EXTREMISM—TERRORISM IN THE NAME OF ISLAM IN PAKISTAN: CAUSES & COUNTERSTRATEGY

Submitted by:
RAZA RAHMAN KHAN QAZI
PhD SCHOLAR

DEPARTMENT OF INTERNATIONAL RELATIONS
UNIVERSITY OF PESHAWAR
(DECEMBER 2012)
EXTREMISM–TERRORISM IN THE NAME OF ISLAM IN PAKISTAN: CAUSES & COUNTERSTRATEGY

Submitted BY
RAZA RAHMAN KHAN QAZI
PhD SCHOLAR

Supervised By

PROF. DR. IJAZ KHAN

A dissertation submitted to the
DEPARTMENT OF INTERNATIONAL RELATIONS
UNIVERSITY OF PESHAWAR, PESHAWAR

In partial fulfillment of the requirements for the

DEGREE OF DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

IN
International Relations

December 2012
DECLARATION

I hereby declare that this dissertation is the outcome of my individual research and it has not been submitted to any other university for the grant of a degree.

Raza Rahman Khan Qazi
APPROVAL CERTIFICATE

Pakhtuns and the War on Terror: A Cultural Perspective

Dissertation Presented

By

RAZA RAHMAN KHAN QAZI

To the Department of International Relations
University of Peshawar

In Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Degree of Ph.D. in International Relations

December 2012

We, the undersigned have examined the thesis entitled “Extremism-Terrorism in the Name of Islam in Pakistan: Causes & Counterstrategy” written by Raza Rahman Khan Qazi, a Ph.D. Scholar at the Department of International Relations, University of Peshawar and do hereby approve it for the award of Ph.D. Degree.

APPROVED BY:

Supervisor: ___________________________________
PROF. DR. IJAZ KHAN
Professor Department of International Relations
University of Peshawar

External Examiner: ..........................................................

Dean: __________________________________________
PROF. DR. NAEEM-UR-REHMAN KHATTAK
Faculty of Social sciences
University of Peshawar

Chairman: _________________________________________
PROF. DR. ADNAN SARWAR KHAN
Department of International Relations
University of Peshawar
INTRODUCTION

The World in the post Cold War period and particularly since the turn of the 21st Century has been experiencing peculiar multidimensional problems that have seriously threatened human and state security. Of these problems religious extremism and terrorism specifically after the September 9, 2001 attacks in the United States (US) have profoundly endangered international peace, security and stability. The twin phenomena of extremism-terrorism have not only actually and potentially endangered international and regional security in the South Asian and Afghanistan-Pakistan region but have also imperiled the solidarity and survivability of many states. Extremism-terrorism are as old as history but their manifestations in the 21st Century particularly after the watershed events of 9/11 in the US are unique in many respects. The US blamed the 9/11 incidents on global terrorist network\(^1\)—Al Qaeda—which got corroborated when the Al Qaeda founder, Osama bin Laden and other leaders accepted responsibility for the attacks. The subsequent arrest of Khalid Sheikh Muhammad, the alleged mastermind of the 9/11 attacks and other Al Qaeda leaders and their admission for carrying out the attacks, reaffirmed the group’s involvement. As the Al Qaeda leadership including Osama and Khalid Sheikh were residing in Taliban militia-ruled Afghanistan, whose territory was also used for planning the attacks, Washington demanded of Kabul to handover the Al Qaeda leadership. Mullah Omar-led Taliban refused unless the US provided solid ‘evidence’ of Al Qaeda’s involvement. In retaliation the US and North Atlantic Treaty Organization (NATO) spearheading an international coalition force (ISAF)\(^2\) invaded and occupied Afghanistan by overthrowing the Taliban regime. On the other hand the Taliban started a guerrilla war to liberate Afghanistan from foreign occupation but in the meanwhile Al Qaeda leadership after losing its sanctuaries in Afghanistan shifted to Pakistan. This can be gauged from the arrest of Khalid Sheikh in Rawalpindi (Rashid, 2008:225), Abu Zubaydah in Lahore on March 28, 2002 apart from many others commanders from time to time in different areas of Pakistan. In 2002 President G. Bush administration

---

\(^1\)Al Qaeda claims to be an international Jihadist organization and many Muslims also consider the group fighting for an Islamic cause

\(^2\) The international forces had got a mandate for operation in Afghanistan.
claimed that out of the 2700 suspected Al Qaeda member nabbed in 60 countries 500 had been arrested in Pakistan. (Rashid, 2008:225)

Pakistan’s case in the situation that emerged after the 9/11 incidents has been critically important. Pakistani strategists particularly former interior minister retired Major General Naseerullah Babar are widely-believed to have nurtured Afghan Taliban. The aim was to make Taliban Strategic Assets to attain the objectives of Islamabad’s overall Afghan policy of making Afghanistan its Strategic Backyard and to use its territory against arch-rival India. Islamabad has also been allegedly fuelling the Kashmir insurgency in India. Pakistan based so-called Islamist militant groups are believed to have been anchoring the Kashmir insurgency (1989-2009) since the outset while it also helped Kashmiri insurgent groups to launch terrorist attacks inside India. A number of Kashmiri militant groups had their training and planning camps in Taliban-ruled Afghanistan and in this regard they had the support of Pakistan military-intelligence establishment. Through such a strategy Islamabad deflected the criticism from Delhi and the international community of hosting anti-India insurgents on its soil. As the international coalition forces occupied Afghanistan it meant an end to the Strategic Depth for Islamabad in Afghanistan, which it had under the Taliban. Simultaneously Pakistan apprehended that dislodging of the Taliban regime would result in the return of an anti-Pakistan government in Afghanistan. Thus it decided to clandestinely back Afghan Taliban and all those groups that had started a guerrilla war against the foreign forces. This was despite of the fact that Pakistan under General Pervez Musharraf (1999-2008) officially allied itself with the US in its Global War on Terror (GWoT) against the Al Qaeda and the Afghan Taliban after the 9/11 incidents. However, while hosting and staging Afghan Taliban, Al Qaeda and their other foreign affiliates for the Afghan war theatre, Islamabad could not manage deliberately or inadvertently the coming of a large number of alien Muslim militants from across the World on its territory. Empirically Islamabad turned a blind eye to the descending of thousands of foreign militants on Pakistan to fight against the international coalition forces in Afghanistan. Otherwise for Pakistan, having the seventh largest well-trained and well–equipped militarily in the World, manning and managing its borders and mainland should not have been a difficult task. As most of these foreign militants wanted and were let to have their sanctuaries in the border regions most of them went to the
strategically-located Federally Administered Tribal Areas (FATA), which make most of Pakistan’s border with Afghanistan.

In the meanwhile Islamabad-backed Kashmiri insurgent groups could not achieved their mandated task of compelling India to the negotiating table for solving the Kashmir dispute through their militant attacks. In frustration these groups started attacking India’s mainland, which put irresistible diplomatic pressure on Pakistan. Therefore, under duress Islamabad had to shift the so-called Kashmiri Mujahideen groups to the FATA also, so that to cool down things on its border with India and to reinforce the anti-US-NATO insurgency in Afghanistan. The Jihad against the Western-dominated foreign forces in Afghanistan also attracted a large number of Pakistani youths to join the resistance. This first resulted in the emergence of disparate Pakistani Taliban groups in different parts of the FATA and the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KP) province seemingly with some help from the state agencies and afterwards in the formation of the umbrella organization of the Tehreek-e-Taliban Pakistan (TTP) or the Pakistani Taliban Movement in December 2007. Strangely the TTP after a few months of its emergence turned its guns at Pakistan by shunning its basic aim of fighting the international coalition forces in Afghanistan. Since 2007 the TTP has spearheaded the unprecedented wave of terrorist attacks inside Pakistan, which has so far claimed the lives of more than 40,000 Pakistanis besides inflicting financial damages of around $70 billion dollars on the country.

The rise of extremist and terrorist groups operating in the name of Islam in Pakistan has not happened out of nowhere rather their emergence has a historical context. This study finds that the terrorist groups, operating in the name of Islam in Pakistan and out of the country, have had emerged largely as the result of the processes and forces of radicalization of society spanning several decades. This radicalization has largely been the consequence of official sponsorship and mass social engineering carried out by the state. It is important to note that not only the Afghan Taliban got their education and military training inside Pakistan and was helped by the country’s military-intelligence establishment to emerge as a fighting machine but also the Al Qaeda also emerged in Pakistani city of Peshawar in 1989. As Pakistan came into existence in the name of Islam because the founding fathers wanted to separate the Muslim-dominated regions from Hindu-dominated parts of the Indian subcontinent they had to make Islam as the base to justify
the struggle for the creation of an entirely new nation-state. Although all the leading Islamic parties of India—Jamiat-e-Ulema-e-Hind, Jamaat-e-Islami, Khaksar Tehreek and Anjuman-e-Ahrar-ul-Islam—among others opposed the demand for Pakistan spearheaded by the largely secular All India Muslim League (Ziring, 1997) but once Pakistan came into existence these groups started a vociferous demand for Islamization of the state and society. The necessity of the use of Islamic slogan was felt very much like in the pre-independence period. Because Pakistan comprised of different ethno-linguistic groups while dominated and controlled by only one of these groups—the Punjabis—the nation-building in the multiethnic and multicultural state could only be carried out on the basis of the ideology of Islam, which crosscuts ethnic and linguistic divides. Consequently, since the creation of Pakistan the ruling elite of Pakistan constituted of the landed gentry and the civil and military bureaucracy has excessively and continuously employed mass-scale propaganda to transform Pakistan into an Islamic welfare state. However, the ruling elite in earnest has never wanted the country to be an Islamic welfare state lest diluting their own power base. In order to make this propaganda effective the ruling elite started using the Muslim clergy or the mullahs. In the process the clerical forces got over-strengthened than their functional role in the society. Sensing the Pakistanis urged for an Islamic state and system, which they generally perceived to be good governance and to have easy access to justice, deep and intimate and the ruling elite reluctance to yield to the demand, the clerical groups and individuals started to manipulate the situation for cultivating their own economic and political power base to ultimately supplant the traditional ruling elite. As members of the ruling elite have had to legitimize their undemocratic hold on power they have been putting pseudo emphasis on forming an Islamist personality of the state and for themselves. In this regard to convince the masses of the necessity of the ruling elite continued rule the latter has always lent ostensible support to Political Islamist, Islamic Revivalist and Pan-Islamist movements across the World whether it was Akhwan-ul-Muslimeen (Islamic Brotherhood) or the Al Qaeda. This also has a reverse psychological impact in the shape of radicalizing the society, the state and its administration.

At the time of the commencement of this study in 2007 it argued that the extremist and terrorist groups and individuals operating in the name of Islam posed existential threat to the very survivability of the state. This has proven substantially as the wave of extremism and terrorism in Pakistan has claimed 40,000 lives since 2007 which is more than the number of deaths the
country faced in its three wars with India of 1948, 1965 and 1971. Those who killed in these terrorist attacks included the most popular political leader Benazir Bhutto, a governor, ministers, a military general, parliamentarians, academics, journalists. Apart from that the whole FATA region comprising around 32,000 square kilometers fell to the various Pakistani Taliban groups particularly the TTP. To defeat the insurgents the country in 2004 for the first time had to deploy army regulars in the FATA. By the end of 2012 the number of security forces in the FATA had reached 147,000 troops while before 2004 there was not a single regular Army soldier deployed there. However, the threat of insurgents and their cross border activities in Afghanistan become so big a challenge that despite of deploying several divisions of regular Army personnel and extensive use of air force for years, the insurgents could not be defeated.

In addition to the FATA the TTP also occupied Swat—an entire district of the KP province—for months. The insurgents had only to be defeated in a full-fledged military offensive but not before displacement of estimated 2.5 to three million people, constituting nearly the entire population of Swat and the surrounding areas, to other districts.

As militants from Kashmir and the Punjab went in a large number to the FATA there they along with local Pakhtoon Taliban came under the globalist and stateless Jihadist agenda of the Al Qaeda and its profoundly fundamentalist doctrine of Takfirism. This has been instrumental in turning these militants against Pakistan and its agenda of using them for purely statist goals. Because Pakistan nurtured militants did not have any solid Islamic agenda it had to come under the influence of Al Qaeda’s globalist agenda. In the meanwhile the terrorist and extremist threat operating in the name of Islam has become so huge that the military high command, which historically nurtured these militant groups to achieve its dictated foreign policy goals of wrenching away Kashmir from India through a proxy guerrilla war and making Afghanistan a Strategic Backyard of Pakistan, had to declare that the Pakistan faced the biggest threat not from without but from within from the religious extremist groups.

This study was initiated as a policy research to understand what have been the causes of religious extremism and terrorism in Pakistan with the aim to devise a comprehensive and viable counterstrategy. Generally factors like poverty and unemployment among youths; reaction to the
capitalist controlled Word economy and resources; the formation of thousands of militants madrassas in Pakistan during the Soviet-Afghan War; foreign interference in Pakistan from the US, Saudi Arabia or India; and the pseudo Islamization policies of General Ziaul Haq are cited as the root-causes of religious extremism and terrorism in Pakistan. However, this study contended that the generally-cited causes of extremism and terrorism in the name of Islam in Pakistan have all contributed to the rise of religious extremism in Pakistan but they have never been the root-causes of the phenomenon per se. Instead the central hypothesis of the study was that basically the political-constitutional-administrative vacuum termed in short political vacuum in the universe of this study, has been the main reason for the rise and proliferation of religious extremism and terrorism in Pakistan. This hypothesis has proven.

The study has the following breakdown:

CHAPTER 1: THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK: LIBERALISM & PHENOMENA OF RELIGIOUS EXTREMISM-TERRORISM IN PAKISTAN

In the first chapter the central concepts of the theory of liberalism have been discussed. Then in the context of every liberal precept the historical analysis of social, political and economic situation in Pakistan has been done. The aim was to show the illiberal and undemocratic nature of Pakistan state, society and political-economy. The contents of the chapter demonstrate that the non-evolution of a liberal society, culture and political system and the dominance of the state and society by the unrepresentative ruling elite, have given rise to the phenomena of religious extremism and terrorism in Pakistan. The chapter also contends that only through the promotion of liberal ideals extremism and terrorism could be effectively countered.

CHAPTER 2: MEANING OF RELIGIOUS EXTREMISM IN PAKISTAN

3 The three elements of political vacuum could be in any sequence because historically political vacuum led to constitutional vacuum and constitutional vacuum to political vacuum; whereas, administrative vacuum or lack of the state writ particularly due to lack of appropriate authorities and institutions, created and enlarged political and constitutional vacuum.
The chapter argues that meanings of extremism and terrorism vary from society to society and country to country thus there can be no uniform meanings of the concepts. Therefore, extremism and terrorism in each country must be studied within its social and political context as this is the most valid and reliable way of analyzing the twin phenomena. The chapter finds that fundamentalism and terrorism perpetrated in the name of Islam in Pakistan have peculiar meanings whereas most of the extremist and terrorist groups do not have any real Political Islamist or Islamic Revivalist aims their claims notwithstanding.

CHAPTER 3: RISE & PERVASION OF RELIGIOUS EXTREMISM IN PAKISTAN

The chapter is based on the factual history of events, incidents, policies and processes starting from the pre-independent history of Pakistan that have contributed to the radicalization of Pakistani state and society. The chapter argues that it has been basically the use of Islamic slogan as propaganda by the country’s founding fathers to rally public support for Pakistan, which cultivated among the masses deep urge for having Islamic system and institutions of governance in the hope that it would ensure good governance, meritocracy and exquisite service delivery to them. The chapter analyzes that after the formation of Pakistan the ruling elite for the purposes of perpetuating their stranglehold over the state and society, to legitimize their authority and to provide a rallying ground for nation building, excessively used the name of Islam. To achieve the aims the ruling elite resorted to use the Muslim clerical groups despite of the fact that most of their associations and parties opposed the demand for Pakistan by the AIML. As the otherwise socially, economically and politically marginalized religious community saw the large-scale desire among the people for having Islamist structure of governance and the ruling elite reluctance to allow enforcement of Shariah the former saw to manipulate the situation for its vested interest of cultivating its own economic and political base to ultimately replace the ruling elite. The chapter also throws detailed light on the circumstances in which main Pakistani extremist and terrorist groups emerged.

CHAPTER 4: FROM EXTREMISM TO TERRORISM: TRANSFORMING AIMS AND TACTICS OF RELIGIOUS TERRORIST GROUPS
This chapter analyzes that why several religious extremist groups resorted to terrorism like the TNSM and why certain purely terrorist outfits emerged like the TTP. It finds that largely the extensive radicalism in the name of Islam in Pakistan society preceded the wave of terrorism also justified in the name of religion. The chapter links the post 2007 unprecedented rise in terrorism phenomenon to the findings of the studies carried out by researchers, scholars of terrorism studies in other countries. It finds that the formerly extremist groups mutated into terrorist organizations due to their failure to bring about an Islamic revolution, they had been promising their members and Pakistanis at large since long and to capture the state power through political and peaceful struggle. Moreover, the chapter finds that the mainstream religious parties also started supporting terrorist organizations because of their failure to get a fair amount of public votes in various elections. These parties support to terrorist groups has been in the hope that the latter could destroy the existing state dispensation and the political system by large-scale attacks and leave the vacuum thus created to be filled by the members the clerical parties. Whereas, the chapter also finds that the emergence of downright terrorist groups in Pakistan was largely motivated by the feeling among their founders regarding futility of political and peaceful struggle for the enforcement of Shariah.

CHAPTER 5: CAUSES OF EXTREMISM-TERRORISM IN PAKISTAN

This chapter documents various factors and causes for the rise of the twin phenomena of religious extremism and terrorism. The causes have been explained in the descending order of importance. These range from ideological causes to economic besides certain cultural and educational factors. The chapter includes a comprehensive review of theories and causes pointed at by terrorism experts and then analyzing the factors in the context of Pakistan. The chapter finds that all the general or previously discovered causes of poverty, unemployment, madrassas, cultural and physical backwardness, have only been contributing causes instead of being the underlying causes of extremism and terrorism in the name of Islam. Instead it establishes that the chief cause of the twin phenomena in Pakistan has been the prevalence creation and existence of a large constitutional-legal-administrative vacuum.
CHAPTER 6: ROLE OF POLITICAL VACUUM IN RISE OF EXTREMISM-TERRORISM IN PAKISTAN:

This chapter analyzes the meaning of political vacuum, the dynamics of the rise and proliferation of political vacuum in the country and the role political void has had played in the rise of religious extremism and terrorism in Pakistan. It also links historical events, policies, trends and processes, which aggravated the political vacuum in the country with the construct of religious extremism and terrorism.

CHAPTER 7: CONCLUSION/ COUNTER-EXTREMISM & COUNTERTERRORISM POLICY OF PAKISTAN

The final chapter apart from concluding the dissertation documents the foundations of a comprehensive and viable counter-extremism and counter-terrorism policy for Pakistan. The policy foundations suggested are in light of the findings of the study. It argues that if Pakistan’s military-intelligence establishment could adopt such policies, which immensely radicalized Pakistani society and led to the formation of religious terrorist groups, likewise a reverse process is possible if the military-intelligence leadership and personnel could be convinced to shun the policy of nurturing extremists and terrorists as it has inflicted irreparable damage on the state and society and would cause further damage if not reversed. The chapter suggests that the convincing and engagement of the country powers-that-be has to be initiated and anchored by the civil society including the political parties, media, and academia. However, in order to achieve the aim these organizations and institutions ought to build their own capacity.

LITERATURE REVIEW:

Following are some of the many books which have been consulted and cited for the study.

Abdul Sattar (2007): A Concise History. As the author remained Pakistan’ top diplomat the book documents his personal insight into the formulation and execution of the country’s foreign policy from its inception in 1947 to the post 9/11 era. Sattar in his book examines the strategic
compulsions that have traditionally had driven decision-making in Pakistan in the realm of national security and foreign policy.

**Ahmed Rashid (2009):** The book is basically regarding the phenomenon of extremism-terrorism in Pakistan, Afghanistan and Central Asia. It describes how the military in Pakistan and its affiliated intelligence agencies created different militant Islamist groups to wage a proxy war in Afghanistan and India. Rashid also describes the events and factors that have provided the Al-Qaeda and the Afghan Taliban to find a new base in Pakistan.

**Akbar S. Ahmed (1976):** The book describes the Pakhtoon national character. He contends that unlike common understanding the Pakhtoon is equally driven by spiritual and temporal interests. He demonstrates although Pakhtoon tribal code may be outmoded but it has its relevance and value within the relative culture which outsiders cannot understand.

**Ayesha Jalal (1999):** The book describes the authoritarian and non-democratic basis of Pakistan society and the building of the state structure on these foundations. The author argues that authoritarianism in Pakistan’s state structure is embedded in the social processes and dynamics while the state failed to develop itself on the basis of liberal foundations. It also demonstrates that the over-centralization of Pakistan since the very beginning was the result of authoritarianism.

**Farhat Taj (2009):** The author argues that the statelessness of FATA is compatible with the aims and objectives of the Al Qaeda and the Pakistani Taliban. She describes that as Pakhtoon society is based on structural violence therefore the Al Qaeda and Pakistani Taliban have used this to their utter advantage.

**Fazl Rahim Marwat; Pervez Khan (2005):** The central argument of the book is that the strength of religious parties and organizations in Pakistan has been directly linked to important and unfolding events and developments in Afghanistan and the region. The authors build their argument by linking it with the 1979 Saur Revolution in Afghanistan followed by the Soviet occupation of Afghanistan, Islamic Revolution in Iran, Zia’s Islamization, the fall of the former USSR, the prolonged Afghan Civil War and the rise of the Taliban in Afghanistan.
**Hans J. Morgenthau (1955) & Kenneth Waltz (1981):** The book which is considered as bible of international politics describes the struggle for power in both the domestic and international arena. It also contends that all politics is basically a struggle for power. The authors document the key purposes of states to struggle for power. It also provides the basis of a realist-rational basis of policymaking and how such policy could be effectively pursued.

**Hassan Abbas (2005):** The author analyses the dynamics of the rise of religious extremism in Pakistan and establishes its connections to the Pakistani army policies and fluctuating US-Pakistan relationship. In addition to that it provides detailed profiles of the leading Pakistani *Jihadist* groups with details of their origins, development and strength.

**Hassan Askari Rizvi (2000):** The book tracks the origin of domination of politics by the country’s military. It shows that it has been due to the failure of the politicians in the initial phase of Pakistan which provided an opportunity to the military to come and have sway in the country.

**Ijaz Khan (2011):** The book is basically regarding the process and procedure of foreign policy making in Pakistan. It contends that it deals with the question “how” policy is made in Pakistan. The author in the book tries to divulge how foreign policy is formulated in Pakistan and for doing so makes the audience understand the ‘Strategic Culture’ of Pakistan. The book explains the various elements of Pakistan ‘Strategic Culture’, which includes primarily India, the source of security threats; Islam, the basis for Pakistan existence and a useful protection; United States, Peoples Republic of China and Saudi Arabia, the states on whose right side Pakistan must always be.

**Lawrence Ziring (2003):** The author gives a precise and lucid political history of Pakistan and on the basis of historical analysis he forecasts the future of Pakistan and the likely events and incidents to take place. He describes that how Pakistan became an important factor in the US policy of ‘Containment of Communism’ and ‘Encirclement of the Soviet Union’ and was forced into the spotlight by the Global War on Terror.

**M. Amir Rana (2007):** The book is basically a profile analysis of several militant so-called *Jihadist* organizations of Pakistan. The author has documented that how various militants groups
emerged in Pakistan and how they were trained, financed and used by Pakistani military
decision-makers in Kashmir and Afghanistan. The book also points that how many of the
militants got angry with the state and declared a war on it.

Rizwan Hassan (2005): The author examines the role of Pakistan in facilitating the growth of
Islamic militancy in Afghanistan. He also focuses that Zia regime strengthened the religious and
ethnic bonds between Sunni Islamists in Pakistan and Afghanistan and thus making Pakistan the
leading external power in post-Cold War Afghan politics.

Stephen P. Cohen (2006): The book gives a well-articulated view of Pakistan’s political history-
--from its origin till the military rule of General Musharraf---that has experienced uneven
economic growth, political chaos, sectarian violence and several crises. It argues that is the post
9/11 era, Pakistan has emerged as a strategic player on the world stage. The author contends that
Pakistan’s future is uncertain.

Zahid Hussain (2007): Zahid Hussain offers an alternative view of political developments in the
country independence in 1947. His work analyzes the origin of Pakistan Army’s relationship
with Islamist groups of Pakistan, the Taliban and Al-Qaeda; and how military intelligence
continues to strengthen the so-called Mullah-Military alliance in Pakistan.

On the basis of the review of above-mentioned works and many other following streams of
opinion regarding the causes of religious extremism and terrorism in Pakistani in the name of
Islam to the fore emerge.

Many experts point at the Pakistani military-intelligence establishment domination of Pakistani
foreign policy particularly regarding India and Afghanistan as the root cause of religious
extremism and terrorism in Pakistan. Because this domination necessitates the nurturing of
extremism and terrorist groups so as to work as proxies for the attainment of the country’s
military-dictated foreign policy goals of winning Kashmir and making Afghanistan Pakistan’s
Strategic Backyard. These experts include Hussain Haqqani, Hassan Abbas, Zahid Hussain
among others.
Some experts point at the geography and topography of Pakistani tribal areas and their remoteness as the underlying cause for conflict and the region to serve as the hub of local national and international terrorist groups.

Other observers have had thought the Pakhtoon tribal code of life, Pakhtunwali, emphasizing giving shelter to those in need of it as the chief reason that international terrorist groups received widespread acceptability in the FATA.

One stream of opinion regarding religious extremism and terrorism in Pakistan argues that the fallout of the Soviet-Afghan war of (1979-89), has been instrumental in radicalizing Pakistani society and facilitating terrorist groups. According to the experts, who subscribe to this view, the war has been instrumental in radicalizing Pakistani society as it cultivated Madrassa and Kalashnikov Culture in the country.

Another school of thought believes that the economic factors of poverty and unemployment among youths of Pakistan particularly of those regions which are considered as hubs of religious extremists like FATA, parts of KP and southern Punjab, have been the root-causes of the twin phenomenon.

Yet another school of thought consider that the problem rests with the religious scholars, who have not been able to interpret Islamic scripture contextually and deliberately emphasized on the selective interpretation of Islamic texts focusing mainly on the violent struggle or Jihad to promote the cause of Islam as the underlying factor for the rise of religious extremism and terrorism in Pakistan.

Certain scholars have argued the problem rests in the country’s dilapidated public education system both at the primary and higher level. Due to which many parents were compelled to send their children to madrasas or not to give them education at all. Resultantly, the literacy rates in the country remained extremely low while the standard of education left a lot to be desired.
While reviewing the literature it has been discovered that none of the authors have explained that what are the key problems in the FATA that have helped and facilitated the extremist and terrorist from across the world to come and have sanctuaries in these areas? Moreover, none of the scholars and researchers have pointed at the political vacuum as the underlying cause to have facilitated the permissive or contributing causes of extremism and terrorism in the name of Islam in Pakistan.

PROBLEM STATEMENT:

Currently, Pakistan is faced with three conspicuous and empirical trends. The first of these is the joining of clerical-militant groups by hundreds of thousands of Pakistani youths. The second trend is the multiplying number of indigenous radical militant outfits and an unprecedented number of terrorist incidents particularly since 2007 inside the country. The third trend is international and non-state terrorist-extremist organizations finding increasing space and base in Pakistan; using the territory as pedestal for cross-border and international terrorism. The fourth trend is the empirical radicalization of society. Empirically all these trends have had their roots in the: long-spans of unconstitutional regimes, political instability, deliberate de-politicization of the state and society by the ruling elite and resultant political vacuum in the country. In a nutshell extremist-terrorist phenomena in Pakistan have taken somewhat the following course and form: Undemocratic and unconstitutional policymaking led to profound political instability in the country which gave rise to a huge political vacuum. The vacuum led to creation of undesirable power centres including (accidental apolitical so-called politicians, military and its dependent civilian establishment assuming of state powers) or in other words ruling elite of Pakistan. Gradually these individuals and institutions become repository of all the state powers. These
power centres fomented political instability in the country by design to retain rather perpetuate their power in the process resorting to introducing social innovations. This social engineering by military cum civilian establishment as a by-product created extremists-terrorist groups that emerged as another undesirable power centre by threatening the very existence of the state itself and rippling waves of instability in the region and in a way to the world.

PURPOSE OF THE STUDY:

The foremost purpose of this study is to discover the underlying causes of religious extremism and terrorism in Pakistan with the aim to address these problems. Moreover, the purpose of this research is to study the twin phenomenon of extremism-terrorism perpetrated in the name of Islam in Pakistan aiming at discovering whether long-existing political vacuum has been its root cause? If yes then what have been the linkages between and among the political vacuum and the other contributory causes like economy-poverty, cultural and physical underdevelopment of the FATA, militant madrassas, tribal social structure, illiteracy, propagandized education and foreign meddling in Pakistan’s domestic affairs.

AIMS AND OBJECTIVES:

- To identify the causes of extremism and terrorism perpetrated in the name of Islam in Pakistan
- To add to the body of knowledge on extremism and terrorism in general and in Pakistan specifically
- To give a framework or blueprint for a counterterrorism policy and authority for Pakistan
- To give policy advise to Pakistani authorities regarding the dynamics of the twin phenomena of religious extremism and terrorism

JUSTIFICATION:
Extremism and terrorism perpetrated in the name of Islam by certain groups in Pakistan has posed existential threat to the very survival of Pakistan as a nation state. Moreover, there is a critical threat of falling of Pakistani society and the political system to terrorists using the name of Islam for their vested political, economic and social interests. There is a large-scale confusion in Pakistan regarding the sources and forces of religious extremism and terrorism whereas the state sponsorship of extremists and terrorists is also there. Consequently, the country has not been able to devise any counterterrorism policy or has formed any counterterrorism authority.

No research has hitherto striven to study the problem of extremism-terrorism in Pakistan from the standpoint that it has basically been the prevalence of political vacuum in the country and the negative social engineering by Pakistani establishment in the decades of 80s and 90s from which the problem has sprung. Most of the other studies which explored the issue of extremism-terrorism in Pakistan have mostly mentioned factors like poverty, western-dictated policies, backwardness, lack of education, narrow and subjective interpretation of Islamic scripture as the root causes of the twin problem.

SIGNIFICANCE:

Extremism-terrorism is important trend of the contemporary era with deeply negative consequences for national and international life. In Pakistan specifically the KP and FATA, where I live, each of us has been the victim of extremism-terrorism in one way or the other. Therefore, it is high time to try to understand the phenomenon of extremism-terrorism in much detail and in its truer context. This study aims at the same and in the process an attempt would be
made to try to go as deep as possible to comprehend extremism-terrorism in the name of Islam in Pakistan and its root causes in the context of local, regional and international factors.

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY:

HYPOTHESIS:

*Extensive and deeper the political vacuum in Pakistan, greater the menace of extremism-terrorism in the country in the name of Islam (Proven)*

RESEARCH QUESTION(S)

1. What are the root and contributing causes of extremism and terrorism in the name of Islam in Pakistan?
2. Is constitutional-legal-administrative vacuum and resultant political instability the root-cause of extremism-terrorism in the name of Islam in Pakistan?
3. Are generally cited causes: poverty, youth unemployment, militant madrassas the root causes of the rise and proliferation of extremism terrorism in the name of Islam?

RESEARCH DESIGN:

Following research techniques has been employed in the course of the study.

A. Secondary data analysis

B. Focused interviews with actual players and concerned experts on extremism-terrorism

C. In-depth group discussions with experts and academics
The data include not only secondary sources but relevant primary sources. The primary sources include personal interviews with policymakers and politicians, former military generals including two ex Director Generals of the ISI, a foreign secretary of Pakistan, an in-office Governor of the KP province and former governors of KP and Balochistan provinces. Apart from that there are other interviews with both Pakistani and foreign experts and academics of the field which include email interviews with Alex Schmidt, the world-renowned counter-terrorism expert, Bruce Riedel, former adviser to the US president, face-to-face interview with Harlan Ulman, who conceived the strategy of *Shock and Awe*. The interviews also include that of retired Major General Naseerullah Khan Babar, the former Governor of KP, former Interior Minister of Pakistan and Inspector General Frontier Corps (IGFC), the paramilitary force with the mandate to manage the Pakistan-Afghanistan border. Babar is considered as the architect of Pakistan’s Afghan policy of harbouring Afghan mullahs and transforming them into militant mullahs in the 1970s and creator of Afghan Taliban Movement in the 1990s.

After collecting data from the above-mentioned secondary and primary sources it has been collated, interpreted and analyzed to look for the root and contributing causes of religious extremism and terrorism in Pakistan. After analysis it transpired that constitutional-legal-administrative or political vacuum has been root cause of the rise and proliferation of religious extremism and terrorism in Pakistan. Whereas, the generally-cited causes of poverty, unemployment, remoteness of FATA, narrow interpretation of Islamic scripture, *madrassas*, Pakistani state ideology, Pakistan military-intelligence establishment nurturing of militants, foreign interference from the US and Saudi Arabia to create militants for the anti-Soviet Afghan
war and promotion of Wahabism-Salafism have only contributed to the rise, proliferation of extremism and terrorism in the name of Islam in Pakistan.

THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK:

Liberalism

The theory of Political Liberalism has guided the whole study. Keeping in view the key libertarian principles of moderation, self-restraint, individualism and democracy it has been emphasized in the context of this study that it is due to the absence of a liberal society in Pakistan due to which the state structure and particularly the political system has largely been bereft of liberal and democratic foundations. This can be gauged from the statistical evidence that for more than half of the country’s life-span military dictators have ruled directly whereas whenever the so-called civilian-elected governments ruled the key policies of the state regarding foreign and security affairs have been dictated by the military-civilian-intelligence establishment. Consequently none of the elected governments has ever been allowed to complete its constitutional tenure. Due to the illiberal and undemocratic structure of the Pakistani society the state structure, policymakers and governance has not been democratic and thus non-participatory and unaccountable. Rather governance and policymaking has had remained the exclusive domain of the ruling elite, which in order to strengthen and reinforce its power base, has had used pseudo-Islamist slogans for which it courted and patronized the Muslim clerical community, which cultivated fundamentalist religious social attitudes in the country. As the society and the state continued to be illiberal, apolitical and undemocratic the ruling elite kept on formulating policies like nurturing Islamist extremist and militant groups to attain its dictated state foreign and domestic goals, which significantly contributed to the religious extremism and ultimately to
terrorism in the name of Islam in Pakistan. Therefore, it must be emphasized that the phenomena of extremism and terrorism in Pakistan have been extremely complex and therefore it cannot be fixed with a tool-kit approach. Rather it would need a full-scale societal and state level intervention to lay down the foundation of a liberal society and democratic state structure, policymaking and governance, which could reverse and dilute the forces and sources of religious extremism and terrorism in Pakistan.

CHAPTER- 1

LIBERALISM & PHENOMENA OF RELIGIOUS EXTREMISM-TERRORISM IN PAKISTAN
This study is guided by the theory of Political Liberalism as the central contention of the study is that it has been due to the failure of Pakistani state and society to contribute to the process of evolution of liberal political, economic and social institutions and thus culture, which has been holistically responsible for the rise and proliferation of extremism and terrorism in the name of Islam in the country. Therefore, it is only through the setting up of liberal political, economic and social institutions and cultivating and thriving of a liberal culture through which the twin phenomena can be countered.

1.1 MEANINGS OF LIBERALISM

Liberalism as a political theory in the contemporary period, broadly speaking, has two meanings. According to the first meaning, which is relatively narrower, liberalism can be construed as a political position that stands between political conservatism and socialism. In this sense, liberalism is antagonistic to the reactionary tendency of conservatism, which believes in maintaining the status quo and existing socio-economic distribution of status, wealth and political power, in order to preserve the preeminent position of the ruling class. Liberalism in the narrower sense also considers the pro status quo-position of conservatives as arbitrary and unjust resulting in multifaceted social and political problems. Liberalism further argues, the dominant conservative ruling class in a society, despite in minority, uses the economic and political institutions of that society as tools to maintain the status quo and to perpetuate its stranglehold over the state and society by denying all the other classes and masses in general their due social, political and economic rights.

In the specific case of Pakistan the use of state and societal institutions by the dominant class or the ruling elite for the perpetuation of its political, social and economic position has been empirically evident. In the universe of this study Pakistani ruling elite is operationally defined as: the combination and nexus of the civil and military establishment; the landed gentry, many of whose members masquerade themselves as politicians; and those members of the industrialist class, who have familial bonds with members of upper echelons of civil-military establishment and key landlord families. “. . . politics in Pakistan is dominated by a minority group consisting of the political, military and bureaucratic elite which is drawn from the feudal class” (Behuria, 2007: 8). In the beginning of Pakistan “it was revealed that twenty two families between them
owned 66% of industry, 97% of insurance and 80% of banking.” (Noman, 1988: 41) The situation has not improved even after 60 years. According to the president of non-profit research organization, Dr. Murtaza Mughal, “Once there were 22 families that controlled approximately 70% of national wealth; today we have around 115 families that may be controlling more or less 85% of national output,” (Social divide growing as 115 families control 85pc output, 2011). Another source writes “In line with most of the countries in South Asia, Pakistan has a type of politics that revolves around a few powerful families. These families have been ruling the only nuclear Islamic state for the last 60 years.” (Latif, 2008) Some researchers have pointed at another underlying feature of Pakistani ruling elite that apart from representing a specific social-economic class it also has had a peculiar ethnic complexion. “The (Pakistani) elite consisted of the combination of refugee and Punjabi industrial and landowning classes.” (Noman, 1988: 200) Most of these families belong to the Punjab and Sindh provinces. (Latif, 2008) This sufficiently establishes the non-liberal make-up of Pakistan’s ruling elite.

In the broader sense liberalism is considered as roughly equivalent to the construct of democracy “in contrast with either communism or fascism.” (Sabine, 1937: 741) Politically this meaning of liberalism implies to have sustainable popular institutions and processes like voting rights, elected legislatures in addition to distribution of state powers among various institutions. More generally liberalism in the broader sense also means the existence of political institutions that admit certain broad principles of social philosophy and political morality whatever modus operandi they employ. (Sabine, 1937: 741) This conception of liberalism testifies that it is not the ideology of any social class, as is perceived by some quarters, which associate liberalism with the middle class, or a philosophy which calls for a restricted political reform and thus is non-revolutionary. Rather the quarters with an anti-liberal bias contend that liberalism is the holistic manifestation of the ideals of secularism and western civilization.

Liberalism in its early history was the political movement of the English middle-class. The philosophy of liberalism and the middle class concomitantly got increasing importance in the aftermath of the Industrial Revolution because the latter made the middle class the most

---

4 The data on the 22 families was first released by world renowned and celebrated Pakistani economist and then finance minister, Dr Mahboob-ul-Haq, in a detailed research study in 1985.
important social class replacing the landed gentry. It has been the key reason for the critics of liberalism for associating it with the middle class. The movement of liberalism has been instrumental in democratizing the English society. The Industrial Revolution of the late 18th and the first half of the 19th Century and the Glorious Revolution of 1688 in England were largely the result of liberal movement.

On the basis of the above-mentioned description of Pakistan elite this study hypothesizes that the ruling Pakistani elite, which has been completely conservative in its social and political outlook, individual differences of the members notwithstanding, in order to perpetuate its power, has used religious institutions, slogans and personalities to depoliticize society by making the masses believe that politics is forbidden in Islam. The conservative nature of the ruling class and the inherent orthodoxy of the Pakistani clergy made both the classes each other natural allies against democracy and liberal politics. The conservative character of Pakistani ruling elite manifested glaringly when it denied political power to an umbrella organization of left-of-centre and non-Punjabi political groups, National Awami Party (NAP), which had won majority in provincial legislatures of Balochistan and North West Frontier Province (NWFP) in the first general, and relatively free, elections in the country’s history held in 1970. The NAP had a political programme of industrialization and putting an end to sardari (tribal leadership) system. The Balochistan government was soon dismissed by the federal government of Pakistan People’s Party (PPP), led by its founder Zulfiqar Bhutto (Noman, 1988: 65). The NAP believed in ethno-linguistic pluralism, which aimed at striking the very basis of conservative state. The NAP

5 Depoliticization in the context of Pakistan means the formation of an attitude among individuals not to become part of the activities of political groups and political parties to wage an organized struggle for the people rights; disavowing elections to elect parliament and government; accepting military regimes as legitimate governments.

6 Sardar is a chief of a tribe or clan. It is a generic term for the head of a tribe in Pakistan, where every region has its own term for the tribal chief like Chaudhry (the Punjab), Wadera (Sindh), Waja or Sardar (Balochistan), Khan (Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa), Malik (FATA) and so on. In the Sardari system the members of the tribe or a clan owe allegiance to the tribal chief and the loyalty to the tribe and its head overshadows and dominates all other loyalties whether to the state, democracy, constitution or law.
government was dismissed on the unfounded charges of conspiring to secede from Pakistan termed as ‘London Plan’ by the regime.  

No liberal movement, worth its name, could emerge in Pakistan during the early years of the new state that could lead to some sort of an industrial revolution in the country, which, in turn, could entrench the ideals of liberalism in Pakistani society. A strong liberal wave could not surface in Pakistan because in the first decade after the state’s creation (1947-56) the country had had extreme political instability and extensive political void. No constitution during this period under which a representative government could rule had been in vogue in the country conspicuously indicating the level of political instability and political-legal vacuum in the state.

In the same period there had been no elections to the parliament and several regimes came to

---

7 On 10 February 1973 a cache of Russian Arms was recovered from the Iraqi Embassy in Islamabad. Bhutto’s government charged that the arms were to be used by the NAP to stage an insurgency for the secession of Balochistan and NWFP provinces from Pakistan with the backing of the USSR.

8 The affairs of the state in this period had been managed under the key provisions of the British Colonial era Act of Indian Independence of 1935. The Pakistani legislature was comprised of members who were elected in 1946 elections of British India and the representatives were never supposed to run the affairs of an independent state. The legislature was also transformed into a constituent assembly to frame a constitution for Pakistan. The members thus never possessed the requisite qualification and competence for framing a constitution let alone a truly democratic and liberal one. “Between 1948 and 1954 the Constituent Assembly met, on average, a paltry sixteen days a year to frame a constitution.” (Aziz, , 1947-58: 86)

9 Pakistan has always been an extremely unstable country both constitutionally and legally (Mezzera & Aftab: 23). The 1956 Constitution remained in vogue for only two years. In 1962 military ruler General Ayub Khan formulated an entirely new constitution based on presidential form of government, which suited his personal needs. Again the constitution was not the result of a social contract among the federating units, civil society and ethnic groups, as was the case with the first constitution. After the dismemberment of Pakistan in 1971 the country formulated another constitution in 1973, which was again not the result of a social contract, which ideally it should have been. The 1973 Constitution was formulated by the National Assembly members of Pakistan, who were elected in the 1970 elections from the then West Pakistan. Therefore, the assembly was fundamentally not a Constitutional Assembly, as was the case with the first assembly or parliament of Pakistan. Although the 1973 Constitution has remained in vogue somehow up till now it has to be suspended or put in abeyance for years during General Zia-ul-Haq (1977-85) and General Pervez Musharraf (1999-2002) Martial Laws while remaining enforced in the rest of the periods in bits and pieces. The 1973 Constitution has been amended 22 times by the military and elected government to tailor it to their needs. This is despite of the fact that the basic character of the constitution is rigid as it could only be amended with a two-thirds majority in each house of the parliament. The judiciary has upheld or approved all the abrogations of and amendments to the constitution by applying the “doctrine of necessity” save the one instance in November 2007 by striking down the imposition of the Second Martial Law by General Musharraf.
power all managed, midwife and engineered by the civilian and military establishment. (Noman, 1988: 9)

It was in 1956 that Pakistan got its first constitution; however, it was not the result of a social contract among constituent ethnicities and societal groups and classes of the country, which it should have been. Rather the constitution was doctored by the civilian bureaucracy. (Noman, 1988: 9) The then Army Chief, General Ayub Khan, staged a military coup in October 1958 before any elections could be held under the 1956 Constitution. General Ayub continued to rule for the next 11 years. “The military coup of 1958 merely formalized the dominance of the military-bureaucratic complex.” (Noman, 1988: 12)

During that regimented period (1958-69) some industrialization was carried out by the government but the process could not produce a sizable middle class to lay down the foundation of a democratic culture in the country. At the time the political arena was dominated on the one hand by ultra-conservative or right-wing groups like the Jamaat-e-Islami (the JI), Jamiat Ulema-e-Islam (the JUI), Jamiat Ulema-e-Pakistan (JUP), Anjuman Ahrar-ul-Islam and on the on the other hand by leftist political conglomerate, the NAP. After the death of the country’s founder, Muhammad Ali Jinnah, a downright liberal constitutionalist, conservative landlords and in-service civilian bureaucrats came to dominate the founding party of Pakistan—the Muslim League. (Noman, 1988: 9) Some scholars have pointed that initially the Muslim League was formed to safeguard the interest of Muslim landlords. (Gankovsky & Polonskaya, 1964 as cited by Saigol, 2009: 39) Thus in Pakistan during that period there had been no truly liberal and secular parties present in the political sphere because liberalism in its extended sense, is opposed to communism and fascism on the one hand and conservatism on the other.10 The absence of a liberal political movement could not put in place the much-needed checks on the conservative civilian and military bureaucracy to prevent it from using religious slogans and parties. Resultantly, the clerical groups and the country’s establishment by clamouring to make Pakistan the *Fort of Islam* and a *Model Islamic State* (Noman, 1988: 7) strengthened their hold over society and started dominating society’s political and public discourse by making full use of the

---

10 A situation which typically prevailed then in Pakistan with conservative religious groups dominating one side of the political divide and Communist-Leninist-Maoist groups the other side.
institutions of mosque and madrassa, state-controlled media, schools and universities. Pakistani ruling elite also tried to rally people around its anti-India policy by making them believe India embodied Hinduism as opposed to Pakistan, which was depicted as personification of Islam. In order to make this portrayal convincing the ruling elite needed to label India and Hinduism inherently anti-Islam and anti-Pakistan. (Haqqani, 2005: 15) Within the country the ruling elite was helped by the clergy in labelling independent India the reincarnate of Hinduism. These illiberal slogans of Pakistani conservatives and their domination of the public-political discourse not only set the future political direction of the state and particularly its domestic and foreign policies but also sown the seed of a fundamentalist religious society in Pakistan. Against this backdrop “. . . the silent majority of Pakistan wants the country to be a moderate and progressive state. But the problem is that this segment of society is silent. Civil society at large has failed to stand up to the extremist forces. A credible democratic system would have provided an avenue to moderate forces to voice their opinions.” (Abbas, 2005: 12) For this Pakistani liberals are also responsible particularly due to their conceptual ambiguity and disorganization but the liberals only partly admit their shortcomings.

I don’t think there has been any failure of the liberalism in Pakistan as the liberal ideology very much exists in the country and it has its political sphere. However, the problem with it is that its adherents are not organized. Yes they are more complacent in the sense that they are not committed enough that they have to organize people. The liberals have not aggregated and articulated their interests. They lack the platforms where people could have their collective voice. 11

11 Interview with Dr Farzana Bari, a key Pakistani civil society leader and a professor of Gender Studies at Quaid-e-Azam University, (Islamabad, May 2010)
1.2 LIBERALISM, POLITICAL VACUUM AND RISE OF RELIGIOUS EXTREMISM

The failure of Pakistan’s first Constitutional Assembly and politicians to frame constitution for the country partly due to their own conservative policies and incompetence and partly due to the manipulation of civilian and military bureaucracy led the latter to develop a perception, largely deliberately, that politics rather statecraft were above the grasp of ordinary souls in Pakistan and must not be left exclusively to the elite, having the special faculties and talents to govern. As there had been no elections to judge the capacity and ability of the masses to arrive at rational decisions, this perception did not have any logical grounds. Rather the perception was the result of the illiberal complexion and worldview of members of Pakistani civilian and military establishment.

To distance ordinary minds from politics and statecraft the ruling elite started using the clergy while keeping in view the latter apolitical, illiberal and undemocratic nature, to infuse depoliticization within the masses and the country’s body politic. The impact of the scale of depoliticization within the Pakistani society started then can be gauged from the survey of International Republican Institute (IRI) in December 2008. In response to one question asked during the survey that whether Pakistan would be better off when there was a democratically elected parliament and president, 67 percent of the respondents said ‘No’. (IRI Index: Pakistan Public Opinion Survey, 2008). On the other hand 13 percent stated that they think it was the government of Pakistan which was responsible for the suicide attack on the Marriott Hotel in Islamabad, dubbed as 9/11 of Pakistan whereas only one percent considered Pakistani intelligence agencies responsible for the attack.

The ruling elite hired clergymen successfully depoliticize Pakistani society by labelling democracy, the outcome of liberalism, and secularism as anti-Islam. The clergy attained the end by misleading the sentimentally Islamic, politically gullible and educationally backward masses. The nexus between the clergy and ruling elite continuously indoctrinated the people through propaganda that Pakistan was an ideological state which must not have western and liberal political institutions and democracy. The propaganda inadvertently stimulated the masses to demand establishing a Utopian Islamic state as widespread disinformation was disseminated
among the masses that such an Islamic state was the ultimate panacea for all of the social and economic woes the country and people had been facing.

The contention by Pakistan ruling elite that politics is the exclusive domain of the superior leadership having the mental capabilities to run the affairs of state has been the antithesis of liberal assumption that only human intelligence and goodwill are the most appropriate tools for dealing with the issues that surface among humans in economic and political arenas.

1.2.1 Political Problem a Moral Issue

Liberalism also considers that a political problem in the final analysis is a moral issue and has to be settled through the recognition of rights and obligations of and by the parties concerned. In the process of settlement all concerned sides ought to show on the one hand self-restraint and on the other equal determination to stand for one’s rights. (Sabine, 1937: 748) Liberals presume that solution to disagreements and issues can be found through discussion, interchange of claims and proposals by negotiation, adjustments, compromise always supposing that all parties recognize rights and perform obligations in good faith. The institutions of a community, having disagreements and issues, but simultaneously having the peaceful ways and means to settle them, are thought of as providing the means by which discussion can end in a meeting of minds that reduces sheer coercion to an unavoidable minimum. (Sabine, 1937: 748)

To have a lasting solution of the problem of religious extremism and terrorism in Pakistan and to counter argue the religious extremists in Pakistan the other side—government, political parties and society at large—should demonstrate self-restraint from gagging the voices of the former and at the same time taking a firm stand that the agenda of religious extremist and modus operandi for its realization is incorrect.

1.3 POLITICAL THEORY OF EARLY LIBERALISM

Sovereignty Reside in People: In his book Fragment of Government, Bentham argues that the ultimate political sovereignty should reside in the people. Its rationale, he explained, is that only in such a way the interest of government is in consonance with the interest of the masses.
According to the in vogue Pakistani Constitution of 1973 the ultimate political sovereignty rests with the Allah Almighty and the public representatives have to exercise sovereignty as a sacred trust. In this sense there is no conflict between libertarian and Pakistani constitutional conception of political sovereignty because for practical reasons in both conceptions sovereignty is exercised by the people. Many Muslim scholars believe that theocracy is not an Islamic concept or ideal and the faith does provide its followers considerable leverage to ascertain their form of government and political system. These Muslim scholars rightfully questioned that had there been a Quranic procedure for appointing rulers the closest companions of Prophet (SAW) must have adopted it to choose his successors. Therefore, in the absence of such Quranic procedure Umar (RA), the second Caliph of Islam soon after the demise of the Prophet laid down the process of choosing Abu Bakr (RA), as the first Caliph. The decision of the closest companions of Muhammad after his death was based on careful consideration after assessing what is the best to do by applying reason instead of relying on some predetermined theological criteria, as there was none. Interestingly, from this standpoint subversion of the constitution by military generals can be dubbed as un-Islamic. But never a Pakistani religious party or extremist group declared it so. Even according to the Holy Quran God has made the believers His vicegerent on Earth so that to see what they do.

(Muslims are) those who, if We give them power in the land, establish the system of Salah (worship) and Zakah (poor dues) and enjoin virtue and forbid evil and inequity (al-Qur’an: 57:25).

It means that the exercise of authority is ultimately to be made by humans. This position counter-argues the contention of Pakistani terrorist and extremist groups that representative democracy is not an Islamic system and there ought to be real Shariah in the country. However, the concept of this real Shariah is vague, elusive and polysemic. Pakistani religious extremists’

12 The Preamble of 1973 Constitution states: “Whereas sovereignty over the entire Universe belongs to Almighty Allah alone, and the authority to be exercised by the people of Pakistan within the limits prescribed by Him is a sacred trust.”

13 That is it is subject to different interpretations by different groups and individuals.
notion of Shariah roughly means dictatorship of unsophisticated, non-cosmopolitan rather illiterate community of clerics. Never a Pakistani extremist and terrorist group—be it the TNSM or the TTP—has come up with any, let alone a comprehensive, definition or explanation of the concept of Shariah. Whereas, the mainstream religious Pakistani political parties like the the JUI-F, the JI, Jamiat-e-Ulema-e-Pakistan (JUP (various factions), Tehreek-e-Jafaria (various factions) have been part of the county’s political system, contesting elections, seeking votes and becoming part of the parliament. This signifies that the main religious groups think that the popular democracy is Islamic because political expediency especially getting political power, which is their aim, so demands.

The most simple and comprehensive of the definition of Islamic Shariah has been given by great Islamic scholar and philosopher Imam Ghazali. According to him Shariah means welfare of the people. This welfare lies in safeguarding their faith, their life, their intellect, their posterity and their property; and therefore, whatever guarantees safeguarding of these five serves public interest and is desirable. (Zahrah, 1957: 355) In this context the basis of a liberal government and the Islamic concept of governance is exactly the same. Thus if the majority of the people in Pakistan aspire for Islamic government they could be convinced that for practical reasons this could be brought about by pursuing liberal political ideals. Such persuasion would also serve as bulwark against the religious extremists’ anti-social and narrow interpretation of religion and the strategic agenda of the terrorist groups of overrunning the state and establishing their own dictatorship as well as preventing the society from getting further radicalized.

---

14 Even on one occasion an alliance of almost all the main religious parties, the Muttahida Majlis-e-Amal (MMA) won majority in elections for provincial parliament of KP and ruled it for five years (2002-2007) besides ruling Balochistan province as a coalition partner during the same period. the JUI, which is one of the oldest and largest Pakistani doctrinaire religious political parties, surprisingly formed government in KP and Balochistan province in 1973 in coalition with secular and left-of-centre NAP.

15 The full name was Abū Ḥāmed Muḥammad ibn Muḥammad al-Ghazālī (1058 – 1111).
1.4 USING LIBERTARIAN PRINCIPLES FOR DE-RADICALIZATION

Some rather many experts on terrorism and counterinsurgency may argue that liberalism and democracy cannot counter religious extremism and terrorism in Pakistan because liberalism and its ideals are in conflict with the social complexion and religious conception of majority of Pakistanis. Moreover, the record of even the democratic governments in Pakistan has not been impressive in any meaningful way in assuring the greatest good of the greatest number or welfare of the majority. The first part of the argument has had no solid ground and this has been explained in the preceding paragraphs that the ideals of liberalism indeed are not in conflict with the basic principles of Islam or Shariah per se. The second part of the argument regarding incompatibility of democratic values and norms with Pakistani society, as is justified by the historical evidence of the performance of representative governments, has a lot of substance. However, there are reasons for that too. Firstly, democracy and liberalism have never been allowed to flourish in Pakistan as is evident from the several military takeovers and prolong rule by the military generals with only brief interlude of civilian, rarely representative, governments.16 In addition to that none of the popularly elected governments has ever been allowed by the country’s all-powerful military-civilian-intelligence-judicial establishment to complete their constitutional tenures. The underlying motive of the establishment has been to keep its grip on the state and society so that its prevailing selective conception of domestic and foreign policy priorities and dynamics could not be disturbed by the elected government. Apart from that the establishment’s institutional primacy, which has been the cause of huge social and economic benefits for its members, could be preserved.

In order to have legitimacy for its political role and exercise of power the establishment had to form a nexus with clerical groups to help create militants dubbed as Jihadists, which could be used to achieve the objectives of Pakistan’s, military-dictated, key state policies of antagonism towards India and making Afghanistan Strategic Backyard of Islamabad. As explained elsewhere

16 For the first 23 years of Pakistan’s existence there had been no general elections in the country and the civilian bureaucracy leading the regimes in the initial years followed by complete military takeover by General Ayub Khan in October 1958. Gen. Ayub subsequently pronounced himself the country’s president and ruled for 11 years and transferred power to another military chief General Yahya Khan in 1969. Martial law regimes continued to dominate the subsequent political history with brief representative regimes.
in this dissertation these policies, formulated and pursued in conditions of political vacuum, have been the mainspring of religious extremism and terrorism in the country.

**Solution to Prevent Corruption by Public Representatives:** In Pakistan the military-civilian establishment has always dubbed the so-called elected governments as corrupt and thus untrustworthy to rule.\(^\text{17}\) However, if libertarian principles are followed corruption could be checked within the ranks of elected governments. In his *Essay on Government* another icon of liberal political theory James Mill provides a solution for preventing an elected government from indulging in corruption by “securing a legislature whose interest are identical with those of the country, so that its members have no motive for using their power otherwise than in the general interests, and giving the legislature control over the executive.” (As quoted by Sabine, 1937: 696) In order to make parliament and government to act in the public interest rather than vested interest, Mill prescribes the mechanism of ‘universal suffrage’ and ‘short term of office’ for government. Mill further argues that if democracy and representative governments have really to be effective there ought to be enfranchisement of the industrial middle class. According to him this class has the capacity to lead democracy as it is “the wisest part of the community” and the “lower classes” would always be guided by it. (Mill, 1820) Mills argued that universal suffrage could be instrumental in ensuring greatest good of the greatest number because all human with moderate educational qualification could be enabled to have the most vivid comprehension of their interests. Moreover, once people are clearheaded about their interest they will act infallibly in the right direction to realize their interest. He further argued that if every individual ‘reasonably’ seeks its personal interest its natural corollary would be greatest good of the greatest number.

It is immediately obvious, that a wide and difficult field is opened, and that the whole science of human nature must be explored to lay a foundation for the science of

---

\(^{17}\) Since the dawn of so-called Democratic Era (1988-1999) in Pakistan’s history all the four elected governments were not allowed to complete their respective tenures as they were dismissed by military generals, backed by civilian bureaucrats, and the dismissals were upheld by the judiciary on the generic charges of financial misappropriation and abuse of power. The PPP government which came into power in 2008, after the assassination of its chairperson Benazir Bhutto in a suicide attack by Pakistani Taliban on December 27, 2007, has also faced serious corruption charges due to which it is believed that elected governments cannot fight extremism and terrorism because of corruption within their ranks.
government. To understand what is included in the happiness of the greatest number, we must understand what is included in the happiness of the individuals of whom it is composed. (Mill, 1820)

1.5 NON-LIBERAL SOCIAL STRUCTURE & POLITICAL-PSYCHOLOGICAL BASIS OF RELIGIOUS EXTREMISM IN PAK

It is important to note that the liberal means of discussion; interchange of claims and proposals; negotiations; adjustments and compromise can never exist in a condition of political vacuum with self-serving non-democratic and apolitical elite dominating policymaking and governance as has always been the case in Pakistan. This situation has given rise to religious extremism and terrorism whereas blocked the functional ways to counter radicals short of employing coercive means.

1.5.1 Difference between the State & Society

Political liberalism differentiates between the society and the state. Liberalism regards society as an all-inclusive institution which needs multiple rather than a single authority and organization to hold it together. These authorities include both legal and social agencies having the tools of legal and social sanctions respectively at their disposal. On the contrary state is an institution which needs a single authority to hold it together but is not all-inclusive body. Functions of a society are formless and abstract whereas functions of a state are perfect and concrete. Nevertheless there are numerous interrelationships which if are not in a balance create structural problems. Pakistan state-society structural and functional relationship has been absolutely imbalanced which resulted in huge ideological and systemic problems. “The imbalance between state and society meant that Pakistan emerged, like many other post-colonial countries, as more of a state-nation rather than a nation-state.” (Rashid, A., 2009: 17)
1.5.2 Liberal Government & Pakistani Elite Totalitarian Approach

The striking feature of a liberal government is that it is an antithesis of or antipodal to a totalitarian government. Such a government leaves every institution and individual to contribute in its own innovative and creative ways to the society thus channelizing their potential in the most utilitarian ways for the ‘greatest good of the greatest number’. This feature of a liberal regime, in turn, prevents the institutions of state and society from becoming dysfunctional and disharmonized and individuals from going extremists. An important anomaly of successive Pakistani regimes has been that each of it has more or less been totalitarian in approach. This is due to the fact that most of the regimes have been headed or directed by the country’s military. Even the so-called civilian governments were totalitarian in their political behaviour. The totalitarian nature of these regimes compelled them to search for pseudo legitimacy. Further for these regimes Islamic slogan was the only resort to keep the state and society together very much like western monarchs of the Medieval Ages, who often used slogans of Divine Right and portraying themselves as the Shadow of God to ‘legalize’ their temporal authority.

Among the Pakistani totalitarian regimes that of General Zia-ul-Haq (1977-88) even resorted to large-scale social engineering to create Jihadists and institutions for Islamizing the country. The engineering instead of producing religious men and women in the moral sense resulted in the cultivation of a religious extremist mindset in the entire society. The totalitarian nature of successive regimes in Pakistan, with all the state power at their disposal, has had enabled them to introduce mass scale social changes. In order to attain the desired results various regimes employed state’s financial resources to fund madrassas, clerical groups and religious personalities; coercive powers to silence dissent or liberal and secular opposition; propaganda machinery primarily educational institutions, state-own media and above all the combination of mullah, the pulpit and the mosque to depoliticize society and disparage liberalism and democracy.

18 For instance, the first elected Pakistani civilian prime minister, Zulfqar Ali Bhutto, initially assumed the title and exercised powers of civilian ‘Chief Martial Law Administrator’ on December 20, 1971, a unique happening in the history of the modern state.
1.6 DYSFUNCTIONAL PAKISTANI STATE INSTITUTIONS & POLITICAL-PYSCHOLOGICAL BASIS OF EXTREMISM-TERRORISM

With so much emphasis on creating religious men, women and society the institutions of the state become dysfunctional themselves. In turn as the state got dysfunctional it could not cater to the very basic needs of the masses. The process kept on multiplying the country’s economic problems particularly poverty and unemployment; political problems like political instability and social problems like crime, overpopulation and so on. Finding no worldly respite majority of the masses has had to resort to the other worldly pseudo satisfaction in religion. The pulling of a large number of individuals towards religion has been under duress due to socio-economic and political conditions prevailing in the country rather than exhaustive psychological processes, that could make one a real religious man and woman. Such religiously-motivated individuals have never been at ease with their sense of Islam. Therefore, to justify their pseudo religious credentials they have had resorted to extremist ways and tactics like terrorism as social psychologists argue that learning also “pulls” one to get entangle in violence. (Myers, 1993: 434)

This is the political-psychological basis of religious extremism and terrorism in Pakistan.

1.6.1 Denial of Libertarian Rights & Religious Extremism-Terrorism in Pak

1.6.2 Right of Forming Social and Political Associations:

Liberalism is often criticized by the people with an anti-liberal bias while it was merely the figment of imagination of those scholars, who under the influence of the French Revolution, conceived of a liberal community as a mass of individuals, having no bonds with each other than the common citizenship in a state. (Sabine, p. 751) The right of forming associations out of freewill has been one of the cardinal principles of individual freedom in a liberal social setting. The ruling elite of Pakistan by outlawing political parties, student unions, labour unions, unions of professionals and community unions, as has been evident throughout the country’s history, denied the right of voluntary association to the individuals. The banishment of people in Pakistan from forming associations by the state has been reminiscent of the Soviet totalitarian and Italian fascist regimes of Benito Mussolini (b. 29 July 1883 – d. 28 April 1945). Like these countries in
which association with the Soviet Communist Party and Italian National Fascist Party and adherence to their policies was a must, masses in Pakistan have always been forced to agree to the military-civilian formulated foreign and domestic policies. The fundamentals of these state policies, which the ruling elite of Pakistan has always tried to reconcile people to, included: considering Islam as the very basis or *raison d’être* of Pakistani state; India as the eternal enemy; politics and democracy are inherently bad; and military is the sole defender of Pakistan’s physical and ideological frontiers i.e. stateless ideology of Islam. (Haqqani, 2005: 51-52)

The ruling elite employed all the tools, the state has had, to force people to believe the policy goals, mentioned it the preceding paragraph, to be the most correct policies which ought to be backed as *national* goals for the *glory* of Islam and Pakistan. Thus a ban was placed on the people actions and thinking, not to form associations which have been in conflict with the *national* goals. Rather the efforts or attempts of formation such associations have always been labelled as not only *anti-Pakistan* but *anti-Islam*. This policy of making people forcefully agree to the military-civilian establishment dictated national interest as a by-product, very much like fascism and National Socialism in Italy and Germany, resulted in the formation of religiously extremist social attitudes. The roots of the aim and agenda of contemporary religious extremist-terrorist groups like the TTP, the TNSM, the Punjabi–Kashmiri Jihadist groups and many other outfits lie in this state policy of making Islam as the state religion and Pakistan an Islamist state.

### 1.6.3 Suppressing Minority Opinion

In a liberal society with a liberal political culture the government supposedly acts on the basis of consensus but this consensus is always short of unanimity. The government in such a society is bound to create conditions so that the interest and freedom of the minorities whether ideological, ethnic, sectarian, political, must be safeguarded and they could express their sentiments and aspirations and to have the ways available for their realization. In Pakistan none of the successive governments could ever-create such conditions. Resultantly, in the initial decades of the state the voices of Islamist groups, who were clamouring for the introduction of *Shariah* in the state of Pakistan, founded in the name of Islam, were suppressed. As these groups did not find the functional ways to express their sentiments and aspirations and institutional course and means to struggle for their realization they resorted to anti-social ways by preparing extremist mindset
through brainwashing and indoctrination making use of the existing religious institutions of mosque and madrassas.

1.7 JUSTIFICATION OF GOVT IN A LIBERAL SOCIETY

1.7.1 To Satisfy Human Needs

As argued by liberal political thinker David Hume that the basis of a government is not a contract but the satisfaction of basic human need and this is also the sole justification of the government, is one of the basic liberal principles, which is evidently utilitarian in orientation. (Sabine 1937: 477) Gauging the existence and performance of all the successive Pakistani governments by this standard would bring one to the conclusion that none of them had had justification to rule. Importantly, satisfying the basic human needs has never been the priority of any Pakistani government in essence indeed, claims notwithstanding. For instance, *Bread, Cloth and Shelter* are the very founding principles of the largest political party of the country, the PPP. The PPP won most of the national elections, whenever allowed by the military-civilian bureaucracy, which suggests that people also wanted their basic needs fulfilled through political participation and self-governance. So-called Pakistani liberals also failed because they could not address the key problems of the people. Again the example of the PPP drives home the point. The party, which has always claimed to be a liberal entity could not liberalize the state and its policies because of the entrenched conservative state structure, the feudal background of the Bhutto family and rest of the party’s top leadership. Social background of top 50 leaders of the party in 1975-76 showed that 27 were landlords.19 Otherwise, had the people of Pakistan been interested in elusive religious goals they must have voted for the religious parties (See Chapter 2 & 4 of this dissertation for details). The evidence of the PPP’s inability to deliver on its very promise is its failure to begin any universal social security system in Pakistan in four stints in power. This left the majority politically disenchanted leaving people no option but to find solace

19 Source M. Lodhi: *Pakistan People’s Party*, p. 413 (as quoted by Noman, 1988)
in religion by demanding enforcement of *Shariah* believing it may prove to be a panacea for their problems.

### 1.7.2 Facilitating Free Expression of Opinion & Society’s Evaluation of Viewpoints

Importantly liberty not only has salubrious effects on persons but it is also a much-needed social condition. To deny by force someone to express one’s opinion is affront and injustice not only to the person who holds that opinion but also to the society as the opinion, if subjected to free scrutiny and criticism, might have an advantage for the entire community. In Pakistan the state has always tried to gag the voices of the constituent social groups including ethnic and religious minorities, associations of liberals and so on. Thus it has stopped all these groups’ opinions and ideologies, as the case may be, to be examined for their respective advantages and disadvantages for the society by the public. This could be gauged from the monopoly of the state till the year 2000\(^{20}\) over the key channels of public information that is TV and radio. Whereas, till late 1980s most of the national dailies remained under the government control under the body called the National Press Trust (NPT). Even the privately-owned newspapers had to work under strict censorship laws. In this situation only the clerics have had the liberty to express their opinion and agenda to the public as they have had a virtual monopoly over one of the most important public information or propaganda tool that is pulpit of the mosque. As the communication in the mosque, unlike mass media, takes place in an interpersonal and face-to-face environment, according to conclusive evidence by communication experts, the impact of messages and inherent meanings which such communication carries are far more effective than the mass media mediated messages. The power of the pulpit and the impact of the messages delivered from it is amplified by the loudspeaker as mullahs’ voice and sermons could be directly delivered to the people in the surrounding localities within the reach of the public address system installed in each and every mosque. This mullah-pulpit-loudspeaker combination has immensely played a role in not only increasing the social influence rather control of Pakistani society by the clergy but also radicalizing the whole population in the name of Islam. Even a single example of Swat, where one Maulana Fazlullah first established a huge complex of *madrassas* called Maam Dheri by delivering sermons to the local people through public address system, suffices to prove the

---

\(^{20}\) It was in that year in which the first private TV channel started its operation in Pakistan
point. Fazlullah was innovative in the sense as he installed a FM transmitter in the mosque-madrassa complex and delivered such strong-worded pseudo Islamist sermons that people donated million of rupees, sought by Fazlullah, within a few weeks to him. The solicitation for donations by Fazlullah was ostensibly meant for constructing the mosque-madrassa complex but later events and incidents revealed that most of the donated cash and kind was used to buy arms and organizing Taliban insurgency in the region. This insurgency took over the whole Swat-Malakand region and unleashed a Pakistani Reign of Terror.

Thus the domination of Pakistani public sphere by the mullahs and denial of the same by the state to other constituent groups and ideologies of society particularly to its liberal sections has robed the society of evaluating and adapting liberal principles. The outcome of this had been wider and deeper radicalization of Pakistani society in the name of Islam. Contemporaneously the radical discourse has come to dominate the national narrative in such a manner that although majority of the people in Pakistan seemingly disagree with the opinion and agenda of clergy and Muslim fundamentalist groups but dare not express their opposition freely. This is a situation typically explained by the theory of Spiral of Silence (Neumann, 1974: 24-51).

1.8 CORRELATION BETWEEN INEXISTENT DEMOCRACY AND SOCIAL INEQUALITY

Importantly, the function of a liberal state in a free society is not negative but positive. The conditions of freedom cannot be assumed to exist, as is argued by most of the totalitarian and authoritarian ruling cliques, merely by removing legal disabilities as they claim to have removed or refraining from legislation. (Sabine: 715) Similar has been a long-held stance of Pakistani military dictators under whom no parliamentary arrangement, in real sense of the word, as being representative, sovereign and independent, ever existed. Legislation may be a means of creating,

21 “All commentators concur that political extremism is not inherent in Islam per se but is a relatively recent development, though they are not of one mind when it comes to pinning down its causes.” (Ferrero: 2005: 199)

22 This theory contends that society threatens deviant individuals with isolation...which they experience continuously. This fear of isolation causes individuals to try to assess the climate of opinion at all times. The results of this estimate affect behaviour in public especially the open expression or concealment of opinions.
increasing and equalizing opportunity. Against this backdrop the inexistence of real democracy throughout and parliament for decades definitely have had prevented evolution of egalitarian social structures in the country. In the context of Pakistan the correlation between an inexistient liberal society and democracy as independent variables and glaring social inequality between various ethnic groups and social classes as dependent variables could typically proves this. The rise of religious extremism and terrorism in such a social milieu is but natural.

1.8.1 Incapacity of Authoritarian Govt to Hold Society & State Together

According to Green even the most powerful and the most authoritarian government cannot hold a society together and prevent it from falling apart by sheer use of coercive power. In retrospect government must owe its existence to the people’s will not on the use of force because the binding force between an individual and the society is the compulsions of a man’s inherent nature instead of the penalties of the law or calculation of ulterior advantages. Thus the conception and policy of Pakistani power elite to hold the multiethnic, multiclass, multicultural and ideologically heterogeneous society together by sheer military and state power and through unconstitutional rule aimed at denying people and constituent ethnic groups their due civic, political and economic rights and simulatenously using religion as an integrative slogan, clearly conflicts with Green’s above-mentioned liberal ideal.

Men in command were of the centre either refugees from Muslim minority provinces [of India] or from Punjab. Excluded from power were members of the respective elites of Bengal, Sind, Baluchistan and the Frontier province. A political structure incapable of accommodating four of the five provincial elites could not have been expected to provide stable government.” (Noman, 1988: 13)

The denial of equal political and economic rights to Bengalis, the majority ethnic group of Pakistan, by the country’s military regime led to the dismemberment of Pakistan in 1971 and the success of Bengali nationalist movement. In recent years the insurgency of Al Qaeda-backed

---

23 Surprisingly Bengali ethnic community living in the then province called East Pakistan was the largest ethnic group of the country. However, the ruling elite of the country from the then province of West Pakistan belonging mostly to the second largest ethnic group of the country, Punjabis, did not heed to the demands of Bengali leadership
Pakistani Taliban and other religious extremist groups, all fundamentally nurtured by the ruling elite as pawns for the execution of its domestic and regional policy, have created huge schisms and chasms in the society. Also Pakistani ruling elite has always denied the residents of Balochistan, area-wise the largest province of the country, their economic and political rights and instead launched four major and several minor military operations to silence the Baloch nationalist movement for rights. Despite killing of thousands of Balochs and mass displacement of hundreds of thousands of others to Afghanistan, the movement kept on growing and has assumed the shape of a full-fledged separatist insurgency in the first decade of the 21st century.

The examples of the dismemberment of Pakistan, Baloch nationalist insurgency and Taliban religious insurgency and the state’s use of sheer military force to defeat the nationalist and religious insurgents have led to the virtual collapse of Pakistani state and society and has proven Green’s liberal argument quite concretely that a government cannot keep a society together by sheer force.

1.9 LIBERAL GOVERNMENT OUTCOME OF LIBERAL SOCIETY

After it has been discovered that the problem of extremism and terrorism in Pakistan has a lot to do with the absence of liberal governments pursuing liberal policies in the country’s history, the most appropriate question is how liberal government could be brought into power. J. Mill very appropriately recognized that a liberal government has to be buttressed by a liberal society. (Sabine, p. 710) In other words political institutions are linked to the wider social context which to a great extent determines the modus operandi of the former. This is a very rational argument and a significant contribution to political concepts. Interactive society or the community becomes third and a preponderant factor or variable in the relationship between the state and

spearheaded by Bengali Nationalist party, the Awami League, to give the provincial government and Bengalis the control of resources and revenues generated from the province. Instead the country’s ruling elite launched a massive military operation in the East Pakistan to quell what it called Bengali insurgency. However, despite of massive bloodshed of Bengalis besides rapes of hundreds of thousands of Bengali women the operation failed to defeat the Bengali nationalist spirit and the latter ultimately succeeded in establishing a separate state, Bangladesh. To counter Bengali nationalists, Pakistani military, in line with its traditional policy of using clerics, formed two religious armed militias named Al-Shams and Al Badr comprising members of the clergy in Bengal to fight ‘insurgents’ (For see details Chapter 3).
individual safeguarding liberty of the individual. In Pakistan a truly liberal and democratic government could never come to rule because the country never had a liberal society in true sense of the term. The preponderant aristocratic-militaristic social structure at the top on the level of state and the patriarchal structure at the level of family clearly show the illiberal nature of that society. This kind of a social structure has also been the reason for successful military takeovers and long spans of rules by the generals. In a tribal social and apolitical structure it is extremely difficult to organize public resistance to usurpers. Thus Pakistani society on the one hand has illiberal foundations and is simultaneously awash with religious sentiments. On the other hand Pakistani state has had an avowed policy of considering the state more an ideological tool rather than a normal functioning political institution. The outcome of this policy has been shunning running the state as a political federation and instead attempting to dovetail the multi-ethnic and multicultural state through what the researcher choose to call *Islamic Federalism*. Resultantly, Pakistani state has been attempting to integrate the country on the basis of elusive religious ideology rather than uniform development of regions and people by giving ethnic groups and communities control over their resources. Thus social and political conservatism, state’s policy of using ideology of Islam as basis of national integration and denial of peoples, ethnicities and communities their political and economic rights and using of clerics by the state’s ruling elite to propagate ideology, infused de-politicization, have been the very ingredients of evolution of a religiously extremist society in Pakistan.

1.9.1 Individualism

One of the main postulates of the liberal political theory is individualism as opposed to any form of collectivism. According to liberal political philosophers individualism is of immense social value. For instance Bentham’s statement that “individual interest are the only real interests” (as quoted by Sabine, 1937: 745) and Immanuel Kant’s principle that respect of persons treating them as ends rather than as means is the essence of morality. Against this backdrop in Pakistan the power-political elite has always considered the individual interest of least value and has had tried to squash and override the individual interest through emphasizing on the elusive concept of national interest. This is typically a condition which prevails in a totalitarian and authoritarian society. Resultantly, seeing their interest trampled under the so-called national interest, which
mainly has been the interest of ruling elite and of the clergy, more and more individuals and groups of individuals became extremists as they could not find institutionalized means to realize their interest because of prevalent undemocratic culture and political vacuum. Of these individuals and groups many resort to religious extremism because they think this is the only option to create conducive conditions particularly establishing an *Islamic* state, in which realization of their interests could be guaranteed.

