and reviving at the same time—the mystics have seen love as “a flame that burns everything save the Beloved.”

In the first instance, Rumi’s emphasis on the dynamic character of love finds its explication within the second clause where its intensity has clearly been demonstrated. While in the second example, the intensity of the passion of love can be found completely elaborated within the second clause where its various attributes were given a passing reference in the first clause.

Text 8 comprises following three instances of Relations of Elaboration:

i) “Iqbal has interpreted the song of the nightingale in the context of his philosophy of unfulfilled union and longing—only longing gives the soul bird the capacity to sing . . .”

ii) “. . . . was to become one of Rumi’s favorite symbols—he often spoke of the soul as a falcon . . .”
iii) “. . . rubbing his head on his breast: thus the once lost and bewildered soul returns, at peace, to the Lord.”

A vivid relation of elaboration was traced within the first instance where Iqbal’s interpretations to the song depicting the longing of the nightingale were further seen explicated within the second clause where its longing was associated with its capacity to sing. In the second example, the imagery of falcon was just given a minor reference within the first clause where it was seen associated with the soul in the clause to follow. In the third example, a clear relation of elaboration was observed when baz ‘falcon’ rubbing his head on his breast was considered as the soul which at peace, returns to the Lord.

Text 9 contains following one example of Relations of Elaboration:

i) “. . . expressed their feeling of all-embracing unity with amazing audacity—the Sufi is no longer Arab, Hindu, Turk, or Peshawari . . .”

The stance of some of the mystical poets presented in the first clause was further strengthened within the second clause where the universal character of the Sufi was presented. Following one example of Relations of Elaboration was traced in Text 10:

i) “. . . wins the heart of Prince Tamachi by her obedience and sweetness—a story that can be historically located in the late fifteenth century . . .”

Further explanation of the most famous folktale of Nuri Jam Tamachi in which Nuri’s complete submission to Jam Tamachi was put forward was seen along with its historical perspective in the second clause.

It is pertinent here that within all the examples of relations of elaboration, the author tried to achieve the objectives of ‘legitimation’ and through ‘rationalization’ of various aspects, it was employed as an effective tool to legitimize and rationalize various cultural and ideological relations embedded within the instances.

‘Contrastive Relations’ were also explored within the five selected texts which are given as under:
4.3.4.4 Contrastive Relations

Text 6 contains following one instance of Contrastive Relations:

i) “. . . . he is like the faithful, who does not seek glory and power from anything created but only from his eternally rich beloved Lord.”

No evident traces of Contrastive Relations were seen in Text 7.

Following one instance of Contrastive Relations was seen in Text 8:

i) “. . . . carried away from his homeland to foreign lands, but when he sees his home in a dream, he will break all his chains and run there.”

Text 9 contains following examples of Contrastive Relations:

i) “. . . . not in the Persian form of ghazal in quantitative meters, but in Indian poetical forms . . .”

ii) “. . . . Siharfi, “Golden Alphabet” ends with the exclamation hu, He) do nothing but develop ideas well known to earlier Sufis . . .”

Following three examples of Contrastive Relations were found in Text 10:

i) “. . . . the most interesting part of Risalo in terms of mystical syncretism, but it should be read together with the praise of the Prophet . . .”

ii) “She decides to follow the caravan to Kech, but perishes in the desert . . .”

iii) “. . . . a story that can be historically located in the late fifteenth century, but that bears the distinct flavor of the Indian tale . . .”

In all the above instances, relations of ‘difference’ were investigated through presence of contrastive relations. A conjunction ‘but’ was employed to create these relations of difference. It is important here that local cultural and ideological traces embedded within these examples were asserted through the contrastive aspects present within these relations.

After having examined the contrastive relations, I further extract instances of ‘Causal Relations’, one of the significant dimensions of textual analysis. The instances of causal relations found within five selected texts of Mystical Dimensions of Islam are as under:
4.3.4.5 Causal Relations

Text 6 contains as many as six examples of Causal Relations of Purpose:

i) “The term *shahid*, “witness” is used for the beautiful beloved, for he is the true witness of divine beauty.”

ii) “. . . . the treasure of beauty (for “God is beautiful and loves beauty”) reveals itself in order to kindle love in the human heart.”

iii) “The great masters of love mysticism, like Ahmad Ghazzali, Jalaluddin Rumi, and Fakhruddin Iraqi, have regarded this worldly love as a pedagogical experience, a training in obedience toward God, since the human beloved, like God, has to be obeyed absolutely.”

iv) “Rumi compares it to the “wooden sword that the hero gives his child” so that the child may learn the technique of fighting.”

v) “. . . . becomes in literary tradition the model of the lover, because of his inclination toward his slave Ayaz.”

vi) “Only Ayaz went into Mahmud’s shade for here was his true kingdom . . .”

Only one instance of Causal Relations of Purpose was examined in Text 7:

i) “Carried away by this love that manifests God’s beauty as well as His majesty—since it is fascinating and frightening, killing and reviving at the same time . . .”

Text 8 comprises following three instances of Causal Relations of Purpose:

i) “Longing is the highest state soul can reach, for it results in creativity . . .”

ii) “. . . . the bird is called by this name because he longs to come back . . .”

iii) “. . . . is blessed with the vision of its eternal homeland and returns to the primordial Hindustan, for “the ass does not dream of Hindustan at all!”

Following instance of Causal Relations of Purpose was found in Text 9:

i) “. . . . Sultan Bahu (who got his surname because each line of his *Siharfi*, “Golden Alphabet” ends with the exclamation hu, “He”)”
Text 10 comprises following two examples of Causal Relations of Purpose:

i) “. . . replaces the baked jar that she uses as a kind of life vest with an unbaked vessel, so that the loving woman is drowned on her way.”

ii) “. . . as Majnun did, no longer needing the “real” Laila because he had become one with her . . .”

In all the above mentioned instances of causal relations, two clauses have been joined together with various underlined ‘linking words’ which produce relations of ‘cause and effect’ and ‘problem-solution’. The significant dimensions pertaining to local culture and ideological perspectives were highlighted through ‘problem-solution’ and ‘cause and effect’ relations embedded within the texts under study.

Another aspect pertaining to micro analysis is the enquiry of paratactic relations. The paratactic relations within the five selected texts are as under:

4.3.4.6 Paratactic Relations

Text 6 contains as many as three examples of Paratactic Relations:

i) “Beauty and love are interdependent, and many Persian, Turkish, and Urdu romances deal with the eternal story of husn u-‘ishq “beauty and love”.”

ii) “Beauty, though basically a static concept, has no full meaning without admiration and love, and the beloved needs the lover for his own perfection.”

iii) “One day the Huma bird passed over Mahmud’s army, and everybody rushed to be touched by the Huma’s shade.”

Text 7 comprises as many as two instances of Paratactic Relations:

i) “Avicenna has expressed ideas of this kind in his Risala fi’l ishq, and the poets like the romantic Nizami had described the magnetic force of this love . . .”

ii) “. . . . it makes the ocean boil like a kettle, as he says repeatedly, and it is the power that changes everything for the better, purifying it and quickening it . . .”

Following instances of Paratactic Relations were traced in Text 8:
i) “The narcissus looks, with languid eyes, toward the creator or makes the lover think of the friend’s half closed eyes, and the purple, curly hyacinth resembles the tresses of the beloved.”

No evident traces of Paratactical Relations were found in Text 9

Text 10 contains following instances of Paratactical Relations:

i) “... Sohni whose beloved Mehanwal grazes cattle on an island in the Indus and who slips away from her husband every night...”

ii) “Sohni’s sister-in-law discovers her adventures and replaces the baked jar...”

iii) “... the Prince of Kech in Balochistan, falls in love with her and stays with her.”

iv) “... she refuses to look after herself and tries to become as much unattractive as possible...”

v) “Sassui wanders through the desert, lonely and hopeless, and eventually discovers with a verse translated from Rumi’s Mathnawi...”

vi) “... he himself acknowledged his indebtedness to Rumi, and his work cannot be fully appreciated without a thorough knowledge of the different currents of Sufism in Iran and India.”

In all the above cited examples, paratactic relations were investigated through presence of two grammatically equal or coordinate clauses. No element of subordination was witnessed within them as two clauses were joined together with a coordinating conjunction. All the significant features pertaining to local culture and ideological underpinnings were embedded within two independent clauses.

Analysis of hypotactic relations, a significant aspect of ‘micro analysis’ and ‘textual dimension’ for Fairclough’s three dimensional model was further pursued. The instances of Hypotactic Relations observed within five selected texts of Mystical Dimensions of Islam are as under:

4.3.4.7 Hypotactic Relations

Text 6 contains as many as six examples of Hypotactic Relations:
i) “The term *shahid*, “witness” is used for the beautiful beloved, for he is the true witness of divine beauty.”

ii) “... the treasure of beauty (for “God is beautiful and loves beauty”) reveals itself in order to kindle love in the human heart.”

iii) “The great masters of love mysticism, like Ahmad Ghazzali, Jalaluddin Rumi, and Fakhruddin Iraqi, have regarded this worldly love as a pedagogical experience, a training in obedience toward God, since the human beloved, like God, has to be obeyed absolutely.”

iv) “Rumi compares it to the “wooden sword that the hero gives his child” so that the child may learn the technique of fighting.”

v) “... becomes in literary tradition the model of the lover, because of his inclination toward his slave Ayaz.”

vi) “Only Ayaz went into Mahmud’s shade for here was his true kingdom . . .”

Only one instance of Hypotactic Relations was examined in Text 7:

i) “Carried away by this love that manifests God’s beauty as well as His majesty—since it is fascinating and frightening, killing and reviving at the same time . . .”

Text 8 comprises following three instances of Hypotactic Relations:

i) “Longing is the highest state soul can reach, for it results in creativity . . .”

ii) “... the bird is called by this name because he longs to come back . . .”

iii) “... is blessed with the vision of its eternal homeland and returns to the primordial Hindustan, for “the ass does not dream of Hindustan at all!”

Following one instances of Hypotactic Relations was found in Text 9:

i) “... Sultan Bahu (who got his surname because each line of his Siharfi, “Golden Alphabet” ends with the exclamation *hu*, “He”)”

Text 10 comprises following two examples of Hypotactic Relations:

i) “... replaces the baked jar that she uses as a kind of life vest with an unbaked vessel, so that the loving woman is drowned on her way.”

ii) “... as Majnun did, no longer needing the “real” Laila because he had become one with her . . .”
Aspects of Hypotactical Relations were traced within the above mentioned instances where ideological and cultural dimensions were seen embedded within one independent and another subordinate clause. Relevant ‘connectors’ were employed to separate two clauses where one clause acted as a subordinate to another, main clause.

The researcher further traced Modality, one of the significant aspects of the three-dimensional model. Modality demonstrated author’s commitment to truth, obligation and necessity. Further, two types of Modality were also seen in the form of epistemic and deontic modalities which are given as under:

4.3.5 Modality
A blend of Epistemic and Deontic modalities was witnessed in all the five texts of Mystical Dimensions of Islam.

4.3.5.1 Epistemic Modalities

Epistemic modalities found in Text 6 are as under:

i) “The term shahid, “witness” is used for beautiful beloved.”

ii) “The beloved is usually called an “idol” in Persian Poetry . . .”

iii) “The other model of mystical love is Majnun, the hero of the old Arabic tale . . .”

In example i) and iii) commitment to truth was witnessed which is quite normal. An unmodalized verb ‘is’ has been used. Modal adverb ‘usually’ employed in the second example makes the commitment towards truth more firm.

Following two Epistemic Modalities were found within Text 7.

i) “It is only for the sake of the lovers that the sky revolves and the spheres turn . . .”

ii) “The classical definition of love that leads to true tauhid, extinguishing and consuming everything that is other than God, is expressed herein poetical language . . .”
In both the examples, author’s commitment to truth was investigated which is quite normal. No modal adverb was employed while an unmodalized verb was used in both the examples.

Following one instance of Epistemic Modality was traced in Text 8:

i) “Longing is the highest state the soul can reach . . .”

In this example commitment to truth was witnessed which is quite normal.

Following two examples of Epistemic Modalities were traced in Text 9:

i) “The imagery in poetry is generally taken from the daily life of villagers . . .”

ii) “This verse is a fine example of the kind of Panjabi and Sindhi imagery that could easily be understood by everybody in the village.”

In example i) ‘generally’ has been employed as a modal adverb with a ‘median level of commitment’ towards truth. In both the examples ‘is’ has been used as a modal verb.

Text 10 comprises following four instances of Epistemic Modalities:

i) “Some of the Surs are related to folk ballads of the Indus valley.”

ii) “The last chapter (Sur Ramakali) is one of the most interesting parts of the Risalo . . .”

iii) “Sassui is, in a certain sense, the feminine counterpart of Majnun . . .”

iv) “The verses of the Risalo are often repetitious.”

In example iv) ‘often’ has been used as a modal adverb making the commitment towards truth firm while no modal adverb was witnessed in all other examples. Modal verbs ‘is’ and ‘are’ have been used in all other examples making the author’s commitment towards truth normal.

4.3.5.2 Deontic Modalities

Following five Deontic modalities were noticed in Text 6.

i) “To look at him, to adore him from a distance, may induce the Sufi to truly religious ecstasy . . .”

ii) “Wherever beauty is revealed, there out of necessity, love must grow.”

iii) “Beauty would be meaningless if there were no love to contemplate it . . .”
iv) “. . . . we may think, once more, of the concept of God as the hidden treasure . . .”
v) “Rumi compares it to the “wooden sword” that the hero gives his child so that the child may learn the technique of fighting.”

In examples i), iv) and v), ‘may’ has been employed as a modal verb while in example ii) ‘must’ and in example iii) ‘would be’ are acting as auxiliary verbs. However no modal adverb can be traced in all the examples. The author’s commitment to obligation and necessity can be well investigated in all the instances.

In Text 7, no Deontic modalities were evidently witnessed.

**Text 8** witnesses following three examples of Deontic Modalities:

i) “. . . . even the unclean dog can become a model for the Sufi . . .”
ii) “The elephant, an elephant invariably connected with India, may be captured and carried away from his homeland to foreign lands . . .”
iii) “. . . . they may remind the mystic of black-hearted hypocrites . . .”

In examples i) ‘can’ has been employed as an auxiliary verb while in example ii) and iii) ‘may be’ and ‘may’ are acting as modal verbs. However no modal adverb was found out in all the examples. The author’s commitment to obligation and necessity is also evident in all the instances.

**Text 9** witnesses following one instance of Deontic Modality:

i) “. . . . the hairsplitting mollas—might attain a higher level of spiritual life through surrender in love.”

Author’s commitment towards obligation and necessity was traced through the modal verb ‘might’. No modal adverb was witnessed in this example.

Following four examples of Deontic Modalities were witnessed in **Text 10**:

i) “It should be read together with the praise of the Prophet . . .”
ii) “. . . . the journey by which she will find the lost beloved in her own heart . . .”
iii) “. . . . one day it will open to receive the raindrop that will become a pearl in its womb.”
iv) “. . . . his work cannot be fully appreciated without a thorough knowledge of the different currents of Sufism in Iran and India.”

Example iv) is a denial statement with the modal verb ‘cannot’ and a modal adverb ‘fully’ making the author’s commitment to necessity and obligation more firm. In example i) ‘should be’, example ii) and iii) ‘will’ has been used as auxiliary verbs.

It is pertinent to mention here that impact of modality may well be seen within ‘conversational analysis’ as it is more suited aspect of enquiry within dialogic discourse yet their presence in descriptive texts is indicative of author’s commitment to truth, obligation and necessity which are important aspects of enquiry within descriptive texts too. The researcher witnessed a blend of epistemic and deontic modalities within the five selected texts of Mystical Dimensions of Islam. Their presence conveyed various ‘levels of commitment’ with different ‘markers of modalization’. These modalities performed a significant role in investigating Schimmel’s subjectivity, her commitment to truth, necessity, obligation and her assertiveness while interpreting various cultural and ideological themes.

Assumptions play a pertinent role in exposing the embedded ideological aspects within various texts. Significant instances of assumptions investigated within five selected texts are as under:

4.3.6 Assumptions

A mix of ‘Value Assumptions’ and Existential Assumptions were found out within the five selected texts which clearly specify what is desirable.

4.3.6.1 Value Assumptions

For the same term ‘Evaluation’ is another word given in CDA. Value Assumptions found within Text 6 are as under:

i) “. . . . many Persian and Urdu romances deal with the eternal story of husn u-‘ishq . . .

ii) Beauty, though basically a static concept, has no full meaning without admiration and love . . .”
Authorial voice was traced through the value judgment of the author. At the same time, her ideologies attached with the concept of *husn u-ishq* were also traced when she considers *husn u-ishq* as an eternal story. Again, in the second instance, by declaring beauty as a static concept through her value assumption, the reflection of author’s beliefs was investigated. Schimmel’s subjective stance is reflected through the value assumption she attaches with various concepts.

As many as two examples of Value Assumptions signifying what is desirable were found within **Text 7**:

i) “The unsurpassable master of love and passion in the highest sense was, no doubt, Jalaluddin Rumi . . .”

ii) “Love is fire, it burns everything.”

The ideologies and beliefs of the author were evidently traced through her value assumption in which she declares Jalaluddin Rumi as the unsurpassable master of love and passion. Her subjectivity is triggered by this value assumption. In the second instance, another ideological representation of Schimmel’s beliefs was observed where she described the intensity of Love by declaring it as fire.

As many as six instances of Value Assumptions were found within **Text 8**:

i) “Attar’s *Mantiq ut-tair* became one of the favorite story books of Persian Literature.”

ii) “How touching is his imagery when he describes the noble bird . . .”

iii) “Every bird, every animal, has its place in this wonderful cosmos of Attar and his followers in the mystical path.”

iv) “The camel becomes the symbol of the faithful person who fulfills, in perfect patience, the orders of his master.”

v) “One of the finest images in Persian poetry . . .”

vi) “This is a perfect image of the mystic’s soul . . .”

In the first instance, the author’s value judgment has been highlighted as she considers Attar’s book as one of the favorite story books of Persian literature. In the second example also, the imagery of the falcon—a noble bird was declared as a touching imagery which is an instance of value assumption. While presenting various imageries of animals and birds, in the third
instance the author again presented a value judgment by declaring Attar’s cosmos as the wonderful one. Her subjectivity is quite evident through this instance. In instance iv), the patience of the faithful person was portrayed supporting it with a value assumption declaring it as ‘perfect patience’. His perfect patience was associated with the imagery of the camel. In example v) also the imagery of the elephant was also presented with a value assumption considering it as one of the finest images in Persian poetry. Again the imagery of the elephant was seen as a perfect image of the mystic’s soul in example v) which is a value judgment attached with the statement indicative of the authorial voice in which her ideologies are also attached.

As many as two instances of Value Assumptions were traced in Text 9:

i) “The more rustic, very idiomatic Panjabi and the complicated, musical Sindhi—both strong, expressive languages . . .”

ii) “. . . . to believe that here Indian advaita mysticism gained a complete victory over Islamic monotheism.”

The author’s beliefs and ideologies are quite evident within the first instance where many value assumptions were attached collectively with Panjabi and Sindhi languages. The author’s subjectivity is quite evident when she considers these two languages as more rustic and very idiomatic one while further these two languages were declared as strong and expressive ones. While in the second example, another value assumption was triggered by demonstrating the complete victory.

As many as four examples of Value Assumptions were found in Text 10.

i) “The last chapter (Sur Ramakali) is one of the most interesting parts of the Risalo in terms of mystical syncretism.”

ii) “. . . . he could begin his poems with the most dramatic moment . . .”

iii) “. . . . that bears the distinct flavor of Indian tale . . .”

iv) “Nuri is the model of the obedient soul blessed by the love of the mighty Lord for her constant devotion.”
In the first instance, Schimmel’s complete grasp over Shah Jo Risalo was witnessed through her value assumption in which she declares the last chapter of Risalo, Sur Ramakali as one of the most interesting parts of Risalo. Despite the fact that she was a Western scholar, her deep penetration to mystical settings is indeed remarkable. In the second instance, the attribute of Shah Abdul Latif Bhitai was presented with a value assumption that he could begin his poems with the most dramatic moment which again is indicative of the author’s ideologies attached with the statement. In the third example, it refers to the famous folktale of Nuri Jam Tamachi which has been presented with Schimmel’s subjectivity along with her beliefs attached with it. Schimmel refers to the folktale and asserts that the folktale bears the distinct flavor of the Indian tale of ‘the maid with the fish-smell. Many of the facets of local cultural settings were also investigated through this instance. In example iv) Nuri has been presented as the model of the obedient soul. Again, subjective and ideological traces were also investigated with this value assumption which is also a value judgment on the part of the author.

4.3.6.2 Existential Assumption

No traces of Existential Assumptions were investigated within Text 6. However, Text 7 comprises one instance of Existential Assumption marked by a demonstrative:

i) “This cosmological role of love was emphasized by Rumi . . .”

This existential assumption accentuates the existing universal role of love which was also asserted by Maulana Jalaluddin Rumi. The presence of a demonstrative makes this assumption an existential one.

Text 8 comprises following one instance of Existential Assumption marked by a demonstrative:

i) “This is a perfect image of the mystic’s soul . . .”

Imagery of elephant is an instance of existential assumption which according to Schimmel is considered as a perfect image of mystic’s soul. At the same time, this instance was also seen as an example of value assumption because author’s ideologies also seem to be attached with it when she considers the imagery of elephant-an animal as a perfect image of the mystic’s soul.
Text 9 comprises only one instance of Existential Assumption marked by a demonstrative:

i) “This verse is a fine example of the kind of Panjabi and Sindhi imagery that could easily be understood by everybody in the village.”

This existential assumption is supported by a demonstrative which refers to the Qur’nic reference (Sura 50-16) ‘He is nearer to you than your jugular vein’. The essence of this powerful existing reference was investigated within this instance where the existence of this reference strengthens people’s comprehension in the village life.

No evident traces of Existential Assumptions were seen in Text 10.

In all the above cited instances of assumptions, it was testified that the subjective stance of the author, her beliefs and ideological attachments with various themes were the prominent aspects of enquiry and lent a helping hand to the researcher in finding the relevant dimensions of enquiry for his research study.

I further probed into the stylistic inquiries as they become significant while exploring Schimmel’s texts. An enquiry was made to investigate Schimmel’s peculiar style on five selected texts which is as under:

4.3.7 Styles

Looking into style in texts of Mystical Dimensions of Islam, vocabulary and metaphor appear to be the most remarkable facets of style. Identity was also traced while examining these features of style. Schimmel’s style was reflected through the vocabulary and metaphors she employs.

4.3.7.1 Specialized Vocabulary

The use of specialized vocabulary in Text 6 is quite significant. ‘Truly religious ecstasy’ employed by the author reflects Schimmel’s subjectivity through which she conveys her message strongly. This truly religious ecstasy is an outcome of looking at the beautiful beloved. The essence of the very look at the beautiful beloved induces religious ecstasy. The shift from metaphorical love to the divine love becomes the subject matter of many of the Sufi poetic
discourses. Another vocabulary ‘pedagogical experience’ refers to the Sufi concepts which view this world as a pedagogical experience to be refined in the divine love. ‘Intense spiritual passion’ is another instance of specific employment of vocabulary which refers to the world where this sanctified passion sprouts and then gets deeply embedded in poetic discourse. It is important here that these words also have deeper impact on the local cultural settings.

Text 7 comprises specialized vocabulary through which Schimmel’s peculiar style was examined. Cultural traces were also traced through the vocabulary she employed. ‘Cosmological role of love’ was explicated by Jalaluddin Rumi who talked about the universality of love which encompasses everything. The theme of love can also be seen through various manifestations. In local cultural settings, this theme acquires access to the common folk through folktales and Sufi poetic discourse which fascinate the masses. Further, ‘dynamic character of love’ was also put forward by Rumi who described how the intense passionate love ‘makes the ocean boil like a kettle’. The special vocabulary ‘fascinating and frightening, killing and reviving’ presents various attributes of love which is so potent that it burns everything except the beloved.

Text 8 contains specific use of vocabulary through which Schimmel’s peculiar style was examined. ‘Silence and annihilation’ is an employment of vocabulary through which author’s subjective stance was investigated. Silence and annihilation is outcome of union with the beloved while longing leads to creativity as it is ‘the highest state, the soul can reach’. ‘Worldly entanglements’ was employed referring to the fetters the soul is entangled within the world of sufferings. The employment of ‘languid eyes’ points towards the narcissus which ‘looks towards the creator or makes the lover think of the friend’s half-closed eyes while the ‘tresses of the beloved’ is another word where hyacinth resembles the tresses of the beloved.

Through employment of specific vocabulary, the presence of author was investigated in Text 9. ‘Endless yearning of the soul’, ‘burning love’ and ‘longing for pain’ are instances of special vocabulary which become the subject matter of the themes of the Sufi poetic discourse. The evident traces of these themes were seen within folktales which are very close to the masses. ‘Indigenous musical modes’ refer to the kafis, dohras, way which were sung in Indian poetic form closely associated with indigenous musical modes. These poetic forms were sung in
enrapturing tunes which fascinated the common folk and most of them learnt them by heart. ‘All-embracing unity’ refers to the universal image of Sufism which embraces everyone with ‘amazing audacity’ This universal image of Sufi has been portrayed within the special use of vocabulary employed within the text under study.

**Text 10** witnessed specific vocabulary through which Schimmel’s style was reflected. The specific use of vocabulary ‘Mystical moods’ refers to various *Surs* where mystical moods are described. ‘Mystical syncretism’ is another specific employment of vocabulary referring to *Sur Ramakali* where various contrastive mystic beliefs are merged together in the form of mystical syncretism. ‘Sleep of heedlessness’ refers to the sleep of negligence or *khwab i-ghaflat* which made Sassui a great loser as she lost her beloved while she was sleeping heedlessly. ‘Heartrending verses’ refer to the Hindu folktale of *Sorathi* where the king is ready to offer his head to the minstrel who fascinated him with the heartrending verses from divine love and surrender. Sufi poetry is also characterized by the heartrending verses which enthrall the common man. Schimmel employs the vocabulary ‘slightest feelings’ pointing towards the female characters of the folktales whose slightest feelings and every change of mood was also encompassed by Shah Abdul Latif Bhitai. ‘Painful wandering’ refers to the journey of trials and tribulations experienced by Sassui in order to find her lost beloved. This painful wandering becomes the major theme within the Sufi poetic discourse where this painful journey finds its resemblance with the mystical journey towards the divine Beloved. The divine Beloved can be accessed after having experienced a long mystical experience full of trials and troubles. ‘Interior journey’ has been employed which points towards the folktale of Sassui Punhun. After confronting the miseries on the way towards the beloved, she finally turns towards the ‘interior journey’ which is the ultimate way to find the beloved in her own heart. The switch from *ishq i-majazi* ‘metaphorical love’ to *ishq i-haqiqi* ‘real love’ is the outcome of the interior journey. When Majnun found the divine beloved in his own heart, he no longer aspired for the real Laila. Similarly, when Rumi discovered his lost friend Shamsuddin within himself, he never longed for the physical intimacy of his friend. *Ishq i-majazi* and *ishq i-haqiqi* have been the major themes discussed within Sufi traditions and through their poetic discourse, the common folk also develop the familiarity with these themes.
While investigating local cultural dimensions within texts, ‘metaphor’ emerges as one of the significant dimensions of enquiry. Evident instances of the presence of metaphor within the five selected texts of *Mystical Dimensions of Islam* are as under.

### 4.3.7.2 Metaphors

Metaphors were noticed in **Text 6** in a good proportion. The metaphor of the ‘spinning woman’ has been employed for ‘a sensual image of the divine’. ‘The hidden treasure’ was metaphorically employed for the concept of God. The connection between the ‘love’ and the ‘wooden sword’ is another instance of metaphorical representation. Further the metaphor of ‘paragon of beauty’ has been exploited for ‘Laila’. Another metaphor is that of Niyaz ‘asking and petitioning’ which is often employed for the lover who always keeps on asking and petitioning while the metaphor of naz ‘coquetry’ is exploited for the beloved. It is important here that not only these metaphors are representative of the style of the author but also contain plenty of local cultural underpinnings.

**Text 7** does not comprise frequent instances of metaphors except the single example of the metaphor of ‘love’ as ‘fire’. In many of the poetic traditions the metaphor love as fire has been witnessed which explicates the intensity of the passionate love.