The tendency of Pakistan civilian and military bureaucracy and their allied pseudo political parties disregard for individual interests created such political-governance structures which could not provide very basic services to the individuals leading to a situation once described by J. S. Mill: “But where everything is done through the bureaucracy, nothing to which the bureaucracy is really adverse can be done at all.”²⁴ (Mill, 1859) This gradually led to individuals’ disenchantment with the state and society. Having no civic amenities and struck by poverty and economic impoverishment, many individuals join the extremist groups which not only provide them a cause to fight for but also some financial assistance to make both ends meet and feed their families. “…as poverty and insecurity increase, humans are driven to seek the embrace of religion. And it was the mullah whose influence would grown in such circumstances.” (Abbas, 2005: 10)

1.9.2 The Collectivist Culture & Loss of Personality

The ethos of individualism have been in conflict with the existing tribal social structure and collectivist culture in Pakistan, which is called *tribalism* in FATA; *biradri-pechayat* system in the Punjab; *Wadera* system in Sindh; and *Sardari* system in Balochistan. “Tribal and *biraderi* or clan-based patrilineal kinship ties play and important party in social and political organization.” (Jalal, 216) The collective nature of social structure in the tribal areas is most elaborate. Keeping in view the tribal structure and the inherent solidarity the British Colonial rulers came up with a

unique legal framework for the FATA, which in many respects applies the laws not to individuals but to the whole community and the tribe.25 “… tribal and biraderi solidarities in principle broadly approximate each other at both the ideational and structural levles.” (Jalal, 1999) Elsewhere in Pakistan the individual has been subjected at different levels to values, norms, like and dislikes of family, clan community and the state. This can be likened to the situation as described by John Jacques Rosseau (1712–1778) that *Man is born free but is everywhere in chains.* These social and legal constraints have had a strong destabilizing impact on individuals everywhere as they denied individuals a social space to develop their personalities, come up with their aims and devise ingenious ways and means to make use of their faculties and natural talents so as to pursue their interest through a process of self-expression and self-realization. Explaining this character of Pakistani society one expert writes: “A society not allowed to analyze or express itself suffocated in silence, stunted by ideological imprisonment and deformed by sustained repression.” (Noman: 1988: 29) In a society with an elaborate tribal social structure with no opportunity of social mobility and self-fulfilment for its members it is most likely that majority of the members of such a society to have distorted personalities, nagging psychological problems and above all extremist tendencies. The centrality of religion to the state and society and the clergy out there with full state support and license to proliferate religious extremism to cultivate support for the ruling elite’s domestic policy of integrating the state in the name of Islam and giving license to foreign policy of fighting proxy war through so-called Jihadists in the neighbouring countries, it is not a surprise that a large number of individuals in such a state and society could develop extremist religious tendencies.

1.9.3 Gauging Social Practices, Institutions by their Effects on Individuals

Individual rights are so central to liberals that according to Kant’s philosophy human personality is uniquely valuable. (Sabine, 1937: 746) In Kant’s view if the value of a social custom, an institution or a form of government is to be judged, it can be gauged by their effects on people,

25 This is most vivid in clause 40 also called *Collective Responsibility Clause* of the legal framework called Frontier Crimes Regulation (FCR) under which the whole tribe or clan is held accountable for a crime and wrong committed by a few or even a single member of the tribe.25
taken as individual persons. (As quoted by Sabine, 1937: 746) Against this backdrop the social practice of ritualistic Islam in Pakistan and its propagation by various religious groups and private individuals have had deleterious effects on the society. One such measure of this to gauge is the huge financial corruption in Pakistan as is evident from the surveys of Transparency International. So the emphasis on Islamic rituals instead of ideally moralizing society has contributed to religiously radicalizing society. On the other hand the authoritarian and military regimes impact on individual Pakistanis has been adverse. With military consuming most of the national budget very little has always remained for the education, health, civic sectors as well as development of individuals. In particular state’s complete indifference to the education sector resulted in Pakistan ending up with the lowest literacy rates in the World. (Noman, 1988: 173)

The effects of dictatorial regimes on ordinary men and women in Pakistan are evident from just a single fact that Pakistan has not had any system of social security at all, a must for any real Islamic welfare state. Instead of providing for the welfare and social security of individuals the long periods of military rules and absence of constitutional governments created a huge political vacuum which resulted in the rise of religious extremism and terrorism in Pakistan and as is explained elsewhere in this dissertation.

The proliferation of extremism of any type among members of a community or a society whether in the name of religion or any other ideology is partly due to the denial of social space to its individual members to live their lives as they deem appropriate, develop their latent faculties and potentials. From the standpoint of liberal ideals a good society could be one which both provides a sense as well as literal freedom besides opportunity for free and satisfying ways of life. (Sabine: 715) Pakistani society having aristocratic and patriarchal structure does not provide individuals an enabling environment of mobility and growth. Moreover, gradually the tendency

---

26 Surveys could be found on the website at http://www.transparency.org.pk/documents accessed by researcher on September 18, 2011

27 In Pakistan only 54 percent of the population can read. Around 47 million adult Pakistanis were illiterate in 2010 which would increase to approximately 50 million by 2015, leaving Pakistan one of the very few countries having a growing illiterate population. (Winthrop, 2010: 10)
of *social patriarchy* has also becoming institutionalized in the sense that clerics have become self-appointed vigilantes to prevent people particularly women from living their own lives and develop their talents and realize their potentials by claiming to moralize society.

### 1.9.4 Community Support to Individual

In Green’s view a moral community is the one in which an individual takes cognizance of his freedom as it is subject to certain limitations which are quite important for the general social welfare. In such a community the individual rights and interest are recognized and supported by the community as a whole. The community support of individual’s rights and interests has its own rationale because the general social well-being is dependent upon the freedom and creativity of the individual. However, the second condition of creativity cannot be realized without the first i.e. giving freedom to the individual. Thus the ultimate aim of general social welfare becomes the justification of individual’s rights and duties. (Sabine: 732)

As in Pakistan the rights and interests of the individual have always been considered as subservient to the interests of various social groups like family, religion or government by the patriarchs and ruling elite without realizing that in order to attain the tasks of social well-being and communal welfare the assurance of individual freedom, interests and rights is a must rather instrumental as it is the most appropriate way to make individuals socially responsible. The indifference in Pakistan to individual rights and development can be gauged from the extremely poor socio-economic and development related indicators in the country like the high incidence of poverty, high rates of illiteracy, large percentages of people without health cover and free education and so on. On the other hand Pakistan is only one of the seven nuclear powers in the world whose nuclear programme has consumed billions of dollars.

### 1.9.5 Contextual & Biased Interpretation of Individualism & Individual Liberty

Closely connected with individualism rather its precursor is the concept of individual’s liberty, which is another core principle of the political theory of liberalism. In a society a government and a state has to justify the limits of restraints on individuals and the use of coercion in terms of aggregate gain in freedom when everyone’s interest are counted. (Sabine: 746) Same applies to social sanctions. In Pakistan continual Marshal Laws have crippled every kind of individual and
civil liberties. Even in the decade of 2000 the large-scale use of force by the country’s armed forces to quell Taliban and Al Qaeda insurgency greatly eroded human liberties. However, through the use of force the religious insurgency could not be defeated. Individualism is generally perceived obviously wrongly, in Pakistan as a reserve of western societies depicting the selfish and self-centred nature of these societies. This perception of the concept is based on the very term individualism which people in a conservative society and collectivist culture like Pakistan take on prima-facie and considers it as self-explanatory suggesting an attitude and behaviour for the aggrandizement and self-satisfaction of an individual resting on hedonism. They fail to comprehend that individualism is an indispensable outcome and characteristic of a developed and impersonal kind of social organization as it is in the western societies. In Pakistan, which is both religiously ultra-conservative and physically extremely under-developed, people contruct that western values primarily individualism depicts the selfish and inhuman character of western civilization. Therefore, if these values are allowed to prevail in Pakistan it would result in destruction of the society's social fabric. It is also generally argued that western societies would ultimately face social collapse as its weak values would not be able to hold them together. Empirical evidence suggests otherwise. Growing individualism apart western societies have been functioning harmoniously with large-scale social stability. In western societies the most important fissiparous tendency in recent decades has been due to the new generation of Muslim migrant communities. The members of these communities have been increasingly finding it hard to adjust to their adopted culture due to their virtual socialization into the cultures of their parents and discovery of their cultural roots and the resultant cognizance of conflict between their ancestral values and the ethos of western civilization. Thus producing counter cultures28 in western societies.

Individualism on its part has kept western societies developed and harmonious because contrary to the misperceived conception of individualism, the philosophy means that in a liberal society the individual gets an environment of profound peace and tranquillity. The environment enables the individual to make use of its latent faculties and develop its personality by uninhibited free thinking and action capacitating him or her to ultimately contribute to the greater good and well-

28 A counterculture is a subculture that rejects societal norms/ values and seeks alternative lifestyles (J. Yinger, 1960)
being of society. This is how in western societies individuals have had got a facilitating social milieu and in return they have contributed immensely to their societies and states which have kept their societies greatly harmonized and completely functional.

In Pakistan civilian-military bureaucracy supported by the clergy, never allowed such social conditions like democracy to prevail and thrive; thus preventing individuals from either making efforts for their own development or for that of their society. With pent up energies and drives finding no functional ways out they have had to undergo mutation and find expression in all forms of extremism chiefly religious fundamentalism.

1.10 INDIVIDUAL’S DISENCHANTMENT OF THE POLITICAL SYSTEM IN PAKISTAN & THE LOUD MINORITY

In Pakistan even the political culture has been dismissive of individuals and their interests. This is evident from the absence of representative governments for 37 years of the 65 years of the state’s existence. For eight more years there had been quasi representative governments but headed by a serving military general as self-appointed ‘president’. So keeping people disenfranchised for so long prevented them to express their political choices and install a government which in their view could address their issues and problems and put the country on the path of development. In a democratic polity, which is at the core of political liberalism, aggregation of individual choices determines the rulers, the rights and duties and respective domains of the state, the society and the individual. Due to the denial to individuals the institutionalized ways to express their political choices more and more people in Pakistan got disenchanted with the state and the political system. Therefore, whenever, the people got the rare and importantly fair opportunity to vote for electing a government the majority opted not to exercise their right of franchise.29 Because gradually due to denial of the right of exercising

29 The exercise of the right of franchise among Pakistanis is among the lowest in the world. Since independence, the overall turnout for parliamentary elections has been 45.3 percent. (Mazzera & Aftab, 2009: 34). The turnout for different national elections has been 43.07% (1988); 45.46% (1990); 40.28% (1993); 35.42% (1997); 41.08% (2002); and 44.23% (2008). This shows people lack of faith in public offices and services. Consequently, people have had a tendency to turn to informal systems of adjudication and service delivery, mostly dominated by the local elites and religious elites. This has been strengthening the non-state actors vis-à-vis the state institutions leading to
political choice most people developed a mindset that their vote would hardly matter in determining the political direction of the state which turned them into the ‘silent majority’ leaving the arena of politics and governance to the ‘loud minority’ (Moscovici, 1991: 298-308) of political elite gradually joined in by the clergy. This loud minority in order to maintain its stranglehold over the state and society never allowed a liberal ‘public sphere’ to evolve which could ultimately become a marketplace of ideas spiralling up rational thoughts and ideas and driving out of the marketplace obscurantist and illogical ideas.

The formation of a strong and elaborate public sphere and democratic institutions in which not only the individual but the constituent social groups, especially different ethnicities could express their viewpoints and political preferences, has indeed been critical for the evolution of a democratic culture in Pakistan. This in turn has been indispensable for the national solidarity as well as social and national cohesion in a multiethnic and multi-sectarian country. However, as democracy and a public sphere have been antagonistic to the vested-interests of the power elite in Pakistan it never let them take root and thrive in the country. The ruling elite has had stunted democracy even at the cost of seriously endangering national solidarity. Consequently, the country had to dismember in 1971 while the rest of the country is extremely unstable in the sense that a full-fledged ethnic insurgency is going on in Balochistan, one of the four provinces comprising Pakistan, with the potential of dismembering the country yet again. On the other hand a countrywide religious insurgency by Pakistani Taliban is posing an existential threat to the entire state and society. Nevertheless, considering national cohesion in a multiethnic and multi-cultural state indeed indispensable, the ruling elite find no other way than using the slogan

the formation of a huge political-administrative-legal vacuum on the one hand and a colossal disconnect between the state and society on the other hand.

30 The silent majority is an unspecified large majority of people in a country or group who do not express their opinions publicly. The term was popularized (though not first used) by U.S. President Richard Nixon in a November 3, 1969, speech in which he said, "And so tonight—to you, the great silent majority of my fellow Americans—I ask for your support." http://www.watergate.info/nixon/silent-majority-speech-1969.shtml: accessed on February 11, 2011.

31 The public sphere is an area in social life where people can get together and freely discuss and identify societal problems, and through that discussion influence political action. It is a discursive space in which individuals and groups congregate to discuss matters of mutual interest and, where possible, to reach a common judgment (Houser, 1998)
of Islam to unite the society and state. Understandably the use of religious slogan was not an earnest effort to implement Islamic principles in the form of a legal-political system but to deny individuals and ethnic groups their due democratic political rights and preventing the country to become a democracy.

1.10.1 Individual Interest Dominated by Group Interest

Separately in Pakistan interest of the group, which the individual is part of, has always dominated individual’s interests. The rationale of this preference has been protruded by the power-political elite as that overall group interest would ultimately be beneficial to the individuals comprising it. This has exactly been the opposite what liberalism as a social theory has presumed that it is the individual welfare first which in the final analysis would result in the group, community and the societal interest. Keeping individual interest subservient to the national and social interest by Pakistani state and society is the manifestation of the prevalence of a strong, authoritarian and elitist-centred social structure in the country. In this social structure tribal and group solidarity is of utmost importance. “Clan-based social networks in the Pakistani context have weathered lengthy spells of military dictatorships which typically undermined party organizations, such as they existed and sought to localize the nature of electoral politics.” (Jalal: 221) Therefore, national interest and national solidarity in Pakistan have always meant the reinforcement of tribal and elite-dominated group solidarity. In other words national solidarity in Pakistan is interpreted by the ruling elite as the perpetuation of its power and (strangle)hold over society. In a liberal society national solidarity and national interest always mean the aggregation of individual interests. In Pakistan members of ruling elite in order to justify usurping rights of the individual has often used the slogan on media and through curricula and generally in the political discourse: “Don’t question what your country has given to you. Just ask yourself what you have given to your country.”

Liberal thinker Leonard Hobbhouse also explained illiberal tendency of the state to make individual interests subservient to the interests of society and the state. He wrote:

---

32 Because in Pakistani context only religious slogan could crosscut ethnic, sectarian and other divides.
The happiness and misery of society is the happiness and misery of human beings heightened or deepened by its sense of common possession. Its will is their will in conjoint result. Its conscience is an expression of what is noble or ignoble in them when the balance is struck. If we may judge each man by the contribution he makes to the community, we are equally right to ask of the community what it is doing for his man (Hobbhouse: 1918: 133).

1.10.2 Free Thinking by Individuals

Rather one of the liberal ideals to have social solidarity requires that the members of a society interact as moral equals the condition for which is mutual respect. More importantly all individuals in such a society must have the conditions to think and act according to their conscience, interests and beliefs while their attitudes and behaviours are driven and held by full moral responsibility. Against this backdrop Pakistani society is marked with glaring moral inequalities as the mullah and the religious community at large considering themselves as standard bearers of morality to which rest of the society ought to conform. Further the members of the clergy also have a profound misperception to consider theirs is the only blessed and chosen community that has the divine right to think and act on behalf of the whole society. From the standpoint of the mullah standard of morality, free thinking and introspection is an anathema and cannot be allowed in an Islamic society as it could distract the people from the righteous path. This is despite of the fact that Holy Quran at several places enjoins Muslims to engross themselves in Tafakur, (a word derived from Fiqr meaning thinking) regarding the universe.

1.11 GROWING CLOUT OF CLERICS AND ELITE OVERDEPENDENCE

In Pakistan when the non-representative conservative ruling elite saw the societal clout and influence of the religious groups it started courting and coaxing their members for its own vested foreign and domestic agenda. (Saigol, 2009: 37) Through state patronage and connivance these clerical groups have become so strong that they now have a firm stranglehold over the state’s ideology, policies and thus society. The involvement of many of the so-called religious groups in
acts of terrorism and their terrorizing power thereof; the social influence of the clergy through movements like Tableeghi Jamaat as well as mosque-madrassas nexus; and their nuisance value in the political arena through such groups like the the JUI-F, the the JI and other has reached enormous proportions. Consequently, now for any government it is indeed impossible to protect the minority ideological groups like the liberals and secular sections of society as well as the moderate non-violent, law-abiding silent majority to publicly express their sentiments and struggle for their political and social agenda. The murder of the Punjab Governor Salman Taseer in January 2011 by a renegade Muslim fundamentalist policeman for his liberal views is a case in point.\textsuperscript{33} The inability of the governments in Pakistan to ensure the social and political space to the groups opposed to the agenda of religious groups including the silent majority is contributing immensely to radicalizing the Pakistani society by making people believe that the opinion and agenda of the fundamentalist religious groups is indeed the only and correct social agenda and all the other social groups and individuals somehow have to align their respective agendas, attitudes and behaviours with the political and social programme of the religious extremists.

1.12 COMPLEXITY OF LAWS AND EXTREMISM IN PAKISTAN

According to Bentham formality, obscurity and technicality in the law results in maximum of “expense, delay and vexation to litigants, in withholding justice from great number of persons, and in rendering the outcome of legal processes capricious and uncertain.” (As quoted by Sabine: 683) This is what people in Pakistan have practically experienced while pursuing justice. An important element of Pakistan’s judicial system is its dependence on the personnel of legal profession to buy someone justice. This is basically due to the fact that the laws are so numerous, alien, and mostly written in English language that for an ordinary person, given mass illiteracy in Pakistan, it is next to impossible to have justice without well-paid lawyers. This also makes the pursuit of justice extremely costly for members of the poverty-stricken society. This situation is the very anti-thesis liberal ideals envision. Contrary to that Bentham’s ideal was “every man his

\textsuperscript{33} Governor Taseer was killed by a policeman, Mumtaz Qadri, who was part of the former official escort. Qadri surrendered soon after shooting the governor dead. The killer argued that he did not have any repentance as the governor had committed blasphemy by publicly advocating change in Pakistani blasphemy laws terming them as discriminatory. Qadri declared he was motivated by a Muslim cleric to kill the governor.
own lawyer” (Bentham, Papers Relative to Codification and Public Instruction, 1811) In order to facilitate every man to be his own lawyer Bentham advocated informal pleading before an arbiter to replace formal proceedings that are too cumbersome. This informal pleading according to Bentham aims at conciliation, universal admissibility of any kind of relevant evidence and a large measure of judicial discretion, rather than rigid rules to irrelevance. This is what Pakistan judicial system typically requires exigently because hundreds of thousands of cases have been pending in various courts of the country for years. Even the Judicial Policy announced by the country’s Chief Justice, Iftikhar Muhammad Chaudhry, in May 2009 charting a roadmap vowing to dispose of the backlog of cases pending in the country’s courts within one year has failed to deliver. As mentioned earlier this problem of getting justice through normal judicial process due to its cumbersome nature and costly procedures have led many people to develop religious extremist tendencies by locating justice in the ‘system’ of God and thus have made them easy prey to the radical and terrorist agenda of groups like the TNSM and the TTP. In the words of former Chief Justice of Peshawar High Court, Justice Tariq Pervez, who was subsequently elevated as a judge of the Supreme Court of Pakistan, “If the courts fail to deliver justice soon Taliban would be everywhere.”

1.13 EQUITABLE DISTRIBUTION OF RESOURCES

According to Jeremy Bentham, one of the avant-garde scholars of liberalism, as a matter of policy the law should aim at a relatively equal or at least equitable distribution of property or prevent creation of arbitrary inequalities. Against this backdrop in Pakistan firstly there has continually been no constitution during the rules of military dictators, therefore, the law could not protect even the fundamental rights of people let alone creating conditions for the equal or equitable distribution of property and avoiding emergence of arbitrary inequalities.

Pakistan’s economy and political system have historically been dominated by a relatively small number of powerful families. Land-owning families in southern Punjab and northern Sindh in particular have been able to dominate local and regional politics, and extend their dominance to the national level. Their political power is rooted in their
control over land and their ability to deliver voting blocks based on tenants, clients and shared biradri. It also stems from their ability to link “horizontally” with other elite families. In addition to these families, there are a growing number of military-industrial elites in politics who have used their access to state resources to build economic and political fortunes. (Mezzera & Aftab: 26)

In such a legal-political arrangement the protection of the very legitimate property rights of individuals cannot be guaranteed. Apart from it in such a political order there is no constitutional and institutional arrangement for the formation of laws whereas whatever laws are there cannot be expected to ensure equality or equity in any sphere. Rather official pronouncements presented as laws are bound to result in concentration of wealth, property and societal power. Pakistan has been its typical example. The long years of military dictatorship and the stranglehold of the civilian-military bureaucracy on Pakistani state and society strengthened only the landed class and the clergy. Apart from this being a natural consequence, the military in order to have control over the state and society joined hands with the established landed clans and families. Obviously, this had to be done at the altar of the rest of the social classes and masses as a whole. The nexus between the civilian-military bureaucratic rulers and the landed class of Pakistan has been so strong and symbiotic that a large part of the military and civilian bureaucracy has had consisted of members of the families of landlord politicians (Jalal, 1999). However, since 1980s there has been a transformation in this nexus as General Zia regime under a policy recruited a large number of young men from lower classes particularly families having religious background in the military. The above explained political-power structure and power configuration in Pakistan not only has kept the general masses out of the power corridors but has also perpetuated the arbitrary societal hold of the civilian-military establishment and the landed gentry as well as of the clerical groups, which by 1990s collectively emerged as the new elite of Pakistan. Simultaneously it has led to the rise of extreme economic and social inequalities in Pakistani society primarily due to the absence of ways and means of social mobility. This has contributed significantly to the rise of religious extremism and terrorism in the country. Without having sufficient means of sustenance for the ever-growing number of children a large number of families have had to put their scions and wards in madrassas whose number has been increasing
simultaneously. In these madrassas the children have not only got shelter and food but also a promise of future employment as member of clergy.

In most cases Pakistani madrassas have been funded by public and private charities of the Arab countries primarily Saudi Arab, Kuwait and Qatar. As these countries and their charitable organizations have the well-formulated historical agenda of disseminating the Arabic Wahabite version of cultural Islam to rest of the Muslim World their charity money has had flown down to only those madrassas in Pakistan which have agreed to diffuse the alien religious ideology inside the country. (ICG, 2002: 12) Given this agenda of the foreign financiers of most of Pakistani madrassas, these seminaries instead of imparting religious education to their students, have indoctrinated them with extremely fundamentalist ideology. (ICG, 2002)

Secondly, finding little economic opportunities within Pakistan a large number of the people had to look outside the country to earn livelihood. Due to the unskilled nature of the manpower the only option for these people has been the Gulf-Arab states, where the exploration of oil in 60s led to a new economic boom which required labour from places like South Asia. With substantial number of Pakistani particularly from the Punjab province as well as its most remote and under-developed parts like the FATA and the KP went to these Gulf Arab countries there (Noman, 1988: 157) they have had to explore their religious identities anew. Because for the first time a large number of Pakistanis and that from the lower classes directly come under the influence of Wahabite Islam as well as Arab cultural Islam, which in significant ways has been different from the Islamic beliefs and practices of Muslims of South Asia or the true Islam as such. Consequently, Pakistani workers brought back with them religious beliefs and practices which were not only alien but in many respects violent and extremist also.

Thirdly, with no or meagre economic means of sustenance due to unequal distribution of poverty, which in turn has largely been the result of the monopolized political-legal order in the state, increasing number of people felt deprived. As the frustration-aggression hypothesis\(^{34}\) suggests a large number of people in Pakistan also resorted to violent behaviour due to their

---

\(^{34}\) The frustration-aggression hypothesis, otherwise known as the frustration-aggression-displacement theory, attempts to explain why people scapegoat.\(^{[1]}\) The theory, developed by John Dollard and colleagues, says that frustration causes aggression, but when the source of the frustration cannot be challenged, the aggression gets displaced onto an innocent target. See for details Dill, J. C.; Anderson, C. A. (1995). "Effects of Frustration Justification on Hostile Aggression" Aggressive Behavior 21: 359–369.
frustration with the system. As these Pakistanis have also been under the sweeping influence of dominating religious discourse in the country, under which every social and economic problem, has been attributed to the absence of Islamic laws and system in the state, whose very raison d’être is Islam, their frustration got the shape of violence justified in the name of Islam.

1.13.1 Impact of Illiberal Economic Policies

From the above-mentioned facts and figures the contributing role of mass poverty, unemployment, unequal distribution of wealth and denial of economic rights to individuals, communities and ethnic groups to the phenomenon of extremism and terrorism in the name of Islam is well-grounded (The correlation between economic factors and fundamentalism has been explored in Chapter 5 of this dissertation). It were the typical liberal economic policies of unrestricted and free trade besides having representative government domestically which led first England to emerge as a modern industrial nation followed by other in western Europe and North America.

Liberals historically by advocating free trade and industrialization in the economic arena have had rivalled the interest of the landed classes because landlords have always sought protectionist policy from the state to safeguard their interest whereas the socio-economic outlook of land holders historically has always been conservative. However, it has been due to the absence of liberal economic institutions and above all economic policies which have led to adverse economic conditions in Pakistan. Due to its conservative societal and state structures Pakistan could not develop liberal economic institutions and policies. Because conservatism as a socio-political philosophy stresses the values of social stability and communal solidarity and this brings it into conflict with industrialism and modernization.

The result of this conservative economic outlook and policies has been the failure of the state to cater to the fundamental needs of the growing population particularly in the rural areas pushing these areas in the throes of abject poverty. The extreme underdevelopment and poverty provided the most conducive environment for the clergy to entrench itself in these areas by exploiting the religious feelings and aspirations of the society. The clergy did so for two main but interconnected reasons. The one was to locate its own economic and social base. The other was
to serve as agents of the conservative ruling class. The ruling class in turn wanted to use clergy for two very important reasons. The first reason to curb any embers of revolutionary or anti-elite political movement by convincing the people that being poor, malnourished, and underdeveloped is God-ordained and they should accept it as part of their Taqdeer (literally destiny) by wrongly and selectively interpreting the concept, which is one of the seven basic beliefs of Islam. This situation could best be explained by Marxian words about the role of clergy in Christian society as agents of ruling classes and pointing at the pie in the sky after you die whereas he dubbed the use of religion work as opiate to intoxicate the masses. Marx wrote “Religion is the sigh of the oppressed creature, the heart of a heartless world, and the soul of soulless conditions. It is the opium of the people.” (Marx, 1843) The second reason for the ruling elite using the clergy, also mentioned above, in the initial years after Pakistan’s birth was to propagate Islam as the only integrative force for the multi-ethnic, multi-cultural and multi-religious state. This was extremely important to deny various provinces formed mainly on ethnic lines their due rights which they must have in a federation so that Punjabi landlords dominated federal institutions have exclusive control over the foreign and domestic policymaking. “The largest province, with 65 percent of the population and providing the bulk of the army and bureaucracy, Punjab never accepted Pakistan as a multi-ethnic state necessitating equal political rights, greater autonomy for the smaller provinces, and a more equitable distribution of funds.” (Rashid, 2008: 36) 35

1.14 UNDERDEVELOPMENT, CONSERVATISM & RELIGIOUS EXTREMISM

The economic and social woes of the growing population kept on multiplying particularly the rural areas as most of Pakistan has remained underdeveloped36 due to the conservative nature of the political and ruling elite—landed gentry, civil and military establishment. This has been a key contributing factor in the rise of extremism in the name of Islam in Pakistan. The ever-increasing role and influence of clergy in the underdeveloped areas left the residents of these

---

35 “The Pakistani Army, for instance, has a preponderance of Punjabi personnel… According to some estimates, 75 percent of Army personnel are from three districts in northern Punjab; a further 20 percent belong to three or four districts in NWFP; while the remaining 5 percent comprises people from other regions. Ethnic Sindhi and Baluchi do not usually run into more than a few hundred.” (Mezzera & Aftab, 2009: 16)

36 This underdevelopment has been multidimensional and observable through lack of institutionalization, low standards of life and socio-economic indicators apart from infrastructure availability.
areas at the whims of the mullahs, who could at best kept the former apolitical and dissuade them from launching a political movement for the attainment of their political and economic rights and at worst to impart them extremism in the name of Islam.

1.14.1 Liberalism: a Moral Order

Liberals have always considered social relations between human beings as ethical relations ultimately to be settled by moral judgments. Here liberalism and secularism are quite close to the moral order of Islam.

I believe in secularism. All the great Islamic scholars like Jalaluddin Roomi, who was accepted as his pir by Dr. Iqbal, Sheikh Saadi, Hafiz Sherazi, Fariduddin Attar like icons were liberal and progressive intellectuals. All of them wanted welfare of the mankind, its progress so that humans be free of hunger and disease and people should love one another. The people I named were secularists. They were not narrow-minded people. In Prophet Muhammad (SAW) there was no narrow-mindedness. After the conquering of Mecca when infidels of Mecca used to visit the Prophet, he would spread his shawl for them to sit on, who were once great enemies of him. This is the secularism which Islam teaches.37

Thus liberalism, which is often labelled by clerics and people with anti-liberal bias in conservative Pakistan, as purely a hedonist social philosophy in essence, is equally a moral order which is, in fact, against materialism and hedonism. Due to this general misconception in Pakistan liberal thoughts could not flourish but if Pakistan has to become a forward-looking, tolerant and egalitarian society, allowing of liberal ideals to thrive is indispensable.

1.14.2 Political Decisions as Moral Decisions

Likewise liberalism considers political decisions basically as moral decisions. (Sabine: 745) Therefore, political decision-making must be reached at by free expression and exchange of

37 Interview with Baloch intellectual and writer, Abdullah Jamaldini (Quetta, October 2005)
ideas and public airing of differences or as it is popularly known as marketplace of ideas. One of the main arguments of religious extremists in Pakistan has been that there should be a system of their liking which they naively or euphemistically call Islamic Shariah is also the result of the absence of a ‘public sphere’ in Pakistan which could serve as the marketplace of ideas where the antagonistic but ethical and truer ideas could contest the falsity of religious extremists. This marketplace of ideas could not take root in Pakistan due to unsustainable representative governments and lack of a democratic culture.

CONCLUSION:

One of the central convictions of liberalism, since the philosophy began to evolve, has been that human relations are amenable to intelligent understanding and management. If this conviction of liberalism is applied to the phenomenon of religious extremism and terrorism in Pakistan it would bring forth the underlying causes of the twin phenomenon. In simple terms social phenomena is nothing but the outcome of social interaction and human relations. Then the application of the liberal conviction could immensely help in devising an elaborate and viable national counter-terrorism strategy by managing the underlying cause(s) of extremism-terrorism in Pakistan. However, to make use of the ideals of liberalism in Pakistan there is a need to remove the misunderstanding of people in the country about liberalism. Generally people in Pakistan presuppose liberalism something akin to hedonism, immorality and deviance from a normal and decent way of life. This is obviously not the case. In fact, liberalism vies to promote self-restraint and moderation is not only opposed to hedonism, but is itself a normative and practical moral order which is completely in consonance with the real Islamic injunctions of the Middle Way and Sabr literally tolerance and self-restraint respectively. Liberalism as a socio-political philosophy is moralizing to such an extent that according to T H Green full moral participation in a social life is the highest form of self-development and the aim of liberal society is to create such conditions necessary for such participation (Sabine: 728). This assertion of
Green also clarifies the negative connotations associated with or ascribed to individualism, which liberalism aims to promote. In other words individualism or individual freedom from liberal standpoint does not mean the negation of social life or departure from social morality rather it means the conditions which ensure the development of individual personality and helping it to contribute meaningfully and positively to social life.

Green argues that at the core of liberal philosophy is the idea of general good or common human well-being which everyone is capable to share and most importantly it provides a standard for legislation. This standard cannot be individual liberty alone or the least possible legal restrictions on exercise of free choice, because in order to express free choice there must be a situation and certain situations are inherently so which make exercise of a free choice a farce. Choice means opportunity and opportunity means a society which is not unnecessarily coercive be it in its legal and political structure or social and economic orientation. Freedom has both individual and social facets; it simultaneously means quality of society and quality of persons. In this context it is not possible that just by abstinence from action and indulging in inactivity as well as by refraining from legislation a government could become a liberal government. Likewise, a liberal society cannot be brought forth by political inadvertence. Instead the function of a liberal government is to create the conditions for the existence of a society where the ideals of liberalism could be pursued and implemented. Obviously, a government cannot diffuse morality in the society or inject it in the people by law. At the same time it can do a lot to remove the impediments which stunt moral development (Greens Lecture on Liberal Legislation as explained by Sabine, p. 730). In short liberal policies pursued by the state whether in the political, economic or social realm could be panacea for many social ills and religious extremism and terrorism is not an exception. The condition for liberal policies to perform such function is the flexibility of these policies so that they could adjust to the varying circumstances of time and space. Moreover, in order to be really flexible the policies ought to follow the guidance of moral purposes. They are fundamentally aimed at opening a humane way of living to the greater number of persons.
CHAPTER-2

MEANING OF EXTREMISM IN THE NAME OF ISLAM IN PAKISTAN

One of the serious threats which the contemporary World is facing is the twin phenomena of extremism and terrorism, which actually and potentially have seriously endangered the international and regional peace and security besides imperilling existence of many states. The phenomena of extremism and terrorism are as old as recorded human history but after the incidents of September 11, 2001 in the United States, some of the manifestations of the phenomena under study are unique in many respects. Extremism, fundamentalism, radicalism and terrorism are indeed general terms and in this form they cannot be applied while studying radicalization and conflict in a particular country, region or society. In other words the terms cannot be used uniformly across countries and societies as this could lead one to invalid conclusions; while one of the very aims of research is to come up with valid findings regarding relationship between and among variable phenomena. In order to understand a phenomenon; more importantly to conduct research on it operatinally defining it within its social context is a must.

2.1 EXPLAINING EXTREMISM

As religious extremism and terrorism are social phenomena they have cultural underpinnings. Therefore, like every social phenomenon extremism and terrorism in a country or a region must be studied with relevance to its cultural settings. Religious extremism could be explained as a state of mind, which is prevalent within a community or a people, and thus is part of a society’s non-material culture while terrorism is fundamentally a violent behaviour, which is demonstrated by a few or many individuals, usually as members of a group or organization, is therefore part of a society’s material culture. The terms extremism and terrorism have different meanings in every social setting therefore in Pakistan both have quite peculiar meanings. The terms are largely used in respectively for radical social attitudes held or formed and violence displayed or justified in the name of Islam in Pakistan. In this chapter the terms would be explained at length in the context of Pakistan.
Before attempting to further define and explain the phenomenon of religious extremism and radicalism in the context of Pakistan it is important to have a general definition of the phenomenon. McCauley and Moskalenko define radicalization as a “change in beliefs, feelings, and behaviors in directions that increasingly justify intergroup violence and demand sacrifice in defense of the ingroup.” (McCauley; Moskalenko, 2008: 416) Various theories explain the dynamics of the process of radicalization. In general, it could be deduced that during this process group forces and processes including “ideological indoctrination, repetitive training, and peer pressures” transform group members’ perceptions of and ability to participate in violence. (Victoroff, 2005: 30)

There has been an ongoing debate among experts that which of the aspects of the process of indoctrination are the most important. Moreover, there are also disagreements whether the group dynamics are sufficient to drive a non-violent individual on the path of employing terrorism or whether there is a need to include the individual psychology as a factor to reach valid conclusions regarding understanding the phenomenon of terrorism.

2.1.1 Religious Extremism in the Context of Pakistan

According to Sageman, terrorism is basically “a group phenomenon,” and argues that it can only occur within the context of the group processes [i.e. radicalization] (Victoroff, 2005: 30). Contrarily there are scholars who contend that terrorist groups only target those individuals who have a psychological predisposition towards violence (See Victoroff, 2005: for a summary of this debate). Keeping the interpretation of the above-mentioned scholars in view religious extremism or radicalism in the context of Pakistan thus can be explained as the development of such attitudes at the state, societal and individual levels that all the policies, actions and thought processes of the state machinery, society and individuals respectively are primarily driven by selective and distortedly interpreted Islamic principles and parts of scripture. Consequently, the Pakistani state apparatus, societal groups (mainly clergy) and the individuals, who have
internalized and conform to the prevailing norms and values of the society, have gotten the justification and self-assumed right to question the religious and moral beliefs of deviant citizens of the state and members of the society and to transform the attitudes and behaviours, of those who are deemed to have un-Islamic attitudes and behaviour, in line with the dominant values and norms of society, if necessary, through physical force.

Studying Pakistani society and politicaleconomy with the aim to understand its religious fundamentalist profile and dynamics can lead one to the conclusion that it is primarily the state, society and community of radicals attempts to impose their respective, selective, decontextualized and thus narrow understanding of Islamic beliefs and practices upon the state’s policies, societal behaviours and individual actions, which has transformed Pakistan into an extremist state and society.

2.1.2 Problems in Defining Extremism

It is hard to define the phenomenon of extremism and radicalism rather more difficult to measure the level of extremism in a state, society or community; still some criteria could be set and scales developed upon these criteria to separate radicals in a state and society from others. Insofar as Pakistan is concerned in the universe of this study religious extremist or radical is a person who is either a member of: a banned terrorist or extremist religious outfit (See Annesture for list of banned religious organizations); a non violent Islamist groups like Tableeghi Jamaat (the Islamic missionaries and congregationists), which want others to follow their beliefs and practices and proactively struggle to achieve the aim; members of both violent and non-violent Islamist groups, who reject the country’s political system and want to overthrow and replace it with a non-democratic and unelected so-called Islamic government; and those individuals among the general public, who are supportive of the agenda and modus operandi of both the above-mentioned violent and non-violent groups as well as supportive of the state unofficial and

39 The apparent values and norms of Pakistani society may not be the values and norms of majority of the members of the society rather empirically they are the values and norms of the dominant social groups or if one use the term by Moscovici Loud Minority (Moscovici, 1991) like the ruling elite and religious elite.
unauthorized policy of using proxy Muslim militants both inside the country and outside to promote or achieve certain dictated state policy goals.40

2.2 PAKISTAN INDEPENDENCE MOVEMENT & ROOTS OF EXTREMISM

The struggle for Pakistan in order to have somewhat rational base and potential of success compelled the founding fathers to give it an Islamic colour. Therefore, the roots of extremism in Pakistan partially lie in such colouring. Critical analysis of the struggle for independent state by All India Muslim League (AIML), the mother party of Pakistan, reveals that its ultimate aim was the creation of a nation-state, fundamentally a very much secular and irreligious construct. “The whole concept of Pakistan was novel: While it favors Muslim rule in conquered territory, Islamic tradition has nothing to say about carving out a state from territories with a Muslim majority.” (Keddie, 1998)

Thus the basis of the struggle for the carving out of a new state could be administrative, geographic or even ethnic in orientation. The argument of AIML for the creation of a new state was that the Muslims of India had a different culture and religion from other communities of India therefore, to safeguard their communal interest, preserve their culture and provide them complete religious freedom it was indispensable to create a new state for the Muslims of north-western and south-eastern Muslim majority regions of Indian subcontinent. Moreover, the leadership considered it was the only way to protect Muslims from religious persecution of the dominant Hindu community. Sir Dr. Muhammad Iqbal is generally referred to as the person who came up with the idea of Pakistan as he personally was convinced of the need of safeguarding the religious, economic, political and cultural rights of Muslims of India. But he was equally convinced of the crucial factor of ethnicity in the creation of a nation state. Dr. Iqbal was convinced that ethnically disparate Muslims would have a natural bond rooted in their common religion.

40 In concrete terms these goals include inside the country preventing and hurdling democracy and constitutional government from functioning and outside the country either to wrench away Indian part of Kashmir or compel India to give up the territory and make Afghanistan a Pakistani dependency apart from cherishing an Islamist Empire in the region or the World.
I would like to see the Punjab, North West Frontier Province, Sind and Balochistan amalgated into a single state. Self government within the British empire or without the British empire, the formulation of a consolidated North-West Indian Muslim state appears to me to be the final destiny of the Muslims at least of North-West India (Address at Allahabad India, 1930 as president of AIML cited in Zaidi, 1979: 67).

However, the subsequent AIML leadership after the death of Iqbal (1938) thought that only an ethno-linguistically unified state could protect the vital interests of Muslims of India. Therefore, to give this a practical shape it was critical first to subsume the ethno-nationalist tendencies among the Muslims because if different Muslim states on ethnic bases were demanded the British rulers of India could not be convinced of the creation of such states. However, this was the perception rather the apprehension of the AIML leadership. Otherwise, secular and ethnic grounds at that time, like always, could be a base for the struggle for different Muslim states and the colonial ruler of India, the United Kingdom, having an ethnic base itself, could be convinced to yield to the demand.

A nation-state primarily does not have religious personality, origin and makeup, exceptions notwithstanding. Therefore to create a religious outlook of Pakistan the leaders of the AIML had to assume a pseudo extremist religious posture. The indispensability of Islam for Pakistan was explained by one Pakistani professor and scholar Professor Waheeduz Zaman:

If we let go the ideology of Islam, we cannot hold together as a nation by any other means...If the Arabs, the Turks or the Iranian, God forbid, give up Islam, the Arabs yet remain Arabs, the Turks remain Turks, the Iranians remain Iranians, but what do we remain if we give up Islam? (Siddiqui, Military in Pakistan: 204-206 as quoted in Haqqani, 2005: 108).

A variant of this argumentation earlier was adopted in order to convince the Indian Muslims they ought to have religious freedom without which they could not have religious self-fulfilment. Therefore, formation of a separate Muslim state was presented as critical by the AIML leadership. Because it could only be such a state, lately called Pakistan, which would create such
conditions where Muslims could practice their religion with complete freedom. The creation of
the desired conditions by the state, in turn, required a fundamentalist dispensation. The narrative,
which was overly used by the founding fathers of Pakistan in the following decades proved
instrumental in the formation of fundamentalist social attitudes in Pakistani society. “Pakistan
became trapped within its own history, finding it hard to climb out of its foundational
mythology, the two-nation theory. (Saigol, 2006) In other words the narrative sowed the seeds of
Islamic fundamentalism in Pakistan. “The Pakistan movement and the formation of Pakistani n
1947 embodied a latent contradiction. Although the chief founder, Muhammad Ali Jinnah, did
not favor a religious state, the very existence of Pakistan as a Muslim state opened the door to an
increased number of Islamic interest groups.” (Keddie, 1998: 708) Otherwise it could have been
argued that once Pakistan would come into existence its inhabitants, whose dominant majority
would be Muslim, through free and uninhibited social intercourse, could evolve a system and
society of their liking which could be religious in outlook and even essence but not necessarily a
fundamentalist one. The extent of the religiousness of such a society would depend upon the
democratic choice of its members. But the emphasis of the founding fathers was on the need of a
state which would be responsible to create enabling conditions for Muslims to pursue their
religious beliefs. This bestowed upon the state a proactive rather intrusive role in the religious
sphere and private lives.

Once the state had been carved out on the basis of an exclusivist, dominant, ruling class
version of religious nationalism, it became easy for Pakistan’s successive ruling elites to
deploy religion as a weapon of legitimacy and power. The alliance of religion and state
became deeper over time, as rulers – both, civil and military, religious and moderate –
used religion as a legitimizing ideology and a means of perpetuating class power. (Saigol,
2009: 44-45)

As mentioned above, the term extremism often refers to fundamentalist social attitudes and
worldviews of members of a society. Regimes and governments have also received their fair
share of criticism for following extremist policies. However, any state itself has seldom been
termed as fundamentalist or extremist. The reason may be that the state is basically an inanimate
construct thus neutral in form. But calling Pakistani state as extremist in religious sense is
appropriate because it has been the grand state policy of pursuing a *Divine* mission by using the national power and state’s resources for the promotion of non-state religious agenda and *reforming* its citizens in line with the narrow interpretation of Islam. This policy has survived and intensified over the years. Moreover, these policies of the state have also overshadowed the individual political programmes and reformist and welfare agenda of regimes. Thus Pakistan, although a nation-state, has evolved as a fundamentalist state with a fixed agenda. The role of the country’s ruling elite that is civilian-military bureaucracy and landed gentry, has been central in transforming the secular state into a radical one. Both civilian and military leaders have imposed or attempted to impose “‘Islamic’” legal regimes appropriating *Shariah* to shore up weak governments, appeal to generous Arab Gulf State patrons, or to mitigate ethnic tensions by calling for national unity around Sunni Islam among other reasons (Qadeer, 2005; Nasr, 2001; Rizvi, 2000).

### 2.3 SOCIETY’S RADICALIZATION

An important aspect of the process of radicalization in Pakistan, set in by the use of fundamentalist Islamist or *Political Islam*ist rhetoric by the founding fathers, has been the pressure on society to adapt itself to the state policy whereas the state policy should have been the manifestation of social dynamics and objective conditions. To put it other way due to ideological and functional disconnects between the state policy and society’s values the state has had to conduct large-scale social-engineering to tailor the social psychology and societal behaviour as desired by the ruling elite. This situation has been explained by Professor Ayesha Jalal in these words:

> The very fact that the British transferred power in India to two centralized high commands instead of the provincial and the local bosses whose support they had so long solicited and used to strengthen their raj meant that the institutionalization and consolidation of a new political centre over the Muslim-majority areas was implicitly a question of society accommodating itself to a state whose structures of authority were as uncertain as its claims to legitimacy were vague and ambiguous. There is where Islam proved to have its uses. (Jalal, 1999: 277)
In a country where the state has had a fix agenda of guiding the functioning of society by dictating that the members of society ought to adhere to the official religious ideology the evolution of a fundamentalist society is the natural corollary of such social engineering. The policy of Nazi Party in Germany in the decade of 1930 is a case in point. Radicalization of Pakistani society has largely been the result of similar state policy of imposing its Islamic ideology on the citizens.

Once the state of Pakistan assumed a practical fundamentalist posture and adopted an ultra-conservative policy as early as 1949, when the Constituent Assembly adopted the so-called Objective Resolution, placing fundamentalist guidelines for the framing of the future constitution, radicalization of society was set in motion. The Objective Resolution based on ultra-conservative interpretation of Islam provided a framework for the character of Pakistani state, the nature of state-society and individual-state relationship.

2.4 PECULIAR NATURE OF ISLAMIC EXTREMISM IN PAKISTAN

From the above analysis it is apparent that religious extremism and its transformation into religious terrorism in Pakistan have peculiar dynamics. To put it other way, religious extremism in Pakistan is in essence different from Islamic radicalism in other countries or regions.

2.4.1 State-sponsored

Unlike other countries Islamic radicalization in Pakistani society has primarily been state-sponsored. The ruling elite of Pakistan promoted radical clerical groups to provide a common ground for nation-building in a multiethnic and multi-interest country. The interests of various ethnicities and groups comprising Pakistan have been divergent and non-homogenous. The aim of the ruling elite of using Islam as a common ground for all Pakistanis has been to make the Muslim countrymen and women and the World believe that Pakistani state is a gift of God which the Almighty Allah created to be a Fort of Islam the custodian of which is the ruling elite and

---

41 The first clause directs that the sovereignty over the entire universe belongs to Allah Almighty to be exercised by His chosen people as a ‘sacred trust’. This according to certain scholars was the institutionalized means of shifting political power from the masses and placing in the hands of the clergymen. (Saigol, 2009: 43)
this provides the biggest legitimacy for the undemocratic and unelected rule of the elite. Pakistan support to the Taliban in Afghanistan without which they cannot survive and the presence of Islamist militants from across the World, have roots in the long-cherished desire of Islamabad to be seen as the pivot of *Islamic Revivalism*. (Haqqani, 2005: 317) Radical religious slogans, symbols and groups have constantly been promoted to rally the public support behind the ruling elite-dictated state policies. These policies primarily envisaged collision with India and to vituperate and disparage ethno-nationalist and civil society movements within Pakistan and *reformation* of the society on the basis of religion. Subsequently, the state patronized militant groups to fight proxy war in Afghanistan and Indian-controlled disputed region of Kashmir.

### 2.4.2 Not the Result of Social Forces Interplay

The second peculiarity of Islamic extremism in Pakistan is that it has not been the result of natural societal dynamics or interplay of domestic forces. Empirically and arguably one of the characteristic traits of Pakistanis is their sentimental and non-rational association with Islam. This emotionality of character has not been limited to association with the religion only but many other aspects of social and national life. For instance, the sweeping public sentiment in Pakistan has since long been anti-US, anti-Jewish and pro-Arab. These sentiments could be attributed to Pakistan’s sentimental attachment to Islam. However, Pakistanis emotional liking for Chinese belies that their emotionality is merely limited to Islam as well as countries, symbols and individuals associated with Islam. Pakistani’s emotional feelings for Chinese have been the result of official policy of demonstrating China as the most *reliable* friend of Pakistan through widespread propaganda. Contrarily a close look at the Chinese-Pakistani relationship would reveal that most of the Chinese investment and support to Islamabad has been for the establishment and running of strategic industries and other projects which has mostly benefited the members of the ruling elite particularly the military and help reinforced the elite’s stranglehold over the state and society. Whereas, the flooding of Pakistani markets with substandard Chinese products due to Islamabad policy of completely opening up its markets to China, has actually inflicted huge economic losses on majority Pakistanis apart from having its social implications in the form of a creation of a consumerist culture in the country. This also
shows the impact of state policy and propaganda thereof in Pakistan to make its citizens believe who is friend and who is foe and what is right and what is wrong.42

The sentimental attachment of people to Islam has since the very early days of Pakistan been exploited by the ruling elite to perpetuate its hold over power and stranglehold over society. In other words the religious extremism in Pakistan has not been the result of functional societal dynamics but social engineering by the ruling elite dominated state. “If anything, the state’s palpably crude attempts at Islamic social engineering gave religious bigotry its head a never before.” (Jalal, 1999: 283) And the by product of this social engineering is extremism and terrorism.

This is very true particularly in two ways. Firstly creating these monsters and secondly destroying or weakening democratic institutions. These two manipulations together have created what we now seen as a mess in Pakistan.43

Another writer put it this way:

A brief examination of the post-partition history of Pakistan reveals that virtually every ruler, whether civil or military, religious or ‘enlightened moderate’, used religion as an instrument of the attainment, maintenance and perpetuation of power. In turn, this deployment of religion in the politics of power strengthened and reinforced religious ideologies, as well as, created enormous sectarian, ideological and, ultimately violent, conflicts over the version of religion that would define the state in Pakistan. (Saigol, 2009: 45)

---

42 Under Registration of Printing Press & Publication Ordinance, one of the basic media laws of Pakistan, no print publication could publish material that negatively portrays the ‘friendly’ countries of Pakistan. China, Arab and Islamic countries are generally and repeatedly referred to as ‘friendly’ countries of Pakistan.

43 Interview with Dr. Abdul Hameed Nayyar, who has carried out extensive research on manipulation of curricula by Pakistani governments and authored the book on its basis, The Subtle Subversion: The State of Curricula and Textbooks in Pakistan.
2.4.3 Polysemic Nature of Islamism in Pakistan

Although Pakistan has been labelled as an Islamic ideological state but Islamism of Pakistan has been polysemic as different leaders, regimes, religious groups, masses and individuals have had their subjective interpretation of the concept. For instance, General Zia interpreted Pakistani Islamism as Deobandism having close affiliations with Wahabism of Saudi Arabia without considering that there were very few actual adherents of both schools in Pakistan (Abbas, 2005: 103). He did so ‘inadvertently’. (Abbas, 2005: 103) However, Zia’s ignorance in this respect does not seem to be an apt explanation for his selective interpretation of Islamism in Pakistan. Because on the one hand although Deobandi school of thought has sizable adherents but they are mostly concentrated in the KP and Balochistan provinces rather within their Pashtun population whereas, Zia himself belonged to a migrant family from Indian Punjab. Zia promoted Deobandism and Wahabism (Rashid A., 2009: 26) having his eyes fixed on Afghanistan and its mullahs to organize around them the US-sponsored anti-Soviet resistance. This testifies that General Zia’s Islamization was merely a secular policy motivated by national security interests and US-dictated considerations rather than anything to do with the spirit of Islam. Apart from that General Zia emphasized only on the selective and punitive aspects of Islam. From the standpoint of its own interests General Zia only emphasized on the “regulative, punitive, and extractive” (Rizvi, 1986: 242) dimensions while the progressive and enlightened aspects of Islam like social justice and economic equity as well as accountability of the rulers were hardly or never talked about. (Abbas, 2005: 103) On the other hand masses generally deconstructed Zia’s policy of Islamization or Islamism in general as good governance. Whereas, various Pakistani religious groups from Islamism mean the imposition of their respective sectarian religious conception and agenda on the state and society. Thus it is a well-grounded argument that different rulers, religious parties and masses in Pakistan have their own conception of Islamism. For instance, President Yahya Khan, a public drunkyard, at the time of Bengal insurgency told a delegation of the sessagesionist Awami League Party, according to one of the member of the delegation Dr. Hosain, with a glass of whisky in his hands. Hosain quoted Yahya telling the delegation. Whikeh Mujih, tell your boys they cannot treat the army with disrespect. We must all work for the glofy of Islam and the integrity of Pakistan together.” (As quoted in Haqqani, 2005: 75)
The state’s use of Islamism as a policy tool in Pakistan has had its negative consequences. Gen. Zia’s promotion of Deobandism and Wahabism under the garb of its policy of Islamization set in the process of converting the majority Barelvis into Deobandis a process which has been described as ‘converting the already converted’ (Abbas, 2005: 103). The involuntary and manipulative conversion through propaganda, triggered social and cultural changes in Pakistan, which holistically have had insalubrious effects on the society; for instance, it created deep chasms on religious basis profoundly affecting the functionality of the society.

In the Pakistani lower-middle and middle-middle classes lurks a grim and humorless Saudi-inspired revivalist movement that frowns on every expression of joy and pleasurable pastime. Lacking any positive connection to culture and knowledge, it seeks to eliminate “corruption” by regulating cultural life and seizing the control of the education system. (Hoodbhoy, 2009)

2.5 NEITHER POLITICAL ISLAM NOR ISLAMIC REVIVALISM

In the light of above-mentioned analysis and explanation it is evident that extremism in Pakistan in the name of Islam cannot be placed in either of the two categories as explained by the terms Political Islam and Islamic Revivalism. These terms are often associated to the phenomenon of Islamic fundamentalism and used as standards to define a society or a group fundamentalist or moderate. In essence, nature and genesis, religious extremism or radicalism in Pakistan seems to be connected to the movements and phenomena of both Political Islam and Islamic Revivalism. All Pakistani religious-militant groups have a consensus on at least two aspects of Jihad: “to seize political power and to bring about Islamization of society, which means the imposition of the Sunni Shariah upon everyone.” (Bovin, 2007: 119) Critical analysis of the major Islamic fundamentalist trends of Pakistan brings to the fore the significant finding that notwithstanding their apparent nature none of these trends could be regarded as genuine Political Islamist or Islamic Revivalist movements rather currents.

44 The categories roughly explain types of Islamic fundamentalism but are not mutually exclusive and in many respects overlap.
The apparent political and revivelist nature of extremism in Pakistan justified in the name of Islam is due to the persistent efforts by the country’s ruling elite to present the country not only as a symbol but also a manifestation of Political Islam and Islamic Revivalism. The use of such terms, phrases and slogans like Pakistan Ka Matlab Kia? La Illah Illalah (What does Pakistan means? There is no God but Allah); Pakistan Islam Ka Qilla (Pakistan is the Fort of Islam); Khuda Ki Zameen par Khuda Ka Nizam (Allah’s System on Allah’s Land); Islamic Atom Bomb (while referring to the country’s nuclear arsenal) and many others is noteworthy. They have been used by different regimes as well as political and religious parties merely for rallying people behind them, who as explained earlier has had a sentimental attachment to Islam. In other words these terms, phrases and slogans have been used as herding cries.

2.6 LOUD MINORITY, PUBLIC SPHERE & FUNDAMENTALIST DISPENSATION

Due to large-scale and consistent emphasis within the public sphere by the loud minority—the ruling elite and non-state clerical groups—on establishing an Islamic state putting into place such a fundamentalist dispensation become the central theme of the public discourse and national narrative and slowly become the key national and social goal. Gradually establishment of a puritanical Islamic state become one of the main items of discussion in the private arena and soon become a popular demand.45 Therefore, to feign to assuage cultivated public sentiments, accommodate religious clerical groups and to legitimize its (strangle)hold over the state and society, the ruling elite started reflecting the fulfilment of the demand in the national documents like the Objective Resolution and different constitutions. This study finds that had there been not so sweeping emphasis on religion from the ruling elite and the state the demand from the public and the religious groups for establishing a theocratic state would not have been so vociferous. As one writer explained after the passage of the Objective Resolution “the state now became trapped within this confining ideology.” (Saigol, 2009: 43) On the other hand sans the state patronage the

---

45 Here it is important to note that how the ruling elite and clerical groups total control over the channels of public or social discourse and propaganda like national radio, TV and press and public address system of mosques respectively helped them monopolize the national narrative and to carry widespread propaganda for the establishment of a so-called Islamic state and system of Shariah and in the process provided them the tools to manipulate the social psychology of Pakistanis.
religious groups and parties would not have attained so big nuisance value and public importance.

2.6.1 Superficial Islamist Provisions of Pak State Constitution

In the initial years of Pakistan there had seldom been a strong demand from the public to establish a theocratic state. Consequently, neither in the stillborn 1956 Constitution nor in the 1962 Constitution of the state any elaborate or special provisions for establishing an Islamic state and society in Pakistan had been included. However, a special section of Islamic provisions has been made part of the extant 1973 Constitution. Notably these so-called Islamic provisions are not included in the operational or enforceable part of the 1973 Constitution but are only mentioned in the Directive Principles of Policy part; which in other words mean they are non-binding provisions of the constitution. This shows that the ruling elite even at the time of formulation of the present state’s constitution did not have intentions to establish a theocratic state but only wanted to give an impression that it was quite committed to the idea of putting in place a true Islamic dispensation. However, the goal of an Islamic state could only realize when the objective conditions would prevail for such a revolution to take its course. Nevertheless, for the sake of public posturing propaganda was launched both by the state and the religious-clerical groups to term the 1973 Constitution as the great leap forward towards making Pakistan a true Islamic state and society. The ruling elite and the religious groups wanted to take credit for Islamizing the state while consciously knowing that the 1973 Constitution never had any provisions to establish a theocratic or so-called Islamist state. Noticeably it was the first time that some important religious leaders, with all-out support from the state, played a role in debating and finalizing the 1973 Constitution, therefore, the urge to be portrayed as writers of country’s first Islamist Constitution was great among them. The clerics also tried to present the superficial Islamist character of the constitution as a paradigm shift towards putting in place a Political Islamist dispensation.

When the religious parties’ alliance Muttahida Majlis-e-Amal (the MMA) won a large number of seats in 2002 national elections of Pakistan it was the first time ever in Pakistan’s history that any religious party or an alliance of religious parties could get a big public mandate. Many foreign and Pakistanis took the MMA victory for granted as the culmination of Political
Islam and Islamic Revivalism in Pakistan. One of the key leaders of the MMA, Ikramullah Shahid, explained the MMA victory in these words:

An assortment of reasons contributed to the major triumph of the MMA in the October 2002 elections. Indubitably the US attack on Afghanistan in the aftermath of 9/11 incidents in the US was the major factor in the victory of the MMA. Because people of Pakistan and in particular the Frontier, who have historical links with Afghanistan and they have always remained the torch-bearers of the cause of Muslims of the world, thought the US attack unjust. Therefore, to give their anger against the US aggression a political and democratic shape they voted for the MMA, which they thought could condemn the US attack on Afghanistan. However, the above sited reasons were not the sole factor for the MMA victory. In fact, the failed governments of two major political parties, PPP and PML-N, earlier also contributed to the MMA victory.

When the MMA government passed a Shariat law from the KP legislature and attempted to form an institution called Hisba (Accountability) many observers dubbed it as a culmination of Political Islam and replication of Afghan Taliban style of rule in Pakistan. However, the writer of this law disagreed:

Nothing like that is happening in the province. Taliban had two facets: their system was exemplary because there was absolute peace there. But one might differ with the way of governance with Taliban and the scientific explanation of their attitude was the social conditions in Afghanistan prevailing for decades. During the time of the Shah [King Zahir Shah] the beards of the ulema were shaved off, then there was rampant obscenity.

---

46 A closer look at the component parties, their histories, aims, agendas and political support could provide evidence that MMA had nothing to do with the movement or concept of Islamic Revivalism. Had the rise of MMA been the culmination of Islamic Revivalist movement in Pakistan it must have won more parliamentary seats in the following national elections in 2008. The component parties of MMA, which contested the 2008 elections as individual entities, could hardly win a handful of seats of National Assembly and the provincial assemblies. Instead the alliance broke down even before the elections due to internal strife. The wrangling within the MMA was largely because of the petty issues like allocation of the number of seats, which every party of the alliance could have to contest the elections in 2008.

47 Interview with Ikramullah Shahid, who served as Deputy Speaker of KP provincial legislature in the MMA government (Peshawar, December 2005)
there. So when the Taliban came, they compelled people to grow beards and shut out female education; it was a reaction. When Mullah Omer asked for fatwas from ulema, apart from others I gave the fatwa that you should not closed down female schools and should reform them instead.48

However, the validity and reality of the mandate which the the MMA got was questioned on different grounds. The pre-poll propaganda of the the MMA was labelled by the mainstream political parties, independent analysts and international bodies like the European Union Elections Observation Mission (EUEOM), as a kind of manipulation of the social psychology of the people of Pakistan.49 Admittedly this could not be cited as a concrete proof of rigging. But on the other hand the then military regime of General Musharraf all-out support to the the MMA before the elections50 and the polling day rigging in its favour was aimed at enabling the alliance to win a sizable number of parliamentary seats. (Saigol, 2009: 58) The military regime has specific motives to engineer elections in favour of the the MMA.

On the basis of the unprecedented but abrupt rise of the the MMA and its sudden dilution and the support, which it got from Pakistani military-intelligence establishment, besides the context and events surrounding the rise and fall of the MMA one can conclude that the country’s military-intelligence establishment wanted the religious parties unite in order to create the legal grounds and justification to hand them power in two of the four provinces of Pakistan. The aim was to demonstrate to the West particularly the US that Islamist parties were gathering power by getting united and winning significant number of parliamentary seats. This threat could only be thwarted

48 Interview with Mufti Ghulam-ur-Rahman (Peshawar, August 2004)

49 The leaders of MMA tried to manipulate the religious sentiments of the people by carrying out propaganda that the US-led international forces ouster of Afghan Taliban regime and occupation of Afghanistan was a grand western Christian-Jewish plus Hindu/Indian design in the region to prevent establishment of Islamic Shariah based regimes in Afghanistan and Pakistan.

50 Moreover, they repeatedly argued that the MMA election symbol ‘book’ was Quran and it was obligatory on every Muslim to vote for ‘Quran’. To this all other parties objected and demanded of the Election Commission of Pakistan to replace the election symbol but the military regime did not pay any heed. This was explained as the regime’s favouring of the MMA. Whereas, the military ruler General Musharraf also allowed to consider the madrassa certificates as equal to mainstream education’s graduate degrees to enable the MMA electoral candidates to contest elections. The regime had furnished the condition for candidates of having obtained a bachelor’s degree to contest national elections.
and quarantined by the military-intelligence establishment. The MMA vanished when the military-intelligence establishment no longer needed the alliance of the religious parties. This did not mean that the military-intelligence aim of demonstrating to the World that the religious extremism was on rampage had been fully accomplished. Instead the country’s establishment then required to make the World believe that Islamic extremism in Pakistan had attained militant-terrorist form, which in fact, it had. In this context it cannot be a mere coincidence that in the year 2007, as soon as the the MMA vanished, after ruling KP and Balochistan provinces for five years, the same year TTP emerged (See chapter III how and why it born).

The above-cited examples of the superficiality of the Islamic provisions of the 1973 Constitution of Pakistan and the unreality of the the MMA electoral mandate in 2002 are sufficient to dispel the perception observers particularly foreigners have had, that inclusion of Islamic provisions in the 1973 Constitution of Pakistan were motivated by the spirit of Political Islam. The analysis of the the MMA rise and fall also reveals that its phenomenal rise, misperceived by many inside and outside Pakistan as a significant rather decisive stride towards Islamic Revivalism and a glaring indicator of Islamic fundamentalism in the country, was basically engineered by the military-intelligence-civilian establishment of the country.

Nevertheless despite of the evidence to the contrary many Pakistani and foreign scholars and experts have argued that extremism in the name of Islam in Pakistan has been the typical outcome of the movements of Political Islam and Islamic Revivalism. They may disagree with the argument that the increasing public demand for establishment of an Islamic dispensation in the country has little connection with the urge for Muslim renaissance. These experts and scholars also decline to accept that the growing Pakistani public demand for establishing an Islamic state and laws is largely the consequence of the frustration with the existing political-judicial-administrative system. Evidence suggests that from establishment of an Islamic state or a Shariah-based governance system majority Pakistani means a system of good governance that is corruption and nepotism free besides being transparent, efficient ensuring speedy justice. American professor Christian Fair and associates on the basis of their years-long field research in Pakistan analyzed: While polls of Pakistanis consistently show that “Sharia” enjoys high levels of support in Pakistan, they do little to reveal just what “Sharia” means for Pakistanis” (Fair,
Malhotra, & Shapiro, 2010: 514). This is clear evidence that extremism in the name of Islam in Pakistan is fundamentally due to the failure of political-administrative-judicial systems which has its roots in the political-constitutional vacuum in the country. They further argue that Pakistanis call for Shariah has little concern with anything else “than with good governance and popular frustration with systematic corruption and governmental ineptitude. (Fair, Malhotra, & Shapiro, 2010: 514-15)

Pakistanis over the decades have got increasingly fed up of the extant judicial and administrative dispensations. The administrative structures have been profoundly and extensively corrupt. According to Corruption Perception Index (2010) of Transparency International, which measured perceived public sector corruption, Pakistan ranked 143 among 178 countries considered to be the most clean.51 Whereas the judicial system has been characterized by complexity, cumbersomeness and costliness as even civil suits often take multiple years to be decided rather in many instances they become interminable. Due to bad governance and inefficient judicial apparatus people have faced ever-increasing difficulties like denial of basic amenities of life, absence of opportunities of upward social mobility and improving rather sustaining of current standards of living. This frustration has constantly been growing because of the state’s near-total indulgence in perpetuating control of the ruling elite over state’s policies and through it the state’s resources apart from near-complete indifference of human aspects of security. The field research of Fair and associates to document the factors for support of Shariah from Pakistanis have interesting findings.

We asked Pakistanis to identify a number of features that they ascribe to “Sharia.” The vast majority of respondents (more than 95 percent) believe that Sharia provides services, justice, personal security, and is free of corruption. In contrast, a smaller majority (55 percent) believed that Sharia is a government that uses physical punishments. Given the generally positive attributes that respondents ascribe to Sharia, it is not surprising that few see Pakistan as being governed under those principles and that they would like a greater role for Sharia. Fair, Malhotra, & Shapiro, 2010: 514-15)

51 See Transparency International Corruption Perception Index (CPI) 2010 for details.
Even a large number of Pakistani are convinced that once Shariah is enforced it would miraculously improved the governance and administration of justice.

To further explore respondents’ beliefs about what governance under Sharia would mean for them, we asked respondents several questions about how an expanded role for Shariah would affect other aspects of Pakistani civic life. First, we asked if there were to be a greater role for Shariah, how much more or less fair would the administration of justice be? A solid majority (79 percent) believed that the administration of justice would be “a lot more” (41 percent) or “a little more” (38 percent) fair. A mere 4 percent believed that it would be “a little less” or “a lot less” fair. Another 14 percent expected no change and fewer than 3 percent did not know or declined to answer. (Fair, Malhotra, & Shapiro, 2010: 514-15)

2.7 POLITICAL ISLAM, ISLAMIC REVIVALISM AND PAKISTANI RELIGIOUS PARTIES

In purely idealist terms any movement for Political Islam and Islamic Revivalism ought to be incarnation of the collective consciousness and voluntary desire of a Muslim community for a combination of other-worldly and worldly gains or salvation to be attained through raising Islamic administrative, governance and judicial structures. Against this backdrop the demand for Shariah in Pakistan cannot be placed in the categories of Political Islam and Islamic Revivalism because as explained above Shariah is construed by many in Pakistan merely as a system of good governance and efficient and speedy system of justice, which almost entirely are worldly goods.

Among the Pakistani religious parties the three most important have been the Jamiat-e-Ulema-e-Islam (JUI), the Jamaat-e-Islami (JI) and the Jamiat-e-Ulema-e-Pakistan (JUP). On the other hand three of the most significant extremist-terrorist groups have been the Tehreek-e-Taliban Pakistan (TTP), Sipha-e-Sahaba Pakistan (SSP) and Lashkar-e-Tayyaba (the LeT). Among the religious political groups only the JI could be described to have some revivalist in origin, profile and posture. The group emerged in 1941 after its founder Abul Ala Maududi got influenced by
the Egyptian extremist group Akhwan-ul-Muslimeen (Muslim Brotherhood). Abul Ala Maududi first book was *Jihad fi’l Islam* (Jihad in Islam) written in 1927 (Boivin, 2007, p. 106). Thus Maududi borrowed the idea of a revivalist party from Egypt which testifies that revivalist posture of the JI was not the natural outcome of local social dynamics. This seems the fundamental reason for the party’s failure to win any worth-mentioning electoral victories in the history of Pakistan.

The JUI was the outgrowth of Madrassa Deoband, established near Delhi in 1867. This madrassa gave rise to the Deobandi school of Muslim thought, which borrowed its basic teachings from Wahabist-Arab doctrine but conditioned it locally. After the division of United India and formation of Pakistan in 1947, Jamiat-Ulema-e-Hind adopted the nomenclature of the JUI in Pakistan as it did not want to associate with the new country, whose creation was vehemently opposed by JU-Hind leaders. The most oft-repeated slogan of the JUI has been *Khuda Ki Zameen Par Khuda Ka Nizam* (Allah’s System on Allah’s Land), which apparently suggests the group having Political Islamic credentials. However, as it is fundamentally a sectarian outfit the JUI could not expand its sphere of influence significantly because its leaders have been interested more in propagating the group’s sectarian message and than broadening its support base within the Pakistani society.

In the political arena the JUI policy has been to struggle for the attainment of political power within the framework of Pakistani constitution. On occasions the JUI formed coalition governments with secular and leftist political group. According to analysts, the JUI strategy...

---

52 The relationship between Deobandis and Wahabism can be ascertained from the following fatwa No: [994/834=B-1429] of Deoband regarding Muhamma bin Abdul Wahab Najdi issued in 2008: “Najdi is called one who is attributed to a great reformer and scholar Hadhrat Shiakh Muhammad ibn Abdul Wahab). This great reformist was accused of many things; therefore the opponents attribute us to him for irritating us. It is useful to study the book? Muhammad ibn Abdul Wahab ke khilaf propaganda aur Hindustan ke Ulam-e- Haq per uske asaraat? [Propaganda against Muhammd son of Abdul Wahab and its impact on Righteous Ulema of India] written by Hadhrat Maulana Manzoor Noman. (Darul Ulum Deoband India, 2008)

53 In 1973 it led the government in the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KP) province (formerly NWFP) which also included the National Awami Party (NAP), the umbrella organization of Pakistani Marxist-Leninist-Maoist groups. From 1993-1996 the JUI remained part of the central government of the PPP while it also remained part of the PPP-led national government formed after 2008 elections. It only left it in 2010 after the PPP refused to increase the number of ministers from the party.
since 1990s, as formulated by head of its largest faction head, Maulana Fazlur Rahman, has entirely been dominated by the desire to remain in power and to enjoy the perks and privileges of incumbency instead of pursuing its political ideology. The JUI joining of coalition governments headed by the PPP, a party having a diametrically opposite political ideology, is cited as evidence by analysts to pursue vested worldly interests than ideology. “When Fazl was the head of the Parliamentary Committee in our (PPP) government (1993-96) he went to Frankfurt and stayed at a hotel and left a huge bill of shopping outstanding which our ambassador had to pay.”

In recent decades certain elements within the JUI have also provided support to Pakistani Taliban. The backing of Taliban by the JUI has partly been due to latter compulsion as the insurgents threatened its leaders of physical harm if they did not side with them.\(^{55}\) However, some leaders of the JUI have condemned suicide attacks, the main weapon of the TTP.

Suicide bombing are a disgrace. Suicide is not taught by religion. In Quran, Allah has termed terrorists—those who create chaos in society—as His enemies and of His Prophet (PBUH). But I am unable to understand why madrassas are closed down when terrorism takes place. Will it be logical to disband an entire army if some militarmen carry out a suicide attack or should raids be conducted at all engineering and medical institutions if some of their students become suicide attackers.\(^{56}\)

The JUI-run **madrassas** played instrumental role in the creation of Afghan Taliban in the 1990s as most of the Taliban ranks and file at one time or another studied at these religious schools. Some quarters believe it was Pakistani military-intelligence apparatus which prevailed upon the the JUI leadership to provide its facilities for the creation of Afghan Taliban than any conscious

---

\(^{54}\) Interview with late Maj. Gen. Naseerullah Babar, (Peshawar January 2007)

\(^{55}\) The JUI head Maulana Fazlur Rahman escaped two suicide attacks in less than 48 hours in February 2011 in KP province which killed several people.

\(^{56}\) Interview with Mufti Ghulamur Rahman, (Peshawar October 2005)
effort by the party leadership to make Taliban a formidable organization which can establish a regime in Afghanistan to display its Political Islamist credentials and to make them (Taliban) as the Islamic Revivalist spearhead in the region.

The JUP, like the the JUI, is a sectarian organization representing the Barelvi sect. The party cannot be described as a truly Political Islamist or Islamic Revivalist organization rather its energy over the decades has been concentrated on propagating the Barelvi Sect’s ideology and teachings. The Barelvis justified the “meditational, custom-laden Islam, closely tied to the intercession of the pirs of the shrines” (Metcalf 1982: 296). Unlike the JUI, the JUP, after formation of Pakistan developed a special association and affiliation with the state. The Barelvi School of Muslim thought and JUP’s traditional emphasis has been on demonstrating that its adherents have had more love for Prophet (SAW) than members of all other sects. Noticeably Barelvi sect followers narrowly outnumber other Sunni sects in Pakistan but despite that the JUP could never become the largest religious political party.57 Since 1980s as the Wahabist-Arab ideology has constantly been making inroads into the Pakistani society, the JUP main concern has been to prevent erosion of its traditional support base and increasing conversion of Barelvis into Wahabis. The JUP, which got divided into many factions after 1990s, has vehemently opposed Pakistani Taliban terming them anti-Islam and anti-Pakistan. Leading Barelvi religious scholars have issued edicts declaring suicide attacks, the spearhead of Taliban, as un-Islamic. Many of these scholars have been attacked which has claimed lives of several of them. The most notable of these scholars, who have been killed in Taliban attacks, is Mufti Sarfaraz Naeemi (d. June, 2009).

The above evidence and analysis testifies that with the exception of the JI none of the Pakistani religious parties, who have had any significant pockets of support, could be termed as Political Islamist or Islamic Revivalist in nature and approach. Whereas the JI, although is a party believing in Political Islam and Islamic Revivalism, as is evident from the prolific writings of its founder Maulana Maududi, has limited support base within the public. The lack of a large support base of the JI also shows that Pakistanis generally have not been supportive of any ideological and non-sectarian Islamist party.

57 As evident from the insignificant number of seats which the JUP won in various elections.
After late 1960s the JI has pegged its entire political and religious struggle on Pakistani military establishment in the hope that being the most powerful and potential institution only it can guarantee the establishment of a genuine Islamic state in Pakistan which ultimately could be used as platform for Islamic Revivalism in the entire World. This change of strategy on the part of the JI since 1960s is quite evident as there is irrefutable historical evidence that its leadership strongly opposed the division of India and formation of Pakistan. Under this strategy the JI thence onwards had to infiltrate all the key state institutions including the military, the civilian bureaucracy, the academia, the legal community and the media to Islamize the state from within. (Waseem M. , 2002: 129) “He (Maududi) and his Jamaat (the JI) are preoccupied with the problem of how to institute the sharia, in other words, the Islamic order or 'system', not only 'inside the mosques and families' but also in parliaments, banks, schools, cinema halls, radio and TV stations and so on. (Troll, 1994: 126)

Therefore, it is safe to argue that the JI has its role in radicalizing Pakistan military as the military also has had a transforming influence on the JI (as will be mentioned in detail in Chapter 3). Despite the JI’s massive infiltration into the key state institutions the party has failed to establish a regime in Pakistan that can be categorized as a Political Islamist dispensation. The only party which helped military dictator General Zia-ul-Haq regime (1977-1988) to run state affairs and most importantly Islamize state institutions was the JI. In the same period the general forged a very close alliance with the US to organize an anti-Soviet resistance in Afghanistan. As General Zia was adamant to organize this resistance around mullahs to give it a colour of an Islamic struggle he gave a major role to the JI to organize the said resistance on behalf of his regime. Foreseeing on its part that the successful anti-Soviet resistance would be the beginning of Islamic Revivalism in the region, the JI went all-out to organize the Afghan resistance by establishing a large number of militant training camps to be also used as indoctrinating centres. It is important to note in that period the JI also underwent internal changes. The party which never had a strategy of having madrassas, a traditional domain of the Deobandi parties like the the JUI,

58 The JI situates itself in the line of Shah Waliullah's comprehensive efforts to revive Islam in the Indian Subcontinent and beyond, and in the line of the so-called Indian Wahhabi Movement led by Sayyid Ahmad Shahid of Bareilly (d. 1831) which, in conscious imitation of the Medinan period of Muhammad's (SAW) career, had pursued the aim of recovering India for Islam from non-Muslim rule.” (Troll, 1994: 124)
but during the Zia rule with the US-Saudi money the regime asked the JI to establish a chain of madrassas. Consequently, the JI established more than 100 madrassas in the said period. The state-dictation and non-religious motives\(^{59}\) were obvious as 41 of the 107 madrassas were established in the areas bordering Afghanistan while the party had a traditional base in the Punjab and Karachi.

The JI also send a large number of youths, particularly from the student cadres, Islami Jamiat-e-Tulaba (IJT), to Afghanistan for fighting alongside the *Mujahideen*. Afghan resistance also brought the JI very close to the US. Its leaders consumed a share of the US dollars which were coming from the American government for the Afghan *Mujahideen*. Thus a party which has been an emblem of *Islamic Revivalism* and *Political Islam* in Indo-Pakistan sub-continent served as a tool of the US, generally perceived by the Islamists in the world and Pakistan as the biggest hurdle in Muslim Renaissance and success of *Political Islam*. Due to the role which the JI played in 1980s to facilitate the US in Afghanistan not even the secular political parties but also the religious parties started terming the JI as an American stooge. The JI leaders have not been able to give a satisfactory answer for it becoming part of the US-orchestrated and financed anti-Soviet Afghan resistance. It is supposedly believed that the JI calculated that once Soviets would be defeated an Islamic regime could be installed in Afghanistan which never happened. Instead Afghanistan plunged into a civil war in which various *Mujahideen* groups and the JI favourite Afghan warlord, Gulbaddin Hikmatyar, committed huge atrocities on rivals and civilian population. With this the party’s hopes of *Islamic Revivalism* and putting in place a model of *Political Islam* in the region dashed.