**Text 8** witnesses frequent exploitation of metaphorical representation. The metaphor of ‘nightingale’ was used for ‘the soul longing for eternal beauty’ while the ‘petals’ of rose were metaphorically represented for the ‘Koran of the Rose’. The researcher also witnessed the metaphors of ‘falcon, exiled in the company of black crows’ or ‘a nightingale surrounded by ravens’ or ‘a gazelle in the donkey stable’ employed for the ‘captivated soul’. Further ‘unclean dog’ was metaphorically presented as ‘lower soul’ and (Qura’nic reference) metaphor of ‘Seven Sleepers’ was used for the ‘saintly people’. The metaphor of ‘Red tulips with their dark scars’ metaphorically represented ‘black-hearted hypocrites’. *Ku ku* of the dove asking the way toward the beloved and *lak lak* of stork for his pious attestation are also instances of metaphor. Further, the metaphor of ‘duck’ was used as ‘human being’ who is ‘half bound to earth, half living in the ocean of God’. Crow has also been metaphorically associated with the ‘ugly winter landscape of this worldly existence’. ‘Camel has also been seen as a metaphor in a different perspective...
representing the ‘faithful person fulfilling the orders of his master in perfect patience’ while elephant as a metaphor represents the ‘mystic’s soul amidst worldly entanglements’. It is significant here that the author’s style was evident through the metaphors she employs within the text under study.

No evident traces of evident metaphors were seen in Text 9.

‘Camel’ was used as a metaphor in Text 10 as the symbol of the ‘base faculties that become trained during the long journey toward the beloved’. Author’s peculiar style is further enriched through incorporation of various metaphors within the text. The right placement of these metaphors is also indicative of the technique the author employs to make her message more fascinating.

4.3.8 Exchanges, Speech Functions and Grammatical Mood

‘Knowledge exchange’ was witnessed in all the five texts of Mystical Dimensions of Islam while ‘statement’ is the speech function employed within the texts. As the texts are mostly the analytical and evaluative work, types of statement witnessed were mainly ‘statements of fact’ and ‘evaluation’. ‘Prediction’ and ‘hypothetical statement’ were nowhere seen in all the five texts as the nature of the discourse which is a Sufi discourse does not require ‘predictions’ and ‘hypothetical statements’ to be employed within. Interrogative and imperative impact is scanty as they are mainly employed in interactional and conversational discourse. ‘Grammatical mood’ throughout the texts was found as ‘declarative’ one.

The researcher further investigated significant ‘discourses’ employed within the texts as it was a pertinent aspect of the study. Major instances of ‘discourses’ merged and some of its important aspects witnessed within the texts are as under:
4.3.9 Discourses

The discourses of beauty, love ‘husn u ‘ishq’ and their interdependence were elaborated within Text 6. Further, a reasonable ‘mixing of discourses’ of metaphorical love ‘ishq i majazi’, asking and petitioning ‘niyaz’ and coquetry ‘naz’ were also observed. Themes are connected with one another developing a reasonable poise in the text and their flow is quite natural.

Text 7 is also the extension of Text 6. The most discussed and culturally enriched discourse of ‘love’ with its various phases has been elaborated in Text 7. The discourse of classical definition of Tauhid embedded in Sufi traditions was further established within the text. However, I found ‘mixing of discourses’ of ‘fire symbol of love’, extinguishing and consuming everything other than God, has also been explicated. This element has been an integral part in the local cultural tradition. Various discourses established within the text have been well-linked and established and the theme development is quite natural.

Text 8 is replete with the discourses of ‘imagery of birds’ and ‘imagery of animals’. Various birds and animals were employed as metaphors to produce certain impacts. Mixing of discourses of ‘Seven Sleepers’ and ‘lower soul’ were also witnessed within the text. These imageries have a significant value in the local cultural settings as they still sustain their impact after being narrated in many of the Sufi discourses. Again, a very natural flow was developed in terms of transition from one discourse to another. A visible link within the discourses was also traced within the text.

Text 9 commences with a very prominent discourse mentioning the similarities in the types of literature that flourished in the Punjab and Sind. Further the mystical themes employed within these literatures were also briefly touched upon. The discourse of traditional accusation against the molla, which gained more acclaim within the common folk, has also been given due space. The discourse of daily used imagery employed by the mystical poets was drawn upon within the text, especially the reference to great Panjabi poet Sultan Bahu and his famous Alif Allah Chambey Di Buti is a significant discourse mentioned within the text. Then the most famous discourses of spinning and weaving were explicated which are often symbolically
employed by Sufi poets. The relevance of spinning with *dhikr* was also highlighted within the text. A brief mention of the discourse pertaining to the most popular Sufi saint Abdul Qadir Gilani and hymns written in his praise were also found. The discourse referring to Hallaj’s fate also occupies a prominent place within the text. The discourses of Indian *advaita* mysticism, love for the Sheikh and Hindu concept of the love for the *guru* have been briefly related within the text. The instances of ‘mixing of discourses’ were also investigated as the researcher also traced the Koranic reference from Sura 50:16 further elaborating the concept of *dhikr*. Schimmel’s effort in connecting various discourses with a reasonable proportion was also witnessed and the discourses established a natural flow.

**Text 10** is marked with the discourses of various themes presented in different *Surs* (chapters) of *Shah Jo Risalo* by Shah Abdul Latif Bhitai. These themes include: ideal lover in the traditional terminology, camel as a symbol of the base faculties, longings of the seafarer’s wife, the discourse of the dry tree in the desert, the wild grouse and discourses of the group of Yogis. Further the discourse of mystical syncretism, praise of the Prophet (PBUH) and the lamentation on Husayn’s death in Kerbela were also touched upon. It is important here that the researcher investigated just the passing references of the themes of various discourses without finding any details of the concepts. Further, the discourses of various folk ballads which gained greater acclaim within the common folk, were also witnessed. They included: Sohni Mehanwal, Sassui Punhun, Marui, Nuri Jam Tamachi and Laila Majnun. The entire love phenomenon starting with the miseries of the journey towards the beloved in finding the Divine Beloved which lives in the heart was briefly encompassed. The discourses of the critics of Bhitai have also been incorporated within the text. It is important here that plenty of discourses were given space within the text where they are attached with only a brief description.

I further proceeded to the third dimension of Fairclough’s three-dimensional model i.e., ‘representation of social events’ in pursuit of social dimension, a significant aspect of enquiry in CDA. The elaborate analysis investigating ‘representation of social events’ within the five selected texts of *Mystical Dimensions of Islam* is as under:
4.3.10 Social Representation of Events

Text 6 is marked with the social representation of the ‘eternal story of **husn u ishq**’ encompassing the entire text. This very theme is the most discussed theme in many of the folk traditions and it has fascinated the common masses to a great deal. ‘The beauty of Beloved’ has been socially represented supporting it with the Prophetic tradition: ‘God is beautiful and loves beauty’. Schimmel strengthened the text with authentic and powerful references wherever she deemed it suitable. Sufi poets also seem to be captivated with the beauty of the Beloved. To them, the beloved referred to the divine Beloved. Again, this theme traveling through mystic and folk traditions becomes an integral part of the local cultural settings. The next social representation is that of ‘worldly love as a pedagogical experience’. This theme has a religious connotation as well and was further employed by the Sufi poets who considered this world as a testing ground for the life hereafter. ‘Heart is polished by the fire of love’ to make it purified and sanctified for the Divine Beloved. This theme is the extension of the previous theme. Social representation of the theme of **Niyaz** ‘asking and petitioning’ which is an attribute of the lover and **Perfect naz** ‘coquetry’ often employed by the beloved is another distinctive aspect of the text under study. The social representation of ‘Beauty, a static concept’ which has ‘no full meaning without admiration and love’ is also the extension of the concept of beauty, love, lover and beloved.

Another Social representation which gives the text greater strength is that of ‘historical facts to point out eternal truth’. Social representation of the story of Mahmud and Ayaz is the instance of the historical fact elucidating the eternal truth. This historical and cultural reference has a considerable cultural value where the obedience of the slave Ayaz to his master Mahmud of Ghazna was seen as an exemplary one. This historical reference is widely quoted and is embedded within Sufi discourse which also centers around the concept of submission and obedience. Another significant social representation is that of ‘model of mystical love Majnun for his love with Laila’. A bulk of cultural underpinnings is attached with the folktale of ‘Laila and Majnun’ as it is very close to the common masses, therefore, developing significant impact on local culture. ‘**Ishq-i-majazi and Ishq-i-haqiqi**’ are socially represented which are further strengthened by Ruzbihan Baqli’s words: ‘The love of a human being is the ladder toward the
love of Merciful’ where metaphorical love finds its way towards the real love. Again, this theme is very popular amongst the Sufis who are convinced of the truth of the same theme.

The most prominent social representation is that of Husn-\(u\) ishq, the story of Mahmud and Ayaz, Laila and Majnun, \(Ishq-i-majazi\) and \(ishq-i-haqiqi\) and themes can be found with detailed enquiry while all other minor themes were merged within these major social representations. Abstract social representation characterizes all the references.

**Participants**

Following Participants were witnessed within the social representation:
God, Beautiful beloved, divine beauty, love, Persian, Turkish and Urdu romances, idol, Ahmad Ghazzali, Jalaluddi Rumi, Fakhruddin Iraqi, soul, Baqli, child, Mahmud, Ayaz, Poets of Iran, king, Huma bird, beloved Lord, Majnun, Laila, Persian poetry, Jami

All the Participants are reflective of the Sufi, local cultural, historical and ideological perspectives and are significant within their particular context.

**Processes**

Following Processes of various sorts were merged within the entire text under study:
adore, induce, contemplate, grow, deal, hide, want, reveal, think, regard, obey, consist of, become, educate, command, lie, exist, pass, convey, seek, interpret, allude, behold, call, sum up, contract, ascend etc.

All the ‘forms of activity’ associated with these Processes were extracted from their particular context rich in cultural and ideological perspectives.

**Circumstances**

Prominent Circumstances mentioned within the text under study are as under:
as the hidden treasure, as a pedagogical experience, from the satanic and base insinuations, in a wonderful transformation

The Circumstances worked as adverbials and added more meanings to various ‘forms of activity’ already merged within the text. They, along with the Processes they were employed with, contained deeper cultural and ideological underpinnings.

**Text 7** comprises the instances of the social representation of the theme of love with its various dimensions. It commences with reference to the great Sufi poet Rumi and his followers and predecessors. For them, love was the power innate in everything. The theme has been socially represented in poetic discourse. Rumi’s discourse was very close within the common folk who used to learn his poetic discourse by heart. Therefore, the theme of love merged in his poetry was very popular within the masses. To them, it works through everything and directs everything to unification. Another social representation is that of the ‘cosmological role of love’ put forward by Rumi which like an ocean encompasses everything and everything revolves round love. ‘Dynamic character of love’ is the extension of the theme of love existing in various dimensions. ‘Magnetic force of love’ is another representation of the theme of love. This very idea was presented by the Sufi saint Nizami. According to him, it is the love of the magnet which attracts iron with vehement longing. Various dimensions of love rapidly penetrated within the common folk through folk and mystic poetry and the deep imprints of these themes were witnessed in the culture where these themes were originated. Social representation of the theme of love as fire was another prominent reference often found within Sufi settings and was reflected within Sufi discourse. ‘Love manifests God’s beauty as well as His majesty’ is another theme whose representation can be found within Sufi poetic discourse. The extension of the classical definition of the theme of love can be found with the concept of true tauhid ‘oneness of God’. This very theme of ‘tauhid’ extinguishes and consumes everything that is other than God. Sufi poetry which strongly conveys the Divine aspect of love is also reflective of ‘taihid’.

Equal prominence to almost all the themes merged within text under study could be observed and the researcher could not trace any instance of comparatively less prominent aspect.
As the prevalent theme throughout the text is ‘love’, therefore, abstract social representation was observed throughout the text.

Though number of activated processes is greater than the passivated one, yet a visible frequency of passivated processes was also noticed in Text 7.

**Participants**

Following Participants were witnessed within Text 7:
Jalaluddin Rumi, predecessors, followers, love, Avicenna, Nizami, Zulaykha, Joseph, baker, blacksmith, poor lover, mystics, Beloved, Muslim poets, Ghalib

Deep local cultural and ideological underpinnings and references were witnessed attached with these Participants. All the Participants worked as subjects or objects of various ‘forms of activity’ associated with them.

**Processes**

Various processes mentioned in Text 7 are as under:
Discuss, work, direct, express, describe, belong, claim, emphasize, agitate, revolve, turn, stress, boil, say, change, purify, quicken, burn, die, see, lead, extinguish, consume, express, take over

Various ‘forms of activity’ reflected through these Processes contained various aspects associated with Sufi themes and depicted local cultural and ideological underpinnings.

**Circumstances**

Circumstances explicated within Text 7 are as under:
Innate in everything, for the better, in the highest sense

These Circumstances added more meanings to various Processes employed within the texts and gave more strength to the cultural and ideological themes merged within the texts where they were employed as adverbials supporting different Processes.
Text 8 is marked with social representation of the imagery of birds. These imageries had a special relevance with different aspects of the local cultural settings. The social representation of the ‘nightingale yearning for the rose’ is the representative of the soul longing for eternal beauty. Persian poetry is replete with the imagery of nightingale which was employed in various connotations. Soul as a falcon exiled in the company of falcons. The next social representation is that of the falcon which longs to return to his master’s fist. The same imagery was applied on lost and bewildered soul which returns at peace, to the Lord. The traces and representation of this theme can be seen in Sufi settings where Sufi poets always asserted on returning to the Divine Beloved. Social representation of Dove’s ku ku, asking the way toward the beloved, gained greater prominence within the poetic discourse and the relevance of this theme can be investigated in local cultural settings as well. Similarly, Stork’s lak lak was associated with al-mulk lak, al-amr-lak, al-hamd-lak which implies Thine is the kingdom, Thine is the order, Thine is the praise-which strongly conveys complete devotion and veneration to the Divine Beloved. Further, Duck was employed as a symbol of human beings which remains ‘half bound to earth, half living in the ocean of God’. Crow was employed in poetic discourse giving various connotations. But here it is associated with the ‘ugly winter landscape of this worldly existence’. Sufi poets often resort to the imagery of camel symbolizing a faithful person whose level of submission and obedience is an exemplary one. This social representation was found with the text under study. Another social representation is that of an unclean dog which was associated here with an historical event. It becomes a model for Sufi, keeping faithful company with Seven Sleepers, became purified and sanctified. The reference to Seven Sleepers has been taken from the Holy Qura’n, Surah Al-Kahaf. The entire phenomenon refers to the lower soul which purifies in the company of saintly people. The social representation of the animal imagery of elephant portrays a perfect image of the mystic’s soul which despite worldly entanglements seems blessed with the vision of eternal homeland. Various other social representations of flowers, leaves and petals also carry deeper meanings where ‘flowers become a tongue to praise God’, on leaves and petals, ‘God’s wisdom can be read’, ‘lily praises God silently with ten tongues’, ‘the violet sits modestly in its dark blue Sufi garb, its head ‘on the knee of meditation, ‘red tulips with dark scars represent burnt hearts of lovers or the black-hearted hypocrites’. Narcissus looking with languid eyes toward the creator makes the lover think of the friend’s half-closed eyes while the
Purple, curly hyacinth resembles the tresses of the beloved. All these imageries have a significant social representation and relevance; therefore, the mystic poets employed them to effectively convey their message to the common folk. These imageries were taken from the familiar surroundings of the people they were closely intimate with.

Though the concrete entities have been presented within the text yet the social representation attached with them is quite abstract. The frequency of activated Processes is greater than the Passivated ones. However, some of the processes were passively employed.

Imageries of nightingale, falcon and elephant were given more space and considerable prominence as various attributions and representations were attached with them and they were the most discussed imageries in mystic literature while all other imageries were given prominence but not as much as compared to the former ones.

Participants

Following Participants were observed within Text 8:

Birds, Persian literature, nightingale, soul, Ruzbihan, Koran of the rose, Iqbal, Attar, Rumi, falcon, crow, ravens, gazelle, donkey, Simurgh, sultan, Lord, Sanai, dove, stork, duck, camel, dog, Seven Sleepers, saintly people, Khaqani, Nizami, elephant, India, mystic’s soul, ass, flower, mystic poets, God, leaf, petal, lily, violet, tulip, lovers, hypocrites, narcissus, creator, friend, hyacinth beloved

The above mentioned Participants were extracted from Sufi interpretive discourse rich in local cultural and ideological perspectives where they acted as subjects and objects to various ‘forms of activity’ merged within the text.

Processes

Processes of various types were merged within the text under study:
elaborate, become, read, know, yearn, repeat, sing, interpret, give, reach, bring, describe, long, speak, exile, surround, invent, use, call, return, perch, rub, get, connect, fulfill, dream, capture, carry, see, break, bless, express, look, praise, sit, grow, remind, think, resemble

All the above mentioned Processes are reflective of rich cultural and ideological references within which they were employed as ‘forms of activity’.

Circumstances

Prominent Circumstances observed within the text under investigation are as under:
more and more, without tiring, without complaint, in the context of his philosophy of unfulfilled union and longing, at peace, silently with ten tongues, in its dark blue Sufi garb, with their dark scars on their hearts, with languid eyes

The above mentioned Circumstances added more meanings to various ‘forms of activity’ merged within the text and gave more strength to already established context.

Text 9 portrays the social representation of the close similarity between Panjabi and Sindhi literature. Though Panjabi is known to be more rustic and very idiomatic while Sindhi is a little complicated and musical but both of them are similar in a sense that they both are strong and expressive languages and can therefore be considered as an excellent media to convey mystical feelings. Both languages have produced great Sufi saints who have been very popular within the masses and therefore, their message penetrated within them through their poetic discourse.

Another social representation is that of the ‘portrayal of endless yearning of the soul, burning love, longing for pain’ which was conveyed through the poetic discourse of both these languages. The medium through which these themes were conveyed to the common folk included Dohras, kafis, way which were mostly employed in Indian past. In rural cultural settings, Dohras, kafis, way acquired a special acclaim and popularity among the folk and the folk even learnt many of them by heart and sang them in various melodious tunes. Social
representation of dry-as-dust theologians, the *molla* and their ascetic beliefs were often criticized in Sufi poetic discourse. The *molla* and the *Sufi* are the two contrastive characters who have visible imprints on local cultural settings. ‘Surrender in love’ is another theme which presents the essence and crux of the teachings of Sufis and it causes a higher level of spiritual life. Another social representation is that of the poetic discourse of Sultan Bahu, a great Sufi poet, who portrays the daily life of villagers through the imageries he employs from gardening and planting. His Popular *seh harfî* ending with the exclamation *hu* acquired a special acclaim within the Sufi and local cultural settings and the devotees sing this enrapturing melody with complete devotion. Social representation of Spinning and weaving were employed by the Sufi poets to effectively convey their message. Spinning was associated with *dhikr*. Heart is refined through *dhikr* which God will buy for a good price on Doomsday. The concept of spinning is very close to the village folk and therefore, through employing this theme in poetic discourse, it became easier for Sufi poets to effectively convey the theme. Social representation of the hymns extolling the great masters of the mystical orders is another theme which can be witnessed within local cultural settings especially that of Sind. Devotees and *Mureedain* organize special gatherings for their *Pir* or mystical guide where hymns in special poetic discourse are presented in melodious tunes extolling their mystical guide and his mystical order. So, this theme has deeper local cultural underpinnings.

Extension of the theme presents the great saint Abdul Qadir Gilani, his miracles and the poems composed in his honour. Abdul Qadir Gilani is considered to be the most esteemed figure in Sufi settings; therefore, his special attributes also reached the folk through the poetic discourse of the Sufi saints who often extolled the great Sufi saint. Fate of Mansur Hallaj was given a passing reference. This very theme has also occupied special place in Sufi poetic discourse of various Sufi saints. Another significant social representation is that of a universal concept of Sufi whose unique stature is given a special esteem in all the religions. He does not belong to a territory or religion rather his standing is unique and universal. Further, Indian *advaita* mysticism and Islamic monotheism were collectively presented with their unique and distinct attributes. Love for the *Sheikh* in Islamic mysticism is an integral part while typical Hindu love for the *guru* can also be seen as a prominent reference in Hindu beliefs.
The social representation of all the themes were given considerable significance but it is important here that reference to Mansur Hallaj was comparatively given less prominence and only a passing reference was observed within the text under study. Again abstract social representation was witnessed within all the instances.

Almost an equal level of frequency of activated and passivated Processes was witnessed within the text under study. However, the frequency of passivated Processes was comparatively greater than other texts.

**Participants**

Following Participants were observed within **Text 9**:
Panjab, Sind, mystical literature, God, mystical poets, classical and folk music, the molla, mystics, Panjabi poet, peasants, illiterate, imagery, villagers, Sultan Bahu, Siharfi, rural mystics, Pir, dhikr, spinning, Abdul Qadir Gilani, geographical poems, Mansur Hallaj, Arab, Hindu, Turk, Peshawari, judge, lover, divine reality, Indo-Muslim religious life, Indian advaita mysticism, Islamic monotheism, sheikh, guru etc.

References from historic, Sufi, local cultural and ideological contexts were associated with the Participants mentioned above where they became subject and object to various ‘forms of activity’ merged within the text.

**Processes**

Prominent Processes witnessed in the text under study include:

show, express, center, sing, inherit, connect, adapt, invent, appeal, understand, attain, take, get, end, develop, spread, point, plant, combine, observe, compared, enhanced, turn, buy, produced, extol, celebrate, compose, condemn, see, lead, study, believe, gain, become, explain etc.

The above mentioned Processes develop a special link with the rich local cultural and Sufi context where they were employed as ‘forms of activity’ to establish the author’s stance.
Circumstances

Following Circumstances were also observed within the text under study:
with amazing audacity, in forms inherited from Indian past, on the basis of classical and folk music, through surrender in love etc

Folk and Sufi perspective were inferred from the above mentioned Circumstances which acted as adverbials and gave more strength to the text after being attached with different ‘forms of activity’.

Text 10 gives a brief snapshot of themes and social representations in various Surs of Shah Jo Risalo. It commences with ‘ballads of Indus valley’ represented in some Surs of Shah Jo Risalo. These ballads deal with prominent folktales which are deeply embedded within local cultural settings. Social representations of mystical moods or ideal lover were also encompassed within the text under study. Further, miscellaneous discourses mentioned in various Surs of Shah Jo Risalo merged together only with a passing reference. Mystical syncretism has also been asserted in one of the Surs. In mysticism, various discrete traditions and contradictory beliefs form the basis of mystical syncretism. This concept gains prominence within Sufi settings. ‘Praise of the Prophet (PBUH)’ is another theme which was incorporated within the text. This theme has always been very popular not only within Sufi settings but also acquires acclaim within the common folk. Many of the Sufis resorted to the poetic discourse admiring various attributes of the Holy Prophet (PBUH). ‘Bitter laments for Husayn’s death in Kerbela’ is another theme which was given sufficient space in Shah Jo Risalo. The tragedy of Kerbala though brought extreme anguish for the Muslims across the globe yet it had deep impacts on Sufi poets as well who expressed their lamentations through Sufi poetry which was very close to the common folk. Social representations of the most prominent folktales of Sohni Mehanwal, Sassui Punhun, Marui, Nuri and Jam Tamachi were briefly portrayed within the text. The significance of these tales was investigated through their deep impacts on the local cultural settings. These folktales reached the folk through the great Sufi poets. The folktales were not only reflective of the traditional love element portrayed within them rather contained deeper cultural underpinnings worth enquiry. The theme of ‘sleep of heedlessness’ has also been socially
represented referring to Sassui who lost her beloved Punhun when she woke up from the sleep of heedlessness. This very theme also occupies a prominent place in the mystic discourse with many connotations referring to \textit{Khwab-i-ghaflat} which has strongly been condemned.

‘Hindi tale of Sorathi’ with its brief description was also merged within the text to further strengthen the theme already established. It also gives the text a tinge of diversity as it not only encompasses the themes established in Islamic mysticism but also various concepts from other traditions have also been merged within the text. Social representation of ‘the painful wandering’ was also incorporated within the text under study which ultimately resulted in ‘interior journey’ when the lover finds his beloved within his own self. The same phenomenon was experienced by Majnun when he no longer needed Laila and became one with her. Rumi also explored his lost friend Shamsuddin within his own heart after looking for him everywhere. ‘Dying before you die’ is another social representation which was traced within the text under study. This phenomenon is associated with Sassui who gets an access to higher unitive stage by dying before she dies. This discourse was conveyed to the folk through the mystical and folk poetry which deeply influenced them.

Abstract social representation was witnessed throughout the text though many of the concrete elements are present in the text. But those concrete aspects were abstractly represented.

Both activated and passivated processes were observed but the frequency of the activated ones was greater than the latter with the text under study.

Though many of the themes and discourses were merged within the text yet the prominence and more space was given to those discourses which became an integral part of the local cultural settings through the folktales which encapsulated them.

\textbf{Participants}

\textbf{Text 10} comprises following instances of the Participants employed within the text:
Indus Valley, Sassui, Punhun, Lila, Chanesar, Sohni, Mehanwal, Umar, Marui, Nuri, Jam Tamachi, camel, Laila, Majnun, beloved, seafarer’s wife, wild grouse, poet, yogis, Koranic verses, Prophet (PBUH), Husayn, Abdul Latif, tales, heroine, soul, poems, husband, alligators, Sohni’s sister-in-law, loving woman, mighty Lord, king, minstrel, Rumi, poet, Risalo, critics, Sufis, Hindu interpreters, British scholar, Herbert Tower Sorley

Participants employed within Text 10 are reflective of various folk and Sufi contexts they were extracted from, performed various ‘forms of activity’ establishing author’s ideologies within the text.

Processes

Processes of various types observed within text under study are as under:
relate, deal, describe, sing, become, return, shine, read, rely, know, need, dwell, begin, elaborate, translate, graze, slip away, discover, use, replace, drown, attract, stay, send, awaken, find, decide, follow, perish, transformed, kidnapped, refuse, look after, try, wait, win, locate, bear, offer, enthrall, depict, wander, turn, find, discover, reach, die, compare, surround, open, receive, consider, thought, dislike, appreciate etc.

The above mentioned Processes developed their intimacy with cultural and ideological context where they were employed as various ‘forms of activity’.

Circumstances

Prominent instances of Circumstances employed within the text under analysis are as under:
with the most dramatic moment, in traditional terminology, in terms of mystical syncretism, with the praise of the Prophet (PBUH), from all parts of the country, in a certain sense, confined in his castle, for her constant devotion, lonely and hopeless, in the midst of her painful wandering etc.
Folk and Sufi context rich in local cultural perspectives were traced within the above mentioned Circumstances where they acted as adverbials to various ‘forms of activity’ and added substantial meanings to them.

The investigation of substantial aspects of enquiry into five representative texts of Schimmel’s Mystical Dimensions of Islam provided sufficient insights into her work. CDA and exclusively Fairclough’s three-dimensional model proved to be an effective method of enquiry as it played a pivotal role in exposing the embedded local cultural and ideological perspectives. Various prominent aspects of internal and external analysis were exploited in this perspective to seek the relevant responses of the research inquiries already established in the form of research questions.

As through a Veil is the third core book I have selected for my research study in which Schimmel provides the reader an insight into Jalaluddin Rumi’s mystical poetry. I remained very specific towards my objectives and tried not to digress. An investigation of the local cultural and ideological perspectives employed by Schimmel while analyzing Sufi poetry was the major concern I focused. The selection of five texts was tactfully made, being mindful of those texts which were thoroughly related to my research pursuits. Brief insights into the core book were also given in Chapter 1 i.e., Introduction. The procedure of enquiry and the methodological perspectives remained the same that were pursued while analyzing Pain and Grace and Mystical Dimensions of Islam. The five selected texts (Text 11-15) and their analysis based on Fairclough’s three-dimensional model is as under:

4.4 As through a Veil–5 Selected Texts

Text 11:
“The mystery of a rejuvenating dearth . . . . . . . . Friedrich Ruckert in his ghazals.”
As through a Veil (Schimmel, 1982, P.132-133, see appendix 11)

Text 12:
“It should not be overlooked . . . . . . . . . . . . . . and images is as visible as in high poetry.”
As through a Veil (Schimmel, 1982, P.140-142, see appendix 12)
Text 13:
“One enjoys these poems best when . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . to quicken the dead hearts.”
*As through a Veil* (Schimmel, 1982, P.145-146, see appendix 13)

Text 14:
“Hir Ranjha in Panjabi is the best known example . . . . . . . . I had not known it before.”
*As through a Veil* (Schimmel, 1982, P.152-155, see appendix 14)

Text 15:
“Folk poetry, as we mentioned, developed at a time . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . as-salam alaik ya Gesudaraz.”
*As through a Veil* (Schimmel, 1982, P.160-161, see appendix 15)

I proceeded with my analysis examining the aspects related to ‘social events’ within the five selected texts of *As through a Veil*.