As mentioned earlier the JI has had a strategy of infiltrating state institutions to *Islamize* the state from within but with hindsight and ex-post-facto knowledge it could be safely concluded that the party failed to put into place a dispensation to its liking in Pakistan through such a strategy. Rather the strategy has a huge anti-social and anti-state effect as it has been instrumental in profoundly radicalizing Pakistani state institutions. The failure of the JI’s *Islamizing* Pakistan strategy to put in place a model of *Political Islam* has largely been due to military—the

\(^{59}\) Because madrassas ideally should be established for imparting Islamic education instead of militant training
institution on which it relied to implement it—has had its own strategic vision for the state and it
only wanted to use the JI for pursuing that vision instead of toeing the latter line. Clamouring for
Islamic Shariah but desisting from taking any step in this regard has been the core policy of
Pakistani ruling elite, whose strongest pillar has been the military.

Moreover, in the attempt of Islamizing the state institutions the JI came under sweeping
influence of the military which, as mentioned above, has had its own agenda and policy for the
state, which has been far removed from the aim of Islamic Revivalism; personal ambitions of the
few officers notwithstanding. The military’s main purpose in using the name of Islam and the so-
called religious parties aimed at maintaining its primacy within the Pakistani state structure. This
could most effectively be done by depoliticizing society and governance apart from portraying
India as a Hindu state, whose very and ultimate aim has been to undo Pakistan. These policy
objectives had had required disparaging the institution of politics and democracy and cultivating
large-scale anti-India sentiments among the masses for which the JI has been the choicest
religious group to be used as a tool. More than that the JI played an instrumental role in
launching Kashmiri uprising in 1989 on the behest of Pakistan military-intelligence complex. In
this whole process the JI has clearly drifted from its original aim of Islamic Revivalism and
ended up in setting a new goal for it of freeing Kashmir of Indian control and the unrealistic goal
of re-establishing a so-called Muslim Empire of the yore in India.

The earnestness and dedication of the JI to the struggle for Political Islam and Islamic
Revivalism can be questioned on the grounds that it joined hands with the military, which is
dominated by only one ethnic group—the Punjabis—which used the institution for making
Pakistan virtually a Punjabi-dominated state by usurping the state’s constitution, which at least
recognize in theory the rights of all ethnic groups comprising Pakistan. “Punjab has thus been
associated with the most important non-elected institution of the Pakistani State, one which has
arrogated to itself the responsibility for defending the territorial and ideological boundaries60 of
the State” (Talbot, 2002: 54). The Punjabi domination of Pakistani state has been referred to by
Yunus Samad as ‘Punjabization’ of Pakistan (Samad, 1995: 15). The all-out support of a group,

---

60 It was General Yahya Khan, who during his rule widen the role of military from the traditional task of protecting
the country physical frontiers to also the guardian of its “ideological frontier” (Haqqani, 2005: 51)
claiming to be an Islamic Revivalist organization, to a military, motivated by safeguarding the interest either of a nation-state or of the dominant ethnic group rather than the entire population or for that matter Muslims shows the unreality of the JI’s Islamist credentials.

2.8 MILITANT TERRORIST GROUPS

To fully explore the meanings of religious extremism in Pakistan it is important to analyze how the top religious militant groups explain their fundamentalist and terrorist agenda.

2.8.1 TEHREEK-E-TALIBAN PAKISTAN (TTP)

The TTP in a very short period after its emergence has become the most dangerous terrestrial group in the history of Pakistan. TTP has consistently argued that through such terrorist attacks, which it considers as Jihad against the infidels, it wanted the enforcement of Shariah in Pakistan. In this sense the agenda of the TTP sounds to be political and its terrorism politically-motivated. In other words the TTP has political objective(s). These include to weaken the state’s security apparatus to make people dependent upon the Taliban for protection; to desist the government from meddling into the TTP-controlled areas; to effect structural changes in laws or the constitution that are facilitative and accommodative of Taliban structures in the country. (Rana A., 2009: 18) However, the TTP narrative over the years shows that the group does not believe in Pakistani constitution and its legal system and want to overthrow it. The ultimate objective of the group is to overrun the state and overthrow the constitution and political system and replace it with despotism of their own a la Afghan Taliban. Many observers consider Afghan and Pakistani Taliban as similar in nature, form and approach but this is besides the facts in many respects. Obviously there have been linkages between Afghan and Pakistani Taliban because of their ethnic Pakhtoon origin and make-up. However, the Afghan Taliban Movement has a clear aim of

---

61 The use of adjective most dangerous for the TTP is justified on the basis of the number of attacks it has launched against the civilian and military-security personnel, property and infrastructure, which have been accordingly claimed by it.
restoring their Islamic Emirate (Islamic State or Caliphate) in Afghanistan (1996-2001). Therefore, certain observers have regarded the predominantly ethnic Pakhtoon Afghan Taliban struggle partly as a national liberation movement because Pakhtoons are the ethnic majority in Afghanistan. In contrast Pakhtoons are in a minority in Pakistan. Therefore, Pakistani Taliban activities against the US and the NATO forces in Afghanistan and their country’s security forces in Pakistan, can’t be termed as a Pakistani or Pakhtoon nationalist struggle or even Jihad.

Since the TTP has been joined by the Punjabi Taliban it has become a countrywide terrorist outfit and has made the entire country the theatre of its operations and attacks. Punjabi Taliban also have increasingly come to play a central role within the TTP structure after its founder head Baitullah Mehsud and many other Pakhtun commanders have been killed.

The joining of the TTP by an increasing number of Punjab-based militants has complicated the Pakistani Taliban problem. The Punjabi Taliban comprise basically those militant outfits and fighters, who were helped emerged by Pakistani military-intelligence establishment during the decades of 1990 to fight in Indian-held disputed territory of Kashmir. Regarding these militants former Pakistani Foreign Secretary Humayun Khan said:

I would not like to use the word terrorism I think it is more appropriate to call it war by proxies: you do not get directly involved in conflict, but you encourage and train groups to do so. For example, Pakistan was doing this in Indian-Held Kashmir; though I believe the country’s political and military leadership has now realized that this policy is unworkable. The major problem with this policy is that the ISI used the ‘jihadis’ for a specific purpose… [against the Soviets in the 1980s and in Kashmir in the 1990s].

---

62 When the TTP had been formed no Punjabi militant group was part of the umbrella militant organization. However, when TTP got hold of Waziristan, FATA and Swat-Malakand region (in KP) more and more Punjabi and Kashmiri militant outfits and groups went to the TTP controlled areas to survive and fight alongside the local, Afghani and other foreign Muslim militant groups against NATO-US forces. The militants from outside the tribal areas subsequently come to be referred as Punjabi Taliban by the FATA based Pakhtoon Taliban groups.

63 Researcher interview with former foreign secretary of Pakistan, Dr Humayun Khan (Islamabad, January 2009). Khan was country’s top diplomat in 1989 and also served as Pakistan’s high commissioner to India and the UK. He also worked as Home Secretary of KP province and top officer or Political Agent in Waziristan, Malakand; Deputy Commissioner Bannu and Swat and as Assistant Commissioner Tank. All these areas have been badly struck by Taliban violence.
However, it is widely believed that there is a mindset within Pakistani establishment which still considers the militants as *Strategic Assets*. In this regard Mr Humayun said:

> This belief as you pointed at is definitely there and it is a great mistake to commit. These [terrorist] elements assist you, in time of need, on their own terms. In other words you must be prepared for Talibanization of Pakistan also. Because these elements would not support a government in power or democracy to flourish; they have their own agenda. So if you make them your main strategic asset then you are asking for trouble. 64

In response former ISI bigwigs deny the charge of creating and helping Kashmiri militants.

> If you are talking about supporting the Afghan resistance and the freedom struggle in Kashmir, than yes we have supported them. But we did not create militant groups. Moreover, we never run any militant training camps for our own people or local groups. But of course we also had a large number of people who were trained by us but who gone out on their own. I must tell you that it is the governance factor followed by the decision to fight preceded by motivation. Then comes the question of how many are trained and how many got training on the job (as militants). 65

As the emergence of Taliban in Pakistan was not a natural phenomenon rather an engineered one there is also great confusion among the Taliban regarding their political philosophy and goals. It seems that they have a key political objective of capturing the state but do not have a consistent or coherent philosophy of governance or the statecraft. Even the capturing of the state itself is an unstable goal whereas many statements of the TTP commanders over the years demonstrate that they have international aims. For instance, they want to create a Global Islamic Empire, which in

64 Researcher interview with former foreign secretary of Pakistan, Dr Humayun Khan (Islamabad, January 2009).

65 Interview with Lt. General Asad Durrani, former Director General of the ISI (Peshawar, March 2010)
itself is a very unstable aim. One of the reasons for the ambiguous agenda of the TTP is that even the Al Qaeda, under whose tutelage the TTP commanders have had organized terrorist campaigns, has had no fixed goals and its agenda has been fluid. Many militants deserted Al Qaeda due to dubious goals. For instance, Al Qaeda strategist Abul-Walid complained that Al Qaeda violence has achieved nothing but “random chaos” due to its “hasty changing of strategic targets”. (Abrahms: 2008: 88) Same is true for the TTP as the terrorism unleashed by it has achieved nothing for it save death and destruction in Pakistan.

According to Sarfaraz Khan:

We can have the best idea about any religious-clerical movement in Muslim countries and history through the written material produced by the founder and leadership of that movement. In case of Shia Islam in Iran we find voluminous written material and a coherent and consistent policy. Then in Sunni Islam we have in other parts of the World some political philosophy. In Egypt we have thinkers who had coherently worked. In Syria we have people like Rasheed Rida who brought out some coherent thought regarding Salafia Islam. Even certain Wahabi sects in the Middle East have some sort of political thought. I am not saying whether good or bad but at least a sort of a coherent and consistent political philosophy is there. There is no such policy of Taliban. If we lacked any political thought in Afghanistan and Pakistan especially in the context of Taliban is basically due to lack of academic tradition both in government schools and religious madrassas. If we see the composition of Taliban normally they are rural based, they are not very well qualified in either Worldly or religious disciplines because none of them qualified from Deoband or other historical houses of knowledge. Then writings of Taliban leaders and chief clerics are also very few. The only Taliban literature we find in Afghanistan is the Rasmi Jareeda. So if one feels that Taliban thought is a Muslim political thought then it is but heavily influenced by the tribal traditions not only Pashtoons but also Arab; mostly based on traditions than Islamic scripture. In a nutshell if you explain in one word the political philosophy it is ‘imposition’ of tribal and rural values on the population at large.66

---

66 Interview with Dr. Sarfaraz Khan, a Pakistani regional expert and Director of Area Study Centre at the University of Peshawar (Peshawar, August 2008)
Due to severe international pressure, effective security by Indian military and the War on Terror related issues in Afghanistan and the country’s north-west, it had become impossible for the dictatorial regime of General Musharraf (1999-2008) to continue supporting *Mujahideen-e-Kashmir*. Continued terrorist attacks inside India by Pakistan based militant\(^67\) could invoke disastrous response like retaliatory and pre-emptive Indian air strikes on militant bases in Pakistani Punjab and Azad Kashmir. So General Musharraf’s regime decided to relocate militants from Kashmir front to FATA where they for the time being could be more beneficial for the military-dictated state policy regarding Afghanistan by making a common cause with Pakhtoon Taliban. “Between March 2005 and March 2007 alone, for example, about 2,000 militants from southern and northern Punjab Province reportedly moved to South Waziristan and started different businesses in an effort to create logistical support networks.” (Abbas, 2009)

The strategy of sending *Mujahideen-e-Kashmir* or Punjabi Taliban to FATA has wreaked havoc for Pakistan. Many *Mujahideen-e-Kashmir* turned Punjabi Taliban considered that General Musharraf regime compromised Kashmir in talks with India and thus betrayed Pakistan and the mujahideen. Consequently, they decided to pounce upon the state and its security forces considering the terrorism as Jihad. However, the inherent motivation of the TTP extremism has come from the insurgents desire to overrun the state and its institutions to impose their own despotism on the country and society. Thus the extremism by the TTP is not religiously motivated but is a struggle for getting state power which has political goals but militant means.

### 2.8.2 Metamorphosis of Pak Extremist Aims

In Waziristan region the Punjabi Taliban initially developed intimacy with Al Qaeda and gradually came under sweeping ideological influence of the global militant network. The

\(^67\) Already apart from large-scale covert terrorist and militant attacks by Pakistani based militants in India especially Kashmir since 1989, these militants also staged high-profile attacks like the one in 1999 which later escalated into a conflict between India and Pakistan known as Kargil Conflict and the December 2001 terrorist attacks by Pakistan-based outfit Lashkar-e-Tayyaba on Indian parliament.
intimacy was evident from the fact that one of the well-known Punjabi militant commanders, Ilyas Kashmiri, became the new leader of al-Qaeda's *Lashkar al Zil*, or Shadow Army, following the apparent death of its former leader Abdullah Said al Libi by an American drone.\(^{68}\) The closeness of Punjabi Taliban and Al Qaeda in Waziristan was perhaps partly due to the reason that, most of the Punjabi Taliban groups have been Sunni and Salafist in orientation. (Abbas, 2009) Another reason for closeness between Al Qaeda and Punjabi Taliban was that both have been alien to Waziristan. Moreover, both these groups have had deep ideological commitment to their respective domains. Al Qaeda’s main domain has been global Jihad whereas members of Punjabi Taliban had been indoctrinated and trained for cross-border fighting in Kashmir. International borders have no meaning, justification and sanctity for Muslim militants belonging to these groups. This sharing of ideology provided a common ground for them in Waziristan. However, as Al Qaeda has not discriminated among its targets therefore, Pakistani militants groups, after coming under the ideological influence of Al Qaeda, had to consider Pakistani state and its institutions as a legitimate target of its extremism. Thus ultimate aim of extremism by the TTP and other main Pakistani militant groups is getting hold of the state itself for which the ideology, they have borrowed from Al Qaeda, has served as a prop.

Noticeably contrary to non-local Al Qaeda and Punjabi Taliban fighters the local Pakhtoon Taliban in FATA have never been ideologically deeply committed or clear about the aims of their insurgency and objectives as most of them either have had criminal background or have not attended religious schools rather join Taliban as ‘economic fortune-seeking militants’. As mentioned above the Punjabi Taliban and affiliated groups change of strategy regarding Pakistani state and military has much to do with its new-found affinity with Al Qaeda.\(^{69}\)

History reveals that of the various *Mujahideen* or Taliban groups that were formed with the active involvement of the country’s military establishment to pursue through them the latter dictated state policy objectives in Afghanistan, several militant outfits mutated into self-serving

---

\(^{68}\) Mir, Amir (2010-01-06). *US seeks Harkat Chief for Khost CIA attack. The News*

\(^{69}\) Historically Punjabis, the dominant ethnic community of Pakistan, has been ultra nationalist Pakistani, while Pakistani Pakhtoons have a history of fighting the federation for their rights and for decades waged a secessionist movement known as the *Pakhtoonistan Movement*. 

95
units formulating independent agendas. These groups in order to survive and expand in structure and function started espousing new goals, different from the ones which their perpetrators wished them to follow. Since its formation the TTP instead of fighting actively in Afghanistan, its declared goal, unleashed an unprecedented wave of terrorist attacks inside Pakistan seemingly to incapacitate the Pakistani state; thus negating the very justification of its origin. In view of the TTP commanders the overrunning of the state institutions in Pakistan is a must to fulfil the goal of attaining state power and subsequently to pursue the international agenda of training and arming Islamic militants from across the World. Non state actors like Al Qaeda have also played a significant role in making certain Pakistani Taliban groups to pursue the latter agenda of stateless militancy and terrorism (See following paragraphs for detailed analysis). Al Qaeda was able to have a sway over the TTP, its aims, objectives and tactics after relocation of entire Al Qaeda leadership from Afghanistan to the FATA and Pakistani cities. The US National Intelligence Estimate (NIE) in July 2007 unequivocally pointed towards this shift and expressed the fear that any future Al Qaeda attack on the US mainland would be orchestrated by Al Qaeda leadership in FATA. Like the Afghan Taliban regime which during its rule gave Al Qaeda its biggest base Pakistani Taliban also provided sanctuaries and base to Al Qaeda in Pakistan. When the TTP was established in December 2007 with the coming together of 40 militant commanders of the FATA and the NWFP, Al Qaeda hastened to dominate the umbrella militant outfit. For this purpose Al Qaeda used its old links with the TTP founder head Baitullah Mehsud, who after 9/11 helped Al Qaeda men escape from Afghanistan. Soon Al Qaeda was directing TTP militant and terrorist activities (Rashid, 2008: 16). Osama bin Laden also had shrewdly made Afghan Taliban dependent on him. This he very effectively did by isolating them from the rest of the international community. Consequently Taliban had no other choice but to defend Al Qaeda when came under pressure from Americans after 9/11. (Rashid, 2008) This was the strategy which Al Qaeda replicated in the FATA by courting Pakistani Taliban.

70 US National Intelligence Estimate: July 2007
2.8.3 Al Qaeda’s Doctrinal Influence on Pakistani Militant Groups’ Beliefs

As both Afghan and prototype Pakistani Taliban groups comprise entirely of Pakhtoons, therefore, like predominant majority people of their societies they subscribe to Hanafi-Deobandi school of Islamic thought. Al Qaeda presence in Pakistan ideologically influenced Pakistani Taliban with its Wahabist-Salafist ideology. Arguably Al Qaeda influenced Pakistani Taliban ideologically more than Afghan Taliban. In particular the Takfiri derivative doctrine\textsuperscript{71} of Wahabism-Salafism which labels even those Muslims as kafirs (infidels), who don’t subscribe to their doctrine and thus liable to be killed, has made significant inroads among Pakistani Taliban groups. The indiscriminate killing of compatriots by Pakistani Taliban including innocent civilians corroborates the impact of this influence. Moreover, the unprecedented wave of terrorism unleashed by the TTP and affiliated groups in the country in the shape of hundreds of suicide attacks, bomb blasts, man-slaughtering that claimed the lives of thousands of Pakistani civilians and security forces personnel since mid 2007 can partly be ascribed to the growing doctrinal influence of Al Qaeda’s over Pakistani Taliban. (Bombings in Iraq and Pakistan expose implications of Takfiri ideolog: Quilliam Foundation, 2010) This relationship could also be described by using the sociological term homophily that means ‘love of the same’ or the tendency of individuals to associate and bond with similar others (McPherson, J.Cook, & Lovin-Smith, 2001). The coming of Pakistan Taliban under the increasing influence of Al Qaeda also brought a shift in the minds of Pakistani Taliban regarding Pakistani government and security forces.

\textsuperscript{71} Takfirim is a centuries-old belief that suddenly revived among Islamic militants in Egypt after the Israeli victory in 1967. It claims that the Muslim ummah (the community of believers) has been weakened by deviation in the practice of Islam. Takfirim classifies all non-practicing Muslims as kafirs (infidels) and calls upon its adherents to abandon existing Muslim societies, settle in isolated communities and fight all Muslim infidels. Small isolated groups of Takfirimist militants survived throughout the Arab world in the 1970s. They regrouped alongside the mujahideen in Afghanistan in the 1980s, during the war of resistance against Soviet forces. The Egyptian Ayman al-Zawahiri, the Uzbek leader Tahir Yuldashev and Sheikh Essa, who later form the top leadership of al-Qaeda, were among the fiercest proponents of Takfirim in these years. After the US invasion it flourished in Iraq, where the al-Qaida leader Abu Musab Al-Zarqawi, killed in June 2006, was its leading exponent.
Al-Qa’ida accomplishes this in three primary ways: 1) by providing religious “justification” and rallying support for anti-government militancy; 2) acting as a force multiplier for violent activities by providing specific expertise; and 3) serving as a mediator and coalition builder for militant groups within Pakistan to further al-Qa’ida’s aims.

Pakistani Taliban earlier considered Jihad inside Pakistan un-Islamic as the country is inhabited by Muslims. Previously they also considered attacks on Pakistani security forces as uncalled for or illegitimate because the latter comprise of Muslims. This thinking of Taliban regarding Pakistani military was partly due to the intimate relationship between the two. However, Al Qaeda in recent years considered Pakistani military as an enemy force because of its formal alliance with the US and the NATO in the Global War on Terror and launching military operations to kill or capture Al Qaeda fighters in Pakistan.

Thus once Al Qaeda leadership got itself entrenched in the FATA and secured a control over the minds of Pakistani Taliban commanders it compelled the latter to give up its pacifist posture regarding Pakistan military and civilians. Thus it turned out to be a biggest mistake on part of the Pakistani military decision-makers to consider so-called local Taliban as strategic tools to help the strategic assets Afghan Taliban in order to regain and maintain strategic depth in Afghanistan. In this scheme of thinking Al Qaeda role can be equated to that of a confounding and intervening variable the impact of which Pakistani strategists could not calculate while devising the formula of assistance to Pakistani Taliban. Consequently, the TTP has also adopted the aims of Al Qaeda which is Islamic Revivalism through the use of violence.

Due to the abovementioned factors and the fragility of the Pakistani state, which the TTP has experienced firsthand, its top commanders seem to have developed a yearning for grabbing state power through terrorism. The longing for the state power by the TTP commanders is unrealistic. While cultivating such a desire they apparently lost sight of the fact that without the help of state agencies and the resources the latter have had, which itself helped the outfit to emerge, it would be next to impossible to grab state power merely through isolated or even coordinated terrorist attacks.
Following non-violent extremist groups are also very important from this study’s point of view.

### 2.9 TABLEEGHI JAMAAT

In terms of the number of followers and the scale of societal influence Tableeghi Jamaat (TJ) is the most important Pakistani radical group. The TJ was founded by Maulana Muhammad Ilyas (1885-1944). “Its ideals and activities during the past decades have marked the life of countless Muslims in South Asia and, from the 1960's onwards, far beyond.” (Troll, 1994) The agenda of the TJ is apparently reformist and apolitical. It basically has striven to drive Muslim participation in religious rituals in order to make them *practicing* Muslims. When asked why the TJ emphasize so much on rituals and ignore other parts of Islam like establishment of an Islamic state, its leaders and members argue: a puritanical Islamic state is only possible when majority of Muslims have an exact and spirited comprehension of Islam. In other words the TJ leaders and members argue that a true Islamic state is to be preceded by an Islamic society. In their view the pre-condition for having an Islamic dispensation is the adherence of majority of the members of an *Islamic* society to *Islamic* standards of behaviour and rituals. Thus Islamic society and Islamic state, in the view of the TJ leaders, have a cause and effect relationship.

The modus operandi of the TJ in the opinion of their leaders is simple. However, its overemphasis on one part of the religion that is rituals and the knowledge of *Fazail-e-Amal* (Benefits of Actions) and not on total religion on the one hand won it a large number of followers. As it is quite easy to participate in the learning programmes and missionary tours of the TJ, held at mosques of every nook and corner of the country, it give the members a sense of purpose and motivation in their otherwise routine, dull and worldly life. So a large number of people throng the TJ congregations and join its missionary tours. However, on the other hand the unclear agenda of the TJ has led to the confusion among many people regarding the objectives of the group.

The frame of *Islamic Revivalism* and *Political Islam* can be used to analyze the activities of the TJ and its role in radicalizing Pakistani society. While on the basis of its activities the TJ can be dubbed as a quasi *Islamic Revivalist* organization. The TJ believes in and emphasized on literal enforcement of Muslim personal law and “it preaches the need to maintain the traditional
details of Muslim life-style as to behaviour, personal demeanor, dress, including parda for women, etc. In this respect its thrust is not only conservative but revivalist as well.” (Troll, 1994: 124) To achieve this goal the TJ has adopted a somewhat unique modus operandi: moral reformation and making Muslims practicing religionists. On the other hand the TJ although does not espouse a political agenda but whether it would mutate into a purely political organization is unknown. Nevertheless, keeping in view the movement’s cherishing of an Islamic society and its not ruling out formation of an Islamist state the agenda of the TJ can also be termed as Political Islamist. It is also very important to note that members of the TJ generally have a very special inclination towards Pakistan which suggests that the group has a political agenda which they do not disclose. Certain observers have been forecasting that in future the luminaries of the TJ could declare abruptly to become a political organization having the immediate aim of implementing Islamic Shariah. Given the mammoth number of members of the TJ, its organized structures and its influence within the society and most importantly within the official circles on the one hand and prevailing political vacuum in the country and deep urge generally among the Pakistanis for having an Islamic dispensation in the country, there is an ample possibility that the TJ may finally decide to take practical steps for establishing an Islamic state. If the TJ would so decide the grabbing of state power could be almost automatic after an upheaval.

2.10 LASHKAR-E-TAYYABA

The Lashkar-e-Tayyaba (the LeT) is one of the oldest religious militant organizations of Pakistan and is also known in the close circles by the name Markaz Al Dawat Wal Irshad or MDI. A look at the the LeT origin and agenda suggest it is simultaneously a(n) Islamic Revivalist, Political Islamist as well as Pan-Islamist group. The group’s profile shows that it has always believed in global militancy which such groups dub as stateless Jihad. The LeT was formed in Kunar

---

72 Such a scenario is forecasted because leaders of the TJ have been insisting that the organization would call for physical or armed Jihad when in future the circumstances would demand so. The argument the TJ leaders has been forwarding in response to criticism by other Islamist organizations blaming the TJ of not believing in armed Jihad, which is a central part of Islam, as well as questions raised by individuals soliciting the organization’s stand regarding armed Jihad. Thus it can be analyzed that although the the TJ is actually a non-violent organization but at the same time it potentially could transform into an armed group. Already there is evidence that the group prepares a fundamentalist mindset. “Madaris—along with mosques and public proselytizing events (tabligh)—are, however, ‘gathering’ places where militant groups, religious ideologues, and potential recruits can interact.” (Fair, 2007: 107)
province of Afghanistan in 1988 by Hafiz Saeed along with another cleric Zafar Iqbal Chaudhry. Both were once professors of Islamic Studies at University of Engineering and Technology, Lahore. The mentor of these men was Abdullah Azzam, a Palestinian professor at International Islamic University, Islamabad, who during the Soviet occupation of Afghanistan (1979-1988) left professorship to organize and wage an international *Jihad* against the Red Army. (Abbas, 2005: 210-11) He also convinced Osama bin Laden to come to Pakistan and join the Jihad. During this period Saeed and bin Laden developed intimate relationship. Both belonged to Wahabi school of thought and have been carrying out coordinated militant activities in Afghanistan since late 1980s. Since the rise of Kashmiri armed struggle of independence from Indian ruler in 1989, The LeT has been sending armed fighters from Pakistan to fight along Kashmiri *Mujahideen* against the Indian state. It has also staged several terrorist attacks in India due to which it has been listed as a terrorist organization by Delhi. However, observers have pointed that the LeT is not merely a militant body but having a long-term practical plan and strategies to erect a model of *Political Islam*, *Islamic Revivalism* and Pan-Islamism.

Contrary to the general assumption, freedom for Kashmir is not the ultimate goal of this (the LeT) conglomerate. Their ideal is to provide an alternate model for governance and development in Pakistan, and for that MDI’s Muridke Headquarters (near Lahore) occupying two hundred acres of land, was built up as a model city. (Abbas, 2005: 212)

The 2010 survey by Washington based Pew Research Centre titled Global Attitude Project shows that 25 percent of Pakistanis view regarding the LeT was ‘favourable’ and 35 percent as ‘unfavourable’ while 40 percent have no opinion regarding the terrorist outfit (Public Opinion in Pakistan: Concern About Extremist Threat Slips, 2010). Over the years the LeT has also got closer to the Pakistan military and the ISI. The military-intelligence-civilian establishment of Pakistan is alleged to have used the LeT for furthering its regional objectives and national agenda particularly to wage a proxy militant war against India in Kashmir. In the process the LeT, very much like the JI, has lost its revivalist tinge because the core dispute between Pakistan and India has been over Kashmir, which is fundamentally a territorial-cum-economic
issue. Pakistani ruling elite primarily the military has long cherished to wrench away the state from India to ensure constant water flows from rivers which irrigates vast plains of the Punjab. The principles of the LeT philosophy as mentioned at one or the other time at the group’s website include: 1. attack the intellectual elite (westernized Pakistanis) to discredit them before they even go out against MDI/LeT; 2. Democratic system of government is un-Islamic; 3. Sufism dampens the jihad spirit; 4. Jihad is not preaching or personal purity but fighting in the case of Allah by sword; 5. Jihad is and offensive defense. (Abbas, 2005: 215)

2.11 MADRASSAS, POLITICAL ISLAM AND ISLAMIC REVIVALISM

Madrassas or religious schools have a definite and cardinal role in radicalizing Pakistani society (see Chapter 3 for details). A critical function of madrassas since Nizam ul Mulk Hassan Bin Al-Tusi73 founded the Baghdad Madrassa in 1067 was to deal with heterodox traditions associated with Islam by Muslims and to prevent external negative influences on the Muslim World that could make true Islamic teachings questionable for them (Rahman, 2007:129). Recalling the establishment of thousands of madrassas in Pakistan during the Soviet-Afghan War (1980-1988) and in the decade of 1990 and the political-strategic instead of religious basis of mushroom growth of these religious schools,74 the nature of religious fundamentalism emanated from these seminaries could be comprehended. Here it would be appropriate to briefly recount the reasons for the setting up of the madrassas in the 80s and 90s in the country.

In the 80s General Zia and the US wanted to use these madrassas for the production of religious-imbued militants to fight against the Soviets. After Soviet withdrawal from Afghanistan, Pakistani military-intelligence establishment used these madrassas as militant training camps and indoctrination centres for recruits to fight a proxy war in Indian Kashmir so that India could be forced to agree to the settlement of territorial dispute to the satisfaction of Pakistani wishes.

73 He was a Vizier (Minister) of Seljuk Dynasty of Turkish Muslim rulers (1016-1153 A.D.)
74 In Pakistan there are five distinct categories of madrassas. The categorization is sectarian and political. Deobandi and Barelvi schools, the two main branches of Sunni sect, dominate madrassas while Ahle Hadith or Salifi school has its own madrassas whereas the Shiite sect has established a separate chain of seminaries besides another chain of madrassas run by non-sectarian the JI (ICG, 2002)
Saudi Arabia and certain other Arab countries funded the *madrassas* in Pakistan to demonstrate their leadership of the Muslim World. Retrospective analysis reveals by funding these *madrassas* the Saudi regime was partly following the US interests and partly that of its own. In particular these seminaries aimed at dogmatically countering the rising challenge of Shiite Iranian Islamic Revolution (1979) and spreading Saudi Wahabism in Pakistan. On their part Pakistani clerics used these *madrassas* as their economic base.\(^75\) Those who sent their children, sons, and wards to these *madrassas* primarily have had done so for economic reasons. (ICG, 2002) Thus none of those who established, managed or made use of these *madrassas* had had any Political Islamist or Islamic Revivalist aims. Rather the above-mentioned states sponsored these *madrassas* for their international or regional political aims. The non-state elements engaged in and with these *madrassas* wanted to use them for petty economic gains. Over the decades these *madrassas* have got well-entrenched in the society and become institutionalized in a crude manner. Consequently, irrespective of the *raison d'etre* of these religious schools, they have become symbols and their students and supervisors the engines of religious extremism in Pakistan. The fundamental reason is that the students during the course of their religious indoctrination at these *madrassas*, which at best is based on selective Islamic lessons and injunctions, have come to believe that they have been truly the instrument of revivalism of Islam. This idiosyncrasy and frame of mind of the students of the twin seminaries was clearly behind the Red Mosque incidents in 2007. However, the facts and analysis in the preceding paragraphs in any way don’t and could not overshadow the negative and permissive role of the state agencies in aggravating the Red Mosque crisis in the middle of Islamabad so that to make Pakistan the focus of World attention.

So far *madrassas* students of Pakistan have not launched a united movement for the enforcement of *Shariah*. Whether they would launch it is any body’s guess; but given the fact that most of these *madrassas* were established along sectarian lines, a united struggle from the students of these *madrassas* is highly unlikely. An allied reason is that criminal elements have got into

\(^{75}\) Although it is well-nigh impossible to have an exact idea of funding which madrassas receive because there are numerous sources of financing. These sources include public alms, income from *auqaf* lands, shops, shrines and business investments. All these sources are undocumented and cannot be accounted because no madrassa provides financial statements to the state authorities. Whereas, the value of foreign direct assistance, free books, food, clothes and other material in kind can also not be calculated. (ICG, 2002: 14) However, according to reserve estimates the collective annual funds which Pakistani madrassas receive from internal and external sources is in billions of dollars.
sectarian politics and militancy resulting in “in an ‘Islamization of criminal activity’, and criminalization of segments of Islamism in Pakistan.” (Nasr, 2002: 96)

On the other hand if students of madrassas from sects like Deoband and Ahle-e-Hadith Sect resort to civil disobedience or armed insurgency they could create colossal problem for the society and the state. However, the aim of overrunning the state would still be a far-fetched goal. The students of madrassas may have a model of Afghan Taliban to emulate and replicate in Pakistan but there is a huge difference in the objective conditions of Afghanistan and Pakistan. Pakistan has a colossal population of 190 million (estimated) in comparisons to about 30 million inhabitants of Afghanistan. Moreover, two of the four key ethnic groups of Pakistan that is Sindhis and Baloch have largely remained invulnerable to Deobandi and Wahabi ideologies. Most importantly Pakistan unlike Afghanistan has not experienced ravages of full-scale war, which have ripped through Afghan state and society. Then despite of the large-scale radicalization of Pakistan and long spells of military rules it has been continually returning to the system of liberal parliamentary democracy, which is ensured by the existing constitution and have western modelled state institutions. However, the two processes of radicalization of the military, and the lopsided institutional growth of Pakistani institutions in which the military has outgrown all other pillars of the state and the civil society, has the potential extremist threat to Pakistan. The push of growing religious radicalization among the officers and soldiers and the pull of maintaining military’s institutional hold over the state and its policy, may drive the military to fully use students of madrassas for controlling the society, particularly in the ungovernable parts, very much like it did in Afghanistan by using Afghan Taliban. Noticeably the mushroom growth of madrassas continued in the decade of 2000. By 2006 even in Islamabad, the capital and most advanced city of Pakistan there were 127 seminaries with 42 were being constructed. Astonishingly a madrassa a week was being inaugurated in the city. (Rashid, 2008: 236) This indeed is a dangerous forecast.
CONCLUSION

In spirit and scope religious radicalization in Pakistan largely does not have a reviverist and political nature, as the terms connote and used by western political thinkers, writers and analysts. Secondly, Islamic radical groups and parties with the exception of the JI follow sectarian agenda and have different aims and objectives, albeit radical. Consequently, the radical movements are at best fragmented. the JI although may have a Revivalist and Political Islamist origins, which it still may cherish at the doctrinal or cognitive level, but at the behavioural level it since 1970s has been following a very much Pakistani nationalist religious goal of Islamizing Pakistan and its institutions from within. Presently the LeT is arguably the only Pakistani militant organization of import which can be termed as a Revivalist group also espousing a Political Islamist agenda and has been making preparation for establishing a model Islamist state. However, over the years it has also got closer to the military and ISI and its energies have become focused on Kashmir or for that matter India and in the process has lost its revinalist tinge. The largest religious organization of Pakistan, the TJ, has practically been a reformatory organization rather than a revivelist movement.76 Whereas, it avowedly has a completely apolitical agenda which it has stuck to stringently. However, at the very core the TJ espouses a revivelist and Political Islamist agenda but it deliberately has concealed it so that to shield itself from international criticism, vigilance and sanctions. The TJ at the moment is comprised of ordinary people who have joined it permanently as they believe that propagating Islam through speech and canvassing is obligatory. Therefore, the TJ transforming into a Jihadist organization is likely.

Nevertheless, on the individual level large-scale radicalization among Muslims can be observed in Pakistan, which arguably is the most dangerous trend relatively to radicalization of the society and state institutions. Because it is the contagion effect through interpersonal communication and social intercourse that ideas and practices proliferate. The spread of fundamentalism from individual to individual and groups of individuals in Pakistan cannot be an exception. Therefore, if fundamentalist individuals even do not join any religious party or militant group still they

76 Leaders of the TJ believe that Revivalism of Islam depends upon reformation of Muslim societies.
could be instrumental in radicalizing their social milieu and thus society at large by influencing their peers and family members. This radicalization at the individual level is also dangerous as it provides the base for radical religious and militant organization to fall back upon. However, it is the use of radical religious groups, symbols and slogans, by the ruling elite-dominated state, military-civilian establishment-dominated ruling elite and Punjab-dominated military-civilian establishment that has been at the core of radicalization of Pakistani society. Significantly, the ruling-elite of Pakistan never has had real Islamic Revivalist and Political Islamist aims.

In the light of the above facts and analysis religious extremism in Pakistan holistically can neither be described as Islamic Revivalist or Political Islamist in character. Religious extremism in Pakistan has by and large been the by-product of promoting of clerical figures, religious outfits, religious-militant groups, fundamentalist slogans, institutions and literature by the ruling elite. The aim of the elite has been to present Pakistan as the Fort of Islam and Reincarnation of Muslim glory in order to justify its hold over the state and its policies and thus to keep itself in power by labelling its members as custodians of the Fort of Islam and those who wage Jihad Fe Sabi Illah (Jihad in the way of Allah). Moreover, the ruling elite largely serving the interest of the largest ethnic group, the Punjabis, and partially a class interest has used, religious fundamentalist organizations, figures and slogans to deny political, constitutional and above all economic rights to rest of the ethnic groups and classes by terming ethnic differences and rights as un-Islamic and arguing that Islam calls for pooling of resources of Muslims to be used for the welfare of all Muslims collectively. Moreover, in the country certain revivalist and political organizations emerged like the JI and the LeT but over the period of time they have had gone closer to the military and in the process furthered the latter aims and objectives while compromising that of their own. Groups like the TTP although has staged large-scale terrorism and violence but is bereft of any religious ideology or literature and direction. Therefore, it cannot be labelled as a genuine extremist movement. However, it is the growing radicalization of the state institutions particularly the military due to the reverse influence of religious, militant

---

77 Therefore, this may not be a coincidence that under Pakistani constitution financial resources from all the provinces and territories are amassed by the federal government through the mechanism called Federal Divisible Pool (FDP) and then it is distributed on the basis of population in which the most populous province, the Punjab, has been getting the lion’s share.
organizations; radicalization of the individual Pakistani and the metamorphosis of groups like TTP that pose the biggest challenge and this phenomena have the potential to transform into some kind of an Islamist Revivalist or Political Islamic movement in the future. Importantly, Pakistani military-dominated ruling elite has been a common denominator for facilitating the emergence of many of the religious extremist organizations. But as mentioned earlier the ruling elite itself never believed in the ideals and aims of Islamic Revivalism and Political Islam as it would be tantamount to surrendering state power to the religious elite.

The next chapter documents the factual history of the processes of the rise, pervasion and proliferation of extremism in the name of Islam in the Pakistani society.
CHAPTER 3
RISE & PERVASION OF EXTREMISM IN THE NAME OF ISLAM IN PAKISTAN

Extremism has many forms and manifestations and it has always been a source of multifarious problems on individual, community, societal and international levels on the one hand and on the behavioural and psychological levels on the other hand. One of the broad categories of extremism is political-ideological fundamentalism which even on many occasions triggered major global conflicts and international wars. In Germany the Nazi Party agenda of Fuehrer Adolph Hitler in 1930s and 1940s and Fascism of Benito Mussolini in Italy contemporaneously are epic examples of politico-ideological and racist extremism. Religious fundamentalism is one of the many forms of extremism and in our age arguably the most significant one. Religious fundamentalism could be placed in the category of political-ideological extremism.

At the outset of the 21st Century the religious or denominational extremism has seriously threatened global peace and security. Al Qaeda spearheaded so-called Islamic extremism whose highpoint was the September 11, 2001 terrorist attacks in the United States are the cases in point. The US reaction in the shape of Global War on Terror (GWoT) also has had a Christian fundamentalist character mainly because the country’s president at the time, George W. Bush, himself belonged to the radical Christian group, neoconservatives. Bush translated his personal Christian radical beliefs into his statecraft which brought the World to the brink of a virtual clash between major religions of the World and their adherents. Many in the Christian countries called for launching crusades against Muslims whereas thousands of Muslims demanded launching Jihad against the Western countries specifically the US. Even in otherwise tolerant societies like the West there have been instances which aggravated the situation like the incident of burning of Quran by a Christian pastor. Even at a US military academy cadets were taught the possibility

---

78 The pastor Terry Jones, who was associated with the Christian Dove World Outreach Center in Gainesville, Florida, U.S. Jones in July 2010, announced he would burn 200 copies of the Quran on the 2010 anniversary of the September 11 attacks. Jones's threat triggered widespread protests in the Muslim countries while claimed the lives of 20 people. Executing his threat on March 20, 2011, Jones held a so-called "trial of the Quran" in his Gainesville church. He declared the scriptures “guilty” of "crimes against humanity," and symbolically burned it in the church sanctuary. Renewed widespread protests broke out in Muslim countries which killed tens of people.
of bombing Mecca and Medina, Islam holiest cities located in Saudi Arabia. The academy taught the cadets ‘Hiroshima’ tactics to wipe out entire cities which may be required to shield Americans in a ‘total war’ against the world’s 1.4 billion Muslims. (Garner, 2012)

The above mentioned US policy and incidents have been too meaningful at a time when the thesis of the conflict between and among religions termed as *Clash of Civilizations* by political scientist Samuel P. Huntington have had many believers in both the Christian and Muslim world. The basic premise of his treatise is that people's cultural and religious identities will be the primary source of conflict in the post-Cold War world. (Huntington, 1996)

This chapter is about religious or doctrinal extremism in Pakistan. It explores the history of the rise of fundamentalism in the name of Islam in Pakistan. Pakistan since 2007 has faced worst-ever extremism, terrorism and insurgency by fundamentalist Muslim groups. Tehreek-e-Taliban Pakistan (TTP) or Pakistani Taliban Movement and Al Qaeda, acting in concert, have spearheaded this unprecedented Muslim extremist-terrorist wave in Pakistan. Pakistani state and society have got so much radicalized in the name of Islam that international community increasingly define Pakistan as ‘Islamist’, ‘rogue’ ‘radical’, ‘authoritarian’ and ‘Talibanized.’ (Shafqat, 2007: XV)

The chapter focuses on how Islam became compulsion of the ruling-elite of Pakistan both for national integration and for meeting the challenge of perceived enemies of the state and of the elite. The chapter is based on the findings that Muslim clerical groups and Islamic institutions have been used by the ruling elite for the above-mentioned aims whereas in the process the situation has been manipulated by the clerics to their utter individual and group advantage. The chapter explains how the Frankenstein of Muslim extremism and terrorism has grown so huge that both the state and society have fallen prey to it. The chapter also documents the factual history of processes, events and incidents which give rise to and allowed pervasion of religious extremism and terrorism in Pakistan.

According to official figures by September 2011 a total of 40,309 Pakistanis, both military and civilian, had lost their lives in militant and terrorist attacks by TTP, Al Qaeda and affiliated groups largely in reaction to Islamabad’s becoming part of the GWoT. Those killed by the Taliban insurgents include some important figures like former prime minister and head of the largest Pakistani political party, Pakistan People’s Party. Thus the Muslim terrorist-insurgent
group violence since 2007 has proved the deadliest insurgency in Pakistan’s history waged in the name of Islam. The chapter shows that the terrorism by Muslim fundamentalist groups in Pakistan since 2007 is the outgrowth and the upshot of Islamic extremism that had been growing in the country in the last many decades.

According to the findings of this study the underlying reason for the rise and spread of religious extremism in Pakistan has been political vacuum in the country (see Chapter 6 for detail description and analysis). After independence, when the overseeing eye of the British colonial rulers of India, belonging to the World oldest democracy, as well as their role of being the final arbiter of power in the sub-continental affairs, was no longer there, the landowning elite politicians of the new state of Pakistan, having no love or regard for democracy, suddenly found the whole state to run as their personal or family estate. Taking advantage of their inefficiency and lack of political foresight the well-educated and highly-trained civilian bureaucrats gradually took hold of the state from these landowners-turned accidental politicians. Resultantly, in order to strengthen their hold over power the visionless core ruling elite of Pakistan started fostering the military to get its favour (Rizvi, 2000: 78) without foreseeing that the military once entrench itself in the new state would try to encroach upon and ultimately eliminate the political arena altogether. Most of these landowning elite so-called politicians and their families belonged to the Punjab, the most populated and irrigated province of the then West Pakistan which added a new dimension to the power configuration and struggle for power in the new state. One outcome of this situation was that the multi-ethnic Pakistani state became an overly-centralized state instead of evolving into a true federation, which could only be formed by putting in place a democratic dispensation as a result of an institutionalized social contract among different ethnicities, communities and social groups. Such a social contract in turn was the only guarantee of Pakistan becoming a functional and welfare federal state. “Highly centralized and unrepresentative governance has created grievances among different ethnic groups, and the state has yet to create any institutional mechanisms for dealing with such discontent.” (Haqqani, 2005: 315) “Almost fifty-five years after its creation, Pakistan remains a state of five tribes in search of a national identity.” (Chellaney, Winter 2001-2002: 103)
3.1 POWER STRUGGLE, POLITICAL INSTABILITY AND FAILURE IN CONSTITUTION MAKING & INSTITUTION BUILDING

Another outcome of the undemocratic ruling elite incomprehension and hatred for a democratic culture was the engagement of its members in an internal cutthroat power struggle. “Pakistan had seven prime ministers and eight cabinets during 1947-58. They belonged to different political parties and bitterly criticized each other’s policies...” (Rizvi, 2000: 57) This situation prevented the establishment of democratic institutions and their flourishing in the new state. This can be gauged from the fact that in the formative phase of the new state for nine long years the makeshift legislature, which had been transformed into a ‘constitution-making assembly’ almost failed to formulate a constitution. From 1948 to 1954, the Constituent Assembly met, on average, for only 16 days a year to frame a constitution. “The average attendance consisted of forty-six members, hardly an indication of urgency” (Sayeed, 1960: 10) although, it did give guiding principles or framework for the future constitution and composition of the state.

The framework which the constituent assembly gave and called Objective Resolution⁷⁹ was profoundly conservative and religious in orientation. Ayesha Jalal analyzing the gist of Objective Resolution explains the main clauses as:

The state would be based on Islamic principles of democracy’ there would be freedom, equality, tolerance and social justice for all, including the minorities. Yet at the same time it would be the duty of the state to ensure that Muslims at various levels of society lived in accordance with the teaching of Islam. (Jalal, 1999: 286)

The impact of the resolution was documented in these words by Tahir Kamran:

Objective Resolution in 1949 was a significant stride towards the state of ambivalence, this resolution allowed undue space to the religious element into the social and political setting of Pakistan. Thereby the plural and secular spirit of democracy was mauld and

⁷⁹ The Objectives Resolution was adopted on March 12, 1949 by the Constituent Assembly of Pakistan. The resolution, proposed by the then Prime Minister, Liaquat Ali Khan, proclaimed that the future constitution of Pakistan would not be entirely Western in scope and character but would mainly base on the Islamic ideology and tenets of Islamic democracy.
badly distorted. Consequently political instability and authoritarianism became an abiding feature. It led to a socio-political menace of religious fundamentalism and sectarian chasm in the 1980s and 90s. (Kamran, 2007: 10)

In 1956 when the constitutional assembly did formulate the first constitution for Pakistan it could never come into vogue as by that time the civilian-military bureaucracy, taking full advantage of the political instability and vacuum in the newly established state, had tightened its grip over the power of the state. Even during the preceding nine years several ex bureaucrats served as prime ministers and governor generals to oversee the functioning of the government and the assembly. Bureaucrats were able to capture the top governmental positions of Pakistan in the first decade by manipulating the legislature and by pitting one group of so-called politicians against the other. (Ziring, 1997:99) Gradually military overtook civilian bureaucracy to become the strongest state institution by 1958 and when ex bureaucrat Iskander Mirza, who was then the president of the country, dissolved the constitutional assembly he had the full support of Commander in Chief (CNC) of the military, General Ayub Khan. However, within days of the legislature’s dismissal General Ayub forced Mirza to relinquish the office of president and staged a full-fledge coup to takeover the reins of government. For the first time military emerged as the repository of all state powers in Pakistan. Although General Ayub in order to have political legitimacy formed the 1962 Constitution and also enforced but it could not sow the seeds of democracy and also could not provide the state the much-needed stability.

3.2 Oligarchy Employing of Islamist Slogan

In the atmosphere of extreme political instability democracy and constitutional government could be the most important institutions to establish a true federal state, to govern the multiethnic society and building the nation. But formation of democratic institutions was unacceptable to the ruling elite of Pakistan. Still nation-building had to be done for which the only other available, although dysfunctional, course was engineered stability through the elusive slogan of Islam, as it crosscut ethnic, sectarian and class divisions. The use of religion by the ruling elite for the purposes of nation-building has been there since Pakistan got independence. (Haqqani, 2005: 2) Rather the idea of using the religious slogan to form public opinion in favour or against an issue,
community or situation was not something new in the context of Indian subcontinent particularly for Muslims. Already during the movement for independence against British imperialists the mother party of Pakistan, All India Muslim League (AIML), used the slogan of the necessity of a ‘Muslim’ State to be governed under Islamic laws for the Muslims of India, with miraculous success. Jinnah and most of his followers were profoundly westernized but they chose Islamic rhetoric for electioneering in the 1946 polls. (Haqqani, 2005: 7) The use of Islam as a slogan by AIML provided a justification for carving out the state of Pakistan by dividing the centuries old Indian Union. Thus the ruling elite of initial era of Pakistan comprising accidental or unreal politicians subsequently joined in by the civilian and military bureaucracy, got convinced of the strength and potential of Islamic slogan to manipulate the religious feelings of deeply sentimental and gullible population.

Thus the ruling elite since the very early days employed the slogans of Muslim Unity and Islamic Governance for their own vested interest and also to cultivate anti-India feelings among the masses. One of the sections of secular politicians, who were considered by the ruling elite as impediment in the way of realization of their vested interests, as they had been asking for the rights of smaller ethnic and non-elite social groups, were labelled by the ruling elite through clerics as traitors of Islam and conspiring against the unity of Islamic Pakistan (Haqqani, 2005: 316), a gift of God on earth. Saeed Shafqat has fairly described how the use of slogans of Muslim Unity could neutralize demands for ethnic and class rights in the context of Pakistan. Pakistani identity at least can be interpreted in three ways keeping in view how three different interest groups or schools define it. The first school contends as the very raison d’être of Pakistan was Islam; therefore, the same provides the disparate nation the cementing force. Moreover, that agreeing on Islam’s central role could automatically leads to subsuming of ‘ethnic diversity’ and ‘multilingualism’ and thus religion could be an antidote for ethno-nationalism as well as political-economic and social maladies. (Shafqat, 2007: xxiii)

3.4 RULING ELITE PERCEIVED CHALLENGES TO NATIONAL BUILDING

In the atmosphere of political fragmentation and social anomic challenges to nation-building from within and without were massive. India on the one hand was expressing the desire of reuniting the Indian subcontinent (Mahmood, 2000:185); Afghanistan was laying claim to vast
Pakistani territory (Ziring, 1997: 89; Mahmood, 2000: 223) and internally sub-nationalist movements vied for separatism. (Mahmood, 2000: 147) This environment necessitated for the ruling elite to vociferously employ Islamic slogans to present Islam as the *raison d’être* of Pakistan and its very survival. The propaganda of associating Pakistan with Islam and also Islam with Pakistan for the first time worked spectacularly when a large number of Pashtoon tribesmen from the border regions volunteered to fight the forces of Kashmiri ruler *Mahrajha* Hari Singh (a Hindu) backed by Indian military in the Kashmir. These tribesmen got carried away by the official Pakistani propaganda, which portrayed fighting the Kashmiri ruler and Indian forces as *Jihad* because a non-Muslim ruler had held hostage a Muslim population and occupied a Muslim land. Thousands of tribal volunteers of Federally Administered Tribal Areas, the majority of whom were from Waziristan, went to Kashmir and were able to occupy a large chunk of the princely state’s territory by driving out the forces of *Mahrajha*. (Ziring, 1997: 95) This liberated territory since then has been in the possession of Pakistan and officially called as *Azad* (Freed) Kashmir. The tribal volunteers in 1948 were all poised to capture Srinagar, the capital of Kashmir, but Indian government taking of the issue to the United Nations Security Council (UNSC) resulted in a ceasefire. Official propaganda must have led tribal militiamen to Kashmir but it was also partially due to the internal psychodynamics of these Pashtoon tribesmen primarily their sentimental association with Islam and violent national character which played a role in driving them to Kashmir for *Jihad*.

The lesson which Pakistani civilian bureaucracy and particularly the military leadership learnt from the events of tribesmen march towards Kashmir for Jihad was that people could be motivated in the name of Islam and *Jihad* for the attainment of goals set by the ruling elite for the state. At the time the Pakistani ruling elite carried out propaganda that Hindus were mistreating Muslim majority in Kashmir and solicited help from the people but it did not indulge in social engineering to create militants which it has resorted to repeatedly since 1970s through militant-*madrassas*. The episode of a large number of tribesmen from FATA, who volunteered in 1948 to fight in Kashmir, is cited as the reason by the military and intelligence agencies to

---

80 This study finds Pakthun cultural character and the community’s sentimental attachment to Islam as a factor in religious extremism-terrorism in Pakistan. The relationship between Pakthun cultural dynamics, the community’s worldview and fundamentalism in the name of Islam in Pakistan has been analyzed in detail in Chapter 5.
deflect the criticism by arguing that it was basically not their idea to create militants to use them in cross border fighting.

Nothing of that sort (social engineering) we did; we were not capable of doing so. Whatever happened is the result of good or bad policies and not of any social engineering. For instance, when the tribesmen from the FATA particularly Waziristan in 1948 had decided to raise a lashkar and proceed to Kashmir to liberate it then no one had engineered the situation.81

However, India argued that Pakhtun tribesmen were used as proxies by Pakistan to dislodge Hari Singh’s rule in 1948. But Delhi could not provide any evidence to substantiate its allegation. It seems that more than any thing to do with facts Indian stand was the consequence of historical psychological fear of attacks by Pakhtun warriors. (Racine, 2002: 212)

Arguably it was for the first time that the ruling elite also came to realize the potential of FATA and its inhabitants to attain the goals they set for the state and through them attaining their vested interest. The social engineering carried out by the Pakistani establishment in the FATA afterwards has been in the light of the earlier experience. The establishment in the 1980s used the region as a base for anti-Soviet Afghan resistance and in the 1990 and afterwards made it the biggest redoubt for Afghan Taliban and the global Jihadists to train and launch attacks against US-NATO forces in Afghanistan.

3.5 RULING ELITE PROBLEM OF LEGITIMACY AND ISLAM

The ruling elite of Pakistan faced the problem of legitimacy since the very early period after the birth of the new country. The successive regimes were unelected and did not have a constitutional cover and were being manipulated by the civilian bureaucracy and in a number of instances being headed by serving and retired bureaucrats.

---

81 Interview with ex Director General ISI, Lt. General Asad Durrani (Islamabad, April 2010)
Although the postcolonial elite never intended to create an Islamic state on the basis of the Islamic law (shari’at), the close linkage between the nation and Islam has intensified public debates on the meaning of Islam. Islam has become important to legitimize authority, to reform society, as well as to resist state policies and protest state corruption. (Racine, 2002: 344)

Moreover, members of Pakistani ruling elite also used the name of Islam to enter the corridors of power and to disparage and bring into disrepute those who they considered as their enemies. For instance in early 1950s the then Chief Minister of the Punjab, Mumtaz Daulatana, was eyeing the office of federal finance minister, then occupied by Sir Zafarullah Khan, a Qadiani, used Islam for his personal interest. The Punjab chief minister, Mumtaz Daulatana in 1953 used his province secret service personnel to foment anti-Qadiani riots in Lahore by manipulating the Muslim religious community. The chief minister wanted to create a situation for the central government which would ensure its fall. (Haqqani, 2005: 20-21) These riots led to the imposition of Martial Law in Lahore. As Lahore was a cosmopolitan city the ruling elite must have realized that religious slogan equally worked in an urban centre as it worked in FATA. In other words the use of the name of Islam to deceive and mislead the masses could be equally potent in both ultraconservative and remote environment and parts of the country as well as in developed and mainland Pakistan; thus its impact has been omnipotent in the context of Pakistan. The Lahore riots also for the first time sucked in military into civilian affairs of the country and gave it a taste of power.

Another incident when the ruler used Islam to publicly disregard its rival was when in 1963 military dictator, General Ayub Khan, in search of legitimacy decided to hold sham elections to elect himself to the office of president, which he occupied through self-appointment in October 1958. As this manner of getting the office was totally unconstitutional and illegal the genuine democratic political groups making use of the rare opportunity of elections decided to challenge the military general. A woman of high respect, Miss Fatima Jinnah, came up as a consensus

---

Qadianis consider themselves Muslims but do not believe that Prophet Muhammad (SAW) is the last prophets, which contradicts the core belief of Islam. Instead Qadianis give the group’s founder, Mirza Ghulam Ahmed Qadiani, the status of a prophet.
candidate to contest against the general in elections of 1965. Seeing her popularity General Ayub Khan felt that he might lose elections thus he resorted to propaganda through clerics that a woman cannot become a president in an Islamic state as it is against the teachings of the religion. (Rashid A., 2009: 19; Saigol, 2009: 48) This was despite of the fact that neither Pakistan was an Islamic state nor the general was an Amir-ul-Momineen (Leader of the faithful) and the elections were being held in a purely western fashion. General Ayub Khan was not a religious person but at the same time he was not a secularist either and was also not against using Islam as a state ideology. (Haqqani, 2005: 41) While carrying out propaganda that a woman is unqualified to become a president the general even did not take into consideration that the woman in question was extremely revered figure and was the recipient of the title of Mother of Pakistani Nation as she was the sister of Pakistan’s founder Muhammad Ali Jinnah and herself had been in the forefront for the struggle of Pakistan. The general also resorted to the use of religion to personify Pakistan as modern Islam, to make military power acceptable domestically and as an anti-India slogan. (ICG, 2002)

3.6. ISLAM & RULING ELITE URGE TO PERPETUATE HOLD OVER STATE & SOCIETY

Apart from the purposes of nation-building and engineering stability the ruling elite also employed the Islamic slogan because in this manner its members could conceal their real motives of perpetuating their stranglehold over the state and society. Whereas, it could neutralize the sub-nationalist tendencies and deny the ethnic and cultural groups their social, political and most importantly economic rights. In order to fully make use of the Islamic slogan the unrepresentative regimes manned by non-religious but undemocratic elite had to fall back on clerical groups and their expertise of using efficiently and adroitly the pulpit of the mullah. Although most of the religious parties and leaders had opposed creation of Pakistan but Pakistan civilian-military establishment after the formation of the country courted, cajoled and harboured mullahs because the latter could issue edicts, statements and messages to the conservative Muslim population which was beyond the capacity of secular establishment itself to manage. (Haqqani, 2005: 20) The founder of the Jamaat-e-Islami (JI), Maulana Maududi (1903-79), who
earlier had dubbed Pakistan (literally meaning land of the pure) as *Na-Pakistan* (an impure land) and who was a perennial foe of the country’s founder, Jinnah, soon after the latter death was dictating policies to the ruling elite of Pakistan. Maulana Maududi led the struggle for making Pakistan a theocratic state soon after the birth of Pakistan. (Mir, 1986) He transformed the very concept of Jinnah’s Pakistan and argued that it should not be a nation-state but an Islamist state (Mir, 1986:159). “One factor that helped these [clerical] groups reassert themselves was their strategy of conflating the idea of a separate homeland for the Muslims of India with that of a virtually theocratic republic that Jinnah had unambiguously argued against.” (Rashid A., 2009: 18)

The clerics could best serve the elite or oligarchy by labelling the concept of western politics, democracy and constitutionalism as *un-Islamic*. The employing of clerics and their social influence by the ruling elite was aimed at depoliticizing the society so as to create political vacuum only to be filled by unrepresentative aristocratic politicians as well as military and civilian bureaucracy. The use of clerical groups by the ruling coterie to label democracy and politics as *western* ideas having no place in an *Islamic* dispensation was a well thought out strategy because if democracy and western political institutions having pluralistic and popular basis had been allowed to evolve and function independently in early Pakistan the stranglehold of the landowning pseudo-politicians and civilian and military bureaucracy on the state and its institutions would have vanished as a matter of course. The ruling oligarchy use of the name of Islamic and clerics for its vested interest is evident from the two irreconcilable positions—labelling democracy and constitution as western concepts and therefore un-Islamic on the one hand and accepting and extolling the completely westernized concept of a nation-state on the other hand and giving it an Islamic colour. Without a nation-state the elite could not have the power whereas in the presence of democracy also it could not have the control over the state.

### 3.6.1 Negative Fallout of Using Islamic Slogans

The just described irreconcilable positions of the ruling coterie have been a source of multidimensional problems for the state and society particularly regarding consensus over national goals and interests.
Ambivalence about the role of religion in the public and political life has caused conceptual and ideological confusion among the masses. Conceived as a nation state for the Muslims of India, Pakistan became ‘ideological’ state with religion as the fundamental rationale for its existence. That amalgam of modernity (democracy as a Western construct) and tradition (articulated in Islam steeped in its primordial context) has provided a rationale to the clerics\textsuperscript{83} of Lal Masjid and Maulana Fazl Ullah in Swat to challenge the writ of the state in the name of religion. (Kamran, 2008: 11-12).

At the same time while employing the religious slogan the ruling elite could not count the cost of its consequences other than confusion over goals and mechanisms to achieve the goals. Due to the state’s untiring and all-out efforts to spread propaganda through educational institutions, curricula and media that Pakistan and Islam were intertwined and two faces of one reality and it (the ruling elite) is the custodian of the Fort of Islam\textsuperscript{84} (Haqqani, 2005: 15) the formation of a fundamentalist Islamist social attitudes in the country has been natural. The ruling elite and its dominated state has especially had employed Muslim clerics and their power of mimber (pulpit) and their social influence of indoctrinating the gullible, religiously sentimental, mass-illiterate and politically fragmented population. The consequences of such propaganda has been pernicious as it horizontally and vertically radicalized Pakistani society.

### 3.7 RELIGIOUS PARTIES: FANNING ISLAMIST SENTIMENTS TO CREATE OPPURTUNITY FOR CLERICS

On their part the religious parties and clerics have been forthcoming to be used by the ruling coterie for their own group and individual interest. As partially mentioned above both the Islamic

---

\textsuperscript{83} These clerics staged the worst-ever terrorist events in the name of Islam in the country’s history during the first decade of the 21\textsuperscript{st} Century. Details to follow in this chapter.

\textsuperscript{84} The ruling elite by trying to depict it being the custodian of the Fort of Islam may have taken the cue from Saudi Royal dynasty, which for the sake of legitimacy called itself Khadimul Haramain ul Sharifain (Servants of the Holiest Places of Islam).
parties and majority of clerics associated with doctrinal institutions and parties like the Deoband Madrassa, Jamiat-e-Ulema-e-Islam (JUI), Majlis-e-Ahrar-ul-Islam, Khaksar Tehreek and Jamaat-e-Islami opposed the creation of Pakistan but when Pakistan came into existence the leaders of these outfits, given the masses sentimental attachment to Islam, foresaw a political and economic future and social influence for themselves in the new state. (Haqqani, 2005: 15) Maulana Maududi argued that if a completely secular and westernized Jinnah could motivate millions of Indian Muslims by raising a religious slogan the mullahs had far more prospect of taking over the state. (Haqqani, 2005: 22) Maulana Maududi thus came up with a comprehensive blueprint theory of an Islamic state and argued:

Islam is the very antithesis of secular western democracy. The philosophical foundation of western democracy is the sovereignty of the people. Law making is their prerogative and legislation must correspond to the mood and temper of their opinion…Islam altogether repudiates the philosophy of popular sovereignty and rears its polity on the foundations of the sovereignty of God and the vicegerency. (As quoted in Mir 1986: 160)

As the ruling elite of Pakistan was attempting, for its own very reasons, to form national identity of the new state on the basis of Islam the JI found the former its natural ally. The ruling elite also had similar feelings towards the JI.

The Jamaat saw its opportunity in working with the new state’s elite, gradually expanding the Islamic agenda while providing the theological rationale for the elite’s plans for nation building on the basis of religion. Jamaat-e-Islami’s cadres among students, trade unions, and professional organizations, as well as its focus on building its own media, made it a natural ally for those within the government who thought that Pakistan’s survival as a state required a religious anchor.” (Haqqani, 2005: 22-23)

Such a symbiotic relationship did not exist between JI and the founding fathers during the struggle for independence. Perhaps the factor which also helped in establishing that symbiosis
was the common ethnic background of both Maududi and most members of the ruling elite, who all hailed from the Punjab. The mullahs who were made by the AIML to support the demand for Pakistan after independence were joined by those clerics who had opposed Pakistan to demand *Islamization* in the new country. This opportunity they never had or could have in multi-religious Hindustan since the 8th Century descent of Muslims on Indian subcontinent. As the religious elite started promoting its own agenda for the state and society this added to the confusion of already perplexed Pakistanis regarding the key societal values, structure of the state particularly the political system and the nature of the leadership. Instead of considering a nation-state as an instrument for carrying out secular functions and having non-religious make-up, Pakistani religious-political outfits consider the concept of territoriality, which is inalienable part of the nation-state, as irrelevant and ephemeral. Moreover, for them the state must mainly be an instrument to *reform* and change society according to their conception of Islam. (Shafqat, 2002: 133)

*Shariah* and *Jihad* were not only used as rallying cries by the Pakistani ruling elite but certain popular and secular leaders also directly used these slogans to garner public support. For instance, the founder head of Pakistan People’s Party (PPP), Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto, although a self-declared liberal and leftist, who also later became the first elected prime minister of Pakistan in 1973, gave a strange doctrine by conflating two diametrically opposite ideologies Islam and Socialism and called it “Islamic Socialism.” (Saigol, 2009: 48). He also promised a “thousand year war” against India. Moreover the PPP’s founding documents contained a reference to Jihads against India (Feldman, 1975: 13). Bhutto did not bring madrassas into state control and left them to operate autonomously while nationalizing the entire education sector of the country. (Waseem M., 1994: 301) “Despite his secular and liberal outlook at a personal level, Bhutto took recourse to Islam as a political instrument, thus, undermining the secular socialist state that he otherwise propounded.” (Saigol, 2009: 48)

---

85 Arguably the only opportunity for clerics in the history of modern India to demand Islamization of the Empire was in the reign of Mughal Emperor Aurangzeb Alamgir (1658-1707 AD), who himself was an extremist Muslim

86 The architect of Socialism, Karl Marx, as mentioned elsewhere in this dissertation, called the use of religion as opiate to intoxicate the masses. Bhutto by making use of the Islamic slogan and even giving Socialism an Islamic colour did exactly what Marx argued.
3.8 PERCEIVED INDIAN THREAT & NEED OF ISLAMIC SLOGAN

Notwithstanding whether Indians have had any, the fear of Indian expansionist designs, has been used by Pakistani ruling elite to prop itself up and its agenda. On Pakistani side certain overtures by Indian government and political leaders were interpreted as India having plans to undo Pakistan. “India is seen by most decision makers and in many media as a ‘born enemy’. On the one hand, it is considered as being hegemonic, unfair, obnoxious and resolute to weaken or even destroy Pakistan.” (Racine, 2002: 198) The vows and plans of Indian political groups like Hindu Mahasabha to reunite Pakistan with India to form Akhand Bharat (Grand India); the Indian government intransigence to solve Kashmir dispute, annexation of quasi-independent princely states of Junagadh (1947) and Hyderabad (1948), whose princes very much like the Majrajha or ruler of Kashmir, who merged his Muslim-majority states with India, decided to accede to Pakistan, created some genuine fears among Pakistani leaders and military that India and its dominant majority of Hindus wanted to undo Pakistan. (Rizvi, 2009: 52) In other words these actions and statements were interpreted on their face value. More importantly these anti-Pakistan overtures by Indian leadership soon after independence convinced the Pakistani ruling elite that India had the powers and the means to undo Pakistan.

Still these fears had been blown out of proportion and simultaneously, as mentioned earlier, the pretext of state security was used to create an over-centralized state structure in Pakistan. The aim of which was to deny political, economic and cultural rights to the federating units. In other words security against India was partially meant protection against so-called centrifugal forces threat to centralized state. (Haqqani, 2005: 14-15) Pakistan federal law minister, S. M. Zafar, on

87 The full name of the party is Akhil Bhārat Hindū Mahāsabhā or All-Indian Hindu Assembly. The party was formed in 1915, as an alternative for Hindus who were not attracted to the secular Indian National Congress. The nationalist Hindu Mahasabha opposed the struggle for Muslim separatism or Pakistan by the Muslim League. The Mahasabha promoted the principles of Hindutva, a Hindu nationalist ideology conceived by the party leader Damodar Savarkar. The Mahasabha considered India as Hindu Rashtra (Hindu Nation) with no place of adherents of other religions on the Indian soil.

88 Akhand Bharat means Undivided India is an irredentist call to include Pakistan and Bangladesh into India to form a Hindu Rashtra. The greatest exponents of the movement have been the fundamentalist Indian political-religious organizations Vishva Hindu Parishad (VHP), Rashtriya Swayamsevak Sangh (RSS) and Bharatiya Janata Party (BJP). Reclaiming the Hindudom of Akhand Bharat has been instrumental cause of the occasional Hindu-Muslim riots in India. The demolition of Babri Masjid in 1992 by Hindu zealots, which caused the death of at least 2,000 people in the ensuing riots, was also the manifestation of the movement’s ideology. Akhand Bharat is ideologically connected with the ideas of Sangathan (Hindu unity) and Shuddhi (purification)
December 15, 1966 declared in Dhaka\textsuperscript{89} that demanding “greater provincial autonomy” would be “a treasonous act’ and it protagonists “would be identified, hunted, crushed and destroyed.” (Wolpert, 1993: 60 as quoted in Abbas, 2005: 58)
The genuineness of the Indian threat to Pakistan’s survival apart, it also provided the pretext to the aristocrats-turned-accidental politicians as well as the civilian-military establishment to remain in power and keep on deciding the state’s and its citizens fate by stoking anti-India feelings among the highly-sentimental Muslims of Pakistan. The civilian-military establishment presented India as a constant threat and contended that to ward off that threat Pakistan needed strong military institution and that the state could ill-afford creation of political divisions and societal schisms by sub-national ethnic groups and social classes, whose opportunities they may get in a democratic dispensation. The argument was that political polarization and social chasms would \textit{enfeeble} Pakistan and it would lose the internal strength to defy Indians. This fear-infusion by the undemocratic and unelected ruling elite into the masses and state’s body politics was to a great extent driven by the motive to have its stranglehold over the state and its policies. Thus Pakistan started evolving as a security state, whose foreign and domestic policies utmost concern has been to look into ways and means for ensuring territorial survivability of the state. All other goals which a state, particularly an extremely underdeveloped one like Pakistan, must have that of human, socio-economic and political security; development and welfare of the masses and above all a democratic culture become subservient to the primary goal of territorial survivability. (Rizvi, 2009: 56) The ruling elite failed to understand, or feigned not to, that security of state and its people was only possible when all the facets of security had been given approximately equal or equitable attention.

India’s instrumental role in dismembering Pakistan in 1971 by physical intervention in the East Pakistan to help Bengali insurgents reinforced Pakistani fears that India was a real enemy. But such a conclusion overlooks the fact that India could never have got the opportunity to play a role in dismembering Pakistan when one of the major ethnic group of the country—the Bengalis—had not felt disempowered, disenfranchised, disoriented and disgusted due to denial of their political and economic rights and thus had not launched an armed liberation movement. Such a realistic and dispassionate assessment of the situation could only be possible if the

\textsuperscript{89} Dhaka was the capital of the province of the East Pakistan, which in 1971 became Bangladesh
country had democracy and a truly constitutional government and thus a liberal society and state policies.

The dismemberment of Pakistan also clarified the confusion created by the ruling oligarchy that a strong military and Islam as a state ideology could ensure the survival of the multiethnic and multi-interest state. Instead it demonstrated beyond doubt that only democracy and federalism could be the sole guarantees for Pakistan’s survival. Nevertheless, after the 1971 dismemberment of Pakistan anti-India feeling got stronger within the country’s corridors of power and thus has been one of the main factors in the rise of religious extremism in Pakistan. It is important to note that it was the same feeling of apprehension and insecurity of Pakistan ruling elite vis-a-vis India which in the latter decades grew so acute that the state started investing in radical groups to prepare them to wage Jihad against Hindu India for it being against Islamic Pakistan. “Islamic identity, especially that part opposing Hindu India, is today the only real unifying force in a Pakistan torn by sub-national and Islamic sectarian conflicts.” (Keddie, 1998)

The logical analysis of Pakistani foreign policies particularly towards its neighbours reveals that the threat from India was unnecessarily presented as ideological. Afghanistan in the very beginning laid claim to a large Pakistani territory. (Roy, 2002: 150) As Afghanistan unlike India was a Muslim state, so Pakistani ruling elite did not have the leverage of portraying Afghanistan-Pakistan territorial dispute in terms of a religious or ideological conflict. Therefore, Islamabad started labelling Afghan claims as Indian-sponsored remaining oblivious to the fact that how come a Muslim Afghanistan could be compelled by Hindu India to have a dispute with a Muslim Pakistan, a self-declared Fort of Islam. “Pakistan’s national security establishment identified Afghanistan as an adversary and linked the Afghan government to unrest in Balochistan and the NWFP, just as they had seen India playing a role in support of Bengali nationalists.” (Haqqani, 2005: 101) Subsequently in order to neutralize a real or imagined threat from Afghanistan, the Pakistani ruling elite in the 1970s started cultivating Afghan Mullahs by hosting them on its territory by financing and militarily and politically training them to make them as a counterforce to Afghan nationalists, who had been championing their country irredentist claims on Pakistani territory.
3.9 SHUNNING NON-MILITARY ASPECTS OF SECURITY

As indicated above Pakistani state’s undue, most of the time absolute, apprehension regarding state’s territorial survivability and shunning of non-military aspects of state and societal security and employing of and investing, in religious slogans, clerical groups and religious militants to ensure state survival and suppress democratic and political sub-national and civil society movements for rights also extensively radicalized the country. Pakistanis made to believe that their nationhood was under constant threat and the threat emanated from India acting in collusion with sub-national movements inside the country. This required keeping of a large military which bestowed upon the military a special status and gave precedence to strategic aspect of security on all other dynamics of national security. (Haqqani, 2005: 14) An atmosphere of fear and insecurity was created to perpetuate the societal and governmental control of the military-dominated ruling elite. The eschewing of non-military aspects of security by the ruling coterie besides creating and aggravating many problems has been the underlying cause of mass poverty, illiteracy and unemployment which this study finds to be the contributing causes of extremism and terrorism in the name of Islam in Pakistan.

3.10 PAN ISLAMISM & PAKISTANI STATE

In a bid to prove its own and the state’s Islamist credentials, the otherwise secular elite of Pakistan did its utmost to portray Pakistan not only as a Fort of Islam but also as a centre of Muslim world and Pan-Islamism. (Haqqani, 2005: 18) The first president of the Pakistan Muslim League,90 Chaudhry Kaliquz Zaman (1889–1973) announced that Pakistan would bring all Muslim countries together into Islamistan—a Pan-Islamic entity. (Siddiqui, 1960: 89) Pakistan also convened a World Muslim Conference in Karachi in 1949, to promote Pan-Islamism. (Siddiqui, 1960: 82-3) These efforts gradually made many Pakistani believe that Pakistan really came into existence to lead revival of Muslim glory. In other words masses started thinking creation of Pakistan not in terms of the birth of a nation-state rather a symbol and pivot of

---

90 It was the successor of AIML in independent Pakistan
Islamic Revivalism.\textsuperscript{91} Some leaders of the Pakistan movement developed a feeling that the actual goal of Pakistan was to reunite Muslims of the entire World. They also tried to convince the people that Pakistan was not just a state but a movement to lead Muslim Renaissance. The partially shrewd leaders of the ruling institutions also got enamoured by the idea of Pan-Islamism but to use it to deceive the people that the Pakistan they ruled was sacrosanct and by that token they were also sacred being the custodians of the new state.

The above-mentioned state policy drew international Pan-Islamists and radical Revivalist groups like Muslim Brotherhood to Pakistan. The leaders of these groups become frequent visitors to Pakistan. (Haqqani, 2005: 19) Thus even the ideological predecessors of Al Qaeda found support and accommodation in early Pakistan.\textsuperscript{92} Against this backdrop whatever support and bases Al Qaeda and other similar global so-called Jihadists have found in Pakistan in post 9/11 could be easily understood. Pakistani establishment alliance with Jamaat-e-Islami (the JI), an Islamic revivalist party found in 1941 by Maulana Abul Ala Maududi, after getting influenced by Muslim Brotherhood, shows the extent of support of the former to the idea.

The shallowness of Pakistani state policy of Pan-Islamism can be gauged from the fact that on the other hand it took a vivid pro-western stance from the very beginning and this was evident in the statements of the country’s first foreign minister, Sir Zafarullah Khan.\textsuperscript{93}(Waseem 2002: 265) Presenting Pakistan not as a symbol but instrument to attain Pan-Islamism and unite the Muslims of the World led the fundamentalist-minded Muslims inside the country to demand from the government to promote Muslims cause not only through diplomacy but also through other means including organizing and supporting Jihad outside the country. On the other hand Pakistan’s constant indications at the official level that it is not only a state but also the centre of Pan-Islamism allured international Muslim fundamentalist groups and provided them state support in Pakistan, which they seldom or never got in their own countries. That was the very

\textsuperscript{91} In Arabic Islamic Revivalism or awakening is called \textit{aṣ-Ṣāhwah I Islāmiyyah}

\textsuperscript{92} Al Qaeda founder Osama bin Laden was mainly influenced by Muslim Brotherhood leader Sayyid Qutb’s (1906 – 1966) writings, whose brother Muhammad Qutb moved to Saudi Arabia after the execution of Sayyid Qutb and started teaching at a university there and whetted, published and promoted his brother work. Ayman Zawahiri, who was one of the founding members of Al Qaeda and a mentor of Osama bin Laden, remained student of Muhammad Qutb.

\textsuperscript{93} He served as foreign minister between (1947-54).
reason that Muslim ideologues like Abdullah Azzam without hesitation came to Pakistan in 1984 and played an instrumental role in bringing from across the World Muslim fighters to wage *Jihad* against the Soviets in Afghanistan. Afghan *Jihad* and religious radicalization of Pakistan went in tandem while reinforcing each other. (Shafqat, 2007: XXXII) How the international Muslim fundamentalist groups and individuals radicalize Pakistani society is explained in detail elsewhere in this chapter.

The above mentioned factual history of events and their analysis reveals the ruling elite of Pakistan employed Islamic slogans and symbols, patronized national and international fundamentalist and clerical groups for the following reasons:

- To attain legitimacy to rule like the 17th Century Christian rulers of Europe. (Saigon, 2009: 44)
- To provide basis for nation-building as the other functional ways of state-formation and federalism like promoting democratic constitutionalism, giving political and economic rights to the state’s constituent ethnic groups, communities and social classes have been considered *dangerous*.
- To engender anti-India feelings among public by portraying India as a symbol of Hinduism and thus a perennial enemy of *Islamic* Pakistan and to make Afghanistan the *Strategic Depth*94 of *Islamic* Pakistan, the self-declared *Fort of Islam*.
- To justify through propaganda of Muslim clerics the repressive measures of the state to trounce sub-nationalist movements and ethnic groups that have been demanding equal rights, as enjoyed by the dominant ethnic groups—the Punjabis and Muhajirs.

---

94 Former Foreign Secretary of Pakistan, Dr. Humayun Khan attributing the origin of *Strategic Depth* policy to Pakistani military leadership “particularly General (R) Mirza Aslam Beg and ex DG ISI General (R) Hameed Gul explained in the following words. What it means is that since our main cities are located very close to Indian border and in a case of retreat by Pakistani forces due to Indian advance our forces won’t have sufficient depth in our territory to be able to fall back upon and continue fighting. So the idea, which seems ridiculous now, that Afghanistan would provide this depth for us, was floated. (Interview with researcher, Peshawar, January 2010)
To label secular political parties, civil society groups and movements *irreligious* and therefore *unfit* and *incredulous* to rule an *Islamic* state in order to tackle the potential challenge from these groups to the elite’s arbitrary rule.

To convey to Muslims domestically and internationally that Pakistan symbolizes Muslim unity and *Islamic Revivalism* which has been created by God for these very purposes?

### 3.11 MILITARIZATION OF STATE & SOCIETY

While the above-mentioned factors have been responsible for the state cultivation, courting and patronizing of Islamist parties, groups and clerics, the military involvement in the statecraft set off militarization of Pakistani society. The militarization of Pakistani society began with the taking over of the state power by General Ayub Khan in October 1958. He professed a reformist agenda for the state institutions and the society but ended up with deliberately or inadvertently promoting militarization in Pakistani society. This happened because for a military ruler it is hard to comprehend what militarization of the civil society means and what repercussions follow from that? In the words of ardent Pakistani human rights activist and political observer I. A. Rahman:

> The state by definition is an apparatus of coercion but dictatorship is the most vicious form of an oppressive state. Every time an elected authority has been overthrown, the message to the people is: any violence one can get away with is legitimate. The element of violence in the state has been directly proportional to the degree of civilian exclusion from public affairs. Violence is not bad, only getting hauled up for it is. We thus find violence in Pakistan rooted in the nature of the state. (Rahman, 2008)

In Pakistan’s context militarization could be defined as: a subculture, practiced and promoted by physically the most powerful group or institution—the military—setting values and norms or standards of behaviour for the rest of the groups and institutions of the state and the society, extensively modifying rather corrupting the national culture by making attainment of unchecked
physical power, the most sought after value for individuals, groups and institutions and silencing the pro-democracy movements and voices by denying them the public sphere by giving the radical religious groups a licence to dominate the public discourse and social space by attacking or threatening them through militant groups using the name of Islam.

Through militarization of society the military on the one hand set values for the society and on the other hand, by having its monopoly over physical force, it compels other groups and institutions to follow these standards. In Pakistan, like in any militarized society, the arbitrary use of physical force has become the most cherished societal value. Therefore, the members of Pakistani society, where militarism dominates, the employment of physical force is relished, embellished and frequently used, if it is uncontested, by the individuals and groups in dealing with one another and settling matters and disputes. Due to having a typical militarized character social cohesion, that could only be functionally achieved, has been unthinkable in Pakistan. Pakistani society, nevertheless, has had functioned in a dysfunctional way as it has been held together by the dominant and the most powerful state institution, the military on the macro level and balance of terror between and among individuals and groups of individuals on the micro level.

Once Ayub Khan fashioned the state and social institutions on the pattern of military discipline and closed culture, the roots of militarization started going deeper into the society. Contrarily in such conditions a democratic culture could not take root let alone thrive simultaneously. Therefore, when Bengalis, the largest ethnic group of Pakistan, demanded from the federal government to provide their province of East Pakistan equal economic and political rights as enjoyed by the West Pakistan they were ruthlessly treated by the then ruler Gen. Ayub and subsequently by Gen. Yahya regimes. (Jaffrelot, 2002: 20) A military operation was launched against the Bengalis that resulted in the breakup of Pakistan and East Pakistan became Bangladesh. “The atrocities committed in 1971 in East Bengal in the name of the state and with the fullest possible approval of the people in the western wing, sanctified the gospel of violence. (Rahman, 2008)

Not very differently, when in 1973 Balochs asked for their due political and economic rights from the federation the state again launched a military operation to silence the Balochs
nationalist movement. In the operation against Balochs, which continued from 1973-1977 around 5,300 Balochs and 3,300 security forces personnel perished. (Jaffrelot, 2002: 29) This was despite of the fact that the state at the time was ruled by the so-called civilian government of Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto testifying the pervasiveness of militarization deep into the state structure and civil society and its overshadowing of the latter.

General Zia during his rule immensely promoted militarization of Pakistan society and that too in the name of Islam. As the Afghan resistance being organized on Pakistani soil with the sponsorship of the US and Saudi Arabia the generals needed a full-fledge societal mobilization and support. A Jihadi culture was cultivated and promoted by establishing militant madrassas, exhorting armed resistance through propaganda on state media and educational institutions.

While dependence on the US has meant more militarization of the state, dependence on Saudi Arabia on the other hand may have caused considerable conservatism in the society through the spread of a narrow, puritan, Wahabi interpretation of Islam. The two strands came together powerfully when Pakistan became a frontline state under Zia as a key partner in the US-led fight in Afghanistan against the Soviets, fully assisted by Saudi Arabia. (Rashid A., 2009: 12)

Militarization of society during Zia’s era also carried forward the process started by his predecessors General Ayub Khan and General Yahya Khan. During General Zia’s regime the complexion of Pakistan society become so militarized that even elected or democratically elected governments, after restoration of democracy in 1988, could not demilitarize the society and its institutions. Promoting militarization in and of society helped the military to such an extent much that whenever it took power the coup was either generally welcomed or silently accepted. The central role which the so-called Jihadist organizations played in the promotion of a militant culture changed the civilian face of Pakistani society into religiously extremist-militant society.

3.12 MILITANTS AND MILITARIZATION

The militarization of Pakistani society has inescapably had necessitated the fostering and facilitation of militants and militant groups by the military and some political governments,
under the sway of the military. Pakistan military-civilian-intelligence establishment on several occasions fostered militants in order to use them as tools to pursue its dictated agenda of the state. According to the findings of this study the formation of tribesmen militias in 1948, whose members volunteered to fight to liberate Kashmir, was not the result of manipulation by the military *per-se* although all the Islamist militant groups that emerged thereafter have largely been nurtured and helped by the military and intelligence agencies by resorting to social engineering.

In 1971, faced with a Bengali national liberation movement in the then East Pakistan (Bangladesh), Pakistan Army not only launched massive military operation to root out the rebels but in order to have *local* support to resist the *rebels* decided to form a massive so-called volunteer militia of 100,000 from the non-Bengali residents of East Pakistan as well as the pro-military Islamist groups. The the JI and Islami Jamiat-e-Tulaba (IJT), its student arm, were especially instrumental in the formation of these militant wings in May 1971 to serve as counterinsurgency units. (Haqqani, 2005: 79; Abbas, 2005: 63: Also see Chapter 6 for details) In 1980s General Zia created Afghan *Mujahideen* to fight the Soviets. “Pakistan was officially training 20,000 *Mujahideen* per year.” (Haqqani, 2005: 194) In 1990s Pakistani establishment helped produced Kashmiri *Mujahideen* and Afghan Taliban. Therefore, whatever charges in this regard are levelled against Islamabad are quite substantial and the denial of these charges by the military of late quite immaterial if one studies the role of the military in the historical context of creating militants. Military played an absolute role in formation of above-mentioned religious militants while on the other hand on many occasions it also played an indirect role in fostering the militants.

### 3.13 AFGHAN MILITANTS ON PAK SOIL

Zulfiqar Bhutto’s government, as mentioned above, started harbouring Afghan Mullahs and started transforming them into militant commanders in 1973. This strategy was partially motivated by the military and Major General Babar, who authored the idea of harbouring Afghan Mullahs as militants to neutralize the threat from Afghanistan to Pakistan. Bhutto also had to concur with the military’s dictated state policy of considering Islam as the core of Pakistan. (Haqqani, 2005: 49)
“... Pakistan’s intelligence services, infuriated by Daud’s support to Pakistani Pashtun and Baloch Marxists, decided to retaliate by enlisting the Afghan Islamists. They were trained by Lt.–Gen. Naseerullah Babar, the head of the paramilitary Frontiers Corps, and sent back into Afghanistan to launch a guerrilla movement against Daud, which was quickly crushed.... Ironically it was Babar, interior minister in the government of Prime Minister Benazir Bhutto in 1994, who would be instrumental in launching the Taliban” (Rashid, 2008: 9).

Maj. General Babar had another story to tell. In an interview for this study he said:

It was in 1972 when I was Inspector General Frontier Corps posted in Peshawar that Prime Minister Bhutto came to Peshawar and I advised him to open up the tribal areas. So in 1973 we opened Kakar-Khursan region in Balochistan. Then other areas follow. However, in 1973 when Sardar Daud staged a coup against King Zahir Shah in Afghanistan we also thought that we had an interest in Afghanistan. So I wrote a policy paper regarding the consequences of Daud rule in Afghanistan. Bhutto agreed that OK we had to pursue our interest. At the same time one Hizb-e-Islami Afghanistan leader, Habib ur Rahman, came to us and solicited our help because traditionally the Hizb was against the socialist and communist parties in Afghanistan, which Daud represented. Based on the experience of 1950s when Daud became Afghan premier he had opened Afghanistan to Russians and if you can recollect in that period all the routes from Torghundi to Kandahar and the other from Bandar Sher Khan to Kabul were opened up while the main airbases of Bagram and Sheen Dand were built by the Russians also. So we thought this was a plan by the Russians to move on to the hot waters. [You know that] Russian Emperor Peter the Great had left a will to his nation to keep pressing until you

---

95 He was in fact a Major General and did not rise to the rank of Lt. General. Babar was later appointed by Prime Minister Zulfiqar Bhutto Governor of then North West Frontier Province (now Khyber Pakhtunkhwa) in 1976 while Prime Minister Benazir Bhutto appointed him as Interior Minister of Pakistan (1993-1996)

96 The Frontier Corps is the paramilitary force designed by the British colonists to man the Durand Line and Pakistan continued with the arrangement.
Irrespective of Babar’s version of the events it is a well-established fact that Pakistan started nurturing Afghan mullahs in early 1970s. The Afghan mullahs were provided huge lands to recruit militants, impart them militant training and indoctrinate them with fundamentalist religious lessons. The military’s involvement in harbouring Afghan mullahs on Pakistani soil is evident from the fact that the process continued after Zulifiqar Bhutto’s dismissal by General Zia through a coup. The general largely enlisted the same militant commanders to organize anti-Soviet apparently Afghan resistance, who had been used by Maj. Gen. Babar to foment unrest in Afghanistan in 1970s. Among these commanders Gulbaddin Hikmatyar was the most important. Interestingly, Maj. General Babar was critical of this strategy of General Zia:

In Afghanistan when Russians came in Zia should have formed an exile government of seven component parties of Afghanistan in Pakistan but he did not do so as it did not suit him. So then favourites were found like Hikmatyar and others. That led to the subsequent chaos in Afghanistan that remains till today.  

In the 1990s the Afghan Taliban emerged when in Pakistan the PPP was in the saddle. The then ruler Benazir Bhutto gave a go-ahead to the idea conceived by her interior minister retired Major General Naseerullah Babar, who had deep links with with the country’s Army high command. She was convinced of Taliban importance and necessity to make Afghanistan Pakistan’s backyard. (Nojumi, 2002: 131)

---

97 Interview with Naseerullah Babar (Peshawar, February 2008)
98 Interview with Naseerullah Babar (Peshawar, February 2008)
3.14 ZIA REGIME & UPSURGE IN RADICALIZATION

It is generally believed by local and international experts on Pakistan that the seeds of Islamic extremism in the country were sown far and wide during the rule of dictator, General Zia-ul-Haq (1977-88). “A surge in extremism, divisiveness and militarization of society was to be the hallmark of the rule of General Zia ul Haq who deposed Bhutto in a coup in July 1977 and took over.” (Rashid A., 2009: 25) However, this is not wholly correct as this dissertation has thrown extensive light on the genesis of fundamentalism in the name of Islam in Pakistan. However, General Zia regime policies exacerbated and catalyzed the process of radicalization in Pakistan.99 Zia himself was a migrant from Indian Punjab and had a tendency towards religion but he was not a religious man in the literal sense. (Abbas, 2005: 97) Luck was on his side that due to the Soviet invasion of Afghanistan in December 1979 the US badly needed an indigenous Afghan resistance to defy Soviet occupation and give the USSR its ‘Vietnam’ in Afghanistan and to decisively defeat its political philosophy of communism.

Having his own motives in Afghanistan, General Zia offered US his regime’s services and Pakistan’s soil to organize the anti-Soviet Afghan resistance. However, General Zia insisted and convinced the US that the anti-Soviet resistance could only be allowed on Pakistani soil and it could be effective if led by and organize around the Afghan mullahs, of whom many Pakistan already had been harbouring since early 1970s, and the US agreed. In their so-called refugee camps, a cover for militant nurseries, Afghan *Mujahideen* and mullahs were provided various heavy and light weapons including Stinger Missile, a shoulder fire surface-to-air weapon. Subsequently, weapons and militant skills started spreading and rippling respectively to the surrounding localities particularly in the FATA, the KP and Balochistan provinces, as well as Karachi laying the foundation of what has been termed as *Kalashnikov and Madrassa culture* (Rashid A., 2009: 27) in the literature.

---

99 Zia took a number of steps to carry out his self-conceived Islamization of society. He announced the establishment of Sharia Benches which in fact was a parallel judicial system, comprising such bodies like the Federal Shariat Court and Shariat Bench of the Supreme Court of Pakistan. In order to further *Islamize* the judicial-legal procedures he incorporated the Hudood Ordinances of 1979, the Qisas and Diyat Ordinance and the Law of Evidence of 1984. (Saigol, 2009: 53)
“The great success of General Zia was to make Washington endorse, in the name of the ‘roll-back’ policy against the Soviet Union, his own decision of playing the Islamic tool in the region.” (Shafqat, 2002: 151) Zia’s strategy in Afghanistan mainly rests on the intermingling of Islamic and ethnic question. Under this strategy Pakistan gave significant support to Pakhtun-led ‘Islamist’ parties especially to Hizb-e-Islami of Gulbaddin Hekmatyar and later to Taliban so that to manipulate the largest ethnic group of Afghanistan. Consequently, as aimed, Pakhtunistan issue, which for long has bothered Islamabad, was supplanted by Islamic nationalism in Afghanistan. (Shafqat, 2002: 151)

A large number of Afghan refugees, whose number at one point crossed four million, were hosted by the general and provided excellent treatment to facilitate recruiting, training and arming members of Afghan resistance. As a by-product Afghan refugees cultivated the seeds of militancy in Pakistan through Peshawar. In this way the Afghan refugees, now living in ‘de-tribalized’ social setting in the largest north-western Pakistani city came in close contact with the Deobandi madrassas and this produced specific consequences. According to Kepel the young Afghans indoctrinated with the spirit of Jihad in Deobandi seminaries gave rise to an amalgamated movement. The triumphant anti-Soviet Afghan resistance contributed tremendously to the diffusion of Jihadist mindset within Pakistani population. (Kepel, 2000)

Once anti-Soviet resistance was over the traditionally economically deprive Afghan mullahs started selling Kalashnikovs to earn money as no measures were taken by Pakistani authorities to collect weapons from different Afghan Mujahideen groups. As many Pakistani religious organizations and their members fought along Afghan mullahs against Soviets they were also provided weapons by Pakistani military and ISI, which under General Akhtar Abdul Rahman followed by Lt. General Hamid Gul were managing the finances and weapons supply to Afghan resistance, a real militant culture within religious organizations and madrassas was also promoted. (ICG, 2002)

The close nexus between Afghan and Pakistani mullahs also contributed significantly to the radicalization and militancy within Pakistani society’s religious organizations and institutions. Even non-religious bodies got weapons and their cadres learnt militant skills. For instance, members of Karachi and Hyderabad based Urdu-speaking or Muhajir (migrant) community from India were sent by the then military ruler General Zia in small numbers to Afghan militant camps
to get training. Zia wanted to make MQM as a counterforce to its biggest political challenge the PPP in its strongest hold Sindh province, whose urban areas were widely inhabited by *Muhajir* community. (Verkaaik: 2007: 92) As Zia himself was a migrant from India to Pakistan he had a sense of solidarity with the MQM.

### 3.15 US & SAUDI ARABIA ROLE IN CREATION OF MILITANTS

General Zia also swayed the US and Saudi Arabia to contribute to the anti-Soviet Afghan resistance. An agreement in the form of a quid-pro-quo was arrived at between Saudi Arabia and Pakistan midwife by the US. Under it Riyadh pledged to the Americans to “facilitate Pakistani arms purchases, in return for a Pakistani military input to Saudi security.” (Brezezinski (1983: 448) The Reagan administration and Saudi Arabia provided $3.5 billion for the construction of a large number of madrassas. Thousands of militants were also trained by the CIA in the Brooklyn School in New York and in Virginia. The MI6 trained thousands of militants inside Pakistan along with the ISI. (Rana, 2000) Saudis feared both military and ideological threat from the Shiite Islamist state of Iran, which just a year before the Soviet occupation of Afghanistan, had been established after the so-called Islamic Revolution. Thus Saudis had strategic and ideological motives due to which it was more than willing to join the anti-Soviet Afghan resistance. In this way it would get the opportunity to counter Shiite Islam influence through the spreading Wahabism, a heterodox school of Muslim religious thought believing in extreme forms of Islamic practices and institutionally represented by the Saudi state, in Pak-Afghan region. The US similarly apprehended its interest would get increasingly compromised in the region due to the 1979 clerical Iranian Revolution resulting in the ouster of pro-US ruler Reza Shah Pehlvi and ending of US oil companies contracts to extract oil in Iran. Therefore, it helped Saudis in countering Iranian Shiite influence mainly for economic and partly for political-ideological reasons.

Saudis instrumental role in the anti-Soviet Afghan resistance and the presence of almost all the Afghan resistance parties and the millions of Afghan refugees in Pakistan led to significant increase in Riyadh’s doctrinal influence inside Pakistan and among Afghan refugees living in Pakistan. General Zia also encouraged Islamic charities from Saudi Arabia and other Arab-Gulf
states to build mosques and madrassas both for Afghan refugees and Pakistanis. Resultantly, a large number of madrassas were established in the FATA, the KP and other parts of Pakistan which started imparting Wahabist ideology (Matinuddin, 1999: 14). This was the first time that Pakistani society came under direct and sweeping influence of Saudis and Wahabism. The Wahabist influence got rampaging and pervasive as more and more Pakistanis turned to study at Saudi-built madrassas, mostly attended by children of poor and malnourished Pakistani families. The madrassas established by Saudis or Saudi Arab, the birth place of Islam, made many people in Pakistan to believe the lessons they imparted must purely be Islamic but could not fathom the political-ideological agenda behind the facade of these madrassas.

It is important to note that in Pakistan majority Muslims subscribe to Barelvi sect, which originated in India. The Barelvi movement emerged from the teachings of one Ahmed Raza Khan (1856-1921) of Bareilly (Bovin, 2007: 125). On the other hand a large and ethnically significant section of the population follows Hanafi-Deobandi school of Muslim religious thought, which share roots with Wahabism but there are some inherent differences. Both Barelvi and Deobandi parties have been more or less tolerant and moderate in their approach even believing in western political institutions and democratic constitutional struggle to implement Islamic laws and respect temporal state sovereignty and authority. However, when Wahabism was provided an open field, state support and patronage in Pakistan, the doctrine started contesting Barelvi and Shiite schools, primarily through propaganda that many of the latter practices were Un-Islamic. This on the one hand spread sectarian tensions and gave rise to conflicts in Pakistan and on the other hand increased the number of people subscribing to Wahabi ideology. The new entrants to Wahabism started questioning religious beliefs and practices of the adherents of majority Muslim sects of Pakistan mostly through violence. This contributed enormously in radicalizing Pakistani society on religious basis.

3.16 MILITANTS’ DESCEND ON PAK FROM ACROSS THE WORLD

General Zia felt the necessity of having more and more fighters from across the World to fight along Afghans against the Soviets. A large number of Muslim Jihadists from across the World particularly Muslim World right from Morocco on the Mediterranean Coast to Mindanao
(Phillipines) on the Pacific Coast descended on Pakistan to take part in Jihad. According to author Ahmed Rashid the idea of bringing Muslim militants from across the World was that of ISI to which the then CIA head William Casey agreed. (Yousaf & Adkin, 1992: 63) Some attributed invitation of militants from around the globe to General Zia’s personal ‘Pan-Islamic zeal.’ (Haqqani, 2005: 191) However, this study finds that in this regard Zia was driven more by giving the resistance an Islamic colour as well as to avoid the blame of organizing the so-called Jihad’. Zia by giving support only to Afghan Islamist parties instead of secular or democratic parties wanted to portray the anti-Soviet resistance as Islamic and to allay the impression it being a national liberation struggle. (Rashid, 2008: 10) Rashid also argues that the US also wanted to demonstrate that the “entire Muslim World was fighting communism” (Rashid, 2000: 129-30).

The global militants contain some ideologues, who proved instrumental in radicalizing Pakistani society and providing a future base and motivation for the global so-called Jihadist movement or international terrorism in Pakistan. The most significant of these ideologues, cursorily mentioned above, was a Palestinian professor, Abdullah Azzam. Imbued with religious fervour he came to Pakistan to organize cross-border Muslim resistance to Soviets in Afghanistan. For this purpose, he established a body called Maktab-al-Khidmat to raise funds and channelize them for recruitment and training of Jihadists. Azzam was the person who convinced Osama bin Laden of the need of his participation along with his wealth in the Mujahideen war efforts in Afghanistan. As Osama kept Azzam in high esteem he agreed to come to Pakistan. From 1984 to 1988 Azzam and his organization religiously indoctrinated thousands of Muslim recruits from across the World and most of them fought against the Soviets. Although Azzam’s role widely remained unrecognized but more than his on the field role his behind the scene efforts in organizing channels, recruits and funds had been remarkable.

As Azzam was carrying out all his activities on Pakistan’s soil particularly in North Western city of Peshawar many Pakistanis also got influenced by Azzam. The most important example was that of Hafiz Muhammad Saeed and Zafar Iqbal, the two teachers of Islamic Studies at the University of Engineering and Technology, Lahore. Both got profoundly influenced by Azzam and his Wahabist ideology and as long as Azzam was alive they fully supported his efforts. When Azzam was killed in 1988 (Peshawar) in a bomb blast Saeed and Iqbal formed the Lashkar-e-Tayyaba (the LeT). The agenda of the the LeT rests on two pillars of Jihad and Dawa.
(Propagation), which it considered inseparable. (Shafqat, 2002: 143) More specifically the aim behind the formation of the the LeT was to spread Wahabism in Pakistan and to wage armed struggle in the region and the World.

The the LeT has been involved in militant activities and terrorist attacks in India and Afghanistan and government of the former officially declared it as a terrorist organization. In 2010 the US, which had already designated the the LeT as a terrorist organization, on the basis of its intelligence estimates started calling the group as a ‘global threat’, however, the US did not substantiate the blame. The the LeT focus on liberating Kashmir since its very inception and its loathing of India made it a natural ally of Pakistan military, which has always considered India as the biggest ‘threat’ to Pakistan’s security. There is an ethno-sectarian aspect to this enmity that is the overwhelming strength of Punjabis in Pakistani military and the the LeT.

Among Pakistanis, Punjabis have traditionally had carried the most profound anti-Hindu or anti-India feelings than any other ethnic group comprising Pakistan. (Waseem, 2002: 267, 280) These feelings are embedded in history as a large number of those, who got killed or maimed by Hindu zealots while migrating from India to Pakistan at the time of partition,100 were Punjabi Muslims. This cultivated deep hatred among the Muslim Punjabis for Hindus. The LeT head Hafiz Saeed personally was the worst victim of Hindu-Muslim communal violence. “His family had migrated from India to Pakistan in 1947 while sadly losing thirty-six members of the extended family unit in the Hindu-Muslim riots that accompanied the partition of India.” (Abbas, 2005: 211) This military-LeT alliance made the latter the recipient of funds, weapons, training and logistical support. The military aimed at using the the LeT as one of the many proxy militant groups in Indian-held Kashmir to wage a guerrilla war for its liberation from Dehli’s rule. The Jihadist spirit, commitment, militant skills of the LeT leaders and fighters won it many admirers within the military and intelligence agencies. In particular those within the security forces and intelligence agencies, who have been handling the the LeT militants and leaders got enamoured by the group’s religious philosophy and ideology.

The relationship between military-intelligence complex gave a spur to Wahabism and fundamentalist religious thinking within the ranks and files of Pakistan military. Pakistani

---

100 It was the largest migration in modern human history in which 10 million people migrated from Pakistan to India and India to Pakistan. (Chitkara, 1996: 8)
military, or for that matter Army, has been the sole institution within the country, which due to its monopoly over institutionalized violence, has been governing the country and formulating its key policies in the domestic and foreign policy arenas. Therefore, the creeping in of an alien religious philosophy within its ranks was tantamount to its radicalization.

3.17. WAR ECONOMY AND FUNDAMENTALISM

As the ISI was the principle organization to distribute money and weapons among the Afghan resistance groups in the 1980s many intelligence officials got involved in the illegal arms trade (Samad Y., 2002: 72) and many also got the opportunity to misappropriate funds given by the US and Arab-Gulf countries for the purpose. Others got involved in drug trade at times on the pretext of raising funds for the intelligence agency’s secret adventures (Abbas, 2005: 148). Many officials for their very personal vested interests also got engaged in preparing militants. Even after the Afghan resistance was over many former ISI officials and religious parties’ leaders continue harbouring militants for monetary reasons. The involvement of intelligence officials and religious parties in fostering militants during the Soviet-Afghan War gave rise to a war economy in the region which has significantly contributed to the radicalizing of Pakistani society as the key products of this economy have been extremists, militants, *madrassas* and weapons. Therefore, to get personnel monetary benefits the ISI officials and religious leaders expanded the war economy and this required the creation of more religiously-indoctrinated militants and *madrassas*.

Thus historically in a nutshell General Zia rule unprecedentedly contributed to the radicalization of Pakistani state and society. In the period (1979-1988) the greatest ever increase was recorded in religious parties and organizations especially militant sectarian organizations. Simultaneously the number of madrassas in the country increased hundred folds in the country. Before his rule there were a total of 700 seminaries in Pakistan with annual rate of increase three percent. At the end of the general’s rule the rate of increase of seminaries was mindboggling 136 percent a year. (Rana, 2000)
3.18 DEMOCRATIC ERA AND UNABATED RADICALIZATION

In 1988 after the killing of General Zia-ul-Haq and several of his key generals in an air crash in Bahawalpur led to restoration of ‘elected’ government. However, this can never be called the return of pure democracy or civilian rule as behind the scenes the military continue to form the country’s foreign and defence policies. The period from 1988 to 1990 is referred to as Democratic Era in the country’s history. The so-called Democratic Era ended in 1999 when General Musharraf usurped state power by staging a coup. During this period four national and provincial elections were held with PPP and Pakistan Muslim League Nawaz faction (PML-N) forming governments alternatively headed by Benazir Bhutto and Nawaz Sharif respectively. Both the leaders used religion to entrench their power base and also to prolong it and for this they hobnobbed with radical forces. The use of religion to cultivate power base by the elected government reinforced and strengthened the radical Islamist discourse in the country and the clerical groups. (Saigol, 2009, 58)

When the PPP form government within months of General Zia’s death after narrowly gaining majority in the national elections the military took solid guarantees from the head of PPP, Benazir Bhutto, regarding her government’s non-interference in the country security, nuclear, Afghan and India policies (Abbas, 2005: 136) the last two being the cause of much of religious extremism since 1980s, before letting her take oath as prime minister. Additionally to circumvent and operationally contain the PPP government and its perceived anti-military agenda, the military propped up one political novice Mian Nawaz Sharif. The gentleman was made the head of Pakistan Muslim League by engineering a new faction—PML-N—through defections from other parties especially Tehreek-e-Istiqlal.101 The aim was to make Sharif a counterweight to the PPP, led Benazir Bhutto, who had returned in 1988 to Pakistan, to lead the democratic struggle against the military rule. The faction was helped created by retired Lt. General Ghulam Jillani, in 1987. General Jillani was a former head of the ISI and Governor of the Punjab province in the General Zia ruled Pakistan. The ISI latter formed a PML-N led alliance of political and religious

---

101 The founder of Tehreek-e-Istiqlal, retired Air Marshal Asghar Khan, who in the 1960s commanded Pakistan Air Force (PAF), is considered one of the cleanest politicians of Pakistan, later filed a petition in the Supreme Court of Pakistan (SCP) to put an end to the notorious Political Cell in the ISI (details elsewhere in this dissertation).
groups called Islami Jamhori Ittehad (IJI) in 1988 to challenge PPP in the elections (Rizvi, 2009: 79) held after the killing of President General Zia and all his key generals in a plane crash on August 17, 1988. Although the IJI could not win majority in the National Assembly in 1988 elections but military helped it formed government in the Punjab, where Sharif became the Chief Minister.

ISI used various tactics to help PML Nawaz faction (PML-N) to win majority in the largest province. Thus Sharif’s PML-N formed government in the Punjab province and gave very tough time to PPP government (1988-90) at the behest of the military. The main concern of the military regarding the PPP government was that with popular mandate the party would follow policies independent of the military that would clash with the military’s dictated state policies. In particular the military feared that the PPP would end Islamabad’s Strategic Depth policy in Afghanistan, proxy war policy in Indian Kashmir and pack up the so-called militant network and roll back the country’s nuclear programme. Another cause of the clash between the military with the PPP has been that the party has always derived its main leadership and strength from Sindh whereas the military has always been dominated by the Punjabis. “The Punjabis represented only one-fourth of the Pakistani population according to the 1951 Census but they occupied 80 per cent of the posts in the army.” (Cohen, 1987: 318) On the other hand the PPP, if not entirely, has had the ingredients of a progressive organization whereas the military in its very composition has had a conservative core. Therefore, the Punjabi dominated and conservative PML-N using the name of the founding party of Pakistan—The Muslim League—was considered by the military-intelligence complex the most appropriate lever to counter the PPP.

Afterwards the military dislodged the PPP government in 1990, just after two years of its five-year constitutional tenure and paved the way for IJI’s coming into power by rigging elections in the alliance’s favour. Benazir Bhutto herself revealed in her autobiography Daughter of the East that Osama bin Laden also contributed millions of dollars to help Sharif and the IJI win

---

102 The formation of the the IJI was admitted by the then Army Chief of Pakistan, General Aslam Baig, ISI Director Generals, Lt. Gen. Hamid Gul and Lt. Gen. Asad Durrani. The Supreme Court of Pakistan in a landmark decision in 2012 held all the gentlemen responsible for formation of the the IJI and rigging elections through distributing money among the anti-PPP groups including the PML-N. (Haqqani, 2005: 219)
elections against her party. The financial links between Al Qaeda and PML-N\textsuperscript{103} resulted in ideologically radicalizing the ranks of the mainstream political parties also.

In order to give PML-N a cutting edge the military and the party leadership established links between the PML-N and the Punjab and Kashmir based Jihadist organizations and more importantly between the former and the TJ. The annual congregation of the TJ at Raiwind (Lahore) reportedly and observably is the second largest Muslim congregation after Haj or Holy pilgrimage to Mecca and Medina. (Zahab, 2002: 123) “The TJ was founded by Muhammad Ilyas Kandhalawi in 1927 and had sworn to carry out jihad but he ultimately settled on da’wa or preaching.” (Boivin, 2002: 104) The TJ has a vast societal base and seemingly keeping this in view the PML-N leaders and its mentors in the establishment wanted to capitalize on it. Although non-violent, the TJ has been accused by some experts of preparing an extremist mindset in Pakistan. For PML-N the TJ became so important that the father of Nawaz Sharif and founder of Sharif family and estate, Mian Sharif, personally become a member of the the TJ while Sharif has been regularly attending its annual congregations. The Sharif family also set-up a separate estate in Raiwind to give an impression that it was close to the TJ. The influence of radical parties on the PML-N and the conservativeness of its top leadership were evident from the policies of Sharif government. During his first tenure (1990-93) that the much-criticized Enforcement of Shariat Act, 1991 was passed by the parliament. The Act emphasized on the Islamization of economy, education and even the media. (Saigol, 1993) In his second stint in power (1997-99) Sharif tabled on the floor of the parliament the notorious Shariat Bill (15\textsuperscript{th} Constitutional Amendment), which if passed would have catapulted him to the position of Amir-ul-Momineen (Leader of the Faithful). So a man who was engineered by General Zia into a leader tried to fully implement the radical agenda of the latter. (Saigol, 2009, 57)

However, during his ruler Sharif gave a free hand to foreign and local terrorist groups to operate in Pakistan and using Pakistani soil to operate in the region which extensively radicalized Pakistan with the state support (Details latter in this chapter).

\textsuperscript{103} A retired pro-Taliban officer of Pakistan Air Force (PAF), Squadron Leader Khalid Khawaja, who also served for a long time in the ISI on deputation, on several occasion revealed that he was the go-between Osama and Sharif. (Gilani, 2009) Soon after this revelation, Khawaja was kidnapped by unknown persons and was found killed in Waziristan on April 10, 2010. The killing was later claimed by the TTP.
The ISI and PML-N efforts in the 1980s and 1990s to use militant organizations in the Punjab and the TJ in the whole country to provide the party a support base to make it a counterweight of PPP required a quid-pro-quo. So in return for their support and services to PML-N the militant and sectarian organizations wanted a free hand. The TJ on the other hand did not have any such demand as its modus operandi and non-involvement in criminal activities made it generally acceptable to the people. But still it wanted an unhindered permission to preach its agenda inside government organizations and departments. (Haqqani, 2005: 151) The military, intelligence agencies and the PML-N government from 1988-90 in the Punjab had to concede to the demands of militant-sectarian organizations and the TJ. Subsequently, as mentioned above, when the PML-N had national governments from 1990-93 and 1997-99 the religious outfits had had complete freedom of operations and manoeuvring. The militant-sectarian organizations carried out their activities in whatever manner they desired as the state agencies turned a blind eye on all their criminal and anti-social activities like extortion of money from the people raising funds for Jihad, killing and intimidation of opponents, running militant training centres, disseminating highly provocative extremist literature, using mosques and its public address system to impart propaganda. As sectarian outfits especially Sunni militant groups operated without inhibition and even with the suspected support of the state agencies members of several criminal groups also joined in to have a promising career. This happened to 500 MQM militants who were abandoned by the party they joined the Sipah-e-Sahaba Pakistan (SSP). The only requirement for their induction was to grow a beard and memorize some anti-Shite lessons as they already had mastered the art of killing. (Abbas, 2005: 207)

On the other hand the TJ was given full access to government organizations including sensitive institutions of the military and national security to preach religion. While militant-sectarian organizations directly radicalize society the TJ prepared a religiously selective and in many ways extremist mindset. In particular the TJ free access to government organizations and its officials influenced many of the state functionaries. This has gone a long way in radicalizing the state machinery. The military’s had a misperception that unlike religio-political parties the TJ was an apolitical movement. Consequently it was not problematic to permit the TJ preachers to work among military officers and civilian state functionaries who otherwise were required to keep away from political parties at least apparently. Above all Zia made it his routine to attend
the TJ annual congregations symbolically bestowing upon the organization official recognition. (Haqqani, 2005: 151)

Consequently the state machinery non-responsiveness to deal with religious militancy had been greatly the result of cultivation of a radical mindset within the state organizations for which adherence to the so-called Islamic injunctions has been more important than conduct, decorum and discipline, which in turn requires detached, dispassionate and non-ideological handling of organizational affairs.

Although the PPP has suffered a lot due to the promotion of religious extremist and terrorist groups but when the party returned to power in 1993, it again approved the military’s policy of a proxy war in Kashmir and nurturing of Afghan militants. Even PPP head and Prime Minister, Benazir Bhutto went an extra miles when she gave a go ahead to the formation of Afghan Taliban. “In spite of Benazir Bhutto’s secular and liberal outlook, she pandered to the religious lobby, in an effort to retain political power. It was during her second tenure (1993-1996), that the Taliban rose to power in Kabul and her Minister of Interior, Naseerullah Babar, described them as ‘our children.’ (Saigol, 2009: 57) Seemingly Pakistani military strategists initially convinced the US in favour of Taliban by arguing that the militia could give Afghanistan the much-needed stability and thus which was a prerequisite for the US fulfil its economic interests in the region of constructing oil and gas pipelines. Likewise, Washington may have been told that through the vehemently anti-Shiite Taliban she could also achieve her strategic end of putting a check on Islamist Iran. Thus it was no coincidence that US hosted a delegation of Afghan Taliban in Washington. (Nojumi, 2002:172) Apart from that the PPP could not take any mentionable steps against the militant and extremist groups. Apparently the PPP did not want to estrange the country’s military-intelligence and to lose government. However, Benazir Bhutto’s bids to appease the military by toeing the latter line in the realm of foreign and security policy could not save her government, which was sent packing again by the military without completing the tenure.
3.18 FORMATION OF AL QAEDA IN PAKISTAN

After the assassination of Abdullah Azam in 1989 Hafiz Saeed formed the the LeT, which focused on Kashmir and to some extent Afghanistan, another trusted disciple of Azzam, Osama bin Laden, had already established the Al Qaeda on 11 AUGUST 1988. The Al-Qaeda was formed in Peshawar at a meeting attended by Osama Bin Laden, Aiman Al Zawahiri and Dr Fadl. (Wander, 2008) The group—Al Qaeda—key focus has been the Arab World aiming to root out western, particularly American, influence over the Arab royal and ruling families. It would ultimately become the biggest global so-called Jihadist or terrorist organization. Al Qaeda was formed in Peshawar; the very fact which shows that the group got its first base in Pakistan before its leadership relocation to Sudan and afterwards to Taliban-ruled Afghanistan. Al Qaeda formation in Pakistan was not without consequences for the latter. Firstly, Osama and Al Qaeda got an embedded support network within Pakistan. Secondly, Al Qaeda established links with certain Pakistani militant organizations and even political parties. Its ties with the the LeT were a natural corollary of Hafiz Saeed and Osama’s earlier work under Azzam and subscribing to the same sect—Wahabism or Salafism.

The links between the the LeT and Al Qaeda on the one hand and the the LeT and Pakistan military on the other hand apparently created sympathy for Al Qaeda among the personnel of the country’s military and intelligence establishment for the so-called global Jihadist agenda of Osama bin Laden. Thirdly, the sympathy among the ranks of Pakistani military and intelligence administration with the Al Qaeda facilitated the establishing of the militant-terrorist network ties with certain right-wing and conservative political and religious-political parties.

Apart from funding certain conservative political parties, Al Qaeda also funded many madrassas and charity organizations like the Al Rasheed Trust. These madrassas and charity organizations hardly did anything positive than radicalizing Pakistani society. The symbolic influence of Osama and Al Qaeda on the people of Pakistan has been great. As Al Qaeda’s and Osama agenda has been based on anti-Americanism it has a special allure for majority Pakistanis who have had deep anti-American sentiments. (See IRI Index: Pakistan Public Opinion Survey, 2008, 2009, 2010) Osama by physically challenging the US and the West, primarily through terrorism, convinced many Pakistanis of his agenda and the appropriateness of the modus operandi to fulfil
that agenda. Consequently, terrorism in the name of Islam got widespread acceptance and even many religious scholars approved suicide bombing as a proper tactic to fight infidels while glossing over the basic Islamic teachings that killing a single innocent person deliberately is tantamount to the murder of entire humanity. This widespread approval of Al Qaeda’s tactics in Pakistan has deeply radicalized and religiously militarized its society.

3.19 JIHAD IN KASHMIR

After the withdrawal of Soviet forces from Afghanistan in 1989 Islamabad decided to divert the energies of Pakistani origin extremist militants as well as some foreign militants, who took part in Afghan war, to Indian-held disputed region of Jammu and Kashmir where an indigenous separatist insurrection had started. General Zia already had a plan in this respect because these militants had no further scope in Afghanistan and they could be purposefully used to tactically engage India in guerrilla warfare in Kashmir in order to compel her to agree to some solution of the longstanding issue (Abbas, 2005: 146) by manipulating the Kashmir uprising. A strategy was formulated and pursued after the death of general by his military successors. The continuous proliferation of seminaries in the 1990 was also the outcome of this strategy as the country’s establishment wanted to use madrassa students as militants for liberating Kashmir. Importantly in the decade of 1990 when the Kashmir militant uprising had been on its apex thousands of madrassas and mosques opened particularly in Pakistani part of Kashmir. The end of anti-Soviet Afghan war and return of Pakistan militants replenished the newly-established madrassas with the militant and indoctrination skills required. (ICG, 2002: 17)

However after years of guerrilla warfare waged through Mujahideen groups Pakistani military-intelligence establishment could not force India to give in on its traditional stance on Kashmir despite of the daredevil fighting and attacks by Kashmiri militant groups with support of Pakistan military. On the other hand the Indian military hold its own in Kashmir due to the immense deployment of troops in the state, which at one point reached 700,000 personnel, using

---

104 In Sura al Ma’edah of Quran God Almighty says: “That is why We decreed for the Children of Israel that whoever kills a soul, without its being guilty of manslaughter or corruption on the earth, is as though he had killed all mankind, and whoever saves a life, is as though he had saved all mankind. Our apostles certainly brought them manifest signs; yet even after that many of them commit excesses on the earth.” (Al Quran, 5:32)
heavy-arm tactics like mass killings, loot, plunder, rape etc. Such engineered uprisings in another country rarely can succeed and is well-known by the perpetrators but have mostly other motives. According to journalist Ahmed Rashid he was repeatedly told by Pakistan army officers that Kashmir issue is going to get more attention if the more unpredictable and strange actions are made by Pakistani-backed militants. (Rashid, 2008: 114)

3.19.1 US Threat to Declare Pak A Terrorist State

It was towards the end of 1991 that US started expressing concern over Pakistan support to terrorist groups but Pakistan denied each time. However, as the US and other countries expressed further annoyance and raised alarm Pakistan had to officially promise to close down militant training camps for Kashmiris established by individuals or political parties. (Haqqani, 2005: 294) Albeit, these promises were never fulfilled and the terrorist threat from Pakistan was felt so seriously by the US that in May 1992 it threatened to designate Pakistan as a country sponsoring terrorism. (Haqqani, 2005: 295)

Between 1992, when the US threatened Pakistan to be declared a state sponsoring terrorism till the watershed incidents of terrorism in 9/11, Pakistan time and again promised to eliminate Islamist militant groups. In this regard some half-hearted actions were also taken. However, more than eliminating the terrorist networks and camps an impression was created that rooting out these militants groups was extremely difficult. A key reason for the difficulty for eliminating the Islamic militant groups, apart from the extensiveness and deepness of the militant network was given as the intractable terrain and remoteness of the FATA, where the foreign militants entrenched themselves. Another reason for the inability to weed out terrorist groups was given as if the government would crackdown on militant with full force it would drive the country in the “hands of the mullahs” (Jehl, 1993) Therefore, international community should not be pressuring Pakistan to go for an all-out onslaught on militancy. Rather Pakistan should be left to deal with the problem in its own way. These reasons continued to be officially cited by Pakistan for its inability to eliminate the militant groups completely while it has simultaneously used them as cover for patronizing of militants continued.
3.20 FAILURE OF *MUJAHIDEEN* TO COMPEL INDIA GIVE UP KASHMIR AND KARGIL CONFLICT

When Pakistani military leadership sensed that the strategy of limited guerrilla warfare against Indian troops was not working it decided to go for the kill through these *Mujahideen* groups backed by regular Pakistani troops, albeit clandestinely, to cross the international border in Kargil sector of the disputed region. A large number of *Mujahideen* and Pakistani regulars, in civvies, crossed the international border in May 1999 and for a moment occupied some territory on the Indian side of the Line of Control (LoC). The Indian military’s full fledge retaliation made the attackers to retreat but not before a threat of a full scale war came from Delhi, which made Pakistani military to disown the attackers.

As Kargil (mis)adventure of Pakistani military ended in a fiasco it dawned upon some, if not all the top generals, that the strategy of guerrilla war in Kashmir had failed. The threat of Indian retaliation and international diplomatic pressure on Islamabad had also become almost irresistible. The US was particularly putting decisive pressure on Islamabad to disown militant groups, which were active in Kashmir and had been working in concert with Al Qaeda as in the meanwhile the latter carried out watershed terrorist attacks in the US on September 9, 2001 in the US. Consequently, Pakistani military had to make some adjustments to its strategy of engaging Indian military through its proxy *Mujahideen* groups in Kashmir for the time being, if not for good. Therefore, the *Mujahideen* leaders were asked to suspend their activities of crossing LoC and fighting Indian troops as the time was not conducive for that. This greatly annoyed these so-called *Mujahideen* outfits as they felt disenchanted. “Pakistan now faces a typical principal-agent problem: the interests of Pakistan (the principal) and those of the militant groups (the agent) are not fully aligned…” (Stern, 2000) This has had disastrous consequences as most of these militants went or shifted by the Pakistani establishment to the FATA on the Afghanistan border turning the tribal region the largest redoubt of international terrorist groups (Details to follow in this chapter).
The TNSM or Tehreek-e-Nifaze-e-Shariat-e-Muhammadi (Movement for the Enforcement of Shariah of Muhammad) role in the radicalization of north-western Pakistan specifically the Malakand region in the KP has been extremely significant. TNSM is arguably the first Pakistani radical groups which resorted to civil disobedience and subsequently to armed struggle for the enforcement of Islamic laws or Shariah. The group was founded in 1989 by an eccentric cleric, Maulana Sufi Muhammad in Dir district but it unveiled its agenda in 1994, surprisingly simultaneously when Afghan Taliban were emerging in Afghanistan. That year the TNSM activists came in thousands on roads in Malakand administrative division comprising several districts including Swat, and crippled the governmental machinery and demanded enforcement of Shariah or Islamic law. “The TNSM took civil court judges and government officials hostage, captured an airport and blocked highways.” (LaPorte, 1995: 184) The riots turned violent and several people including a member of the KP legislature from ruling Pakistan People’s Party (PPP) was killed. The TNSM has been demanding Shariah enforcement in Malakand region; therefore, it had a localized agenda. However, this could be a stratagem on part of the clerics because demanding enforcement of Shariah in the whole of Pakistan or for that matter in the KP, with existing British colonial era administrative institutions and official procedures, at once could be highly unrealistic and impossible to achieve and may precipitate large-scale reaction. On April 20, 1994 the TNSM leadership in a meeting in Batkhela gave a deadline to the government to implement Shariah in Malakand before May 1994. When the government did not meet the TNSM deadline the latter activists blockaded the main road of Malakand linking the region to the rest of Pakistan on May 04 1994, which it kept cut off from May 11 to May 17, 1994. Sensing that the state had no way out and the vacuum could only be filled by Islamic slogans cross-cutting all laws and administrative structures extant in the region, TNSM demanded Shariah. This demand was made by exploiting the sentiments of the people, who wanted efficient administration and quick justice, which they could never get due to the existing administrative structures and legal lacuna. The TNSM in order to implement its agenda established an Islamic Qazi court in open defiance of Pakistani law and constitution. The court was presided by a cleric Maulvi Hazrat Badshah (Shah, 1995: 18-9). On this point the
government gave in and promised enforcement of Shariah but as the government lingered the TNSM activists took hostage certain judicial officers and took possession of several police stations in Swat in November this year.

In November 2001 Sufi Mohammad led around 8000 to 10000 (Rana, 2002: 189) militants from Malakand region to Afghanistan to fight the US-NATO forces. Thousands of the TNSM militants were killed or captured by anti-Taliban Afghan Northern Alliance fighters. Sufi had to flee the battlefield and while returning was arrested by Pakistani authorities and imprisoned for seven years along with thirty fellow militants.105 This episode showed he did not have limited goals rather believed in stateless and international Jihad.

The TNSM role in radicalizing the whole region where it operated since early 1990s has been instrumental. The region since then has produced a large number of militants who have fought in Indian Kashmir, in Afghanistan along the Taliban against the Northern Alliance and subsequently against the US-NATO forces. TNSM proved a forerunner to Pakistani Taliban groups particularly in Malakand (KP), Bajaur and Mohmand (FATA) and since the formation of the TTP has been its cardinal part.106

As a result of Sufi Mohammad's imprisonment, his son-in-law Maulana Fazlullah got hold of the TNSM. Fazlullah-led TNSM become a self-appointed religious vigilante and ultimately terrorist organization, which later merged with the TTP. While Sufi called mainly for the implementation of Islamic judicial system thinking it a pivot for the whole Islamic Shariah, Fazlullah started meddling into people’s private affairs directly and started militant activities. Fazlullah has been trying to establish a state for his clerical ideology and self-aggrandizement in Swat area and wanted to become its ruler like the Miangul family, of the former princely British Indian state of Swat. It was this agenda of Fazlullah which made Swat-Malakand a theatre of terrorism of TTP since 2007 claiming hundreds of lives and displacing around 2.5 million people during the 2009 (May-October) mass exodus in the face of a military operation against the TTP. Although Swat was retaken by Pakistani military but Fazlullah fled vowing to make a comeback.

105 The sentence was pronounced by a special court in Dera Ismail Khan district of the KP convicting him of leading 6000 Pakhtoon tribesmen to Afghanistan violating an official ban. (Rana, 2002: 182-183)

106 The head of Swat Taliban, Maulana Fazlullah, is Sufi’s son-in-law while ex Bajaur Taliban head Maulana Liaquat also was his son-in-law.

151
3.22 AFGHAN TALIBAN AND RADICALIZATION IN PAK

The role of the rise and dominance of Afghan Taliban in religiously radicalizing Pakistan has been profound but is often overlooked. The foremost contribution of the Afghan militia on Pakistan has been their links with Pakistan madrassas students and teachers or mullahs. Most of the Afghan Taliban including their spiritual leader, Mullah Omar, received their religious education from Pakistani madrassas. The ties they established with fellow Pakistani students during their stay in Pakistan helped them increase their fighting prowess on course of attaining state power. Many Pakistanis fought along Taliban to defeat their Afghan opponents particularly Northern Alliance fighters. (Nojumi, 2002:146-150) When these Pakistani fighters returned to their homes, after helping Taliban installed their regime in Afghanistan, they started espousing the agenda and tactics of their Afghan brethren. Although they have not been able to replicate the Afghan Taliban model in Pakistan but the extremism they promoted and terrorism they conducted considerably contributed to the radicalization in the name of Islam in Pakistan, a far more moderate and developed society than rural Afghanistan, from where Taliban derived their real strength.

Secondly, when Taliban overran Kabul in September 1996 and established a regime in Afghanistan, which behaved in profoundly fundamentalist and ruthless manner, it become a model for Pakistani so-called Islamist parties, clerics and militant organizations. Key Pakistan clerics like Maulana Sami ul Haq, head of Jamiat-e-Ulema-e-Islam Sami faction (JUI-S), who also runs the huge madrassa of Akora Khattak, where many Afghan Taliban studied (Dorronsoro, 2002: 168) and Mufti Nizamuddin Shamzai, the Nazim or Chief Administrator of Jamia Banoria in Karachi, which also hosted many Afghan Taliban besides the TNSM Chief, Maulana Sufi Muhammad, to name a few, exhorted Afghan Taliban for establishing an Islamic state and termed it a miracle of the 21st Century. In defence of Taliban, Maulana Sami-ul-Haq said:

Our strongest link with Taliban is Islam and wherever Muslims are fighting for independence, all Muslim countries and freedom-loving states must help them. The Taliban had brought peace to the war-ravaged country. They were never given any breathing space. Then they were the students of our seminaries. The Taliban were
reluctant to surrender to American agenda. The US is itself the biggest terrorist and fundamentalist, and has many ugly manifestations, especially in the form of Zionism.107

Pakistan military and intelligence establishment had been supporting Afghan Taliban before 9/11, which made Afghanistan a virtual province and a dependency of Islamabad. Extensive state-sponsored pro-Taliban propaganda was carried out in Pakistan. US-NATO forces occupation of Afghanistan not only dislodged Taliban regime but also ended de-facto Pakistani rule over Kabul. Strangely Pakistan under Musharraf officially renounced Afghan Taliban, as it was only one of the three countries108 which had extended diplomatic recognition to the Taliban regime, and instead joined US-led international coalition as a non-combatant ally. As Taliban regime used to call itself the *Islamic Emirate of Afghanistan*, their term for a puritanical Islamic state, it became a model for their Pakistani militant sympathizers. This had a great influence on the large *Islamist* community of Pakistan in particular and the sentimental Muslim population in general. Respect for the Taliban system of governance based on repressive punishments of wrongdoers, grew enormously among Pakistanis and many started yearning to replicate it. Joining the international War on Terror was Islamabad’s compulsion as the US had not left another option for General Musharraf than to choose between either siding with Washington or with the global terrorists. Nevertheless, unofficially Islamabad continued courting Taliban and impeding US-NATO war efforts in Afghanistan to mop up Al Qaeda and Taliban resistance. To manipulate general sympathy for Afghan Taliban within the partially informed Pakistani public and in order to give an impression to the World that whatever support Afghan Taliban and Al Qaeda had been receiving from Pakistan was *unofficial*, the military and the intelligence agencies in Musharraf’s regime had to create groups of militants along the Pak-Afghan border particularly in the FATA and the KP. The idea was to provide Afghan Taliban and Al Qaeda a *depth of retreat* and *operational depth*109 across the international border. Various groups of so-called

---

107 Interview with Maulana Samiul Haq, head of Jamiat-e-Ulema Islam (Sami Faction) and owner of Madrassa-e-Haqqania, (Akora Khattak, Madrassa-e-Haqqania, October 2003)

108 Saudi Arabia and United Arab Emirates were the other two countries, which had extended diplomatic recognition to the Taliban regime.

109 Both the terms are original and are aimed at replacing the much-used *Strategic Depth*. 
Jihadists were created in every district of FATA and many districts of KP. The purpose behind the creation of these militant groups was to control their respective areas as warlords; to intimidate local population; to terrorize the people so that any opposition could be squashed; to fight the civilian authority to displace and supplant it and assumed its powers and to recruit fighters and terrorists to fight US-NATO forces in Afghanistan. The militant groups thus created soon adopted the title *Taliban*. This as mentioned earlier was done under a strategy by the military-intelligence complex so that to give an impression that Pakistani Taliban and Afghan Taliban were one and the same people. The common Pakhtoon ethnicity of both served the cause of Pakistani establishment.

Pakistan militant, self-declared Taliban, groups created after 9/11 befittingly served all the above-mentioned aims of the military-intelligence establishment. Seeing them succeed the military-intelligence complex wanted to expand the scope and activities of the groups, hitherto confined to FATA and KP, to the rest of the country to use them as levers for attaining some of the traditional goals of Pakistan Army of which one had been depoliticizing and militarizing the society. However, in the age of media and instantaneous communication when the old methods of depoliticizing were no more appropriate and workable, terrorizing into silence the political and civilian figures by carrying out their killings and bombings political rallies deemed most appropriate. Thus to unleash a reign of terror different militant groups from the FATA and the KP were brought together under the leadership of Baitullah Mehsud to form the Tehreek-e-Taliban Pakistan (TTP) or Movement of Pakistani Taliban.

### 3.23 RADICALIZATION OF RELIGIOUS PARTIES

This dissertation finds Islamist religious groups have been used as instruments by Pakistani ruling elite particularly its military and civilian administrative components since very early period after the formation of Pakistan. This relationship took a new shape when the military started injecting militancy in these otherwise non-militant outfits during the 1971 crisis in East Pakistan and afterwards during the Afghan War (1980-88). It is important to note that some of the religious parties like the the JUI-F, the largest of all the clerical groups, and the JUP followed somewhat independent political course, whereas on the other hand the JI, the perennial ally of
Pakistan military, without having the strength to win significant number of parliamentary seats despite full fledge rigging of elections in its favour by the intelligence agencies, foresaw pursuing the line dictated by country’s military and intelligence agencies its best chance to get some parliamentary seats and keep intact its nuisance value.

As the Afghan resistance was being organized and thousands of militants were being trained by Zia’s regime in Pakistan the country’s religious parties saw the sympathetic and appeasing attitude of the regime towards them as a big opportunity to train many of their respective members as militants, which would provide them a cutting edge in the traditional violence-marred Pakistani political arena. Moreover, having militants within their ranks was a licence for these parties to get US and Arab money that was being dished out for organizing anti-Soviet resistance and whose distribution managed by the ISI. The leaders of these religious parties also considered the situation as a God-sent opportunity to make economic fortune, which was equally important for the leaders and their parties to have any meaningful chance of winning future elections. However, the greed of the bigwigs of religious parties and the historical opportunity for them to carve a niche and to get power by any means, fair or foul particularly violence, allowed fundamentalism to creep into these parties.

Most importantly with more and more of Pakistani Muslim clerical parties’ members got militant training their complexion transformed and their agendas changed. Thenceforth, these parties instead of endeavouring to attain state power by appealing to the public opinion and getting votes in elections now were desirous of controlling the government by overrunning the state and its institutions and putting in place a fundamentalist dispensation euphemistically called Shariah. The radicalization and transformation in aims and agendas of Pakistani Islamic parties has been a huge socio-political change which has extensively radicalized Pakistan society.

Consequently, religious parties felt that their dream of reaching the corridors of powers could only be realized by radicalizing, depoliticizing society and stunting the evolution of a democratic culture in the country to create space for themselves. Noticeably before that mainstream religious parties like the JUI, the JI and the Jamiat Ahle-e-Hadis (JAH) had been part of the political system. Even afterwards these parties have remained active in Pakistan’s political arena but within all these parties militant cadres have surfaced and have strengthened over the years. In a nutshell these parties felt that in order to attain state power they have to nurture militants and
support religious militant and terrorist organizations as they used these as stepping stones to reach the corridors of power.

3.24 RADICALIZATION OF PAKISTANI STATE INSTITUTIONS

The radicalization of Pakistani state institutions started during the regime of General Yahya Khan (1969-71) especially when his fellow generals come up with the thesis of ideological frontiers as well as the JI’s strategic decision of Islamizing the key state institutions from within (see chapter 4 for details). This process exacerbated and enlarged during the rule of General Zia. (Abbas, 2005: 98) Thenceforth, the Army started training its men to defend Islam rather than the nation and protect Pakistan’s territorial and “ideological” (Islamic) frontiers (Rashid, 2008: 35). General Zia also changed the traditional pattern of recruitment in the military. Traditionally most of the recruitment of officers had been done from families, whose many scions had already served in the security forces. Incidentally most of the military officers producing families happened to have upper class and landed-feudal background. General Zia directed to recruit most of the military officers from middle and lower class families particularly having Islamist tilt and backgrounds. The deleterious effects of Zia’s army recruitment polices were increasingly emerging. Where religion was once a taboo topic for discussion apart from politics it became the most discussed subject. This was done at the cost of professional discussions and led to group formations around not only the sectarian division, but also around various schools of thought within the same sect. (Abbas, 2005: 152)

Before that the state institutions dominated by the ruling elite used clerics, Islamic slogans and symbols for safeguarding institutional interests by masquerading them as national interests. As the general required the support of religious parties and fundamentalist officials to support the Afghan Mujahideen anti-Soviet resistance he fully backed Islamist parties and officials within the state institutions. (Haqqani, 2005: 151)

Within the military, the culture of the British Raj was supplanted by a new culture of Quranic study groups, zikr meetings (prayer sessions presided over by Sufis), Milad (celebration of Prophet Muhammad’s birth) and tableegh (evangelism). (Haqqani, 2005: 151)
For Islamizing the armed forces Zia established Directorates of Motivation for each of the three services which recruited *khateebs* (preachers) to reinforce the religious beliefs of the servicemen. However, in the process of recruitment graduates of Deobandi madrassas were given precedence over the largest Pakistani Islamic sect, Barelvi and this trend continued. (ICG, 2002)

A big reason for the radicalization of key Pakistani security related state institutions is their involvement in the Afghan *Mujahideen* anti-Soviet resistance. After the start of CIA sponsored *Mujahideen* resistance to Soviets Pakistan became the largest CIA office outside the USA. Pakistani soldiers fought alongside the Afghan *Mujahideen* in Afghanistan. (Yousaf & Adkin, 1992: 113-114) After the withdrawal of USSR forces from Afghanistan in 1988 Pakistan began pushing *Jihadists* into Indian Kashmir in line with the strategy followed in Afghanistan. An important by-product of the process was that many a Pakistani officials, which were supposed to influence members of the *Jihadist* groups, got influenced by these groups. According to *The New York Times* quoting former Pakistani senior intelligence officials dozens of ISI officers who indoctrinated and imparted militants skills become sympathetic to the cause of the extremists had had to be expelled from the agency. (Gall & Rhode: 2008)

There is substantial evidence that Pakistani officials facilitated the emergence of Afghan Taliban. (Nojumi, 2002; Rashid, 2008) Apparently the strategy of harbouring militants like the Taliban was adopted under influence of radical officials within the state institutions particularly the military, its affiliated intelligence agencies and civilian bureaucracy. The fundamentalist-minded officials must have convinced the otherwise non-fundamentalist military command that through the Taliban, assuming an Islamist facade, Islamabad could realize its strategic state interest in Afghanistan—a pro-Pakistan government. The political leadership on the other hand was persuaded or forced on extending support to Taliban militia as the latter could plug the security and administrative vacuum in Afghanistan and thus could facilitate Islamabad’s aim of opening regional and inter-regional trading routes. The Interior Minister of Benazir Bhutto government (1993-96) retired Maj. Gen. Naseerullah Babar, who is allegedly called the father of Afghan Taliban, was of the view that his government support to the militia was due to its potential to stabilize Afghanistan which could be instrumental in realizing the government aim of establishing new trading bloc through opening new routes.110

---

110 Interview with Naseerullah Babar (Peshawar, February 2008)
However, Babar’s justification hardly suffices for an avowed liberal-secular government to give a go-ahead for supporting religious militants.

But the real motive of the fundamentalists within Pakistani security institutions behind helping Afghan Taliban emerge was to have an experimentation of an Islamic state in Afghanistan to be later followed as a role-model for Pakistan. This was necessary as without having a model in a nearby country an Islamic state could not be formed at once because in Pakistani society the objective conditions were not conducive for establishing an Islamist state structure. Pakistani state institutions were fashioned after the West whereas the social institutions largely were Indian-influenced and thus the minority Islamic fundamentalist did not have the vital support within the society to achieve their aim of a so-called puritanical Islamist state. In other words the Islamist minded officers empirically hoodwinked the military high-command, the country’s political leadership as well as the US by exaggerating the strategic value of Taliban in order to conceal their plan of having an Islamist dispensation in Pakistan. This is an alternative view on the origins of Taliban and needs further research. The dominant view regarding the rise of Taliban held by most writers and researchers has been that Pakistani military-intelligence complex created the militia solely to pursue its policy of Strategic Depth in Afghanistan.

In October 1995 a number of army officers led by a Major General having radical Islamist views were arrested for trying to overthrow Benazir Bhutto’s government. The arrested officers including Major General Zaheerul Islam Abbassi, Brigadier Mustansir Billa and Colonel Azad Minhas wanted to stage a coup to impose an Islamic dispensation after killing all the nine corps commanders of Pakistan Army. These officers were groomed and cultivated by former DG ISI, Lt Gen. Javed Nasir, who by then had become an activist of the TJ. This was the first publicly known case of Islamic fundamentalists within the military attempted to capture power. (Haqqani, 2005: 238) The timing of the coup was profoundly important as it was being orchestrated when Taliban militia had become a force to reckon with in Afghanistan. The unveiling of the conspiracy proves the analysis done in the preceding paragraph that fundamentalist minded officers of the Pakistani security establishment had specific motives in helping Taliban militia. These officials may have wanted to overthrow Bhutto’s government and capture power so that the Taliban militia could be given fullest support in controlling Afghanistan, to replicate the
model in Pakistan as soon as possible for the attainment of the ultimate aim of establishing a regional *Islamic* Empire. The attempted coup by army officers also proved the reversed process of fundamentalist indoctrination among military personnel. It was after the aborted attempt to take over the Army and the state by killing the latter top brass that the then Army Chief, General Waheed Kakar, dismissed two ISI chiefs—Lt. General Javed Nasir and Lt. Gen. Asad Durrani—for violation of channel of command. General Kakar also appointed Lt. Gen. Javed Ashraf Qazi as the new head of ISI with a specific task of purging the ISI of radicals or “Islamists” besides reining in Kashmiri *Mujahideen*. Lt. General Qazi fulfilled that task and many ISI officers having worked with Afghan *Mujahideen* were disengaged and many of them were compulsorily retired from service. However, ill at ease, several of those expelled ISI officers became unofficial consultants of religious extremist groups. (Abbas, 2005: 153)

Since then there had been one known attempt of staging coup from Muslim fundamentalist officers led by Brigadier Ali Khan and some major ranked officers in 2011 (details in next paragraphs) suggesting the constant, unabated and growing radicalization of the state institutions. Apart from that certain other individuals having their specific Islamist idiosyncrasy although did not try to bring about an *Islamic* revolution by staging a coup but they did use their official position to create conditions for such a revolution to take place both in Afghanistan and Pakistan. One such well-known Islamist officers of Pakistan Army was Lt. Gen. Mohammad Aziz. He served as a director in the ISI and in this position he had been the main architect of Afghan Taliban spree of victories against the Northern Alliance while he was also instrumental in supporting covert Kashmir insurgency. He was personally so much involved with Taliban that when after General Musharraf coup in 1999 he was posted as Corps Commander Lahore he would frequently visit Peshawar to look after the operations ran out of Peshawar Corps headquarter to support Taliban. (Rashid, 2008: 29) The rising religious extremism within the armed forces in Pakistan come to the full public view when several military officials were found involved in the two assassination attempts on President General Musharraf for his ostensibly pro-

---

111 Since the late 1980s three purges have taken place leading to the removal of three ISI directors suspected of being sympathetic to the militants. (Gall & Rhode: 2008)
western policies. Twelve of the suspects were found guilty and given death penalty by a military court. (Rashid, 2008: 231)

The two incidents after the killing of Osama bin Laden in Pakistan in May 2011 corroborate the extent of radicalization within Pakistani state institutions. The first was the June 2011 attack by militants associated with Al Qaeda on a key naval facility of Pakistan, PNS Mehran, in Karachi. The importance of the attack in which several navy officials were killed besides the destruction of multi-million dollars worth P3C Orion Naval Aircraft was that Al Qaeda men barged into the naval base, on whose security thousands of security forces personnel had been deputed. After criticism and reports from media that the terrorists had the support from inside the naval base the military spokesman also in bits and pieces admitted the fact. Soon a celebrated Pakistani journalist, Syed Saleem Shehzad, broke a story that the attack on PNS Mehran was revenge from the Al Qaeda because Pakistani navy officials had arrested around 10 of its own officials for having links with Al Qaeda. These naval officials were under investigation and Al Qaeda had demanded to release them without investigation and firing from service. (Shehzad, 2011)\textsuperscript{112} The story further claimed that senior naval officers even held talks with Waziristan based Al Qaeda leaders to come to a compromise but in vain. The result was the Mehran naval base attack. Surprisingly, the journalist within a few days of this story was picked and ruthlessly killed by ‘unknown’ persons but all believed that he was killed by the ISI, which was confirmed by his wife and also a member of Human Rights Watch, who were told in advance by Shehzad that he was receiving threats from the ISI and if he were killed the intelligence agency would be responsible. The killing thus ostensibly was an attempt to prevent information regarding the links of military officials with Al Qaeda as it would have further corroborated that Osama and all other Al Qaeda ranks and files and affiliated terrorists have been provided protection by the fundamentalist elements within the military and the ISI on Pakistani soil. Nevertheless, the incidents testify the deep radicalization of Pakistani institutions particularly the military.

The second incident of 2011 was the announcement by Pakistan military spokesman that a senior officer, Brig Ali Khan and several junior officers including Major Inayat Aziz, Major Iftikhar, Major Sohail Akbar Khan and Major Jawad Baseer of Pakistan Army were arrested for their

\textsuperscript{112} Full story available at http://www.atimes.com/atimes/South_Asia/ME27Df06.html?sms_ss=facebook&at_xt=4dde264f700949a3%2C0
alleged links with banned organization Hizbut Tehreer (HuT). The five military officers were found guilty in August 2012 by the Field General Court Martial of Pakistan Army and handed the punishment of imprisonment of varying lengths. (AFP, 2012) This was the first time senior army officers were convicted and punished for having links with banned Islamist organizations. Not only the state institutions particularly a section of the intelligence agencies personnel got radicalized but huge powers to these state entities to organize militants for Afghanistan and Kashmir also strengthened them and make them more autonomous. (Mezzera & Aftab: 2009)

3.25 MMA: RADICALIZATION OF GOVERNANCE & INSTITUTIONALIZATION OF RADICALIZATION

Noticeably, even before the 9/11 incidents Pakistani military-intelligence establishment had clobbered together leading Islamist parties and named the forum Afghan Defence Council to pursue its policy of protecting Afghan Taliban regime. When in December 2000 UNSC passed Resolution 1333 slapping complete arms embargo on Taliban specifically Pakistan’s weapons supply to the fundamentalist regime ISI created Afghan Defence Council, a conglomerate of 40 Pakistani Islamist groups to resist UN pressure and provide support to Taliban. (Rashid, 2008: 18) The alliance was renamed as Milli Yakjahati Council (Council for the Unity of Muslims) after the 9/11 attacks. The anti US-West rallies of the council pulled large crowds raising the religious parties’ hopes to get state power through this alliance. The military-intelligence complex also considered the religious parties having a share in government through engineered elections necessary to create atmospherics for its future dealing with the US-NATO. In order to be electorally viable the military-intelligence complex helped religious parties overlook their doctrinal, sectarian and positional disputes and gave their alliance a new look by again renaming it this time as Muttahida Majlis-e-Amal (MMA or United Council for Action). The last version with some necessary changes by the military intelligence agencies was tailored to contest the

113 HuT has on a number of occasions had claimed of having the potential of staging a coup to establish Khilafat in Pakistan whenever it wanted as it has numerous members within the country’s Army and other institutions, who can rise above their respective institutional disciple for the greater cause of establishing Khilafat or Islamist system of government.
October 2002 elections successfully during the rule of General Musharraf. The MMA was given all-out support by the ISI (Abbas, 2005: 229) primarily by rigging elections in its favour and by letting anti-American sentiments rage and then portraying the MMA as the spearhead to express and channelize these sentiments. The help from the military-intelligence establishment enabled the MMA to win a significant number of parliamentary seats in the national legislature and Balochistan province and above all in getting majority in the KP province. Consequently, the the MMA formed government in KP and coalition government in Balochistan. How the the MMA during its rule and existence contributed to radicalize Pakistan would be dilated upon later in this chapter.

3.26 ISAF OCCUPATION OF AFGHANISTAN & RADICALIZATION IN PAK

The US-led international coalition forces, dominated by western countries, occupation of Afghanistan after the 9/11 incidents exacerbated anti-western feelings in Pakistan both horizontally and vertically. Such feelings have always been strong inside the country and they have their roots in the colonial period when British ruled undivided India, of whose part was present Pakistan. Indians got independence after launching decades-long political struggle against the imperial British rule. The occupation of Afghanistan by international military coalition was also seen at by many in Pakistan in an *Islamic* light. A perception was instrumentally shaped by the state-monopolized electronic media. Societal allies of military-civilian establishment including the religious and clerical parties carried out unceasing propaganda to present Taliban regime as a reincarnation of the Golden Era of Islamic history of the Righteous Caliphs of Islam, who ruled soon after the demise of Prophet Muhammad (SAW). The loud minority was able to dominate the national discourse and consequently a public opinion was formed in favour of restoration of the Taliban regime arguing it was critical for the revival of Muslim glory.

The neoconservative agenda of the then US President George W. Bush to revive Christian values and the crusading spirit also contributed to the shaping of the perception among majority Pakistanis, of whom many considered the War on Terror as the *Crusade of 21st Century.*
propaganda by the state media and military-intelligence establishment through its paid journalists, analysts and religious leaders immensely contributed to the formation of anti-western feelings in Pakistan as this propaganda struck the largely illiterate, insignificantly literate and politically gullible population at different psychological levels. This propaganda was so effective that hundreds of thousands of Pakistanis got themselves registered with the religious militant organizations to get militant training and to be sent for *Jihad* against the US-NATO forces in Afghanistan. Many of those were trained, religiously brainwashed and were sent to Afghanistan for fighting against the western forces. On the other hand under the influence of propaganda of clerical figures thousands of Pakistani civilians voluntarily went to Afghanistan to fight Americans. The TNSM head Sufi’s leading of around 10,000 untrained and badly-armed followers is a case in a point. Those who got killed while fighting the US-NATO forces in Afghanistan became symbols of *Jihad* for their families, friends and for many other whereas, those who returned imbued many other to wage *Jihad* and get prepared for it.

### 3.27 RISE OF PAKISTANI TALIBAN: THE APOGEE OF RELIGIOUS FUNDAMENTALISM

However, once Afghan Taliban regime was overthrown by the US-led ISAF forces with Pakistan’s tacit agreement and the military establishment also had to put an end to infiltration of proxy fighters from Pakistani into the Indian territory in Kashmir, *Mujahideen-e-Kashmir* had to seek for themselves another front. The change in Islamabad’s policy, although cosmetic, of using militants as proxies was noticeable after the 9/11 incidents. In his January 12, 2002 speech President General Musharraf declared. “... No organization will be allowed to indulge in terrorism in the name of Kashmir. ... We are not the custodians of taking jihad all over the World.” (Rashid, 2008: 117)

Moreover, in the face of irresistible pressure from the US President General Musharraf in May, 2002, asked the ISI to convey to the religious militant leaders that they would have to put an end to their militancy in Kashmir.
Soon a key ISI officer called a meeting of all militant leadership and conveyed to them the regime’s message. Upon this one of the Jihadi leaders said after ditching Afghan Taliban, Musharraf has also abandoned Kashmiri. As the meeting between the ISI official and militant commanders was reported in in-depth detail in some newspapers it was seemingly an ISI leak. The purpose behind the stratagem could be to give an impression that the militants were getting out of the agency’s hand. Nevertheless, it can also not be ruled out that the ISI could not calculate the growing strength of the militant outfits (Abbas, 2005: 227).

Since 2005 Pakistan has seen the resurgence of religious extremism or more precisely the phenomenon called *Talibanization* and it has gradually transformed into Pakistani Taliban Movement. Militant groups calling themselves Taliban started emerging in Pakistan around 2004. According to leaders of different Taliban groups the Islamic philosophy of Jihad was their *raison d’être*. The growing strength of Pakistani Taliban can be gauged from the fact that Taliban groups at the beginning cropped up in the country’s tribal areas or FATA along the border with Afghanistan but slowly they occupied more and more territories in the KP province and gradually elsewhere in the country. An important aspect of Talibanization in Pakistan is that although most of the groups calling them Taliban emerged around 2004 but certain older Islamic militant and apolitical outfits also came to be regarded as *Taliban*. These groups include the TNSM and various outfits of *Mujahideen-e-Kashmir* subsequently called *Punjabi Taliban*. Thus the term *Pakistani Taliban* has become somewhat tantamount to a melting pot for all the Islamist militant and terrorist outfits of the country. However, the differences in the ethnic make up, leadership, orientation, doctrinal beliefs, worldview and objectives of various Taliban outfits of Pakistan makes it quite difficult to explain the phenomenon in generic terms. For instance, unlike Afghan Pakhtoon Taliban, Pakistani Taliban groups have militants from different ethnic groups like Pakhtoons, Punjabis, Urdu-speaking community and some Sindhis. Arguably Balochs is the only major ethnic community of Pakistan, which does not have any significant number of individuals who joined Taliban. Regarding the doctrinal differences certain groups of Taliban in Pakistan subscribe to Hanafi-Deobandi Islamist doctrine and others to Wahabi-Salafi doctrine. The underlying common feature of all Pakistani Taliban groups is their demand and struggle for the enforcement of Islamic *Shariah*. Most of the Taliban groups want *Shariah* in their immediate
social milieu as most of them are limited to a particular area. The TTP, a relatively new organization, has turned out to be a countrywide organization. A number of Kashmiri Jihadi groups, that predated Taliban groups and had militants from different areas and ethnicities of Pakistan, have increasingly merged with the TTP. The shifting of Kashmir based militant groups to the FATA was also aimed to counter the growing influence of India in Afghanistan. (Rashid A., 2009: 32)

As a new warfront was not available to the state-created militants outside Pakistan they gradually started making use of their militant skills to carry out terrorist attacks inside Pakistan. To justify their terrorism the militants came up with the pretext that Pakistani state betrayed the Islamic causes in Afghanistan and Kashmir; therefore, attacks against the state’s including its security forces and installations is an Islamic obligation as the friend of an infidel is also an infidel. In this regard certain statements of President General Musharraf were particularly cited as treacherous. Thus many of the militants and their groups, which were nurtured by the state agencies, become a colossal threat for the very survivability of the state and society.