### 4.4.1 Social Events

The five texts under study were extracted from ‘Rumi and the Metaphors of Love’ and ‘Mystical poetry in the Vernaculars’ chapters of *As through a Veil*. This volume is based on five lectures delivered by Schimmel within the auspices of American Council of Learned Societies in 1980 which were later published. The very objective behind selection of these 5 texts lies within the cultural traces embedded within them in a reasonable proportion. The discourse represented here is a ‘Sufi Discourse’ as it is an investigative study of the mystical poetry in Islam. I came across many instances where cultural representations were found within social events. They have been highlighted in many aspects to follow. Texts appeared to be the part of ‘chain of social events’ where Schimmels’ pen probed into the social events explicated in the mystical poetry of the vernaculars and the metaphors of love employed by Rumi. The overall tone of the five texts is analytical and investigative while all the texts again are descriptive like the texts of other core books. The roots of the texts were found within the book while no connection in terms of ‘chain or network of texts’ could be traced other than this book. Again, it is remarkable here that the aspects of intertextuality may not be considered here within this perspective. All the five texts
were seen as an extension in terms of the theoretical construction already established within various chapters of the book.

Another research pursuit was the investigation of ‘Genre’ within the five selected texts of the core book. The research insights within this perspective are as under:

**4.4.2 Genre**

The genre within which these texts were placed is ‘Sufi Discourse’ which is marked by its peculiar tone. However, descriptive and analytical spirit prevails in all the texts as they are analytical work of a writer who has been inclined towards Sufi discourse since long. Her pursuits towards Sufi and cultural dimensions of discourse were found worth investigating for the researcher. No evident ‘genre nixing’ was witnessed as the texts belong to the same type of discourse. Schimmel went deeper into various dimensions of Sufism well incorporated in Rumi’s Sufi poetry which is replete with many of the cultural aspects worth noticing for a researcher especially mystical poetry in the vernaculars is such an area which becomes quite significant for a researcher who intends to explore the Sufi and cultural dimensions at the same time. The researcher traced and further investigated all these pursuits within his research study under various aspects of Fairclough’s three-dimensional model.

Examination of other voices merged within the texts and significant aspects of their attribution were further inquired by the researcher under ‘intertextuality’. Prominent instances of intertextual references traced within the five selected texts are as under:

**4.4.3 Intertextuality**

**Text 11** is marked with powerful intertextual references. It refers to the most famous expression of the musical imagery elaborated in *Mathnawi* by Rumi which makes the text more valid in terms of reliability. Another strong intertextual reference is that of a direct quotation extracted from Sir John Davies’ *Cosmic Dance*, in Wheelwright, Burning Fountain which refers to one of the prominent Sufi and cultural aspects often employed by Dervishes in Sufi settings: ‘for
dancing is Love’s proper exercise.’ The dance of ecstasy by *Dervishes* and *Malangs* can often be witnessed at the shrines of Sufis which is a matter of local culture and has a cultural relevance. Another intertextual reference is that of two prominent Sufi doctrines of *fana* and *baqa* already elaborated within this study: ‘In this whirling movement the lover experiences the secret of *fana* and *baqa*’. These Sufi doctrines have been the centre of focus by many of the leading Sufi scholars and the concepts have a considerable relevance within Sufi settings. Intertextual reference of the German writer Friedrich Ruckert and the direct quote presenting the concept of the ‘whirling dance’ which had also been brought into limelight by Rumi, gives the text more strength as it gets replete with specific and direct intertextual references.

The issue of attribution of these intertextual references is significant here as within this text, they are properly attributed. For instance attribution towards Rumi, Davies and Friedrich Ruckert are the examples of specific attribution which carries greater significance in terms of making the text more valid. Though the researcher witnessed the specific attribution and the direct references but still the authorial voice is significant as being tactful Schimmel employs these references to convey her message on powerful footings. The appropriate and relevant placement of these intertextual references characterizes Schimmel’s adept authorial skills.

**Text 12** is quite significant in terms of intertextual references as many of the references are directly quoted and their specific attribution gives a tinge of validity to the entire text. The powerful intertextual reference from Younus Emre’s Divan emphasizes the value of the mystical guide or *Murshid* in Sufi settings:

> “Even if you read for a thousand years the black from the white
> It does not work unless you reach a perfect mystical guide”
> (Yunus Emre, Divan, p.514, CLVI)

The concept of *Murshid* has also been briefly presented within the study. This very concept acquires significance in local cultural settings as *Murshid* is given great esteem and he is the most revered figure in the Sufi cultural norms. Further, another powerful intertextual reference has also been extracted from Emre which gives more strength to the text in terms of its
validity. Schimmel has directly quoted Emre who considers the Mystical Guide as ‘The true man of God’ and remarks that he is the one ‘whose arena is higher than the Divine Throne’ (p.31, IV)

Again, the value of Murshid may well be comprehended by Qadi Qadan’s line. Schimmel proceeding further refers to Yunus Emre’s same concept which has been directly quoted within the text:

“Whose very glance transforms dust into jewels”   (Yunus Emre, Divan, p.309, LXI)

Another intertextual reference is that of Alif which has been presented by various Sufis in different connotations. Though it is incorporated within the text yet it has been unspecifically attributed without directing it to anybody. However, a general idea which a reader can deduce out of it is its relevance with Murshid who according to Yunus Emre is the true man of God. Schimmel further intertextually refers to ‘Persian-writing mystics’ while she elaborates the concept of daily used imagery employed by Rumi. One may witness that the reference has unspecifically been attributed. Schimmel just gives a passing reference and does not probe into the details. Another very powerful reference is that of ‘Koranic injunctions’ which the author deliberately employs to create an impact. Schimmel refers to the folk poets who followed the ‘Koranic injunctions’. The author gives an intertextual reference from the Holy Quran referring to the folk poets who follow God’s signs:

“in the earth and in yourselves-do you not see?” (Sura 51/21)

Again the mastery of the author may well be seen in the placement of these intertextual references. Though many of the intertextual references are directly quoted and they are specific to the writers who have employed them in their works, but still the way Schimmel has incorporated these references at their appropriate places is indicative of her command over incorporation of other texts within her own.

Text 13 commences with the powerful intertextual reference of Bijapuri Sufis of late sixteenth and seventeenth centuries who really adored the concept of spinning and the charkhi
nama. This very theme can also be traced in Sufis of Bijapur by Richard M. Eaton. Intertextual reference of allusion to Sura 9/112 explicating the concept of refinement of heart through dhikr is also significant here. Indirect quoting from Bhitai’s Risalo (Sur Kapaiti) also signifies the theme of spinning. Another intertextual reference in poetic form was extracted from Eaton, *Sufis of Bijapur* where theme of spinning associated with various types of dhikr: dhikr-i jali, dhikr-i qalbi, dhikr-i aini have been presented in a poetic form. Intertextual reference in poetic form extracted from an anonymous Punjabi poet translated by Dr Athar Ahsan is also a powerful reference which carries deeper meanings in local cultural settings. Reference to *chakki nama* also presented in poetic form extracted from *Sufis of Bijapur*, (p.163) by Eaton also enriches the text in terms of cultural perspective. The reference of Koranic verses about the resurrection associated with analogy from agriculture gives more validity to the text. ‘Paradise in its green robes’ is also an extension of the theme associated with agriculture which has been extracted from *A Spring Day in Konya* by Schimmel, Another very powerful intertextual reference *Rahmatul lil aalamin* Prophet (PBUH) is associated with the beliefs of the people and has been extracted from Sura 21/107 where theme of rain is connected with the praise of the Prophet (PBUH) as mercy for the worlds. The love of the Holy Prophet (PBUH) is a central aspect, also deeply embedded within the beliefs and culture of the masses.

The author’s skill in merging these intertextual references was observed. Despite the frequency of direct quotations is greater and they have been specifically attributed to the specific writers, but still Schimmel’s subjectivity can also be witnessed as she seems to know well where to place these references to make her message stronger.

**Text 14** commences with the strong intertextual reference of Hir Ranjha- a folktale which gets deeply embedded within local cultural settings. At the same time, author’s subjectivity is quite evident as she merges the powerful reference within the text giving it more strength. Another powerful intertextual reference is that of Bullhe Shah who has been very close to the masses as his poetic discourse gains greater acclaim within them. The next powerful intertextual reference is a direct reference of the poetic discourse extracted from Bullhe Shah’s *Qanun-i-Ishq*, (kafi no.109 “Ranjha Ranjha Kar di . . .” It is important here that with the inclusion of this powerful intertextual reference of the poetic discourse, the author seems to be more effective in
conveying her message. At the same time, much validity has been given to the text by the inclusion of this direct reference. The intertextual reference of Madho Lal Husain—an ecstatic mystic of the Qadiri order also gives prominence to the text while Warith Shah’s reference as the figure to give final form to the most renowned folktale of Hir Ranjha which was elaborated in more than hundred versions in Panjabi, Sindhi, Urdu and Persian, is also important here. Intertextual references of ‘Qadi Qadan’s verse’ in the first half of the sixteenth century and ‘Shah Abdul Kareem Bulrri’s short verses’ have been incorporated within the text referring to the folktales employed for mystical purposes. The incorporation of these references further strengthens the theme elaborated within the text under study. But the major emphasis of the author has been on the intertextual reference of ‘Shah Abdul Latif of Bhit in the eighteenth century’ who has given sufficient space to most famous folktales within his Shah Jo Risalo. Intertextual references of the folktales of Sassui Punhun, Marui, Nuri Jam Tamachi give strength to the text and the author tries to acquire acclaim by merging the brief description of these folktales. The text also acquires a distinctive flavor with the inclusion of the brief description of these folktales which are very close to the masses within local cultural settings. Another intertextual reference is that of nafs mutma’inna which has been attributed to Nuri who is the soul at peace and she acquires this status by complete obedience and submission to his beloved Prince Jam Tamachi. With the inclusion of the intertextual reference of ‘virahini quality of the Hindu tradition’, the author seems to gain more prominence by demonstrating her diverse command over mystic themes of various religions. At the same time, she intends to draw a comparative line between various Sufi themes of different religions. The author’s grasp over the subject is also evident through the inclusion of these intertextual references. Intertextual references of ‘poetical genre of barahmasa’ and ‘Bengali Sufi poetic imagery of Krisha-Radha cycle’ are also instances of the tinge of diversity given to the text by the author. Another powerful intertextual reference is that of the directly translated poetic discourse of ‘Bengali song depicting longing woman’. The longings of the women have frequently been portrayed within various Sufi discourses which acquire acclaim within local cultural settings.

A blend of direct and indirect references was observed within the text under study. Though a significant number of intertextual references are the direct references but still the author’s voice was traced with the way these references have been incorporated. The direct
references, though, are specifically attributed to their authors but still the tactful incorporation of these references at the right places demonstrates the skill the author employs in merging these references.

Text 15 commences with the most significant intertextual reference of Pir which encompasses the entire text. This theme acquires special acclaim within local cultural settings and at the same time, more insights regarding the concept of mystical guide can be found within the Sufi poetic discourse. The rest of the text is specified to portray the legendary Sufi saint Abdul Qadir Gilani and his miracles. The great Sufi saint acquires greater acclaim within the Sufi settings. The intertextual reference of ‘Balochi folk tradition’ which reports that the great saint approached the Prophet (PBUH) during his heavenly journey. The extension of the same intertextual reference can be seen within the reference of ‘heavenly mount Buraq’ upon which the Prophet (PBUH) travelled to meet the divine Beloved. The intertextual reference of ‘Abdul Qadir’s foot stand on the neck of every other saint’ was extracted from Popular Poetry of the Baloches by Longworth Dames which is quite significant reference within Sufi settings. Further, the intertextual references to Turkish poets who considered themselves ‘the honey of his bees, the rose of his garden and the nightingale of his meadow’ are indicative of the esteem given to the Sufi saint within Sufi settings. The inclusion of this very intertextual reference directly attributing to Turkish poets gives a considerable strength to the text. The extension of the same theme was traced with the inclusion of the intertextual reference to the Panjabi folk singer who presents the great saint as ‘the gardener of the garden of truth’. The intertextual reference of ‘the first geographical poem in Sindhi’ which enumerates dozens of cities and countries as ‘Abdul Qadir’s Domain’ is also powerful and significant aspect strengthening the text. The intertextual reference of wilayat, already elaborated in chapter 2, is also significant here. It may be seen as a Sufi practice of assigning a spiritual territory to a saint and from the saint to his Khalīfa. The significance of this theme is quite evident within Sufi settings and through the Sufi discourse, reaches the common folk. A very powerful intertextual reference which gains greater significance within Sufi and local cultural settings is that of qawwali which is sung in ‘enrapturing rhythms’ on the shrines of the Sufi saints in which hymns are presented in praise of the mystical guide or Pir. Qawwali is an essential feature of the local cultural settings which is sung before the special gatherings on the shrines of the Sufi saints. The folk and Dervishes seem
to get ecstatic on the enrapturing rhythms in which they are sung. ‘Assalamu alaika ya Bandanawaz, assalamu alaik mere Gesudaraz’ is an example of poetry in honour of the saint Gesudaraz presented in Kitab-i-Nauras by Sultan Ibrahim II Adilshah of Bijapur. This direct intertextual reference gives the text a distinctive flavour.

The text acquires more validity through the inclusion of many of the direct intertextual references specifically attributed to their authors. But it is significant here that despite these reference are specifically attributed, still they have been skillfully merged within the text at the appropriate places.

The next enquiry within this core book is that of semantic and grammatical relations which become significant within textual dimensions.

4.4.4 Semantic/Grammatical Relations between Sentences and Clauses

Instances of semantic and grammatical relations including Embedded Relations, Causal Relations, Contrastive Relations, Additive Relations, Relations of Elaboration, Paratactical and Hypotactical Relations were found within five texts of As through a Veil. However, frequency of some of the grammatical relations varied within this book as compared to Pain and Grace and Mystical Dimensions of Islam.

In pursuit of grammatical relations within the core book of As through a Veil, I started with investigation of Embedded Relations.

4.4.4.1 Embedded Relations

Text 11 comprises following one instance of Embedded Relations:

i) “Rumi whose poetry was born out of the whirling movement of ecstatic dance.”

Text 12 comprises following three instances of Embedded Relations:

i) “... the perfect mystical guide who has lost himself in the Prophet (PBUH) and in God . . .”
ii) “. . . the illiterate villagers who were thus assured that they too could reach perfection.”

iii) “The figure of the illiterate village saint, who may even be slightly mentally deranged . . .”

Following two examples of Embedded Relations can be found within Text 13.

i) “. . . many of them taken from the world of women, who were even less educated than men . . .”

ii) “And the woman-soul who neglects this duty . . .”

Text 14 comprises following three examples of Embedded Relations:

i) “. . . the ecstatic mystic of the Qadiri order who is buried together with his Hindu beloved in a modest tomb . . .”

ii) “Among these woman-souls is Sohni who swims every night through the Indus to meet her beloved . . .”

iii) “Her counterpart Sassui, who follows her beloved Punhun through burning deserts . . .”

No evident instances of Embedded Relations were traced in Text 15.

In all the above mentioned instances of ‘Embedded Relation’, this relation proved to be a significant aspect in which one clause was tactfully embedded within the other and functioned as an element of another. Schimmel employed this tool to be more effective in comprehensively conveying her analytical discourse. Various elements pertaining to folk, Sufi and cultural dimensions loaded with ideological references were witnessed embedded together.

The researcher, further, traced instances of additive relations from all the five selected texts which are as under:

**4.4.4.2 Additive Relations**

Text 11 comprises following one instance of Additive Relations:
i) “. . . mystics in all religious traditions have seen in their visions the dance of the soul (Susu) or the cosmic dance. They saw the lilies dancing at Love’s music . . .”

The concept of dance in Sufi settings and the cosmic dance have further been extended within the second sentence where various manifestations of nature also seem to be dancing at Love’s music.

No evident traces of Additive Relations could be found within Text 12.

Only one instance of Additive Relations was found within Text 13:

i) “One enjoys these poems best when one knows the country and realizes how true to life their imagery is. There occur other images in folk poetry as well . . .”

The second sentence where the images in folk poetry were further added to the concept of various imageries employed in the first sentence.

Text 14 contains following two instances of Additive Relations:

i) “In Sind, the range of folktales utilized for mystical purposes is even wider. Early allusions to these tales appear, however veiled, in Qadi Qadan’s verse . . .”

ii) “Finally, she is completely transformed into love, her voice no longer that of a woman but of love itself.”

In the first instance, the reference to folktales utilized for mystical purposes in local cultural settings of Sind were further extended and explicated in Qadi Qadan’s verse. In the second example, the process of complete transformation of Sassui into Punhun’s love was further extended in the second part of the sentence where her womanly voice gets thoroughly transformed into love. But this transformation is acquired after having experienced the difficulties and miseries of the mystical path.

Only one instance of Additive Relations was traced in Text 15:

i) “. . . each community has hymns in praise of the mystical guide at whose shrine the qawwali gather. Here was and still is the center of popular religious life.”
The first sentence amplifying the stature of the mystical guide and presenting the theme of qawwali was further extended in the second sentence where this very phenomenon was considered as the center of popular religious life.

The researcher, after having investigated the additive relations, proceeded to enquiry of Relations of Elaboration. The significant instances of this enquiry are as under:

4.4.4.3 Relations of Elaboration

Following two instances of Relations of Elaboration were witnessed in Text 11:

i) “This mystery of a rejuvenating death also underlies the symbolism of the mystical dance: Rumi, whose poetry was born out of the whirling movement of ecstatic dance . . .”

ii) “In this whirling movement the lover experiences the secret of fana and baqa: he is taken out of the gravitational field of the material world . . .”

In the first example, the second clause where the concept of mystical dance ‘whirling movement’ explicated in Jalaluddin Rumi’s poetry is an elaboration of the first clause in which the concepts of rejuvenating death and mystical dance were presented. In the second instance, the most prominent Sufi themes of fana and baqa found their appropriate explanation in the second clause which acted as an elaboration of the first clause.

However, no evident examples of Relations of Elaboration were witnessed in Text 12, 13, 14 and 15.

It is significant here that the frequency of the Relations of Elaboration observed within this book was lesser than other books. However, within the traced instances of employment of relations of elaboration, the issue of ‘legitimation’ was addressed. Schimmel tried to acquire the objectives of ‘legitimation’ through ‘rationalization’ of various Sufi themes to rationalize cultural and ideological issues.

‘Causal Relations’ were another aspect of enquiry within the research study. The significant instances of this particular aspect of enquiry are as under:
4.4.4.4 Causal Relations

Text 11 comprises following one example of Causal Relations of Purpose:

i) “They saw the lilies dancing at Love’s music, “for dancing is Love’s proper exercise.”

Text 12 does not contain any example of Causal Relations of Purpose.

Text 13 comprises following one instance of Causal Relations of Purpose:

i) “The act of spinning could be easily compared to the dhikr, for regular breathing is similar to spinning . . .”

Following five examples of Causal Relations of Purpose were witnessed in Text 14:

i) “. . . he usually begins his poetical renderings with the most dramatic moment in order to describe, with remarkable psychological insights, the moods of the soul on its way to the beloved.”

ii) “She does not fear the blood thirsty crocodiles and sharks nor the whirlpools because the lover does not care about the obstacles on his way toward the beloved.”

iii) “Sassui has lost Punhun because she fell asleep.”

iv) “Her heart is always with her friends-for the soul should remain unstained by the blandishments of this colorful world . . .”

v) “She has reached the lofty stage of the nafs mutma’inna because though a simple fishermaid, she is devoted to the beloved king in absolute and unquestionable obedience.”

Only one instance of Causal Relations of Purpose was witnessed in Text 15:

i) “There are many songs in honor of other saints too, because each community has hymns in praise of the mystical guide at whose shrine the qawwali gather.”

Within all the above mentioned instances, relations of ‘cause and effect’ and ‘problem-solution’ were traced and within them aspects pertaining to local culture and ideological perspectives were put forward.
After having examined the causal relations, the researcher further proceeded to the enquiry of evident contrastive relations.

4.4.4.5 Contrastive Relations

No Contrastive Relations were witnessed in Text 11.

Text 12 contains following one instance of Contrastive Relations:
   i) “. . . . a mystic like Rumi often used everyday imagery to express lofty thoughts and deep mystical experience, but most Persian-writing mystics composed their verse in the precious style . . .”

Text 13 contains only one instance of Contrastive Relations:
   i) “This world is the seedbed for the other world”. But there are also realistic descriptions of fields and animals that thirst for rain . . .”

Text 14 also comprises one example of Contrastive Relations:
   i) “Sindhi poets compare the silent suffering of the loving soul to the state of a potter’s kiln, which is not supposed to show any flames, but is supposed to keep the fire inside.”

No evident instances of Contrastive Relations could be traced within Text 15.

Relations of ‘difference’ were asserted through two contrastive aspects merged within two clauses and sentences and they were further joined through a conjunction. The cultural and ideological aspects merged within folk and Sufi perspectives embedded within these examples highlighted their contrastive features.

Paratactic Relations, the next aspect of enquiry for the researcher, was one of the significant aspects of ‘micro analysis. The prominent ‘paratactical relations’ observed within the five selected texts are given as under:
4.4.4.6 Paratactic Relations

Following three examples of Paratactic Relations were found within Text 11:

i) “Its breath fills the reedflute to make it sing of its external home, and its hand touches the lute of man’s body to make him speak of the beloved.”

ii) “Dance expresses best the mystery of dynamic Love, and mystics in all religious traditions have seen in their visions the dance of the soul . . .”

iii) “They saw the exercise and they felt like participating in the agitated yet harmonious movement which permeates the cosmos.”

Only one instance of Paratactic Relation was found within Text 12:

i) “. . . . a mystic like Rumi often used everyday imagery to express lofty thoughts and deep mystical experience, but most Persian-writing mystics composed their verse in the precious style . . .”

Text 13 contains two examples of Paratactic Relations:

i) “The poets saw the women spinning, and some of the earliest Urdu poems for mystical instructions are charkhi nama, spinning songs . . .”

ii) “. . . . regular breathing is similar to spinning, and the humming sound of the wheel reminded the poets of the sound of the dhikr . . .”

Text 14 does not contain any example of Paratactic Relations.

Following four instances of Paratactic Relations were traced within Text 15:

i) “Folk poetry, as we mentioned, developed at a time when the mystical orders and fraternities were firmly consolidated and therefore the role of the Pir in this poetry is highly important.”

ii) “. . . . mystical verse in the popular languages was largely composed by members of the fraternities for missionary purposes, and thus a special genre developed which centers around the veneration of the founder of the order or the patron saint.”

iii) “Abdul Qadir Gilani is certainly the most popular saint, and he was extolled everywhere from West Africa and Turkey to India and Indonesia.”
iv) “Sometimes such poems are merely rhymed accounts of the spiritual or family lineage (sil sala, shajara) of the Pir, or they contain blessings over the saint and his family.”

Presence of two grammatically equal or coordinate clauses within all the above mentioned instances is indicative of ‘paratactic relations’. Two independent clauses connected through a coordinating conjunction and within them embedding of significant aspects associated with local culture and ideological underpinnings made them distinct.

After probing into the paratactic relations, analysis of hypotactic relations was further pursued. The significant instances of Hypotactic Relations observed within five selected texts are as under:

4.4.4.7 Hypotactic Relations

Text 11 comprises following one example of Hypotactic Relations:
   i) “They saw the lilies dancing at Love’s music, “for dancing is Love’s proper exercise.”

Text 12 does not contain any example of Hypotactic Relations.

Text 13 comprises following one instance of Hypotactic Relations:
   i) “The act of spinning could be easily compared to the dhikr, for regular breathing is similar to spinning . . .”

Following five examples of Hypotactic Relations were witnessed in Text 14:
   i) “. . . he usually begins his poetical renderings with the most dramatic moment in order to describe, with remarkable psychological insights, the moods of the soul on its way to the beloved.”
   ii) “She does not fear the blood thirsty crocodiles and sharks nor the whirlpools because the lover does not care about the obstacles on his way toward the beloved.”
   iii) “Sassui has lost Punhun because she fell asleep.”
iv) “Her heart is always with her friends-for the soul should remain unstained by the blandishments of this colorful world . . .”

v) “She has reached the lofty stage of the nafs mutma’inna because though a simple fishermaid, she is devoted to the beloved king in absolute and unquestionable obedience.”

Only one instance of Hypotactic Relations was seen in Text 15:

i) “There are many songs in honor of other saints too, because each community has hymns in praise of the mystical guide at whose shrine the qawwali gather.”

Within all the above mentioned instances of Hypotactical Relations, the researcher witnessed one clause subordinated to the main clause. It is important here that various significant aspects of Sufi and folk traditions were found embedded within independent and subordinate clauses.

After having investigated the grammatical relations, the researcher further proceeded to the examination of Modality, another prominent feature of enquiry. The researcher remained concerned in investigating author’s commitment to truth, obligation and necessity and traced instances of epistemic and deontic modalities within the five selected texts of Schimmel which are as under:

4.4.5 Modality
A blend of Epistemic and Deontic Modalities was witnessed in all the five texts of As through a Veil.

4.4.5.1 Epistemic Modalities
Only one instance of Epistemic Modality was found within Text 11.

i) “The beginning of the Mathnawi is the most famous expression of this musical imagery.”

The author’s commitment to truth is quite normal with the use of ‘is’ as an unmodalized verb. However, no modalized adverb was seen.

Text 12 and Text 13 comprise no evidences of Epistemic Modalities.
As many as three examples of Epistemic Modalities were seen in Text 14.

i) “Hir Ranjha in Panjabi is the most known example of the complete spiritualization of a medieval folktale in which woman Hir is identified with the soul . . .”

ii) “Sassui is the perfect embodiment of all those qualities which were expected from someone who enters the difficult mystical path.”

iii) “Marui, another poetical character, is the ideal soul.”

In all the three examples ‘is’ has been employed as an unmodalized verb. The author’s commitment to truth was witnessed in all the three examples, which is quite normal.

Only one example of Epistemic Modality was found within Text 15.

i) “Abdul Qadir Gilani is certainly the most popular saint . . .”

Strong level of commitment towards the truth was witnessed through the presence of the modal adverb ‘certainly’. An unmodalized verb ‘is’ has been employed here.

4.4.5.2 Deontic Modalities

Deontic Modalities are nowhere seen within Text 11. However, as many as three examples of Deontic Modalities were found within Text 12.

i) “It should not be overlooked, however, that there is one source from which one can derive this immediate divine knowledge, the wisdom of Love, that is the Pir . . .”

ii) “Perhaps, they thought, there might even be some saints hidden among them . . .”

iii) “The figure of the illiterate village saint who may even be slightly mentally deranged and can speak to God without any restriction, plays an important role in this area of folk mysticism and its literary expression.”

Example i) is a denial statement where a modal verb ‘should’ has been employed to depict author’s commitment towards necessity. However, modal adverb was not employed. In Example ii) author’s commitment towards necessity was traced through the employment of a modal verb ‘might’. Again in example iii), through the use of modal verbs ‘may’ and ‘can’, author’s commitment to necessity is quite obvious.
As many as four instances of Deontic Modalities were traced in **Text 13**.

i) “By such an act, the heart will, like yarn, become the more precious the more finely . . .”

ii) “. . . and finally God will buy it for a high price . . .”

iii) “And the woman-soul who neglects this duty will find herself naked at the day of the Feast when everyone else is wearing fine new garments.”

iv) “They may have thought thus of the Prophetic tradition: “This world is the seedbed for the other world.”

The author’s commitment to obligation was investigated from the first three examples where ‘will’ was employed as the modal verb whereas author’s commitment to necessity is also obvious in example iv) where ‘may’ was used as a modal verb. However in all the four examples no modal adverb is used.

**Text 14** and **Text 15** comprise no evidences of Deontic Modalities.

The researcher investigated the instances of both epistemic and deontic modalities within the five selected texts of *As through a Veil* where author’s commitment to truth, necessity and obligation were observed through various ‘levels of commitment’ reflected through different ‘markers of modalization’. Schimmel’s subjectivity and her forcefulness embedded within cultural and ideological dimensions were investigated through epistemic and deontic modalities. Again, it is important to assert that the best impact of this tool of enquiry can be achieved within conversational analyses as this tool of enquiry is more suited to it but it does not mean that descriptive texts do not utilize it at all.

To investigate ideological perspectives, ‘assumptions’ were found as the suitable tools of enquiry. The instances of assumptions investigated within the five selected texts are as under:
4.4.6 Assumptions

A blend of Value Assumptions and Existential Assumptions was noticed in all the five selected texts of As through a Veil. However, the frequency of the Value Assumptions was greater than the Existential Assumptions.

4.4.6.1 Value Assumptions

Only one instance of Value Assumptions was seen in Text 11.

i) “Mathnawi is the most famous expression of this musical imagery . . .”

In this instance, author’s subjectivity was inferred from the value judgment of considering Jalaluddin Rumi’s Mathnawi as the most famous expression of musical imagery. Value assumption is indicative of the ideological perspective the author attaches with her discourse.