Farzana Bari brilliantly summarized the process and dynamics of the rise of religious extremism and terrorism in the name of Islam Pakistan:

There are multiple reasons for this fundamentalism and militancy. The roots go back to the pro-independence movement because the issue of [Muslim] identity was there. Because Hindus were in majority in undivided India and Muslim had the sense of insecurity because they had lost their [Mughal] Empire. But Muslims of India were quite diverse ethnically, culturally and linguistically and of course it has been their religion which brought them together. So the role of religion was central in defining the identity of the new nation-state. However, there were competing forces and religious forces have always also been there. When Pakistan came into being these forces tried to create space for themselves in the new state and very soon the religious forces got that space.
With that our foreign policy has also been responsible for the rise of extremism right from the beginning. Because Pakistan could not pursue an independent foreign policy and decided to join the US camp. It was due to the conservative mindset of Pakistani leadership which drove them towards America as the USSR was considered as non-religious, atheist entity. Gradually the internal situation and the external conditions particularly due to the 1979 Soviet invasion of Afghanistan contributed to the strengthening of militancy in the region and Pakistan. Even before that the military had started using the militants and these were created to fight as proxies in Kashmir. In East Pakistan the military has also used non-state religious elements. During the Soviet-Afghan war the CIA and Pakistani establishment strategized the creation of militants. Obviously Pakistan establishment at the same time wanted Strategic Depth in Afghanistan to secure the western borders. So it thought it is right to invest on these militants. With so much money coming and training imparted Pakistan had become a hub of global Jihad. Most of those fighters who came to Pakistan or were brought were religious fanatics, criminals and undesirable elements in their own countries. In other words you brought all these ‘fundos’, who had a criminal history and established training camps for them. Pakistani agencies were also enjoying all the benefits which these militants brought like money and weapons. When the Soviet-Afghan war was over these militants did not want to go back and continue with their militant activities. As a result they kept on flourishing while our establishment people turned a blind eye. The part of the reason was that they wanted to use the same militants in Afghanistan and Kashmir. Then in the 1980s and 90s thousands of madrassas were established to help prepare militants and indoctrinate them. Although some people argue that all madrassas were not involved in militancy but if you observe the timing of the establishment of so many madrassas and the rise of militancy in the region then the correlation is obvious. The building of so many seminaries was politically motivated. These madrassas worked very systematically to prepare a fundamentalist mindset.114

---

114 Interview with Dr Farzana Bari (Islamabad, May 2010)
CONCLUSION

The contents of this chapter are based on the history of factual events, movements and processes that contributed throughout the existence of Pakistan to the formation of extremist social attitudes among majority population of Muslims. The radicalization of society in Pakistan in the name of Islam has largely been the result of the wrong interpretation which the ruling elite consciously has had done of the core national goal. For their own vested interests members of the country’s ruling elite excessively used Islamic slogans, symbols and personalities. This has been sending a very wrong message to the masses, who have been made to believe that Pakistan could only survive, Islam could only revive and they could only rights and develop if the state adopts Islamic structures of governance. However, the ruling elite has never been serious or sincere in putting in place so-called Islamic structures of governance. In order to deflect the blame of failing to form Islamic governance structures the ruling elite has been pointing at western countries and forces as the impediments to the Islamic laws in Pakistan. The blaming of the West especially the US has had cultivated large-scale extremist sentiments among the Muslims of Pakistan. For the ruling elite presenting Pakistan as a symbol of Islamic Revivalism to the masses required to portray rival neighbour India as a Hindu state always on the lookout to undo Islamic Pakistan. Such a propaganda depicting Pakistan as Islamic and India as a Hindu state has been instrumental in formation of extremist social attitudes in the country. The huge challenges to nation-building in a multi-ethnic and multi-lingual state dominated administratively and institutionally by a single ethnic group—the Punjabis—also necessitated the use of clerics by the ruling elite to present Pakistan as the symbol of Islam. The propaganda carried out by Muslim clerics at the behest of the ruling elite and to attain personal and group economic and political interest has also been responsible in the gradual pervasion of religious extremism and terrorism in Pakistan.

The military taking over of the country in its effective and near-total control in late 1950s and the perpetuation of the military hold over power in Pakistan required the military leadership to resort to social engineering to legitimize it in the eyes of the masses. As such social engineering could best be done on the basis of the key and dominant social value—Islam—which has had unmatched appeal for the Pakistani social psychology, the military command had to establish
strong relationship with clerics, which could be instrumental in carrying out the above-mentioned social engineering. To use the clergy the military establishment had to patronize the clerical community with state money and in return the clerics used all their social influence to form extremist social attitudes which are largely anti-democracy and thus pro-authoritarianism. The objectives of military-dictated foreign policy particularly in Afghanistan and India also necessitated the creation of so-called Mujahideen for Afghanistan and Kashmir. The preparation of these militants on Pakistani soil has also contributed to the menace of religious extremism. The facilitation of foreign Muslim fundamentalist groups like Al Qaeda by the country military-intelligence-administrative establishment to emerge and thrive in the country also greatly radicalized Pakistan in the name of Islam. The converging agenda of the US, aiming at defeating the Soviet Communism through Afghan Mujahideen, and the Saudi state, to promote Wahabism in Pakistan, and the attainment of their respective policy objectives through harbouring Muslim militants on Pakistani soil, has also been responsible for the formation of extremist social attitudes in the country. The reverse process of radicalization of officials of military-intelligence-administrative establishment of Pakistan while indulging in social engineering and the resultant radicalization of the security and administrative institution of Pakistan has also played a huge role in radicalizing Pakistan in the name of Islam. The winning of elections and formation of government in the KP and Balochistan by the alliance of religious parties, the the MMA, and its fundamentalist policies also catalyzed the process of radicalization in these provinces in particular and the country in general. The occupation of Afghanistan and dislodging of Afghan Taliban regime by the western-dominated international coalition forces has also catalyzed the process of formation of extremist social attitudes in Pakistan.

While this chapter is regarding the gradual formation of extremist and radical social and individual attitudes and the trends, events, policies and processes, which have contributed to the formation of such attitudes Chapter 5 specify the main factors in descending order of importance, which have been found responsible for extremism and terrorism in the name of Islam in Pakistan.
CHAPTER 4
FROM EXTREMISM TO TERRORISM: TRANSFORMING AIMS AND TACTICS OF FUNDAMENTALIST GROUPS

The relationship between extremism and terrorism is so intimate that most often than not terrorism is the natural corollary of the protracted process of radicalization of some political or religious movement. Factionalism results when political or religious movements lose public support and influence. At times the relatively more extremists among the fundamentalist groups resort to terrorism in order to revive the group’s social influence. (Reinares, 1998; De la Corte, 2006) Apart from that “terrorism would not be possible without the existence of an extreme ideology that provides meaning and justification for the people who plan, execute, and support the violent actions.” (Corte, 2007) On the other hand one of the dominant paradigms in terrorism studies, the Strategic Model, contends that perpetrators of terrorism are fundamentally rational actors and their actions politically motivated. Furthermore the terrorists are political utility maximizers as they employ the tactics because from their standpoint “the expected political gains minus the expected costs outweigh the net expected benefits of alternative forms of protest” (Richardson, 2006). This had typically been the situation which Pakistani state and society experienced between 1980 to 2010 with one important exception that the goals of Pakistani terrorist outfit operating in the name of Islam have not been political per se other than capturing the state power through sheer violence. In the later decade of that period, specifically in its second half, Pakistan faced its worst ever terrorist attacks. The perpetrators of these attacks, in most of the cases, were various so-called Islamist groups or Mujahideen. These groups included the Tehreek-e-Nifaze-Shariat-e-Muhammadi (TNSM), the Tehreek-e-Taliban Pakistan (TTP), the Al Qaeda, the Lashkar-e-Jhanghvi (LeJ), the Punjabi Taliban and the Lashkar-e-Islam (LI). In this period not only certain entirely new terrorist groups, for instance the TTP, emerged but several of the formerly Islamist extremist groups adopted terrorism to carry forward their respective agendas. Earlier during that period the mother of most Pakistani Sunni sectarian, militant organization, Sipah-e-Sahaba Pakistan (SSP), grew out of the Jamiat Ulema-e-Islam (the JUI), one of the oldest fundamentalist political party and groups of Pakistan. This chapter deals with motivations and conditions that have been responsible for the surfacing of totally new
terrorist groups operating in the name of Islam in the country and transmutation of the formerly extremist (and in some instances militant) Islamist outfits into terrorist groups. Seemingly various factors interacted to produce the effect that is terrorism. The chapter also explains the objectives which the terrorist groups operating in the name of Islam want to attain through unleashing a reign of terror across the country in particular the FATA and parts of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KP) like Swat. These motivations have been explained in detail below.

At the same time it is also important to understand why groups and individuals resort to terrorism as the above-mentioned Strategic Model of terrorism studies has its critics. Terrorism may be a rational choice from the standpoint of the terrorists but the strategy is not rational generally. So the terrorists’ rationality is relative and subjective and not absolute or objective. In other words the terrorists may believe that no other way but terrorism could achieve for them which is otherwise unachievable. Otherwise there is substantial evidence that terrorism as a strategy has failed to achieve its aims. The Rand Corporation in the 1980s concluded that “terrorists have been unable to translate the consequences of terrorism into concrete political gains.” (Cordes, Hoffman, Jenkins, Kellen, Moran, & Sater, 1982 and 1983) Around the same time on the other hand Crenshaw was of the view that terrorist organizations were unsuccessful to get “the long-term ideological objectives they claim to seek, and therefore one must conclude that terrorism is objectively a failure.” (Crenshaw, 2001: 15, as cited by Abrahms, 2008: 49) In the 1990s Thomas Schelling arrived at the same conclusion observing terrorism “never appear to accomplish anything politically significant.” (Schelling, 1991) Due to the ineffectiveness of terrorism as a political strategy scholars have questioned the so-called rationality of its employment. For instance, Crenshaw questioned what the purpose of terrorism when it cannot be justified. In response most terrorism experts argue that terrorist outfits have a compulsive proclivity to employ terrorism. This assertion contradicts the validity of the assumptions of the Strategic Model that terrorism is the weapon of last choice when all other non-violent ways lead to nowhere.

Regarding the motivations of terrorists a world-renowned terrorism expert Alex Schmidt stated:
The motivations for engaging in terrorism—a form of violence without moral restraints, targeting preferably civilians—vary: some groups engage in it to defend or advance the interests of a class of people (e.g. the land-owning class or the working class), of a group of people defined in ethnic terms (e.g. white supremacists or brown fascists) or they divide mankind into true believers and infidels. In each case the goal is political power here on earth. Those who are willing to sacrifice their lives for class, race or religion are promised certain rewards. In the case of religious terrorism these rewards are supposedly delivered in another world which makes it special. The objectives of terrorism are the same for secular and religious groups—gain or maintain power here on earth—but the rewards promised to the foot-soldiers who do the killing and dying are different in the case of religious terrorism. Yet there are many religions and they are not all the same. Those of them claiming to be in possession of absolute truth are the most dangerous ones. Religion, like terrorism, is not easy to define. There are many definitions, including this allegoric one: "Religion is a daughter of Hope and Fear, explaining to Ignorance the nature of the Unknowable" (A. Bierce). Man, in his search for meaning, is drawn to religion, especially bad things happen to good people and good things to bad people rather than the other way round as it should be. While some lose faith in face of the fact that life-chances are often unfairly distributed, others manage to give a positive religious interpretation to this.115

These findings and observations are very important from understanding the objectives of terrorism in Pakistan and the formulation of a counterterrorism strategy. At the same time it must be remember, as this study finds, that each country and society has its own peculiar political environment and socio-cultural dynamics as well as the nature of terrorist outfits, which provide either permissive conditions for or inhibitive atmosphere to terrorism and therefore, the findings of one country cannot be generalized across several states or societies. Therefore, in order to understand the phenomenon of terrorism and to devise effective counterterrorism policy the

115 Interview with Alex Schmidt, a former head of UN anti-terrorism unit (by email, April 2010). Schmidt held chair of International Relations at the University of St. Andrews, where he was Director of the Centre for the Study of Terrorism and Political Violence CSTPV. At the time of the interview he was the Director of the Terrorism Research Initiative.
phenomenon should be studied within the cultural and political context of each country. In Pakistan the terrorist groups have justified the adoption of terrorism in the name of Islam, therefore, unlike the western countries, where all the above findings were documented, at least Pakistani terrorist groups have a very strong justification for violence. Although it is equally true that overall terrorism cannot achieve for its perpetrators what they desire—to compel the state to replace the existing political and governance systems with such political and social structures as desired by the terrorists. In the context of Pakistan the leaders of the terrorist outfits operating in the name of Islam seems to have an innate compulsion to use violence. As most of the commanders of Pakistani terrorist outfits have come from extremely tribal and rural background particularly from the FATA, KP and the Punjab, so feeling powerless to carve a niche for themselves in the urban power centres of the country as well as unable to understand how modern world, systems and institutions operate and how one can move forward in these systems and structures they resorted to violence. For other terrorists like Omar Saeed Sheikh, who got education at the London School of Economics, the psychopathological reason seems to have compelled them to resort to terrorism. Nevertheless, to fully comprehend why groups and individuals have been resorting to terrorism in Pakistan a comprehensive analysis is required which is as follows.

4.1 MOTIVATIONS FOR EXTREMISTS TO BECOME TERRORISTS & NEW TERRORIST GROUPS

There have been a number of general motivations for the transformation of radical outfits into terrorist groups and the emergence of purely new terrorist outfits by experts, scholars and researchers. These motivations crosscut national boundaries. The following sections of this chapter would analyze most important of the general motivations and their relevance in the context of Pakistan
4.2 CULMINATION OF RADICALIZATION & ISLAMISTS FAILURE TO GET STATE POWER

Like the rest of the World particularly Muslim countries terrorism in Pakistan in the name of Islam has been the climax of around 30 years of process of radicalization due to the resurging clerical forces heretic or neo-interpretation and exegesis of Islamic scripture. “It (9/11) was the culmination of a rising tide of radicalization which has been sweeping the Muslim world over the last couple of decades from Palestine to Iran, from Pakistan to Sudan, from Afghanistan to Somalia, from Egypt to Algeria, and elsewhere”. (Ferrero, 2005) However, the case of religious terrorism in Pakistan at the same time has also been quite different from other Muslim countries. Terrorism in the name of Islam in Pakistan is partially the outcome of the decades-long radical Islamic narrative at the state or official as well as the societal level. The Islamist movement in Pakistan historically has had disparate elements including the Majlis-e-Ahrar-ul-Islam (Association for the Knights of Islam, the Khaksar Tehreek,116 the Jamaat-e-Islami (Party of the Islam), the Tableeghi Jamaat (Party of the Propagators) and the Jamiat-e-Ulema-e-Islam (Party of the Scholars of Islam). An array of religious groups, the Jamat-i-Islami, the Ahrars117 and the Khaksars for instance, opposed the demand for Pakistan on account of its being insufficiently

116 Allama Inayatullah Mashriqi was the founder of Khaksar Tehreek which basically was a social movement later developed militaristic leanings but did not become a militant outfit. The movement established in 1931 was mainly based in Lahore, however, had millions of followers in the entire British India. The initial aim was to free India from the rule of the British Empire and to establish a Hindu-Muslim government in India. (Amalendu, 2009: 71-72) On March 14, 1937, Allama Mashriqi delivered his 14 points, which became the guiding principles of the movement. (Amalendu, 2009:128). These points suggested that the group had both dictatorial and militaristic objectives. At this point Khaksar Tehreek aims were to establish its rule over India and then perhaps over the entire world. The reflections of these objectives could be found in the arguments of TTP and the LeT commanders. However, unlike the TTP and the LeT, which believe in enforcing their version of Shariah rule through naked use of violence, Khaksars believed in success of Muslim rule in India dependent on certain conditions, such as: "(a) regard for the religious and social sentiments of the various communities that live in this county: (b) maintenance of their particular culture and customs, and (c) general tolerance." (Amalendu, 2009: 130-131). Khaksar Tehreek was disbanded by Mashriqi in October 1947 and then founded Islam League. After the death of Mashriqi his followers revived Khaksar Tehreek which operates in pockets in different parts of Pakistan.

117 Majlis-e-Ahrar-ul-Islam also known in short as Ahrar, was a conservative Sunni Muslim political party in the Indian subcontinent during the British rule. Syed Ata Ullah Shah Bukhari created All India Majlis-e-Ahrar-e-Islam with Maulana Mazhar Ali Azhar, Chaudhry Afzal Haq, Maulana Habib-ur-Rehman Ludhiqani, Sheikh Hissam-ud-Din, Master Taj-uj-Din Ansari and Maulana Zafar Ali Khan on December 29, 1929 before the partition of India. The party opposed Pakistan founder Muhammad Ali Jinnah and establishment of an independent Pakistan.
imbued with the tenets of religion. After partition, these same groups became the loudest proponents of an ‘Islamic state’. (Jalal, 1999: 278) Although having different agendas and modus operandi these groups and parties in Pakistan have somewhat common aim of establishing a fundamentalist Muslim state in Pakistan, albeit in their own peculiar manner. However, all of these groups have utterly failed to attain the aim through political and social struggle spanning several decades.

Two important factors played instrumental role in their failure. The first has been the inability of these outfits to win majority in elections and get political power.

Their (Islamic parties) combined vote came down from 21.5 percent in 1970 to 6.7 percent in 1993. In 1997, all Islamic parties put together got two out of 207 National Assembly seats. It was clear that their real strength and agenda had moved outside the narrow confines of electoral politics and even the territorial limits of Pakistan. (Waseem, 2002: 23)

The second and more important factor behind failure of religious parties of Pakistan in getting political power has been their inability to rally mass public support behind them and to effect change through it. This inability disenchanted most of the leaders, members and followers of the religious parties of Pakistan, who increasingly lost faith in the capacity of their organizations to bring about an Islamic revolution in the country created in the name of Islam. On the one hand the failure of different components of the Pakistani Islamist movement to grab political power and on the other hand disillusionment within and without these parties, in turn, curtailed these parties social influence they once had. In the meanwhile seeing this situation with utter dejection the radical among those parties started resorting to terrorism as the preferred way to regain social influence and ultimately political power. This change of modus operandi is not something unique to Pakistani ideological Islamist parties and movements as historically many fundamentalist religious parties across the World adopted terrorism eventually. “But what happens if the ideological movement or organization has not yet been able to grasp secular power, or if it has lost it, for instance by war like the Taliban in Afghanistan, the Khmer Rouge in Cambodia and a branch of the Anabaptists after their Muenster kingdom had been routed. (Stayer, 1976: chapters
12 and 13: as quoted by Bernholz, 2006) Then the probability is great that the movement turns to guerrilla warfare and terrorism to finally gain or regain secular power against the forces of evil depicted as such by its ideology.” (Bernholz, 2006)

There are some very important examples that could be cited as ready reference regarding concocted grievances of Pakistani religious groups. The TNSM founder Maulana Sufi Muhammad was a the JI renegade (Rana, 2002: 184) who left the JI after disagreeing with its modus operandi of struggling for Islamic system in the country through the constitutional means and participation in mainstream politics resting on electoral system. Consequently, Sufi formed the TNSM to enforce Shariah in Malakand region by the force of arms, mass agitation and sit-ins through crippling state machinery and building pressure on the state to give in to its unconstitutional demands. 118

Sipha-e-Sahaba Pakistan (SSP), the mother of Pakistani militant and terrorist organizations, as mentioned earlier was the outgrowth of the JUI (Abbas, 2005: 204) because the former concluded that the latter failed to implement the Deobandi brand of doctrinaire Islam in Pakistan, a regime in which Shiites, the bête noire of the group, would be declared non-Muslim. The SSP although has been a radical and militant organization but it has taken part in democratically-held elections (Grare, 2009); thus it at least did not have disagreements with the the JUI on the methodology of attaining power and enforcement of Shariah. The SSP by resorting to militancy and vitriolic anti-Shiite rhetoric radicalized its ranks and files until some of the extremist within the group detached from the mother party, considering it pacifist and soft on its enemies and incapable to bring about an Islamic revolution in the country. Consequently, the radical factions of the SSP formed Lashkar-e-Jhanghvi (LeJ), a purely terrorist organization. (Rana, 2002: 204)

Many of the TTP top brass like its first and long-serving deputy commanders Maulvi Faqir Muhammad and Maulvi Waliur Rahman and many other had been former the JUI office-bearers. Mehsud, 2010) Others TTP commanders like Qari Hussain, the master-trainer of suicide bombers; its second head Hakimullah Mehsud, had been associated with LeJ while another commander Maulana Fazlullah was a member of TNSM. On this basis it can be argued that “. . .

118 See Chapter 3 for the origin, complexion and tactics of TNSM.
the JUI has long been a political patron of the Taliban and other Deobandi militant groups. This shows that radicalization of the fundamentalist groups went on but their concomitant failure resulted in relatively more extremist groups resorting to terrorism.

4.3 FACTORS IN GRADUAL PROCESS

Insofar the abrupt emergence of entirely new terrorist organizations like the TTP is concerned, although many of its leading commanders may have been part of extremist parties like the JUI-F and the LeJ but a sizable part of these organizations ranks and files comprise of those who chose terrorism as a first option to press for their objective(s) and their ultimate attainment.

4.4 MINORITY’S GRIEVANCES: AS FIRST CONDITION OF TERRORISM

The first condition that can be considered as a direct cause of terrorism is the existence of concrete grievances among an identifiable subgroup of a larger population, such as an ethnic minority discriminated against by the majority. The extremist groups of Pakistan can be termed as identifiable subgroups because they have their brand names and signature tactics. In the context of Pakistan one of the direct causes of terrorism and the transformation of Islamic radicalism into terrorism in the name of Islam is the grievance of the religious parties and groups, backed by a sizable part of population, is the non-enforcement of Shariah in the country. This has provided a pretext for groups like the TNSM, TTP, SSP, and LI among others to resort to terrorism to achieve the same goal through violence. Pakistani Muslim ideologues categorize Jihad into two main types—external and internal. The former is to wage a holy struggle against those non-Muslim forces and countries which oppress Muslim the latter to them means to create a true Islamic society in Muslim states.

However, there is a radical difference in the conception of extremist parties and groups and general masses regarding Shariah and so-called Islamic system. While the former consider enforcement of Shariah as virtual dictatorship of a specific brand of clerics or sort of Muslims, people generally think Shariah as good governance as explained above.
Pakistani radical groups increasing employment of terrorism terming it as Jihad has been a mere pretext because none of these outfits has ever purely had struggled through political means for the establishment of an Islamic state in Pakistan, although feigning it to be their very raison d'être. Instead all these organizations have either being pursuing power for personal or group aggrandizement or economic gains or to implement their sectarian agenda. There has also been little consensus among these groups on the concrete meanings of their ultimate goal—Islamic State and Islamic Shariah. Against this backdrop the grievance of the dominant Islamic community of clerics is clearly fabricated.

Many minority groups conduct terrorist activities as a way to bring about social change (Kruglanski, 2003). Usually, these groups represent beliefs and positions on political and religious issues which are not readily accepted by the majority. These terrorists are what some social psychologists define as “active minorities.” (Moscovici, Mugny Perlez, 1991; Moscovici, 1996) The TTP objective of overthrowing the existing state dispensation and imposition of its brand of Islam or Shariah in Pakistan is tantamount to bringing about a social change. The TTP, TNSM, the Punjabi Taliban or generally all shades of Pakistani Taliban beliefs of imposing their doctrinal brand of Shariah, formulation of their own ultra-radical domestic and foreign policy for the state, has been unacceptable to the majority Pakistani population but more importantly to the existing power centers and cannot be enforced through the extant power structures. Therefore, for these ‘active minorities’ the most desirable way to achieve their aims is terrorism.

The desired social change of this active minority of Pakistani religious terrorists can be attained by destroying the existing governance and state structures through large-scale terrorism. This requires terrorizing the population of which most are unsupportive of the cause of the extremists. As mentioned earlier in this chapter, the so-called religious parties failed to win popular public support as is evident from the negligible percentage of votes they got in different elections. Thus these groups could not mould the public opinion in their favour. Therefore, the dominant Islamic religious parties started supporting the agenda and tactics of religious terrorist groups. The motive of religious parties for extending this support is that if the people cannot be won over through political means they at least could be silenced through terrorism by making opposition to the violence and radicalization extremely costly. The religious parties believe terrorizing into
silence would create a situation as is explained by the theory of Spiral of Silence\textsuperscript{120} in which the religious parties would dominate the public discourse as well as the public sphere by taking advantage of the terrorizing of the people. In this process the religious parties would become a \textit{Loud Minority} and making the people a \textit{Silent Majority}.\textsuperscript{121}

The social change which Pakistani terrorist groups have perceived as ‘Islamic Revolution’ in essence is the replacement of the existing Pakistani constitution and political and administrative structures with the dictatorship of the former in which state policies are determined by the illiterate or partially-literate clerics.\textsuperscript{122}

4.5 \hspace{1em} \textbf{CONSERVATIVE RELIGIOUS ELITE CRAVING FOR POWER}

The contextual factors behind terrorism have their specific dynamics which are aptly explained by Crenshaw:

\begin{quote}
Context is especially significant as a direct cause of terrorism when it affects an elite, not the mass population. Terrorism is essentially the result of elite disaffection; it represents the strategy of a minority, who may act on behalf of a wider popular constituency who have not been consulted about, and do not necessarily approve of, the terrorists' aims or methods. (Crenshaw, 1981: 383)
\end{quote}

\textsuperscript{120} The spiral of silence is a political science and mass communication theory propounded by the German political scientist Elisabeth Noelle-Neumann. Spiral of silence theory describes the process by which one opinion becomes dominant as those who perceive their opinion to be in the minority do not speak up because they fear isolation from society. For details see (Neumann, 1974)

\textsuperscript{121} The detailed relevance and application of the theory of the Spiral of Silence in Pakistan has been discussed in Chapter 1.

\textsuperscript{122} Social change according to sociologist Wilbert Moore (1967: 3) is a process of significant alteration over time in behaviour patterns and culture, including norms and values. (Schaefer & Lamm: 1992: 603)
This is typically true of Pakistani dominant religious or conservative elite, which believes it represents the popular sentiment while demanding Islamic government and social structures in the country. The ultimate aim of the religious elite in Pakistan has been to replace the traditional social-political elite. However, this craving of the clergy for state power could not be satiated in the context of Pakistan having western political system and state institutions as well as the traditional ruling elite, which only wanted to use the clergy for strengthening its own power base without sharing state power with the latter. “In Pakistan's formative years, the political elites and the civil-military bureaucracy wrestled for power but held the clergy at bay. Some leading ulema were co-opted to give the new state a symbolic Islamic identity, but by and large the clergy were excluded from the power game.” (ICG, 2002) This has been the main cause of the frustration of members of the clergy with the state. The JI founder Maulana Maududi once said: “The ultimate aim of all the Prophets' missions in the world has been to establish the kingdom of God on earth and to enforce the system of life received from Him”. (Zainuddin, 2000: 4) Thus having state and governmental powers are essential to implement the teachings of Islam. So out of frustration and in a hope that the terrorist groups operating in the name of Islam would destroy the existing state structure and institutions and thus would create for the clerical groups the rare opportunity to rule the religious elite, sans the Barelvi sect parties, started supporting religious terrorist groups. Rather, as partially explained above, the religious elite on many instances played an instrumental role in creating terrorist groups. For instance, the the JUI affiliation with and support to Harkat-ul-Ansar, the TTP, various other Pakistani Taliban groups and above all Afghan Taliban are cases in point which are not without any objectives. The the JUI links with Taliban are admitted by a top leader and parliamentarian, Maulana Gul Naseeb’ but with certain reservations.

No, we have acquaintances, relationship with Taliban; many of them remained our disciples. It is wrong that we don’t have any links with them. In Pakistan the same objectives religious forces are trying to get through political means but in Afghanistan Taliban have adopted a militant way to stop Allied forces and US aggression, because the latter has usurped their independence. We disagree with the imitation of modus operandi
of Taliban in Afghanistan in our country; they have their own country and they should do what suit them.123

On the other hand the JI has supported Al Qaeda; Hizb-ul-Mujahideen and other terrorist outfits; whereas TNSM founder Sufi Muhammad was one of Jamaat’s renegades and mentored the TTP head in Swat Maulana Fazlullah, who also was his son-in-law. the JI relationship with Al Qaeda and other terrorist groups has been explained in these words by Ahmed Rashid.

On behalf of the ISI it (the JI) had spawned numerous extremist groups to fight in Kashmir and had twice helped the military undermine the government of Benazir Bhutto in the 1990s. Opposition politicians alleged that the Jamiat was protecting al Qaeda militants. Several alleged militants had been arrested from Jamiat members’ homes in Karachi and Lahore, while the Jamiat leader, Qazi Hussain Ahmed, denied that al Qaeda even existed. (Rashid, 2008: 226)

The majority of Pakistanis have little interest, whatsoever, whether the religious elite is able to grab political or for that matter state power in Pakistan. However, to satisfy their personal craving for power, pelf and perks the members of the religious elite of Pakistan have portrayed their demands as the cherished goal of the entire population but without having receiving any mandate from the latter. Had the majority of Pakistanis been approved of the aims and methods of the dominant religious community it should have voted for the religious parties candidates in elections? But hardly the religious parties got a fraction of the votes of the people. For the religious elite, without state and political power, neither its members can implement their radical agenda nor could satisfy the personal or group craving for power so as to become the new ruling elite. Therefore, it is also necessary for the members of the religious elite to use the pretext of working for the enforcement of Islamic system in Pakistan to masquerade their personal urge for power. Pakistani religious elite instrumental support to terrorism in the name of Islam is

123 Interview with Senator Maulana Gul Naseeb, who remained the JUI-F parliamentary leader in the Senate of Pakistan and president of the party in the KP province (Peshawar, December 2007)
motivated basically by this drive. This is also a significant factor behind the transformation of religious extremist groups increasing use of terrorism in the name of Islam. Here it may again be recalled the religious elite got its present privileged status within the Pakistani society and state structure because of the ruling-elite\textsuperscript{124}dominated state consistent patronage to use the social influence rather nuisance value of the clerics for the purposes of nation-building and perpetuation of its (traditional ruling elite) control over the state and its polices.

It has also been observed that this orthodox elite (the mullahs for instance) has been very entrepreneurial and made good use of their small but vocal and assertive power-base to keep themselves in circulation. The fact that the most prominent among these conservative elites have been vulnerable to opportunistic offers, suggest that their success has been in direct proportion to the willingness of the ruling elite of the time to accommodate them. (Behuria, 2007: 10).

Still there is a significant disconnects between the two elites. Despite of possessing the privileged status the traditional Pakistani ruling elite has never given the religious elite or clerics a decisive say in the country’s policymaking institutions and processes. Therefore, to reach the echelons of power the religious elite has seemingly thought it expedient to support terrorist outfits operating in the name of Islam. In other words the religious elite want to reach the power corridors riding the tidal wave created by terrorist groups.

4.6 MASS PASSIVITY AND ELITE DISATTISFACTION

Terrorism is most likely to occur precisely where mass passivity and elite dissatisfaction coincide. Discontent is not generalized or severe enough to provoke the majority of the populace to action against the regime, yet a small minority, without access to the bases of power that

\footnote{To recall the ruling elite in the context of this study means feudal and industrialist so-called politicians as well as the military and civilian establishment.}
would permit overthrow of the government through coup d’état or subversion, seeks radical change (Crenshaw, 1981: 379). In other words “terrorism is the resort of an elite when conditions are not revolutionary.” (Crenshaw, 1981) As explained earlier majority of the population of Pakistanis has been indifferent to religious parties and never supported them to get state power by voting in their favour. The history of Pakistani elections is testimony to the fact. Therefore, enforcement of Islamic Shariah has never been an ‘obtrusive’ issue\textsuperscript{125} for the mass of Pakistanis. As mentioned earlier this situation also left the religious elite disaffected and somewhat frustrated because its members cannot expect attaining state power through the political process. Therefore, they started supporting terrorists because the members of the dominant religious elite think that in the event Islamic terrorist groups overthrow the existing political system and power configuration an opportunity mechanically would arise for them to get hold of the state itself as the terrorist, in such an event or eventuality, would not have the capacity to run the state affairs. Therefore, the religious elite members have expectation that terrorists eventually would hand over the state to them to run it. This hypothetical scenario seems unrealistic to come to fruition as the terrorists might not be able to run over the Pakistani state. Given the low educational levels and non-cosmopolitan personality-type of members of dominant religious elite of the country, such farfetched expectations are understandable. For the sake of argument if Karl Marx and Frederick Engels like philosophers and social thinkers could foresaw the evolution a classless and stateless communist societies, the revolution that has never happened after the passage of almost 120 years of the death of both, then wishing of ultimately capturing state power by Pakistani mullahs should not seem strange.

\textsuperscript{125} Obtrusive issues are generally issues with which we can have some kind of personal experience, (e.g., city-wide crime or inflation at the gas pump). Unobtrusive issues are issues we cannot directly observe (e.g., national unity). To learn about unobtrusive issues we can't directly observe, we must turn to news media. As such, there tends to be a higher correlation between the salience of unobtrusive issues presented in the news media and audience's perceptions of these issues as important problems. Research performed by Zucker in 1978 suggested that an issue is obtrusive if most members of the public have had direct contact with it, and less obtrusive if audience members have not had direct experience. (Zucker 1978: 225–246)
4.7 MOTIVATIONS FOR OUTRIGHT TERRORISM

Certain Pakistani Islamist radical groups from the very outset have used terror as a tool. The TTP and LI are typical cases of this category of outfits. At the time of their formation the leadership of these groups seemingly discovered that terrorism was the best tool available to make their presence felt and to ultimately grab state power. The yearning for power and ultimate desire to overrun the state in case of LI and TTP has been evident from the fact both outfits established miniature *Islamic emirates* with own *governance* and crude *justice* structures. The LI formed such structures in the Khyber Agency and the TTP in South Waziristan. The latter was named as *Islamic Emirate of Waziristan* (Waqar, 2006) The TTP and LI were only able to establish virtual *sheikhdoms* by overthrowing the existing state dispensation and whatever little state writ extant in the above-mentioned areas. That in turn was possible by terrorizing the local population through tactics like beheadings officials and civilians above all tribal *maliks* (chieftains).

Some organizations like the TNSM changed its tactics from the original agitprop to armed violence because the original tactics failed to win it any major victories. TNSM initial demand was the enforcement of *Shariah* in Swat-Malakand division of the KP province and through its *modus operandi* it twice forced governments to give in to its demand. However, on both these occasions—1993 and 1999—the government notified enforcement of *Shariah* and formed so-called Islamic or *Qazi* courts but on each occasion TNSM first accepted and later rejected the government measures terming them Islamic merely in name. It is also significant to note that around ten thousands armed men went from Pakistan to Afghanistan after the US-NATO occupation of Afghanistan in the wake of 9/11 incidents. (Abbas, 2005: 223) Most of them were mobilized or were from the TNSM.

Most of the traditional mainstream religious political parties like the the JUI-F and the JI supported groups like the TTP and Al Qaeda respectively apart from attempting to effect a social change (as mentioned above) because these parties ultimately realized that despite of half a century in democratic and mainstream politics they could not get political power and could not expect of having it in the future without the support of terrorist organizations in the shape of
intimidating and silencing the majority. Already both major factions of the the JUI had contributed to the foundations of what has been termed as Jihadist culture in Pakistan.

Madrasas affiliated with the Haqqaniya chain of Samiul Haq and the the JUI faction led by Fazlur Rahman established jihad networks across Pakistan’s major urban centres. Jihadi seminaries with Afghan and Arab volunteers spread to Karachi and later the Punjab. Central Asian, North African and Caucasian Muslims also arrived to participate in the Afghan war. (ICG Asia Report, 2003: 13)

Thus groups like the TTP and the TNSM, which emerged as pure terrorist outfits, must have the history of religious parties and the TNSM in front, particularly their failure to get state power and their support to and transmutation into militant-terrorist organizations. Thus they realized the futility of struggling through political means or by establishing organizations to propagate their ideology.

4.8 COMMUNICATIVE DIMENSION

Through terrorism its perpetrators always want to convey a message; the message is from the minority to the majority aimed at changing or moulding the opinion or stance of the latter. Thus terrorism has a communicative dimension. (De la Corte, 2006) When a group of disgruntles feels that its message cannot be put across through normal channels of communication or through routine social and political processes and intercourse, it resorts to violence. As according to one anarchist terrorism is “propaganda by the fact” (De la Corte, 2006), Pakistani so-called Islamist organizations like the TTP, the LI, the Punjabi Taliban among others have resorted to armed violence to make themselves and their agenda known to the public, policy-makers and the World at large. Employing of terrorism by these outfits has been the best way to rise to eminence otherwise the other route to get itself known—political struggle— was too long and uncertain a mean to achieve the same aim.
The TNSM, the TTP, the Punjabi Taliban and the LI all realized that the communicative potential of terrorism must be fully exploited to achieve their respective objectives. Again the example of TNSM serves this chapter’s purpose of explaining why in Pakistan many extremist groups ultimately resort to terrorism or why entirely new terrorist groups emerged. The TNSM after almost two decades of agitprop and occasional violence failed to convince the state to enforce its brand of Shariah in the Malakand region. Therefore, many of its members joined or started supporting the TTP, whose very agenda has been to have its way and sway through terrorism. One of the strands of the strategy of TNSM was to communicate to the people and the government that if its demands were not accepted its upshot would be terrorist attacks to attain the main demand of Islamic system in Swat-Malakand. Afterwards when the TNSM backed TTP insurgents captured the district of Swat in May 2009 and eliminated Pakistani state apparatus and established a virtual fiefdom there the situation also had a communicative dimension. Through this occupation the TTP and its affiliated groups wanted to tell the people, government and the World at large that it has the potential to overrun the state and establish its own writ.

It is widely-known that the head of Swat Taliban Maulana Fazlullah received support from within the country’s security establishment and the the MMA or religious parties’ government of KP to rise as a militant commander and form a well-entrenched militant network in the district. The the JUI-F, which led the the MMA government in the KP, when Fazlullah started his activities in full public view in Swat in 2007, denied its involvement and squarely put the blame on the military.

[In Swat] These are artificially created conditions by the government. On both sides it is the government people. Surprisingly, at the outset authorities maintained there are 500 militants who were resisting in Swat for which 15000 security forces personnel were deployed there. In the ensuing operation none of the militant died and fled. There were only civilian casualties and large-scale damage to property. The purpose of this is to tell the World that Musharraf is doing its utmost to root out terrorism and extremism.\footnote{Interview with Senator Maulana Gul Naseeb (Peshawar, December 2007)}
There are different opinions about what was the motive(s) of the country’s security establishment to support Maulana Fazlullah, helping the maulana launch an insurgency and ultimately letting him to overtake Swat (although briefly) while on the other hand itself (the military) initiating a massive operation (REF) to eliminate the terrorist network and reclaim Swat. The most plausible explanation is that the military wanted to convey different messages to different audiences. To the international especially western audience the military wanted to tell that the institution had always been and could be the only bulwark against Islamic insurgents. The message the military-intelligence establishment wanted to put across to the national audience was that military was the ultimate guarantee of national and people’s security. This communication was not something new from the Pakistan military and was very much the demonstration of the old thesis first conceived and presented by Major General Sher Ali Khan in 1969 when he was appointed Information Minister by military ruler General Yahya Khan (1969-1971).

Sher Ali Khan’s thesis in a nutshell was that the real power of the Pakistan Army in outperforming all other institutions of the state was embedded in its charisma within the general public. This charisma, according to the general, was the result of the lack of direct interaction of the majority of the Pakistanis with the Army. Therefore, for great mass of people, military was a mythical power and magical force that look after the very needs of Pakistanis when all other institutions fail. He argued that unlike the bureaucrats and politicians, with whom the people had routine interaction, the latter considered them as corrupt and oppressive due to which they think of the Army highly and the ultimate assurance of the country’s integrity and well-being. However, Sher Ali argued that this charisma of the military within the public had very weak foundations as it was largely due to their lack of knowledge of the military internal dynamics. Rather the general masses failed to understand that the army personnel were of the same ilk and formed of the same clay as other Pakistanis and could be as rapacious and corrupt as any civilian. Therefore, in order to keep the dominant and elitist status of the Army intact, the latter institutional charisma needed to be reinforced and strengthened otherwise the Army would lose its traditional respect within the masses. (Haqqani, 2005: 54)

The situation in Swat was created so that ultimately the militants could be shown to be uprooted after displacing the entire population of around 2.5 million and launching a massive military
operation. The purpose seemingly was to restore Pakistanis fast eroding faith in the country’s armed forces capacity and to convince the World that Pakistani military has the ability to fight terrorism provided it is given special funds.

The TTP, Punjabi Taliban groups, the TNSM, LI, all of whom were encouraged by Pakistani state security agencies in the hope to use them as tactical assets for the strategic designs in the future, turned their guns towards the state and its institutions as they seemingly got convinced that in order to achieve their grand designs of having an Islamic Empire in South Asia, Afghanistan and Pakistan, it was indeed important first to Islamize Pakistan. In the course of these groups transmutation, which is largely an inescapable process for any engineered extremist or militant group, their leadership started believing that the biggest hurdle in the way of the extremist outfits’ grand designs was the existing Pakistani state. Because the state with its administrative-judicial structures, agencies and political institutions fashioned after the West could not structurally and functionally allow Islamizing of the state and its branches. The removal of this hurdle—the existing state structures and institutions—can be overthrown only through terrorism. If functional ways of political struggle and participation in elections, having the examples of mainstream religious parties in perspective, are adopted than it would not result in the dilution of the state’s structural edifice without which the extremist groups would not be able to impose their brand of Islam and philosophy of governance euphemistically called Khilafat or Shariah over the state and society. Consequently all of these outfits employed terrorism.

The dominant religious political groups particularly the the JUI and the the JI have been claiming that they never supported terrorist groups operating in the name of Islam. However, the links of many members of the TTP to the the JUI (see Chapter 3 for details) and the JI support to Al Qaeda (as mentioned elsewhere in this dissertation) contest rather disproves the claims of these parties. On the other hand country’s leading ulemas associated with these parties have remained silent on the issue of declaring suicide attacks, the spearhead of Islamic terrorist groups in

---

127 This can be gauged from the fact that successive governments failed to outlaw interest-based economic transactions—a totally un-Islamic practice—despite passing Shariat Laws and injecting Islamic provisions in the constitution.
Pakistan, un-Islamic, has also raised many questions regarding the support of these parties to terrorists.\footnote{One of the leading the JUI-F religious scholar, Maulana Hassan Jan, who also remained an elected member of Pakistan’s National Assembly from 1990-1993, was shot dead in Peshawar apparently by Taliban because of his repeated \textit{fatwas} (Islamic edicts) declaring suicide attacks as un-Islamic. However, his party the the JUI-F, which had its government in the KP, in whose capital he was killed, neither brought the culprits to book nor even strongly condemned the murder.}

\subsection*{4.8.1 Unrealistic Goals}

Pakistani religious terrorist groups might have objectives which otherwise seem to be farfetched and implausible ideals. So for many the analysis of the goals of these groups may be hard to believe. However, history of terrorist organizations reveals they often set apparently unbelievable objectives.

Saying that extremist groups resort to terrorism in order to acquire political influence does not mean that all groups have equally precise objectives or that the relationship between means and ends is perfectly clear to an outside observer. Some groups are less realistic about the logic of means and ends than others. \citep{Crenshaw:1981:386}

Similarly in Pakistan fundamentalist religious parties, whose offshoots started engaging in terrorist activities or supporting so-called Islamist terrorist organizations, the ultimate objective of all these radical groups is to grab state power. However, most of the Islamic outfits do not have definitive goals in practical terms for what to have the state power. Most of the Pakistani \textit{Islamist} groups think that having the state power is indispensable for \textit{Islamizing} Pakistani society. Many of them also contend it would be used to make Pakistan a base of Pan-Islamism. Still there are others which have been of the view that state power in Pakistan is necessary to launch global Jihad. But few of the leaders and commanders of these radical groups have precise definition what do they mean of \textit{Islamizing} Pakistani society, \textit{Pan-Islamism} and \textit{Global Jihad}. The use of terrorism by many of the groups testifies that these groups have vague and half-baked
ideas about their objectives and the means to attain these ends. Thus when there are disagreements on the precise objectives the overthrowing of the existing state dispensation and the imposition of a new one is quite unlikely through terrorism. However, through terrorism the creation of conditions in which the fundamentalist groups could dictate their agenda to the rest of society and the state is likely quite possible. As the leadership of Pakistani extremist Islamist organizations is generally unsophisticated and naive, therefore, there is sufficient reason to argue that the radical leaders may have a misperception that by employing isolated terrorist attacks they could bring about an Islamic revolution in Pakistan, a country of nearly 180 to 200 million people. It is also possible that a sizable part of fundamentalist Islamic leadership might know that through terrorism their personal political yearning of having the state power is unattainable. However, by launching terrorist attacks the leadership can still pressurize the ruling elite to give substantial role to the religious elite in the statecraft and most importantly state resources. The above analysis reveals that these groups have only one underlying and common urge of seeking power—to use it for its members personal and group aggrandizement.

4.9 TERRORSIM IN PAKISTAN AS ANARCHISM

If the goals of religious terrorists are unrealistic then the terrorism by Pakistani so-called religious insurgent groups while backed by ostensibly religious political parties can be seen against the backdrop of principle and prescriptions of the ideology of anarchism. As find in this study the ultimate aim of Pakistani extremist and terrorist groups operating in the name of Islam is to capture the state, its power and resources. This is possible only when the existing state and societal structures and organizations could be overthrown. Thus from the standpoint of extremist and terrorists the six tools prescribed by anarchists could be used in this respect. According to the father of classical Anarchism, Michael Bakunin, six steps are necessary to destroy a social structure. These steps are: Kill members of the intelligentsia of a society; kidnap the rich and powerful (particularly those who can pay huge sums of money in ransoms); infiltrate the politicians to look for their foibles and secrets so as to discredit them in the eye of public; assist the convicted criminals to challenge the society’s judicial system and create confusion and hate for the system within the public; Defend the loudmouths, who make destructive declarations;
nurture the supporters (help fellow men and women, who believe in societal destruction. A profile and history of actions by Pakistani religious insurgent groups specifically the TTP, would reveal beyond doubt that it has exactly followed these six tools of the anarchists. However, it needs further research whether these groups ultimate aim is the formation of same governance structures as envisioned by anarchists like syndicates or self-regulating stateless communities to run affairs if they are able to capture the state of Pakistan? Because anarchism is basically a theory of governance whereas, the Pakistani religious insurgent, in their own words want to impose a system of Shariah not only in Pakistan but the entire World. It means that at least the means which the TTP have employed are anarchist in form and essence and it may also resort to anarchist principles in its agenda of governance. This is very much possible because the consequent chaos and instability due to destruction of the existing state and societal structures would be so huge that it would be unmanageable to control a ragtag army of Pakistani religious militants. In such a situation the resort to anarchist ideals of self-regulating communities or syndicates would be the only option.

The use of anarchist tactics by the TTP can also be gauged from the fact that it has resorted to large-scale violence and killings thus sticking to key anarchist principle of propaganda by deed. Moreover, there are some other main anarchist principles which Pakistani extremist-terrorist groups have employed; for instance, the tactic of murder-suicide prescribed by Karl Heinzen. (Heinzen, 1853) Henizen declared murder-suicide the highest form of revolutionary struggle. The TTP has used hundreds of suicide attacks to foment terror across Pakistan. As suicide is haram (completely forbidden) in Islam therefore, seemingly this tactic, which has been the spearhead of the TTP, has more to do with anarchism than Islamism. Heinzen along with another anarchist, Johann Most, advocated the use of weapons of mass destruction. The TTP or other insurgent groups have not used such weapons so far but it is due to their inability rather than restraint that they have not employed these weapons. Thus there is always a danger that if these groups somehow get hold of WMDs they would use them. Anarchist propaganda is not merely limited to deed but anarchists equally calls for “propaganda by word” in order to radicalize the people by use of subversive literature. The TTP has also exactly done the same. It has resorted to large-scale propaganda to justify its subversive activities. It is also important to note that all the extremist, militant and terrorist groups whether the TTP, the LeT, Jaish-e-Muhammad (JeM)
or others have used large-scale propaganda to radicalize Pakistanis, which is typically the tactics of anarchists. Some anarchists like Charles Gallo, Auguste Vaillante, Emile Henry, and Claudius Konigstein advocated the idea that in order the violence to be most effective, the targets must be innocents—killed or maimed—at crowded places like shopping malls or they should be symbols of economic success like stock exchanges. Pakistani religious insurgent-terrorist groups like the TTP have targeted places like the Mariott Hotel in Islamabad, which killed hundreds and there have been many other similar attacks like on the PC Hotel in Peshawar, shopping centres, airports which killed innocent civilians. The perpetrators could not justify such violence and killing while Islam clearly forbids killing of innocent or destruction of property. Again such tactics have more to do with anarchism than Islam, the very basis upon which these groups justify their violence.

4.10 TRIBAL SOCIAL STRUCTURE AND PERMISSIVE CONDITIONS FOR TERRORISM

Environment is also an important factor in providing permissive conditions for an individual to become a terrorist. It is the socialization of a person in an environment which largely determines his or her behaviour and attitudes; developing of extremist tendencies within an individual is no exception.

Obviously, growing up in an environment marked by radical ideas and values could lead one to join a terrorist group which embraces the same ideas and values. For example, many members of Euskadi Ta Askatasuna (ETA), Red Brigades or Irish Republican Army (IRA) were born and raised in families respectively attached to the subculture of Basque nationalist (Reinares, 2001; Romero, 2006), Irish Catholic (Lee, 1983) or Italian radical left-wing. (Della Porta, 1990)

Socialization of the core leadership of the TTP in the profoundly conservative and closed environment of the FATA, where the group emerged, has had the same effect(s). The
totalitarianism and closeness of the social structure in the FATA develops among the inhabitants of the region a peculiar frustration. This frustration creates within individuals a feeling of powerlessness over their lives and behaviour. In other words being subject to the stringent social sanctions of the elaborate and deep-rooted tribal system individual members of the FATA’s society cannot live the life as they like it. On the other hand religion is ubiquitous in the society of the region which provides the only source of solace to the frustrated individual. But a frustrated person’s interpretation of religion could hardly be rational and thus more prone to be radical. The frustration-aggression model contends frustration breeds in an individual violent attitude, which ultimately drive one to behave aggressively. (Myers, Social Psychology: 395) In FATA frustration among the individuals eventually manifested in the form of terrorism in the name of Islam. Against this backdrop the rise of ferocious terrorist commanders like Baitullah Mehsud, who founded the TTP, which carried out the largest and deadliest terrorist attacks of Pakistan’s history; Qari Hussain, the ferocious master-trainer of suicide attackers; Hakimullah Mehsud; Maulvi Faqir, the long-serving deputy commander of TTP; Mengal Bagh Afridi, who founded the terrorist outfit Lashkar-e-Islam and Farman Ali Shinwari, who was appointed as head of Al Qaeda in Pakistan, (Pirzada, 2012) to name of few, have not been coincidental. All these terrorist commanders belong to the FATA and got socialized in the areas environment which is extensively marked by fundamentalist values and ideas.

The environment in FATA has always been conducive for criminal and terrorist elements but in the aftermath of 9/11 incidents national and international terrorist groups took advantage of the facilitating conditions like their near-stateless nature prevalent there and made the region as their redoubt and base wherefrom to launch terroristic attacks by using the areas for running terrorist and militant camps. Several extremist Islamist groups used FATA as laboratories for their transmutation into terrorist outfits whereas others purely terrorist groups like the TTP and the LI took full advantage of the conducive environment to launch themselves from the FATA. Without the FATA providing a space and base to local, national and international terrorist groups, the unprecedented terrorism, which Pakistan and the region, faced after the 9/11 incidents, would not have been possible.
4.11 TERRORISTS IDENTIFICATION WITH LARGER PUBLIC & SOCIETAL INTERESTS

One aspect that terrorist organizations share with ordinary political or religious movements is the central role played by psychological processes of collective identification. Typically, terrorist organizations present themselves as the defenders of the values and interests of an ethnic or religious community. (see Javaloy, Rodriguez, & Espelt, 2003). This dimension of terrorist groups is also quite pertinent while analyzing terrorism in the name of Islam in Pakistan. The so-called Islamist terrorist and militant groups justify their actions by dubbing their struggle for the establishment of a true Islamic state and society, which arguably has been the most cherished social value of Pakistanis. Moreover, Pakistani Islamist terrorist groups by arguing that the very raison d'être of the country is Islam therefore, by labelling their terrorism a struggle to establish an Islamic state, have tried to justify their modus operandi. This identification and association with the society and the official state ideology at large is considered to be helpful by Pakistani religious terrorists to attain their goals. These attempts of Pakistani terrorist outfits to associate with the community are exactly akin to the situation as is explained by the Social Identity Theory. The theory predicts the self-identification of terrorists as members of a much larger community will help them to fulfil their goals. (De la Corte, 2006; Tajfel, 1984; Turner, 1991; Javaloy, Rodriguez and Espelt, 2003; Taylor, 2003) Pakistani religious terrorists have continuously claimed that their violence has been aimed at serving the larger public and societal interest. These groups have at times argued that they were compelled by the government of Pakistan to act in such a way otherwise violence in their motherland, in which many civilians perished, was not their choicest way to press their way forward. Although the majority of Pakistanis do not agree with the aims and agenda of the terrorist groups but the later identification with the most-cherished value of the countrymen—enforcement of Shariah—has won many supporters and sympathizers for these groups.
4.12 MATERIAL, TECHNOLOGY, MANPOWER AND SYMBOLS

Materials including money, technology and arms; manpower like militants, terrorists, collaborators, supporters; and signs and symbols that are unambiguously linked to the ideologies that drive and inspire terrorist campaigns are the fundamental requirements of terrorism. (Waldman, 1997) To get these critical resources, terrorist may resort to theft, extortion, kidnapping or an array of legal and illegal businesses (see Bovenkerk & Chakra, 2004; Ward, 2004). In case of the TTP or other Pakistani Islamist terrorist groups reportedly money came from various sources. Two sources are often suspected to have provided the initial funds. One is the state intelligence agencies and the other is foreign intelligence agencies. There is no concrete evidence that foreign and local intelligence agencies provided funding to Pakistani terrorist organizations. However, given the scale, magnitude and extensiveness of Pakistani terrorist groups’ campaigns and more importantly there abrupt emergence, there is sufficient reason to believe that they must have been provided funds and support by some state agencies (whether foreign or domestic). Afterwards to meet the rising cost of terrorist campaigns and sustaining the violence the groups’ members resorted to robberies, extortion and above all kidnapping. As far as manpower is concerned the majority of fighters in case of the TTP, the LI initially came from the Pakhtoon tribes, which have traditionally, produced ferocious fighters. In the case of the Punjabi Taliban groups, militants chiefly came from the groups and individuals that were trained and indoctrinated by Pakistani military. “In the 1980s, Pakistan’s military dictator, General Muhammad Zia-ul-Haq, nurtured radical Sunni militant groups as terrorist proxies against India over the control of Kashmir, for Pakistan had been defeated in the three conventional wars with India since the 1947 partition” (Majidyar, 2010). Insofar technology and arms are concerned, as mentioned elsewhere in this chapter, the spearhead of the TTP has been human suicide bombers. Keeping in view the situation in Pakistan particularly its north-western tribal areas and resources at the disposal of religious terrorists, human suicide attackers have been the best weapon in their armoury. The extensive use of this method of terrorism employing crude technology is not only cheap, readily and abundantly available129 but is compatible with the ultraconservative social

129 The FATA and the KP, from where most of the suicide bombers belonged, have the highest rates of poverty and unemployment even inside Pakistan. According to different authentic estimates the incidence of poverty in both
attitudes of the terrorists. Above all the terrorists tried to link suicide attacks with Islamic philosophy of Jihad by presenting suicide attacks as the ultimate Islamic sacrifice of Shahadat (martyrdom). This has been done with a purpose to make the people praise the otherwise loathsome act, of killing oneself and others; and if this was not possible to at least accept suicide attacks as legitimate response to state oppression as has been evident through military operations. Presenting suicide attacks as the ultimate Islamic sacrifice by the TTP commanders have also aimed at indoctrinating the young boys to be ready for the ultimate sacrifice, which had become indispensable for the supremacy of their religion and their personal salvation.

Keeping all these aims and conditions in view primarily the availability of potential manpower to become suicide bombers and the leverage available to the terrorists to present suicide attacks as fidayee (martyrdom), some Pakistani Islamist extremist groups thought it expedient to get themselves transformed into terrorist outfits, other radical outfits found it useful to support terrorism while certain fundamentalist individuals felt it righteous to launch entirely new terrorist groups.

### 4.13 ECONOMIC MOTIVATIONS

Certain Pakistani extremist groups and individuals’ adoption of terrorism and the emergence of new terrorist groups also have an economic dimension. In the preceding paragraphs it was found that terrorist campaigns on such a large-scale could not be possible without the alleged financial support from either foreign or domestic intelligence agencies to Pakistani terrorist groups. Therefore, many terrorist leaders, who decided to launch terrorist outfits and to organize terrorist campaigns in the name of Islam, whether belonging to the TTP, the LI or the TNSM, they did so for monetary gains. On the basis of the findings that most of the leaders of Pakistani Taliban and non-Taliban terrorist outfits come from very ordinary family backgrounds it could be inferred

---

regions is above 70 percent. Whereas, the KP is the most densely-populated Pakistani province with little extensive agriculture and negligible industrial base and services sector.

130 For instance, the founder of TTP, Baitullah Mehsud used to be a low-paid cleric and a gym trainer. TTP Swat chapter head Fazlullah was a manual chairlift operator, LI founder Mengal Bagh was a bus cleaner and so on.
and concluded that they joined or launched terrorist outfits primarily for economic reasons and partially for political motives; but the political aims are also ultimately to contribute to their economic objectives. So they and many others of their comrades might have felt that by joining terrorist groups and by launching one they could invite *investment* into the so-called *Jihadist* Network from foreign and domestic agencies. “Young Wazir and Mahsud tribesmen who had guided al Qaeda out of Tora Bora became rich as they provided logistical services for a price. Within a few years these guides had become commanders of the armed groups that emerged as the Pakistani Taliban.” (Rashid, 2008)

The subsequent criminal activities of Pakistani terrorists groups including kidnapping for ransom, extortion etc may also not be entirely for getting funding for the terrorist campaigns but to have a perennial source of income and *enterprise* for enriching themselves. The foreign or domestic paymasters of these terrorist organizations must have been demanding of them concrete and tangible results in the shape of large-scale death and destruction. But the leadership of the terrorist groups found remaining part of extremist groups or launching a new one of no worth as such outfits could only be effective on the psychological and attitudinal level. Whereas, the paymasters’ demanded results which could be delivered on the behavioural level that is by engaging in and organizing of terrorist campaigns.

**4.14 THE RED MOSQUE CRISIS AS PRECIPITATING EVENT**

The concept of a precipitating event that is linked to situational factors is the instant cause of outbreak of terrorist violence. Though precipitating event is generally referred to as the most unreliable cause of terrorism still there is certain government action which catalyzes terrorism. (Crenshaw, 1981: 384) The Red Mosque crisis in Pakistan of 2007 in Islamabad served as a precipitating event for the unprecedented terrorism in the name of Islam in Pakistan. Religious extremism, which had been brewing inside the *madrassas*, manifested in the form of large-scale terrorist attacks. The curators of the madrassa “[Ghazi brothers] threatened civil war if the government did not accept *Sharia* law (Rashid, 2008: 382). It was after the crisis that the Swat Taliban led by Maulana Fazlullah and others groups of Taliban declared an all-out war on the
Pakistani state and vowed to take revenge on the rulers for the killings of the seminary students in the Army operation. These militant groups translated their words into actions by staging massive attacks across the country. “In the three weeks following the July assault, 167 people, including 120 soldiers and policemen, were killed in 21 attacks by militants, which included 12 suicide bombings. . . The country never faced such a devastating bout of terrorism by its own citizens”. (Rashid, 2008: 383)

The Red Mosque crisis also provided a common ground to disparate groups of Pakistani Taliban to eventually join hand and form Pakistani Movement of Taliban or the TTP in December 2007. Thus precipitating event in the shape of Red Mosque Crisis played more significant role in the transformation of religious extremist groups to employ the tool of terrorism in the name of Islam and it gave a potent reason for purely terrorist groups to emerge.131 General Musharraf regime amateurish way of handling the Red Mosque Crisis cordon-sanitarian for Al Qaeda, Pakistani Taliban and other radical outfits, who now joined forces to overrun the existing dispensation and create an Islamic state (Rashid, 2008: 383).

The profundity of the Red Mosque crisis can also be gauged form the fact that it attracted international terrorist groups, hitherto limited to the FATA, to mainland Pakistan.

Al Qaeda’s focus also shifted from Afghanistan to Pakistan, where it saw a demoralized army, a terrified citizenry, and an opportunity to destabilize the state. For the first time, senior Pakistani officials told me, the army’s corps commanders accepted that the situation had radically changed and the state was under threat from Islamic extremism. (Rashid, 2008: 383)

131 Some of these groups included Ghazi Force, named after Ghazi Brothers and Hafsa Brigade named after the Hafsa madrassas for Banat (girl students).
4.15 TERRORISM: A RATIONAL POLITICAL CHOICE

As mentioned elsewhere in this dissertation the resort to terrorism by an organization or a group is a rational political choice. (Crenshaw, 1981: 382) In other words when a group or organization considers that the use of terrorism is the most effective way of advancing or achieving one’s goals and pressuring the government to give in to its demands, the assessment is based on rational calculation instead of unthinkable reaction. The radical Pakistani Islamist groups also resorted to terrorism as they rationally calculated that if they were able to silence the majority through intimidation the democratic government which basically would be dependent on the popular support, could be put on the defensive. Therefore, without people’s backing the democratic government would not be able to adopt a tough line against the terrorists as this would provide the terrorists a wide field of operations and attacks. Thus with people coming under more and more attacks from the terrorists and government unable to control the situation there would be extreme public pressure on the state to engage in talks with the terrorists. Consequently, in these talks, in which the government would participate from a position of weakness, the terrorists could have their demands fulfilled. Pakistani terrorist groups also calculated that a popular political leader with genuine leadership qualities may deal the former with an iron hand. Sensing that this role could be played by PPP head, Benazir Bhutto, she was killed in a suicide attack on December 27, 2007, in Rawalpindi at the end of a public meeting.

The rational calculation of Pakistani terrorists’ actions operating in the name of religion proved quite successful as Pakistani authorities, both civilian and military, made several so-called peace-deals with them. These peace-deals virtually and technically ceded territory to Pakistani terrorist groups like the TTP, Shura Ittehadul Mujahideen and TNSM. The North Waziristan accord

---

132 Benazir had just returned from a decade-long self imposed exile and had unequivocally vowed to challenge the menace of religious extremism and terrorism once voted to power in the elections.

133 This was the second successive attack on Benazir Bhutto as the first attack was made on her entourage on October 18, 2007, the very day she returned to Pakistan after eight years long self-exile.

134 The KP and federal government (mainly army) struck a number of peace deals in different parts of the KP and FATA. Among these peace deals the most prominent were the KP government peace deal with Maulana Fazlullah-led militants in Swat district in 2007; the peace deal between the military with Baitullah Mehsud led TTP militants in South Waziristan (2005) as well as semi-tribal region of Darra Adam Khel and a truce with North Waziristan based Taliban led by Hafiz Gul Babadur. Apart from them local ceasefire deals were also signed with militants in Orakzai and Mohmand agencies of the FATA.
signed on September 5, 2006 the army virtually handed over the region to Taliban control. (Rashid, 2008: 277) This provided the basis for what turned out to be ‘Islamic’ Emirate of Waziristan. The so-called peace deal with the TTP-backed TNSM by the government of KP was signed for the enforcement of Shariah in Swat-Malakand region. The government of KP entered into the agreement with the extremists after getting approval from the national parliament, which gave the same under duress. However, the TTP declared it as its “victory” and started eliminating state apparatus from the region by occupying offices and killing and kidnapping officials and security personnel. This led to a full-blooded military operation against the terrorists in Swat-Malakand area ultimately resulting in the neutralizing of their terrorist network based at a madressa in a locality called Maam Dehrai.

The analysis that terrorist groups are fundamentally “rational” actors proceeds from the argument that terrorist outfits hold internally consensual and consistent set of values, beliefs and worldview. (Crenshaw, 1981: 382) Therefore, one of the findings of this study—Pakistani religious terrorist groups, like the TTP and the LeT, have political objectives—is consistent with this aspect of theoretical understanding of the phenomenon of terrorism in the country. This also expounds why the former members of religious fundamentalist organizations like Sufi Muhammad (TNSM), Baitullah Mehsud (TTP), Haq Nawaz Jhangvi (Sipaha-e-Sahaba Pakistan or SSP) founded these terrorist organizations.

However, despite the apparent consensus and coherence of ideas and values the Pakistani terrorist organizations there have been deep-rooted personal disagreements and conflicts within these outfits. For instance, when founder of the TTP, Baitullah Mehsud, was killed in a US drone attack in August 2009, there was reported fighting and killings among the key successors including Hakimullah Mehsud, Waliur Rahman Mehsud and several others.

---

135 Sufi was a JI renegade, Mehsud was a JUI-F worker and Jhangvi (1952-90), before founding the SSP got his religious training at a madressa and served as vice chairman of the JUI in the Punjab.
4.16 CONCIEVING & NURTURE MUJAHIDEEN FOR NATIONAL SECURITY

One of the important reasons for the transformation of the long-existing extremist Islamist movement into a number of terrorist groups and the emergence of entirely new and downright terrorist organizations in Pakistan has been the military-controlled Pakistani state policy of several thousands militants, euphemistically called *Jihadis* or *Mujahideen* to fight the country’s proxy war in Afghanistan and Kashmir as both have been thought of as critical for Pakistan’s *security*. The state’s policy of creating non-state militants as proxies goes back to the period of General Ayub Khan (1958-69). During the era the Bureau of National Reconstruction, an intelligence and research agency, “proposed solution to Pakistan’s security problems as irregular warfare.” (Haqqani, 2005: 46) While making the proposal the bureau observed:

> In its manpower, Pakistan is very fortunate. In some of the regions’ people have long traditions of irregular fighting. Now that they have got a homeland and a state based on their own ideology they are bound to show great courage and determination to defend them. Then why not train irregular fighters whom even the existing industries of Pakistan can well equip? Of course, they will have to be politically conscious. They will have to be aware of the stakes involved in such a struggle, which is bound to be protracted. Their training in warfare will have to be strenuous and wide in scope. The irregular fighter will have to be shrewd, familiar with local environment factors, aware of the psychology of his own people and of the enemy and of the political consequences of the struggle. (As cited in Haqqani, 2005: 46-47)

**It further wrote on the basis of its findings:**

Irregular warfare can help in reducing the crucial nature of the initial battles of Pakistan. It can help in spreading out prolonging action. The essence of this irregular warfare is to deny the enemy any target and keep attacking him against unexpected places....

Lack of military formalities in the eyes of military experts seems to detract from the respectability of irregular warfare. But actually, it is this lack of formal logic and system which is making it increasingly important in this age of missiles and nuclear weapons. (As cited in Haqqani, 2005: 46-47)
The most extensive production of so-called Islamist militants at the state level was carried out during the era of General Zia, when the military regime followed a policy of society’s militarization and Jihadization mainly to create conditions locally to organize anti-Soviet Afghan resistance in Pakistan and to keep democratic forces at bay. After the anti-Soviet Afghan resistance ended in late 1980s most of the skills of these militants were consumed in Afghan civil war and Indian occupied Kashmir. These guerrilla wars kept on employing the skills of the militants.

However, the state half-hearted efforts to change the policy of nurturing militant after the 9/11 incidents turned many militants against the state (for details see Chapter 3).

Islamization of the state and polity was supposed to have been in the interests of the ruling class, a classic strategy for preserving it from the wrath of the working class. But the amazing success of the state is turning out to be its own undoing. Today it is under attack from religious militants, and rival Islamic groups battle each other with heavy weapons. Ironically the same army—whose men were recruited under the banner of jihad, and which saw itself as the fighting arm of Islam—today stands accused of betrayal, and is almost daily targeted by Islamist suicide bombers. (Hoodhboy, 2009)

In other words on its part “this policy of sustaining the ‘good jihadis’ has strained Pakistan’s social fabric and endangered the state when erstwhile proxies have turned on it.” (Fair; Seth, 2010:2).

4.17 NARROW INTERPRETATION OF ISLAMIC SCRIPTURE AND TERRORISM

The overall degeneration of the discourse on Islam in Pakistan and the relative and thus narrow interpretation of the Islamic scripture particularly the concept of Jihad has played a significant role in the transformation of religious extremist trends in the country into a terrorist movement. The selective and narrow interpretation of Islamic text by Islamic extremist groups resulted in large-scale sectarian violence and killings in the country in 1980s and 1990s which continues with lesser intensity since then. The sectarian violence pattern has mainly been the killings of
members of Shiite minority by Sunni radical and militant groups primarily the SSP. Shiite militant groups also killed many Sunni extremist leaders but their number has been far lower. The pinnacle of the sectarian violence in Pakistan was the assassination of Iranian Counsel General in Lahore, Sadiq Ganji in 1990. A member of SSP, Riaz Basra, was suspected and finally arrested in 1992 but he escaped the custody of police in 1994137 (Abbas, 2005: 204). Basra according to an ex Pakistani intelligence official was operating under direction of some junior ISI officials. (Abbas, 2005: 207) Thus sectarian terrorism between Muslim extremists predates the rise of terrorism in the name of Islam in Pakistan.

The narrow interpretation of Islamic scripture by extremist groups has its links with intergenerational change which the Pakistani radical outfits experienced.

One can distinguish between the two generations of Islamists in Pakistan’s history. The first-generation Islamists, who were generally supra-sectarian, aimed at changing the law of the land, struggled to enter the state through elections, operated through the printed word and dabbled in conceptualizing the West, modernity, science, public morality and statehood. The second-generation Islamists were sectarian, localist and militant. They lacked intellectual tools for understanding the dynamics of the state, the region, and the world at large. They focused on simple polarities such as Islam and the West as good and evil, respectively. They prepared themselves for war against the perceived domination of Christians and Jews over the Muslim World. (Waseem, 2004: 27)

137 Escape of high-value terrorists from the custody of Pakistani authorities has been not uncommon and many suspect they did so with the connivance of the state intelligence agencies as the former were tasked by these agencies to carry out the terrorist attacks. The British-Pakistani Rashid Rauf, who was held responsible by the UK authorities for orchestrating airline bombing also escaped police custody in December 2007 when he was being taken by jail authorities surprisingly in a very casual manner (by foot) from jail to court in Rawalpindi. He was later killed in a US drone attack in Miranshah in the tribal belt137 on November 22, 2008. Whereas, the head of Swat TTP head Maulana Fazlullah, could not be arrested by Pakistani military authorities despite of dismantling its whole terrorist network. All these incidents have been cited as evidence of military-intelligence establishment using the terrorists for its objectives.
4.17.1 Youth Bulge, Purposelessness & Terrorism

Demographic changes in the Pakistani society over the decades like the growing young population or ‘youth bulge’ increasingly outnumbering the old population has also had interacted with this narrow interpretation of Islamic scripture in the employment of terrorism by religious extremist groups and the emergence of new terrorist groups citing Islam as justification for their origin. Although the energies of growing youth population in the country could get another revolutionary form for instance, Marxism-Leninism, but the latter, due to the demise of the Soviet Union, as anti-imperialist ideology in the said era had got too weakened and discredited to be attractive. Moreover, Pakistani youths could also contribute to the process of national development and economic uplift but due to the absence of educational, technical, infrastructural and employment opportunities in the country because of the crisis of governance, which in turn is the effect of political vacuum, the energies and skills of the young population remained unutilize. As youths are generally more revolutionary than other age groups, in Pakistan they found terrorism in the name of religion to be the best revolutionary spirit as in a multiethnic and multi-interest Muslim country any other motivation hardly has a charm. This is consistent with evidence from around the World as analysis of voluminous demographic data reveals that most of the terrorist organizations are composed of unmarried young men. (Abrahms: 2008: 96) Many young boys who could not get proper education and ultimately jobs also went closer towards terrorist groups. Without arguing that the economic compulsions forced youths to join terrorist groups but with nothing to do and being bombarded with extremist religious propaganda a large number of youths become fatalist and went in search of finding solace in Islam. This pulled and pushed many Pakistani youths towards terrorist groups feigning to be Islamic.

Another very important demographic development in Pakistan since the dawn of the 21st Century has been the migration of a large number of people from rural areas and the countryside to the cities and towns. This has substantially increased the population of the urban areas however, have left the infrastructure in tatters giving rise to huge slum localities devoid of any civic facilities. This has transformed these relatively urban areas infrastructurally rural and socially anomic with a culture neither rural nor urban with profound confusion over values and norms. In
such a situation the going of a large number of young men towards extremist, sectarian and terrorist organizations is but natural.

4.17.2 Impact of Globalization & Terrorism

The phenomenon of globalization and media images of persecution of Palestinian by Israel as well as oppression of Kashmiri, Chechen, and Bosnian Muslims by their respective governments also contributed to the formation of a Jihadist mindset in Pakistan. But as due to physical and economic constraints the majority members of this so-called Jihadist culture could not go to help their Muslim brethren in the above-mentioned regions they resorted to terrorism in Pakistan. For this they also developed a pretext that as Pakistani governments have been helping the US, which has its role in each of the above-cited conflicts, therefore, taking on the Pakistani state was a viable option for which the only means could be terrorism.

4.17.3 Continual Dictatorship and Terrorism

Democratic societies usually allow terrorist groups more leverage to operate than the totalitarian regimes, wherein indulging in terrorism is quite difficult; primarily due to the huge capacity and coercive power of the totalitarian state apparatus to suppress violence. However, the case of Pakistan is quite opposite. It has been under the dictatorial regime specifically military rulers’ that helped Islamic extremist and terrorist groups to emerge and get strengthen. This aspect of terrorism in the name of Islam in Pakistan has been explored in detail in Chapter 7, which is regarding the role of political vacuum in the pervasion of religious extremism and terrorism in Pakistani society. The key finding of this study, *inter alia*, the large-scale political vacuum or in other words absence of constitutional and democratic political structures for most part of Pakistan’s history, which has been responsible for the rise and proliferation of fundamentalism and terrorism in the name of Islam.
4.17.4 Psychological Impact of Taliban Success in Establishing an *Islamic* State

Afghan Taliban grabbing of state power in September 1996 in Afghanistan through an armed insurgency set a precedent for Pakistani religious extremist groups as mentioned above. The latter on the one hand have had a longstanding agenda of radicalization of the society and on the other have cherished political objectives of capturing the state power. The capturing of Afghanistan by Taliban and imposition of their regime on the country greatly helped Pakistani military-intelligence complex in organizing militant training of recruits meant to fight in Kashmir in Afghanistan. Under Taliban Pakistan-Afghanistan border did not exist and Pakistani officials relocated most of the militant training camps to Afghanistan. “This gave Pakistani officials greater deniability.” (Haqqani, 2005: 299)

As mentioned above in this chapter Pakistani religious radical groups have had failed to substantially impact the public opinion and thus could not get a sizable number of votes and parliamentary seats in various elections. Seeing Afghan Taliban rise from nowhere in 1994 to capture the whole of Afghanistan within two years, many among these groups got convinced that political struggle could never get them state power. Resultantly, they (extremists) would not be able to realize their goal of establishing a puritanical, a euphemism for clerical dictatorship rather totalitarian, *Islamic* state. Factions within Pakistani religious extremist groups started thinking that they could realize their long-cherished dream of capturing the state by using the *modus operandi* of Taliban—militancy and terrorism. Afghan Taliban success in keeping Afghanistan under their occupation for almost five years and their ability to suppress and browbeat their every political and militant opposition reinforced the believe of the above-mentioned factions among Pakistani Islamist groups in the tools of militancy and terrorism for the attainment of their objectives. Pakistani radical Islamic parties have always found and considered secular and leftwing groups their rivals in the country’s politics so the complete trouncing of Afghan secular and leftist groups by Afghan Taliban through violence also showed the way to Pakistani Islamist to employ violence to coerce into submission and silencing secular opponents.

Most of the Afghan Taliban studied at Pakistani madrassas run by Pakistani religious radical parties specifically the JUI-F and the JUI-S. This also furthered the belief of these parties that capturing state power is not impossible; because if Taliban from their own madrassas could
overrun Afghanistan why Pakistani Taliban from the same madrassas cannot overthrow the state structure in Pakistan? A large number of Pakistani Taliban fought along Afghan Taliban to defeat the rival militias of the latter in Afghanistan. This firsthand experience of victory through militancy contributed to the reinforcement of the impression among Pakistani extremists that through militancy and terrorism Pakistani state machinery could also be neutralized. When the MMA formed provincial governments in 2002 many the JUI mullahs who fought alongside Taliban in the 1990s were now elected members of provincial parliaments in KP (then NWFP) and Balochistan provinces.\textsuperscript{138} This put all the state apparatus in the two provinces on Taliban disposal. (Rashid, 2008: 243)

In leadership of extremist parties calculation Pakistani Taliban numbering in millions have had more potential than their Afghan brethren had to capture state power. The sending of a large number of their members to Afghanistan to fight alongside Taliban against Tajik and Uzbek and other ethnic opponents of the student militia, by Pakistan radical groups was also aimed to create or strengthened their militant cadres. Some Pakistani groups like Harkatul Ansar and Harkatul Jihadul Islami and other even set up their militant and terrorist training camps in Taliban-run Afghanistan. The latter had six training camps during Taliban rule in Afghanistan. (Rana, 2007: 268) A to Z The training and experience went a long way in transforming many Pakistani extremist groups into militant and terrorist outfits.

\section*{4.18 Influence of Al Qaeda}

Like the Afghan Taliban regime which during its rule provided Al Qaeda its biggest base, Pakistani Taliban also provided sanctuaries and a base to the group in Pakistan. When the TTP was established with the coming together of 40 militant commanders from FATA and NWFP, Al Qaeda wasted no time to dominate the umbrella militant outfit. For this purpose Al Qaeda used

\textsuperscript{138} For instance, Maulana Faizullah, the Minister of Agriculture of Balochistan, fought by the side of Mullah Omar in Kandahar. Likewise, Balochistan Information Minister Hafiz Hussain Sharodi became a virtual Taliban spokesman while the curator of Quetta’s Shaldara Madrassa, which was the first Pakistani seminary that had sent its students to fight along Taliban in 1994, turned the madrassa into the rendezvous of Taliban insurgents once the MMA had government in the province. (Rashid, 2008: 243)
its old links with the TTP founder head Baitullah Mehsud, who after 9/11 helped Al Qaeda men escape from Afghanistan. Soon Al Qaeda was directing the TTP militant and terrorist activities. (Rashid, 2009: 386) As Al Qaeda believed in global terrorism, which many Muslims think of true Jihad, therefore, after the overthrown of Afghan Taliban regime by the US-led international coalition forces, many Pakistani militant organizations decided to join forces with Al Qaeda. Around 40 Islamist extremist groups\textsuperscript{139} in Pakistan, all having links with the ISI and so-called Islamist political parties. Many of these groups already had come under the sway of Al Qaeda’s ideology of global \textit{Jihad} before 9/11 weaning them away from their very course of waging a \textit{Jihad} against India. (Rashid, 2008: 220) This inescapably brought Pakistani militant organizations to agree with Al Qaeda regarding the \textit{modus operandi} of \textit{Jihad}—terrorism.

\textbf{CONCLUSION}

The transformation of Islamist extremist crosscurrents in Pakistan into a terrorist wave in the name of Islam is a relatively new phenomenon. Likewise, the emergence of entirely new and out-and-out terrorist groups hitherto (when such groups surfaced) had been an unfounded trend. There are various reasons for both this transformation of religious extremist crosscurrents into terrorism and the surfacing of terrorist groups. The foremost reason is that terrorism in the name of Islam has simply been the culmination of long-drawn religious extremism in Pakistani society. Additionally the failure of Islamist religious parties in gaining political power through elections and influencing the public opinion, have been other key causal factor for many of these parties to support terrorism in the name of Islam and its perpetrators and to allow certain of their ranks to get militant training. These parties have supported terrorism both out of frustration and in hope. In the latter case they have had anticipated that once the terrorist were able to overthrow the existing state dispensation they would have their biggest opportunity to get hold of the state as the terrorist would lack the wherewithal necessary to run the state affairs. The utter lack of faith

\textsuperscript{139} These 40 militant groups were other than which formed TTP in 2007. The groups which formed the TTP only had presence in FATA and KP province whereas the 40 Pakistani militant outfits which joined forces with Al Qaeda after 9/11 had networks across Pakistan particularly the Punjab province and Karachi.
of the new generation of Pakistani Islamist extremists in the existing state structure and political system and their belief in the necessity of overthrowing them also contributed to the rise of religious terrorism in Pakistan. The urge among the extremists, terrorists and certain sections of the population to bring about a desirable social change has also been an underlying factor in the transformation of religious extremism into terrorism and the rise of purely terrorist organizations. Seeking of economic fortune, localized power and status by leaders of terrorist outfits have also been responsible for the emergence of terrorist groups in the name of Islam in Pakistan. Communication also has played its part in the employment of terrorism by certain groups. By supporting terrorism the religious extremist wanted to display the prowess of their community and also to intimidate their rivals and the state that what could happen if power is not ceded to the radicals. On the other hand the terrorist groups wanted to demonstrate their strength and the weakness of the state and above all their intentions of overrunning the state. Anarchists, which could be found in abundance within the Pakistani population, have implicitly supported the terrorists to see their long-cherished goal of destruction of the existing institutions so that to realize the quixotic situation of self-regulating and stateless communities. The rise and overriding success of Afghan Taliban in capturing the state also convinced Pakistani Islamists of the power of terrorism and insurgency. The depravity of the tribal social structure in FATA and the increasing loss of state writ in these areas also contributed to the emergence of terrorist groups in the name of Islam. Narrow interpretation of Islamic scripture also led to the rise of religious terrorism in Pakistan by labelling it as Jihad. Demographic trends in Pakistan in which the young population has briskly outnumbered the older age groups and resultant large-scale unemployment in the young population and general poverty also drove many youths to join terrorist outfits. The training of a large number of fighters by the state intelligence agencies to wage the country’s proxy war in Kashmir and Afghanistan and the decreasing fighting opportunities in these regions have been instrumental in the rise and rampaging of terrorism in the name of Islam inside Pakistan. The occupation of Afghanistan by US-led western forces on the one hand drove many Pakistani extremists to adopt terrorism and on the other motivated neo-fundamentalist to establish purely terrorist organizations. For instance, the oft-repeated stand of the TTP has been that the very raison d'être of the group was to organize Jihad against the infidel forces in Afghanistan by giving all-out support to the Afghan Taliban. Subsequently,
these groups launched large-scale terrorist attacks inside Pakistan because Pakistani state entered into an alliance with the US in the latter Global War Against Terror, which they think has been a war against Islam and Muslims. Last but not the least the precipitating event in the shape of Red Mosque incidents served as a catalyst for the emergence of terrorist outfits. All these factors and motivations in most instances have been related to one another and cannot be seen in isolation. So they all interacted to produce the very strong effect that is the unprecedented terrorism in the name of Islam in the post 9/11 era.

This chapter was about the reasons that why a number of extremist groups transmuted into terrorist outfits; the support of mainstream Pakistani religious parties to terrorist groups and the surfacing of new and downright terrorist groups in the country. This chapter documented the motivational factors for the rise of terrorism and terrorist groups in Pakistan. The next chapter documents, explains and analyzes all the main structural contributing causes (which have been discovered in the course of this study) for phenomenon of religious extremism and terrorism in Pakistan.
CHAPTER 5

CAUSES OF EXTREMISM TERRORISM IN THE NAME OF ISLAM

Generally there are three approaches to studying terrorism and its underlying causes namely macro-sociological\textsuperscript{140}, psychological and psychosocial.\textsuperscript{141} (Corte, 2006) Whereas, factors of terrorism can be classified into two categories. The first category can be termed as \textit{preconditions} the second category can be named as \textit{enabling or permissive} factors category. (Crenshaw, 1981: 380) This study has used a combination of these approaches to study the phenomenon of terrorism in the name of Islam in Pakistan. Given the nature of Islamic extremism in Pakistan and its close interlinks with terrorism in the name of Islam, it is appropriate and valid to use the above-mentioned approaches as frames to study the twin phenomena. Furthermore, the complex nature of the phenomena of Islamic extremism and terrorism in Pakistan warranted the use of a hybrid approach to reach valid and reliable conclusions regarding their causes. In fact, in the context of terrorism studies neither the individual psychology of terrorists, nor the social environments provide a comprehensive and intelligible explanation that why individuals employ terrorism. “For this reason, more and more researchers are turning toward a psychosocial perspective in their studies.” (Corte, 2007) This study has used all the three approaches; but given the societal and macro level prevalence and implications of extremism and terrorism in the name of Islam in Pakistan, this study has drawn more on the macro-sociological and psychosocial or social-psychological approaches. Qualitative analysis of psychological factors

\textsuperscript{140} Macro-sociological approach focuses on the social systems and populations at the level of social structure. It is used to study societal level phenomenon particularly high level of theoretical abstractions. (Calhoun, 2002) The approach deals with broad social phenomenon that can be narrowed down to the smaller features of a society in order to better understand them. “Those researchers who subscribe to a macrosociological approach view terrorism as a reflection of various social dysfunctions or conflictive trends in the social system. In general, terrorism has been associated with several so-called "root causes" that have promoted other kinds of political violence such as riots and street protests, revolutions, civil wars, and international armed conflicts. Some of the possible root causes are poverty, authoritarian and repressive regimes, or cultural and religious practices.” (Corte, 2007)

\textsuperscript{141} While psychological approach to studying the causes of terrorism focuses on the mental profile analysis of individual terrorists the psychosocial approach focuses on the combination and interaction of the psychological and social factors which compel groups and individual to employ terrorism and makes the environment permissive or preventive of terrorism.
has also been carried out to make an attempt to fully discover the underlying causes of religious extremism and terrorism in Pakistan.

The main difference between the current and the preceding chapter is that while Chapter 4 was regarding only the reasons and motivations for the extremist groups or individuals to employ terrorism and the surfacing of completely new terrorist outfits, without having a known extremist history or profile, this chapter provides indepth analysis of the causes of not only of terrorism but also for extremism. Moreover, the preceding chapter was regarding the general motivations of terrorism observed and documented across the World and seeing at Pakistani terrorist outfits and individuals against this backdrop to understand their motivations whereas the present chapter is regarding specific causes of extremism and terrorism and relating it to the general causes of the twin phenomena. Bifurcating the general motivations of terrorism and specific causes of both extremism and terrorism is aimed at addressing the key problem of considering motivations of Pakistani terrorist groups and individuals typical of terrorist outfits and individuals studied around the World. This has also helped in understanding the nature of various Pakistani terrorist outfits and makes their categorization possible that whether a specific organization falls into the category of 19th Century Russian Norodonya Volya, Catholic Irish Republican Army, Islamist Akhwan or Afghan Taliban and so on. Whereas, this study finds that there are certain causes of radicalization and terrorism in the name of Islam which are peculiar to Pakistan whereas there are other causes which are related or similar to causes which have also been explored and documented in other countries. This chapter identifies, explicates and analyzes all the major factors of extremism and terrorism in the name of Islam in Pakistan and shows what role each factor play or has played in radicalizing Pakistani society. Various scholars and observers point at different factors and their combinations for the rise and proliferation of religious extremism and terrorism in Pakistan. Most of these experts and stakeholders agree that all the indicated causes of extremism and terrorism like poverty, unemployment, lack of opportunities, cultural factors have served as contributing or permissive causes for the rise of the phenomenon of religious extremism and terrorism among Muslims in Pakistan. Whereas, this study finds that all the above-mentioned factors have played a role in the rise, proliferation and justification of extremism and terrorism in the name of Islam, however, these contributing causes are in turn the outgrowth of long-existing political, constitutional, legal, administrative vacuum in the country.
This also proves the hypothesis of the study. However, before having a detailed analysis and description of various factors an exhaustive review of most relevant theories, causes and studies on extremism, political violence and terrorism is necessary. The purpose of the review is to help better understand the causes of extremism and terrorism in the name of Islam in Pakistan.

5.1 A BRIEF REVIEW OF RELEVANT THEORIES

This section significantly draws on the work of Victoroff (2005) who has done his own review of different theories. The review of these theories was necessary to attain the objectives of this study. Understanding derived from the analysis of the theories would be instrumental in figuring out the most appropriate counterterrorism policy and strategies for Pakistan. In this section the assumptions of these theories and their relevance to the phenomenon of religious extremism and terrorism in Pakistan is discussed.

5.2 THEORIES OF RADICALIZATION

5.2.1 Identity Theory

According to this theory participating in political violence is an attractive option for young individuals, who lack self-esteem and are seeking to “consolidate their identities” and find self worth. (Erikson, 1959) Empirically most of the Pakistani Taliban and other so-called Jihadist commanders have had come from ordinary rather modest socioeconomic background\textsuperscript{142}; therefore, the assumptions of this theory are quite relevant in the context of Pakistan. The identity and status which Pakistani Islamist extremist and terrorist commanders got would not have been possible had they not been conscious of their original identities and lack of self-esteem. The motivation to form their self-esteem, redeem their identities and to carve a niche for them and their families has been instrumental in these militant commanders resort to violence.

\textsuperscript{142} For examples see Chapter 4 of this dissertation.
5.2.2 Novelty-Seeking Theory

Some individuals have a proclivity for “high-level stimulation, risk, and catharsis,” and employ political violence to fulfill these desires. (Victoroff, 2005: 28) The assumptions of this theory are based on interviews with present and past terrorists. The assumption of the novelty-seeking theory typically explains the personality of Pakistani Taliban commander Hakimullah Mehsud. According to BBC journalist Riffat Orakazi, who met with Mehsud along with a group of newsmen, the latter told him that he was fond of novelties and innovations. Then to prove this the commander deliberately demonstrated his skills in the use of heavy arms and driving an Armoured Personnel Carrier named Humvee snatched from the NATO supplies in Pakistan. During this display of militant skills when a commercial aircraft appeared in the sky, Hakimullah even pointed a heavy machine gun and fired at that plane just for “thrill.”

5.2.3 Social Learning Theory

Bandura (1973, 1998) contends that those individuals, who have a first-hand experience of violence or is a member of a society, which values and cherishes violence, will imitate this behavior. This is typical of inhabitants of Pakistan Federally Administered Tribal Areas (FATA). While having lived and got socialized in the violence-filled environment of the areas, their residents are prone to develop violent personality traits. If most of the deadly Pakistani religious terrorist groups emerged in the FATA then this could be satisfactorily analyzed while keeping assumptions of this theory in view.

5.2.4 Frustration-Aggression Theory

The theory contends that all violence including political violence stem from frustration (Davies, 1973) although the theory has its valid share of criticism. For instance, there may be many individuals, who are frustrated but not all of them resort to violence still the core assumption of the theory is quite plausible though simplistic.

---

143 Interview with Riffat Orakazai (Peshawar, March, 2011), I saw the video of the demonstration, which the journalist had but was not aired.
5.2.5 Strain Theory

A closely aligned theory to the frustration-aggression hypothesis is the strain theory, which comes from the literature on crime and unemployment. (Merton, 1938; Cantor and Land, 1985; Aseltine et al., 2000) In criminology, the strain theory states that social structures within society may pressure citizens to commit crime. Furthermore, that crime (or anti-social behavior) results from emotional frustrations due to discrepancies between aspirations and achievement. The assumptions of this theory could be used to locate the factors responsible for the joining of religious terrorist groups in Pakistan by many young men. For instance, many of those who joined religious extremist and terrorist outfits have been unemployed as well as frustrated due to political, economic, familial educational and religious structures or institutions in Pakistan. This frustration has been specifically significant in case of the FATA and rural areas where the closeness of the social structures\textsuperscript{144} did not and do not allow political, economic and social mobility to the inhabitants of these social settings. Again it is important to note that this closeness of the system and structures has been the result of long-existing political vacuum in the country. In turn due to the absence of genuine and visionary leadership long-term strategic policies to replace the decadent structures could not be devised. The leadership which the country has got could not take cognizance of the strain and stresses these structures have put on the people. Observably genuine and visionary leadership could not emerge due to the long-extant political vacuum in the country.

5.2.6 Relative Deprivation Theory

When groups or individuals suffer relative to others or are deprived of something to which they believe they are entitled, they may participate in violence or extremist movements in order to improve their situation. (Gurr, 1970) The theory has provided the foundation for analysis that attempts to link economic deprivation to terrorism. This theory also holds a lot of substance while analyzing the factors of religious extremism and terrorism in Pakistan. Because, as

\textsuperscript{144} Such social structures are marked by mechanical solidarity as termed by classical French sociologist Emile Durkheim. According to him mechanical solidarity means a society in which people generally all perform the same tasks and in which relationship are closed and intimate. (Schaefer & Lamm, 1992)
mentioned elsewhere in this dissertation, most of the commanders of the terrorist groups operating in Pakistan, emerged from extremely modest backgrounds therefore, their perception of relative deprivation must have played its role in their joining of terrorist groups. Same also seems to be true for the fighters of these terrorist groups. Nevertheless, it would be wrong to conclude that relative deprivation of the ranks and files of Pakistan Islamist extremist and terrorist groups have been the only factor for majority of them to resort to violence.

5.2.7 Rational Choice Theory

The theory, which was first proposed by Sandler, Tschirhart, and Cauley (1983) and latter further developed by Sandler and Lapan (1988); Crenshaw (1992); Wilson (2000), argues that terrorists are neither neurotic nor psychotic or psychopath or sociopath but are rational actors. In other words the theory assumes that terrorist acts are guided by a conscious, rational, calculated decision, which calls for employing the violent means as the optimum strategy to accomplish a sociopolitical goal. Against this backdrop the employing of the tool of terrorism by Pakistani religious extremist groups is also very much rational from their standpoint as discussed in previous chapter. Because without popular support base and having cognizance that they may not be able to win over the majority to their side, Pakistani Islamist extremist groups resorted to armed violence. In their calculation in this way, if even the popular support cannot be rallied behind their aims, at least the majority could be browbeaten into silence to desist from expressing their opinion against the terrorists and their agenda. Martha Crenshaw has raised questions about the veracity of the assumptions of the theory arguing that terrorist believes that their adopted way of political violence would not achieve the sociopolitical goals they cherish. Therefore, this gap rather irreconcilability between these two cognitions, the one regarding the need of using violence and the other about the ultimate futility of the violence to achieve the goals, contradicts the thesis that terrorist are rational actors. The barbarism against non-combatants also contests the thesis that terrorists consider their behaviour as ‘rational.’

On the contrary, it appears that groups and individuals employ terrorism as a practicable alternative for its low-cost strategy which could help the former to achieve their otherwise unachievable goals. (Sandler & Enders 2004)
5.2.8 Religion as an Ideology for Political Violence

An ideology in itself cannot drive groups to behave violently and establishing such a link and considered it to be correct is largely a mistaken assertion. (Victoroff 2005: 5) There has to be a full context and permissive conditions for an ideology to effectively drive a group to resort to political violence. The foremost driver of political violence is the goals and objectives of its perpetrators. In other words politically- motivated violence, as is self-explanatory, ought to have concrete goals and ideology otherwise any violence cannot be categorized as political. Political objectives of terrorists can broadly include the goal to change the form of government or state; claim or reclaim a territory. Berrebi (2009) in his thorough review of the theory of ‘religion as a motivational ideology for political violence’ concludes that groups indulge in violence because of their religious beliefs.145 He stressed:

Dealing with religious terrorism can be confusing, since it is difficult to know whether terrorist organizations, which on the face of it are considered religious, are using religion to attract an audience while primarily motivated by secular goals. Further confusing to the outside observer is when political goals are claimed by terrorist organizations in the name of religion, despite the fact that religion was not at the source of these claims. (Berrebi, 2009)

The above mentioned description of the motives of terrorism perpetrated in the name of religion is profoundly true of Pakistani religious terrorist organizations operating in the name of Islam while cherishing purely secular aims of getting the state power through violence (as explained elsewhere in this dissertation). Therefore, Islam as a religion has nothing to do with the actions of these people. (Roy, 2004)

145 The terror created in the name of religion is not an end in itself rather is a means towards a larger goal, which is not conventional in nature. According to the U.S. National Commission on Terrorism: “Today’s terrorists don’t want a seat at the table, they want to destroy the table and everyone sitting at it.” Moreover, religious terrorists held themselves accountable and answerable only to God (or their idea of God) and consider their violence is divinely sanctioned. “Thus they operate within different moral, political, and practical constraints than secular terrorists” (Countering the Changing Threat of International Terrorism, 2000)
5.2.9 Poverty and Lack or Low Education as Drivers for Political Violence

For a considerable time it was hypothesized and also believed that poverty and lack of or low education has been among the key causes of terrorism. However, certain studies focusing on Palestinian and Lebanese terrorists contend, on the basis of thorough examination of biographical data of terrorists, that poverty and lack of or low education, were not the main causes of terrorism. Although such findings may be relevant to the specific conditions and socio-political context of Palestine and Lebanon but they cannot be generalized across all the countries especially Muslim societies. In the context of Pakistan the conditions of poverty and lack of or low education have certainly been the key contributing factors in political violence and terrorism in the name of Islam; although they have far from been the root causes. The most important evidence for this argument is that hardly a mentionable numbers of individuals, who belong to well-off or socially or politically well-known Pakistani families, have been found part of extremist or terrorist organizations. There is only one exception that is of Omar Saeed Sheikh, an Al Qaeda operative, who killed US journalist Daniel Pearl. He belongs to a rich family and also got education at the London School of Economics.

There is one important aspect of the linkage between education and terrorism is that very few Pakistanis having social sciences or humanities educational background could be found among the ranks of religious terrorists or extremists. One known exception is Farman Ali Shinwari, who became the operational head of Al Qaeda in Pakistan in 2012. He is said to have obtained an MA degree in international relations. Those highly educated, who joined terrorist groups mostly were either doctors or engineers. For instance, Dr. Asad remained part of the TTP in Mohmand tribal district. More obvious example is that of Dr. Afia Siddiqui, who was putting up with Al Qaeda in Afghanistan before her arrest by the US forces and shifting to the US.

In addition to that education allows individuals particularly youths to have a better access to and participation in the political and economic system, which leads to non-violent attainment of objectives and goals like employment or change of system or government.

Certain experts argue that there is hardly any concrete evidence to link madrassas with terrorism. After having done analysis of data collected through survey, census report and expert opinion (Winthrop and Graff, 2010) discovered that madrassas are not clearly linked to terrorism. The biggest limitation of this study is that these experts could not gather data from thousands of
militant-madrassas particularly established on the Pak-Afghan border during the anti-Soviet Afghan resistance as well as remote areas of Pakistan, which produced not only Afghan militants but also many Pakistani terrorists in 1990s and 2000s. Another limitation of this study is that survey data in this regard cannot be relied upon because no one from madrassas admits they have been involved in terrorism or for that matter militancy.146

The incontrovertible proof of madrassas role in indoctrinating their students with radicalism and imparting them terrorist training was the 2007 extremist episodes in which students of Jamia Hafsa and Jamia Faridia were involved. The two madrassas were linked to Red Mosque crisis. The way the students of these madrassas resorted to violence was seen for days live around the World through satellite TV channels (For details see Chapter 3). The involvement of the two madrassas’ students in terrorism also proves the authenticity of qualitative methodology this study has employed to study the twin phenomenon of religious extremism and terrorism in Pakistan. Because relying on quantitative data based on the answers or surveys of owners, teachers and students of madrassas would never establish the link between extremism-terrorism and madrassas.

The other argument of Winthrop and Graff’s (2010) that usually parents send their children to madrassas because they value religious education and radicalization is in no way an obvious outcome, could be contested on many counts. Parents generally in a deeply religious Pakistani society definitely value Islamic education but for that matter most of them send them to Maktabs not madrassas. Maktabs are often part of the community mosques, which do not provide boarding and food to those who come to get religious education especially of Quran. Instead those parents who sent their children to madrassas mostly aim at having shelter and food for their children because they themselves cannot afford these necessities. Madrassa education can also ensure a modest employment of becoming a maulvi for their children in future.

146 This the researcher observed during the course of his study while visiting different Pakistani madrassas and asking the owners, operators and teachers whether their madrassas have been involved in producing militants. Even Maulana Samiul Haq, the owner of Madrassa Haqqania, the most notorious seminary for creating indoctrinated militants, and also the head of the religious party, the JUI’s Sami faction, absolutely denied his madrassa’s involvement in militancy and terrorism. This is despite of the fact that it is an open secret that most of the Afghan Taliban, Afghan Haqqani Network, whose top militants carry with them the title Haqqani for having graduated from Madrassa Haqqania, and many Pakistani militant-terrorists were produced by the madrassa.
Researchers have also been unable to establish clear link between the independent variable of poverty and the dependent variable of religious extremism and terrorism. For instance, Shapiro and Fair (2009) do not find poverty to be a root cause of support for militancy in their study regarding support for militant organizations in Pakistan.

5.2.10 Material Incentives as Drivers of Political Violence

It is one of the most important theories on the subject which assumes that individuals become part of the groups involved in violence for material benefits. Ladbury (2009) finds that Afghans, who were unemployed or underemployed, joined the Taliban and Hizb-i Islami to have money. Another theory linking anticipating material returns to terrorism contends that the existence of “lootable” resources increase the potential of violence at the organizational level. The premise of this theory is that the prospect of accessing and controlling “lootable resources” drives many individuals to join groups that employ violence. These “lootable” resources mostly exist in the form of natural resources and commodities. According to De Soysa (2000), those countries that have abundant natural resources particularly minerals are prone to what he called ‘greed-motivated’ violence and uprising. This theory can be applied to the TTP decision to overrun Swat, a mineral-rich area. During their occupation of Swat valley the TTP insurgents extracted most of the emerald deposits of the area while also hacked to ground a large portion of forest cover of the valley and sold the precious wood besides looting the residences and workplaces of three million IDPs, who had fled the region due to the TTP occupation and military offensive against the insurgents. The voraciousness of the TTP insurgents for emeralds was so great that lacking expertise to extract the stones from the mines they used explosives to get them and in the process emaciated more stones than what they got. In addition to that the TTP occupation of Swat resulted in innumerous forced marriages and rapes and this may be one of the material incentives for a large number of Taliban. They wrongly justified their action in the context of Islamic concept of Mal-e-Ghanimat (God’s given wealth) to have forced marriages with girls of Swat.
5.2.11 Self-control Theory

The self-control theory suggests that countries having majority of their population comprise of young males are susceptible to crime and violence because of the tendency of the youths towards violence. This is more relevant to Pakistan with a 63 percent population aged between 15-35 years. Coupled with youth and lack of clarity about national goals and the aligning of personal goals with the nationals goals have resulted in developing violent radical tendencies which have transpired in the form of unprecedented terrorism.

5.3 OTHER STUDIES: BASED ON INTERVIEWS WITH TERRORISTS

Ibrahim (1980) conducted a series of interviews in 1977 of 33 imprisoned Islamic militants who were members of the Technical Military Academy group (the MA) or the Repentance and Holy Fight group (RHF) in Egypt. Those interviewed occupied a range of positions within the organization’s hierarchy. Among other findings, Ibrahim et.al discovered most militants belonged to rural areas or small towns and joined the groups shortly after moving to a large city. He also found that most of the militants generally were good students and were also highly spirited and were having middle or lower-middle class background. Most join militancy during times of national crisis or sociopolitical upheavals. Ibrahim noted that in the absence of a clear, valid and secular national goals and visions, upon which the present and future upward socioeconomic mobility of the members of the middle and lower classes largely depend, many among them would join the militant groups (Ibrahim et al., 1980: 423-53).

Empirically most of the Pakistani religious militants also belonged to the rural and small towns. For instance, the entire FATA, where Pakistani and foreign religious militants have had the largest base and whose residents have the largest contribution to the ranks of Pakistani Islamist insurgents, are rural rather tribal in characteristics.\textsuperscript{147} However, militants from the FATA did not

\textsuperscript{147} The whole FATA do not have a single city of import due to which even the administrative headquarter of the region called FATA Secretariat is located in Peshawar, the capital of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa province, which happens to be the closest city for residents of FATA.
join radical groups after moving to cities instead they become extremists in their ancestral areas in FATA. Diametrically opposite to what Ibrahim and colleagues found in Egypt, many Pakistani militants from cities and mainland went to the rural and remote FATA to join local and international terrorist groups like Al Qaeda.\(^\text{148}\) Moreover, unlike Egyptians militants, Pakistani Muslim militants did not attend schools as most of them are illiterate. On the other hand due to absence of a clear set of national goals there has been an aura of disenchantment prevalent among Pakistani youths driving many of them to join militant groups to achieve other worldly goods perceiving their actions in the backdrop of Islamic concept of life in Hereafter.

5.3.1 Study on radicalization in Afghanistan

The study by Ladbury and Sarah (2009) underscores a number of factors contributing to a culture of Islamic insurgency in Afghanistan. The most important findings of the study are:

- Religious motivation is one of several reasons for joining or supporting the Taliban or Hizb-i Islami; the religious message of the militants does resonate with the majority, but only because it is couched in terms of two keen grievances: the corruption of government and the presence of foreign troops; there is almost no government support in the regions studied (less than 6% attributed something positive to the government); the majority of respondents supported the Taliban; young men join (the insurgents) for cash due to unemployment, for status reasons-to receive a gun and a cause, for religious beliefs, for self-protection, to leverage armed support for an ongoing dispute, usually over land or water with another family or lineage member]; radicalization generally occurs after joining the Taliban group; responses from those interviewed confirmed the Taliban is a broad movement of groups with different agendas and varying degrees of alliance to a central command. (As quoted in Victoroff (2005)

Many of the factors Ladbur and Sarah discovered contributed to the culture of Islamic insurgency in Afghanistan have nearly been the same for extremism and terrorism in the name of

\(^{148}\) The members of Al Qaeda including many Egyptians themselves shifted from Afghanistan after the 9/11 incidents to FATA.
Islam in Pakistan. There are various reasons for this sameness. Firstly there have been deep cultural and historical commonalities between most of the Afghan and Pakistani militants. In fact, the entire membership of Afghan Taliban and HIA has been ethnically Pakhtun so is of the TTP and the TNSM. Even non-Pakhtun Pakistani Islamist insurgents have had deep cultural ties and interactions with the above-mentioned Afghan insurgent groups. Rather both the Afghan groups’ top commanders including Mullah Omar and Gulbadin Hikmatyar were religiously-indoctrinated and militantly-trained inside Pakistani madrassas and military training camps respectively. On the other hand key Pakistani militant and terrorist groups the TTP and the TNSM fighters have been going to Afghanistan to fight on the side of Afghan Taliban against their Afghan rivals and US-NATO troops.

Like Afghans religious motivation is one of the potent factors for Pakistani youths to join religious extremist and terrorist groups and the latter have been quite successful in attracting recruits by harping on the abstract slogans. Such oft-repeated slogans include moral corruption under western influence; infidelity of the Pakistani rulers to the Islamic cause and the state’s Islamist ideology by joining the US led War on Terror against Islamist groups like Afghan Taliban and Al Qaeda; and the role of Pakistani authorities in facilitating Americans and western “infidels” to occupy an Islamic land, Afghanistan, by dislodging an Islamic Emirate there and giving military bases to the infidels and “Enemies of Islam” on the Pakistani land.

As found by Ladbur and Sarah in Afghanistan, many of Pakistani youths, who became part of the religious extremist, terrorist groups, empirically did so for economic and social reasons. Many, if not all, of these militants have been poverty-stricken and joining militant groups to have monetary gains. Without money and education most of these terrorists hardly anticipate a bright future, therefore, they found the short cut for having an elevated status by joining extremist outfits, which provide them with guns, a status symbol in the tribal Pakhtun regions or even mainland Pakistan. Many Pakistani Pakhtun and Punjabi youths also seem to have joined religious terrorist groups to strengthen their position against their rivals in ongoing or future disputes within their families or tribes as well as other families or tribes of their areas. This is something understandable for people living in a collectivist culture like Pakistan. In the past many people from rural and remote areas would join Pakistan military and police, the repository of state power, to strengthen the family position vis-à-vis their rival families and clans as well to
get the institutional protection. Being the member of the TTP or other Taliban group or even non-Taliban Islamist insurgent and terrorist groups in Pakistan is a guarantee for a person and his family of protection against rivals. Therefore, in the recent decades many people have been joining Taliban ranks to get protection and it is far easier than recruitment in military or police.

5.3.2 Studies on Factors in Popular Support for Militancy in Pakistan

There have been specific studies on Pakistan to trace the roots of religious extremism and terrorism in the country. For instance, Winthrop, Rebecca and Croinne Graff (2010) study titled, “Beyond Madrassas: Assessing the Links Between Education and Militancy in Pakistan.” The study is based largely of analysis of existing studies like Asal et.al which rely on data from surveys of 141 Pakistani families, primarily concentrated in the Punjab and the KP provinces. These families lost at least one son while he was a member of a militant organization.

Major Findings of the study (verbatim): Demand for education within Pakistan far exceeds the government’s ability to provide it; contrary to popular belief, madrasas have not risen to fill the gap in public education supply and have not been one of the primary causes of the recent rise in militancy; beyond madrasas, the education supply gap in and of itself likely increases the risk of conflict in low income countries, including in Pakistan, highlighting the importance of expanding educational access; a nuanced analysis of the mechanisms whereby education may exacerbate conflict risk suggests that in addition to access, education quality and content may be just as important for promoting stability; poor education-sector governance creates huge discrepancies in the public education system, inflaming citizens’ grievances against the government; poor learning outcomes hinder the development of the core skills, including those related to good citizenship, that are needed to help mitigate extremism; the curriculum and teaching in government schools help create intolerant worldviews among students; schools do little to prepare students for the labor market, frustrating young achievers and increasing the pool of possible militant recruits; and education provision is highly inequitable, exacerbating grievances by those left out of the system.

There is another survey research on the militant families in Pakistan. The major findings of the study “Consenting to a Child's Decision to Join a Jihad: Insights from a Survey of Militant
Families in Pakistan” by Asal, Victor; C. Christine Fair, and Stephen Shellman (2008) includes: a family’s economic standing influenced their beliefs about their son’s joining a militant organization; richer households are less likely to consent to their son joining a militant organization; Pakistani sons who were unemployed faced fewer rebuttals when they attempted to join a militant organization than those who were employed; there is a positive correlation between the son’s madrassa attendance and his family’s consent; Deobandi families are less likely to consent to their sons joining a militant organization than non-Deobandis.

Through their survey data, Asal et. al. test the following seven hypotheses: Families who are weaker economically are more likely to give consent; families who have more sons are more likely to give consent; sons who are educated and unemployed are more likely to be given consent; families that are more religious are more likely to give consent; sons who are educated in a madrassa are more likely to be given consent; families that are connected to militant-inclined traditions should be more likely to give consent; older heads of household are more likely to give consent.

In addition to the above mentioned analysis of the causes of extremism and terrorism in the name of Islam in Pakistan in the context of the existing theories and studies, this study have found the following factors to have been contributing to the phenomenon of extremism and terrorism in the name of Islam in Pakistan.

5.4 IDEOLOGICAL CAUSES

In Chapter 3 of this dissertation it was analyzed how and for what purposes Pakistani ruling elite, personifying the Pakistani state, employed Islamic rhetoric and slogans. It was found that the ruling elite felt the necessity of the Islamic slogans and symbols primarily to respond to the mammoth task of nation-building in a multi-ethnic and multi-interest state and anomic society. Both the Pakistani state and society had never been monolith entities or holistic bodies in administrative and social terms. Jinnah had not envisioned Pakistan in terms on an ideological state; however, his successors clobbered the state ideology. Islam, animosity towards India and Urdu language were chosen as foundations for the state ideology. (Haqqani, 2005: 15) Another reason for the ruling elite overemphasis on Islamic slogans and symbols has been found to be its
urge to tighten grip around the state and society and to legitimize its illegal and undemocratic rule. The ruling elite could best utilize Islamic slogans and symbols to serve its ends by employing the services of Muslim clerics and religious institutions under their control like madrassas.

Consequently, the services of the clergy were hired. This created patron-client relationship between the ruling elite and the clergy. In this process members of the Muslim clergy through state patronage got a huge opportunity to make economic fortune individually and collectively, to get themselves socially-entrenched and make the ruling elite dependent on them. In turn all this necessitated for the clergy to pursue its own agenda of radicalizing society and do a selective and extremely narrow interpretation of Islamic texts and major Islamic concepts like Jihad. This on the one hand religiously radicalized Pakistani society at the core and on the other hand gave birth to Islamist militancy in the country.

The ruling elite in order to attain the above-mentioned class-specific aims through emphasizing on Islamic ideals and slogans also resorted to propaganda through educational institutions, curricula and media.

The apprehensions to lose Muslims religious identify, which formed the very premise of the struggle for Pakistan, gradually became the new state’s core policy. This identity was blown out of proportions through propaganda over state TV (Pakistan Television or PTV) and radio as well as the education system. (Haqqani, 2005: 14) The crux of that propaganda has been that the state of Pakistan has only one identity that is Islam and that Pakistan is the Fort of Islam (Haqqani, 2005: 15) and Base of Pan-Islamism. The military and the intelligence agencies associated with it have been on the forefront for building the country’s identity on the basis of Islam.

This political commitment to an ideological state gradually evolved into a strategic commitment to Jihadi ideology—ideology of holy war—especially during and after the Bangladesh war of 1971, when the Pakistani military used Islamist idiom and the help of Islamist groups to keep secular leaders who were supported by and elected by the majority Bengali-speaking population out of power. (Haqqani, 2005: 3)
Through ideological propaganda the tangible and realistic goals of the state which could be reflected through domestic and foreign policies objectives have been shown in the light of abstract religious fundamentals.

As mentioned above the ruling military-civilian establishment could not calculate the risks involved in legitimizing not only the role of religion in the statecraft but also that of the self-appointed spokesmen of Islam—the mullahs.

The military leadership, assuming that the military would remain in control, saw no threat to the state from the Islamists. Acceptance of an Islamic ideological state, however, led to the inevitable claim by Islamists of their right to define the contours of that state. (Haqqani, 2005: 43)

In the aftermath of 1965 India-Pakistan War many officers who took part in the fighting depicted the conflict as a war between Islam and non-Islamic forces. Although it was Pakistan which started the 1965 conflict by launching Operation Gibraltar of sending paratroopers and irregulars or *Mujahideen* inside Indian territory. The war described as an Indian aggression which was defeated with the help of God. In order to disseminate this propaganda the state needed the mullahs. Manipulating the situation the mullahs furthered their own ends and the most important end was that they should be officially acknowledged as the custodians of state’s Islamic ideology and personality.

The argument advanced by some western scholars that fundamentalism is not the problem of Islam but how Muslims interpret their religion (Fuller, 2002) seems to be quite tenable and plausible in case of explaining extremism and terrorism in the name of Islam in Pakistan. Fuller further argues that followers of all faiths indulge in their respective religion’s interpretation, which justifies any political end. (Fuller, 2002) The Pakistani state has exactly interpreted the political and territorial dispute of Kashmir as a conflict between Islam and Hinduism, India being labeled as the manifestation and collective identity of the latter. Resultantly, the largely uneducated and unsophisticated Pakistani masses, who have merely a popular but elusive
understanding of the complex concepts like the institution of state, international politics and national interest while simultaneously having an ambiguous cognition of their religious identity, deconstructed the Pakistani state propaganda vis-a-vis India prima facie. This has been a key factor in radicalizing Pakistani society along religious lines.

It is argued that terrorism is impossible without an ideology that provides context, meaning and legitimacy for the planners, executors and supporters of acts of violence. (De la Corte, 2006) From this standpoint all shades of Pakistani Islamist terrorist groups share a somewhat common ideology, which gets justified when couched in the state’s Islamic ideology. This common ideology underlines the need of a struggle for the establishment of a true Islamic state. Some of these extremist and terrorist outfits called their cherished Islamic state as Khilafat (Caliphate) others Nizam-e-Shariah (System of Shariah) still others Nifaz-e-Sharia (Enforcement of Shariah) and so on. Their insistence and the state’s evasion on an Islamic dispensation and the people’s ever-increasing miseries extensively radicalized Pakistan society.

Many Pakistani clerics and even secular leaders in pursuance of their respective vested-interests have had argued that Pakistani state has a divine aim of becoming a model of Islamic governance and Islamic Revivalism. In order to demonstrate the genuineness of their claim members of Pan-Islamist and radical-revivalist international groups like Muslim Brotherhood were brought to Pakistan to discuss ways and means to achieve the aim of Muslim Unity and through it the Revivalism of Islam. (Haqqani, 2005: 19) If one have a look at the following examples Pakistani state support, although partial,\(^{149}\) to Pan-Islamist movements becomes obvious. In 1970s Islamabad, albeit secretly but as a state policy, brought certain Afghani militant-mullahs to Pakistan; in the 1980s Afghan Mujahideen movement was pieced together on Pakistani soil; in the 1990s Kashmir Jihad and Afghan Taliban were organized inside Pakistan while in the first decade of 21st Century Al Qaeda and Taliban have been allowed to get themselves entrenched inside Pakistani territory. Pakistani state support and patronage of the global Islamist movements, groups and individuals significantly contributed to formation of fundamentalist attitudes among people.

\(^{149}\) The support was partially-motivated by religion in the sense because providing support to these foreign militants also greatly served the objectives of Pakistan’s perceived security needs.
The Islamist clerical parties and extremist groups that were either patronized or conceived by the state security agencies under a policy, to attain the earlier mentioned aims, gradually fathomed the countrymen and countrywomen deep desire for having Islamic structures of governance in Pakistan. At the same time Pakistani clerical outfits have been well-aware of the insincerity of later in establishing an Islamic dispensation. This realization on part of the clerics of the ruling elite’s real motives regarding the role of religion in the statecraft has been the result of the clergy’s protracted and close association with the ruling elite. For decades the ruling elite used the clergy to present Pakistan as an Islamic state and the elite as the Custodians of Islam. The non-religious ruling elite of Pakistan contemplated that as long as it was able to rally people behind it on the basis of elusive Islamist ideology its power base would remain secure. Therefore, finding that the longing of people and society for an Islamist order or Shariah profound; whereas, the ruling elite commitment to have a welfare Islamic state shallow, many clerical groups discovered the situation tailor-made to their radical manipulation.

5.4.1 Clerics U-Turn against Ruling Elite

Pakistani clergymen from all schools of thought initiated the propaganda about the ruling elite’s two-facedness and insincerity regarding enforcement of Islamic governance system in the country. Noticeably, the propaganda by the clerics against the ruling elite has not been aimed at the attainment of an Islamic system either. The underlying motive of the clerics in this respect has been to present themselves as alternative rulers to the public, who can fulfil the Pakistani long-cherished dream of putting in place an Islamist dispensation. This propaganda of clerics played a critical role in making the public believe that the ideological base for the creation of Pakistan was Political Islam. The cultivation of this pseudo Islamist perception among the masses first by the ruling elite and afterwards by the clergy profoundly radicalized Pakistani society and obliterated its traditional but relative secularity. This narrative at the national level developed a strong public mindset, which started foreseeing a promising future of Pakistan if it adopted Islamic institutions, a sugar-coated term for ultra-extremist governance structures.

There has been an official Pakistani rhetoric that the very emergence of the state of Pakistan was the manifestation of Islamic Renaissance and that Pakistani military and its arsenal belonged to the entire Islamic World. This rhetoric has played a significant role in driving the governments to
act emotionally and irrationally. Additionally presenting Pakistan as a source of *Pan-Islamism* and *Islamic Revivalism* made the Pakistani Muslims to believe and demand from the state to be on the forefront for safeguarding and fighting the Muslim causes around the globe not only through moral and diplomatic means but also physically by waging Jihad. The state somehow tried to live up to its official rhetoric and to the public expectations emerging thereof by participating in the Israeli-Arab conflicts of 1967 and 1973 when it sent Pakistani pilots to fly Arab fighter planes and as well as by declaring Pakistani nuclear bomb as *Islamic Bomb*. (Sayyed, 2003) Analytically, Pakistan’s serving as Al Qaeda’s birthplace (1989) and its base for global terrorism (post 9/11) was not strange keeping in view the historical Pakistani state and societal support to Islamic causes around the World. How Al Qaeda presence in Pakistan radicalized and terrorize Pakistani society has been discussed in detail in Chapter 3 & 4.

### 5.5 ECONOMIC CAUSES

According to the theory of *Base and Superstructure* of Karl Marx (Marx, 1843) at the foundations of every society is the institution of economy, which determines the character of other social institutions. In other words the character of the *base* (economy) determines the nature of the *superstructure* erected over it. The type and nature of the state, the structure of the family or the form(s) of ideology prevalent at a certain point in time in a society are inalienable attributes of the superstructure. Religious extremism as part of the society’s ideology and in turn its social psychology and militancy as an element of behaviour of society are also shaped and determined by the nature of the base. This theoretical frame of *base* and *superstructure* can be used for establishing and studying the link of Islamic extremism and terrorism with the prevalent economic conditions in Pakistan.

The relationship between economic factors and religious extremism and militancy in Pakistan is as old as the state itself. Pakistan came into existence as a result of a secular and non-religious political movement, which nevertheless used Islamic slogans and symbols to give it an Islamic colour for rallying Indian Muslims support behind the struggle for the new state. Therefore, the success of the secular political struggle for Pakistan—a so-called Islamic ideological state—
further marginalized the religious community and clerics both economically and socially. On the contrary it reinforced the economic base of the landed gentry while gave the members of civilian and military bureaucracy a strong economic footing. The linkage between economy and religious extremism-terrorism was established by the efforts for strengthening and sustaining of their respective economic base by the landed gentry and civil-military bureaucracy, the traditional ruling elite of Pakistan, on the one hand and the struggle to create an economic base by the clerics on the other hand. Having its nuisance value the Islamic religious community foresaw in the new state of Pakistan new opportunities to market its members’ skills and slogans. The ruling elite strategy of using Islam to perpetuate its newly established stranglehold over the state and society required the essential services of the clerics (see for details Chapter 2). The ruling elite could only secure the support of clerics by outright buying of their services through giving monetary perks and social privileges. As most of the mullahs came from the socially and economically extremely modest backgrounds they had to take up the opportunity, offered by the ruling elite, by the forelock. Gradually the clerics, with no other message for the society but radical rhetoric, started dominating the national discourse and more importantly the minds of the masses. The mullahs in order to increase their nuisance value so that to get a high price for their propagandist services from the ruling elite, also resorted to infuse fundamentalism within the Muslim communities of Pakistan. In this way the clerics would have more followers, which they could sell to or bargain upon with the ruling elite.

Subsequently, when the US in order to inflict a decisive blow on the erstwhile Union of Soviet Socialist Republic (USSR) chose Afghanistan to be the Red Army’s Waterloo, it needed the support of Afghans-Pakhtuns of both Pakistan and Afghanistan. This support could partly be organized by exploiting the Islamic religious sentiments of Pakhtuns in particular and Afghans and Pakistanis in general. The best way for attaining the end was thought to be establishing a large number of seminaries in Pakistan mainly along the Durand Line, in Afghan refugee camps mostly in the suburban areas. (See for details Chapter 3). For the first time Pakistani clerics, who were brought to run these madrassas financed by the US, Saudi Arabia and other Arab countries got huge sums of money, which they had never seen before. Hitherto clerics or mullahs had had a marginalized role in the Pakhtun society or for that matter the whole of Pakistan. The cleric operators of the madrassas not only got money by running these so-called centres of Islamic
teachings but also attained social power previously enjoyed by local notables like Maliks, Chaudhris, Khans and Waderas in different parts of Pakistan. The newly established madrassas provided a strong economic base to clerics in Pakistan. Moreover, with madrassas money the mullahs no longer remain economically dependent on alms which had traditionally been the only sources of sustenance of the local communities. After receiving huge amount of money from the US and Arab countries these madrassas went on strengthening and soon became springboards of Muslim militants, euphemistically called mujahideen, and depots of arms.

To meet the finances of the mammoth militant enterprise in Afghanistan, the CIA set up a large number of heroin manufacturing factories in Pakistan’s tribal areas. The raw material for the heroin—opium—was available in a plenty in Afghanistan and FATA. (Yousaf & Adkin, 1992) Soon a large number of people of General Zia-led military establishment got involved in drugs trade. The mechanism of Afghan Transit Trade was also exploited by these elements to the maximum for heroin smuggling. Partly the heroin production and smuggling money was funnelled by the CIA to recruit and train militant groups.

The Taliban regime in Afghanistan (1996-2001) had also been financially dependent almost entirely upon the opium production and trade. Whereas, Taliban in Afghanistan after their overthrown have been growing opium especially in the Southern districts of Helmand, Zabul and Kandahar and successfully trading it partly to meet their finances. Afghanistan despite NATO’s presence since 2001 has been second leading producer of opium in the World. A large part of this opium money is transferred to Pakistani Taliban in order to get a constant supply of fighters against NATO troops. A part of these funds is also believed to be delivered to madrassas in Pakistan.

The rise of Imam Ayatollah Khomeini-led Iranian Revolution ended the US near-complete monopolistic exploitation of oil resources of Iran. The US had had a virtual control over Iranian oil during the reign of the deposed Shah of Iran, Raza Shah Pehlvi. The other supporters of American policies in the region like the Saudi monarchy and various Gulf sheikhdoms were

---

150 The clerics were able to extend their social influence across Pakistan, starting with the FATA and the KP during the Afghan War, through the thousands of madrassas, which were established during the 1990s in most instances with the support of Pakistani establishment to provide fighters for anti-India separatist insurgency in Kashmir.
equally apprehensive of Iran’s Islamic Revolution. The rulers of these Muslim states feared rebellion within their respective populations after getting influenced by Iranian Revolution. Arabs had a centuries-old clash of civilization with Persians and the US dextrously exploited this animosity by fomenting anti-Iranian and Shiite feelings among the Arab neighbours of Iran on the one hand and non-Arab but overwhelmingly Sunni neighbours of Iran towards its East—Pakistan and Afghanistan—on the other hand. The US aim was to encircle Iran and to pressurize its cleric-regime. For this purpose a large number of US and Arab sponsored madrassas were established in Pakistan. In response Iran also funded the construction of a large number of Shiite madrassas in Pakistan. (Rana, 1997) The product of these madrassas has been continual large-scale sectarian violence in various parts of Pakistan.

Without money coming from certain quarters it is difficult to sustain the process. We have seen that the breeding ground was present for Talibization because of the Afghan War. Then the money was coming from the West. At least the Western money is not coming in now. Though the state money from Saudi Arab has also decreased, it is still coming. Importantly, enough local money is also available from madrassas and other institution linked to Talibalization from places like Karachi and Lahore.\textsuperscript{151}

As explained above, a large number of Pakistan clerics due to their instrumental role in producing militants for the anti-Soviet Afghan resistance at their madrassas attained unprecedented social significance and economic benefits. As the Soviet troops’ withdrew from Afghanistan and the resistance ended the biggest problem for the clerics was the perpetuation of their new-found social influence and convert their madrassas into sustainable and ever-increasing sources of income. One significant way of getting maximum economic and social

\textsuperscript{151} Researcher interview with Dr. Sarfaraz, a Pakistani expert on extremism and Political Islam and Director Area Study Centre, University of (Peshawar, January, 2007)
benefits out of the situation was to use these madrassas for making a political base in order to capture power. Pakistani clerics did succeed in their perennial aim of getting political power, although partially. The success came to them in 2002 general elections when they collectively got an unprecedented electoral win through the the MMA, an alliance of clerical parties, in the KP and the FATA. The electoral results enable the clerics to capture political power by forming government in KP and become part of a coalition government in Balochistan. In order to cement clerics’ economic and thus political base in Pakhtun society, the the MMA government allocated special funds in provincial budgets for seminaries.

Poverty has been an important factor behind continuous and increasing joining of madrassas by children and youths including those madrassas which impart militant training. There are various economic reasons for sending children to seminaries. The first is the inability to meet the cost of tuition fee, books and uniforms. According to a large number of parents whose children have been studying at seminaries they did not send their sons and even daughters to get involved in militancy but to get free of cost religious education. Arguably the most compelling cause for parents to put their sons and daughters in seminaries has not been to have free religious education and books but above all accommodation. Having several children and without having the means to feed and nourish them many parents have found it expedient to pass on their parental responsibility to seminaries and their administrations. Mostly madrassas with huge complexes and facilities for boarding are located in cities therefore, they have been an additional attraction for children and youth and their parents. Otherwise, for the parents largely hailing from rural areas, finding a living place in cities, where the opportunities to find future economic prospects are relatively higher, is extremely difficult. This has been the reason that a large number of children and youths from far off and remote places like Waziristan and Kohistan as well as Afghanistan often come to live and study in places like Madrassa-e-Binoria in Karachi, the twin madrassas of Jamia Hafsa and Jamia Faridia in Islamabad, Jamia Haqqania in Akora Khattak near Nowshera and Jamia Usmania in Peshawar.

The links between economy and religious extremism is explained by economist Zafar Moeen Nasir:
If we go into the root causes of terrorism you would find it is poverty and exploitation which made these people to become religious fanatics. Very poor people send their children to madrassa and those who teach them there don’t have even the fundamental knowledge of Islam but only the subjective interpretation of the faith. This created an extremist mindset.\(^\text{152}\)

Against this backdrop it is indeed understandable that why children and youth from the poverty-stricken places or districts with low per capita income of the KP; the FATA; remote districts of the Punjab like D. G. Khan, Rahim Yar Khan, Rajin Pur, Bahawalpur; and Azad Kashmir join madrassas in bulks. As far as the KP is concerned according to official estimates the total population living below the poverty line in the province was about 40 percent in the decade of 2000-2010. According to estimates of independent economists the incidence of poverty in real terms in these regions has been around 70 percent during the same period. In particular living conditions in remote districts of the KP like Kohistan, Hazara region, Upper Dir, Chitral and Tank have been the worst.

It is not only the rural poverty which drove hundreds of people towards militant groups but also the urban poverty, whose impact is rather severe than rural poverty. Due to inability of the state institutions and agencies to provide economic opportunities in cities like Karachi, Faisalabad, Multan, Jhang along with civic amenities to the rising population more and more people in cities, mostly migrants from villages and other areas, become greatly deprived. A good option for them has been to join *madrassas* and militant wings of banned militant organizations especially those of sectarian nature. This is perhaps the reason that organizations like Sipah-e-Sahaba Pakistan (SSP), Sipah-e-Muhammad, Lashkar-e-Tayyaba, Jaish-e-Muhammad, thriven in these areas.

\(^{152}\) Interview with Dr Zafar Moeen Nasir, Chief of Research at the Pakistan Institute of Developmental Economics (Islamabad, January 2010). He also worked as Director Policy at the Ministry of Labour and Manpower where he authored National Employment Policy, National Migration Policy and National Human Resource Development Policy for the Government of Pakistan.
In FATA poverty has been large-scale, pervasive and ubiquitous. Some tribesmen made a big fortune by legal and illegal means but they constitute only a fraction of the population of the region. The correlation of poverty and religious extremism is vividly evident in FATA. Somewhat similar economic conditions prevailed in remote districts of the Punjab.

The economic situation in the KP and the FATA for the last four decades became worst because of the migration of 3.7 million Afghan refugees to Pakistan. Seventy percent of these refugees have been living in the KP and the FATA. These Afghan refugees, on whom Pakistan government never placed any restrictions of exploiting any economic opportunities for the political reason—of making Afghanistan dependent on Pakistan—encroached upon the already meagre economic opportunities in these regions. This led to large-scale frustration among the local population and much of this frustration manifested in the shape of violence justified in the name of Islam.

In tribal areas the economy has not changed the socio-economic conditions of the people. The tribal system was like it was kept in a deep-freezer while the society crumbled due to inevitable social changes and likewise the colonial administrative system has also gave in because of the more demanding times and their incapacity to deliver. 153

5.5.1 Unemployment

Yet an important economic reason for extremism among Muslims in Pakistan has been the widespread unemployment particularly among youths. Unemployment has forced youths to join the ranks of militants primarily in two ways: firstly, by joining madrassas imparting militant training and secondly by joining the militant outfits directly without going through the rigours of training at seminaries. Unemployment in the KP, the FATA and Balochistan, has been rampant especially due to absence of any worth-mentionable industrial base and lack of extensive agriculture, largely due to underdeveloped irrigation infrastructure, in these regions. On the other

153 Interview with Dr Ijaz Khan, a regional expert and professor of International Relations at the University of Peshawar (Peshawar, July 2007)
hand in the South Punjab although agriculture is extensive but there is no significant industrial sector. Consequently the huge population of youths in these areas have had to remain unemployed. With little prospects of economic gains and upward social mobility there are a very few options left for the youths to explore. The society in the Frontier that is the KP and the FATA, the hotbed of religious extremism in Pakistan after 9/11, economically by the year 2010 had reached a brink of collapse. This point could have arrived quite earlier. However, with the migration of a large part of the workforce from these regions during 1970’s and 80s to the Gulf countries and earlier to Karachi—Pakistan’s economic and industrial hub—making it the the largest Pakhtun-populated city in the World, economic situation in Pakhtoon regions remained in control as the remittances from abroad and money transfer from Karachi kept providing sustenance to a sizable part of the population. Due to ever-decreasing employment opportunities for the, largely unskilled, Pakhtun youths in the Gulf and redundancy in Karachi’s job market as well as the ever-increasing Pakhtun population the economic options for the Frontier youth kept on becoming dearer.

During the last two decades petro-dollars, patronage from Pakistani government and monopoly of a few groups on untaxed border trade between Afghanistan and Pakistan have economically strengthened religious fundamentalist outfits in Pakistan and Afghanistan. These fundamentalist forces have whitened their black money by investing it in real estate and other businesses. Over the years religious fundamentalists, especially in the Frontier and Balochistan, have diversified their investments. They control a portion of real estate, transportation, retail and wholesale businesses in these areas.

Economic injustice is one of the main reasons for rising extremism in Pakistan. It may take any radical form including religious, sectarian or ethnic. The outcome of economic injustice is not absolutely religious extremism like it is in Balochistan, where the people resorted to violence for their economic and cultural rights. The example of Balochistan is very interesting because the region is situated next to Pakhtun areas, which are considered as grounds for religious extremism. So people rally behind those whether mullah, nationalist or chief justice whom they hope could give them their rights and economic justice. Therefore I don’t think the chief cause of religious radicalization in Pakistan is economic. However as far as the economic factors for extremism are
concerned yes there are discrepancies in the international economic system, which have
given rise to the feeling that the responsibility rests with those who control the system.
People like Osama have capitalized on this aspect of economic system to justify their
militancy. 

The importance of economic sources for extremist organizations can be gauged from the
example of Lashkar-e-Tayyaba (LeT) which has established micro level economic structures.
The outfit in order to operate its huge militant-madrassa complexes have invested heavily in real
estate and other businesses. Through such adventures the group has got itself entrenched and
institutionalized. The LeT leaders even think that these structures indeed resembles miniature
states and are necessary so that the group members have the requisite experience to run the state
once it would get political power. In other words these states are meant for anticipatory
socialization of the the LeT members in governance. This strategy underlines shows the political
objectives of the the LeT.

Although it is generally perceived that poverty and related economic factors have been the main
cause of religious extremism and terrorism in Pakistan but as is hypothesized by this study and as
findings of this study show, economic factors have only been the contributing or permissive
causes in the rise of religious fundamentalism and terrorism in Pakistan. The profile analysis of
the rank and file of Jihadist groups that surfaced in Pakistan in 1980s and 1990s show that its
members hailed from different social classes. 

Extremism is because of oppression. Osama was a filthy rich person and there have been
many from the upper and middle classes who become extremist militants. Had economy
been the reason there would have been decreased extremism in Pakistan with rising
foreign exchange reserves and significant economic growth in the recent years.

154 Interview with Dr Ijaz Khan (Peshawar, July, 2007)

155 In this case ‘different social classes’ must mean upper-middle, middle-middle, lower-middle and lower-lower
strata of society

156 Interview with Ghulam Sarwar Mohmand, an industrialist from Mohmand district of the FATA (Peshawar, July
2008)
Mohmand further argued that suicide attacks were launched by the Japanese on Pearl Harbour in the US during the WWII and many Pakistani army soldiers also blew up their bodies in the 1965 war to destroy Indian tanks. In both cases the extreme steps were taken to reply to the oppression. So if today some Muslims carry out suicide attacks then they have a feeling of oppression from the Western countries. However, in the context of Pakistan particularly the FATA Mohmand argued that economy was a contributing factor in fuelling extremism in the name of Islam. 157

At the same time it is also safe to believe that economic factors like poverty and unemployment have been instrumental in inflating the number of militants. This contention still does not satisfy the question, however, that how come such a large number of people suffering from poverty and unemployment could develop extremist and militant tendencies in the name of Islam. The central argument of this hypothesis is when there is large-scale want and misery humans have tendency to go towards religion and consequently in this situation the influence of the clerics increases. (Abbas, 2005: 10) This may be true for some cases but not many instances that economic factors forced people to join Islamic extremist and terrorist groups.

The hypothesis or argument that economic factors of poverty and unemployment are the main causes of extremism and terrorism in the name of Islam in Pakistan also does not take into consideration the other intervening variables, which may have their respective effects between the independent variables of poverty-unemployment and the dependent variables of religious extremism-terrorism. The poverty-unemployment-terrorism nexus thesis argument also lacks substance because those who stick to that argument have seldom pointed out that poverty and unemployment are themselves dependent variables in most of the cases.

The poor and unemployed youths have to be ideologically indoctrinated before being militantly trained to give them a cause to fight for. Noticeably joining extremist groups and waging a militant struggle does not ensure that the fighter gets paid. Although this study does find conclusive evidence that the extremist and militant groups have been paying a certain amount of

157 Interview with Ghulam Sarwar Mohmand, an industrialist from Mohmand district of the FATA (Peshawar, July 2008)
money to all its members. Most of the groups’ efforts to raise money through seeking charities and alms both from within the country and outside as well as funding from state’s intelligence agencies have been meant to meet operational costs of the respective group than paying salaries to its rank and files. This also contests the hypothesis that economic factors of poverty and unemployment have been instrumental in the rise of religious extremism and terrorism in Pakistan. Because if the militant and terrorist groups cannot pay all or most of its fighters and operators then why such a large number of youths should not have joined these groups. If so many young men have joined these outfits this means there are other potent factors than poverty and unemployment which have pushed them to do so.

5.6 CERTAIN PAKISTANI CULTURAL FEATURES AS CAUSES OF RELIGIOUS EXTREMISM-TERRORISM

Specific Pakistani cultural aspects and characteristics like society’s ultra-conservatism, superstitions-marred social psychology, people’s sentimental attachment to Islam, their unscientific approach to temporal and worldly issues, ossified or change-resistant social structure and values, have had strong and complex interrelationship with the phenomenon of extremism and terrorism in the name of Islam in Pakistan. Within Pakistani culture the Pakhtun and Punjabi sub-cultural values and ethnic character have had significantly contributed to the rise and proliferation of Islamic extremism and terrorism in Pakistan.

5.7 PAKHTUN TRIBAL SOCIAL STRUCTURE LINKS TO RELIGIOUS EXTREMISM-TERRORISM

Pakistani Pakhtun tribal areas or the FATA are a few regions left in the contemporary World, whose inhabitants’ attitudes and behaviours can best be explained as primitive as concepts and institutions like freedom of thought, of speech, of association, of choice and of action; civil

158 Noticeably all these cited socio-cultural characteristics of Pakistani society are anti-thesis of the values of liberalism. On the basis of this explanation Pakistan society can be described as a of a traditional-tribal-conservative-non-liberal type. This testifies the absence of liberal values in Pakistan have been fundamentally responsible for every type of extremism including Islamic fundamentalism and violence, down from familial to state-perpetrated violence, including terrorism in the name of Islam.
society; government institutions and development are totally alien to this society. Since long historians and writers have been pointing at the extremely violent character of the Pakhtuns. In 1896 British official William Crooke wrote: “The true Pathan [Pashtun] is perhaps the most barbaric of all the races with which we are brought into contact.” Pashtuns are 'cruel, bloodthirsty and vindictive in the highest degree ...” (Crooke, 1896: 167-168 as cited by Johansen, 1997: 56). These attitudes and behaviours have their roots in the socialization of the residents of FATA in the archaic social structures of the area.159 160 As mentioned above since 9/11 incidents, whose responsibility was accepted by Al Qaeda Network, the FATA have been the focus of World media. The key reasons for this extraordinary World attention on the FATA had been due to the shifting of Al Qaeda from Afghanistan when the US led international coalition forces invaded Afghanistan and dislodged the Afghan Taliban regime (1996-2001). Not only Al Qaeda but other international so-called Jihadist organizations like Islamic Jihad Union (IJU), Islamic Movement of Uzbekistan (IMU), East Turkistan Islamic Movement (ETIM) and hundreds and thousands of individual Jihadists from around the World including the Middle East, North Africa, the USA and Europe particularly Germany came to take up residence in the FATA. The aim of these professedly international rather stateless Jihadist organizations and

159 Elements of the social structure include social statuses, social roles, social groups and social institutions. Pakistani tribal areas have such peculiar elements which make its social structure one of the unique in the World. The society there has very few statuses as is a feature of any traditional society. Some of the main statuses include that of Malik or elder (tribal leaders), mullah or clergyman, Kasabgar (artisan or worker). Likewise, the social roles in the society of Pakistan tribal areas are also correspondingly a few because of the non-complexity of the society. Social groups in Pakistani tribal areas include that of sub-tribes and clans. Social institutions of Pakistani tribal areas mainly comprise of extended family or clans; subsistence economy; Islamic education institutions or madrassas; Islam a predominant religious faith while there are no political institutions in the literal sense of the word and according to Pakistani laws the people in tribal areas are not allowed to take part in politics until August 2012. Whereas, certain related administrative and cultural characteristics of FATA include: the region outside the purview of the normal and constitutional laws of Pakistan, in vogue in rest of the country; the settlement of intra-tribal and intertribal disputes and feuds through tribal councils locally called jirgas presided over by tribal chieftains or elders and not through law-courts; decisions by jirgas either according to Rivaj (local customs) or Shariat (Islamic Laws); collective habitation of clans and tribes at a specified piece of land where no one from the outside is allowed to purchase land; individual subject to and bound by the decisions of the clan or tribe even regarding his her personal life; the absence of any nuclear families in the region as the basic social institution; collective responsibility and punishment of tribesmen and tribeswomen under the Frontier Crimes Regulation (FCR), the legal framework for the area since the British Colonial times.

160 Pakhtoons consist of around 60 loosely confederated tribes of different sizes dwelling northwestern regions of Pakistan and southeastern regions of Afghanistan. The Pashtuns today comprise one of the world's largest functioning tribal communities, with an estimated 14 million Pashtuns living in Pakistan and 7.5 million in Afghanistan (Encyclopedia Britannica, 1994, Vol. 9, p. 181 as cited in Johansen 1997: 56)
individuals has been to fight against the US and NATO forces in Afghanistan justifying their action on the ground that US-NATO dislodged an *Islamic* regime and invaded an *Islamic* state obligating the Muslims from around the World to wage *Jihad* against the *infidel* forces. Simultaneously thousands of Pakistani youths and a large number of members of Muslim militant outfits, earlier formed by Pakistani military to fight a proxy war against Indian forces in the disputed territory of Jammu and Kashmir, also took up residence in FATA to join the anti US-NATO *Jihad*. In the meanwhile Pakistani Taliban groups comprising of residents of FATA and the contiguous Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa province also emerged in different parts of the tribal areas and this culminated in the formation of an umbrella organization of these groups called Tehreek-e-Taliban Pakistan (TTP) or Pakistani Taliban Movement in December 2007 in Waziristan. Al Qaeda and other international so-called Jihadist organizations and individuals find extremely conducive environment in FATA to make the region their base for launching regional insurgency and international terrorism in the name of Islam. On the other hand Pakistani Taliban also got the perfect milieu in FATA to emerge and thrive.

Experts and researchers have had argued that the FATA become a hub or epicentre of global terrorism as terrorist groups like Al Qaeda because of the facilitation provided by Pakistani military-civilian-intelligence establishment to local, regional and global terrorist groups. It is often alleged that Pakistani establishment deliberately allowed international terrorist organizations to have sanctuaries and bases in the FATA because despite being officially an ally of the US in the Global War on Terror (GWoT), Pakistani establishment objective in Afghanistan coincided with the agenda of Al Qaeda and international terrorist organizations. The policy objective of Pakistani establishment in this regard has been the defeat of the US-NATO forces at the hands of Afghan Taliban backed by Al Qaeda and international Jihadist groups. Only in this way Pakistan expect restoration of Afghan Taliban regime which had been under a domineering influence of Islamabad and under whom Afghanistan had become a virtual

---

161 Both these regions of Pakistan are ethnically Pakhtoon dominated. Pakhtoon or Pashtuns is the largest ethnic group of Afghanistan and the second largest ethnic group of Pakistan. The ethnic make-up of Afghan Taliban is entirely Pakhtoon. Earlier Pakistani Taliban groups also were predominantly Pakhtoon; however, later militants from the largest ethnicity of Pakistan, the Punjabis, who have now come to be called as *Punjabi Taliban* also joined Pakhtoon Taliban, to make Taliban a countrywide movement.
Pakistani dependency besides assuaging Islamist and Pan-Islamist sentiments of certain strong quarters within Pakistani establishment.

There has hardly been an alternative explanation from experts and researchers why the FATA became epicentre of global terrorism. Therefore, this study apart from re-examining the oft-cited above-mentioned reasons which converted the FATA’ into a hub of local, regional and global Islamist terrorist organizations also tried to search for other more plausible causes. In the course of this study, it was discovered that more than Pakistani establishment support to Al Qaeda and the Pakistani Taliban to embed their outfits in the FATA, it has been the peculiar ultraconservative and reactionary features of social structure of the FATA as well as the stateless nature of the territory and its inhabitants, which mainly assisted international and local terrorist organizations to find space and base in the FATA and in the process make the region the hub of international terrorism. On the basis of close empirical observation of the tribal areas’ society and interaction with hundreds of their inhabitants, including tens of tribal leaders and civil society members, this study finds that it has actually been the compatibility of the nature of social structure of the FATA and the region’s stateless character with the agenda and aims of international non-state terrorist organizations which greatly helped these organizations and individuals to ensconce themselves in the region and garner support from the local people. In other words the statelessness of the FATA and non-state character of the Al Qaeda and affiliated terrorist outfits have been greatly compatible and instrumental in establishing a symbiotic relationship between them.

When a large number of militants belonging to Al Qaeda and affiliated foreign outfits as well as non-local Pakistani militant groups came and took up residence in the FATA to use these areas as training and launching pad for their violent activities in the rest of Pakistan and across the border in Afghanistan it was a big social change for the residents of the FATA. These alien militants and terrorists have exploited the tribal social structure and social conditions to strengthen themselves and further their agenda. According to Luigi Bonanate terrorism is basically the outcome of a "blocked society" that has such strong cultural values which preserves the status quo supposedly through large-scale inertia among the members of the society that is strong enough to preserve itself (presumably through popular inertia) by keeping the innovation
at bay. This self-perpetuating "immobilisme" motivates terrorism (Bonanate, 1979). This explanation by Bonanate largely defines the situation in Pakistani tribal areas which have a blocked society. The emergence and thriving of Islamic extremism and terrorism in the FATA has linkages with its blocked society. It cannot be mere coincidence that certain radical forces like Taliban and Al Qaeda after being made to flee from Afghanistan, Arab and African lands got their strongest base in the FATA. The shifting of Al Qaeda as well as other jihadist groups and their entrenching themselves in the FATA; coming of a large number of German and British, American and Chinese Jihadists and ensconcing themselves in the tribal areas; emergence of Pakistan Taliban Movement or TTP, founded and successively commanded and manned by militants from the FATA; formation of a so-called *Islamic Emirate of Waziristan*; the surfacing of insurgent groups in each of the seven tribal districts of the FATA and their success in having sway over the local population; the failure of Pakistan government in meaningfully defeating the Pakistan Taliban, the Al Qaeda and other foreign Jihadist groups based in the FATA despite deployment of nearly 147000 military and paramilitary troops in the region are ample empirical proofs that Pakistan Taliban, Al Qaeda and other foreign Jihadist groups have had found conducive conditions in the FATA. The key difference in these areas and rest of Pakistan is the tribal social structure in place there. This testifies that the tribal structure has served as a supporting base for Islamic extremists and terrorists in Pakistan, the region and globally.

### 5.8 UNRULY CHARACTER OF PAKHTOONS & RELIGIOUS EXTREMISM

Former British Prime Minister and one of the noteworthy statesmen of the 20th Century, Sir Winston Churchill, has the most profound and explicit description of Indian (now Pakistani) Pakhtun violent national character in these words.

> The inhabitants of these wild but wealthy valleys are of many tribes, but of similar character and condition. The abundant crops which a warm sun and copious rains raise from a fertile soil, support a numerous population in a state of warlike leisure. Except at the times of sowing and of harvest, a continual state of feud and strife prevails throughout the land. Tribe wars with tribe. The people of one valley fight with those of the next. To the quarrels of communities are added the combats of individuals. Khan assails khan,
each supported by his retainers. Every tribesman has a blood feud with his neighbour. 
Every man’s hand is against the other, and all against the stranger. (Churchill, 1898)

The unruly, defiant and uncivilized nature of the Pakhtoon border tribes in particular and Pakhtoons in general has been a source of constant trouble due to which officials and servicemen posted to these areas after having firsthand experience of the conditions and the people have had suggested punitive action against them. For instance, the commander of British frontier forces wrote in 1859 that it was necessary “to carry destruction, if not destitution, into the homes of some hundreds of families' because with savage tribes, to whom there is no right but might, the only course open [to the British] as regards humanity as well as policy, is to make all suffer'. Indeed, 'if objection be taken to the nature of punishment inflicted as repugnant to civilization, the answer is that savages cannot be met and checked by civilized warfare, and that to spare their houses and crops would be to leave them unpunished and, therefore, un-restrained. In short, civilized warfare is inapplicable.” (Quoted by Yunus, 1947: 75-76 as cited in Johansen, 1997: 56-57)

Although there is substantial evidence about the violent and unruly character of Pukhtoons but it is also important to recognize that the violence among them has partly been in response to atrocities committed by foreign invaders and tribal rivals. In certain instances foreign invaders demonstrated more violence than the Pakhtoon. (Johansen, 1997: 57)

5.8.1 Narrow or Cultural Interpretation Of Islam Among Pakhtoons

Like every tribal society where superstitious, conservative and narrow interpretation of religion is a norm, Pakistani Pakhtoon tribal areas residents’ understanding and practice of Islam reflects the very features. Therefore, it has not only been the violent Pakhtun tribal national character but its susceptibility to any dogmatic influence in the name of Islam which played instrumental role in making Pakistani tribal areas a hub of clerical radicalism.

The famous American writer, J. W. Spain, while explaining the religious credentials of Pakhtoon tribesmen wrote:
A deeply cherished secular tradition in public matters, a low literacy rate, and centuries of isolation from the main currents of Islam have made tribesmen’s understanding of their religion narrow and personal and have contributed to the growth of superstition. (Spain 1963)

On the other hand Sir Winston Churchill observed:

Their superstition exposes them to the rapacity and tyranny of a numerous priesthood – “Mullahs,” “Sahibzadas,” “Akhundzadas,” “Fakirs,” – and a host of wandering Talib-ul-ilms,162 who correspond with the theological students in Turkey, and live free at the expense of the people. (Churchill, 1897)

The extensively tribal character of Pakhtun society is recognized by some of its ardent observers and exponents of Pakhtun social values but they consider that this is *positive* tribalism which is relatively democratic than negative collectivism, which is the key feature of other tribal communities. A long-serving member of Senate of Pakistan and noted Pakhtun intellectual, Abdul Rahim Mandokel, articulately explained Pakhtun tribalism:

Tribalism in Pakhtun society has not been akin to primitivism rather it has always merely been a sort of collectivism. Whenever, Pakhtuns make use of this tribalism in political or social arenas it brought positive results. The ownership of sources of production among Pakhtuns has been collective. The share of each tribe has been relative to its strength. Pakhtun tribalism unlike other societies has not been under tribal *sardars*. It had been a collective, total, economic, national ownership down till the level of an individual family called *Urbal*. This was the most profoundly democratic arrangement of its time. The Pakhtun states founded by Bahlol Lodhi and Sher Shah Suri in India were not personal estates but in which all Pakhtuns had stakes. The *wesh* (distribution) of land by Shiekh Mali Baba in Peshawar valley among different tribes and formation of tribal *lashkar* (fighting force) by Ahmed Shah Abdali to rescue Indian Muslims from Marhatas are vivid examples of this democratisation and discipline. (Mandokhel, 2005)

---

162 The meaning of Taliban or Talib ul Ilm are the same. Thus the influence of Taliban among Pakhtoons was noted almost a century back by Churchill.
However, a collectivist culture is inherently non-democratic and this has been the case with Pakhtun culture while the members of that culture have also been extensively influenced by religion. About the religious character of Pakhtun former Jamiat Ulema-e-Pakistan leader Abdul Sattar Khan Niazi, who was a non-Pashto speaking Pathan, once said, “A Pathan is a Muslim first and Muslim last.” (Sayeed, 1968: 99)

The radical Arab influence directly through Al Qaeda, Saudi-Arab promotion of Wahabism through madrassas and indirectly through tribesmen working in Gulf-Arab countries reinforced the tribal structure in the FATA but deprived it of the certain positive traditional Pakhtoon values of respect, altruism, chivalry and abstinence from killing of non-combatants.

Unlike the Pakhtuns, the neighbouring Baloch society, housing another key Pakistani sub-culture, is glaringly secular; mullahs do not have an elevated social status within that society and Islamization has made no inroads among Balochs (Rashid, 2008: 283). Arguably, as a result there has been no recorded violence in the name of Islam among the Balochs. This is despite of the fact that contrary to Pakhtun national character Baloch are inward-looking and in comparison to Pakhtun, very few Balochs have lived outside their territory both inside Pakistan and around the World due to which poverty and unemployment has by far been more rampant among Balochs than Pakhtuns.

5.9  IDENTIFY CRISIS AMONG PUNJABIS & RELIGIOUS EXTREMISM- TERRORISM

Traditionally Punjabi culture have largely been non-violent, however, members of this largest Pakistani subculture has always been confused regarding their true religious identity and beliefs. The underlying reason for this has been that unlike Pakhtuns or Balochs, the Punjabis have never been a monolithic religious entity.\(^{163}\) Originally a significant portion of Punjabis were Hindus and most of its members once constituted the lowest castes in the classical caste-based social stratification among the Hindus of subcontinent. Persecution of the lower classes (Shudras &

\(^{163}\) There are hardly any non-Muslims among Pakhtoons and Balochs. Even there are an insignificant number of Shiite Muslims among these two ethnic groups in Pakistan.
Vaishya) by the upper classes (Brahmin & Kshatriya) was an institutionalized feature of the Hindu caste system. Therefore, facing extreme persecution and suppression at the hands of upper caste Hindus, a large number of Punjabis, belonging to the lower castes of Hindus, converted to Islam, Sikhism, Christianity—religions of the conquerors of the subcontinent—to escape persecution and elevate their low social status. The conversion of low caste Hindus among Punjabis to Sikhism is quite noteworthy.

The origin of caste in Punjab and within Sikhism needs to be understood in the context of the large scale entry of Jats\textsuperscript{164} into Sikhism that not only rescued them from their low status but also turned them into a powerful community. The Jats (with 30-35 percent of the total population of the state [Indian Punjab]) not only constitute the single largest group in the state but also the majority of the Sikh population. Traditionally considered as a low-caste group, the Jats entered into the fold of Sikhism during the time of Guru Arjun\textsuperscript{165} in great numbers and rose to position of a land-owning aristocracy during the time of Maharaja Ranjit Singh.\textsuperscript{166} The numerical preponderance of the Jats in the Sikh religion and their hold over the landownership structure and politics of the state placed them at the top position within Sikhism. (Sharma: 2012: 29)

The services of low caste Jats to the British colonialists also aimed at throwing away the pathetic social status. Resultantly, the low caste Jats in the Punjab were patronized by the British because of their invaluable services to the latter in squashing the Indian War of Independence (1857-58 termed mutiny by the British colonialists). The British rulers of India as a reward substantially increased the enlistment of Jats in the British Indian Army (Ibbestion, 1883; Deol, 2000). It seemed that due to the British protection and patronage many Jats converted to Christianity and also led other low caste Punjabis to follow suit.

\textsuperscript{164} Jats are the largest sub-tribe among the Punjabis

\textsuperscript{165} He was the tenth Sikh Guru (15 April 1563– 30 May 1606)

\textsuperscript{166} (Born 1780- Died 1839)
The conversion to other religions among a large number of low caste Punjabis\textsuperscript{167} was largely not voluntary but had been under duress. Freewill or exhaustive examination of the adopted religion’s beliefs and fulfilling the demands of the faith had little, if any role, in their acceptance of Islam. Thorough examination of the tenets and beliefs and full observance of the mandatory rituals (\textit{Faraiz}) are necessary conditions for converts under Islam. In Arabic this is called (\textit{Iqrar-e-Bil Lisan Wa Tasdiq-e-Bil Qalb} (Lit. Admission by tongue and endorsement by heart)). Therefore, without socializing into Islamic belief system and without internalizing to the core Islamic values Punjabi Muslim converts could never transmit their adopted religious beliefs to the succeeding generations. Resultantly, the later has always remained doubtful about their religious identity.\textsuperscript{168} After Pakistan’s creation, the Punjabis became two of the largest ethnic groups in the new country\textsuperscript{169} and the largest and domineering in the West Pakistan.