Text 12 comprises as many as three examples of Value Assumptions.

i) “. . . . one can derive this immediate divine knowledge, the wisdom of Love: that is the Pir, the perfect mystical guide . . .”

ii) “The role of at least one branch of mystical folk poetry in cementing the tremendous influence of the Pir over his followers should never be forgotten.”

iii) “. . . . most Persian-writing mystics composed their verse in the precious style . . .”

The traces of the belief system and ideologies attached with Pir were investigated within the text under study where the value assumption associated with this concept declares Pir as the perfect mystical guide. In the second instance too, another value assumption is asserted through ‘the tremendous influence of the Pir over his followers’

Text 13 contains following two instances of Value Assumptions.

i) “. . . . many of them taken from the world of women, who were even less educated than men but were, and still are in rural areas, the best transmitters of religious poetry, songs and proverbs. . . .”

ii) “Similar are the chakki nama, which take inspiration from the most important occupation of the Indian housewife, the grinding of the grain.”
The first instance was taken from the world of women, who have been declared through the value assumptions as ‘the best transmitters of religious poetry, songs and proverbs. The author’s perception about the women folk was well comprehended through this value assumption with the attachment of her ideologies. In the second instance also, the grinding of the grain was considered through a value assumption as the most important occupation of the Indian housewife. Many of the cultural underpinnings are attached with this theme of grinding of the grain which takes us to the rural settings.

As many as three examples of Value Assumptions were found in Text 14.

i) “Hir Ranjha in Panjabi is the best known example of the complete spiritualization of a medieval folktale . . .”

ii) “. . . . he usually begins his poetical renderings with the most dramatic moment . . .”

iii) “Sassui is the perfect embodiment of all those qualities which were expected from someone who enters the difficult mystical path.”

Value assumption in the first instance is reflected through the value judgment regarding Hir Ranjha-the best known example of the complete spiritualization of a medieval folktale. While in the second instance, Shah Abdul Latif’s attribute was presented as a value assumption in which the ideological perspective of the author was amplified. In the third instance, Sassui was graded as ‘the perfect embodiment’-another value assumption associated with the theme of the folktale while the path she adopts to find her beloved was also viewed as the difficult mystical path which again is a matter worth enquiry.

Text 15 contains only one example of Value Assumptions.

i) “Abdul Qadir Gilani is certainly the most popular saint . . .”

Schimmel’s beliefs and ideologies attached with the most famous mystical guide of the Sufi settings Abdul Qadir Gilani were depicted through the value assumption that he is known to be the most popular saint.
4.4.6.2 Existential Assumption

Existential Assumptions are nowhere seen in Text 11.

Text 12 comprises just one instance of Existential Assumptions
   i) “This emphasis on the alif, and on immediate knowledge as derived from the living ‘man of God’ was, of course, consoling for the illiterate villagers . . .”

   Existential assumption here is triggered by the presence of a demonstrative which confirms that the truth of the existing significance attached to knowledge and esteem given to the mystical guide is quite consoling for the illiterate villagers.

Text 13 contains as many as two instances of Existential Assumptions.
   i) “The act of spinning could be easily compared to dhikr . . .”
   ii) “This bed is the seedbed for the other world.”

   The first existential assumption is triggered with the presence of the definite article where existing concept of the act of spinning mostly employed within the rural settings was associated with the sanctified concept of dhikr. The second instance is a Prophetic tradition which is triggered by a demonstrative where ‘this bed’ refers to the existing world. Both of these existential assumptions are indicative of the existing thoughts merged within the text under study.

No instances of Existential Assumptions were seen in Text 14 and Text 15.

   Subjectivity of the author, essence of her beliefs and ideological associations with various Sufi, folk and local cultural themes were the prominent aspects of enquiry within the investigation of ‘assumptions’ in all the above mentioned examples.

   Another research pursuit was the enquiry of Schimmel’s style. I explored Schimmel’s texts, through her peculiar style. The examination of her style reflected within the five selected texts is as under:
4.4.7 Styles

While investigating the style in texts of As through a Veil, the significant evidences of specialized vocabulary and metaphor were found worth investigating. The traces of ideology were also examined while exploring the obvious manifestations of style. At the same time, probing into vocabulary and metaphors Schimmel employed, the researcher acquired insights into her peculiar style.

Investigation of Schimmel’s style was conducted through the specific vocabulary she employed.

4.4.7.1 Vocabulary

Specific vocabulary employed within Text 11 is indicative of Schimmel’s subjectivity and style. At the same time, many of the cultural facets were also traced within them. ‘Rejuvenating Death’ asserts the Sufi concept of life within death attributed to lovers. Further, ‘whirling movement’ and ‘ecstatic dance’ also portray the state of jubilation and contentment experienced by the Dervishes while they are engrossed in the ecstatic experiences of mystical dance. Within this state, the Sufi experiences rejuvenating death. Schimmel’s artistic and skilful employment of the vocabulary is quite significant here as her peculiar style was well investigated through it. The concept of whirling movement was further strengthened with the ‘cosmic dance’ which permeates everything explicating that the entire universe experiences the state of mystical dance. Within local cultural settings, this particular ecstatic dance acquires significance especially on the shrines of the Sufi saints. Another employment of vocabulary through which Schimmel’s peculiar style was traced is ‘dynamic Love’ whose secret was revealed within ecstatic dance. The reference to ‘Uncouth demon’ is also significant here which was contrasted with Gabriel projecting their dancing in love. As the uncouth demon is representative of evil forces, so the object of his love is only a she-demon. Significance of mystical dance can be testified from the fact that even Gabriel and uncouth demon experience this phase. ‘Magnetic field’ was attributed to the ‘eternal life’ which is experienced within the state of annihilation. The theme is an explication of the concepts of fana and baqa. Specific vocabulary employed within this context
is indicative of Schimmel’s grasp over the subject. Further, the concepts merged within this text contain enriched local cultural references which can be traced through Sufi poetic traditions influencing the common folk to a great extent.

Employment of specific vocabulary within Text 12 portrays facets attributed to Schimmel’s subjectivity and style. ‘Mentally deranged’ was employed for the illiterate village saint whose role is quite significant within mystic traditions especially within folks of the village. The specific vocabulary ‘Abstract patterns’ refers to Persian-writing mystics who resorted to the ‘precious style’ contrary to Rumi who employed daily-used imageries. The Persian-writing mystics soon focused on abstract patterns. ‘Age-old symbols’ and ‘fossilization of forms’ were attributed to the folk poets and mystical folk poetry which was employed to revive them. Through employment of the specific vocabulary, Schimmel is more assertive in her approach giving vent to her style and subjectivity.

Text 13 is distinct with the employment of specific vocabulary which has a significant status within rural cultural settings. ‘Trousseau’ has a meaningful contribution within the lives of the village woman who has fascinated the Sufi poets to a great deal and has been the center of focus within the folktales. The laborious characters of the village folk work diligently preparing their trousseau, which acquires a special status in their lives. Schimmel though was a Western scholar, yet her special intimacy with local cultural aspects was quite significant. Another employment of specific vocabulary was taken from agriculture which offered analogies to human life. ‘Seemingly dead earth’ was attributed to the concept of *fana* and the arrival of spring characterizes *baga* which are two significant themes embedded within Sufi settings establishing a special intimacy with the common folk. Schimmel’s style and subjective stance were traced through the instances of specific vocabulary employed.

Text 14 is also rich in terms of employment of specific vocabulary. Schimmel has been quite effective in reconstructing local culture through her stylistic exploitation of specific vocabulary. ‘Poetical renderings’ referred to Shah Abdul Latif Bhitai who presented them in the most dramatic moment giving vent to the psychological insights into the lover and beloved relationship. ‘Eternal union’ was employed by Schimmel referring to the folktale of Sohni
Mehanwal where Sohni was blessed with eternal union with her beloved whom she had promised faithful love at the day of ‘Primordial covenant’. ‘Swift-footed camels’ refer to the most famous folktale of Sassui Punhun where she was found unable to catch up with the swift-footed camels of the caravan who took away Punhun when Sassui was engaged in her ‘sleep of heedlessness’. Another employment of specific vocabulary ‘blandishments of the colorful world’ refer to Marui who discourages mighty Omer’s temptations to seduce her and therefore remains unstained from the blandishments of the colorful world. ‘Primordial beloved’ within the same folktale refers to the divine Beloved which should be the ultimate destination of the lover to experience the eternal union. ‘Unquestioning obedience’ refers to the complete submission and obedience of Nuri for the Sindhi ruler Jam Tamachi in the fifteenth century. Through her unquestioning obedience for Jam Tamachi, she reaches the loftiest stage of *Nafs Mutma’inna* which is the highest state of contentment.

**Text 15** is exclusively specified asserting the miracles and veneration associated with the mystical guide, *Pir* or the patron saint. Schimmel exclusively employed specific vocabulary where her subjective stance was noticeable. ‘Veneration of the founder of the order’ was employed to assert and portray the highest level of esteem and reverence associated with *Pir*. This particular reference also signifies the local cultural perspective where within rural cultural settings; *Pir* acquires special acclaim within the masses especially within the followers, disciples or *mureedain*. Another special vocabulary ‘enrapturing rhythms’ is associated with the most significant feature of the Sufi settings which is known as *Qawwali*, which is sung in enrapturing rhythms at the shrines of the Sufi mystics in which special veneration is shown towards the Sufi saint and his order.

The researcher also examined metaphorical presence within the five selected texts. The basic objective behind investigating metaphor was to unveil the cultural dimensions represented through Schimmel’s style. The prominent instances of ‘metaphor’ extracted from the five texts of *As through a Veil* are as under:
4.4.7.2 Metaphor

**Text 11** is rich in metaphorical references which is not only indicative of Schimmel’s style rather plenty of local cultural aspects could also be inferred from these metaphors. Metaphor of ‘Love as the great musician’ was employed by Rumi who further explicated the phenomenon of whirling movement of ecstatic dance. Another metaphorical representation is that of ‘white robes as garments of resurrection’ which is a significant concept within Mevlevi Dervishes who cast off their ‘black coats’ before the whirling dance is initiated. The entire phenomenon refers to the deep secret of transforming love. Within local cultural settings, this metaphor is quite significant as this theme reaches the common folk through the mystic traditions especially through the Sufi poetry. Another metaphor was an intertextual reference by Davies, merged by Schimmel within her discourse viewing ‘Dancing as love’s proper exercise’. Again the most prominent and significant aspect of mystical dance was highlighted through viewing ‘dance’ as love’s proper exercise.

Within **Text 12**, *Pir* was metaphorically employed as ‘embodiment of Love’. Further, ‘superhuman wisdom’ and the ‘perfect mystical guide’ were also presented as metaphors signifying the lofty stature of *Pir* which he is blessed with. *Pir* was also employed as a metaphor projecting him as ‘the true man of God’. Within local cultural perspectives, significance of all the metaphors employed for the mystical guide was quite evident.

**Text 13** is also rich in terms of metaphorical presentations which are deeply embedded within local cultural settings. The metaphor of the ‘act of spinning’ was employed for *dhikr* which acquires great acclaim within Sufi settings and through Sufi poetic discourse reaches the common masses. Further, the extension of the same theme was witnessed within ‘humming sound of the wheel’ that was also presented as a metaphor employed for *dhikr*. ‘The grinding of the grain’ is another metaphor pointing toward the refinement of the soul before it is presented before the divine Beloved. ‘Handle of the grain mill’ was also presented as a metaphor pointing towards *alif* of Allah. All these metaphors were deeply embedded within local culture, therefore developed special intimacy with the common folk.
Text 14 is also important in terms of metaphorical presence. ‘Sleep of heedlessness’ referring to Sassui was metaphorically presented indicating *khwab-i-ghaflat* considered as a great sin within Sufi settings as it takes the lover away from his beloved. Metaphor of ‘Potter’s kiln’ employed representing the silent suffering of the loving soul. Potter’s kiln never shows any flame but keeps the fire inside. The theme of the loving soul is quite significant within local cultural perspectives as it has been the central theme within many of the folktales and acquires special prominence within Sufi poetic discourse.

Text 15 is distinct as it is replete with the instances of the miracles and reverence associated with the mystical guide. Metaphorical representation is also indicative of Schimmel’s style and also contains deeper cultural meanings. Metaphorical representation was witnessed pointing towards the Turkish poets who considered themselves as ‘Honey of his bees’, rose of his garden’, ‘nightingale of his meadow’ signifying the stature of the great mystic of the Sufi order, Abdul Qadir Gilani. Further, the metaphorical representation was merged within the text referring to the Panjabi folk singer who considered Abdul Qadir Gilani as the ‘gardener of the garden of truth’. All these metaphors are reflective of Schimmel’s style and at the same time are rich in local cultural connotations.

The researcher after having investigated stylistic dimensions proceeded to examine ‘exchanges, speech functions and grammatical mood’. The investigation made in this regard is as under:

4.4.8 Exchanges, Speech Functions and Grammatical Mood

Keeping into consideration the descriptive nature of Sufi interpretive discourse of *As through a Veil*, the researcher witnessed that the prominent type of ‘exchange’ employed within the texts was ‘knowledge exchange’ while ‘statement’ was observed as the prevalent ‘speech function’. Likewise the investigation of other core books, ‘types of statement’ investigated were found to be mostly ‘statement of fact’ and ‘evaluation’. The reason is that in Schimmel’s interpretive Sufi discourse, factual and evaluative stances were employed. As the nature of the study does not require any predictive and hypothetical statements, therefore, ‘prediction’ and ‘hypothetical statements’ were not traced. In terms of investigating ‘grammatical mood’, the researcher
observed that ‘declarative’ stance was employed with absence of ‘interrogative’ and ‘imperative’ clues as such clues are frequent in interactional and conversational analysis.

The researcher, further, conducted an investigation into prominent discourses merged within the texts. The insights of this investigation are as under:

4.4.9 Discourses

The discourses of musical imagery and the themes associated with it employed by Maulana Jalauddin Rumi were drawn upon within Text 11. Further, the discourse of ‘mystical dance’ which has a greater significance in Sufi settings encompasses the entire text. The discourse of ‘white robes’ referring to the ‘garments of resurrection’; ‘cosmic dance’ and ‘dynamic love’ were also traced. ‘Mixing of discourses’ of ‘fana’ and ‘Baqa’ (already elaborated in chapter 2) which gain prominence in Sufi settings were also witnessed. Another instance of ‘mixing of discourse’ is that of ‘Gabriel and uncouth demon Ifrit’ and the discourse of ‘dancing in love’ attached to it. Schimmel’s technique in mixing and merging discourses is visible as the discourses seem to be merged in a reasonable proportion. Themes are naturally linked to each other.

In Text 12, the discourse of the concept of Pir as the ‘perfect mystical guide’ was extended. Further, it is marked with sketching the overall influence of the Pir over his disciples and followers. In the local cultural settings, this concept carries greater significance as Pir is considered as the most revered figure among the masses. Instances of ‘mixing of discourses’ in terms of Yunus Emre’s remarks regarding the stature of Pir: his ‘arena is higher than the Divine throne’ and also further extends ‘whose very glance transforms dust into jewels’, was also traced. Further, examples of ‘mixing of discourses’ were seen mentioning ‘Koranic injunctions’ employed by the folk poets. The discourses of ‘imagery taken from the daily life’ employed by Rumi was contrasted with ‘the precious style’ adopted by the Persian-writing mystics. Schimmel again seemed to be more effective in merging various discourses within text. Discourses seem to be merged in a way that natural flow of theme does not get affected at all.
Discourses ‘from the world of women’ set the tone of Text 13. They were further described as ‘the best transmitters of religious poetry, songs and proverbs and the depositaries of mystical lore’. Rural woman was the central theme in most of the Sufi works. Her simplicity and the way the housewives keep themselves engaged the entire day grabs the attention of the folk-writers. The discourse of ‘grinding of grain’ evolves significance as it is considered to be the ‘most important occupation of Indian housewife’ and this very theme has deeper cultural connotations. This discourse was incorporated within text with the title *chakki nama*. Further, the discourse of ‘spinning woman’, and the association of the theme of *dhikr* and spinning were incorporated within the text. In poetic discourse, the mention of the types of dhikr: *dhikr-i jali, dhikr-i qalbi, dhikr-i aini* are the instances of ‘mixing of discourse’. The discourse of Prophetic tradition was mixed with the discourses of ‘sowing and reaping’ by interrelating these themes. Koranic references were also mixed within various other discourses giving them strength. It is important here that Schimmel incorporated these religious discourses at the appropriate places to make her message more convincing. Analogies taken from agriculture for human life were also few of the significant instances of incorporation of a powerful discourse as the themes associated with agriculture gain more prominence in rural and local cultural settings.

**Text 14** is marked with powerful and culturally enriched discourse of *Hir Ranjha* which has been widely interpreted and contains deeper meanings in local cultural settings. The elaboration of this very romance can be found in more than hundred versions. Allusion to the theme can also be traced within the works of Madho Lal Husain. However, Warith Shah is known to give its final form. Another significant discourse established within the text was regarding ‘employment of folktales utilized for mystical purposes’ in which the ‘woman soul’ emerged to be the central figure. Discourses referring to the folktales of ‘Sohni and Mehar’ and ‘Sassui and Punhun’ pointing towards the distress faced on the thorny way to love was significant within the text. Discourse highlighting the folktale of Marui who ‘remains unstained by the blandishments of the colorful world’ to acquire her union with ‘primordial beloved’ was another significant aspect of the text. Further, discourse portraying ‘Nuri’ and ‘her absolute and unquestionable obedience’ to Jam Tamachi also gave considerable strength to the text. However instances of ‘mixing of discourses’ from Hindi tradition were also significant here. ‘Virahini’ quality of Hindi tradition’ and poetical genre of old *barahmsa* were merged within other
discourses giving the text a tinge of diversity. The transition from one discourse to another was made in natural flow when the researcher came across the reference to ‘Bengali Sufi poetry and the famous concept of ‘Krishna-Radha cycle’ and ‘Bengali folk singers’ who seem to be depicting ‘the longing woman’. Again Schimmel’s grasp over various Sufi themes was witnessed. The skill involved in merging various discourses at their right places also characterized Schimmel’s exclusive style.

Text 15 exclusively portrayed the discourse of the ‘veneration of the patron saint’ and ‘the role of Pir’ in Sufi settings. Most of the text was specified for the discourse pertaining to the miracles of Abdul Qadir Gilani who is known to be the most popular saint in Sufi settings. ‘Mixing of Discourses’ of the Turkish poets’ remarks were also significant here who regarded themselves as ‘the honey of his bees, the rose of his garden and the nightingale of his meadow’. These remarks exhibited extreme level of reverence and affection with the great saint. Further, discourses referring to the song sung in praise of the great mystical guide and the first geographical poem ‘Abdul Qadir’s domain’ in Sindhi written in his esteem, were also mixed with other discourses. Another powerful discourse employed within the text was that of ‘Qawwali’ in which hymns in praise of the mystical guide were sung in ‘enrapturing rhythms’. The concept of Qawwali was the most popular one in Sufi and local cultural settings. People flock themselves together on the shrines of the great mystical guides, sit reverently and get ecstatic on the sweet tunes of Qawwali. In Chishtiya order, Qawwali is given more prominence. The concept of Qawwali has already been presented in chapter 2.

‘Representation of Social Events’, the last research pursuit pertaining to the most significant dimension of Fairclough’s three-dimensional model was conducted by the researcher. Insights of the investigation are as under:

4.4.10 Representation of Social Events

Representation of social events in Text 11 was significant in terms of Sufi and cultural aspects. The researcher traced the development of ‘mystical dance’ within the entire text which was the most prominent aspect of Sufi discourse. Dervishes are found thoroughly engrossed in ‘whirling
movement’ on the shrines of Sufi saints. They are then in the extreme state of ecstasy. This mystical dance has a significant value in local cultural settings. However, the abstract social representation of the theme was witnessed within this instance. Social representation of ‘Musical imagery of love’s music’ was also found prevalent within the text which is also abstractly put forward. Another representation was that of ‘cosmic dance’- the outcome of love’s music. Love’s music makes everything dance and even the entire cosmos employs the whirling movement. Even this music makes the Gabriel and uncouth demon dance though the object and centre of the love of both of them is contrastingly opposite. Ugly demon longs for the materialistic love of she-demon. Again the abstract social representation was obvious. Social representation of the manifestations of nature i.e., ‘dancing of lilies at love’s proper music’ was also the extension of the theme of dance set prior to it which was also abstractly made. The same theme was elaborated in ‘Cosmic Dance’ by Sir John Davies where the phenomenon of mystical dance was explicated. Abstract Social representation of the most prominent themes (also discussed in chapter 2) fana and baqa, implying the taking out of the gravitational field of the material world and annihilation in the spiritual sun’s magnetic field, was also obvious. The researcher also traced the social representation of ‘white robes’ as ‘garments of resurrection’. The white robes in Sufi discourse have a considerable significance as they are considered to be the garments of resurrection. Mevlevi Dervishes cast off their black coats symbolically representing the materialistic world, thus, exploring the deep secret of ‘transforming love’. Abstract social representation was evident in all the instances.

The researcher was concerned in probing into the aspects which were given more prominence. In Text 11, much of the focus was seen in elaboration of the theme of whirling movement found in Rumi’s poetry. Mystical dance, musical imagery of love and the concepts of fana and baqa seemed to acquire prominent place within the text. However, the concept of rejuvenating death was just mentioned to in the beginning of the text and was not further explained.

Processes

Various ‘processes’ mostly ‘existential’ and ‘verbal’ were traced within Text 11:
underlie, see, fill, touch, permeate, inaugurate, dance, whirl, experience, take, annihilate, appear, render etc.

The Processes clearly exhibited various discourses attached with these forms of activity. The nature of these Processes also indicated their intimacy with the common folk and the Sufi settings.

However, the frequency of activated processes was greater than the passivated ones.

**Participants**

Various Participants were also seen performing different ‘forms of activity:
Rumi’s poetry, reed-flute, Mathnawi, The Love of the Sun, The cosmic dance, Gabriel, uncouth demon Ifrit, she-demon, lover etc.

All the participants performing various forms of activity acquire special acclaim within local cultural settings.

**Circumstances**

While some of the Circumstances mentioned in Text 11 include:
- in enthusiastic dance, dancing at Love’s music etc.

The Circumstances added more meanings to the forms of activity in the form of various Processes and were also indicative of the traces of rich local cultural references.

**Text 12** was marked with the theme of *Pir* encompassing the entire text. The social representation of the ‘perfect mystical guide’ who is also considered to be the ‘embodiment of love’ and ‘superhuman wisdom’ was the most prominent representation of the text. The significance of *Pir* or *Murshid* in the local cultural settings gives him a dignified stature within the masses. He is the most revered and esteemed figure in the Sufi settings. ‘Tremendous influence of the *Pir* over his followers’ was another representation which was witnessed in Sufi
settings and this aspect acquires greater prominence in the cultural settings. Yunus Emre’s remarks about the mystical guide were indicative of his raised stature and at the same acted as an extension of the same theme within the text: ‘The true man of God’ whose ‘arena is higher than the Divine Throne’ and further ‘whose very glance transforms dust into jewels’ clearly portrayed the true picture of Pir and manifested his lofty stature within his followers Mureedain. Another social representation the researcher investigated was that of ‘illiterate village saint’ whose role was quite significant within folk mysticism and literary expression. Further, the comprehension level and beliefs of the illiterate villagers regarding the mystical guide were also highlighted. The ideological footings of the common masses were quite significant here becoming an integral part of the local cultural settings. Social representation of the imagery taken from daily life was also investigated. Here two different sorts of style were contrasted. Rumi was more inclined towards the everyday imagery while most of the Persian-writing mystics employed the ‘precious style’ which ‘crystallized into more and more abstract patterns’. It is important here that all of the social representation within Text 12 was abstract in nature and the researcher did not find any concrete aspect within the representation of social events.

In Text 12, much of the emphasis of the author seemed to be in projecting ‘influence of the Pir’ and his overall stature within the masses. At the same time, a reasonable prominence was given to daily-used imagery employed by Rumi while the researcher noticed comparatively less prominence given to the ‘precious style’ adopted by most of the Persian-writing mystics. Schimmel here seemed to show her subjectivity and inclination towards the daily-used imageries.

**Processes**

The researcher found various Processes mostly ‘existential’ and ‘verbal’ within Text 12: overlook, derive, become, lose, highlight, assure, study, speak, facilitate, resort, use, experience, composed, develop, crystallize, follow, come etc.

All the Processes employed within the text pointed towards the context from where they were extracted and showed their relevance with various local cultural perspectives.
Activated processes were more frequent than the passivated ones. The subject in the following instance seemed to be deliberately hidden:

“... consoling for the illiterate villagers who were thus assured that they too could reach perfection...”

In the above mentioned passivated process, no idea could be developed who actually assured the illiterate villagers.

**Participants**

Various ‘participants’ were also traced:
God, Prophet, Pir, followers, Emre, mystical guide, illiterate villagers, illiterate village saint, masses, poets, Rumi, Persian-writing mystics, folk poets etc.

These Participants were embedded within Sufi and Cultural perspectives whose essence was traced within them.

**Circumstances**

Some of the ‘circumstances’ discussed in Text 12 include:

to express lofty thoughts and deep mystical experience, in the precious style etc.

The Circumstances added more details to the Processes already presented. They also showed their deep intimacy with Sufi and cultural themes.

In Text 13, the most significant social representation was that of the images taken from the world of women. The rural woman has attracted the attention of the Sufi mystic poets and they have given this theme a significant space within their poetical works. Her simplicity, laboriousness and loyalty to the cultural norms have been the most discussed aspects. Extending the same concept, woman was considered to be ‘the best transmitter of religious poetry, songs, proverbs and depositaries of mystical lore’. ‘Act of spinning’ was another social representation
which made the piece of text culturally loaded. This very theme contained plenty of the cultural underpinnings as this act was attributed to the rural women. Sufis related this theme to *dhikr* which again was known to be the most prestigious theme with Sufis. As Sufi practices are very close to the common folk, therefore, the significant Sufi themes became a part and parcel of the culture. ‘Humming sound’ of the wheel while spinning was associated with ‘Regular breathing’ within the process of *dhikr*. Again, this very social representation was quite prominent and contained deeper meanings. This theme not only acquires significance in folklores, rather evident references can be traced in mystic poetry as well. Another social representation pertains to different kinds of *dhikr*: *dhikr-i-jali, dhikr-i-qalbi* and *dhikr-i-aini* which have been given proper place in Sufi discourse where social representation of *dhikr* may be witnessed within the disciples (*mureedain*) of Sufis which is significant aspect of local cultural settings. It is important here that impacts of Sufi practices were so prominent on the common masses that deep imprints of these practices can be observed in local culture. ‘Grinding of grain’ was another social representation whose associations could be traced with various themes in Sufi discourse especially the poetic discourse of *chakki nama* by Bijapuri Sufis acquired greater acclaim within the masses and, therefore, it became an integral part of the local cultural settings. Social representation of various analogies from agriculture referring to human life was also traced within the text; especially the theme of ‘sowing and reaping’ was associated with the Prophetic tradition: ‘This world is the seedbed for the other world’. This particular religious belief has a significant value within cultural settings as the common masses are fascinated to such analogies and comprehend the message easily as these analogies are drawn upon from their surroundings. Then the description of rain as *rahma* ‘mercy’ was associated with the praise of the Prophet of Mercy (PBUH) who was declared as ‘the mercy for the worlds’ in Qura’n. The rain of *Rahma* has a healing effect and it quickens the dead hearts. The love and praise of the Prophet of Mercy (PBUH) is not only the most prominent religious aspect rather it has a considerable value in the cultural settings as well. Muslims organize special gatherings *Mahafil-e-Na’at* in which special poetic discourse mostly written by great Sufi saints is recited in melodious voices showing reverence to the Prophet (PBUH). These *mahafil* have a considerable value within local cultural settings. A bulk of Sufi discourse has been written showing special veneration to the Holy Prophet Muhammad (PBUH).
It is important here that though many concrete elements were presented within the text but all these concrete aspects were abstractly represented and therefore the social representation was considered as an abstract one.

**Participants**
Major participants mentioned within Text 13 are as under:
Allah, Muhammad (PBUH), Bijapuri Sufis, poets, Richard M. Eaton, heart, girl, woman-soul, Panjabi folk poet, Indian Housewife, Rumi etc.

All the Participants employed within the social representations were indicative of their close link with Sufi and cultural themes.

**Processes**
Some of the processes found within Text 13 are as under:
enjoy, know, realize, occur, see, show, remind, become, buy, prepare, neglect, find, call, use, offer, connect, wear, mention etc.

The Processes employed within the text established their intimacy and special link with the context they were extracted from.

The number of activated processes was greater than the passivated ones within the text under study.

**Circumstances**
Some of the circumstances noticed in Text 13 include:
for a high price, by constant spinning, at the day of the Feast

Again the Circumstances seemed to add more details to the Processes already presented within the text and at the same time developed their special link with the local cultural perspectives.
**Text 14** commenced with the social representation of ‘folktales utilized for mystical purposes’. All the folktales were representative of their local cultural norms and contained plenty of cultural underpinnings. The brief description of all the tales gave the text greater strength as many of the cultural aspects were extracted from these folktales. Another representation is that of ‘appearance of woman-soul in various guises in Shah Abdul Latif Bhitai’s poetry’. It was noticed that the concept of woman-soul has fascinated the Sufi poets who have given this theme a sufficient place in their Sufi discourse. The sufferings and longings of the woman-soul have been depicted in poetic discourse. But this theme gained more prominence in Bhitai’s *Shah Jo Risalo*. The researcher also found the social representation of the most-famous folktale of Hir Ranjha which was elaborated in more than hundred versions. Warith Shah was known to give it the final form. The next social representation was that of the folktale of Sohni Mehanwal where the eternal union of Sohni with her beloved was portrayed. The obstacles she confronted on the way to the beloved were also represented. The sufferings, the loving souls face on their love journey have been the subject matter of many of the folklores and these folklores develop intimacy with the common folk. Resultantly, the aspects portrayed in these folktales become an integral part of the local cultural settings. Social representation of the folktale of Sassui and Punhun was also encompassed within the text. Again, miseries confronted by Sassui while looking for her beloved Punhun were merged within the text. After having suffered anguish, the soul finally acquires the divine love. The transfer from metaphorical love to the real love was the most quoted aspect within Sufi discourse. Social representation of another folktale pertaining to Marui and her remaining ‘unstained by the blandishments of the colorful world’ was portrayed. Various other representations from other religions also made the text worth enquiry. ‘Virahini quality of Hindu tradition’ and ‘poetical genre of barahmasa’ were merged with the Islamic concept of Sufi beliefs. ‘Krishna-Radha cycle in Bengali Sufi poetry’ and ‘Bengali folk singers’ and their poetic discourse were given sufficient place within the text.

Abstract social representation of the entire Sufi, poetic and cultural discourse was evident throughout the text while no concrete representation was found within the entire text.
It is important here that the discourse from Shah Abdul Latif Bhitai’s *Shah Jo Risalo* finds a prominent place within the text. All the folktales merged within *Shah Jo Risalo* were exclusively portrayed while ‘Qadi Qadan’s verse’ and Abdul Karim of Bulrri’s short verses were deliberately given less significance as only the passing references was traced within the text. The frequency of activated expressions was greater than the passivated ones.

**Participants**

Participants of Text 14 include:
Qadi Qadan, Shah Abdul Karim Bulrri, Shah Abdul Latif Bhitai, woman-soul, Sohni, beloved, Sassui, crocodiles, Sassui, Punhun, blue serpents, lions, swift-footed camels, Marui, Omer, Nuri, Jam Tamachi, beloved-king, stories, mystical ideal, soul, heroines, Bengali folk singers, longing woman etc.

The rich cultural and Sufi context these Participants were extracted from, gave strength to the text by making it culturally and ideologically loaded with local cultural and ideological underpinnings. These Participants became subject and object to various significant ‘forms of activity’ employed within the text under study.

**Processes**

The Processes found within Text 14 are as under:
utilize, appear, swim, shatter, use, drown, fear, care, follow, scare, lose, catch-up, discover, resist, neglect, remain, illustrate, contain, assume, recite, compare etc.

Various ‘forms of activity’ were employed with the text under study which along with various Participants and Circumstances conveyed deeper local cultural meanings and ideological implications.

**Circumstances**

Following Circumstances were found within Text 14:
with the most dramatic moment, with remarkable psychological insight, on his way to beloved, over terrifying hills, in despair, in absolute and unquestionable obedience etc.

All the Circumstances employed within the text under study were employed as adverbials giving more meanings to the Processes already established within the text. They also pointed to the rich historical and local cultural context from where they were extracted.

Text 15 was exclusively specified for the social representation of the stature of Pir (mystical guide) in Sufi and cultural settings. The special place Pir acquires within local cultural settings is indeed indicative of the presence of reverence and veneration within local culture. Especially in Sindhi culture, Pir acquires an unmatched level of esteem. Much of the emphasis was given on the social representation of the role of Pir within communities. Another social representation was that of the ‘veneration of the patron saint’ that was a distinctive feature within Sufi and local cultural settings. Bulk of the text was specified for the Great Sufi Saint Abdul Qadir Gilani and the special miracles attributed to him. His stature can be witnessed through his veneration portrayed by Turkish poets who considered themselves as ‘the honey of his bees, the rose of his garden and the nightingale of his meadow’. Further, the social representation of the special reverence offered by the Panjabi folk singer and Sindhi poets gave the text a considerable strength. Sindhi geographical poem goes to such an extent that it ‘enumerates dozens of cities and countries as Abdul Qadir’s Domain’. Another social representation was that of the most famous concept of ‘wilayat’ which gains greater significance within Sufi settings and it is very close to the common folk. A special spiritual territory is assigned by the mystical guide to his khalifa in local cultural settings, both Pir and his khalifa in local cultural settings and the special mentions of the concept of wilayat in Sufi poetic discourse gets the common folk familiarized with this concept and therefore, this theme gets embedded within local cultural settings. Social representation of hymns written in honour of other saints also became a significant aspect of this text, especially ‘Qawwali’ sung in special gatherings at shrines of the Sufi saints extolling Sufi saints, becomes a ‘centre of popular religious life’. Its ‘sweet tunes’ and ‘enrapturing rhythms’ fascinate the common masses, making it an integral part of Sufi and local cultural settings. The next social representation was that of the concept of family/spiritual lineage (silsala/shajara). Again, this theme, which emerged from Sufi settings where in Qawwalis through its poetic
discourse, praised the family lineage of the patron saint and the disciples (mureedain) even learnt this poetic discourse by heart and extolled their Pir.

Again the social representation in all the instances was abstract with no traces of concrete representation. Even the concrete elements were abstractly represented.

The emphasis throughout the text was given on the description, roles and commendation of the mystical guide. Further, the legendary figure of Abdul Qadir Gilani also occupies a prominent place within the text. However, members of fraternities and mystical orders were just given a passing reference and the concept was not extended further. Schimmel’s subjectivity was evident throughout the text as the aspects she deemed appropriate to amplify were given prominence while others were just given a passing reference.

Number of activated Processes was greater than the passivated ones but many instances of passivated examples were also found within Text 15.

**Participants**

Following Participants were witnessed in Text 15: Divine Presence, Prophet (PBUH), Pir, the Patron saint, Abdul Qadir Gilani, Gabriel, mount Buraq, members of fraternities, Turkish poets, Panjabi folk singer, Sindhi poets etc.

It is significant here that all the Participants employed within the text under study pointed to various cultural and historical references they became the significant part of. Therefore, they were culturally and historically loaded as they became the subject and object to such Processes.

**Processes**

Text 15 comprises following Processes of various types: Mention, develop, compose, center, extol, approach, draw, offer, recite, tell, see, praise, prompt, enumerate, contain etc
The Processes employed within the text under study were indicative of the rich cultural context they became an integral part of. Therefore, their significance was manifold as they not only employed various prominent Participants but also attached various Circumstances within them to strengthen their implications.

**Circumstances**

Following Circumstances were seen within Text 15:
for missionary purposes, during his heavenly journey, in his praise etc

The rich historical connotations were attached with the Circumstances employed within Text 15. They also acted as adverbials with various Processes and further strengthened their meanings and conveyed rich Sufi and ideological implications.

The researcher inferred various insights from the critical discourse examination of Schimmel’s *As through a Veil*. The selection of the five representative texts was made from ‘Rumi and the Metaphors of Love’ and ‘Mystical poetry in the Vernaculars’ chapters of *As through a Veil*. An internal and external analysis based on Fairclough’s three-dimensional model was conducted in which various aspects of three-dimensional model were exploited. The researcher remained very particular in tracing the relevant answers to the research inquiries already established. The major emphasis of the researcher was the investigation of local cultural and ideological pursuits within Schimmel’s Sufi interpretive discourse.

The detailed and comprehensive analysis of Schimmel’s Sufi interpretive discourse was conducted by the researcher keeping into perspective Fairclough’s three-dimensional model. The application of this particular model was made on the 15 selected texts from three core books of Schimmel i.e., *Pain and Grace*, *Mystical Dimensions of Islam* and *As through a Veil*. Though every possible effort was made in making the analysis an adequate one, but still the researcher admits that he may have encountered various limitations during his analysis. Therefore, this analysis cannot be considered an exhaustive work made within critical discourse perspective as the CDA in itself was in evolution phases and despite its being an effective method in pursuit of
cultural and ideological dimensions, its limitations raised many substantial inquiries. I still consider my effort in investigating the construction of local culture in Schimmel’s analysis of Sufi poetry, a useful endeavour through application of CDA to a new dimension i.e., Sufi interpretive discourse which opens new horizons and distinct aspects of enquiry for the future researchers.
CHAPTER 5

CONCLUSION

Brief summary of the research study provides an insight into the entire research proceedings. The gist of the study is given as under:

5.1 Summary of the Research Proceedings

Establishing the background of the study within the current study, chapter 1 commenced on an introductory note. By briefly stating that the critical discourse perspective was the most comprehensive of the language-based analytical approaches to examine the Sufi discourse, the study unfolded various interpretations of Sufism by renowned scholars who tried their pen on Sufi discourse. Evolution of Sufism was also briefly encompassed being mindful of a very important point that the study might not tilt towards investigation of Sufi beliefs and its origin exclusively rather Sufi discourse was the sole target of the study. Further, enriched Sufi poetry, with deeper cultural underpinnings, was brought into the limelight. Key figures who conducted interpretive and analytical studies on Sufi poetry were also introduced. Annemarie Schimmel’s biographic details, her major works and inclination towards Sufi discourse were also briefly touched upon. Schimmel’s three major works under study: Pain and Grace, Mystical Dimensions of Islam, As through a Veil were also briefly introduced and the rationale behind investigating Schimmel’s works and especially the three core books under study was also given due space. CDA (Critical Discourse Analysis), on an introductory stage, the connotation of the term ‘discursive practices’, Fairclough’s stance towards discourse as a form of social practice and as being ‘constitutive’ as well as ‘constituted’ were comprehensively stated. A clear-cut agenda of
the research study was also put forward that is investigation of the construction of local culture through Schimmel’s analysis of Sufi poetry. An operational definition constructed by the researcher clearly suggested how ‘local culture’ was seen within this research. Fairclough’s three-dimensional model focusing on textual dimension, discursive practices and social practices was also presented as a research model. Statement of the Problem presented gives the crux of the study that is to investigate how Schimmel’s works on Sufi poetry present the discursive construction of local culture. Research questions outlined set a clear dimension of the study. These questions pertain to construction of local culture in Schimmel’s analysis of Sufi poetry, ideological perspectives employed by Schimmel while interpreting Sufi poetry, and analysis of Schimmel’s adequate reconstruction of local culture. Significance of the study is evident through the point that Schimmel’s works were investigated through a critical discourse perspective which was a new and unique dimension of enquiry for Sufi discourse. Further, it is a systematic study revealing a Western scholar’s interest and concern towards Sufi themes. Also, investigation of cultural traces from a Sufi discourse was quite significant.

In chapter 2, a significant space was given in probing into the keyword ‘discursive construction’ employed within the study. Various connotations of ‘discourse’ perceived by the key figures of discourse analysis were elaborated. While defining discourse, ‘text’ and ‘discourse’ were clearly differentiated. Further, insights into CDA unveiling its various principles and dimensions of its functionality and various stances of the major writers of critical discourse perspective were brought into the limelight. An evident contrastive difference between the content analysis and CDA testified CDA as an analysis worth enquiry. The close association of CDA and Systemic Functional Linguistics by Halliday with the heavy reliance of the former to the latter provided a footing for textual dimensions of the analysis which became an integral part of Fairclough’s three-dimensional model. Ideology, one of the major dimensions of enquiry within the study, and its close relationship with CDA was explicated through insights from the renowned figures of the area. Various approaches in CDA were brought to limelight with an emphasis on discourses being historical which connected discourse with the ‘context’. The concentration of CDA on the social processes and structures surrounding the production of texts was made clear through this perspective. Context, a very significant discursive dimension of CDA, and its relevance with the study were established through its various aspects established by
the major theorists. Intertextuality, a term coined by Kristeva, its various implications and the heavy reliance of the study on intertextual dimensions was given due space. Further, one of the fundamental concerns of CDA, discourse and society, was also brought into the limelight. Halliday’s assertion on three functions of the text: action, representation and identification which later became an integral aspect of CDA was put forward with vivid explications from the major theorists. Limitations of CDA highlighting the major criticism it faces and how those limitations were relevant to the study were also the significant dimensions of the study. Further, the defensive stance against the critical discourse perspective helped the study remove many of the restraints the researchers confront at different stages of the research. To further validate the self-analyzed data, Gee’s insights in the form of ‘components of ideal discourse analyses were also presented through which a self-analyzed discourse analysis can further be validated. But at the same time, it was admitted that as the ideal research settings are extinct, the researcher might gain insights from these components to make his analysis more effective. Compliance with these components was tougher as CDA itself is in evolution stages and comprises many limitations. Culture, one of the key terms of the study, with insights from various theorists of the area helped in comprehending the term to a great deal. An operational definition of ‘local culture’ was also framed keeping into perspective various dimensions extracted from definitions of the term ‘culture’. Sufism, with insights and interpretations from various scholars, a brief review of critical works on Sufism and Sufi thought and the distinction of the research study with all these major critical works on Sufism were given a considerable space. Further, prominent Sufi doctrines and key concepts in Sufi discourse were presented with a clear rationale that familiarity with these terms was necessary as many of the themes and terms could be traced within core texts extracted from Schimmel’s works. The point was also made clear that though, the study comprises brief description of Sufi doctrines, yet its major pursuit is the Sufi discourse by unveiling the presence of local culture through Schimmel’s discursive construction which she has made in her analysis of Sufi poetry. Therefore, the researcher was more concerned with the discursive dimensions than conducting an enquiry into Sufi beliefs.

While framing the research methodology in chapter 3, rationale for choosing CDA as the most suitable method was established. Schimmel’s three books: Pain and Grace, Mystical Dimensions of Islam and As through a Veil, were selected as the core texts for this research
study. Further, 15 sample texts, 5 from each book, were selected. The rationale behind selection of these three core books out of many of Schimmel’s books on Sufi discourse was established. Selection of 15 texts was carefully made and the rationale behind selecting those 15 texts was also elaborated. Fairclough’s three-dimensional model with textual, discursive and social dimension was explicated in detail focusing on every necessary detail. Three-dimensional model was further divided into subcategories which were termed as ‘Aspects of Three-Dimensional Model’. The subcategories comprised: social events, genre, intertextuality, assumptions (existential, propositional, value), grammatical relations (paratactic and hypotactic relations, embedded relations, additive relations, relations of elaboration, causal relations, contrastive relations), exchanges, speech functions and grammatical mood, discourses, representation of social events, styles (vocabulary, metaphor), modalities (epistemic, deontic). Explication of these terms and the procedural details of their application on the core texts were also given.

Chapter 4 commenced with a brief overview of the research paradigm and methodology in which internal and external relations of text for text analysis were encompassed. Sample texts, five in number, were extracted from the ‘Grace Section’ i.e., Shah Abdul Latif Bhitai’s section of the core book *Pain and Grace*. These 5 core texts were collectively analyzed keeping into perspective Fairclough’s three-dimensional model. Aspects of three-dimensional model (social events, genre, intertextuality, assumptions i.e., existential, propositional, value, grammatical relations i.e., paratactic and hypotactic relations, embedded relations, additive relations, relations of elaboration, causal relations, contrastive relations, exchanges, speech functions and grammatical mood, discourses, representation of social events, styles i.e., vocabulary, metaphor, modalities i.e., epistemic, deontic) were employed to investigate 5 selected texts extracted from *Pain and Grace*. While analyzing texts, pursuits of research questions were kept into perspective on every single revelation. Linguistic resources employed in Sufi poetry, traces of local culture through various manifestations in texts, ideological perspectives, author’s subjectivity and influence over the texts, her beliefs attached with Sufi discourse, voices of other texts merged within Schimmel’s texts, prominence of other voices and the distinction of the author’s voice despite the presence of other prominent voices, author’s commitment to truth, obligation and necessity and Schimmel’s grasp over the Sufi discourse despite being a Western scholar
remained the major areas of concern for the researcher. The relevant indicators were extracted from the texts and interpreted in the light of research pursuits.

The next five texts were extracted from ‘The Rose and the Nightingale’ and ‘Sufism in Indo-Pakistan’ chapters of Mystical Dimensions of Islam, the second core text of the study. In order to investigate the rich cultural and inherent mystic underpinnings and various other facets set in the research questions, again the texts were investigated on the same parameters mentioned above. The frequency of various ‘aspects of three-dimensional model’ traced within the texts was different, however, the research pursuits remained the same. Though Mystical Dimensions of Islam is an historic account of Sufism and its various dimensions but the chapters from where the texts have been extracted were found replete with the desired pursuits. The pertinent instances were extracted and interpreted keeping into perspective all the significant inquiries mentioned in research questions.

The last five core texts were extracted from ‘Rumi and the Metaphors of Love’ and ‘Mystical poetry in the Vernaculars’ chapters of As through a Veil, third core book of the study. The core book is based on five lectures delivered by Schimmel within the auspices of American Council of Learned Societies in 1980, which were later published. The book exclusively focuses mystical poetry in Islam and therefore is rich in cultural traces embedded within its various texts. Persian mystic traditions and Maulana Jalaluddin Rumi have been brought into limelight. Selected texts were examined on textual, discursive and social dimensions mentioned in three-dimensional model keeping into consideration various aspects of the model already established. Research questions provided directions while investigating various cultural, ideological and other dimensions. Again, interpretations were followed by various pertinent examples extracted from the core texts. However, evidences of various tools of enquiry remained different within all the texts.

Chapter 5 commences on by giving the brief gist of the proceedings of the research. Later, the findings address answers to three major research questions one by one. Construction of local culture through Schimmel’s interpretations of Sufi poetry is briefly presented supporting the findings with relevant instances. Ideological perspectives are also traced, interpreted through
relevant aspects of Fairclough’s three-dimensional model. Here the inquiries of ‘assumptions’ and especially ‘value assumptions’ are found significant in reaching the relevant answers. The issue of adequate reconstruction of local culture by Schimmel is also addressed supporting it from relevant section of the text analysis. After putting forward the findings of the study, conclusive insights are established addressing the answers of research questions comprehensively. Limitations encountered within various stages of the research proceeding are straightforwardly put forward followed by the recommendations for the future researchers and implications of the study highlighting the significance of the study and the considerable difference it will make within academic settings.

Findings and conclusions responding to various dimensions of the research pursuits are given as under:

5.2 Findings and Conclusions
5.2.1 Research Question No. 1:
What construction of local culture emerges out of Schimmel’s interpretation of Sufi poetry?

All the 15 selected texts under study, based on Schimmel’s interpretation of Sufi poetry, are rich in local cultural underpinnings which were touched upon in Chapter 4. Following conclusions have been drawn keeping in view Research Question No.1:

Various indicators of local culture have been merged within the texts. For instance, in Text 1 within Sur Ripa’s description in Shah Jo Risalo, ‘the longings of the lonely wife for her husband’ is an instance of the husband-wife relation which becomes quite significant in local cultural settings especially in folk tradition. ‘Yogis’ in Sur ‘Khahori’ who walk from place to place and ‘suffer every possible discomfort’ signify these ascetic practitioners of meditation within local cultural settings. The traditional theme of ‘spinning of cotton’ expressed in Sur Kapaiti becomes significant for Sufi poets of Sind and Panjab which is a significant indicator in rural settings. The concept of kang, the messenger bird (discussed in Sur Purab) considered as being a major source of conveying messages in the past becomes a fascination for Sindhi and
Panjabi folk songs and mystical poetry developing close association with the common folk. In *Sur pirbhati* (Early Morning), man’s soul seen as ‘wandering minstrel’ with historical and cultural significance attached to it portrays the figure of the minstrels (usually poets and musicians) who used to visit place to place carrying a stringed instrument and narrated mystic themes. ‘Powerful rulers of Sind’ appearing to be symbols of ‘Muhammad’s (PBUH) grace and munificence’ mentioned in *Sur Bilawal* are an indicator of reverence and esteem with the Prophet Muhammad (PBUH) which though is an integral part of the ideologies of the Muslims, yet greater level of reverence may well be witnessed in local culture of Sind. ‘Special Mahafil’ exclusively conducted to narrate Prophet Muhammad’s (PBUH) special attributes in the form of *Na’at* (admiration of Prophet Muhammad’s (PBUH) special attributes) are significant aspects of local cultural settings especially in Sind and Panjab.

Many of the instances of the reconstruction of local culture through Schimmel’s discourse were traced in **Text 2**. ‘Sighs of the deserted women’, a theme prominent in folktales portrayed the pangs of the deserted women suffering all the troubles and tribulations on their journey to the beloved, contains rich local cultural dimensions where the character of village woman gains greater significance. Various other themes including the ‘beauty of the beloved’ occupy a prominent place in folk traditions. This theme has fascinated folk poets and the common folk to a great extent. Through the portrayal of the folktales of ‘Sassui’ and ‘Marui’, Schimmel has reconstructed local culture signifying the essence of these prominent folktales embedded within local cultural settings. The theme of *Khwab-i-ghaflat* ‘sleep of negligence’ has been contrasted with the culturally loaded theme of ‘nightly vigils’, ‘mystic tradition of remaining awake’, which are considered to be ‘great boon for the lovers’. Through Sufi poetry, the common folk develop familiarity with the term and the theme becomes embedded in local cultural settings. The raised and esteemed stature of the beloved was also reconstructed in Schimmel’s interpretations of Sufi poetry which is the most prominent theme in folk and Sufi settings and therefore contains deeper significance in local culture.

**Text 3** carries plenty of features where instances of reconstruction of local culture are evident. The miseries of the ‘wretched lovers’ and ‘pangs and sufferings on the way to love’, major themes in Sufi and folk traditions, gain greater prominence in local culture as these themes
are seen embedded in Sufi and folk poetry and the Sufi poems and folk songs loaded with these themes are often sung by the rural folk which is indicative of their significance in local culture. The theme of ‘ruthless beloved’ acquires prominence in most of the poetic discourses especially its evidences in folk traditions are manifold where the beloved is presented as a ruthless figure and the term of ‘wretched soul’ is employed for the lover. This theme is significant in terms of local culture as it is merged in folk and Sufi traditions which are very close to the masses. The theme of *Qurbani* (sacrifice) which though is a Quranic theme and is significant in terms of religious background but its cultural relevance cannot be denied. The concept of ‘the arena of love’ *mahabbah*—a place for seekers to prove their spiritual maturity occupies a prominent place within folktales and Sufi discourse and therefore carries cultural underpinnings.

**Text 4** comprises reflection of the famous folktales with themes representing the concise narrative of the folktales in *Shah Ju Risalo* of Shah Abdul Latif Bhitai. The folktale of Sohni and Mehar acquires access with the common folk through the poetic discourse and folktales, becoming an integral feature of the Sindhi local culture. The essence of the pangs of Sassui can be witnessed within folk songs of Sind. The essence of the theme of Sassui and Punhun can be traced within the soil of Sind establishing deep impacts on the local cultural settings. Folktale of ‘Laila and Majnun’ becomes a significant feature of the Sufi discourse and its impact can be traced within the Sufi poetic discourse where Majnun is seen as ‘a paragon of the true lover’ whose love for Laila has been idealized for his beloved. Folk and Sufi poetry portrays the theme of ‘union with the beloved after years of yearning on the way to love’ which is embedded within folk songs leaving deep impacts on local cultural settings.

Likewise Text 4, in **Text 5**, the instances of construction of local culture were investigated through portrayal of few more folktales deeply embedded in Sindhi local culture. The famous folktale of Lila and Chanesar establishes close links to the common folk. The theme of ‘process of purification in order to be acceptable to the Lord’ gains greater acclaim and familiarity within the common folk as it emerges out to be the central theme of the folktale. The extension of the same theme of purification was observed within folktale of ‘Mumal and Rano’ where the deep impacts of the ‘dangerous, courtesanlike woman’ in the form of Mumal leaves deep impacts on local culture of Sind where the theme gains popularity within the common folk.
‘Purification and union with the beloved’ constructs local culture of Sind where the theme of love gains greater prominence with poetic and folk traditions. The essence of the theme of ‘remaining faithful to the beloved under the heaviest pressures’ was witnessed through the folktale of Marui where construction of the value of faithfulness becomes a salient value characterizing the local cultural traditions of Sind. The same theme becomes the subject matter of many of the folktales and therefore gains prominence in Sufi and cultural settings. Another construction of local culture is evident through the theme of ‘perfect surrender and obedience’ which emerges to be the central theme of the folktale of ‘Nuri and Jam Tamachi’ where Nuri was the perfect example of Nafs mutma’innat ‘soul at peace’. Local culture of Sind characterizes the essence of the theme of ‘Perfect surrender’ which gains significance in Sufi settings. The theme of ‘fulfilled love and happiness’ portrayed in ‘peaceful Sur Kamod’ sung early afternoon, reference to ‘Sindhi swinging bed’ as center of the cultural activity within Sindhi culture are instances of the construction of Sindhi local cultural settings. Further, the reference to folktale of brave Morirro who kills the ‘shark of desire’ also forms deeper impact on local culture where this theme reaches the common folk through Sufi poetic discourse.

‘Eternal story of husn u ishq’ encompasses the entire Text 6. The fascination of this theme can be observed within local cultural settings as this is the most discussed theme in folktales and Sufi poetic discourse. The construction of the theme of the ‘beauty of Beloved’ supporting it with the Prophetic tradition: ‘God is beautiful and loves beauty’ attaches strength to this theme. Among Sufi traditions, the beloved refers to the Divine beloved and the theme experiencing mystic and folk traditions becomes an integral part of the local cultural settings. ‘Worldly love as a pedagogical experience’ and ‘Heart is polished by the fire of love’ are also an extension of the theme of love which has deep imprints on the local culture. Further, the construction of the theme of Niyaz ‘asking and petitioning’, an attribute of the lover, and Perfect naz ‘coquetry’, often employed by the beloved, have greater significance within Sindhi culture where the essence of both these terms even becomes an integral feature of the behavior of Sindhi folk. Another construction of local culture was investigated in the form of ‘Beauty, a static concept’ which has ‘no full meaning without admiration and love’. Beauty establishes a special association with the admiration of the lover which becomes the subject matter of many of the poetic discourses. These poetic discourses deeply embedded in local cultural settings are
embedded in Sufi and folk poetic discourses. Further, construction of local culture was witnessed through the theme of the story of ‘Mahmud and Ayaz’ where this historical cultural reference has a significant cultural value. The ‘submission and obedience’ being the major theme of the historical reference characterizes the cultural values of Sindhi culture where obedience of the slave Ayaz to his master Mahmud of Ghazna was portrayed as an unmatched instance. Another powerful instance of construction of local culture was traced through the reference of Majnun who was considered as the ‘model of mystical love’ for his love with Laila. The folktale of Laila Majnun is very close to the common folk as it acquires greater acclaim among the masses when it reaches them through Sufi poetic discourse. Major themes of ‘Ishq-i-majazi’ and ‘Ishq-i-haqiqi’ are further supported by Ruzbihan Baqli’s words: ‘The love of a human being is the ladder toward the love of Merciful’ where metaphorical love transforms into real love. The essence of this theme may well be observed in local cultural settings where the common folk are not only familiar with these themes rather establish deeper association with them through Sufi poetry, through which they get an access to the themes.

Theme of love with its various dimensions has been constructed in Text 7. The reference to the great Sufi poet Rumi and his followers and predecessors gives strength to the text. According to them, ‘love was the power innate in everything’. This theme travels through poetic discourse and establishes an easy access to the common folk where the imprints of the theme of love and its understanding can be witnessed within Persian local cultural settings. Rumi’s poetic discourse developed fascination among the masses. Further, ‘cosmological role of love’-another dimension of the theme of love put forward by Rumi and ‘dynamic character of love’, further elucidating the theme of love are evident examples of construction of one of the significant aspects of local culture portrayed in Sufi discourse forming close association with the masses. ‘Magnetic force of love’ presented by the Sufi saint Nizami explicates love of the magnet which attracts iron with vehement longing. Various aspects of love established a close association with the common folk through folk and mystic poetry and the culture exhibited traces of these themes from where these themes sprouted. Theme of ‘love as fire’, ‘love manifests God’s beauty as well as His majesty’, the concept of true tauhid ‘oneness of God’ constructed in Schimmel’s discourse also portray the significance of these themes within local cultural settings. Reflection
of the theme of *tauhid* as Divine aspect of love is a Sufi interpretation which develops access within the masses.