\textsuperscript{167}“In Punjab, \textit{biradri} (clan or caste) networks provide a ready source of social and political affinity, which can also be exploited for political purposes.” (Mezzera, 2009: 17)

\textsuperscript{168} The most relevant and most apt explanation of Punjabi ethno-religious character has been done by no other than the architect of Pakistani statehood the poet-philosopher Dr. Allam Muhammad Iqbal (1876-1938) in his poem titled \textit{Punjabi Musalman}. Part of his book \textit{Zarb-e-Kaleem} In this poem describing Punjabis ethno-religious profile, Dr. Iqbal states

\begin{verbatim}
Mazhab Mein Bohat Taza Pasand Iss Ki Tabiyat Kar Le Kahin Manzil To Guzerta Hai Bohat Jald
A newborn faith invokes his taste, Adopts with zeal but leaves with haste.
Tehqeeq Ki Bazi Ho To Shirkat Nahin Kartaa Ho Khail Mureedi Ka To Harta Hai Bohat Jald
In search for truth he takes no part, As disciple stakes both head and heart.
Taveel Ka Phanda Koi Sayyad Laga De Ye Shakh-e-Nasheman Se Uterta Hai Bohat Jald
If comments’ snare some hunter set, From nest on bough would drop in net.
\end{verbatim}

In a nutshell it means that in matters of religion Punjabis temperament is erratic or novelty-seeking as if a Punjabi converts to a religion he seldom remains steadfast. This explanation of Punjabi national character is most relevant because Dr. Iqbal born and lived most of its life in Sialkot, a town of central Punjab.

\textsuperscript{169} Bengalis was the largest ethnic group inhabiting East Pakistan now Bangladesh.
Due to Pakistani state exhaustive, rhetorical and propagandist use of Islam for the purposes of nation-building and formation of national identity the post Pakistan generations of the Punjabis have had to reinvent their Islamic religious identity.

Like the Meos (or Mewatis), the dwellers of a large rural neighbourhood of Delhi, who had accepted Islam as their faith many centuries ago, but only to some extent (Troll, 1994: 117), many Punjabis, who converted to Islam also become Muslims to a certain extent and not completely. So like the Tableeghi Jamaat founder Maulana Ilyas (1885-1944), who founded the movement to reinforce the Muslim religious beliefs and practices of Mewatis through tabligh (preaching) in order to revive and strengthen the faith, it is possible that the leaders of the TJ in Pakistan by basing their movement in Raiwind near Lahore, the provincial capital of Pakistani Punjab, was aiming at reinvigorating the Islamic beliefs and identity of the Punjabis. It is important to note in this context that after the death of Maulana Ilyas his son Yosuf became the leader of the movement and took up residence in the Punjab and died in Lahore in 1965. As the TJ has an important role in radicalizing of Pakistani society (see for details Chapter 2 and Chapter 3) the movement impact on the Punjabi society and population has been quite strong. The urge for reformulating the group’s religious identity was strongest among those Muslim members of Punjabi ethnic group who migrated from the Indian Punjab after the creation of two separate states of India and Pakistan in 1947. As many of those who migrated from India faced violence and suffered atrocities at the hands of Sikhs and Hindus while on their way to Pakistan, they started percieving that their persecution was due to their religious affiliation. Although this perception was to a certain extent had substance but the dominant majority of Punjabis and other Urdu-speaking Muslims who migrated from India to Pakistan at the time of partition of the subcontinent were economic migrants or include those who faced uncertain social status and future in India.

The urge for reinventing Islamic or Muslim identity among the Punjabis has also been quite strong because the ethnic group has dominated the Pakistani state so while trying to form an Islamic personality of the state many among the Punjabis also seem to have felt the necessity of reinforcing and redefining their own Islamic beliefs. This feeling particularly exacerbated during and after the rule of General Zia-ul-Haq (1979-1988). The general, who was a Punjabi migrant
from India, with his so-called *Islamization* policy tried to bulldoze the secular state and societal institutions and processes and to veneer the rest with *Islamic* plating.

Terrorism in the name of religion is not specific to Islam. Religious terrorism started centuries back and in this connection three groups are quite noteworthy. These include the *Thugs* the *Assassins* and the *Zealots-Sciari*. The Thugs was a Hindu sect, which carried out its activities from 7th until the mid-19th century, when they were eliminated by the British authorities. The members of the Thugs “would strangle their victims as an offering to the Hindu goddess of terror and destruction, Kali; their overriding motivation was religious rather than financial. Indeed, the cult may be the only example of a ‘terrorist’ group motivated entirely by a religious imperative.” (Burgess, 2004) Empirically speaking many of Pakistani ruling elite, which predominantly has had belonged to the Punjab, members being the direct descendents of Hindus after having an overriding control of Pakistani policies, come up with the novel idea. The idea was to use terrorism apparently *a la* Hindu Thugs on the domestic level to dominate other ethnic groups and at the international level to settle score with India and justify this in the name of Islam.

Innumerable people particularly in the Punjab come under sweeping influence of the Wahabist sect doctrinaire Islam. Having weak Muslim religious identity many Pakistani Punjabis seemingly have had believed that subscribing to the stringent dogma of Wahabism could redeem their lost Muslim identity and reinforce the same. A typical example of this process has been the personality of Hafiz Muhammad Saeed, who founded Lashkar-e-Tayyaba (the LeT). Saeed himself migrated from India (Punjab) to Pakistan and while a young boy saw the killing of a large number of his family members at the hands of Hindu and Sikh zealots. So personal agony led Saeed to believe that he was persecuted because of his religion; therefore, he should revisit his Muslim identity. Arguably Saeed’s decision to give up a decent employment of a professor of Islamic Studies at the University of Engineering and Technology, Lahore, and heading personally to Afghanistan to wage physical Jihad against the Soviets, coming close to Osama bin Laden there and founding of the the LeT, a Wahabist group, is a microcosm reflection and indicator of radicalization of Punjabi society, impact of *Islamization* policy of Zia as well as that of the influence of Saudi-Wahabists on Pakistan particularly the Punjab. The Ahle Hadith Sect,
the interchangeable name for Wahabists, which had no existence in the Punjab before the 1980s, during the rule of Zia established hundreds of madrassas, mostly in the commercial centres of the Punjab. (Malik, 1996: 198)

For three decades, deep tectonic forces have been silently tearing Pakistan away from the Indian subcontinent and driving it towards the Arabian peninsula. This continental drift is not physical but cultural, driven by a belief that Pakistan must exchange its South Asian identity for an Arab-Muslim one. Grain by grain, the desert sands of Saudi Arabia are replacing the rich soil that had nurtured a rich Muslim culture in India for a thousand years. This culture produced Moghul architecture, the Taj Mahal, the poetry of Asadullah Ghalib, and much more. Now a stern, unyielding version of Islam—Wahabism—is replacing the kinder, gentler Islam of the sufis and saints who had walked on this land for hundreds of years. (Hoodhboy, 2009)

Thus the above-mentioned causes not only transformed the traditional moderate Punjabi normative framework and values but greatly radicalized the Punjabi society. For instance, “Punjabis, who were far more liberal towards women than Pukhtuns, are now beginning to take a line resembling the Taliban.” (Hoodhboy,--------: 2). As Punjab is the dominant subculture of Pakistan and the ethnic group has dominated the military and has the largest share in the statecraft, therefore, radicalization of the Punjabi society has reflected strongly into Pakistani policies and statecraft.

5.10 MANIPULATION OF EDUCATION SYSTEM & INSTITUTIONS

Another very important factor in growing religious fundamentalism in Pakistani society has been the manipulation and doctoring of the social institution of education. “Understanding the characteristics and weaknesses of Pakistan’s education sector is key to developing better explanations of the link between education and militancy.” (Winthroop, 2010: 9) Extremism in the name of Islam in recent years has greatly affected the structural stability and functionality of Pakistani society. The case of Pakistan is unique because here educational institutions and
academia instead of modernizing, civilizing, democratizing the society and most importantly neutralizing the factors that have been responsible for the rise and proliferation of extremist tendencies particularly religious radicalism, have, in fact, contributed to the phenomenon of extremism, militancy and terrorism in the name of Islam. In this way education system and institutions (through manipulation) become a key factor in extremism and terrorism in the name of Islam. Although in the context of extremism most the attention has remained focus on the role of militant madrassas in Pakistan, however, the main issue regarding the correlation between education and extremism in Pakistan is the failure of successive governments and regimes to provide adequate education infrastructure and curricula. (Winthrop, 2010: 15) In the context of Pakistan three important linkages between education and extremism can be identified. Firstly, educational institutions role in enhancing the knowledge base of the society and diffusing awareness within it regarding religious extremism-militancy-terrorism and their negative fallout. Secondly, contribution to the phenomenon of religious extremism-terrorism in the country. Thirdly, making use of educational institutions primarily teachers’ influence on society, communities and individuals to counter the menace of extremism.

Analysis of educational institutions primary role of disseminating and diffusing knowledge in the society in order to contribute to the stability, functionality and ultimately mental and physical development of Pakistanis society reveals that they have clearly lacked on this count. Firstly, never in Pakistan’s history the rate of literacy crossed the 40 percent mark (current) while the situation in the past decades has been pathetic both in terms of literacy levels as well as condition of institutions of learning. Pakistan is one of the only 12 countries of the World that spend less than 2% of its GNP on education. The average Pakistani boy receives only five years of schooling; the average girl just 2.5 years. The U.S. Agency for International Development claims that only two-thirds of Pakistani children aged 5-9 are ever enrolled in schools and only one-third will complete the fifth grade. The UN in the year 2004 assigned Pakistan the lowest “education index” of any country outside Africa. (UNDP, 2004) In such a situation the educational institutions cannot play their critical social role of disseminating knowledge. Whereas, due to the substandard quality of curricula, faculty plus interference in universities and degree awarding colleges by successive governments, especially military regimes, the latter could not play any meaningful role in educating the society and thus failed to provide it
leadership. Pakistani universities did occasionally serve as rallying grounds and launching pads for liberal and leftist political movements but by and large they have failed to play their manifest functions.

Military dictators particularly Zia too fearful of the revolutionary potential of the universities imposed colossal checks on them and made them totally ineffective in relative sense. Universities and colleges instead of playing their social role of educating the society through its graduates and studying and finding solutions to social problems have suffered deep parochial divisions. Various political parties and the establishment supported groups during General Zia’s military rule not only undercut the capacity of institutes of higher learning to play their part for which they were established but rather turned them into seats of extremism like ethnic and Muslim sectarian strife. “Zia-ul-Haq pitted radical-minded university students against their professors with the aim of driving the secular-minded teachers from the universities.” (Haqqani, 2005: 151) This policy struck at the very roots of the universities to impart liberal education that in turn could offset Islamic extremist trends.

Due to absence of strong research traditions and capacity to study contemporary issues, Pakistani universities cannot take exact cognizance of prevailing social problems, including religious extremism, exploring the issues, reaching their root causes and bring forth the findings, suggesting solutions and enabling the decision-makers to take informed and appropriate policy actions. The adverse situation in Pakistan’s education system and its causes was explained by former chairman of the University Grants Commission (UGC later Higher Education Commission), Pereshan Khattak:

The basic problem has been with the education policy; so far we have had nine such policies. The best one was that of 1989. The rest of the educational polices could not be implemented due to change of governments. So I must say that we have not been serious about educational policy. When I was the chairman the UGC, we studied the educational policies and systems of 61 countries and I had to go around the World for the purpose. What I discovered that in the US they were annoyed that there education was outmoded by almost 100 years. While in the UK the society was clamouring even louder that their [education] system was almost 200 years behind the US. I was astonished and was ineffable after thinking that what would be our difference with the US educational system.
because we already knew that we were 200 years behind the UK. Therefore, when
nations so advanced felt so much deprived in terms of education and wanted to improve
then what would be our fate where there was no feeling at all of improvement. When I
was a young kid and getting education under the British rule, the system was more sound,
good rather better then the present system in vogue in Pakistan. Nowadays the education
system is absolutely corrupt; our examination system has totally failed; both annual and
semester systems are in tatters. In the annual system of the UK and the semester system
of the US there is absolutely no concession for anybody, unlike our system.\textsuperscript{170}

Yet another problem with mainstream public educational institutions has been their incapacity to
impart education literally and instead inculcating into the minds of students state-devised
propaganda. It started during the rule of General Ayub Khan that only officially sanctioned
syllabus and books must be taught in schools and colleges. This practice continued under Bhutto
(1971-77). Successive government used these text books to disseminate propaganda to create a
uniform and undifferentiated discourse and through it an uncritical mindset. A thorough
examination of the texts of these books by Professor K. K. Aziz reveals that they generally
supported military rule in Pakistan, engendering animosity towards Hindus, adulating wars and
distorting the pre-Pakistan history of different ethnic groups, cultures and areas that comprise
Pakistan. Especially Pakistan was being depicted as a \textit{Fortress of Islam}'. (Aziz, 1993: 188)
During Zia-ul-Haq regime Pakistani text books were rewritten and so-called ideological content
were heavily incorporated in them. (Haqqani, 2005: 49). General Zia’s regime unabashedly
distorted history through text books that he went to such an extent to the appeasement of clerics
and radicals that Maulana Maududi, the founder of the JI, was declared in the text books one of
the founders of Pakistan’s ideology while he, in fact, opposed Pakistan tooth and nail. ((Haqqani,
2005: 150)

You would recall that there was first the Islamization of the curriculum in General Zia-ul-
Haq’s time where the curriculum had to have the very sound religious foundation, that
was the first step and it was in that \textit{Islamization} of the curriculum that they first started to
redefine Pakistani nationhood. Pakistani nationhood was defined by creating hatred

\textsuperscript{170} Interview with Pereshan Khattak, former Chairman of University Grants Commission of Pakistan (Peshawar, May 2007)
towards the Hindu community in India and Pakistan. They tried to do that in a very crude manner, which certainly would hurt the feelings of the Pakistani Hindus also. This is what they did at that time, but then too, when the Afghan Jihad started, the US and Pakistani governments, both of them, started to run this agenda on creating Jihad against Soviet Union. The CIA prepared text books for Afghan children, which implored them to wage Jihad against Red Army. It was just at that same time that Pakistani textbooks also started talking about Jihad. This also happened at the same time because by then a particular political party [JI] which subscribed to such ideas about Islamization of education had taken a firm hold of the education establishment in Pakistan. They were making sure that the education is given in the form that they desired.\textsuperscript{171}

The dictates from the state impeded educational institutes to play their role in educating the society independently keeping in view and in response to the societal needs. The curricula based on value-judgements and propaganda has resulted in disillusionment of large number of students when faced with practical problems and hard realities of life. This is perhaps the reason that many so-called well-educated (by Pakistani standards) people joined the extremist ranks. Moreover, having undemocratic orientations and experience of large periods of military rules the educational policy planners failed to develop curricula that inculcates and cultivates fundamentally democratic, anti-extremist and tolerant values among the students.

When I was in education affairs I used to tell generals, they are good people, very politely that you are trained as soldiers not as educationists. In education as in politics two and two can make five, 13 or 21 but in military it makes only four. It means different trainings. I know how much tactful you need to be to administer affairs and to deal with students. But a general is not trained for the purpose. On the one hand a vice chancellor has to be very strict while on the other hand he is a father rather more than a father, he is a teacher; he loves the student. An educationist VC rules the heart of staff and students. A general does not know how to do so. When he controls the head he loses the hearts.

\textsuperscript{171} Interview with Dr. Abdul Hameed Nayyar (Islamabad, December 2009)
Universities are not regiments, divisions or companies to be run by military people. I am totally against it.\textsuperscript{172}

A part of Pakistani educational institutions instead of having a moderating and democratic influence on society themselves become hubs of religious extremism and terrorism! The large number of madrassas particularly those that cropped up under Genera Zia and in 1990s financed by Arab countries and Muslim charities have been instrumental in radicalizing Pakistan.

The Afghan jihad changed everything. During the war against the Soviet occupation of Afghanistan, madrassas provided the US-Saudi-Pakistani alliance the cannon fodder needed for fighting a holy war. The Americans and Saudis, helped by a more-than willing General Zia, funded new madrassas\textsuperscript{173} across the length and breadth of Pakistan.” (Hoodbhoy, 2009)

However, the problems with madrassas are multifaceted and not just limited to militancy. The students of thousands of madrassas are imparted religious theory, largely based on selective lessons from the Islamic scripture and its de-contextualized exegesis and are prepared to take up jobs in the religious sector. The main problem of madrassas is that the extremely narrow worldview, and the curricula bereft of modern civic education and the poverty of the students interact causing large-scale radicalization of society. (ICG, 2002) Hardly anywhere in the World the centres established for imparting education transformed into nurseries of radicalism. Noticeably madrassas in Pakistan become the base for engineering societal wide Islamic extremism in Afghanistan. (ICG, 2002) Afghan Taliban, which were produced in controlled conditions of Pakistani madrassas by Pakistani military establishment, turned out to be one of the ultra-extremist Muslim regime of modern Islamic history. The 50 madrassas constructed along the 80-mile Quetta-Chaman highway have been instrumental in imparting militant training to Afghan Taliban. “Every month all the heads of the the JUI madrassas met in Quetta with a

\textsuperscript{172} Interview with Pereshan Khattak (Peshawar, May 2007)

\textsuperscript{173} During the first three years of Zia ruler (1979-82), only 151 new seminaries were established while in the next six years more than a thousand new madrassas were established. (ICG, 2002) In the later period anti-Soviet Afghan resistance got a great momentum which shows the correlation between madrassas and militancy.
senior ISI officer to work out their rotation of young men and their expenses.” (Rashid, 2008: 249-50) Afghan Taliban not only got hold of state power there but established a novel extremist structure based on violence and forceful submission of masses. The phenomenon of Talibanization in Afghanistan, fundamentally a product of Pakistan madrassas, subsequently gripped north-western Pakistan and gradually through squeezing more and more conservative sections of population encroached upon the rest of the country.

In Pakistan for majority of the youths receiving liberal education by investing long years of life and hard-earned money of parents is no guarantee for getting a decent or any employment. This failure to get a respectful source of income and sustenance after completing education has had put extremely negative impact on Pakistani social psychology. The educated people who used to be highly respected in the society due to joblessness become a laughing stock. This discouraged other people particularly those from the lower-middle classes to get education and improve their lot thus rendering the large part of population especially the youths, with impressionistic minds, uneducated and susceptible to religious extremism. This encouraged a large number of parents to send their children and dependents to madrassas for a secure economic future. The latter with a sense of extreme economic insecurity and mindset of using education for economic gains solely have been easy prey to the mastermind of religious extremists who could offer them a handsome amount of money.

Importantly, well before madrassas in Pakistan became hubs of militant training and extremism, many universities and colleges had already been dens of arms, ammunition and violence if not of militant training per se. The example of the Punjab University is a case in point where a student group Islami Jamiat-e-Tulaba (IJT), associated with Jamaat-e-Islami, since long has made the institute into its virtual fort and preaching of its radical agenda. Groups like the IJT recruited many Jihadists from the universities to fight in Afghanistan and Kashmir. On the other hand there are indications that although madrassas have been part of the problem of extremism and terrorism in the name of Islam but at the same time the public schools also have their own contribution to the menace. According to Christian Fair she was told by some Pakistani interlocutors as much as 40 percent of militant manpower actually comes from Pakistan’s public schools and higher education institutions. (Fair C., 2004: 494)
5.10.1 State Incapacity

The most important aspect of education and Islamic extremism in Pakistan has been the inability and incapacity of the state to provide to all the children of the country primary education. This left a large number of school-age children out of schools. For instance, in the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KP) province, one of the hotbeds of religious militancy and terrorism, even in 2012 an estimated three million children are out of schools. These three million children include two million girls. (Speakers say 3 million kids out of school in KP, 2012) A large number of them have had to land in madrassas to get at least religious education. The successive governments’ failure to evolve a viable public education system also compelled many parents to send their children to madrassas (Abbas, 2005: 202). The state’s inability to provide adequate education infrastructure especially in the rural and tribal areas, where most of the country’s population live, provided conducive environment to the religious radical groups and individuals to construct a large number of madrassas to cater to the local demand for education for their children. This also helped the state intelligence agencies to build a large number of militant-madrassas in the rural and economically backward areas as well as the FATA.

5.11 SOCIAL-PSYCHOLOGICAL CAUSES OF EXTREMISM-TERRORISM

Extremism in whatever manner one defines it is basically a form of social attitude having violent and aggressive connotations. The surge in the phenomenon of extremism among Muslims in Pakistan has many psychological causes. The foremost psychological cause of extremism in Pakistan, especially in the northwest and rural areas has been the large-scale social instability in terms of conflict over norms, values and the concerned normative framework and value-system. There has been a general misperception among the local political and social elite and even many academics that the society in the above-mentioned regions has been fundamentally stable. This misperception about Pakistani society’s stability is based on the argument that the underpinnings of traditional, personalized social-relationships, where consensus on norms and values is but natural, have held together Pakistani society and thus it is fundamentally stable. But for an objective observer the argument of stability of Pakistani society is merely a paradox. Instead
even this pseudo-stability is superficial and beneath this stability lurks every conceivable conflict among communities, classes, subcultures and ethnicities. In addition there has been a great disconnect between the values of society and goals of the state as is enshrined in the objectives of key policies over decades. The relationship between the state and society in Pakistan “was grounded in a historical context where the state did not organically emerge from socio-economic structure existing below but at the top by constructing a wholly new central government which could then impose authority on areas hitherto ruled from New Delhi.” (Jalal, 1999: 277) The state dominated by the ruling elite has its primary goal of perpetuation of the elite’s illegal control. The society manipulated by the ruling elite and the clerics, for their respective vested interests, which on many occasions have coincided, set Islamic governance as its main goal. The purpose of an Islamic system of administration is to attain basic amenities of life as well as curbing the social evils primarily vulgarity and monetary corruption.

In addition to this the exposition of the traditional society to varieties of dogmas and numerous exotic people, the once so-called stable social structure has become extremely destabilized. In particular the social contact with radical Arab religious dogmas has largely disturbed the classical stability of Pakistani society. It may again be mentioned that beginning in 1970s, a large number of people from Pakistan, of which majority belonging to the KP, the FATA and the rural Punjab, have been going to Arab and Gulf countries for employment. Simultaneously thousands of Arabs, North African and Central Asian fighters came to Pakistan during the Soviet-Afghan war and many among them stayed back. This two-way cross-border movement resulted in complex interaction and social contact between Arab and Pakistani societies at various levels. The workers from Pakistan after having spent many years in the Arab lands while coming back and forth have brought with them values and customs of Arab culture. Most Pakistani workers assimilated these Arab values and customs by misperceiving them as Islamic values. They have also been asking their extended family members, friends and neighbours to internalize these purely Islamic values which they have brought back from the cradle of Islam. This situation has created large-scale psychological confusion rather perplexity among Pakistanis regarding which normative framework to adhere to and what goals and values to work for. In this situation it is but natural for the people to become extremely frustrated and some kind of mass hysteria may result.
5.12 PAK SOCIAL SYSTEM INCAPACITY TO ADAPT TO ZEITGEIST

Another reason for social instability in the Pakistani society is the inability of the traditional social system particularly in the rural and tribal areas to functionally transform and adapt to the demand of times. At the same time Pakistani society could not escape the impact of the forces of globalization. This has created a situation where the traditional social structures could not hold the society stable while the majority’s social attitudes, due to large-scale illiteracy among population and its non-urbane social settings, remained traditionally-oriented or more aptly rooted in the distant and unredeemable past. For instance, majority of Pakistani have yearned for and cherished the governance system of the righteous Caliphs of Islam but could not understand that how those righteous Caliphs, on whose personalities this system was based, could be brought back.

Generally in Pakistan the basic social-psychological reason for Islamic extremism is the state of normlessness technically called anomie. Anomie is a social condition where there is large-scale conflict (instead of consensus) over norms and values and no value-system or normative framework is so compelling and forceful to organize the social behaviour. Conflict and frustration are outcomes of this situation. According to social-psychologists there are two main types of aggression: hostile and instrumental. The former is an end in itself and the latter is a mean towards some other end. The nature of religious extremism in Pakistan is that it is the combination of both types. Hostile aggression, which is driven by hatred, has equally been the cause of religious extremism in Pakistan. However, by appending the pseudo-religious motives with personal anger and disaffection a feeling is created by terming it is instrumental aggression. This is also evident from the confusion in the minds of aggressors; in fact, terrorist activities like suicide attacks are a result of this mental confusion about goals. Contemporary Pakistani society is marked by large-scale personal ill-feelings and frustrations and that is when there is a rampage of violent extremism. In order to attain self-justification and win sympathies of others, the terrorists present their aggression as instrumental aggression.
Elucidating the psychological roots of extremist violence in the country Professor Aly Ahmed,a known Pakistani social-psychologist, argued:

Since the inception of human civilization aggression existed in one form or the other; terrorism is a form of aggression or violence. From psychological point of view it is an instinctual behaviour as defined by Sigmund Freud. The level of violent behaviour varies from individual to individual and society to society even within society and families. Extremism may refer to the highest intensity or highest level of violent behaviour exhibited to other individuals and groups. Sometime this behaviour is exhibited to the weakest individuals. Sometimes it happens that one does not care whether the concerned object or person is weakest or strongest. There are various types of terrorists as defined by various social psychologists.

About development of frustration Ahmed said, “This all depends upon the socialization processes. Some individuals are highly frustrated in their own family and society they are either invited to or incidentally fall prey to terrorists or intentionally join terrorists.” (Ahmed, 2007)

Insofar, as the causes of aggression are concerned experts give three reasons: an inborn drive, natural response to frustration, a behaviour learned as part of the society. By nature people of Pakistan and particularly that of North western areas are relatively violent. The case of Waziristan, whose residents have the most violent history and profile among the Pakhtun tribes, is particularly important.

As an underlying social-psychological reason for extremist aggression is natural response to frustration, which in Pakistan’s case has been ubiquitous, deep-rooted, pervasive and extensive. The manifestation of extremism in the northwest of the country is especially important where due to stone-age social conditions and massive underdevelopment has engendered extreme mass frustration. This frustration acting in concert or symbiotically with violent nature of people has manifested in the shape of Islamic extremism because Pakistani society has had a tendency of labelling everything Islamic, for instance, Islamic banking.

174 Interview with Dr. Aly Ahmed, a Pakistani psychologist and a former professor of Psychology at the University of Peshawar (Peshawar, October, 2008)
In social-psychological terms frustration is the blocking of goal-oriented behaviour. It is said that frustration grows when the motivation to achieve a goal is very strong, when gratification is expected and the blocking is complete. Pakistan being a closed society especially in its north-western and rural areas, the social mobility, both intergenerational and intra-generational has almost been negligible. The denial of ways towards this basic urge and goal along with the ultimate aim of socio-economic development and monetary gains creates a situation in which frustration is a natural corollary.

A school of thought within the psychologists explains that a group or individual is frustrated in terms of economic conditions, unemployment, social norms and when the goal-directed behaviour is stopped; means one is unable to satisfy the concerned need or motive this individual or the group considers to attack or to attempt upon the property of any individual or organization. He or she considers this is the legal way but it is not socially approved in any society or moral framework particularly Islam. Terrorists exhibit such behaviour not only to obtain their goal but they think that through anti-social behaviour they would at least attract the attention of concerned society or attract international audience.175

5.13 TERRORISM AS GROUP AGGRESSION

One aspect of religious extremism in Pakistan is that fundamentally it is a kind of group aggression. Various groups of clerics have been training terrorists and brainwashing them. On their part the executors of violence and their supporters do not held themselves personally responsible and consider it as a collective goal. Groups are believed by social-psychologists to amplify aggressive reaction partly by diffusing responsibility. This is particularly true in north-western largely tribal areas. Without group support individuals attacks in these areas are highly risky and can evoke huge reprisals. The clerics in these areas could only organize their aggressive behaviour once they got convinced of group support. Sageman (2004) states that personal paths, interactions, and choices may lead young Muslims to become radical jihadists.

175 Interview with Dr. Aly Ahmed, a Pakistani psychologist and a former professor of Psychology at the University of Peshawar (Peshawar, October, 2008)
According to that study, the act of joining a jihadist organisation such as Al Qaeda stems from the individual making an unintentional friendship with a person who has radical jihadists’ views. In the sample of 168 subjects who were investigated by Sageman, 68% said friendship was the main influencing factor contributing to joining jihadist groups.

In about 14% of the cases, one joined a jihadist organisation because of familial bonds. The two other explanatory variables also dealt with socialization experiences prior to involvement in terrorist activity: 1) experiences related to education in certain madrassas or Koranic schools (8% of the members of the sample, or 2) assiduous participation in the activities of certain radical mosques (Sageman, 2004).

5.13.1 Secondary Socialization

In an effort to explore and explain the causes of extremism and terrorism from a psychosocial perspective secondary socialization is also very important to make individuals members of extremist and terrorist groups committed terrorists. (De la Corte, 2006) This assertion is quite relevant to explaining the increasing radicalization of Pakistani extremist groups and their turning towards terrorism and its extremist forms. It could be believed that most of the people joined so-called Islamic extremist and terrorist outfits after hoodwinked by their catchy religious slogans but transformed into ultra extremist after undergoing secondary socialization within the extremist group environment in particular after subjected to indoctrinative propaganda.

Above analysis show that the rise and proliferation of religious extremism and terrorism and its affliction of the Pakistani state and society are indeed complex phenomenon and have many causes. One writer has concluded it in this way.

Modern religious fanaticism in Pakistan is the product of interlocking capitalist, imperial, national and local factors. … Pakistan’s ruling classes, including those involved in its birth, took frequent recourse to religion and made alliances with retrogressive forces to achieve the worldly aims of political power. In this, they sought the help of global and imperial powers, such as, Saudi Arabia and the US. In return, Saudi Arabia greatly enhanced the influence of Wahhabism in South Asia, and the US defeated the former.
Soviet Union and gained control over the route to the riches of the Caspian Sea. (Saigol, 2009: 58)

However, a closer look at these factors would reveal that is has basically been the political vacuum in Pakistan which allowed the capitalist, imperial, national and local actors and factors to use Islam for the attainment of their respective vested interest and in the process leave the state and society profoundly radicalized. So this study takes forward the existing body of knowledge regarding the phenomenon of religious extremism and terrorism in Pakistan from the existing knowledge base.

CONCLUSION

In the chapter various key causes of extremism and terrorism in the name of Islam in Pakistan have been identified and analyzed. The first chief cause of the twin phenomenon, which has been discovered, is the pseudo-Islamist ideological standpoint of the non-religious Pakistani ruling elite that Pakistan is: the Fort of Islam, Reincarnation of Islamic Glory, a model of Political Islam and the base of Pan-Islamism. The ruling elite needed this pseudo-ideological Islamist position to justify its control of the state and its institutions; to provide a common ground and slogan for nation-building and to prevent the evolution of a democratic-liberal-constitutional culture in the country. These interests and objectives of the elite required carrying out extensive and persuasive propaganda to convince the public of the Islamist credentials of the state and most importantly that of the non-religious ruling elite itself. This necessitated for the ruling elite-dominated state to count on the social influence and nuisance value of the clerics. The state-sponsored propaganda carried out in this regard through state-dominated media, curricula and clerics cultivated a deep-rooted social attitude considering the state really an Islamic institution and a sizable population particularly the conservative sections started demanding every state policy to be formulated and executed to enforce Shariah domestically and pursue the ideal of Pan-Islamism through foreign policy. The ruling elite, having profoundly secular and reactionary complexion, never meant what it propagated; therefore, its reluctance and failure to enforce an
Islamic system in the country and further Islamist agenda through the foreign policy, has had created large-scale resentment among the masses who were made first to belief Pakistan was an Islamist state. A part of this resentment manifested in the form of terrorism in the name of Islam in the process radicalizing the whole society.

Secondly, Pakistani clerical groups realized that the demand within the public for an Islamic system and support for Pan-Islamism was quite strong while the ruling elite had been unwilling and unable to fulfil the promises of making Pakistan a truly Islamic state and the Fort of Islam. So the mullahs found the situation tailor-made to pursue their own group and individual interests. The collective interest of Muslim clerics forming the traditional-conservative social elite of Pakistan in this regard has been to replace the de-jure ruling elite in order to capture the state power themselves. Therefore, the clerics and their groups, whether patronized by the ruling elite-dominated state or otherwise, in order to attain this particular goal started fomenting fundamentalism in the society; as only religiously radicalized social attitude(s) could guarantee clerics to completely dominate the state institutions and electoral politics—the stepping stones to state power.

Thirdly, the economic factors of poverty, unemployment and aim of making monetary gains have also contributed significantly to the phenomenon of religious extremism and terrorism in Pakistan. Large-scale poverty left people susceptible to manipulation by the clerics and extremist-terrorist outfits. Many people have been sending their children to madrassas because of inability to provide for their basic requirements of food, clothing and shelter, which they could at least get at madrassas. Unemployment among the youths led many of them to join extremist groups. Poverty among members of the Muslim clergy motivated them to take advantage of the conditions prevailing in Pakistan and to make mosque and madrassas their economic base. This result in immense proliferation of madrassas and mosques, mostly constructed through funds provided by Arab-Gulf countries particularly Saudi Arabia and Kuwait to use these institutions for the propagation of their state ideology of Wahabism in Pakistan.

Fourthly, the facilitation of so-called Afghan Mujahideen, Kashmiri Mujahideen, Afghan Taliban and Pakistani Taliban groups by the Pakistani military-civilian-intelligence establishment to pursue its dictated foreign policy goals of the country in Afghanistan and
Kashmir as well as domestically has been instrumental in radicalizing Pakistani society and transmutation of many fundamentalist Islamist groups into terrorist organizations. Fifthly, the support by Pakistani state, clerical groups and society to international Jihadist groups like the Al Qaeda, the Afghan Taliban and the the LeT to emerge in Pakistan and support of these actors to many others foreign militant-terrorist groups like IJU, IMU, ETIM to have a base and launching pad inside Pakistan specifically in the FATA also contributed monumentally to the rise and proliferation of extremism and terrorism in the name of Islam.

Sixthly, certain ethnic characteristics and dynamics of main Pakistani ethnic groups—Pakhtuns and Punjabis—have also contributed to the complex phenomenon of religious extremism and terrorism in Pakistan. In this regard the ultraconservative social structure in the FATA, the collectivist-reactionary features of Pakhtun culture as a whole and the Pakhtuns sentimental attachment to Islam on the one hand and the large-scale confusion among the Punjabis regarding their religious personality, due to the majority’s Hindu-Buddhist-Sikh descent and their incidental-opportunistic conversion to Islam and thus reinvention of their religious identity and in the process the coming of both these culture under sweeping influence of Saudi-Wahabist-Arabist religious doctrines have been instrumental in the radicalization of Pakistan society and unleashing of terrorism in the name of Islam in the country.

Seventhly, prevalent mass illiteracy; the state’s inability to provide for the education of all the children of the country; the incapacity and substandard quality of the public schools; the construction of thousands of madrassas including many militant-madrassas to create militants for Afghanistan and Kashmir; the inability of Pakistani universities and institutes of higher learning to cultivate large-scale civilized, liberal, democratic and tolerant social attitudes, have also contributed significantly to the phenomenon of religious extremism and terrorism in Pakistan.

Eighthly, the social-psychological and individual psychological causes of society’s lack of consensus over norms, values and societal goals or social anomie; Pakistan social system’s inability to functionally develop and adopt to the spirit of the times; and the individual psychological causes of confusion among majority of Pakistanis about their religious identity,
social roles; masses disenchantment with the political and economic system have also played a significant role in the rise and proliferation of religious extremism and terrorism in Pakistan.

However, what this study has fundamentally discovered is that all these above-mentioned causes have been contributing factors instead of the prime or the most important underlying cause for fundamentalism and terrorism in the name of Islam in Pakistan. Instead what this study has found to be the root-cause of the twin phenomena in Pakistan is the long-existing constitutional-legal-administrative vacuum, in short referred to here as ‘political vacuum’, in the country. The construct of political vacuum becomes comprehensible if seen against the backdrop of rule for decades by unconstitutional, undemocratic and unelected regimes in Pakistan as well as absence of a democratic and liberal culture in the society. Ideally a democratic culture which is the outgrowth of societal dynamics and values could adequately and efficiently fill political vacuum and provide political stability to a state. However, in a profoundly conservative, illiberal cultures and societies like Pakistan this has simply not been possible. Political vacuum could have been plugged and relative political stability could have been achieved through pro-social engineering by the independent state; however, the state, which came into existence through a political, if not a democratic struggle, become a victim of the ruling elite conservatism and its wish to perpetuate the oligarchy’s stranglehold around the state and society. In the next chapter the construct of Political Vacuum has been explained in detail as well as its role in the rise and proliferation of religious extremism and terrorism in Pakistan has been analyzed.
CHAPTER 6
CORRELATION BETWEEN POLITICAL VACUUM & RELIGIOUS EXTREMISM-TERRORISM

Since the turn of the present century Pakistan has been experiencing four conspicuous and empirical trends. The first of these trends has been the increasing number of Pakistani young men joining of clerical-militant groups. The second trend has been the multiplying number of indigenous radical militant outfits and occurrence of an unprecedented number of terrorist incidents since 2007 inside the country perpetrated in the name of Islam. The third trend has been members of internationalist non-state Muslim extremist-terrorist organizations finding sanctuaries and bases on Pakistan’s soil after fleeing their respective states legal systems; using Pakistani territory as pedestal for cross-border and international terrorism particularly in their own countries against their own governments. The fourth trend has been the large-scale empirical radicalization of Pakistani society in the name of Islam.

What this study has found out, as duly documented in the preceding chapters, all the above-mentioned trends have had their roots in the: perennial and ubiquitous political instability in the country since its creation; deliberate de-politicization of the state and society by the ruling-elite; and the resultant political vacuum in the country leading to near-collapse of the administrative-legal structures and procedures and dysfunctional social institutions in the first decade of 21st Century. If one has to summarize the evolution of extremist-terrorist phenomenon in the name of Islam in Pakistan it has taken somewhat the following course and form: Political instability and resultant political vacuum in Pakistan led to the creation of undesirable power centres (military and its dependent civilian establishment becoming repository of all the state powers) and institutions unleashing processes that concentrated state’s entire policymaking powers in these centres.176 The undesirable power centres in order to retain rather perpetuate their power fomented political instability in the country by design in the process by resorting to social

---

176 Policymaking in Pakistan has never been democratic or consultative. (Mezzera & Aftab: 2009: 28) Policies have been formulated and decided upon at the executive level and then presented to the military or civilian heads of states (presidents) or federating units (governors) to promulgate as ordinances or presented to the parliament, with extreme and intricate details and technical language that the majority of the uneducated or partially educated parliamentarians have had no other option but to give approval.
engineering using the name of Islam to get wider public acceptability of this manipulation. The social engineering by the landed gentry and military-cum-civilian establishment as a by-product created so-called Islamically-imbued extremists-terrorist groups, that have emerged as another undesirable power centre by threatening the very existence of the state itself; creating waves of instability and violence in the region and the World at large. This chapter explains in details the construct of ‘Political Vacuum’ in Pakistan and the correlation of political vacuum and the rise of Islamic extremism and terrorism in the country.

6.1. GENESIS OF POLITICAL VACUUM IN PAKISTAN

The roots of political vacuum\(^{177}\) in Pakistan fundamentally lie in the pre-independence history of the country. In the provinces and regions of India, which became part of Pakistan, political institutions were either non-existent or were extremely weak; whereas, democratic decision-making was not part of popular culture in these areas. Whatever, political arena existed there was the exclusive domain of the landed gentry and the minuscule highly-educated members of society. Despite British Colonial rulers’ efforts to build political institutions in order to train the Indian masses in the art of self-governance and introduction of elections in this regard,\(^{178}\) a broad-based political culture could not be cultivated, particularly in the regions which later constituted Pakistan. There were different reasons for the non evolution and failure in cultivating a broad-based political culture in these territories. Firstly, these regions were the remotest in India and the state apparatus and infrastructure was weak there. Secondly, the social structure in these regions was extensively tribalistic and rural. Thirdly, the rates of literacy in these regions were extremely low both relatively and absolutely. Therefore, legions of illiterate masses socialized in the values of tribalism and rural environment could not understand the meanings of concepts like politics, political participation, political movements and political power. Consequently, they remained apolitical and look at everything political with disdain rather

---

\(^{177}\) In the preceding chapters the creation of political vacuum has been slightly mentioned while this is a comprehensive account of its formation.

\(^{178}\) The 1946 elections were held on the basis of restricted electorate. Members of All India Legislative Assembly, which came into existence as a result of 1946 elections, from the regions that became part of Pakistan, after partition of the subcontinent into the independent states of India and Pakistan in 1947, were brought together to serve both as a legislative assembly for Pakistan as well as constitution-making body for the country.
suspicion. Resultantly, the leaders, with a few exceptions, who emerged in these regions, were for all intents and purposes anything but not politicians as they lacked the very qualities of true politicians and democrats like: believing in democratic pursuit of power; considering governmental powers and authority as a public trust to be used for public welfare instead of using it for self and group aggrandizement; management of issues and conflicts non-violently and through the application of tact, failed to run the affairs of the new state. This was concretely evident from the failure of the first federal legislature of Pakistan to frame a constitution for nine long years. “Due to weak political management of the state, the army as an institution was increasingly becoming independent.” (Abbas, 2005: 27)

It were the landlords largely from the Punjab, who formed the elite group of politicians in the initial years of Pakistan, and along with members of the civilian bureaucracy, manipulated the entire political system to their advantage and infused extreme political instability in the country so that for nine years the Constitutional Assembly, which was dominated by these landlords, could not agree on a constitution. The civilian bureaucracy manipulated the conditions of political instability in the initial years of turmoil of Pakistani history to have control over the state. The creator of Pakistan, Muhammad Ali Jinnah’s death in 1948, just after one year of the country’s creation, and the mysterious assassination of country’s first Prime Minister, Liaquat Ali Khan in 1951, which is still an enigma, left the political arena open for the civilian bureaucracy to encroach upon. Procrastination in framing of a constitution proved disastrous for the country. “The delay created a political vacuum which was filled by the military.” (Noman, 1988: 58) Not only the feudal politicians and the clergy took the fullest advantage of the political vacuum but the civil and military establishment also used the situation for promoting their vested interest. (Mir, 1986; Saigol, 2009: 44)

6.2. POLITICAL VACUUM AND EXTREMISM-TERRORISM IN THE NAME OF ISLAM

The relationship between political vacuum and extremism-terrorism and other state and societal problems are explained aptly by A. H. Nayyar:
Extremism and terrorism have been supported by state institutions in Pakistan and states institutions have also created political vacuum in Pakistan. So both the things were done by the same actors. Therefore, it goes without saying that different actions of same actors led to same consequences. Yes I think had there been a little more democratic politics in Pakistan perhaps these groups would have difficult to come into or assume power or become so strong. But when I say little more democracy, I certainly mean that the institutions of state should have been subservient to the party in government and particularly to the parliament. This is the only way which you can create an environment in which politics become more democratic and such actors like militants don’t get space for themselves. Military interruptions in Pakistani governments have been a single most devastating factor for country in every respect: governance, economy, constitution, education, health. The reason Pakistan is poor in all sectors it is primarily because of military intervening into politics and its trying to defined things according to its own interest which has always led to disasters.179

A Pakistani historian also points towards the relationship.

Political Vacuum played its role at the stage of proliferation of extremism and terrorism. Usually we think that why we cannot control extremism and terrorism is because we have weak institutions, crisis of leadership and frequent disruption of the political process by the military. These factors have a direct role in the spread of militancy and radicalism. Our entanglement into regional conflicts in Kashmir and Afghanistan has had much to do with the rise of extremism and militancy.180

In the words of Afrasiab Khattak, a politician and human rights activist:

First of all the problem is there are elements within the establishment, who patronized militancy. Secondly, the misguided policies of the dictatorship have brought international war into our country. Our ruling elite are very fond of becoming the frontline state and it

179 Interview with Dr. Abdul Hameed Nayyar (Islamabad, December 2009).

180 Interview with Pakistani historian, Professor Razia Sultan, who held the chair of History Department, Quaid-e-Azam University, Islamabad, at the time of the interview (Islamabad, December, 2010)
is like an addiction. But let us not forget that the extremist elements can’t reconcile themselves to modern state system. They are basically anti-modern democratic state. Their success starts where the state fails. In Afghanistan they could launch their system only when that country becomes a failing state. This is something which they would like to repeat in Pakistan also. We have seen the failure of the state system in different nooks and corners of the country. The unit of the state has disappeared and the vacuum is being filled by radical elements.\textsuperscript{181}

**According to Farzana Bari:**

When I look at these religious extremist groups I always feel that they have a state support and money behind them. So if these things are taken away from them then it would be very difficult for them to operate. In Swat-Malakand there was an impression that people were with Taliban. But people staged mass migration. When we talked with the IDPs there were a lot of people who were actually against the militants but were silent as they were fearful of them. Obviously when you have power then power has its own dynamics. It is therefore, not necessary that the extremists have the popular base. In fact, their base is quite narrow. However, because they are very organized and as they are trained, have money and arms they are so dangerous. So if they continue to have state support, which they have always enjoyed, obviously we are going to be in trouble. Our only concern is that the state should withdraw all kind of support from the religious extremists. Even now when government forces are conducting operation against militants they are still very selective and they are still protecting certain groups of militants. So this is a dangerous proposition. When you support and strengthen this kind of groups who have no democratic values and are just based on violence then there is no guarantee that they will not turn on the state and society because they also have their own aspirations. And if they want to take control of the state, put in place their own system and then govern and rule, obviously arbitrarily, then you can’t contain their aspirations either. However, I don’t think that these people can take over the state event though the situation is adverse and then I totally agree with that our liberal elements are not having their act

\textsuperscript{181} Interview with Senator Afrasiab Khattak (Peshawar, January 2008). Khattak is the president of Awami National Party (ANP), in the KP and former chairman of Human Rights Commission of Pakistan. Khattak himself escaped a suicide attack in 2008 from the TTP
together. I only fear that this doomsday scenario could only happen if the religious extremists continue to get the kind of support they have become used to from the state.\textsuperscript{182}

**The lack of democratic control over policies due to political vacuum is also pointed at by Mahmud Khan Achakzai**

Prayers, fasting, madrassa and Talib are a part of society. But during Zia's martial law, religious institutions of Pakhtoon areas suffered from a peculiar kind of interference. God knows for what purpose -- may be for Kashmir. In fact, the problem in Pakistan is that people have never been involved in its external policymaking.\textsuperscript{183}

Even an ex DG ISI pointed at political-constitutional-administrative vacuum and resultant lack of good governance as the main cause of the rise and proliferation of extremism-terrorism in the name of Islam.

These people who are called terrorists and somehow militants, who are using terrorism as a vehicle to achieve the ends of war, which is a state function, they got motivation provided by a large number of factors. These include political grievances; sometimes the motivation is given by their nationalism or tribalism, sometime that their kith and kin have been killed. Religion is also a potent motivational factor. So the grievances and political causes come first and the use of religion motivation adds to such environment.\textsuperscript{184}

Researchers also points towards the correlation between political-legal vacuum and extremism-terrorism in the name of Islam:

The legitimacy vacuum left by an elite that is completely unresponsive to the needs of the majority of the population, threatens to be filled by actors and ideologies that can mobilize masses very effectively, though not necessarily along a progressive path. The

\textsuperscript{182} Interview with Dr Farzana Bari (Islamabad, May 2010)

\textsuperscript{183} Interview with Mahum Khan Achakzai, a veteran Pakistani politician and parliamentarian and a long-serving chairman of Pakhtun nationalist political party, Pakhtunkhwa Milli Awami Party (Peshawar, March 2003)

\textsuperscript{184} Interview with former DG ISI, retired Lt. General Asad Durrani (Islamabad, April 2010)
current surge of religious extremism in the country [Pakistan] needs to be understood in this context. (Mezzerra & Aftab, 2009: 8)

Thus the panacea is plugging the political vacuum through promotion of liberal values and democracy in Pakistan. (For details see next chapter)

6.3. INHARMONIOUS DEVELOPMENT OF STATE-SOCIETY INSTITUTIONS & CREATION OF POLITICAL VACUUM

An important aspect of creation of political-legal-administrative vacuum in Pakistan has been the inharmonious development of national institutions. In the process of national institutional building military-intelligence complex has domineered all other state institutions. This situation has been aptly explained by Hassan Abbas.

As Pakistan progressed in its regression, as the army became stronger and stronger, and particularly as the army subdued and outlasted the few genuine political leaders of the old guard around whom a political process and governance consensus could be built, a political vacuum was created within the first decade of Pakistan’s birth. (Abbas, 2005: 10)

Not only the Army got oversized but also its affiliated intelligence agencies followed suit. “The ISI now has a lieutenant colonel heading a unit in every district of the country and a brigadier, who is in charge of five to six districts, in every major city. . .Since the late 1990s, MI is also represented in each district.” (Grare 2009: 16)

Here one clarification is necessary that the Army’s dominating of other national institutions in the initial years was not merely internally-propelled rather the United States also played a role in helping the Army overshadow and dwarf other institutions of the state. According to Pakistani writers Mushahid Hussain\(^\text{185}\) and Akmal Hussain it was fundamentally the US support which helped Army to become the domineering institution so as through it the US can promote its political influence in Pakistan. (Hussain; Hussain, 1986: 30)

\(^{185}\) Mushahid afterwards join politics and also served as Pakistan federal minister for information.
The ruling elite-dominated state policies also depoliticized Pakistani society which furthered political vacuum and in this process the religious extremist were promoted or they have taken fullest advantage of the condition to radicalize Pakistani society.

For the first twenty-four years of Pakistan’s existence, its military, bureaucratic, and political elite carried out ruinous policies at home, alienating both the ethnic and religious minorities and the ethnic majority, sparking the 1971 uprising in East Pakistan, defeat at the hands of India, and the secession of half the country. The creation of Bangladesh was the most traumatic event in the country’s history. For the next thirty-five years, that same elite, now dominated by the military and often in alliance with the United States, nurtured Islamic extremists, which helped prepare the ground for 9/11. (Rashid, 2008: 33)

6.4. MILITARY INSTITUTIONAL INTEREST TO DEPOLITICIZE

The military’s desire to control and direct the political system in order to set the national security parameters and priorities has been the most important factor in developing the concept of an Islamist ideological state of Pakistan. (Haqqani, 2005: 311) A closed political system with doctored elections and unrepresentative rulers is a recipe for disaster (Behuria, 2007: 12) as the history of Pakistan testifies. This situation has had necessitated to see the secular and religious-blind state’s interest through an Islamist prism which in turn made it indispensable to unleash an Islamist ideological discourse through the mullahs on the one hand and nurturing of Islamist terrorist groups to achieve the military-set objectives of the state both inside and outside the country on the other hand. These objectives could not be achieved without dilution of democratic institutions and damaging political parties so as not to allow a democratic culture in the country to thrive. If such a culture had flourished it would have gone directly against the military’s institutional interest of state domination and its strategy of achieving its dictated-policy

---

186 According to Iftikhar H. Malik: “Operations against dissenting politicians, objective intellectuals and other activists were carried out through systematic harassment, disinformation campaigns, fictitious trials, kidnappings, torture and assassination.” (Malik, 1997)
objectives by waging so-called Jihad through the militant groups specifically in Kashmir and Afghanistan that have been the cornerstones of the military-envisioned state security priorities.

When asked whether the roots of religious extremism in Pakistan are embedded in the decades-long process of de-politicization and lack of democratization ex DG ISI Asad Durrani said:

It may be possible but it is a question which is beyond my competence to fully agree with this argument. However, it is possible that if we were more democratic society, political participation and governance were better one can understand that these people might not have take up arms.

In the words of former C.I.A. Islamabad station chief: “Pakistan would certainly be better off if the ISI were never used for domestic political purposes. That goes without saying.” (As quoted in Gall & Rhode: 2008)

As the mullahs gathered strength and influence through patronization of the military and civilian bureaucracy and due to the political vacuum they also developed yearning for taking over the state for which a realistic chance existed. This situation was in conflict with the ideal which the father of the nation had envisioned for the state in which the mullahs had no political role.

In any case Pakistan is not going to be a theocratic state to be ruled by priests with a divine mission. We have many non-Muslims, Hindus, Christians, and Parsi—but they are all Pakistanis. They will enjoy the same rights and privileges as any other citizens and will play their rightful part in the affairs of Pakistan (Ali, Emergence of Pakistan, p. 386 as quoted in Abbas, 2005: 13).

These words of Jinnah are clearly contradicts to the political objectives of clerics and terrorists operating in the name of Islam in Pakistan. But the succeeding politicians and civil-military bureaucrats in complete disregard to the vision of the founder of the state, cultivated, courted and appeased mullahs and gave them a definite role to make an Islamic personality of Pakistan and also occasional share in the statecraft and state power. This made the mullahs ultimately so powerful that they developed yearning for controlling the state itself for which they supported the terrorist groups.
6.5. SUPERIOR COURTS ANTI-DEMOCRACY BEHAVIOR/DECISIONS & POLITICAL VACUUM

Historically in Pakistan the superior judiciary has always sided with the country’s civilian and military establishment in the latter tussle with the democratic forces. This can be gauge from the fact that the Supreme Court of Pakistan (SCP) upheld all the four military takeovers and imposition of Marshal Laws and above all abrogation of the respective constitution by the military generals. Some key anti-democracy and pro-establishment decisions by the country’s Supreme Courts have also been instrumental in aggravating political vacuum in Pakistan. On March 21, 1955, the then Chief Judge of Pakistan Muhammad Munir of the country apex Federal Court upheld the dissolution of the first Constituent Assembly by the Governor General. Justice Munir surprisingly declared that the Assembly was not a sovereign entity. The very words of the decision are hilarious. He ruled the Constitutional Assembly had “lived in a fool’s paradise if it was ever seized with the notion that it was the sovereign body of the state.” Justice Munir’s failure in this historical decision to indicate which body was the ultimate repository of state sovereignty compounding the political and legal vacuum in the country. (Abbas & Jasam, 2009: 144) In 1955, Justice Munir in response to the then Governor General Ghulam Muhammad seeking of an advisory ruling of the court regarding his powers propounded what is referred to as a doctrine of necessity in the country’s political and legal history. The top judge while referring to Bracton’s principle, that which is otherwise not lawful is made lawful by necessity, wrote in the ruling “subject to the condition of absoluteness, extremeness, and imminence, an act which would otherwise be illegal becomes legal if it is done bona fide under stress of necessity, the necessity being referable to an intention to preserve the Constitution, the state, or the society, and to prevent it from dissolution, and affirms.....that necessity knows no law.....necessity makes lawful which otherwise is not lawful.” (As quoted by Abbas & Jasam, 2009: 144) While upholding the October 1958 dissolution of the country’s Constitutional Assembly-cum-parliament and abrogation of the country’s first Constitution simultaneously, Chief Justice Munir called President Iskander Mirza’s act a “legalized illegality” arguing that a victorious revolution and a successful coup d’état creates a law of its own. 187 This decision paved the way for the

187 “It sometimes happens, however, that the Constitution and the national legal order under it, is disrupted by an abrupt political change not within the contemplation of the constitution. Any such change is called a revolution, and
Commander-in-Chief of Pakistan Army, General Ayub Khan, taking over of government from Iskandar Mirza later the same month. This decision integrated the judiciary into the country’s “notorious establishment” playing a subservient role to the the military-civilian officialdom and political elite. (Mezzera & Aftab, 2009)

The above-mentioned verdicts not only aggravated the political vacuum in the country during its constitution and institution-making period but also set precedents for the country’s judiciary as well as the generals to legitimate coups. It was only in 2007 that the present Chief Justice, Iftikhar Muhammad Chaudhry, resisted the generals illegal exercise of powers and refused to resign and instead led a historic legal community movement to get the superior judiciary restored, which had been dismissed by the military ruler General Musharraf. Since restoration Chief Justice Chaudhry led judiciary has assumed a purely constitutional posture and has been doing whatever it could to force institutions including the military to stick to the constitution but the political-legal-constitutional issues created by decades of political vacuum have made things almost incorrigible that even the judiciary has had felt itself helpless on many occasions. For instance, the case against political interference of the ISI case which was decided in 2012 after 16 years but still none of the responsible military official was punished. Explaining the issue retired Major General Naseerullab Babar said:

See what business the army has to distribute money among the parties; today [Lt. Gen.] Hameed Gul [ex DG ISI] proudly says that he made the Ithe JI; in 90 ISI chief [Lt. Gen.] Asad Durrani did so. We went to the Supreme Court with all the evidence, Chief Justice Sajjad Ali Shah took the case but he went out (possibly that was the reason) then [succeeding] CJ Saiduzzaman Siddiqui came, he said we should better forget the past and what have we done to overcome it. I gave the then CJ the report or Air Marshal (R) Zulfiqar constituted committee in which it was envisaged that how intelligence agencies could be brought under the law, constitution so they should play a formal role. After that the SC has not deemed it fit to take the case with all the evidence available. Now there

its legal effect is not only the destruction of the existing constitution but also the validity of the national legal order…..Thus, the essential condition to determine whether a constitution has been annulled is the efficacy of the change…Thus, a victorious revolution, or a successful coup d’etat is an internally recognized legal method of changing a constitution……If what I have already stated is correct, then the revolution having been successful, it satisfies the test of efficacy and becomes a basic law-creating factor”. (Pakistan Law Department, 1958 SC 533)
are disappearances of people have been taking place. The SC has been asking the agencies to produce people but despite of all the orders they fail to do so. Therefore, had they [agencies] been under the government control the incumbent government would have asked [their personnel] to comply with the SC orders.

6.6. WEAKNESSES OF POLITICAL PARTIES & POLITICAL VACUUM

An important aspect of political vacuum in Pakistan has been that the groups and parties calling themselves political entities and their leaders terming themselves politicians have not been political and democratic in the real and literal sense of the terms. Most of the parties which emerged as popular parties their leadership remained confined to the same family, clan or core group cluster around the central figures. This situation has been aptly explained in following words:

Politics in Pakistan is personalistic and patrimonial in character. Political parties in Pakistan have become personalised fiefdoms and, with the exception of Jamaat-e-Islami, show few signs of internal democracy. Votes are seldom won through appeals to broad-based or cross-cutting socio-economic identities or interests, and politicians are seldom elected on the basis of policy proposals and manifestos. Instead, political parties and political leaders rely on patron-client networks to garner votes. Local-level social and economic ties are mobilized and support is given to patrons in exchange for the real and perceived benefits it may bring to one’s self, family, village or biradri. Once in power, patrons can use their position within the formal system to reward their clients with contracts, jobs or development resources. In these circumstances, those who enter politics or the civil service are expected to use their position to advance their kin, biradri, clients and patrons. (Mezzerra & Aftab, 2009: 28)

Consequently the political leaders and political parties could not play their critical role in the evolution of a democratic culture in the country. There are different reasons for the weaknesses of the political parities which include apart from their domination by a family, clan or individual, extremely low literacy rates among population and narrow ideological and
socioeconomic or ethnic agenda. The weaknesses of Pakistani political parties have been summed up by Hassan Askari Rizvi:

All political parties suffer from weak organization and internal incoherence. In theory, political parties have an organizational structure, from the top to the lowest level. However, the operational realities are very different. The national and provincial level bodies of political parties function intermittently, on the call of the top leader. However, below these levels, their organizational network is weak or non-existent except at the time of general elections, when the party candidates activate local party units or create new ones, comprising their loyalists and supporters. Thus, the parties are built around personalities with political clout and local influence. These leaders dominate local politics and often create a party organization that revolves around them. Lacking institutionalization, party organization suffers from internal feuds based on personal factors, region and political jealousies. (Rizvi, 2009: 71-72)

The undemocratic and non-political character of these parties and leaders can be gauged from the fact that never a Pakistani political party has held intra-party elections in which the party members have voted to choose the party officer bearers. Leaders have always been imposed on the parties and groups. Consequently, whenever these parties got the opportunity to rule they did not have the capacity of formulating key policies and managing the state institutions due to lack of expertise within their ranks but most importantly due to lack of internal strength to face up to the civilian-military-intelligence establishment in the realm of policymaking regarding defence, finance and foreign policy. Therefore, these parties had to compromise on the key policies by accepting the exclusive right of the establishment particularly the military over these policies. As the civilian-military-intelligence establishment-dictated defence policy of the state has been India-centric and Afghanistan-focused which required the creation of Kashmiri and Afghan Islamist militants to be backed by Pakistani militants, the so-called political parties could not do anything to stop the establishment from taking such a dangerous and extremist course. At the same time the primacy of the military-civilian-intelligence establishment in Pakistan required the diverting of the largest financial resources of the country towards these institutions primarily the military. Also the so-called political parties and politicians, due to their own undemocratic and
unpopular standing, could resist the allocation of colossal resources to the establishment in the name of state’s security. This has severely affected the process of national and human resource development as well as the state’s capacity to address the core economic issues of mass-poverty, unemployment and social issues of mass-illiteracy, hunger and disease, which have significantly contributed to the phenomenon of religious extremism and terrorism in the name of Islam in Pakistan (See for details Chapter 5).

The military and its affiliated intelligence agencies have been final arbiters of power within the Pakistan state structure—a position which it got due to the long-existing political vacuum which it furthered. Therefore, the political parties due to absence of a political-democratic culture in the country and their internal weaknesses have always been attempting to get the favours of the military and its intelligence agencies to get power. The natural corollary of this situation has been that the political parties have had to enter into trade-offs on policymaking with the military. Therefore, they have hardly had questioned the rationale of creating militants in the name of Islam or have attempted to stop the powerful military-administrative-intelligence establishment from doing so.

6.7 POLITICAL VACUUM AND 1971 CRISIS

Another very vivid example of correlation between political vacuum and extremism in the context of Pakistan was the 1971 crisis in East Pakistan, which ultimately dismembered the country. Pakistan’s first general elections on the basis of universal adult franchise to elect national legislature had been held in December 1970 but at the time no constitution was in place and the country was being run by the military junta led by General Yahya Khan through the Legal Framework Order (LFO). There were serious differences on the composition and nature of the would-be constitution as well as the distribution of power between the federation and provinces; in fact between the domineering Western Wing and the up in arms Eastern Wing of the country. The military generals tried to use Islamic parties against the secular and leftwing parties—the PPP and Awami League—to prevent them dominate the Constitutional Assembly so as to have a constitution of their own liking. (Haqqani, 2005: 68)
The leader of Eastern Wing Sheikh Mujeeb ur Rahman, whose party the Awami League had won 162 of the 164 parliamentary seats in the province, was demanding near-independence, while the military junta almost agreed to establish a confederation between the East and the West Pakistan, the crisis had reached a point of no return. (Abbas 2005) In this situation the military, having no public support in the East Pakistan and lacking the basic idea and training of political management, could not assess the nature of demands of the population of East Pakistan, rejected a political settlement of the issue by peacefully accepting the region to become fully autonomous. Instead the military rulers devoid of skills of political management of the affairs and statecraft decided to launch a massive military offensive to squash dissent by force. Therefore, without any public and political support the military had to fall back on the religious forces especially Jamaat-e-Islami (JI) both to get whatever public support it could provide as well as militant support to fight the rebels. The JI on its part termed Bengali nationalists as “enemies of Islam” (Nasr, 1994: 165-169). The army decided to raise a volunteer militia comprising of non-Bengalis residents of East Pakistan as well as pro-Pakistan Bengali mullahs. The Jamaat-e-Islami and its student wing the IJT contributed significantly to the military bid to raise the volunteer militia. Around 50,000 volunteers, who mostly came from the Jamaat and IJT, were divided into two sections Al Shams (the Sun) and Al Badr (the moon). The first group comprised of well-trained and properly educated men while the rest were put in the second group. (Haqqani, 2005: 79)

6.8. GENERAL ZIA STRATEGIC POLICY CHANGES UNDER CONDITIONS OF POLITICAL-CONSTITUTIONAL VOID

Many observers, researchers and commentators maintain that General Zia-ul-Haq (1977-1988), who usurped state power by hanging an elected prime minister, policy of Islamization has had the biggest contribution in radicalizing Pakistani society. This is largely correct and described in detail in the preceding chapters. However, again the point to note is that General Zia’s usurpation of power was itself helped by the political turmoil in the country. As the 1978 elections were allegedly grossly rigged by the Pakistan People’s Party (PPP) government consequently, the
opposition parties, which were already greatly annoyed with the iron-handed civilian rule of Bhutto, formed a joint opposition to force the government to held free and fair elections. (Ziring, 1997: 411) As Bhutto and the PPP did not give in to the opposition demands, General Zia had the golden opportunity to intervene and take the reins of government and to promise elections in 90 days. Although these elections never held and the military regime could only hold party-less\(^{188}\) elections in 1985, by which time the general had made himself president and had ruled for well over eight years.

The policy of *Islamization* which Zia pursued was his compulsion because he had subverted the country’s constitution and was liable for capital punishment; therefore, he was critically in search of political legitimacy. The dictator had no constituency and slogan to fall back upon and as Islamic slogans had had a perennial appeal among the Pakistani masses the dictator deemed it most appropriate to promise *Islamization*. (Abbas, 2005: 100) In the beginning he was not at all sincere to the policy of *Islamization* but only used it as a ploy to get legitimacy for his rule and to keep himself in the saddle. Gradually he observed the success of the religious slogan and developed grand religious designs for domestic society as well for the region. Within the country he wanted to create a radical society whereas regionally he wished to make Pakistani society as a model to establish an Islamic block right up to Central Asia with Afghanistan becoming a province of Pakistan (Abbas, 2005; Haqqani, 2005; Rashid, 2008). In a press conference by Zia ul-Haq in Islamabad on March 22, 1982 he said: “We have no intention of leaving power till the accomplishment of our objectives of Islamization of the national polity . . . until then neither I will step down nor will let anyone rise.” (As quoted in Rizvi, 2000)

One could argue that General Zia was not himself an Islamic fundamentalist as the term is known but used the slogan for getting legitimacy and fill the political vacuum he created by overthrowing the constitution and an elected government as he did not have a specific Islamist ideology, at least initially, to propagate and advance through the regime’s policies but this is quite debatable. Among the religious groups he allied with JI, which although shares some of the

---

188 The party-less elections mean that no political party was allowed to contest and candidates could vie only in individual capacity. The military regime holding of elections without political parties testifies the political vacuum which it wanted to create and the de-politicization it wanted to infuse in the society and state apparatus.
ideological beliefs with the Wahabis but cannot be called a Wahabi organization. On the other hand General Zia also got the support of politically influential families of *pirs* like Makhdooms of the Punjab. These families belonged to the Barelvi sect as well as Sufi orders. Wahabis have been so critical of *pirs* and Barelvis that they do not consider them as Muslims at all. Thus the ideology, sect and order of divinity of Islamist groups, schools of thought and family did not matter for General Zia to have their support. The only criterion for the dictator to elicit their support was their Islamist credentials within the Pakistani society and more importantly their societal-cum-political influence. (Abbas, 2005: 101)

General Zia’s *Islamization* was entirely strategically and personally motivated because in his era Pakistan cultivated very strong strategic relations with the US, which is generally considered as the biggest anti-Islamic power in Pakistan. Again the reason was to have international recognition for his unconstitutional regime as well as to get the much-needed western economic and military aid.

### 6.9 DESCENT OF FOREIGN/CENTRAL ASIAN FIGHTERS ON PAK

The Central Asian Islamist militants have had carried out many deadly and ferocious terrorist attacks in Pakistan during the 2000s. The name of Tahir Yuldashev became a symbol of terror in Waziristan region as hundreds of his Islamic Movement of Uzbekistan (IMU) fighters’ unleashed worst atrocities and terrorism on the local population. It is often questioned that how come such a large number of Central Asian fighters came to Pakistan tribal lands and most importantly developed ultra-extremist and terrorist tendencies. The story of these Central Asian fighters starts from the anti-Soviet Jihad days in 1980s.

The ISI brought these Central Asian and Arab fighters to Pakistan and started training them in specially established *Madrassas* so that to impart the willing militants fighting skills and to shape their fundamentalist Muslim worldview. Through these militants seeds of radicalization in the name of Islam had been sown in Central Asia also. At the same time for the first time Central Asian militant fundamentalism and Arab-Wahabist extremist ideas were allowed to flourish in Pakistan particularly in the FATA which wreaked havoc in the long term.
It is important to note that had there been a democratic and representative regime in place in Pakistan at the time of Soviet occupation of Afghanistan (1979-1989), the state’s response would have been much more cautious, calculated and calibrated as the decision-making process would have gone through exhaustive filters. Like the rest of the policies and decisions made during the period of General Zia, when Pakistani state was having deep political vacuum, the step to recruit and bring Muslim radicals from around the World to Pakistan for onward supply to the Afghan war theatre to fight Soviets, was the result of irresponsible and unaccountable governance. This proved sooner rather than latter when even the quasi political government of Prime Minister Muhammad Khan Junejo brought Afghan War to an abrupt end when it agreed to the Geneva Accord of 1988 despite severe opposition from Zia and his military regime. It was the sobriety and responsibility of thought and behaviour of PM Junejo which brought out Pakistan and the region from the quagmire of an interminable war or so-called Jihad. However, Junejo and the parliament he led had to pay for it when General Zia, who had then become a self-appointed President, sacked both on May 29, 1988, months after the Geneva Accord was signed by Pakistan. (Talbot, 2003: 388) After attaining its aim of wining the Cold War and containing communism the US did not focus any further on Afghanistan which contributed to enlarging the power-political vacuum in the war-shattered country, which in the coming decades proved dear for the whole region. (Rashid, 2008: 11)

Islamabad’s Afghan policy under General Zia underwent radical paradigm change. Thenceforth pursuing the earlier policy—to keep hands—off from political developments in Afghanistan; to strive for having a friendly government in Kabul and, above all, to convince Kabul to recognize the Durand Line as a permanent border—the military regime actively engaged itself in Afghanistan and this engagement was not merely limited to help anti-Soviet Afghan resistance. The idea of having Strategic Depth in Afghanistan emerged in Pakistani decision-makers minds at this stage. On the other hand the wishes of General Zia and certain other generals to have an ideological and possibly physical Islamic Empire in the region were instrumental in effecting the policy change. This situation required compromising the state interest of getting Durand Line, strategically the critically important 2400 kilometres-long disputed border of the country with Afghanistan, recognized as permanent border. It is argued for a long time in Pakistan policy circles that had an Afghan regime merely recognized Durand Line as a permanent border
between Afghanistan and Pakistan, Islamabad would have no interest in the internal affairs of Afghanistan. This argument has been based on the premise that it was the historical claims of Afghanistan on Pakistani Pakhtun territory which compelled Islamabad to have an animistic posture towards Kabul. This view is over-simplistic analysis of complex relationship between the two countries after the Soviet-Afghan war.

During Taliban rule there arrived several occasions that Pakistan could force its client, Taliban regime, to recognize the Durand Line but it did not. Even Islamabad could ask for the recognition as a quid-pro-quo while agreeing to sign the 1988 Geneva Accord but it did not despite prodding by the UN to settle the issue once and for all. Some senior Pakistani officials, including Sahibzada Yakub Khan, who was foreign minister in the 1980s, admit that the military deliberately never asked for Afghan recognition of the Line. At the time, President Zia-Ul-Haq passionately worked toward creating a pro-Pakistan Islamic regime in Kabul, to be followed by the Islamization of Central Asia. In military parlance, this was Pakistan’s strategy to secure Strategic Depth vis-à-vis India. Zia’s vision of a Pakistani-influenced region extending into Central Asia depended on an undefined border with Afghanistan, so that the army could justify any future interference in that country and beyond. A defined border would have entailed recognizing international law and obligations and the sovereignty of Afghanistan. As long as there was no recognized border, there was also no international law to break if Pakistani forces were to support surrogate Afghan regimes such as the Taliban.” (Rashid, 2008: 267)

As Pakistan’s Afghanistan and Kashmir or for that matter India policies were formulated by the military without any political management and accountability, therefore, it was the outcome of the political void in the country. Pakistani military-led establishment support to mullahs in Afghanistan and formation of Islamist militia’s like Taliban and Afghan Mujahideen as well as Kashmiri Mujahideen have significantly contributed to the rise of Islamic fundamentalism and terrorism in the name of Islam (See Chapter 2 for details).
6.10 EMERGENCE OF SIPHA-E-SAHABA: THE HYDRA OF ISLAMIST MILITANCY OUT OF POLITICAL VOID

The case study of Sipah-e-Sahaba Pakistan (SSP) is quite relevant in order to understand how an unconstitutional, undemocratic and non-political government first allowed one of the most extremist militant terrorist groups to surface in Pakistan and then to operate with impunity. Even if it was not enough the unconstitutional military regime of Zia-ul-Haq, in whose rule the SSP was formed, used the extremist lessons and militant skills of the SSP for its own unrepresentative state policy. (Abbas, 2005: 204) As the SSP main agenda has been targeting Shiite, Saudi Arabia with its own anti-Shiite Wahabist ideology and political stance found the group instrumental to counter growing influence of Shiite Islamic revolutionists of Iran in Pakistan. Pakistan is one of the most important countries of the Muslim world whose state and society has always been supportive of Saudi royal family considering it the servants of Islam holiest places—Mecca and Medina. General Zia’s search for legitimacy necessitated from him to have the moral and financial support of Saudi royal family for the survival of his regime. Riyadh provided Zia regime the support on conditions including the patronization of the SSP. (Grare, 2009: 69) Thus the extant political vacuum in the early and mid 1980s enabled one of the earliest Pakistani extremist-terrorist Islamist group to get foreign and local official support to thrive. Had there been a constitutional and politically independent government in saddle at the time it would never have allowed the SSP to grow and would not have used it for its state agenda.

6.11 MADRASSAS MUSHROOM GROWTH & POLITICAL VACUUM

Often Pakistani Madrassas are dubbed as the breeding grounds for local and Afghan religious extremists and terrorists. However, again the question arises here is that a madrassa, particularly where traditional Islamic lessons are taught, itself could not become a nursery of extremism and militancy. Madrassas have been present in the region now comprising Pakistan and elsewhere in the Indian subcontinent for centuries but never prior to 1980s they had been found imparting militant training. The institution of madrassa in Pakistan started spreading religious radicalism
when the state established thousands of madrassas in the decades of 1980s and 1990s to produce religiously-imbued militant youths. These madrassas were established across the country by the state itself or by arranging or facilitating financial support of foreign governments as well as domestic and foreign non-governmental religious bodies. The purpose in turn was to use these militants for the achievement of the country’s civilian-military establishment-dictated foreign policy aims of fighting the Soviets and Afghan nationalists in Afghanistan and Indian troops in Kashmir. For this very purpose the military-civilian-intelligence establishment in connivance with the US authorities designed special curricula and hired special trainers having command over the techniques of brainwashing and indoctrination.189 Most of the clerics who owned or operate these madrassas as well as those who have worked at these institutions besides pockets of people within the country argue that madrassas can never impart fundamentalism and it is mere the western propaganda to blame Islam and bring into disrepute the institution of madrassa and religious scholars, who these institutions, they think, produce. They fail to understand that the thousands of madrassas that have cropped up in Pakistan since the decade of 1980 have never been the madrassas in the traditional sense. Moreover, how come it is possible that the number of madrassas which had been established in only two decades is hundreds times more than the madrassas that had been established since 712 AD, the year Arab Muslims started occupying the areas now comprising Pakistan? The answer lies in the above-mentioned policy of the state to use these madrassas for producing hundreds of thousands of religiously imbued fighters to serve as tools for the attainment of the country’s and its allies primarily the US and Saudi Arabia’s foreign policy objectives in the region.

Another very pertinent question could also be asked that that why so many parents send their children to these militant madrassas? The foremost reason has been the unavailability of public funded educational institutions to take all the students, lack of quality education institutions and above all a meaningful curricula which could motivate and enable student to rise in their lives

---

189 In this regard special textbooks were published in both the official Afghani languages, Dari and Pashtu, conceived by the Centre for Afghanistan Studies at the University of Nebraska-Omaha for which the grant was provided by the USAID. The books purpose was to promote Jihadist values and culture. The printing took place in Pakistan and an estimated 13 million books were distributed among Afghan refugees in Pakistan. (Stephens & Ottaway, 2002)
and build career; in short the education which could equip them to attain upward social mobility. This dilapidated state of education sector has also been due to the political vacuum or crisis of policy and governance (ICG, 2002: 29) in the country as the unrepresentative and unaccountable rulers of the country never considered social sector like education of any significance. Rather keeping people ignorant and aloof has been critical for the perpetuation of their stranglehold over the state and its institutions and the consequent manipulation of state policies for its dictated agenda euphemistically called national interest.

6.12 TNSM: EMERGENCE OF TALIBAN FORERUNNER DUE TO POLITICAL-LEGAL VACUUM

The death of Zia and the advent of so-called Democratic Era of Pakistan history in 1988 did not result in the end of political vacuum rather it continued to spew forth Islamist extremists and militants afterwards. The very reason that the Tehreek-e-Nifaz-e-Shariat-e-Muhammadi (TNSM) or its architects within the Pakistani establishment selected Swat-Malakand region to serve as a theatre for the group’s display of extremism and terrorism was that the region has been one of the underdeveloped places in Pakistan but above all since long there existed a peculiar kind of political-legal vacuum in that area. The region has been governed under the British Colonial era Provincially Administered Tribal Area (PATA) regulations with some areas through Pakistani common law and local customary laws. The two main districts of the regions Swat and Dir were formerly princely states of British India before their merger with Pakistan in 1969. The administration of Swat by the ruling Miangul family was exemplary in the region but with its coming under PATA regulations, the administration deteriorated and a vacuum emerged.

Under our family rule first the system of law and order was efficient and if there is any breach of the law and order then a quick administration of justice was in place. Both these primary things were available to the Swati people. Mistakes may have been made, but the mistakes of today far outweigh the mistakes committed by the administration of Swat state. 190

190 Interview with Mian Gul Auranzeb, the heir-apparent of Swat state’s ruling family. Later he joined PML-N and became the first Pakistani to serve as governor of two of the four provinces of Pakistan—the KP and Balochistan—between (1997-99 (Islamabad, April 2002)
Thus the existing legal-judicial arrangement in Swat-Malakand region, the sphere of the TNSM influence, was a hotchpotch with resultant judicial-administrative and political vacuum. Three of the several districts forming Malakand were princely states of the British Raj with their own administrative and legal structures until they merged with Pakistan in 1969. However, Pakistani governments did not bring these areas in the mainstream of the country. The political-administrative vacuum in the region got profound when the Peshawar High Court (PHC) on February 24, 1990 declared the PATA Regulations in conflict with Pakistani Constitution and thus null and void. The decision was subsequently upheld by the country’s apex court, Supreme Court of Pakistan. (Marwat & Toru, 2005) But the government failed to introduce a new legal-administrative set-up and the TNSM fully exploited the situation to intensify its efforts for Shariah. (Rana A., 2009: 16)

Earlier the militant agenda of TNSM had become obvious when Maulana Sufi Muhammad gave a fatwa or decree in favour of seeking military training declaring it compulsory for every Muslim. The TNSM workers were sent to training camps based in Afghanistan and other parts of Pakistan. An extremist Maulana Masood Azhar, a Pakistani Punjabi, who was arrested in India for various terrorist attacks and was released in a deal between Indian government and his militant comrades, came to Swat after his release and formed a militant organization, the Jaish-i-Muhammad. He joined TNSM, trained its workers and started its activities along with Taliban in Afghanistan. Jaish-i-Muhammad was the pioneer organization of suicide attacks in Kashmir and Afghanistan. So Azhar also took advantage of political-legal vacuum in Malakand to further his extremist agenda.