In Text 8, construction of local culture is made through imageries of birds. These imageries established a special link with different aspects of the local cultural settings. They were taken from the surrounding, therefore were easy to comprehend. ‘Nightingale yearning for the rose’ refers to the soul longing for eternal beauty. Imagery of nightingale has often been employed by Persian poets attaching various connotations to them. The falcon longing to return to his master’s fist has been exploited for lost and bewildered soul which returns, at peace, to the Lord. The same theme can also be employed within Sufi settings where Sufi poets always aspired to return to the Divine Beloved. In local cultural settings, this theme acquires great significance as the common folk establish a deeper comprehension of this imagery and its various connotations. ‘Dove’s *ku ku*’, asking the way toward the beloved, is a prominent theme within poetic discourse which is deeply embedded in local cultural settings. ‘Stork’s *lak lak*’ can be perceived as ‘*al-mulk lak, al-amr-lak, al-hamd-lak*’ implying ‘Thine is the kingdom, Thine is the order, Thine is the praise’. The traces of complete devotion and veneration to the Divine Beloved may also be traced within local cultural settings. Further, Duck as a symbol of human beings ‘half bound to earth, half living in the ocean of God’; crow associated with the ‘ugly winter landscape of this worldly existence’; camel symbolizing a faithful person; unclean dog presented as a model for Sufi, keeping faithful company with ‘Seven Sleepers’ (*Quranic reference from Sura Al-Kahaf*), became purified and sanctified referring to the lower soul purified in the company of saintly people—all these instances contain deeper significance within local cultural settings. Elephant as a perfect image of the mystic’s soul despite worldly entanglements possesses the vision of eternal homeland. Flowers, leaves and petals also carry deeper meanings where ‘flowers become a tongue to praise God’, on leaves and petals, ‘God’s wisdom can be read’. All these imageries acquire prominence within Sufi poetic discourse and through this powerful medium travel to the common folk becoming an integral part of the local culture.

In Text 9, close association between Panjabi and Sindhi literature was brought into the limelight. Construction of local culture may well be witnessed through Schimmel’s explication
of more rustic and very idiomatic Panjabi language and a little complicated and musical Sindhi language. Their strength and expressiveness make them an excellent media to convey mystical feelings. The message of Sufi saints within these languages established a direct access with the common folk and it can visibly be traced within local cultural settings. Another evident construction of local culture was seen in the effective media of *Dohras, kafis, way* in which ‘portrayal of endless yearning of the soul, burning love, longing for pain’ established deeper association with the masses in rural settings where the simple villagers had profound association with this medium of poetic discourse. ‘Dry-as-dust theologian’, ‘the *molla*’ who is a prominent figure within rural local cultural settings was also constructed through Schimmel’s discourse. These theologians and their ascetic beliefs faced severe criticism in Sufi poetic discourse. Visible traces of the powerful contrastive characters of the *molla* and the *Sufi* can be noticed within local cultural settings. Construction of ‘surrender in love’ within Schimmel’s interpretations highlights one of the significant aspects of local culture where this theme has developed sufficient familiarity within the common folk through Sufi discourse. Further, Schimmel constructs one of the prominent Sufi figures Sultan Bahu, theme of his poetic discourse, portrayal of daily life of villagers through his imageries from gardening and planting, his popular *seh harfi* ending with the exclamation *hu* and the enrapturing melody with which it is sung. It is important here that Schimmel’s interpretation visibly construct local culture. Another significant construction of local culture has been made through the concept of ‘spinning and its association with dhikr’ and heart’s refinement through *dhikr*. The concept of spinning established deeper association with the village folk and its impacts can also be traced in local culture. The concept of ‘hymns extolling the great masters of the mystical orders’ was also constructed which has deep imprints on local cultural settings. Special gatherings are organized by the devotees for their *Pir* or mystical guide mostly within rural settings where hymns sung in melodious tunes extol their mystical guide and his mystical order. So, this theme emerges to be equipped with deeper local cultural underpinnings. Abdul Qadir Gilani, the most revered figure in Sufi settings, his miracles and the poems composed in his honour were also constructed in Schimmel’s discourse which have ample local cultural clues as the great saint and his teachings had deeper impacts on the common folk. The construction of the concepts of ‘fate of Mansur Hallaj’, universal concept of Sufi, his unique stature, special esteem given to him in all the religions, ‘Indian *advaita* mysticism’, ‘Islamic monotheism’, ‘love for the Sheikh in Islamic mysticism’ and the ‘Hindu
love for the *guru*’ were also witnessed within Schimmel’s analysis which are culturally loaded themes establishing deep impacts on the respective local cultural settings.

Within **Text 10** various culturally loaded themes mentioned in *Surs of Shah Jo Risalo* were elaborated. ‘Ballads of Indus valley’ dealing with prominent folktales and mystical moods or ideal lover were also constructed which carry deeper local cultural underpinnings. Construction of local culture was also traced with the elaboration of the theme of ‘mystical syncretism’ in which various discrete traditions and contradictory beliefs are given due space. The concept acquires acclaim within Sufi settings and therefore reaches the common masses through Sufi discourse. ‘Praise of the Prophet (PBUH)’ and ‘bitter laments for Husayn’s death in *Kerbela*’ were also constructed within Schimmel’s interpretations. Though these themes are thoroughly religious but their deep impacts and special attachment of the folk within these themes can be witnessed in local culture. The most prominent folktales of ‘*Sohni Mehanwal*’, ‘*Sassui Punhun*’, ‘*Marui*’, ‘*Nuri and Jam Tamachi*’ and the reflection of the traditional love element can be seen constructed within Schimmel’s discourse carrying deeper local cultural meanings. The construction of the theme of ‘sleep of heedlessness’ referring to Sassui’s ‘*khwabi-ghaflat*’, who lost her beloved Punhun when she woke up from the sleep of heedlessness, also forms deeper impacts on the common folk. ‘Hindi tale of Sorathi’ constructed in Schimmel’s analysis strengthens her construction with a tinge of diversity as not only the portrayal of Islamic conception of mysticism is given significance rather the concepts of other religions associated with mysticism have also been incorporated. The themes of ‘the painful wandering’ of Sassui ultimately resulting in ‘interior journey’, the depiction of the same state experienced by Majnun and ‘Rumi’s discovery of his lost friend Shamsuddin’ within his own heart after looking for him everywhere, constructed by Schimmel establish close association with the common folk and their reflection can also be observed within local cultural settings. The construction of the theme of ‘Dying before you die’ associated with Sassui who gets an access to higher unitive stage by dying before she dies. These discourses develop an access with the masses through mystical and folk poetry.

In **Text 11**, the construction of local culture was traced through Schimmel’s interpretation of ‘mystical dance’ as the most prominent aspect of Sufi discourse. Further,
Dervishes’ engrossed state reflected through ‘whirling movement’ and their extreme state of ecstasy on the shrines of Sufi saints contain plenty of local cultural underpinnings as the mystical dance acquires significant value in local cultural settings. ‘Musical imagery of love’s music’ and ‘cosmic dance’- the outcome of love’s music were also effectively constructed where Love’s music makes everything dance and the entire cosmos acquires the whirling movement. Construction of evident manifestations of nature i.e., ‘dancing of lilies at love’s proper music’ can be traced from mystical tradition where such themes find ample space and become an integral part of the local cultural settings because the Sufi poetic discourse develops considerable association with the masses. Further, the construction of the themes of ‘fana’ and ‘baqa’ being the most prominent Sufi doctrines were also merged within Schimmel’s discourse which imply the taking out of the gravitational field of the material world and annihilation in the spiritual sun’s magnetic field. The construction of ‘white robes’ acquire considerable significance as they are viewed as the ‘garments of resurrection’. Construction of local culture was also evident through the reference of casting off black coats by ‘Mevlevi Dervishes’ which symbolically represent the materialistic world, reveal the deep secret of ‘transforming love’.

In Text 12 the construction of local culture was witnessed through a very prominent and revered figure of Pir as the ‘perfect mystical guide’, ‘embodiment of love’ and ‘superhuman wisdom’ as he acquires a dignified stature within the masses. ‘Tremendous influence of the Pir over his followers’ is another reference through which local culture was constructed. The evidences of the same instance can be traced within rural settings. The raised and esteemed stature of Pir before his followers was constructed in Schimmel’s discourse where Yunus Emre has been referred who considers Pir as ‘the true man of God’ whose ‘arena is higher than the Divine Throne’ and further ‘whose very glance transforms dust into jewels’. On the contrary, the construction of illiterate village saint, his comprehension level and beliefs regarding the mystical guide and the ideological footings of the common masses were also observed through which local cultural underpinnings can be inferred. Rumi’s reference, imagery taken from daily life and the precious style employed by Persian-writing also maintain an access with the common folk leaving deep imprints on the local culture.
In Text 13 the construction of local culture was witnessed through the images taken from the world of women where the rural woman finds ample space within Schimmel’s discourse. Schimmel constructs her image as ‘the best transmitter of religious poetry, songs, proverbs and depositaries of mystical lore’ which contains sufficient local cultural underpinnings. Further, culturally loaded theme of ‘act of spinning’ was attributed to the rural woman. *Dhikr*, the most prestigious theme with Sufis was associated with the act of spinning. This theme acquires great significance within local cultural settings. ‘Humming sound’ of the wheel while spinning was attached to ‘regular breathing’ within the process of *dhikr*. Different kinds of *dhikr*: ‘*dhikr-i-jali*’, ‘*dhikr-i-qalbi*’ and ‘*dhikr-i-aini*’ were constructed which are common practices within Sufi settings embedded with cultural meanings. Another construction of local culture was traced through the concept of ‘grinding of grain’ highlighted in the poetic discourse of *chakki nama* by Bijapuri Sufis acquired greater acclaim within the masses becoming a prominent reference in local cultural settings. Various analogies from agriculture referring to human life could also be visibly noticed within Schimmel’s discourse. For instance ‘sowing and reaping’ was linked with the Prophetic tradition: ‘This world is the seedbed for the other world’. Though it has religious connotation, its relevance in local cultural settings is also significant as the common folk develop a special acclaim because of their closeness to their surroundings. Construction of theme of rain as *rahma* ‘mercy’ linked with the praise of the Prophet of Mercy (PBUH) as ‘the mercy for the worlds’ in Qura’n contains significant relevance with the masses as it not only has a religious relevance rather comprises considerable significance within local culture. Special gatherings in the form of *Mahafil-e-Na’at* are organized by the Muslims in which special reverence is shown to the Prophet (PBUH) in melodious voices. A considerable value is attached with this concept within local cultural settings.

In Text 14, ‘folktales utilized for mystical purposes’ were found constructed within Schimmel’s interpretations. The themes portrayed in the folktales are representative of their local cultural norms and comprise plenty of cultural indicators. Further, many of the facets of local culture can be inferred from the construction of the theme of ‘appearance of woman-soul in various guises in Shah Abdul Latif Bhitai’s poetry’. This very concept has always been the center of focus for the Sufi poets as the Sufi discourse has always given this aspect prominence where the portrayal of the sufferings and longings of the woman-soul can be witnessed. Evident
portrayal of the character of woman was witnessed in Bhitai’s *Shah Jo Risalo* interpreted by Schimmel. The construction of local culture was observed within the most famous folktale of Hir Ranjha elaborated in more than hundred versions which was given its final form by Warith Shah. The construction of the folktale of Sohni Mehanwal depicting the eternal union of Sohni with her beloved and miseries confronted on the way to the beloved. The theme of the folktale develops intimacy with the common folk reflecting plenty of local cultural aspects. Further, local culture was found constructed within folktale of ‘Sassui and Punhun’ depicting anguish on the way to beloved, ultimate attainment of the divine love and transition from metaphorical love to the real love. Folktale of Marui and her remaining ‘unstained by the blandishments of the colorful world’ was also seen constructed in Schimmel’s discourse highlighting local cultural aspects in plenty.

It is important here that Schimmel has not only constructed insights from the Islamic concept of Sufism rather the same concept in other religions was also brought into the limelight. The construction of local culture was evident through the themes of ‘Virahini quality of Hindu tradition’ and ‘poetical genre of *barahmasa*’. Further, a passing reference to ‘Krishna-Radha cycle in Bengali Sufi poetry’ and ‘Bengali folk singers’ contains local cultural underpinnings.

In **Text 15**, the construction of local culture was witnessed through the portrayal of a prominent character of Pir (mystical guide), the special place he acquires and the reverence and veneration associated with him within local culture. The construction of local culture was witnessed through the prominent reference of Great Sufi Saint Abdul Qadir Gilani, special miracles attributed to him, his veneration portrayed by Turkish poets who considered themselves as ‘the honey of his bees, the rose of his garden and the nightingale of his meadow’. The construction of local culture was also reflected through special reverence offered by the Panjabi folk singer, Sindhi poets and Sindhi geographical poem ‘enumerating dozens of cities and countries as Abdul Qadir’s Domain’. Local culture was again constructed through the most significant concept of ‘wilayat’ and the stature of Pir and his khalifa. All these themes establish a special link with the common folk and therefore become an integral part in local cultural settings. Further, hymns written in honour of other saints, ‘Qawwali’ with its ‘sweet tunes’ and ‘enrapturing rhythms’ sung in special gatherings at shrines of the Sufi saints extolling Sufi saints have also been constructed in Schimmel’s discourse which depict plenty of local cultural traces.
Examination of 15 selected texts of Schimmel through critical discourse perspective revealed that the construction of local culture within Schimmel’s interpretive discourse was evident through various indicators which were merged in her analysis of Sufi poetry. These local cultural indicators include various Sufi beliefs, practices, esteemed figures, themes and characters of folktales, rural cultural norms, superstitions, music and traditional element of *husn u-ishq* etc. It is important here that Schimmel’s interpretive discourse constructed local culture and at the same time her discourse was constituted by these local cultural indicators which established direct impact on her analysis of Sufi poetry. This is a significant aspect of CDA.

5.2.2 Research Question No. 2: What ideological perspectives does Schimmel employ while interpreting Sufi Poetry?

While tracing ideological perspectives, assumptions were considered to be the appropriate linguistic tools through which relevant clues could be found. In ‘assumptions’, ‘value assumptions’ were found suitable to answer the question pertaining to ideological traces.

In Text 1, the authorial voice seems to be more judgmental giving vent to her beliefs and ideologies. After having examined *Sur Ripa* extensively, the value assumption of ‘impressive images’ attaches her subjectivity to the theme. Further, the ideologies of the author attached with the theme of Yogis by declaring them as ‘perfect men’ is also indicative of the ideological perspectives employed by Schimmel. ‘Beautiful and mysterious, powerful and mild’ is another value assumption which contains great strength. Evident clues to the belief system of the author associated with the divine Lord can be witnessed within this instance.

In Text 2, the value assumption through the phrase ‘in full etiquette’ described the ideological association of the author with the concept of *houris* which are promised by Almighty Allah to be bestowed upon the virtuous in the heaven. In another instance, the concept of Lord described by Schimmel as ‘eternally beautiful Lord’ is reflective of the beliefs of the author attached with the Lord.
Text 3 also comprises traces of ideological patterns. After having extensively examined *Sur Kalyan*, the author attaches her subjectivity in the form of a value assumption with the song declaring it as ‘the most purely mystical song’.

In Text 4, Schimmel after having thoroughly grasped the love story of Sohni and Mehar, attaches her ideologies in the form of a subjective value assumption declaring it as ‘pre-eternal love-covenant’. At another point, value assumption was traced when Schimmel after complete investigation of Sassui’s story, considered it as the ‘intriguing story’. Schimmel’s subjective stance and her ideologies are evident though the value assumption.

In Text 5, the value assumption ‘spoiled and pleasure loving’ employed by Schimmel for Lila is indicative of her ideologies attached with the story of ‘Chanesar and Lila’ where the complete image of Lila is portrayed before the reader. At another point, the researcher traced her ideologies through the value assumption employed within the story of ‘Nuri and Prince Jam Tamachi’. Schimmel establishes a clear image of Nuri through her ‘perfect surrender and obedience’ before the Prince.

In Text 6, authorial voice along with her ideologies were traced through the value assumption attached with the concept of ‘husn u-ishq’ where many Persian and Urdu romances dealing with ‘husn u-ishq’ were described and the story of *husn u-ishq* was declared as an ‘eternal story’. Giving vent to another ideological perspective, beauty was declared as a ‘static concept’ through her value assumption where reflections of author’s beliefs about the concept of beauty were investigated.

In Text 7, the ideologies and beliefs of the author were clearly traced through her value assumption in which she declares Jalaluddin Rumi as the ‘unsurpassable master of love and passion’. Her subjective stance was also evident within this instance. Her beliefs and ideological stance was observed at another point where she explicated the intensity of passion of Love by declaring it as ‘fire’.
In Text 8, Schimmel’s subjectivity and ideological perspectives were observed through her value assumption in which she considers Attar’s book as ‘one of the favorite story books’ of the Persian literature. Secondly, the imagery of the ‘falcon-a noble bird’ was presented in a value assumption considering it as a ‘touching imagery’ reflective of the ideological perspective employed by Schimmel. At another point through various imageries of animals and birds, Schimmel expresses a value assumption by declaring ‘Attar’s cosmos’ as the wonderful one. Further, the ‘patience of the faithful person’ associated with the imagery of the camel was described supporting it with a value assumption declaring it as ‘perfect patience’. In another instance, the imagery of the elephant was portrayed with a value assumption considering it as ‘one of the finest images in Persian poetry’ which is reflective of the ideological perspective Schimmel attaches with the value assumption. In extension to this theme, further, the imagery of the elephant was viewed as a ‘perfect image of the mystic’s soul’ which gives an insight into Schimmel’s ideologies attached with mysticism.

In Text 9, the author’s beliefs and ideologies attached with Panjabi and Sindhi languages were reflected through the value assumption. Schimmel attached various value assumptions collectively with Panjabi and Sindhi languages by declaring Panjabi as ‘more rustic and very idiomatic’ and ‘musical Sindhi’ while both languages were attached with a few more value assumptions declaring them to be ‘strong and expressive languages clearly demonstrating author’s ideologies associated with them.

In Text 10, Schimmel’s command over themes of *Shah Jo Risalo* and her interest in its themes were traced through her value assumption in which she declares the last chapter *Sur Ramakali* of *Risalo* as ‘one of the most interesting parts’ of *Risalo*. At another point within the text, Shah Abdul Latif Bhitai’s attribute was portrayed with a value assumption stating that he could begin his poems with the ‘most dramatic moment’ which again is reflective of the Schimmel’s ideological attachment with *Shah Jo Risalo*. Schimmel again gives vent to another value assumption associated with the folktale by emphasizing that the folktale comprised the ‘distinct flavor’ of the Indian tale of ‘the maid with the fish-smell’. It was also reflective of her comprehensive grasp over the themes. Further, Schimmel again becomes judgmental through
her value assumption about Nuri who was portrayed as ‘the model of the obedient soul’. Subjectivity and ideological perspectives were evident through this value assumption.

In **Text 11**, author’s subjectivity and ideological stance was deduced from the value assumption attached with Jalaluddin Rumi’s *Mathnawi* which considered it as the ‘most famous expression of musical imagery’.

In **Text 12**, the glimpses of the belief system and ideologies of Schimmel attached with the concept of *Pir* were examined where the value assumption attached with this concept declares *Pir* as the ‘perfect mystical guide’. At another point, value assumption put forward by Schimmel portrayed the ‘tremendous influence of the *Pir* over his followers’. Again, this instance was also ideologically loaded and gave vent to Schimmel’s subjective stance.

In **Text 13**, Schimmel’s ideological stance attached with the world of women was presented through a value assumption in which the women were declared as ‘the best transmitters of religious poetry, songs and proverbs’. The author’s stance towards the womenfolk could also be accessed through this value assumption. At another stage, the value assumption regarding the ‘grinding of the grain’ brought into limelight the ‘most important occupation of the Indian housewife’ reflective of Schimmel’s complete grasp over the themes of rural local cultural settings.

In **Text 14**, Schimmel’s value assumption was witnessed regarding the folktale of ‘Hir Ranjha’. It was considered as ‘the best known example of the complete spiritualization of a medieval folktale’ was indicative of the ideological stance of Schimmel regarding the folktale. At another point, the value assumption regarding Shah Abdul Latif’s skill of beginning his poetical renderings was highlighted by declaring that he could begin his poetical renderings with the ‘most dramatic moment’. The ideological perspective of the author was evident within this instance. Further, Sassui was declared as ‘the perfect embodiment’ signifying Schimmel’s ideological stance towards the theme of the folktale. Another value assumption linked with the theme of the folktale was also observed in which the path adopted by Sassui to find her beloved was considered as the ‘difficult mystical path’. Schimmel attached the theme of the folktale to
the mystical concept in which miseries on the way to beloved were attached to the difficult mystical path.

In **Text 15**, Schimmel’s ideologies and beliefs linked with Abdul Qadir Gilani, great mystical guide of the Sufi settings, were reflected through the value assumption stating that he was known to be the ‘most popular saint’.

The answer to the second research pursuit pertaining to ideological perspectives revealed that various ‘value assumptions’ mentioned above were indicative of Schimmel’s beliefs and ideologies associated with various indicators of local culture embedded within her analysis of Sufi poetry. The researcher brought into limelight her ideologies linked with themes and characters of different folktales, Sufi beliefs, Sufi saints, Sufi practices, cultural values, womenfolk and regional languages.

5.2.3 Research Question No. 3: How far do Schimmel’s interpretations adequately reconstruct local culture from Sufi Poetry?

Addressing this question pertaining to adequacy though involves ‘validity’ and insights from other works to conduct a comparative analysis and then concludes how far adequacy was maintained. But the constraint the researcher encounters in this regard is that he does not find any other linguistic study especially a critical discourse perspective on Schimmel’s works to be employed as a comparative work tracing adequacy. What is available on Schimmel’s works is mere a general review of his books. So, the subjectivity of the researcher was definitely involved in investigating the issue of adequacy.

To answer this enquiry, only one linguistic device or aspect of Fairclough’s three-dimensional model cannot be relied. Through insights from intertextuality, use of specific vocabulary, additive relations and relations of elaboration, it can be concluded how far Schimmel’s interpretations adequately reconstruct local culture from Sufi poetry.
In terms of intertextuality, the frequency of the indirect quotations in all the 15 texts selected from the three core books is greater than the direct ones. The indirect reporting of the references is indicative of the prominence of the authorial voice as Schimmel seems to maneuver these intertextual references with the impact of her own subjectivity. It is also pertinent to mention here that despite being a Western scholar, her grasp over the minutest details of local cultural aspects is significant. Though, she being a Western scholar was alienated to the minutest cultural norms, yet she not only established a fair understanding of the Sufi themes but also developed a reasonably sound sense of the poetic styles, variations and local cultural traditions. Schimmel merges other voices referring to various local cultural references within texts to give prominence to the texts but her own voice still remains distinct because of various faculties involved. The specific vocabulary which characterizes her style is one of the tools through which she creates distinction.

The matter of adequacy was also evaluated by investigating which local cultural aspects were given prominence and how it was reconstructed within texts of Schimmel.

In Text 1, more prominence was found attached wherever the cultural instances are found, while other trivial aspects seem to be deliberately given less space and a mere passing reference was found. ‘Song of the swan’ was not given more prominence within the text while all other culturally loaded terms in terms of local culture gained prominence.

In Text 2, themes of ‘beauty’, ‘sleep of negligence’, ‘mystic tradition of remaining awake’ and ‘nightly vigils’ were skillfully constructed explicating every possible details attached to them and were given greater space and therefore acquire more prominence within the text. On the contrary, the sighs of the deserted women were given lesser prominence as compared to other themes merged within the text. Further, through ‘relations of elaboration’ and ‘additive relations’ relevant and required details were added strengthening construction of local culture.

Throughout Text 3, the miseries, sufferings and sacrifices offered by the ‘wretched lovers’, significant themes of folktales merged within local culture, were given more prominence. Similarly, Mansur al Hallaj’s reference and his historic words ‘Ana’l Haqq’: ‘I’m
the absolute Truth’, becoming integral feature of the Sufi discourse, acquire greater space and prominence while the theme of ‘the arena of love’ was given lesser space as compared to other themes. Through ‘additive relations’ and ‘relations of elaboration’, adequate reconstruction of local culture was traced supporting the theme with required additions and elaborations.

In Text 4, themes of folktales of ‘Sohni and Mehar’ and ‘Sassui and Punhun’ and ‘forever union with the divine Beloved through death’ were found prevalent throughout the text and through strengthening these local cultural themes with intertextual references, relations of elaborations and additive relations, reconstruction of local culture was found adequate. However, where mere passing references were made especially within the theme of the folktale of Laila and Majnun, adequacy requires more elaborations and additions.

In Text 5, the themes of the most famous and renowned stories like ‘Lila Chanesar’, ‘Mumal Rano’, ‘Omer Marui’ and ‘Nuri Jam Tamachi’ occupied more space with greater prominence and Schimmel has tried to adequately reconstruct local culture through supporting these local cultural references with the linguistic tools and further employed various grammatical relations especially ‘additive relations’ and ‘relations of elaboration’ to strengthen her reconstruction. However, the references of Sur Kamod and Sur Ghatu needed to be more elaborate to acquire more adequacy.

In Text 6, culturally embedded themes of ‘Husn-u ishq’, the story of ‘Mahmud and Ayaz’, ‘Laila and Majnun’, ‘ishq-i-majazi’ and ‘ishq-i-haqiqi’ were merged and themes were found more prominently strengthened with specific vocabulary, intertextual references, relations of elaborations and additive relations employed by Schimmel. The support of all these aspects helped Schimmel adequately reconstruct local culture through Sufi poetry.

In Text 7, almost equal prominence seemed to be given to all the themes merged within the text and adequate reconstruction of local cultural aspects again was witnessed to a great extent.
In Text 8, imageries of nightingale and falcon and elephant, which occupy a prominent place in Sufi discourse, were given considerable prominence as various attributions and representation were attached with them through specific employment of vocabulary, additive relations, relations of elaboration and adequate intertextual references. Schimmel tries to be more accurate through her considerably adequate reconstruction of local culture supporting her interpretations with the relevant tools discussed. However, more adequacies were required in the description of other imageries which have comparatively been given less space.

In Text 9, considerable significance was given to all themes supporting them with various linguistic devices. ‘Additive relations’ and ‘relations of elaboration’ provided necessary assistance in the adequate reconstruction of local culture by strengthening the text with required additions and details. However, reference to Mansur Hallaj seemed to acquire less prominence and required more adequacies to be given through various tools.

In Text 10, various themes and discourses were merged within the text but prominence was given to the discourses merged in folktales and while giving the brief description of these folktales, through significant linguistic tools of employment of specific vocabulary, intertextual references, additive relations and relations of elaboration, Schimmel tried to maintain adequacy in the reconstruction of local cultural aspects, to which she remained considerably successful.

In Text 11, Schimmel after having established sound understating of the themes embedded in Sufi discourse, introduced various themes not only significant in Sufi discourse but also in local culture. Adequate reconstruction of local culture was witnessed when Schimmel presented culturally embedded theme of ‘whirling movement’ and associated it with ‘mystical dance’ found in Rumi’s poetry. Further, through adequately reconstructing themes of ‘musical imagery of love’ and the concepts of ‘fana’ and ‘baqa’, Schimmel relied on specific employment of vocabulary, intertextuality, additive relation and relations of elaboration. However, more elaboration was required to be attached with the theme of ‘rejuvenating death’.

In Text 12, Schimmel portrays Pir or ‘mystical guide’ as one of the significant figures of Sufi discourse who is also given great esteem within local cultural settings. The employment of
specialized vocabulary and intertextuality play a prominent role in reconstructing aspects of local culture. Schimmel attached more prominence to ‘Influence of the Pir’ and his overall stature within the masses and ‘daily used imagery’ employed by Rumi while more accuracy was needed to be attached to ‘precious style’ adopted by most of the Persian-writing mystics through various linguistic tools. Schimmel’s subjectivity and inclination towards the ‘daily used imageries’ were quite evident within the text. Further additions and elaborations could be more effective in adequately reconstructing local culture.

In Text 13, adequate reconstruction of local culture was witnessed through ‘imageries taken from the world of women’, ‘the concept of dhikr’, ‘analogies taken from agriculture’ and ‘veneration to the Prophet of Mercy (PBUH)’. The matter of adequacy was traced through the employment of relevant linguistic tools mentioned in Fairclough’s three-dimensional model through which Schimmel remained effective in adequately reconstructing local cultural aspects embedded within these instances. It is pertinent here that no ‘relations of elaboration’ were witnessed within this text, however, the additive relations employed by Schimmel played a pivotal role in adding sufficient details to adequately reconstruct local culture.

Text 14 is distinct because various folktales from Shah Abdul Latif Bhitai’s Shah Jo Risalo were merged within the text. Various aspects of the reconstruction of local cultural themes merged within folktales were adequately represented as even the minutest details were encompassed through various linguistic devices. However, more adequacies were required to be attached with the themes of ‘Qadi Qadan’s verse’ and Abdul Karim of Bulrri’s short verses as they have not been given prominence within the text. Additive Relations and Relations of Elaboration could have been employed to give more adequacy to the reconstruction of local culture.

Text 15 is specified for the description, roles and commendation of the mystical guide, one of the significant figures of local cultural settings. Through specific vocabulary and intertextual references, local culture was reconstructed referring to the legendary figure of Abdul Qadir Gilani and his influence within Sufi settings. However, ‘members of fraternities and mystical orders’ need some more adequacies in terms of elaboration and addition to make them
strengthened and more comprehensible. Schimmel’s subjectivity and her influx over the entire text is quite evident as the dimensions she wanted to assert were given prominence while others were given mere a passing reference.

After having investigated the 15 selected texts, the researcher concluded that despite the fact Schimmel was a Western scholar, she was able to develop a reasonably sound sense of various local cultural indicators and her interpretations based on Sufi poetry were indicative of a reasonably adequate reconstruction of local culture. However, in responding to the question regarding the adequacy, the researcher’s subjectivity was involved to a great extent as the researcher could not find any comparative work made on Schimmel in this connection through which he might conduct a comparative investigation to explore the significant aspect of adequacy. Through intertextual references, indirectly quoted, Schimmel was capable of maneuvering the local cultural references with her own impact on them. Further, with employment of specific vocabulary, additive relations and relations of elaborations, she was able to portray those local cultural indicators adequately within her interpretive discourse which represented the local cultural values in practice. However, the researcher also traced some of the local cultural aspects within Schimmel’s analysis which require some more accuracy in terms of their elaboration.

5.3 Limitations of the Study

Despite being very careful while analyzing texts according to the spirit of CDA, the study may not be considered as an exhaustive work on CDA. The main reason being CDA is itself in evolution stages and still carries many loopholes. So maintaining an idealized accuracy within a CDA study is entirely an arduous task. However, the researcher has tried his best to be more effective and well targeted towards his research pursuits. The major constraint I encountered was that within three-dimensional model, more focus was laid on textual dimensions focusing on the minutest aspects but in terms of social analysis, evident principles have not been put forward. The researcher has to rely on his own faculties to investigate the social perspective which is the third and the most important dimension of Fairclough’s three-dimensional model. Secondly, while selecting texts, I tried to be very careful but still the objection of researcher’s subjectivity
in selecting texts for analysis cannot be removed. The same limitation of CDA was highlighted by Widdowson (1995, 1998) stating that the researcher selects those texts for analysis which support ideal interpretation.

Further, at various points during my analysis, I felt an urgency of a separate model for the type of work, I was pursuing. Some of the aspects of Fairclough’s model were not exactly required with the research study I was pursuing and were more suited to conversational analysis. So, I could not be as elaborate in interpreting those aspects as compared to the aspects which really strengthened my study. Most of the features of micro-analysis devised by Fairclough, though did not play a major role in affecting the results but being an integral part of textual analysis, could not be skipped.

The major constraint I came across was that a bulk of interpretive and analytical work on Schimmel, keeping into perspective linguistic dimensions, is not available. What is available pertains to review of her works on Sufism dealing with Sufi beliefs in historical perspectives. So, the researcher could not find extensive work on Schimmel matching the research pursuits to establish a comparative analysis making the analysis more effective. Still every effort has been made to make the research investigation worth within academic settings despite various limitations the researcher encountered during the research proceedings.

Another limitation worth mentioning was encountered at the selection of texts. Most of the works of Schimmel centre on the belief part of Sufism, exploring various principles and beliefs associated with it and the historical evolution of Sufism. So, tracing relevant texts associated with local cultural dimension was indeed a difficult task. But the researcher tried to be very careful not only to avoid bias during selection process but also within the process of selecting those texts which were really worth researching.

Moreover, one of the limitations pertains to the fact that the study is not dealing with any extensive work of Schimmel rather is based on selected excerpts relevant to the research enquiry. It is not an investigative study of the historical evolution of Sufism and its various doctrines.
rather it is just a critical discourse perspective of the selected works of Schimmel that is a linguistic dimension.

5.4 Implications of the Study

The research study may have various implications. To begin with the most striking aspect, it is imperative to bring into limelight the research based methods of enquiry in pursuit of Sufi interpretive discourse. Most of the work which is available on Sufi discourse is tilted towards investigating Sufi beliefs and is focused on historical revelations and inquiries of miracles associated with great Sufi saints. But textual dimensions have not been the supreme priority within writers of Sufi discourse. Though translations and somewhat critical aspects are available, an urgency was observed in research-based inquiries of the textual and discoursal dimensions of Sufi works. Further, most of the studies are confined to impressionistic analysis and research-based textual inquiries have been compromised. So, this research study acquires a unique stature in this regard that it has not only probed into the textual dimensions of Sufi discourse rather a distinct method of critical enquiry was conducted to reach the conclusions instead of relying only on impressionistic analysis. Employment of CDA as theory and research method was indeed a unique dimension of enquiry in terms of Sufi discourse.

Secondly, the study is an endeavour in establishing and promoting ‘Discourse Competence’. It would not only refine the abilities of the research scholars to understand and construct Sufi discourse as a distinct entity rather their critical abilities would also be sharpened and they would be more concerned in investigating textual and discoursal dimensions than mere focusing on historical perspectives. In this regard, they would develop intimacy with various linguistic tools necessary to be known to budding research scholars.

Thirdly, as CDA asserts on developing a ‘counter discourse’ after having successfully investigated the text with critical discourse perspective, this study would develop familiarity with ‘counter discourse’, its significance in CDA and how helpful it proves to be in devising new strategies and plans of action for the future researchers.
Further, the research study lends a helping hand in positively portraying and promoting various cultural aspects prevalent and practiced within local cultural traditions. Though for the researchers in cultural studies, these aspects may not be unique but the procedures and linguistic means through which these local cultural dimensions were accessed are indeed significant. For the scholars in cultural studies, the term ‘discursive construction’ would definitely be a significant dimension through which various cultural inquiries could be investigated. The research study would also expose and introduce various cultural values which were reflected through Sufi discourse and further reconstructed in Schimmel’s interpretations. The study is also an endeavour in reviving various folktales and the key terms of Sufi discourse.

Moreover, the research study may not only satisfy the academic pursuits rather it plays a pivotal role in forming the positive and tolerant image of Islamic concept of Sufism through promotion of cultural values which is the need of the hour where the conflict situations prevail all around. Further, the research-based and critical enquiry of Sufi discourse especially that of a Western scholar would also be pertinent in terms of positive image construction of the scholars establishing their work on research grounds rather than grounding their work on mere impressionistic, biased and exaggerated footings. It would also resultantly remove the misconception that inquiries into Sufi discourse are based on mere reverence and exaggeration, not on any research and critical footings.

It also opens up new avenues for the researchers conducting their studies employing CDA as their research methodology, as CDA can be a very effective and purposeful method of enquiry for Sufi discourse. Further, for ideological and cultural pursuits, CDA is a recommended method of enquiry. Therefore, my research study would encourage and motivate the future researchers to apply CDA on Sufi discourse and it should not be restricted as a method of enquiry only in pursuit of relations of power and hegemony.

Lastly, my research study would develop and enhance the comprehension and readership of Schimmel within ordinary readers and provide insights for the scholarly researchers to explore new avenues basing their research on the humble footings my research study developed. It would also leave a pertinent aspect of enquiry for the scholarly researchers to investigate the factors that
led a Western scholar to critique Sufi poetry inquiring her source of inspiration for inclination towards Sufi discourse. It would also be important to conclude whether it was Sufi tradition and Islamic culture that attracted her attention or it was Sufi poetry and its universal appeal that fascinated her. This study would be of great help in satisfying these striking inquiries.

5.5 Recommendations

Though works on Sufi literature exploring its various dimensions are not scanty yet when it comes to the matter of its validity and reliability, most of the literature is neglected thinking that it is based on mere exaggeration or intensely subjective with a tinge of biasness attached to it because of the beliefs of the writers linked to it. Various stereotypical beliefs suggesting that Sufi studies are based on mere miracles and lack any research and critical dimension, impede inquiries into Sufi discourse. Most of the people think that sifting between what is right or wrong and then confirming the truth within this scenario often becomes difficult. So within this perspective, it is recommended that research culture may be promoted within the masses so that such impressionistic opinions could be overcome. The researchers should be encouraged to employ various critical dimensions while analyzing Sufi discourse.

Familiarity with discourse analysis and CDA should be promoted so that the future researchers may utilize this method of enquiry to Sufi discourse as well. In this regard, such institutions must be formed within countries where research pursuits especially within Sufi discourse may further be explored exclusively grounding it on research and critical footings. These institutions may establish worldwide collaborations so that new research dimensions may emerge and further pursued. An online central system should monitor the activities and research proceeding conducted on Sufi discourse. New linguistic and discourse inquiries should be experimented and such scholars experimenting new and emerging techniques should be encouraged.

The institutions working on Sufi discourse may be patronized on governmental level so that a peaceful image emerging from such studies may go worldwide. In this regard, institutions working across the globe on Sufi discourse may conduct joint sessions across the globe where
the researchers conducting their research studies within Sufi discourse may be given opportunities to share their research work and present them in joint sessions in the form of seminars, workshops, symposium and conferences worldwide.

Further, Sufi discourse should be linked with cultural studies so that the researchers working within these areas may sort out joint footings where their works develop intimacy with each other. It would be advisable that the researchers working within these different genres may integrate their research proceedings on joint forums. In this regard, sharing of the works should be promoted. Local culture of different regions worldwide should be brought into limelight on international forum where the commonalities within Sufi discourse and cultural studies may be highlighted. Considerable space may be given to any new research enquiry within Sufi discourse into the journals of international repute.

Though Sufism has already acquired international acclaim through its universal appeal which is embedded in its universal message of peace, the research pursuits within Sufi discourse should be promoted. Joint efforts on international level may be of a great help in this regard especially the international media may function effectively and realize the urgency of promoting research pursuits within Sufi studies so that the message of peace may gain international acclaim and conflict resolution may tactfully be employed.

Keeping in view the academic perspective, a bulk of Sufi studies can be found focusing on qualitative aspect. It is highly recommended that Sufi studies may also be conducted on quantitative data to give it a tinge of diversity. It would then also add to its validity. Corpus data may be effectively utilized in this regard.

As regards CDA as a methodology, various methods by key figures of CDA can be found pertaining to various aspects for analysis. A consensual methodology also needs to be developed to achieve better results. A joint collaborative effort is required in this perspective. Further, various types of discourses require separate models to be effectively analyzed. It has been observed that within different models of CDA, a mix of descriptive and dialogic linguistic devices or aspects of the model are present which may not be required within specific studies.
For instance, in most of the dialogic studies, linguistic devices pertaining to pragmatics may be required more than others. So, CDA practitioners should sit together and devise separate models for different types of discourses.

The study is only signposting what is happening in the selected texts. It may not be seen as a comprehensive analysis of the core texts the researcher has selected from Schimmel’s works. The core books of Schimmel contain many of the facets of enquiry comprising the historical perspectives from Sufism which may not be of any concern to the researcher as the researcher is interested in analyzing only those aspects from the excerpts which respond to his research pursuits.
References


Hamiduddin, M. Early Sufis: Doctrines. In Sharif (Ed.). *A History of Muslim Philosophy*, 1, 332-34.


APPENDIX NO.1

Pain and Grace (Schimmel, 2003. P.159-161)

Sur Asa belongs to the sweetest chapters of the Risalo; it is filled with mystical and poetical imagery, but does not rely as much on folk tradition as some other Surs, whereas Sur Ripa, a short song, describes in impressive images the longing of the lonely wife for her husband.

Sur Khahori is written in praise of Yogis who walk from the village of Ganji Takar near present-day Hyderabad to the sacred mountain Hinglaj (an ancient Shiva sanctuary in Balochistan) and suffer every possible discomfort. They are further described in detail in the long-winded chapters of Sur Ramakali, which constitutes for the historian of religion one of the most interesting parts of the Risalo (see pp.219ff). Inserted between the two songs in the praise of Yogis as ‘perfect men’ is Sur Barvo Sindhi, written to a lovely evening tune, which expresses the deep veneration of the poet for his beautiful and mysterious, powerful and mild, divine lord, utilizing, toward the end, again the theme of Sassui.

A topic which is not rarely found in the poetry of Sind and the Panjab is the spinning of cotton, one of the most important occupations of the women. This is the theme of Kapa’iti, which name points to traditional folk melodies sung by the women folk while spinning. Here, the connection between the spinning woman and the soul which is busy with the constant recollection of God is obvious; and the Quranic imagery of God as the merchant who buys man’s soul is extended to the idea that the cotton thread, e.g., the heart, has to be refined and prepared with utmost care so that the spinning soul will not be rejected by the merchant.

In Sur Purab, ‘East’ , the poet describes the feelings of the loving woman who sends out the crow to find out how her beloved is; the crow, kang, is the typical messenger bird in Sind, as was the pigeon in high Persian poetry, and its importance has often been underlined in Sindhi folk songs and mystical poetry. But out of this first touching verse Shah turns once more to the Yogis and warns them not to make false pretenses in yogidom. The theme of the soul-bird—of which the crow is a variation—is taken up in extenso in Sur Kara’il, the song of the swan who is admonished not to fly and dive with the other, unclean birds, but continue to feed on pearls.
In the following *Sur, Pirbhati*, ‘Early Morning’, man’s soul is seen as a wandering minstrel who is kindly treated by the rulers of Las Bela, the representative of Almighty Lord. *Sur Dahar* gives in its first chapter a fine description of the dried-up tree, a common sight in the valley of the ever shifting Indus and its tributaries, but also a sight which leads the poet to a praise of the Prophet’s kindness in the second part while the Sassui imagery is utilized toward the end. *Sur Bilawal* (I, II) contains a number of historical allusions to the powerful rulers of Sind who in the end appear to be symbols of Muhammad’s grace and munificence. A little joke about Shah Latif’s friend and servant forms the last chapter of this Sur; he, though ‘stinking’, ‘a glutton’, ‘ugly’,—to mention only a few of his epithets—becomes purified in the rose-water-like company of the master. *Sur Bilawal* is probably the most difficult one to appreciate for a non-Sindhi reader.
APPENDIX NO.2

*Pain and Grace* (Schimmel, 2003. P.176-178)

There is no end to the sighs of deserted women, of the outcries of lonely souls, in *Shah jo Risalo*. They feel the nails (mikh, mik) of love in their hearts which fix them to their beloved, and call out:

> If you should come once, remembering me, o beloved, I would spread under your feet my eyelashes, and lay my hair on the ground,

> O beloved, I shall spend all my life in seeking (BS I 6).

There is no end to true love, because there is no end to the beauty of the Beloved, as already *Dhu’n-Nun* and later Abu Hamid Ghazali had stated.

> His dream-image has intoxicated my mind (BS I 21).

> His beauty is alike to the green garment of the soil (Ripa II 7); when he walks out of his house earth and heaven are delighted, and the houris stand in silent admiration and confusion ‘in full etiquette’ (BS II 6, cf. *Hus. II wa’i*). One may detect here an allusion to the Prophetic tradition ‘Verily God is beautiful and loves beauty,’ a favorite hadith with the Sufis, which may also be intended when Marui, after months of imprisonment in Omar’s castle, complains that she has lost her beauty and dares not go back to Marus, who are so beautiful that only the lovely ones are acceptable in their presence (Mar. V 1-10): the soul sullied by dirt and dust of this world, has to undergo through purification before she is allowed to return into presence of eternally beautiful Lord.

> The topic of *khawab-i-ghaflat*, ‘sleep of negligence,’ is central in Shah’s poetry. Not only *Sassui* has to undergo punishment because of her sleep, the lonely wives in *Dahar III* and *Ripa II* likewise complain, or are scolded by the poet, that they have lost their husbands because they stretched out their feet in their beds.

> Had *Sassui* not slept comfortably, how would the Balochis have carried away her beloved? But the same warning can be applied to the seafaring merchants as well (Sar. III 20);
every moment of slumber can cause damage to the boat. And will there not be enough lonely nights in the graves? Why then? Spend the few nights of life in sleep instead of enjoying the friend’s sweet discourse (Dah. III 17)? This constant admonition to remain awake is derived from the classical Sufi tradition: the mystic is called to remain awake and to remember the Lord, by performing the nightly prayers or constant *dhikr*, as it was Sufi custom from the very beginning of Islamic mystical life. The nightly vigils were always considered a great boon for the lovers, for in these lonely hours they could continue spiritual conversations with the divine Beloved, dialogues, which cannot be properly translated into human words.

Is there any meaning in staying in one’s shabby hut or in the deserted village? No, the soul has to leave this world, and has to enter the *tariqa*, the Path, to perform the pilgrimage, as it has been described by so many mystical poets in East and West, be they Attar in his *Mantiq ut-tair*, or J. Bunyan in his *Pilgrim’s progress*. When Sassui bursts out into the words:

I will put fire in *Bhambhore!* (Hus.IV,wa’i),

she expects in fitting symbol her wish to forget completely her worldly attachments. *Bhambhore*, where the beloved had once appeared to her, is of no use without him: the world can serve, for a short while, as the place of Divine manifestations, but once the soul is deprived of the vision due to her own laziness and heedlessness, it is impossible to find the beloved in this place; one has to cut off all worldly relations and joys to enter the narrow road that leads into the wilderness. Only those who are completely naked, and do not carry any burden with them, can cross the mountains and reach *Kech* (Ma’ dh. II 8). Indeed, the major part of *Shah jo Risalo* consists of a praise of the path, and of the never ending travelling of the lovers. The Sindhi poet stands here in the line of *Attar’s* successors—similar to the birds in *Mantiq ut-tair*, Sassui crosses deserts, mountains and valleys:

To travel after *Punhun*, that is my happiness (Ma’ dh. III 1);
APPENDIX NO.3

Pain and Grace (Schimmel, 2003. P.182-184)

In Shah Latif’s poetry, however, this emphasis on suffering leads to most cruel descriptions of the fate of the lover, faithful to the tradition of Indo-Persian mystical and profane poetry. In Kalyan, the most purely ‘mystical’ song in the Risalo, the initiate is told to roast his flesh over the skewer (II 10). The knife with which the beloved cuts his throat should be blunt so that he feels the friend’s hand a bit longer (II 12)—an idea often repeated by the court poets of India during the 17th and 18th centuries, who indulged in descriptions of this kind, as remained very much alive even during the 19th century in Ghalib’s Urdu verse. The beloved kills poor Sassui ‘like a little goat’ (Kohy. IV 9), and her designation as qaribani, ‘the near one’, may well be intended as a pun on qaribani, ‘a sacrifice,’ for all lovers are sacrificed like animals slaughtered at the festival of pilgrimage. A very naturalistic feeling of importance of shedding blood in order to make divine Lord beloved happy permeates this poetry--: again, who would not think of Blut- und-Wunden poetry of the Christian Church, if one does not prefer to turn to sacrifices at Indian temples and shrines? Shah Latif therefore does not hesitate to describe how limbs and heads are being cooked in a kettle (Kal. II 26); one is reminded of Rumi’s verse that beloved is a butcher dealing in lover’s hearts and livers, not to mention the innumerable verses in Persian and Turkish poetry where the hearts and livers of wretched lovers become roast-meat (kabab).

The imagery of corporeal pain is particularly strong in the Sassui circle.

When the wild beasts eat my flesh,

then my bones go to the friends (Desi I 26)

She wishes that the crows of Kech, where her beloved dwells, may pluck and eat her flesh (Abri X wa’i), or else, that the dogs of Kech should eat her (Ma’dh.I 1), an image which leads the poet to the idea of the soul-dog. But the lover has other wishes, too, in order to suffer even more. In ecstatic longing the woman calls out:

I will take my heart out so that the crow eats it before the friend,
so that he says ‘Who is the sacrifice,’ qurbani? (Pur. I 12).

Many of these sighs of burning passion remind the reader immediately of the legends of Husain ibn Mansur al-Hallaj who said, when speaking of God ‘Kindness is from Him, but suffering is He Himself.’ Indeed, we may assume that the images of Hallaj, who had wandered through the Indus Valley in 905, has impressed the poets of this part of the Islamic world even more than elsewhere. His name and fame as the martyr of love was known all over the Muslim countries, particularly in the countries with the Persian tradition, where the word ‘Mansur’ has become a *cypher* for the claim of having attained union. Did he not ecstatically say: *Ana’l-haqq,* ‘I am the absolute Truth’? But this word (which was not, as legend has it, an enthusiastic cry but the quintessence of his thinking and feeling) made him also the model case of the lover who divulged the secret of love and therefore had to be punished. Shah Abdul Latif is only one of the numerous poets in Sind and the Panjab who have alluded to his saying and, even more, to his suffering: wherever in this poetry the gallows are mentioned, we can see the shadow of Hallaj, for whom the gallows were the final station on his way to the divine beloved. The gallows are, as Shah Latif says (*Kal. II* 6 *sequ.*) the bridal bed for the lover, the place where he can enjoy union with the beloved, as Sindhi folk poetry still sings in touching variations of the same theme; hence, the wayfarer is called to ‘climb on the gallows tree a hundred times a day.’ *Sassui,* the roaming lover, belongs to the same group of initiates who are asked to sacrifice themselves:

You will climb upon the trees, becoming food for the vultures—

*Sassui* has climbed on the gallows (*Ma’dh. VII* 11).

The arena of love (*mohabbata jo maidan*), one of Shah Latif’s favorite expressions, is the place where the seekers can prove their spiritual maturity:

In the arena of love do not think of head—

Climb on the beloved’s gallows that you may become healed;

Love is a dragon; those who have been devoured know that! (*Kal. II* 17, 15 *sequ.*).
APPENDIX NO.4


The topic of the sea, or river, with its whirlpools and sand banks forms also the center of next Sur, which bears the name of Sohni, ‘the Beautiful,’ ‘who died swimming.’ This is a tragic love story which reverts the classical motif of Hero and Leander: here, the heroine Sohni, unhappily married to a man whom she despises, swims every night to the island where her beloved Mehar grazes the buffalos. One night her sister-in-law replaces the jar, which she uses as sort of a swimming vest, by a vessel of unbaked clay, and she dies in the whirling waves. Shah begins the story in the most dramatic moment, when the young woman cries out for help in the cold river, attacked by crocodiles. The whole chapter is merely an extension of this dreadful and yet hoped for moment, when the vessel of her body breaks and she, faithful to her pre-eternal love-covenant with Mehar, will be forever united with the friend through death.

Sohni is one of the favorite folk tales in both Sind and the Panjab. But even more famous is the story which Shah Latif has made the subject of following five Surs and which is alluded to in many other verses of Risalo. It is the intriguing story of Sassui (Abri, ‘the weak one,’ Ma’dhuri, ‘the helpless one,’ Desi, ‘the native one,’ Kohyari, ‘the mountaineer,’ and Husaini, in the tragic melody of the dirges in Muharram). Sassui, a beautiful girl, was found by a washerman in Bhambhole, who adopted her. The fame of her beauty spread widely, and eventually even Punhun, the Baloch prince of Kech, decided to see her. At the end of numerous complicated adventures he stayed with Sassui, but his relatives came one night, made the couple drunk, and carried away Punhun on the speedy camels, while the young woman was fast asleep. Shah’s chapters deal with her search for the beloved: following the tracks of Punhun’s camels, she runs in despair through desert and forests where blue snakes and other frightening creatures live (Abri II 9):- snakes are here, as in traditional religious imagery, symbol of the devil from which, as Shah says elsewhere, the peacock-like Yogis keep aloof, or rather, kill it (Karayil II). Even the wild animals and trees and birds began to share her grief and cry with her. Eventually, she perishes on the road. This tragic story becomes for Shah the parable of the seeker on the mystical
path who undergoes all kinds of tribulations in the quest of God whom he will find, at the end of the road, in his own heart, and Sassui, roaming in the wilderness and talking to the beasts, becomes something like a feminine counterpart of the Arabic Majnun who, demented by his longing for Laila, is taken by the mystics of the Persian and Turkish tradition as the paragon of the true lover: he, too, experiences his unity with Laila when he is almost dying after years of yearning in the desert.
APPENDIX NO.5

_Pain and Grace_ (Schimmel, 2003. P.157-158)

The following _Sur_ has again a traditional story as its background, e.g., that of Lila _Chanesar_, which can be dated back to the time of Jam Chanesar, one of the Summa rulers in 14th century Sind. It has often been retold in Sindhi and Persian. Chanesar’s wife, the spoiled and pleasure loving Lila, is enticed by another woman by a necklace worth 900,000 rupees to allow the former owner of the necklace to spend one night with Chanesar. Furious that he had been ‘sold’, Chanesar divorces Lila, and she has to undergo a long process of purification until she is once more acceptable in her husband’s presence. Shah tells only her suffering and pining, and describes how the queen has to become a slave in order to be accepted by the Lord. Another folktale of similar character is that of _Mumal Rano_ which forms the basis of the following _Sur_; it originated in Lower Sind some time in the 15th century, and tells the adventures of _Mumal_, a beautiful and dangerous, courtesanlike woman, and her lover _Rano. Rano_, wrongly assuming that she has cheated him one night, leaves her alone. Eventually, after a long period of waiting, the loving woman is purified and united with the beloved, whose light she knows and recognizes everywhere.

_Sur Marui_ goes back to a historical event in the 14th century; the home of the heroine is located in Thar desert, where the mighty Omar of Omarkot kidnapped her. But the lovely maiden refuses to become the nobleman’s wife, as much as he tortures her, and eventually is sent back to her beloved village to which she had remained faithful even under the heaviest pressures.

As I have come here, thus I will go to them. (_Mar. VI I_)

_Sur Kamod_ relies upon another historical event. It is the famous tale of the Prince Jam Tamachi’s falling in love with the charming fishermaid _Nuri_ (15th century ). _Nuri_ makes the prince happy by her perfect surrender and obedience which causes him to raise her above all the other queens: she is the _nafs mutma’inna_, ‘the soul at peace’ (Sura 89/27), returning to her Lord. _Kamod_ is one of the most peaceful _Surs_, to be sung at the time of early afternoon, when one
dozes on a big Sindhi swinging bed. It is the only Sur that sings of fulfilled love and happiness, not of burning love and hopeless search.

The very short Sur Ghatu takes up once more the themes of the world or nafs under the image of dangerous, merciless sea with its monsters which swallow the fishermen, and the Sindhi reader will remember the story of brave Morirro who slayed the whale that had killed his six brothers.

The fishermen got deep into the whirlpool and killed the shark of desire.

Now their eyes beam with joy. (I 15)

But there is also much realism in the description of the dangerous current in the coastal area near Karachi between Clifton and Manorha.
APPENDIX NO.6


The term *shahid*, “witness,” is used for the beautiful beloved, For he is the true witness of the divine beauty (R 549). To look at him, to adore him from distance, may induce the Sufi to truly religious ecstasy, and to contemplate his face is worship. Wherever beauty is revealed, there out of necessity love must grow. Beauty and love are independent. And many Persian, Turkish, and Urdu Romances deal with the eternal story of *husn u-‘ishq*; “beauty and love. As a late Indo-Persian poet has put it:

Wherever there is an idol,

A Brahmin was created. (AP 258)

The beloved is usually called an “idol” in Persian poetry, worthy of worship, a sensual image of divine, which is hidden by its very brightness. Beauty would be meaningless if there were no love to contemplate it –we may think, once more, of the concept of God as the hidden treasure who wanted to be known: the treasure of Beauty (for “God is beautiful and loves beauty”) reveals itself in order to kindle love in the human heart.

The great masters of love mysticism like Ahmad Ghazali, Jalaluddin Rumi, and Fakhruddin ‘Iraqi, have regarded this worldly love as a pedagogical experience, a training in obedience toward God, since the human beloved, like God, has to be obeyed absolutely. “When the soul is educated by human love and has become firm-footed in the innermost secret of love, and heart is polished by the fire of love from satanic and base insinuations, then the ‘soul which commands evil’ becomes “peaceful” beneath the strokes of the violent wrath of love”(BA 203), says Baqli in his book on Love. Rumi compares it to the “wooden sword that the hero gives his child” (D27) so that the child may learn techniques of fighting.

Lover and beloved are unthinkable without each other-the Lover’s actions consist completely of *niyaz*, “asking and petitioning,” whereas the beloved is made of perfect *naz,*
coquetry”; beyond this contrast lies the unity in love. Beauty though a static concept, has no full meaning without admiration and love and Beloved needs the lover for his own perfection. The story of Mahmud and Ayaz is a typical expression of this kind of love and shows, at the same time, how the poets of Iran used historical facts to point out eternal truth. Mahmud of Ghazna, the warrior king of Afghanistan (d.1030), famous in political history as the conqueror of northwest India, becomes in literary tradition the model of the lover, because of his inclination toward his slave Ayaz. The complete surrender of the Turkish officer Ayaz, for whom only Mahmud exists, results in perfect love of the king, who becomes, in a wonderful transformation, the slave of his slave. Ayaz is the symbol of the loving soul. One day the Huma bird passed over Mahmud’s army, and everybody rushed to be touched by Huma’s shade, which, in Persian tradition, conveys kingdom. Only Ayaz went into Mahmud’s shade (U 176), for here was his true kingdom: he is like the faithful, who does not seek glory and power from anything created but only from his eternally rich, beloved Lord.

The other model of mystical love is Majnun, the hero of old Arabic tale, who lost his senses in his love of Laila. This woman, who was not even particularly beautiful, was for him paragon Of beauty, and thus, as interpreted by the Sufi poets, became the manifestation of divine beauty seen through the eyes of love.

It is in this world of intense spiritual passion that Persian poetry grew. When Ruzbihan Baqli holds that love of human being is the ladder toward the love of the Merciful (BA 183; B 571), he alludes to the classical Arabic saying that the metaphor is the bridge toward reality – hence, human love is generally called, in Persian tradition, ‘ishq-i majazi, “metaphorical love.” Jami sums it up this way: “Beholding in many souls the traits of Divine beauty and separating in each soul that which it has contracted in the world, the lover ascends to the highest beauty, to the love and knowledge of Divinity, by steps of this ladder of created souls.”
APPENDIX NO.7

Mystical Dimensions of Islam (Schimmel, 2006. P. 292-294)

The unsurpassable master of love and passion in the highest sense was, no doubt, Jalaluddin Rumi, whose work will be discussed later. For him, as for many of his predecessors and followers, love was the power innate in everything, working through everything and directing all things toward unification. Avicenna has expressed ideas of this kind in his Risala fi’l-ishq, and poets like the romantic Nizami had described the magnetic force of this love:

If the magnet were not loving, how could it attract the iron with such longing?

And if love were not there, the straw would not seek the amber.

In the great hymn on love in Khosrau Shirin, to which these lines belong, Nizami claims that “the heaven has no mihrab save love.” This cosmological role of love was emphasized by Rumi: love is, for him, like an ocean on which the skies are only foam, agitated like Zulaykha in her love for Joseph; the whirling movement of the skies is the result of the wave of love—if there were no love, the world would be frozen (M 5:3854-58).

If this heaven were not in love, then its breast

would have no purity,

and if the sun were not in love, in his beauty would be

no light,

and if earth and mountain were not lovers, grass would

not grow out of their breast.

It is only for the sake of lovers that the sky revolves and the spheres turn, not for the sake of the baker and the blacksmith, nor for the sake of magistrate and pharmacist (D 11:58).
More than any other poet, Rumi stresses the dynamic character of love—it makes the ocean boil like a kettle (M 5:2735), as he says repeatedly, and it is power that changes everything for the better, purifying it and quickening it:

From love bitterness became sweet, from love copper

Became gold,

from love the dregs became pure, from love the pains

became medicine,

from love the dead become alive, from love the king is

made a slave.

(M 2:1529—31)

For love turns the dead matter of bread into soul and then makes the perishable soul eternal (M 5:2014). It is poison, but:

Sweeter than this poison I did not see any drink,

Lovelier than this illness I did not see any health.

(M 6: 4599)

Love is fire, it burns the station of patience: ‘‘My patience died the night that love was born’’(M 6:4161). And the poor lover is in the hand of love ‘‘like the cat in the bag, one moment high, one moment low’’ (M 6:908).

Carried away by this love that manifests God’s beauty as well as His majesty—since it is fascinating and frightening, killing and reviving at the same time—the mystics have seen love as ‘‘a flame that burns everything save the Beloved’’ (N 408). The classical definition of love that leads to true tauhid, extinguishing and consuming everything that is other than God, is expressed here in poetical language that was taken over by almost all the Muslim poets writing in Persian,
Turkish or Urdu. The fire symbolism that abounds in the work of a nineteenth-century Urdu poet like Ghalib has its roots in this concept of absolute love.
APPENDIX NO.8


The imagery of the birds was elaborated more and more after *Attar’s Mantiq ut-tayr* became one of the favorite story books of Persian literature. Everyone who has read Persian poetry, if only in translation, knows of the nightingale who yearns for the rose—it is, in mystical language, the soul longing for eternal beauty, as Ruzbihan defined it. The nightingale infinitely repeats the praise of rose without tiring, tells of its longing, sings hymn from the Koran of the rose (i.e., its petals), suffers without complaint the stings of thorns. Iqbal has interpreted the song of the nightingale in the context of his philosophy of unfulfilled union and longing—only longing gives the soul bird the capacity to sing, inspiring it to create lovely melodies. Longing is the highest state the soul can reach, for it results in creativity, whereas union brings about silence and annihilation.

One of the birds described in *Mantiq ut-tayr* is the falcon, the white royal bird who longs to return to his master’s fist. The falcon, or white hawk, as beautifully described in *Attar’s Ushtur name*, was to become one of Rumi’s favorite symbols—he often spoke of the soul as falcon, exiled in the company of black crows, or as a nightingale surrounded by ravens, or as a gazelle in the donkey stable (M 5:33-38). And just as Attar invented a pun on the name of the Simurgh, Rumi used a pun on the word falcon, *baz*—the bird is called by this name because he longs to come back, *baz*, to his sultan’s breast. How touching is his imagery when he describes the noble bird, returning at the sound of the falcon’s drum from his earthly exile; he perches on his master’s forearm, rubbing his head on his breast: thus the once lost and bewildered soul returns, at peace, to the Lord (D 1 35). Every bird, every animal has its place in this wonderful cosmos of Attar and his followers in the mystical Path. *Sana’i* had invented the litany of the Birds. The dove constantly repeats *ku ku* because it is asking the way toward the beloved, repeating the question *ku ku,* “Where, where?” And the stork, *lak-lak, al-hamd lak,* “Thine is the kingdom, Thine is the order, Thine is the praise.” The duck symbolizes the human being, half bound to earth, half living in the ocean of God; and the crow is always connected with the ugly winter landscape of this worldly existence.
The camel becomes the symbol of the faithful person who fulfills, in perfect patience, the order of his master (M 4:3389); even the unclean dog can become a model for the Sufi since, keeping faithful company with the Seven Sleepers, he became purified and sanctified, just as the lower soul becomes elevated and purified in the company of saintly people.

One of the finest images in Persian poetry—used by Khaqani, Nizami and Attar in the late twelfth century, and then often by Rumi and his imitators—is that of the elephant who dreamed of India. The elephant, an animal invariably connected with India, may be captured and carried away from his homeland to foreign lands, but when he sees his home in a dream, he will break all his chains and run there. This is a perfect image of mystic’s soul, which, in the midst of worldly entanglements, is blessed with the vision of its eternal homeland and returns to primordial Hindustan, for “the ass does not dream of Hindustan at all!” (M 4:3067). As Kipling expressed it in his poem “The Captive’s Dream,” the elephant thinks:

I will remember what I was, I am sick of rope and chain.

I will revisit my lost loves, and playmates masterless.

Every flower in the garden becomes, for the mystic poets of the late twelfth century, a tongue to praise God; every leaf and petal is a book in which God’s wisdom can be read, if man will only look. God has put signs on the horizon and in man’s soul (Sura 41:53); man has only to look at them. The lily praises God, silently, with ten tongues; the violet sits modestly in its dark blue Sufi garb, its head on the “knee of meditation.” Red tulips with their dark scars in their “hearts” may grow out of the burned hearts of lovers, or they may remind the mystic of black-hearted hypocrites. The narcissus looks, with languid eyes, toward the creator or makes the lover think of the friend’s half-closed eyes, and the purple, curly hyacinth resembles the tresses of the beloved.
APPENDIX NO.9


The Punjab and Sind show close similarities in the types of mystical literature that flourished there. The more rustic, very idiomatic Panjabi and the complicated, musical Sindhi—both strong, expressive languages—were excellent media to express mystical feelings, though not mystical theories. The mystical works center around the endless yearning of the soul, burning love, longing for pain, which is very blessing of God. These themes were sung time and again in forms inherited from the Indian past-*dhoras,kafis*, way—not in the Persian form of *ghazal* in quantitative meters, but in Indian poetical forms that were closely connected with indigenous musical modes. The tunes were partly adapted from the Indian tradition, partly invented by mystical poets themselves on the basis of classical and folk music.

The old accusations against the dry-as-dust theologians, the *molla*, which form a standard motif of Persian and Turkish mystical and quasi-mystical poetry, were taken up again by the mystics in the northwest part of the subcontinent.

Reading and reading knowledge, the muftis give

Judgment,

but without love they have remained ignorant, Sir!

By reading knowledge the secret of God is not known,

only one word of love is efficient, Sir!

an eighteenth-century Panjabi poet sings. Such verses appealed particularly to the peasants and the illiterate, who understood that even they—though not learnt like the hairsplitting *mollas*—might attain a higher level of spiritual life through surrender in love.

The imagery in this poetry is generally taken from the daily life of the villagers, from gardening and planting. Though the verses of the first great Panjabi mystical poet, Sultan Bahu
(who got his surname because each line of his *Siharfī*, “Golden Alphabet,” ends with the exclamation *hu*, “He”) do nothing but develop ideas well known to earlier Sufis, his approach is worth mentioning as typical of the way rural mystics spread the ideas of Sufism.

The first verse of Sultan Bahu’s (d. 1691) poem goes:

Alif: Allah is like the jasmine plant which the preceptor

planted in my heart—o *Hu*!

By water and the gardener of negation and positive

statement it remained near the jugular vein

and everywhere—o *Hu*!

It spread fragrance inside when it approached the

time of blossoming—o *Hu*!

May the efficient preceptor live long, says Bahu,

Who planted this plant—o *Hu*!

These lines point to the recollection of the divine name, planted in the mystic’s heart by his *Pir*. The water of negation and affirmation, the *la* and *illa* of the profession of the faith in the *dhikr*, is combined with the allusion to Sura 50:16—“He is nearer to you than your jugular vein”—in the context of plant life. This verse is a fine example of the kind of Panjabi and Sindhi imagery that could easily be understood by everybody in the village.

In both provinces, a preference for the motif of spinning and weaving can be observed, a natural propensity in a cotton-growing country; the *dhikr* could therefore be compared to the act of spinning (the aptness of image is enhanced by the similarity of the humming sounds). Such “spinning” can turn the heart into fine, precious thread, which God will buy at Doomsday for a good price.

Both provinces have also produced hymns extolling the great masters of the mystical orders, particularly ‘Abdu’l-Qadir Gilani, whose glorious deeds are often celebrated. One of the first “geographical” poems in Sindhi was composed in his honor. His blessings are described as extending to a long series of cities and countries nicely enumerated in alliterative form. Allusions
to the fate of Mansur Hallaj are very common. Some of the mystical poets expressed their feelings of all-embracing unity with amazing audacity—the Sufi is no longer Arab, Hindu, Turk or Peshawari; eventually Hallaj and the judge who condemned him, the lover and the theologian, are seen as nothing but different manifestations of the one divine reality. Such verses have led a number of authors, particularly the Hindus who studied this aspect of Indo-Muslim religious life, to believe that here Indian advaita mysticism gained a complete victory over Islamic monotheism. The love for the sheikh and attempt at becoming annihilated in him, which is a peculiar feature of Sufi practices, has also been explained as the typical Hindu love for the guru.
APPENDIX NO.10

*Mystical Dimensions of Islam (Schimmel, 2006. P. 391-393)*

Some of the *surs* are related to folk ballads of the Indus valley, like those dealing with *Sassui Punhun, Sohni Mehanwal, ‘Umar Marui, and Lila Chanesar*. Others describe the mystical moods or the ideal lover in traditional terminology, like *Asa* and *Yaman Kalyan*. Still others sing of the camel, the symbol of the base faculties that become trained during the long journey toward the beloved, or of the seafarer’s wife waiting for her husband to return from Ceylon; of the dry tree in the desert, or of the wild grouse. Or the poet describes a group of *yogis* to whom he applies Koranic verses: their knees are like Mount Sinai, places of revelation; their faces shine in the divine light.

The last chapter (*Sur Ramakali*) is one of the most interesting parts of the *Risalo* in terms of mystical syncretism, but it should be read together with the praise of the Prophet in *Sur-Sarang*, or with the bitter laments for Husayn’s death in Kerbela in *Sur Kedaro*.

For the Sindhi, however, the favorite poems are those in which Shah ‘Abdu’l Latif relies upon folk tales. Everybody knew the contents of these tales, so that the poet did not need to dwell on the preliminaries; he could begin his poems with the most dramatic moment and then elaborate the feeling of the heroine and the different shades of the soul’s movements—hope, longing, fear, annihilation. Shah Latif translated into poetry the cries of *Sohni*, whose beloved Mehanwal grazes cattle on an island in the Indus and who slips away from her husband every night to swim across the river to meet Mehanwal, guided by the starlike eyes of the soft cows, though surrounded by alligators and all kinds of danger.

Finally, one night, Sohni’s sister-in-law discovers her adventures and replaces the baked jar that she uses as a kind of life vest with an unbaked vessel, so that the loving woman is drowned on her way.

And there is *Sassui*, a washerman’s daughter whose beauty attracts people from all parts of the country; even *Punhun*, the prince of *Kech* in Balochistan, falls in love with her and stays with her. His father sends some relatives to make the couple drunk and carry away *Punhun*.
Sassui, awakening at dawn from the “sleep of heedlessness,” finds herself alone. She decides to follow the caravan to Kech, but perishes in the desert after her voice, no longer the voice of a woman or a bird, has been transformed into the voice of love itself. Sassui is, in a certain sense, the feminine counterpart of Majnun in the Arabo-Persian tradition.

There is the shepherd girl Marui, kidnapped by the mighty ruler ‘Umar of Omarkot. Confined in his castle, she refuses to look after herself and tries to become as unattractive as possible, waiting everyday for a letter from her family, until the ruler sends her back to her homeland. Or there is Nuri, the fisher maid who wins the heart of Prince Tamachi by her obedience and sweetness—a story that can be historically located in the late fifteenth century, but that bears the distinct flavor of the Indian tale of “the maid with the fish-smell.” Nuri is the model of the obedient soul blessed by the love of the mighty Lord for constant devotion. And there is the Hindu tale of Sorathi, in which the king offers even his head to the minstrel who enthralls him with heartrending verses about divine love and surrender. Rumi in common with many tales of initiation through death sang: “What is beheading? Slaying the carnal soul in the Holy War” (M 3:252).

In the description of the female characters Shah ‘Abdu’l-Latif made every possible effort to depict even the slightest feelings and every change of mood. Sassui wanders through the desert, lonely and hopeless, and eventually discovers—with a verse translated from Rumi’s Mathnawi (M 1:174)—that

Not only the thirsty seek the water,
but the water seeks the thirsty as well.

Or, in the midst of her painful wandering, the poet suddenly turns to the “interior journey,” that journey by which she will find the lost beloved in her own heart—as Majnun did, no longer needing the “real” Laila because he had become one with her, or as Rumi discovered the lost Shamsuddin in himself. Sassui reaches the higher unitive stage by dying before she dies. Marui, in turn, is compared to the oyster, which would rather die from thirst than drink the salty water that surrounds it; one day it will open to receive the raindrop that will become a pearl in its womb.
The verses of the *Risalo* are often repetitious. Some critics have considered them rather unpolished in terms of classical (i.e., “Persianized”) metrics and vocabulary, or thought they were too full of jingling rhymes and puns (thus Trumpp, who thoroughly disliked Sufism). Shah ‘Abdu’l-Latif did use the inherited language of the Sufis; he himself acknowledged his indebtedness to *Rumi*, and his work cannot be fully appreciated without a thorough knowledge of different currents of Sufism in Iran and India. This is the point at which most of the Hindu interpreters, and even an excellent British scholar like Herbert Tower Sorley, have not done full justice to him.
APPENDIX NO.11

As through a Veil (Schimmel, 1982, 2001, P. 132-133)

The mystery of rejuvenating death also underlines the symbolism of the mystical dance: Rumi, whose poetry was born out of the whirling movement of the ecstatic dance, often saw Love as the great musician. Its breath fills the reedflute to make it sing of its eternal home, and its hand touches the lute of man’s body to make him speak of the beloved. The beginning of the Mathnawi is the most famous expression of this musical imagery, and it permeates his whole work. Rumi felt that love makes man dance, and not only man, but all creatures are called forth by Love’s music to stamp their feet, clap their hands, and whirl around. The love of the Sun (i.e., Shamsuddin) makes the atoms run in the enthusiastic dance from nonexistence into the wide fields of existence. The cosmic dance, thus inaugurated by Love, permeates everything: Gabriel and the uncouth demon ‘Ifrit dance in love, even though the object of this ugly demon’s love is only a she-demon, and the dust particles whirl around the gentle yet fierce central sun.

Dance expresses best the mystery of dynamic Love, and mystics in all religious traditions have seen in their visions the dance of the soul (Suso) or the cosmic dance. They saw the lilies dancing at Love’s music; “for dancing is Love’s proper exercise” (Davies) and they felt like participating in the agitated yet harmonious movement which permeates the cosmos. In this whirling movement the lover experiences the secret of fana and baqa: he is taken out of the gravitational field of the material world and annihilated in the spiritual sun’s magnetic field, gaining eternal life and participating in eternal movement. The symbolism of the white robes—garments of resurrection—which appear after the Mevlevi dervishes have cast off their black coats at the beginning of the whirling dance, points to this deep secret of transforming Love. It was translated into poetry by Rumi, and was beautifully rendered into German by Friedrich Ruckert in his ghazals (1819).
APPENDIX NO.12

As through a Veil (Schimmel, 1982, 2001, P.140-142)

It should not be overlooked, however, that there is one source from which one can derive this immediate divine knowledge, the wisdom of Love: that is Pir, the perfect mystical guide who has lost himself in the Prophet and in God and thus becomes the embodiment of love and superhuman wisdom:

Even if you read for a thousand years the black from the white,

It does not work unless you reach a perfect mystical guide.

The role of at least one branch of mystical folk poetry in cementing the tremendous influence of the Pir over his followers should never be forgotten. Like other mystical writers, Yunus Emre has highlighted time and again the importance of the mystical guide, the true “man of God,” whose “arena is higher than the Divine Throne” and “whose very glance transforms dust into jewels.”

This emphasis on the alif and on immediate knowledge as derived from the living “man of God” was, of course, consoling for the illiterate villagers who were thus assured that they too could reach perfection even though they had not studied theological works and were barely aware of more than the basic duties of a Muslim. Perhaps, they thought, there might even be some saints hidden among them, since God is jealous of his saints and conceals them under his domes, as the tradition says. The figure of the illiterate village saint, who may even be slightly mentally deranged and can speak to God without any restriction, plays an important role in this area of folk mysticism and its literary expression.

In order to facilitate the spread of mystical teachings among the masses, the poets resorted to an imagery taken from daily life and from the landscape that surrounded them. To be sure, a mystic like Rumi often used everyday imagery to express lofty thoughts and deep mystical experiences, but most Persian-writing mystics composed their verse in the precious style, which, though often developed out of generally used images, soon crystallized into more
and more abstract patterns. The folk poets followed the Koranic injunction to find God’s signs “in the earth and in yourselves—do you not see?” (Sura 51/21).

In their poetry age-old symbols came to life again. Yet, in the history of mystical folk poetry too the process of repetition and fossilization of forms, topics, and images is as visible as in high poetry.
One enjoys these poems best when one knows the country and realizes how true to life their imagery is. There occur other images in folk poetry as well, many of them taken from the world of women, who were even less educated than men but were, and still are in rural areas, the best transmitters of religious poetry, songs, and proverbs, and the depositaries of mystical lore. The poets saw the women spinning, and some of the earliest Urdu poems for mystical instruction are *charkhi nama*, spinning songs, which were popular, as Richard M. Eaton has shown, among the Bijapuri Sufis of the late sixteenth and seventeenth centuries. The act of spinning could be easily compared to the *dhikr*, for regular breathing is similar to spinning, and the humming sound of the wheel reminded the poets of the sound of the *dhikr*, repeated thousands of times with low voice. By such an act the heart will, like yarn, become the more precious the more finely and regularly it is “spun” and finally God will buy it for a high price (allusion to Sura 9/112). Is not every girl called to prepare her trousseau by constant spinning? And the woman-soul who neglects this duty will find herself naked at the day of the Feast when everyone else is wearing fine new garments.

As you take the cotton, you should do *dhikr-i jali*,

As you separate the cotton, you should do *dhikr-i qalbi*,

As you spool the thread you should do *dhikr-i ‘aini’*:

The threads of breath should be counted one by one, O sister,

sings a Bijapuri Sufi in a style typical of women’s song while the Panjabi folk poet calls the woman soul:

Quit playing, and spin the spinning wheel, young girl!

Hurry and make the bridal gear ready, young girl!
The droning spindle moans God, O God!

The trembling and shaking in fear of the Lord,

The spindle wind breathes like the sighs—

Seems, there is a heavy load ahead, young girl!

Similar are the *chakki nama*, which take inspiration from the most important occupation of the Indian housewife, the grinding of grain. Does not the straight handle of the grain mill look like an *alif*, the symbol of God?

The *chakki’s* handle resembles *alif*, which means Allah,

and the axle is Muhammad and is fixed there,

in this way the true seeker sees the relationship,

*Aḥ bismillah hu hu Allah!*

We put the grains in the *chakki*,

to which our hands are witnesses;

the *chakki* of the body is in order

when you follow the Divine Law . . .

That is how the *Bijapuri Sufis* used the image.

Agriculture offered fine analogies to human life. The Koranic verses about resurrection as prefigured in the awakening of the seemingly dead earth in spring when the soil all of a sudden becomes alive again (and, as Rumi would add, looks like Paradise in its green robes) were certainly in the poet’s minds when they mentioned sowing and reaping. They may have thought thus of the Prophetic tradition: “This world is the seedbed for the Otherworld.” But there are also realistic descriptions of fields and animals that thirst for rain, of clouds gathering and finally distributing *rahma*, mercy, to the world.
Such descriptions are then ingeniously connected with praise of the Prophet who too was sent *rahmatan lil’alamin*, “as mercy for the worlds” (Sura 21/107), to quicken the dead hearts.
APPENDIX NO.14

As through a Veil (Schimmel, 1982, 2001, P. 152-155)

_Hir Ranjha_ in Panjabi is the best known example of the complete spiritualization of a medieval folk tale in which the woman Hir is identified with the soul, and her beloved Ranjha with the longed-for Divine Beloved.

_Ranjha Ranjha kar di nihn men_

_Ape Ranjha hui—_

Repeating Ranjha, Ranjha in my mind,

I myself have become Ranjha, Ranjha in my mind,

I myself have become Ranjha.

Allusions to this theme are found as early as the sixteenth century in the Panjabi verse of Madho Lal Husain, the ecstatic mystic of the Qadiri order who is buried together with his Hindu beloved in a modest tomb near the Shalimar gardens in Lahore. The romance of Hir Ranjha, elaborated in more than a hundred versions in Panjabi, Urdu, Sindhi, and Persian, was given its final form in the late eighteenth century by Warith Shah. It is his verse which is sung, time and again, wherever Panjabis meet.

In Sind, the range of folk tales utilized for mystical purposes is even wider. Early allusions to these tales appear, however veiled, in Qadi Qadan’s verse in the first half of the sixteenth century. They become more obvious in Shah ‘Abdul Karim of Bulrri’s short verses, and reach full bloom in the eighteenth century. In his poetry the woman soul appears in various guises. Since the original tales were known to everyone, he usually begins his poetical renderings with the most dramatic moment in order to describe, with remarkable psychological insight, the moods of the soul on its way to the beloved. Among these “woman-soul” is Sohni, who swims every night through the Indus to meet her beloved on an island, until the jar which she uses as a
kind of life-vest is shattered and she is drowned. She thus reaches eternal union with the beloved to whom she had promised faithful love at the day of primordial covenant. She does not fear the bloodthirsty crocodiles and shark nor the whirlpools because the love does not care about the obstacles on his way toward the beloved.

Her counterpart Sassui, who follows her beloved Punhun through burning deserts and over terrifying hills, is not scared by blue serpents and lions. Sassui has lost Punhun because she fell asleep. During the “sleep of heedlessness”—a major sin for the Sufi—her friend was carried away. In despair she runs after him until, though she can’t catch up with swift-footed camels of his caravan, she discovers that he lives in her (as Shams lived in Maulana Rumi). Finally, she is completely transformed into Love, her voice no longer that of a woman but of Love itself. Sassui is the perfect embodiment of all those qualities which were expected from someone who enters the difficult mystical path.

Marui, another poetical character, is the ideal soul. Captured from her native village by powerful ‘Omar of Omarkot, she resists all temptation and neglects her outward appearance to discourage his attempts at seducing her. Her heart is always with her friends—for the soul should remain unstained by the blandishments of this colorful world and seek only its eternal home and primordial beloved.

Nuri, another character, was a historical figure, the consort of the Sindhi ruler Jam Tamachi in the fifteenth century. She has reached the lofty stage of the nafs mutma’inna because, though a simple fishermaid, she is devoted to the beloved king in absolute and unquestioning obedience.

Although these stories have their roots or parallels in Indian folk tales they perfectly illustrate the mystical ideal of complete devotion, of the primordial love between God and the soul and of suffering for the sake of Love. The soul assumes here the virahini quality of the Hindu tradition; therefore the poetical genre of barahmasa often contains allusions to the heroines of these tales or is recited by the poet, who then assumes the character of Sassui, Sohni, or Marui. Bengali Sufi poetry has utilized the imagery of Krishna-Radha cycle in a similar way. Sindhi poet compares the silent suffering of the loving soul to the state of a potter’s kiln, which
is not supposed to show any flames but is supposed to keep the fire inside. Bengali folk singers have the longing woman speak in similar images.

One who has loved without weighing consequences

Has subjected himself to a constant anguish

Consuming him slowly, like a fire fed with rice husk

And cow-dung. I did not know before—

I have made a pen of my fingers

And ink of my tears

And parchment of my heart which I send to my beloved.

Alas, I had not known it before!
Folk poetry, as we mentioned, developed at a time when the mystical orders and fraternities were firmly consolidated, and therefore the role of the Pir in this poetry is highly important. In fact, mystical verse in the popular languages was largely composed by members of the fraternities for missionary purposes, and thus a special genre developed which centers around the veneration of the founder of the order or the patron saint. Among the founder figures, ‘Abdul Qadir Gilani is certainly the most popular saint, and he was extolled everywhere from West Africa and Turkey to India and Indonesia.

There is no end to his miracles. It was he who, according to a Balochi folk tradition, approached the Prophet during his heavenly journey when he drew close to the Divine Presence, and while Gabriel had to recede ‘Abdul Qadir offered the Prophet his neck to step on when descending from his heavenly mount Buraq. Gratefully, the Prophet made ‘Abdul Qadir's foot stand on the neck of every other saint. Turkish poets regarded themselves as “the honey of his bees, the rose of his garden, and the nightingale of his meadow.” They told how the saint, standing on one leg, used to recite whole Koran in one night, while the Panjabi folk singer praised him as “the gardener of the garden of Truth.” Sindhi poets saw his Baraka extending over the whole inhabited world. The first geographical poem in Sindhi, which enumerates dozens of cities and countries as ‘Abdul Qadir’s domain, was written in the early eighteenth century in his praise. It is possible that the Indian Sufi practice of assigning to each saint, and he in turn to his khalifa, a spiritual territory, wilayat, has prompted the poet to claim that ‘Abdul Qadir’s territory is all-comprehensive.

There are many songs in honor of other saints too, because each community has hymns in praise of the mystical guide at whose shrine the qawwali gather. Here was and still is the center of popular religious life. Sometimes such poems are merely rhymed accounts of the spiritual or family lineage (silsila, shajara) of the Pir, or they contain blessings over the saint and his family, repeating dozens of times in sweet tunes and enrapturing rhythms a formula like as-salamu ‘alaika ya Bandanawaz, assalamu ‘alaik mere Gesudaraz.