191 These were Swat, Dir and Chitral.

192 These militants had hijacked an Indian passenger plane in 1997 and had brought it to Kandahar to demand Azhar’s release. At the time Taliban had their government in Afghanistan and Kandahar was their headquarter.
6.13 POLITICAL VACUUM IN FATA AND RELIGIOUS EXTREMISM AND TERRORISM

The tribal social structure in FATA and its institutions and values particularly its inherent and continued stateless nature, a history of the region’s inhabitants defiance of state’s authority, their ‘independent’ and unruly character; their over-sentimental affiliation with Islam; and hence unsuspected assistance to any group claiming to be the custodian of Islam have immensely supported and facilitated Al Qaeda and other global non-state Jihadist groups when they shifted from Afghanistan to these areas in the aftermath of 9/11 when Afghanistan was invaded and occupied by the US and international coalition forces. “People in tribal areas have very pronounced religious sentiments and any group of people who they consider is working for the cause of Islam are helped.”\(^{193}\) The social conditions in FATA helped Taliban, Al Qaeda, and other international Jihadist outfits to entrench themselves there and make these areas the biggest terrorist staging and training grounds in the World. The stateless ideology of these Jihadist organizations and their non-state nature has especially been compatible with the statelessness of the FATA and independent character of the inhabitants of Pakistan tribal areas. The social structure in the FATA and the political vacuum\(^{194}\) in these areas and the weak state writ thereof also greatly assisted and abetted the rise of Pakistani Taliban groups in particular the TTP or Pakistan Taliban movement.

Tribesmen have a sense of deprivation; there is no modern infrastructure in place. For instance, there is no mobile phone system over there which is exigently needed; there is no electricity or gas; there is not a single university in the entire FATA or any good hospital. Despite of it like the people of Balochsitan, who have taken arms for their rights, we have never done so. We have never destroyed any government installation or block roads. How it is justified that gas is being supplied to Punjab from Karak oilfields,

\(^{193}\) Interview with Rustam Shah Mohmand, who served as KP top civilian official, Chief Secretary; Pakistan’s ambassador to Afghanistan and Political Agent in different districts of the FATA (Peshawar, March 2006)

\(^{194}\) A political vacuum has had existed in the FATA since the birth of Pakistan in August 1947. Never any publicly-elected government or legislature came into being in the region while Pakistan’s law courts have had no legal jurisdiction in these areas.
situated next to NWA but not to the latter. One the one hand we are derprived and on the other target of guns.\textsuperscript{195}

The marginality of the FATA tribesmen and tribeswomen has been due to the unavailability of political choices and failure to politically mainstream the region. (Rana A., 2009: 21). Any development worth a name in FATA is only possible by changing the politico-legal status of the tribal areas. (Rashid, 2008: 277)

The tribal social structure in the FATA became more facilitative of the agenda and aims of Al Qaeda and Pakistani Taliban when the latter after getting a firm base in these areas made this structure more compatible with their causes by dislodging the traditional institution of authority of \textit{malik} or tribal elder and replacing it with that of mullah or cleric. Thus whatever customary socio-legal structure was in place there evaporated aggravating political-legal vacuum in the region. Al Qaeda and Pakistani Taliban replaced the old system of temporal authority with \textit{divine} authority of mullah by resorting to large-scale killings of \textit{maliks} particularly in the Waziristan region of FATA where around 500 such \textit{maliks} were killed by Pakistani Taliban groups. The government of Pakistan or the country’s all-powerful civilian-military-intelligence establishment persistent efforts to use the FATA as the base for non-state insurgent groups like the Al Qaeda, the Afghan Taliban, the Haqqani Network, all having basis and hideouts in the tribal areas, to fight international coalition forces in Afghanistan to yet again make Afghanistan as Pakistan’s virtual province, has had necessitated to further close these areas to positive influences from outside World and above all filling political-legal vacuum there. This is the reason that even after one decade of the 9/11 incidents and despite of ever-increasing vows from Pakistan government particularly military establishment to mainstream, develop, politicize the FATA they cannot be while the extremists and terrorists have increasingly extended and entrenched their hold on the region. (Rashid A., 2009: 21-22)

\textsuperscript{195} Research interview with Maulana Nek Zaman, the JUI-F former Member of National Assembly of Pakistan from North Waziristan Agency (Islamabad, March 2006)
Many areas have been neglected and could not become part of the mainstream. This is also correct for FATA areas although it is rich with natural resources like minerals; have good human resources as their dwellers are so built to become good soldiers. Then it is also the bad governance in tribal area partly by Maliks and partly by corrupt political administration which could not let these areas develop. However, the ultimate responsibility lies with the government. It is the whole Pakistan which is facing brunt of the issue.\footnote{Interview with Dr Maqsoodul Hassan Nuri, president of Islamabad Policy Research Institute (Islamabad, July 2008)}

**Another expert Brigadier retired Mahmud Shah argues:**

In fact, the basic purpose of FATA was not to be a buffer. It just happened to be there by coincidence. The government weakness has been that it failed over the last 50 years to merge tribal areas into Pakistan. Various factors delayed the decisions and negligence was also one of the major elements in this. Pakistan has been mainly engaged with Kashmir and India and considering FATA as safe.\footnote{Interview with Brig. Mahmud Shah, who worked as ISI chief in Balochistan province and as Home Secretary the KP province and Secretary Security FATA (Peshawar, April, 2008)}

It is important to mention that in Chapter 05 it was found that tribal social structure in the FATA has links to religious extremism and terrorism in Pakistan. The tribal social structure in FATA could not be transformed in the best interest of Pakistani society and the state because in the ruling elite-dictated foreign policy objectives, the state security paraphernalia has had to be fully focused on India with least attention to the Western border with Afghanistan especially the tribal areas. Although Pakistani ruling establishment continued with the British colonists policy of keeping the FATA as a buffer zone between mainland Afghanistan and India, (Rashid A., 2009: 15) however, unlike the British India, which used to keep more than half the British army garrison in India along the Balochistan and NWFP (now KP) border with Afghanistan (Talbot, 1998) to have secure lines of communication, Pakistan decided not to keep any regular troops at all along the same border and instead handover the control of the same to the Pakhtun tribes of FATA, whose members have always been fierce fighters. The state while manipulating the Islamic sentiments of the tribesmen made them believe that they are the defenders of the borders
of the Islamic Pakistan and the state has had full faith in their sincerity and loyalty to protect its borders. However, keeping no troops in the FATA along the border with Afghanistan was the outcome of Pakistan’s security dilemma and fear of Indian attack due to which it has to deploy all its military strength on the eastern border with Afghanistan. This was despite of the fact that all the invaders of India historically either came from Afghanistan or used that country for reaching there. The use of Islamic sentiments of tribesmen although have worked a great deal for Pakistan by reducing the cost of defence but at the same time sown the seeds of radicalism in the tribal areas which in the initial years of 21st Century has been the biggest problem rather in the words of Pakistan’s Army Chief, General Ashfaq Pervez Kiyani, ‘security threat’ of Pakistan. Consequently, Pakistan had to deploy in 2004 Army regulars for the first time in history to counter religious extremism and terrorism emanating from FATA. The maintenance of status quo in FATA was the result of miscalculation by the ruling elite specifically the military-civilian bureaucratic nexus of the security of Pakistan. By deliberately creating politico-legal vacuum in FATA the state writ could not be established in the region on the grassroots level. (Rana A., 2009: 16) This made the traditional social institutions dysfunctional and transformed them negatively. Resultantly whatever positive value these social institutions had evaporated, which helped the obscurantist religious characters and institutions to dominate the tribal landscape and turned it into a hub of Muslim extremists. Noticeably, the decision to maintain status quo in FATA without providing the necessary security umbrella and political paraphernalia was taken by non-political leaders of the state.

6.14 POLITICAL VACUUM AND MILITARY’S CONCEPTION OF NATIONAL SECURITY

As testified on several occasions in this study many of Pakistani state decisions to create and promote militancy and terrorism in the name of Islam mostly taken during the military rules or behind the scenes working by the powerful military generals even during civilian regimes. These decisions have been linked to the military’s overall conception of Pakistan’s security and foreign policy. For instance, Pakistan Army conception of national security in 2000 had had three prongs: challenging Indian perceived hegemony and promoting Kashmir secession from India;
modernizing and shielding the country’s nuclear programme; and making efforts to install a pro-Pakistan government in Afghanistan. (Rashid, 2008: 219) The first and the third pronged required the promotion of religious militants to act as proxies in both these regions. Had the policy regarding national security was left to be formulated by political leaders through the democratic process, the policy would have been more responsive to address the critical issues of human security, economic security, political-legal security and environmental security rather than merely focusing on the military-strategic aspect of the state security. The lopsided focus on military-strategic security not only required the nurturing of extremists in the name of Islam but also leading to adverse socioeconomic indicators, which significantly contributed to the phenomenon of religious extremism and terrorism in Pakistan (as documented in detail in Chapter 5).

6.15 POLITICAL VACUUM & SYSTEM FAILURE TO PUNISH MILITARY USURPERS

One important indicator of political vacuum in Pakistan and the consequent lack of democratic culture, weakness of the political actors and dominance of the military establishment thereof, is the unaccountability of the military generals for taking over the country illegally and unauthorized involvement in the statecraft. Never a military dictator was tried by the successive regime(s) for abrogating the country’s Constitution even posthumously, which should set a precedent for general to desist from overthrowing the constitution. This unaccountability of generals was also evident when a former Army Chief General Aslam Beg, while facing court cases for his involvement in political engineering during his tenure as head of the Army, he told the Supreme Court of Pakistan he “was not answerable to [the court] regarding his actions as the chief of army staff” (as quoted in Haqqani, 2005: 219). Lt. General Asad Durrani, the ISI chief under General Beg, argued that he and the army chief (Beg) engineered the formation of the JI in 1990 by generating and disbursing money among handpicked politicians in the national interest. The army chiefs who followed General Beg also never held the latter accountable for the illegal meddling in politics. This is testimony to the fact that it was the institutional interest of the military not to allow politics take its natural course. (Haqqani, 2005: 219-20)
When at times the military felt that preventing political parties from taking over government was unavoidable it tried to enter into bargaining with the leading contenders for state power. The military since 1990s has been agreeing to handover government to that political party which promised to support the former policy of Jihad in Kashmir. This had very negative repercussions as even the otherwise liberal, democratic and anti-military PPP head Benazir Bhutto started competing to get the generals favour with her main rival Nawaz Sharif. (Haqqani, 2005: 220) Moreover, despite handing over of the administrative powers to the civilian government the administrative-military-intelligence establishment has tried to ensure in whatever manner it could to dominate foreign and security policy-making. For this purpose it has tried to keep the civilian government under constant pressure. One of the purposes for the military intelligence agencies to support sectarian groups is to make this violence to create problems for the civilian and elected governments and keep them in constant pressure. (Abbas, 2005: 208) A relatively more apt explanation could be that apart from using these groups in Afghanistan and Kashmir to pursue the military-dictated state objectives in these countries, the military wanted to use sectarian violence to keep the elected and democratic leadership under check and to make the civilian government dependent upon itself to deal with the militants and terrorists. Former Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif during office is believed to have personally requested the ISI chief to get hold of country’s top terrorist Riaz Basra but it did not happen. Instead Basra made a failed bomb attempt on the life of Sharif on January 03, 1999. (Abbas, 2005: 209)

6.16 POLITICAL MIND, REALIST STATE AGENDA; POLITICAL VACUUM IDEOLOGICAL STATE AGENDA

In the context of Pakistan it has been observed that whenever policies were allowed to be formulated through political and democratic process the result was religiously and ideologically-blind state agenda whereas when policies had to be framed under conditions of political-constitutional void the upshot was non-realist ideological agenda necessitating promoting extremism and terrorism in the name of Islam. One of the arguments regarding the nature of Pakistani policies is that the country’s domestic and foreign policies have been driven more in pursuit of realist goals than abstract Islamic ideological goals, which the state political elite
otherwise often claim. In this respect the deep Pakistani strategic, economic and cultural ties with Communist China are often cited as evidence of the state’s policy driven by worldly interests than divine blessings. This is shrewd by any standard. Credit is given to the fist elected Prime Minister of Pakistan, Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto for laying the foundations of extensively friendly relations with China. Both countries state ideologies—Islam (Pakistan) and Communism (China)—are otherwise completely incompatible and irreconcilable. Bhutto evaluated the great strategic and economic value of having relations with a neighbouring superpower when another superpower—the USSR—had an antagonistic posture while the ever-emerging India continues to be Islamabad’s arch rival. Thus a political man made a political decision.

Although the military regimes and decision-makers also fully supported the policy of maintaining deep ties with China, however, when religiously radical men within the military and intelligence establishment got the decision-making powers they started thinking of the state’s relationship with other states in purely religious context. The case of Lt. General Javed Nasir, who became the Director General of the ISI, is a case in point. “General Nasir invited several Deobandi religious scholars to organize jihadi groups and extended the ISI’s patronage to these groups.” (Haqqani, 2005: 292) Lt. General Nasir’s conceived Pakistan as an Islamist state and thus duty-bound to help struggling Muslims across the World Translating his thoughts into action he helped the Bosnian Muslims fighting Serbs with arms supplies including anti-tank missiles as well as supporting through different means separatist Uighur Chinese Muslims and Muslim insurgent group fighting their states in the Phillipines and the Central Asia. Especially General Nasir’s help to Chinese Muslims rebels made a dent in Pakistan-China relationship and arguably must have roused fears among the Chinese decision-makers that how elusive and fickle a relationship in final analysis could be with a state founded on the basis of Islamic ideology, which in deep conflict with its own ideology of Communism. General Nasir extended the ISI’s underground operations against the so-called “enemies of Islam” that is “USA, Hindu leadership of India, the communists, [and] the Zionists.” (Lieutenant General Javed Nasir, complain no. 107 before the Anti-Terrorist Court, Lahore, October 23, 2002 as quoted in Haqqani, 2005: 292). “The ISI’s support for Deobandi and Wahabi groups as part of the jihadi movement remained part of official policy even after Nasir’s removal from the ISI.” (Haqqani, 2005: 293)
6.17 POLITICAL VACUUM AND STATE INCAPACITY TO DEAL WITH TERRORISM

“The most salient political factor in the category of permissive causes is a government's inability or unwillingness to prevent terrorism.” (Crenshaw, 1981: 382) In Pakistan this inability of the governments has been obvious. Irrespective of the fact that most of the Islamic radical groups and many so-called Islamic terrorist groups have been patronized by the military-dominated Pakistani state in different eras, the long-existing political vacuum in Pakistan has not only had depoliticized Pakistani society but also radicalized it. The political vacuum instead of strengthening the state institutions to deal with their primary duties have significantly curtailed their capacity and ability to deal with ordinary law and order problems let alone dealing with the extraordinary threat posed by Islamic fundamentalist groups. For instance, beginning in 2004 more than eight years of full-fledge military operations in the FATA and the KP, the Pakistani state even could not root out a single terrorist organization. Ironically so acute has been the inability of the Pakistani military and allied security forces that they have been trying to neutralize the terrorist groups like the TTP, which has been fighting a guerrilla and asymmetrical warfare, through traditional military strategy using artillery and aerial bombardment. On the other hand Pakistani state has been clearly unwilling to fight religious terrorist groups because the state has considered them as strategic assets to promote military-civilian bureaucracy-dictated state policies of making Afghanistan Strategic Depth and winning over Indian occupied Kashmir through Jihad wage by these so-called Islamic proxies.

We genuinely feel that due to the wrong policies of the present regime [General Musharraf] not only the government has collapsed but also there are reasonable apprehensions that the state itself has collapsed. This is why we want a consensus of the people of Pakistan to bring about a change so that national integrity and solidarity can be maintained. . . One ugly manifestation of the state’s collapse, which one even does not
like to think about, is the dismemberment of the country. Pakistan has already faced that.
But the state collapse also means the collapse of the state’s institutions. 198

6.18 POLITICAL VACUUM AND FOREIGN INTERFERENCE IN PAKISTAN

The domination of state affairs and policymaking by unaccountable and undemocratic institutions of the military and civilian establishment and the resultant political-legal-administrative vacuum allowed foreign powers like the US and Saudi Arabia to meddle into Pakistan affairs and to realize their respective interests at the cost of the interest of Pakistan and its citizens without hindrance. During the Cold War the US wanted Pakistan to play the frontline role in Washington’s policy of containing Soviet Union and Communism and ultimately eliminating the threat by dismembering Soviet Union and by creating so-called Mujahideen for the purpose. After the Cold War the US wanted Pakistan to dismantle the militant network which it first created at the behest of the former. Both this creation and elimination of religiously indoctrinated militants have immensely contributed to the phenomenon of religious extremism and terrorism in Pakistan. Political vacuum within the country also hindered the Pakistani state to check the influence of alien fundamentalist dogmas within the state structure and more importantly within the society. Due to political vacuum Pakistan remained a soft state having porous borders with fundamentalist alien men and ideas along with huge amount of foreign money to establish and promote radical religious institutions particularly from the Arab countries flowing in without any inhibition. All this contributed to the extremism and terrorism in the name of Islam in the country.

AUXILIARY FACTORS IN FORMATION OF POLITICAL VACUUM

198 Interview with Masud Kausar, one of the founding members of the Pakistan People’s Party (PPP) and a former Senator (Peshawar, September 2006). Kausar was made Governor KP by the PPP government in 2011.
**Poverty, Unemployment and Political Vacuum:** As was found in Chapter 5 the economic deprivation and unemployment of many, not all, extremist groups members made them and their families to seek an occupation and pastime as well as an ideology and a goal which the state-sponsored extremist groups offer in the shape of fighting and militant training, *Jihad* and salvation in the World. A deeper look into the phenomenon reveals that poverty and unemployment as well as the lack of collective peaceful national goals and the unavailable functional ways to pursue these goals have been the result of the long-existing political vacuum, in terms of inexistent constitutional governments and democratically-controlled domestic and foreign policy making, in the country. Due to political vacuum and militaristic administration of state affairs the state could not politically manage socio-economic issues like poverty and unemployment besides defining peaceful national goals and create enabling environment for masses to pursue these goals. The ruling elite domination of the state could offer the elusive and abstract construct *Islamic State*, having the system of *Shariah* as the only national goal to the people. The ruling classes find this elusive goal as the tool to distract the attention of the masses from their immediate social and economic issues and thus perpetuate their rule over the state and society. Clerical groups also have had discovered in demanding making Pakistan an *Islamic state* a source for their economic sustenance and a tool of societal manipulation and domination. This was the genesis of the alliance between Pakistan’s ruling elite and clergy as well as Islamist parties. Open to multiple interpretations, different classes, institutions and organizations started conceptualizing the national goals of *Islamic State* and *Shariah* in their own way resulting in large-scale confusion and conflict in society and above all radicalizing the masses.

In Chapter 5 it was also proven that economic deprivation of the majority inhabitants of the FATA, the KP, Balochistan, interior Sindh and the South Punjab, has been a significant contribution factor in the rise and proliferation of extremism and terrorism in the name of Islam in Pakistan. Digging deep into the problem of economic deprivation in these provinces and regions of Pakistan, reveals that at the root of this dispossession lies the over-centralized economic decision-making and financial structure of Pakistan. This over-centralized state structure put in place by the ruling elite since the very birth of Pakistan was the result of political vacuum, that is absence of a constitutional-legal and democratic-electoral arrangement to run Pakistan as a federation. As time passed by political vacuum aggravated. The nexus between
over-centralized state structure and economic deprivation could be explained with a few examples. Even as late as 2007 both the KP and Balochistan provinces despite of having substantial resources\textsuperscript{199} were relying for around 90 percent of their budgetary requirements on federal government. The FATA have directly been under federal government with no annual budget. Instead of giving the FATA a share, like provinces of Pakistan, in the National Finance Commission (NFC), these areas have been used by the federal government functionaries for generations to get ill-gotten money by engineering a politico-administrative vacuum in FATA.

CONCLUSION:

The above-mentioned analysis shows that there has been large-scale misperception inside and outside the country regarding the main cause of phenomenon of extremism and terrorism in the name of Islam in Pakistan. Most of the experts, analysts and masses have mistaken the symptoms of religious fundamentalism and terrorism as the central cause of the phenomena. Even many in America and the West could not understand that the core reason of religious extremism in Pakistan has been political vacuum in the country. Therefore, the Bush administration after 9/11 only demand from Pakistan was to help it catch Al Qaeda members. The US did not ask General Musharraf to control domestic militancy, work for evolving a democratic culture and carry out massive institutional building which could off-set the Jihadi culture the military had promoted for the last three decades. Political vacuum in the context of Pakistan has been conspicuous and has its roots in the domination of the state by undemocratic political institutions and the ruling-elite. During the British rule in India a few elections were held in provinces of the United India but the democratic-political system remained restricted while the dominant majority of Indians particularly Muslims from the regions, which later became parts of Pakistan, were extensively uneducated specifically in the political sense. This left the landed gentry in these regions to dominate the political landscape before Pakistan got independence. After the birth of Pakistan members of this landed gentry and feudal families, who in a large number had won seats in the

\textsuperscript{199} These resources in case of the KP include billions of dollars worth of hydroelectricity, natural gas and minerals like gemstones plus agriculture produce particularly tobacco leaf and in case of Balochistan these include natural gas, gold, copper and other minerals.
pre-independence 1946 elections of India, dominated the legislature, which was given the task of both lawmaking and constitution-making for Pakistan.\textsuperscript{200} The elections of 1946 were held on the basis of qualified voting system. So without having the experience to run a local government or a provincial government the members of landed gentry and feudal families now had to form policies and laws for the whole state. However, as these members of the legislature were the product of apolitical and non-democratic cultural processes and had no experience of politics and governance they started running the affairs of the new state as of their personal estates. Consequently, the legislature-cum-constitutional assembly failed to frame the constitution even during an unprecedented nine years of its existence. This created a huge political, administrative and legal vacuum in the country. The affairs of the state had still, somehow, to be run; therefore, first the members of civilian bureaucracy and then the country’s military took reins of government into their hands. Slowly and gradually bureaucrats and generals developed a taste for power as well as the perks and privileges associated with it. Bureaucrats and generals started considering political-democratic institutions as their nemesis due to their potential and very role of politicizing and democratizing the state institutions, processes and society, which if achieved would have restricted the bureaucrats and generals to their constitutional and legal role, which, in turn, would have been tantamount to their subservience to politicians and the civil society. This status and state of affairs was unacceptable to bureaucrats and generals. Thus in order to avoid this situation bureaucrats and generals resorted to depoliticize society and policymaking. Earlier the landed-feudal-elite ‘politicians,’ who by dint of their social influence and money, had become public representatives, had also tried to depoliticize the society and policymaking lest politicized masses would replace them (so-called politicians) with genuine political leaders.

The domination of policymaking and its execution by civilian bureaucracy and military generals resulted in over-strengthening of the institutions they represented while enfeebling other institutions like parliament, political parties, judiciary and the civil society. This lopsided growth of state-society institutions furthered the political, legal and administrative vacuum in the

\textsuperscript{200} “The large dependency of the country’s economy at the time of partition on agriculture, contributed to the rise of the landowning class as an elite group within society. Pakistan’s politics to date continues to be dominated by rural-based elites, who have been able to parlay control over land, tenants and customary loyalties (e.g. \textit{biradri}) into political power.” (Mezzera & Aftab, 2009: 18)
country. Thus military and bureaucracy could not be subjected to constitutional checks. Therefore, when the bureaucracy and generals employed Islamist slogans and clerics to depoliticize society and nation-building on the basis of elusive religious slogans as well to make a religious personality of a secular entity, Pakistan, they did not face formidable resistance from other key state-society institutions. The political vacuum which existed at the time of Pakistan’s emergence as a nation-state within the country was furthered either deliberately by the ruling elite or was the natural corollary of prevention of a democratic political culture. This in turn prevented formulation of realistic foreign and domestic policy with concrete objectives based on the core national interest of development and all-encompassing security for masses and society. Consequently, when the ruling elite pursued military-centric state security by labeling it the “core” national interest and in this regard created religiously-imbued militants to fight in Afghanistan and Kashmir and to terrorize and vandalize democratic and civil society forces inside the country masses did not react. It was a totally non-political decision to launch a military offensive against the majority ethnic group of Pakistan—the Bengalis—by military ruler General Yahya and his generals and the creation of Al-Shams and Al-Badr fundamentalists to fight and defeat the national rights movement of Bengalis. An important aspect of the political vacuum in Pakistan is that it undercut the capacity of the state institutions to negotiate the challenge of religious extremism and terrorism. The political, administrative and legal vacuum that existed in Pakistan since its birth got adverse during the rule of military ruler General Zia-ul-Haq as he had dismissed the first elected government of the country and subjected the state to non-political, unelected and unaccountable rule. The decision of forming of Afghan Mujahideen to fight the Soviets in Afghanistan, which exacerbated extremism and militancy in the name of Islam in the region and Pakistan, was taken by General Zia. During the same period the policy of making Afghanistan, Pakistan’s Strategic Backyard and a dependency, was adopted for attaining the objective Afghan and Pakistan militants were created, which in later decades culminated in the shape of rise of the TNSM, the Afghan Taliban and the Pakistan Taliban. If madrassas are to be blamed for having radicalized Pakistani society and produced militant then it is important to know that the decision to establish thousands of militant madrassas had been taken by General Zia and his successor generals to produce militants for the Afghan Jihad, Kashmir Jihad, Afghan Taliban (to create a Pakistani dependency in Afghanistan). Thus it was not a political decision at
If the mushroom growth of madrassas, is linked to lack of public educational facilities in Pakistan, this situation also has its roots in political vacuum because it has been the non-democratic and non-political policymaking under which public education remained an area of subsidiary importance relative to the country’s so-called national security. These militants and terrorists found conducive environment to have sanctuaries, staging grounds and launching pads in the FATA because of the huge political-legal-administrative vacuum which has had existed there. This vacuum is evident as Pakistani parliament and judiciary have had no jurisdiction in the region while the areas never have had a provincial legislature and municipal councils. If the ISI and the MI have played role in the creation of Islamist militants and supported Islamist parties then holding these agencies responsible for radicalization is tantamount to considering symptoms as causes of extremism and terrorism in the name of Islam in Pakistan. A deeper look into the situation reveals that the ISI and the MI become so powerful and unaccountable due to political vacuum in the country. Due to political vacuum in the country foreign countries, specifically the US and Arab states, meddling in the policymaking processes of Pakistan especially by asking the latter to let its soil be used against other countries like the Soviet Union and Iran and promoting of religiously-indoctrinated militants also contributed immensely to the phenomenon of religious extremism and terrorism in Pakistan. On the other hand due to the political vacuum in the country the state became soft and its borders porous due to which it could not check the flowing in of alien fundamentalists, terrorists, radical ideas and money to promote radicalism.

201 Here one explanation is necessary: the nexus between the madrassas, militancy and army commenced during the rule of Zulfiqar Bhutto when he brought many Afghan religious teachers (Ustads) like Rabbani, Hikmatyar, Massaoud to Pakistan in 1973 to impart them militant training in Pakistan. Although mostly the military officials were instrumental behind Bhutto’s policy like Maj. General Naseerullah Babar but the final decision rested with Bhutto. As Bhutto was basically a feudal from Sindh and only a liberal in name as testified by a number of his government policies and actions, some of which mentioned in the preceding chapters, this also proves the contention of this study that the so-called feudal politicians, bereft of liberal characteristics, also could not take political decisions.
CHAPTER-7

CONCLUSION: STRATEGY TO COUNTER EXTREMISM & TERRORISM

The nature of fundamentalism and terrorism in the name of Islam in Pakistan and the situation it has created in the country is indeed complex. It is also difficult whether to define it as a war or not because by defining it as a war entails legal consequences. The challenge of extremism and terrorism can be met albeit the task to de-radicalize Pakistan is daunting, gigantic and painstaking. Countering religious extremism and terrorism requires a full-scale state and societal effort to neutralize and eliminate forces and sources of Islamist extremism and terrorism. “The sheer diversity of terrorism-its varying methods, goals, and perpetrators-precludes the design of any single doctrine to meet the threat.” (Simon, 1987: 114) Therefore, an assortment of political, economic, ideological, security measures and extensive socio-cultural engineering are required to achieve the huge task. This study has found that it is mainly the long-existing political vacuum in the country which is responsible for the rise and proliferation of extremism and terrorism in the name of Islam. It is also due to the political vacuum that the state has not been able to come up with a counterstrategy to deal with the twin phenomena. A comprehensive analysis of Pakistan military and civilian cabinets, parliamentary decisions, counterterrorism and de-radicalization strategies since 2001 or early 1990s, when the US threatened declaring Pakistan as a state sponsoring terrorism, reveals that there has been no comprehensive counter-extremism and counterterrorism policy in place in the country. This is surprising because since the turn of the present century Pakistan is among those few countries worst hit by religious extremism and terrorism. The only significant measure in this regard has been the formation of Anti-Terrorism
Courts in the country in 1997. However, the rate of conviction in these courts has been negligible whereas these courts do not specifically deal with the extremism and terrorism perpetrated in the name of Islam.

This chapter on the one hand concludes the dissertation and on the other hand documents a comprehensive counter-extremism and counterterrorism strategy in the light of the findings of the study. It is important to understand that fundamentalism in the name of Islam has pervaded so deep into Pakistani society that de-radicalization could not be done quickly and smoothly. Rather it would require years and decades to completely de-radicalize Pakistani society. An important and prospective factor in the process of de-radicalization is that the silent majority in the country is against extremism and employing of terrorist tactics by labelling it as *Jihad*. If the silent majority is convinced that the state and its institutions are on its side instead of the radicals and terrorists, which largely would depend on the state’s display of earnestness and commitment to take on the extremists and terrorists, then most of Pakistanis could stand up against the fundamentalists and put an end to their manipulation in the name of Islam. In the words of Pervez Hoodbhoy “the way forward lies in building a sustainable and active democracy, an economy for peace rather than war, a federation in which provincial grievances can be effectively resolved, elimination of the feudal order and creating a tolerant society that respects the rule of law.” (Hoodbhoy, 2009: 137-138)

7.1 PLUGGING POLITICAL VACUUM

The *Strategic Model* of terrorism studies, which is widely relied upon by policy circles in the developed countries for designing counterterrorism policy, prescribes that the best strategy to defeat terrorism is by minimizing terrorism political utility for its perpetrators. This can be done curtailing the political benefits, which terrorists want to achieve, through a stringent no concession strategy; reducing the potential benefits to the perpetrators of terrorism by a measure of appeasement as well as decreasing the political benefits in relative to purely non-violent course by promoting democracy. (Abrahms, 2008: 78) This study has discovered political

---

202 The model has three core assumptions: (1) terrorists have relatively stable and consistent political preferences; (2) terrorists calculate the political outcome of various options or courses of action available; and (3) terrorism is employed when its anticipated political outcome outweighs that of other options. (Abrahm, 2008: 79)
vacuum in the form of long spans of unconstitutional and undemocratic regimes, domineering role of the military and civilian bureaucratic establishment to the exclusion of genuine democratic political system and actors, and weaknesses of political forces as the chief cause of the rise and proliferation of extremism and terrorism in the name of Islam in Pakistan. Therefore, the foremost requirement for formulating an overall policy of countering religious extremism and terrorism in the country is to fill the political vacuum through constitutional, legal, accountable structures of governance so that to restore the writ of the state. According to Maj. General Naseerullah Babar, “For countering extremism and terrorism you only have to have the writ of the government, which for all intents and purposes and in every instance is not there. Moreover, if you have the support of the people then nothing these elements can do.” Babar’s view regarding counter-extremism and terrorism this is very important because he was the architect of Afghan Taliban, remained Pakistan’s Interior Minister (1993-96) and Governor KP (1977), who is ex-officio the chief-executive of the FATA, the most affected region due to religious extremism and terrorism, and had successfully crushed the seemingly uncontrollable terrorist attacks and militancy by members of MQM in Karachi as interior minister. Moreover, he was one of the main characters who advised PM Zulfiqar Bhutto to create political cell in the ISI. When General Babar was asked who are the perpetrators of Talibanization? The curt reply was, “No one it is just lack of governance.” Thus only by plugging the political vacuum in Pakistan that actual and potential political gains of the terrorists could be denied to them.

An important way to fill the political vacuum is to put an end to the political role of the intelligence agencies particularly the ISI. Maj. General Babar, when asked that it was he, on whose advice PM Bhutto created a political cell in the ISI and so how it could be ended, to which he said:

In fact, they (ISI people) have been using the one incident that of Hyderabad Conspiracy Case Tribunal. It was the ISI which had framed the case against the

---

203 Interview with Naseerullah Babar (Peshawar, February 2008)

204 Interview with Naseerullah Babar (Peshawar, February 2008)

205 The Hyderabad tribunal (1975–1979) dealt with the Hyderabad conspiracy case. The proceedings of the tribunal were aimed at persecuting the opposition politicians of the National Awami Party (NAP) on the charges of treason
pro-communist National Awami Party and it had brought all the evidence against it. However, as an intelligence agency its agents could not legally make representation before the court. So the ISI had to be given a fictional cover so an administrative order was issued putting a political cell within the ISI to give its officials a locus standi to bring evidence before the court. Since then the military and the intelligence agency have been using that precedent to create an empire of the ISI. Importantly, the political cell within the ISI was created through an executive order of the government, which could be cancelled any time. But they do not want to put an end to the political cell within the intelligence agency. They have allowed the ISI and all the intelligence agencies to become so big that they are now bigger than the state.

The process of intelligence agencies becoming state within the state in Pakistan has been explained by Frédéric Grare:

Military agencies such as Military Intelligence (MI) and the Inter-Services Intelligence (ISI) have gone far beyond their professional domains to conduct surveillance on civilians and political opponents of the military regime as well as masterminding alliances of co-opted civilians, occasionally playing on religious and ethnic sentiments and more generally along all fault lines in an already divided Pakistani society. For that matter, military agencies have sometimes employed means they should have used to combat terrorism against Pakistani citizens. (Grare, 2009: 4)

and disbelieving in the state ideology. The Supreme Court of Pakistan, on 30 October 1975, declared that NAP was conspiring to create an independent Pakhtunistan and greater Balochistan.

---

206 Babar became a party to the petition filed by retired Air Chief of Pakistan, Air Marshal Asghar Khan, before the Supreme Court of Pakistan in 1996 to scotch the political cell in the ISI.

207 Interview with Naseerullah Babar (Peshawar, October 2003)
Thus the intelligence agencies including the ISI could be effectively controlled through legal and administrative orders provided someone within the politicians has the commitment to do so in the larger national interest. One such attempt was made by the Benazir Bhutto government in late 90s but it was half-hearted.

We tried to break the ISI chain but we could not succeed. Officers are from the army so they look towards the Army Chief for their postings, promotions and further well being. In 1989, we decided to make a change in the ISI and I asked whether it was necessary for a serving general to be its head; but I was told that anyone—be it a civilian or a retired general—can be its chief. Then we appointed retired [Lt.] General Kalu in place of [Lt. General] Hameed Gul. Unfortunately, we were too entrenched that we could not bring about the changes that we desired; then our government was dismissed. But we did make an attempt to break the stranglehold of ISI on politics. Another unfortunate episode was that President Ghulam Ishaq Khan was siding with them.208

7.1.1 Cultivating & Promoting Democratic Culture

Raising legal, constitutional and accountable structures of governance specifically of social control is not possible without having a broad-based and deep-rooted democratic culture in the country. In turn such a culture cannot evolve without liberalizing and democratizing all the social institutions right from the basic social institution of the family to the highest and elaborate institution of the state or government.209 Promoting such a culture is a long-term solution for countering religious extremism and terrorism. However, the foundations of a democratic culture could be well laid through repeated elections not only at the national level but also at the

208 Interview with Naseerullah Babar (Peshawar, October 2003).

209 Sociologists recognize five basic social institutions including family, religion, economy, government-politics and education. Increasingly, sociologists also regard media and technology as social institutions due to their central functional role in modern societies. In Pakistan all these social institutions have largely been based on undemocratic procedures and decision-making resulting in whimsical power wielding.
provincial and municipal level. Once lawmaking and administrative structures and institutions get democratize this would set in a process of democratization of the rest of the social and state institutions.

It is significant to note that for the first time in history a second elected government would be completing its constitutional tenure in Pakistan\(^{210}\) in 2013. Simultaneously two consecutive local governments have already completed their respective tenures and after some delay all the provinces are poised to have third elections in 2013 as Supreme Court of Pakistan has ordered to hold these elections by that time as it is a constitutional requirement. On the other hand Pakistan for the first time is having the most transparent and independent superior judiciary led by Chief Justice, Iftikhar Mohammad Chaudhry. The putting into place of an independent superior judiciary has been possible after the heroic resistance which the top judges put to military ruler General Musharraf.\(^{211}\)

\(^{210}\) The first-ever national government which completed its tenure was led by Pakistan Muslim League-Quaid (PML-Q) from December 2002 to November 2007. Along with it four provincial governments also completed their five-year constitutional tenure. Although the PML-Q was created through engineering by the then ruler General Pervez Musharraf and brought in to power through heavily-rigged elections and was termed as ‘King’s Party’ by the national media. Still the PML (Q) comprise of many seasoned politicians. The government of Pakistan People’s Party (PPP) which took power in March 2008 although has been shaky all along during its rule but is expected to complete the rest of its tenure.

\(^{211}\) General Musharraf sacked Chief Justice Chaudhry in March 2007 unconstitutionally after the latter refused either to resign or to toe the military line in deciding certain cases particularly pertaining to the missing persons, most Baloch nationalist movement members and not religious militants, allegedly taken into unlawful custody by the military agencies. (Grare: 2009: 127) The resistance was backed by the country’s lawyers’ community and bodies of other professionals as well as the civil society and a sizable portion of the population. Only a so-called long-march from various opposition parties forced the PPP government to restore the Chief Justice and other of his fellow judges, who had refused to accept General Musharraf’s illegal orders and meddling into judiciary’s affairs. Since restoration the superior judiciary has given landmark judgments on a number of high-profile cases including involvement of the government, military, bureaucracy and intelligence agencies personnel in financial corruption, illegal detention and abduction of citizens, atrocities and violation of the constitution. This can be gauged from the fact that for the first time in Pakistan’s history the Supreme Court dismissed the longest-serving sitting prime minister, Yousaf Raza Gillani, for violating the constitution and defying the courts orders to write an official letter to Swiss authorities to open cases of ill-gotten money against President Asif Ali Zardari, who also happened to be head of the prime minister’s party, pending before the Swiss courts. Moreover, for the first time in the country’s history a high-ranking military official, Major General Obaidullah Khattak, the Inspector General of Frontier Corps Balochistan was summoned to the court to answer charges against his organization of extra-judicial picking and killing of Baloch nationalists. The court also took up the long-pending case against Inter Services Intelligence (ISI)
On the other hand Pakistan is having a massive media booms with the airing of at least 60 private channels. The process started in 2003 with the establishment of the first private TV channel, Geo TV. Media focus on politics and political and economic issues and above all democracy and elections related matters has resulted in renewed and issue-based interest in country’s politics among the masses as well as increasing the knowledge and awareness level of the people of the constitution, governance structures, democratic and official processes and rights and responsibilities or various institutions and citizens.

The continuation of the political system for almost ten years without interruption, two national, provincial and local municipal councils elections each, the surfacing of an independent superior judiciary and vibrant media and strengthening civil society are signs of a democratic culture taking root in the country despite of huge challenges to it from various sides. The civilian government, the political parties, the civil society and people have to actively support the process of democratization and liberalization so as to plug the political vacuum in the country. (Rashid, 2009: 34) If the future civilian governments would overcome the problems of financial corruption in various ministries and government departments and institutions and would be able to satisfactorily address the immediate issues and concerns of the people and demonstrate its commitment to the policy of separation of power and subservience of the military and civilian bureaucracy to the will of the people as represented by the country’s parliament the military-civilian-intelligence establishment power base could be diluted. Even a weak political-democratic government like that of Prime Minister Muhammad Khan Junejo (1985-1988), which was taking care of country’s administration under General Zia as a self-appointed president of Pakistan along with a kitchen cabinet of his handpicked generals stood up to the latter and to their utter displeasure signed the Geneva Accord which paved the way for Soviet military withdrawal from Afghanistan. (Abbas, 2005: 123) It was Junejo government which for the first time in the country’s history initiated the process to cut down country’s defense budget. In an unprecedented move the special review committee appointed by Prime Minister Junejo, having members of the parliament and officials from the economic ministries, recommended for

---

for distributing public funds among handpicked politicians and political parties in 1990s to influence the outcome of elections.
maintaining a ‘small’ ‘professional’ army in place of the huge existing one and the scrutiny and accountability of defense spending. (Hussain; Hussain, 1993: Abbas, 2005: 93) To this general retorted on May 22, 1988 by stating, “Pakistan cannot afford any cut or freeze in defence expenditure, since you cannot freeze threats to Pakistan’s security.” (Hussain; Hussain, 1993: Abbas, 2005: 93) Ironically on May 29, 1988, General Zia dismissed Junejo on frivolous charges of corruption and failure to enforce *Islamic* laws in the country.

The startling disclosure by former premier Sharif that former Army Chief, General Aslam Beg and former DG ISI, Lt. General Asad Durrani, proposed to him to raise funds for ISI’s covert operations through selling drugs is another example when democratically-elected government rejected the illegal acts of the intelligence establishment. However, Sharif claimed he refused the gentlemen to go-ahead; although the two generals have denied ever making such a proposal to Sharif. Still it is an open secret within the military circles that in 1983 the entire staff of the Quetta headquarters of ISI was sacked for involvement in drug trade. (Abbas, 2005: 148)

The above cited cases and instances while on the one hand prove that democratic-political governments, howsoever weak they may have been, take political decisions with no element of violence involved to achieve the policy objectives. While on the other hand they demonstrate that even in Pakistan elected and constitutional regimes have and could stand up to the powerful military-civilian-intelligence establishment and thus can plug the political vacuum provided they get the chance to complete their tenures and the democratic political system get somewhat strength.

7.2 PROMOTING DEMOCRATIC CULTURE & ESTABLISHING COMPATIBLE AND VIABLE POLITICAL SYSTEM

In the light of the findings of this research study the most lasting, comprehensive and effective solution of the twin menace of extremism and terrorism in the name of Islam in Pakistan lies in promoting a democratic culture in the country. The influence of Islamists in Pakistan can perhaps best be contained through democracy. “Unless there is fundamental change in Pakistan
establishing a democratic dispensation regulated by the constitution we really can’t resolve this problem by fire fighting. The situation would go on worsening.”

Most often than not the common man and the woman as well as certain segments of intelligentsia on the one hand and the non-democratic forces and institutions particularly the civilian and military bureaucracy on the other hand, blames elected governments for all the ills of the country. While the former erroneously equate elections with democracy without considering that only 30 to 40 percent of Pakistani usually have voted in the general elections while the political parties that have had formed governments got only one-third of the polled votes (mostly cast by people in the rural areas). So for a strong democracy participation of an ever-increasing number of people in the process has to be ensured. The general feeling among Muslims that democracy is a US or western concept must also be overcome to increase the acceptability of democracy and freedom

Firstly, why do we worry so much about the US-inspired democracy? That talks generally in terms of freedom and democracy. These are values cherished by anyone; even the Muslims. The Muslims have to decide for themselves. But it does not make sense that we should be against democracy just because the US talks about it. ... My worry is that many Muslims tend to exploit the fact that America is supporting and inspiring to debate so what we want then? Do we want military regimes, dictarships, authoritarianism, illiberal democracies and no free media, like we have in Malaysia? I am afraid, we don’t have a choice. We have to have freedom.

Foundations of a truly democratic culture could not be laid without putting in place an effective political system, which Pakistan has lacked throughout its existence. An effective political system could be set up only when it is compatible with the positive social values and prevailing

---

212 Interview with Senator Afrasiab Khattak (Peshawar, January 2008)

213 Interview with Dr Anwar Ibrahim, former Malaysian deputy prime minister and finance minister (Islamabad, March 2006)
objective conditions of Pakistan. Decentralization, participatory and an all-encompassing political system could be the real panacea for the integrity of Pakistan instead of elusive state ideology. The state has used the ideology to keep the state together. Because if there is no state ideology there would hardly be any need for defining that ideology and devising ways and means to achieve the inherent goals of that ideology. In such a situation there would be no need of Islamist militant groups by the state to further that ideology. In the context of Pakistan this is an uphill task still it is not impossible provided the key institution the military is convinced of the extreme dangers of using Islamist ideology as the state policy.

Unless Pakistan’s all-powerful military can be persuaded to turn over power gradually to secular civilians and allow economic and regional interests to prevail over religious sentiment, the country’s vulnerability to radical Islamic politics will not wane. (Haqqani, 2005: 312)

In turn an effective political system and a democratic culture cannot be formulated and promoted respectively without having a strong civil society in the country.

Weak civil society and political instability were additional reasons why groups like these (extremist outfits) carried on with their business unchallenged by society at large through a majority felt disturbed by these trends. (Abbas, 2005)

The demands for Islamization can be countervailed through strengthening the civil society and non-religious political parties. (Haqqani, 2005: 327)

7.2.1 Addressing Weaknesses of Existing Political System
As far as the existing Pakistani political system is concerned it is apparently parliamentary-democratic-federal in nature. This system despite being in place continually since 1973\textsuperscript{214} has not solved the key problems of Pakistan rather have made them more profound as is evident from economic meltdown in terms of plummeting growth rate and rising public depth and large-scale corruption within the system. Above all the weakness of the system can be gauged from its inability to prevent military takeovers and even to hold the generals responsible for their extra-constitutional measures.

Thus in order to have a strong political system while keeping in view the objective and subjective conditions of Pakistan this study suggests there is a need of introducing presidential form of government. Because parliamentary democracy in Pakistan was also a British legacy which resulted in the rise to political prominence of the rural elites as they had the power and money to influence the results of the elections. (Mezzera & Aftab, 2009: 16) In this study we found that those politicians who remained part of the ruling elite have only been political leaders merely in name which also contributed to the depoliticization of society and creation of political vacuum in the country. Therefore, only a popularly-elected individual could ensure the sustainability of the policies and thus strength of the political system. Moreover, popularly elected presidents could be better poised to stand up to the challenges of domination the policymaking by strong military-administrative-intelligence establishment. In the context of Pakistan a presidential system can also ensure good governance especially in the area of social services delivery. Because whenever there came a military ruler and pronounced himself as president he established local government system.\textsuperscript{215} On the contrary all the elected governments of political parties have had discouraged local government elections and have tried to pack up those introduced by the preceding military ruler for the very reason that financial and administrative powers within the local municipal corporations and administration deprive the

\textsuperscript{214} The constitution remained suspended between 1977-1985 and was arbitrarily amended by military ruler General Zia and during 1999-2002 when military ruler General Musharraf kept it in abeyance,

\textsuperscript{215} Three of the four military rulers of Pakistan including General (later self-pronounced Field Marshal) Ayub Khan (1958-69); General Zia (1977-88) and General Musharraf (1999-2008) put into place local government system through elections arguing it is the grassroots democracy which is more suited to address the immediate problems of Pakistan.
political parties of their share in administration without realizing that parliaments are meant basically to legislate then to run the affairs of local councils.

Due to absence of local administrative structures the National Assembly of Pakistan as well as the provincial assemblies became the repositories of all administrative and governmental powers and authority which has made them the choicest places for genuine and pseudo politician to reach by whatever means possible as this bestows not only power but also perks and privileges on the members. This situation has prevented the legislative assemblies to concentrate on their actual work of law making and policy formulation and preventing them to be responsive to the demands of the people and time. In the absence of local municipal corporations the government policy planners could not have a fair idea of the actual problems and needs of the people, which created a huge disconnect between the rulers and the masses.

Moreover, due to absence of local government system and municipal councils, which has been the case for most part of Pakistan’s existence, the state writ could not be enforced uniformly and efficiently in mostly rural regions. This created a huge political-administrative vacuum in the country. This situation on the one hand resulted in complex legal-judicial and economic problems and on the other hand led to shaky governmental control. Both legal-judicial and administrative problems significantly contributed to the rise of extremist, militant-terrorist groups in the country. Here the example of the FATA could strikingly demonstrate the correlation between the local municipal councils and state control. The FATA never have had any local municipal councils whereas the state control has been the weakest in the region which facilitated local, national and international terrorist groups whether the TTP or Al Qaeda to make the areas their base (See for details Chapter 3). The absence of local government structures in Pakistan for a long time also prevented political leadership to grow from the grassroots which left the political arena open for domination by members of feudal-landed families or urban trade or business tycoons. Resultantly, a true democratic culture could not thrive in Pakistan.

Therefore if a viable, accountable and responsive political system has to replace Pakistan’s present decadent, unaccountable and corrupt political dispensation there is a need to put in place a presidential system at the top and under it the local government system at the lowest tier. The developing of such a political system is not difficult provided the political parties, politicians,
masses and the civil society have the will to work for it. Such a political system would ensure the functionality of key state institutions besides giving the society direction and the much-needed concrete, perceptible and achievable goals to strive for.

In the course of this study it has been discovered that certain state organs, without having the mandate to formulate policies for the state and to pursue them, have had taken upon themselves the task of setting the national goals, framing policies in the light of these goals and devising strategies to achieve these goals and in this process become states within the state. In this regard the military and its intelligence arm the ISI have been blamed but with a lot of evidence by various quarters for promoting and protecting Islamist militants. Police officials of Karachi believed that the ISI had deep-seated links with the religious militants and have extensive knowledge of their cells but refuse to provide the same to the police to eliminate their network. (Rashid, 2008: 155) If Pakistan has to formulate a viable and effective counter-extremism and counterterrorism policy all the institutions, which have become virtual states within state and have made the state institutions their estates have to be subjected to the law and made accountable for their deeds and misdeeds. In this regard there is a need to take concrete actions on the legislative, judicial, administrative levels. The national parliament has to adopt laws which specifically lay down the legal recourse in case there is evidence of involvement of officials of intelligence agencies and other departments in aiding, abetting religious extremist groups and militants. The trial of those officials who are found in any way involved in their personal or institutional capacity in supporting Islamic extremists and terrorists must be taken up by special tribunals or Anti-terrorist courts. These trials must be time bound and the punishments should be made public and publicized widely. Apart from this the civilian government must launch special training programmes for police, intelligence agencies including the military intelligence agencies personnel inculcating them that all their actions are subject to law and constitution and they must be extremely cautious in taking actions. Especially these officials must be given thorough lessons on human rights, legal and constitutional provisions. During these lessons they must be unequivocally told that ‘ignorance of law is no excuse’ and even if they receive instructions from their superiors for aiding and abetting extremists and terrorists they must decline the orders telling them that ‘for an order to be followed it has to be legal’ otherwise they would land them in deep legal trouble.
7.2.2 Increasing the Capacity of Parliamentarians

Apart from passing an inconsequential resolution in 2010, as it is not legally binding on any of the state institution, Pakistani parliament has failed to legislate a viable legal framework or policy to counter religious extremism and terrorism in the name of Islam in Pakistan. The parliamentarians, however, have been taking great pride in coming up with a unanimous resolution to give policy guidelines to the government for its counterterrorism and counter-extremism strategy. Therefore, the analysis of this resolution is necessary to ascertain the scope and effectiveness of the role, if any, of parliament in Pakistan counter-extremism and counterterrorism policy and to discover the loopholes.

The resolution was passed in an in-camera session of the joint sitting of parliament which ended with the announcement of a consensus resolution to fight the challenges to national security posed by militancy and terrorism. The then ruling party the Pakistan People’s Party (PPP) was able to convince other government partners and opposition political parties to have unanimous policy guidelines regarding de-radicalization and counterterrorism.

The content analysis of the unanimous resolution of the parliament reveals that the members of parliament called for reviewing the national security strategy and changing the mode of operations of combating terrorism to restore peace and stability in Pakistan and the region. The resolution emphasized on pursuance of independent foreign policy. This guideline was tantamount to rejection of the years-long extant counter terrorism strategy as well as the foreign policy. However, the parliamentarians failed to understand or recognize that the state already had exhausted the option of dialogue with the insurgents after engaging in talks with the latter time and again. The results were counterproductive as these talks strengthened the terrorists and reinforced their insurgency.

The point that the challenge of terrorism and extremism in the name of Islam must be countered through developing a consensus through dialogue with all genuine stakeholders is indeed important. This calls for scotching the policy of counterterrorism devised in isolation by the military-civilian-intelligence establishment of the country. Instead the political forces, the residents of the areas affected by militancy and terrorism and civil society bodies must have a
significant and proportionate contribution in the devising of the policy to counter terrorism. But above all the intellectuals should lead the way in this regard because, as is always the case with public opinion on key policy issues it needs to be led by the political leadership and intelligentsia. Religious extremism-terrorism had been the key policy and societal issue since 1990s but during this period Pakistani politicians failed to apprise the public about the dynamics of the twin phenomenon and accordingly shape the public opinion. Instead the politicians due to their incapacity in terms of educational qualification and cosmopolitanism readily accepted the superficial public understanding of the phenomenon.

In the said parliamentary resolution the most representative politicians, by virtue of their membership of Pakistani parliament, emphasized on addressing the root causes of extremism and terrorism. But while mentioning the root causes no explanation of these causes of religious extremism and terrorism, whether discovered in this study or other studies, was given. Generally the country’s parliamentarians, with a few exceptions, have considered the occupation of Afghanistan by the US and NATO forces in 2001 and Pakistan’s subsequent joining in of the Washington-led Global War on Terror as the root cause of religious extremism and terrorism in Pakistan.

In the context of this study the root cause of radicalization and terrorism in the name of Islam in Pakistan has partly been due to the so-called politicians’ non-political behaviour and policies which created political vacuum in the country. This political void has had to be filled by the military. The military, in turn, has seen at the national interest in military-strategic terms and consequently arrived at profoundly wrong decisions in the arena of foreign and internal policies. This testified the key principle of foreign policy and diplomacy set by Hans J. Morgenthau. According to Morgenthau “The armed forces are the instrument of foreign policy not its master. No successful and no peaceful foreign policy is possible without observance this rule.” (Morgenthau, 1985: 590)

Even the Pakistani military generals admit their limited capacity in the realm of policymaking and governance. According to Maj. General Naseerullah Babar:
The military have limited education; they have no experience of political life and governance so they can only use force or best they could link up with mullah while the latter find furtherance in life. They are many people who were yesterday mullahs in mosques and today they are MPs, what you would expect from them.\textsuperscript{216} \textsuperscript{217}

This process has resulted in making economic growth and development in education as subservient national goals to the attainment of territorial security ultimately failing to get either that is human and economic security as well as military and state security. “Instead of the national security paradigm, Human Security needs to be emphasized, as the latter concept encompasses the notions of economic and social security of the population.” (Saigol, 2009: 62)

Without having the comprehension of the above-mentioned historical genesis of the issue of extremism and terrorism in the name of Islam most Pakistani politicians particularly those in the parliament could not understand the root cause of terrorism and extremism and thus could not be expected to come up with correct policy guidelines to counter extremism and terrorism.\textsuperscript{218}

The parliamentary resolution also pointed at some appropriate areas which if addressed could be instrumental in countering militancy and extremism. For instance, it had stressed not to allow the use of Pakistani soil for launching militant attacks in any other country. Pakistan could really implement this policy direction if there is genuine commitment on part of the military-industrial-

\textsuperscript{216} Interview with Naseerullah Babar (Peshawar, October 2003)

\textsuperscript{217} Although Naseerullah later became a politician and won parliamentary seats from the platform of the PPP but it seems that when he talked about military officers limited education and linking up with mullahs he partly admitted his own mistakes. Because he was the person who linked up Pakistani establishment with the Afghan mullahs and he was the architect of Afghan Taliban.

\textsuperscript{218} This incomprehension of the politicians of the root cause of extremism and terrorism in the name of Islam can be gauged from the fact that in the resolution to give policy guidelines to counter religious extremism and terrorism they called for safeguarding Pakistan’s sovereignty and territorial integrity, clearly a military-intelligence line of thinking. On the other hand the politicians failed to understand that none of the Islamist extremist and terrorist groups of Pakistan has been a separatist movement and thus not a threat to a territorial solidarity of the country. Rather extremist-terrorist groups have political objectives the core aim is to overrun the state and impose upon it their own dictatorship euphemistically called Shariah.
intelligence establishment and to put an end to its strategy of locating *Strategic Depth* in Afghanistan and winning over Kashmir through a proxy insurgency.

The resolution stressed upon dialogue as the principle instrument of conflict management and resolution and it is to be encouraged by all elements willing to abide by the Constitution of Pakistan and rule of law. In this regard the government should offer peace to all shades of militant groups and those refuse ought to be moved against with full force. This may help drive wedges among various militant groups with foreign elements having no choice but to resist. This would clarify any confusion within the state functionaries regarding extremists and terrorists. This strategy has been emphasized upon by Imran Khan, Chairman of one of the leading Pakistani political party, Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf (PTI).

The most potent part of the parliamentary resolution is the pursuance of development of the FATA, and the KP with all possible means. The underdevelopment in these areas indeed has been a cardinal factor in the rise and proliferation of extremism, militancy and terrorism in Pakistan. The country’s decision-makers must now realize that the policy of keeping FATA underdeveloped to serve as a buffer between Pakistan and Afghanistan and to keep the KP economically dependent on the central government despite of having adequate oil and gas reservoirs to meet the country’s burgeoning energy needs, as well as other resources has proved extremely costly for the whole country. The underdevelopment of the FATA and the KP has fomented extremism and terrorism in the name of Islam in the entire country.

While the military component of the government’s policy may be unpopular, Pakistanis tend to support political reform in FATA. Only 8% of respondents favoured leaving the colonial-era Frontier Crimes Regulation unchanged, while 46% favoured modifying it slowly over time, and more than one in four favoured abolishing it altogether. (Fair; Seth, 2010: 2).

The parliamentary resolution while giving policy guidelines for countering religious extremism and terrorism called for the strengthening the federation or the state of the union of Pakistan. It also mentioned the ways and means to attain the objective that is the ensuing of the processes of
democratic pluralism, social justice, religious values and tolerance and equitable resource-sharing among the provinces as enshrined in the Constitution of 1973. The collective wisdom of Pakistani parliament apart the situation at the end of 2012 is so grave, as marked by two extremely dangerous insurgencies, the Islamist one spearheaded by the TTP in the entire country and the other by secular Baloch separatists in the province of Balochistan, that there are existential threats to the very survivability of the state. Therefore, to counter the threats there is a need to do something drastic rather than merely distributing the country’s economic resources between the federation and provinces as enshrined in the 1973 Constitution. A good starting point of addressing the situation is giving provinces entire control over their resources and stopping the process of usurping of the same on part of the central government. The question at the end of 2012 is of ‘saving’ the federation than to ‘strengthen’ it as the resolution called for. In this respect the introduction of a presidential form of government, as explained above could be instrumental.

The above-mentioned analysis show Pakistani politicians and the parliamentarians have a poor track-record in devising correct policy guidelines to counter religious extremism and extremism in Pakistan and they lack the comprehension of the factors and their interaction in the rise and proliferation of fundamentalism in the name of Islam in Pakistan. Keeping this in view there is a need to build the capacity of the politicians and particularly parliamentarians to develop their comprehension of the complex issue of religious extremism and terrorism. This could only be done if they are imparted extensive lessons by independent civilian experts on religious extremism, terrorism and counterterrorism. In this regard experts in Pakistani universities could be of great value.

7.3 OVERHAULING ANTI-TERRORIST JUDICIAL AND PROSECUTING PROCEDURES:

There have been a few convictions by Pakistani courts on the counts of terrorism and even fewer on the charges of fomenting religious intolerance and extremism. Most of the accused have had to be acquitted because of lack of evidence as the prosecuting and investigating officials could not gather admissible proofs to be presented before the courts of law. Without evidence judges have also been hesitant to hand down punishments to the accused despite significant indications of their involvement. Fears regarding personal and family security have been one of the
important reasons which have prevented judges from sentencing terrorists. The high-profile cold-blooded murder of liberal-minded Governor of the Punjab Salman Taseer in January 2011 by one of his police bodyguards, who accused the Governor of having committed blasphemy against Prophet Muhammad (SAW) is a case in point. The judge Pervez Ali Shah, which convicted the assassin Mumtaz Qadri on the basis of irrefutable evidence, had to resettle in an Arab country because of constant threats from religious fundamentalists. (Tahir, 2011) Therefore, the government has to devise pellucid and implementable anti-terrorist laws and investigation and prosecuting procedures as well as has to take steps for ensuring foolproof security of judges.

7.4 THE NEED TO ENGAGE MILITARY BY POLITICAL LEADERSHIP & CIVIL SOCIETY

The dominance of the military in Pakistani history particularly in the realm of foreign policy and management of internal politics necessitated the institution to promote religious militants (for details see Chapter 3 and 5). The military has been hesitant to eliminate many groups of Islamist militants because it considers them of great value in its strategy of proxy war in Afghanistan and Kashmir. According to Ahmed Rashid a general of Pakistan Army told him, “It is not possible to completely crack down on the fundamentalists, as they may be needed in any future conflict with India.” (Rashid, 2008: 155) Pakistan after 9/11 calculated that the US will have a short period of stay in Afghanistan and once the Americans are gone, Islamabad would reassume its role of shaping things in Afghanistan. (Rashid, 2008: 219) Under this strategic assessment of Pakistani strategists have provided support to Afghan insurgent groups like the Taliban, Hizb-e-Islami Afghanistan (HIA) and the Haqqani Network against all odds and have created enabling conditions to Pakistani brand of Taliban in order to provide depth of retreat to Afghan groups on Pakistani territory. Military ruler General Musharraf condemned extremists in words but when it came to deeds regarding them he stuck to the Army’s institutional view that the fundamentalist were the only reliable allies in the country’s war with India and checkmating liberal democrats domestically. (Rashid, 2008: 220)

7.4.1 Changing the Strategic Mindset of Military
These above examples show the challenges to any counterterrorism strategy in Pakistan when the most powerful institution of the state—the military-intelligence complex—has had no interest in countering terrorists operating in the name of Islam and in de-radicalization society. Keeping this in view the formulation of an effective counterterrorism strategy in Pakistan and its implementation is not possible without changing the traditional security state mindset of Pakistan military leadership. Surprisingly this mindset has sustained for over generations and there has been little positive intergenerational change in this mindset. Expecting that the mindset would change itself and outside factors cannot change it is irrational. Military and intelligence agencies may have their institutional interests but still they are inanimate in form. Only humans, who run and manage these institutions, matter and could be meaningfully dealt with. Military and intelligence personnel may be different from other humans or Pakistanis for that matter in many respects but still they are humans—susceptible to cognitive, attitudinal and behavioural changes. If the specific strategic security mindset of the military and its intelligence agencies is responsible for the rooting of belief within these institutions that patronizing Islamist militants as proxies is indispensable for the security of the state at the same time the civilian governments, political parties, civil society and international actors are equally responsible for their failure in changing the mindset of the military.

The task of changing Pakistani military traditional mindset may have been daunting but in no way impossible. The process of changing the mindset of the country’s military must be spearheaded by the political parties particularly the civilian governments. In this regard the political parties and civil society groups must be brought together on a single point agenda to change the military’s mindset. This must be done not by taking a collision course with the military but by engaging the military high command into an intelligible and meaningful debate. The political parties and the civil society must attempt to convince the military that its conception of the security state; considering India and Afghanistan as perennial enemies; propagation of pseudo Islamic ideology; and patronizing of Islamic extremist and militant groups instead of providing security to the state has made the state and its inhabitants more insecure. Because the clerical Muslim groups, Muslim extremists and perpetrators of terrorism in the name of Islam have pervaded in Pakistani society whereas the terrorists have got a religious justification for their non-religious, illegal and inhuman actions.
The so-called ground realities have kept us captive of the circumstances and dismembered the country, while the present situation is not less critical than the 1971 crisis. We are not against the military personnel taking part in politics. But they should form their political party or may join any existing party. However, they cannot be allowed to drag an important state institution like the military in politics, which is not in the state’s interest nor in the interest of its people. Political forces should take a firm stand against military generals’ interference in politics and there should not be any middle ways. 219

7.4.2 Compromising Non-military Aspects of Security:

The policy of searching for military-strategic security through religious extremists as a natural corollary necessitated ignoring and compromising other aspects of security that is human, economic, political, cultural and environmental among others. The political parties and the civil society has to convince the military through deep and multipronged discourse that security is a holistic concept and it is not divisible into parts220 and insecurity in one sphere automatically result in total insecurity. The changing of military-specific security mindset of the military-intelligence establishment is critical otherwise it would lead to the ultimate collapse of the state itself both in the form of inescapable and probably unpreventable foreign aggression and internal institutional breakdown rather meltdown. Simultaneous realization within the military regarding the threats which extremists pose to the country has been noticeable since the turn of the 21st century. On January 12, 2002 General Musharraf while addressing the nation announced banning core fundamentalist groups Jaish-e-Mushammad, Tehreek-e-Jafaria, the Lashkar-e-Tayyaba (LeT), the Sipah-e-Sahaba Pakistan (SSP) and the Tanzeem Nifaz-e-Shariat-e-Muhammadi (TNSM). In his address he said:

---

219 Interview with Mahmud Khan Achakzai (Peshawar, March 2003)

220 The concept of security could be divided into different parts but only for the sake of explanation otherwise it is an all-encompassing concept.
The day of reckoning has come. Do we want Pakistan to become a theocratic state? Do we believe that religious education alone is enough for governance or do we want Pakistan to emerge as a progressive and dynamic Islamic welfare state? . . . Look at what this extremist minority is doing. They are indulging in fratricidal killings . . . Mosques are being misused for propagating and inciting hatred against each other’s sect and beliefs . . . The extremist minority must realize that Pakistan is not responsible for waging armed Jihad in the World” (As reported by different Pakistan newspapers).

The political parties, political leadership and civil society have to contribute to reinforcing this realization within the military by active engagement of its personnel at every forum and level. In order to successfully achieve the task the political parties, political leadership and the civil society have to first increase their own capacity as mentioned above in this chapter. Apart from engagement the military through discourse, the political parties and civil society must resort to constitutional and legal resorts to check the escapades of the military personnel. At the same time the political parties, civil society particularly the media must convey in unequivocal terms to the military leadership that any action not sanctioned by the parliament and the civilian government has no legal status. Pakistan’s history is replete with examples that the military and its intelligence agencies acted unconstitutionally and illegally\textsuperscript{221} but as mentioned elsewhere in this chapter never any military dictator and his aide de camps have been held accountable and punishable even posthumously by any parliament or the country’s Supreme Court, which constitutionally is duty-bound to safeguard the constitution. Therefore, the parliament and the Supreme Court must declare the past dictators of having committed treason and thus liable to be handed down capital punishment as enshrined in the Article 6 of the Constitution of Pakistan. This would convey a very strong message to the military generals that any of their illegal act would have severe consequences in future.

In this dissertation it has been found that the military establishment has patronized religious elements and militant groups because the liberal sections of society have an alternative

\textsuperscript{221} There have been four military coups in Pakistan and 34 years of direct rule after abrogation of the country’s constitutions.
understanding of the national interest and objectives. So the promotion of extremist and terrorist groups had also become a compulsion of the establishment as the leaders and members of these groups agreed with the military’s conception of the national interest and concur to become tools for the achievement of the objectives of the national interest. However, in recent years some extremist and terrorist groups have come up with their own understanding and explanation of the national interest and national goals, which rests on either handing over the country to them or they overrun the state so that they could impose their own system of Shariah and governance. Thus it is the most opportune time for the liberal elements, which dominate Pakistani civil society, to become closer to the military establishment and must convince it of the dangers of investing on the extremist and terrorist groups. The liberals must try to liberalize the military from within as the Islamist groups like the JI adopted a strategy of Islamizing the country from within by infiltrating the key institutions of the military, civilian bureaucracy, judiciary and the media.

7.5 OVERCOMING DIFFICULTY OF STATE FUNCTIONARIES TO CONSIDER EXTREMISTS AS ENEMIES

The role of Pakistani military and intelligence agencies in the production of Muslim militant groups has been well-known, therefore, for many individual state functionaries, who once helped create and nurture militant extremist groups to target and eliminate the same has been quite difficult.“It is difficult for some members of the law enforcement machinery to look upon Islamists as enemies of the state, after almost two decades of treating them as national heroes.” (Haqqani, 2005: 307) Therefore, if Pakistan has to devise a viable counterterrorism strategy it ought to purge the administration and its national institutions particularly the military and its affiliated intelligence agencies of those individuals who have somehow been engaged with the policy of creation of proxy militants. Without doing so even any change in the state policy regarding using militants and extremists as tools for attainment of foreign and defence policy objectives would be meaningless. For those military and intelligence officials it is very difficult to psychologically adjust to the changed realities and to realize that it is no more the state policy to cultivate such militants and any further engagement and patronization of such elements would be counterproductive and goes against the interest of the state. Reforming the intelligence
agencies therefore requires not only a change in the state, but a change of the state of mind of the actors involved. (Grare, 2009: 6) They need to be told as argued by Pervez Hoodbhoy, that “First, an upward-mobile India has no reason to want an additional 170 million Muslims. Second, even if India wanted to, territorial conquest is impossible. Conventional weapons, used by Pakistan in a defensive mode, are sufficient protection.” (Hoodbhoy, 2009: 137) Therefore, there is a need to clarify to them that their services could only be continued if they reconcile to the transformed policy of the state and if they are not ready to comply they have to leave the government service. Moreover, the new generation of officials, who have not been involved in the policy of creation of militants must be told that the earlier policy of the state to cultivate proxies has backfired and it has turned out to be a totally ruinous policy. They need to be informed through special inculcation sessions.

It is important to note that some of the main military and intelligence officials who were instrumental in the policy of formation of Afghan Mujahideen, Afghan Taliban, Kashmiri Mujahideen have got killed by militants themselves or compulsorily retired from service. For instance, Colonel Sultan Ameer Tarar alias Colonel Imam, who was the master-trainer of Afghan Mujahideen and Afghan Taliban along with another main handler of Mujahideen and Taliban Squadron Leader Khalid Khawaja were killed in cold-blood in Waziristan and the responsibility was accepted by the TTP. Moreover, former Pakistan Army Chief, General Aslam Beg; ex DG ISI, Lt. General Hameed Gul, who is believed to be the moving spirit behind Pakistani Taliban after retirement, and another former DG ISI Lt. General Asad Durrani have been disgraced after proven guilty by the Supreme Court of Pakistan (SCP) for their unwarranted actions of interference in the politics of the country specifically of clobbering alliance of Islamist parties of the country the Islamic Democratic Alliance to resist liberal-secular parties. All the above events took place in the year 2011. Whereas, in the preceding year former self-declared president General Musharraf fled into self-exile to evade arrest for staging a coup and abrogation of the constitution. It is also noteworthy that earlier in 1988 President General Ziaul Haq along with DG ISI General Akhtar Abdul Rahman, who was the architect of anti-Soviet Mujahideen resistance, with other senior generals of the military regime, got killed in a plane crash. All these instances and incidents could be used to clarify to the present military and intelligence officials
that the state can no longer tolerate illegal and unwarranted actions of its functionaries and even those who in the past got involved into illegal acts had to face the consequences.

7.5.1 Military’s Reluctance to Eliminate Extremists

A country cannot have a real rather any effective counterterrorism strategy until all the key state institutions act in unison. The role of executive, parliament, judiciary, military and civil-armed forces, is critical in any counterterrorism strategy. The critical and immediate role of the above-mentioned institutions has to be buttressed by other important public or private bodies like the media, educational institutions, research organizations, economic-finance and social welfare ministries and so on. A great problem with Pakistan counterterrorism strategy, if there has been any, that all the institutions have their selective conception of what constitute extremism-terrorism and the adoption of ways and means to counter both. Deep disagreements and chasms among main state institutions have not only been limited to the policy-planning area of counterterrorism but have been endemic in every sphere of policy-making. For instance, the civilian leadership would promise curbing religious militancy and preventing Pakistan soil from being used for terrorism in other countries, the military and ISI would keep in setting militant training camps for Islamist militant across the World to wage so-called Jihad in Kashmir and Afghanistan. (Haqqani, 2005: 275) On the other hand when the security forces were conducting operations against Red Mosque terrorists, most of the political parties and media disapprove of the action. These dichotomies and divisions within the state institutions have to be addressed.

7.6 COUNTER-EXTREMISM-TERRORISM THROUGH REFORMING EDUCATION SYSTEM

“Scholars of conflict agree that education is one of the few areas in which development policy can mitigate violence.” (Winthrop, 2010: 2) As this study finds that the dilapidated state of educational institutions both in terms of quality and quantity has been one of the contributing factors to the phenomenon of religious extremism and terrorism in Pakistan (for details see Chapter 5), therefore, reversely educational institutions can be very effectively used to counter the twin phenomenon provided the government has a comprehensive strategy in this regard.
Given the present condition of Pakistani educational institutions some progress has been made in terms of the manifold increase in the number of schools, colleges and universities and new courses. Some slight improvement could also be observed in infrastructure, the curricula and faculty standards primarily at public sector universities and privately-run schools. This has happened over the last one decade with the replacement of the obsolescent University Grants Commission with more modern-oriented Higher Education Commission and perceptible increase in government funding to the body and with the establishment of several commercially-run chains of English-medium chains of schools through private initiative. But the condition of publicly-run primary and secondary levels education particularly in rural areas could not be improved. Whereas, areas considered as sanctuaries of extremists like the FATA and parts of the KP and Balochistan any worthwhile educational infrastructure does not exist or is in a shambles. An inherent problem with the publicly-funded educational sector in Pakistan has been that even the increased budgetary allocation could not have an impact in improving the situation due to increasing population and widespread corruption. On the other hand the state still lacked the funds to provide standardized compulsory primary education to the entire population.

7.6.1 Investing in Education

Lack of finances has been a recurring problem with the public sector education in Pakistan and successive governments failed to devise a viable policy to deal with the issue. As an easy alternative to providing affordable primary education the regime of General Zia established cost-effective maktabs (mosque schools). The product of these hybrid seminaries was unfit for either religious or secular vocations. A large part of the zakat funds were allocated for madrassas and their asnads (certificates) were declared equivalent to college degrees and their holders qualified to become judges of Qazi courts. Thus for the first time in country’s history the state bestowed official recognition on madrassa network. The seminaries kept on receiving huge official patronage in the shape of funds and jobs and they got so strengthened that they turn into factories of radical youths. Many among the latter went to fight against the Soviets in Afghanistan, other to become Taliban and many to join Kashmir Mujahideen while many resorted to terrorism inside Pakistan. (Abbas 2005: 108)
Against this backdrop from the standpoint of countering religious extremism and terrorism in Pakistan it is important to have a complete overhauling of the whole primary education system. As this requires billion of dollars, which the state cannot afford given its military-security specific priorities the Western countries must provide the funding but not to be merely spent on the existing public sector education infrastructure. This would simply not work. So these countries as well as their controlled International Financial Institutions (IFIs) have also to devise a policy framework for re-establishing the primary education infrastructure of Pakistan. In this connection these countries and institutions have to hire the expertise of imminent Pakistani educationists, who have long experience of working in the federal and provincial education ministries and independent researchers. Such a policy once devised has to be forwarded to the Government of Pakistan and it should be asked by a consortium of donor countries that it has to follow it in letter and spirit if it needs the funds to be provided for the overhauling of the primary education system.

7.6.2 Public-Private Partnership in Education

If the Western countries and the IFIs, which the former control, cannot provide the required billions of dollars to lay the foundation of a completely new primary education system in Pakistan still there is an option. In Pakistan government-run primary education has huge and expensive physical infrastructure particularly buildings and land in each and every of the 107 districts of the country as well as seven tribal districts in the FATA. Mostly the buildings are in a dilapidated shape and the quality of teaching and courses is extremely poor. On the other hand privately-run schools are numerous and the quality of teaching and curricular far better than the public schools but mostly they have very limited physical infrastructure despite getting handsome profits in terms of tuition fee from their students.

Thus the government could sign a typical public-private partnership agreement with the owners of private schools that the former would provide the latter the physical infrastructure or the

---

222 This can be gauged from one example that teachers of the government schools mostly send their children to private so-called English-medium schools. In order to deal with this situation the government t of KP once placed a ban on government-run schools teachers to put their children in private schools but the policy backfired as these teachers refused to comply with the orders.
hardware and the latter would provide educational services (teaching, curricula, examination etc.) or the software at a nominal and fixed tuition fee which most of the parents could afford. If such an agreement is reached one hopes a new system of primary education could be established. In this way the several incompatible educational streams or standards could be put an end to which have been a source of conflict in the society. In particular these educational standards produce individuals with varying socioeconomic statuses and thus in turn have been source of extremism in the name of Islam. The outcome of the proposed public-private partnership would also be a unified primary education system with a single curricular, uniform pedagogy and examinations. This could go a long way in dismantling the madrassa system and distract the people from the so-called religious schools. Because the reading of Quran (Nazira) and learning Quran by heart (Hifz), and the imparting of students the education of Hadiths (Prophet Muhammad’s saying) and Usul-e-Fiqh (Principles of religious schools), the traditional domain and purpose of madrassas can be easily arranged in public-private schools. (ICG, 2002: 28) This would attract religious teachers to these schools and would bring them under government regulation and check. Even Maulana Samiul Haq, the head of the madrassa, which produced arguably the largest number of militants, Madrassa Haqqania, admits that if Islamic lessons are arranged in public schools, madrassa would vanish. He said:

No, no at all we don’t want madrassas under government control. To hand them over to the government means to give it a gun to kill all the madrassas. The US has earmarked substantial funds to throttle madrassas by bringing in courses, teachers and education system of its liking. Their aim is to make madrassas similar to institutions of liberal education. If the US and Pakistani governments are so concerned then why don’t they reform the mainstream education system of Pakistan, where even the system of worldly knowledge has gone to dogs. Otherwise, if you are so concerned about Islamic education, it should be part of the curricula of universities, colleges and public schools; madrassas would then cease to exist automatically.  

---

223 Interview with Maulana Sami-ul-Haq (Madrassa Haqqania, Akora Khattak, October 2003)
However, observers have pointed to the madrassa owners’ intransigence to allow reforms in the madrassa system on one pretext and another because it means dilution of their power and economic base. “Unfortunately when efforts are done to reform education Mullah raise voice against it and blame that the same is done to appease the US. This is non-sense.” 224

7.6.3 Making Education Purposeful

The situation at the Pakistani institutes of higher learning although has somewhat improved but there is widespread purposelessness among the academia and students, however. This is basically due to certain factors like the absence of any national discourse regarding agreement on key societal values and using educational institutions for achieving the same societal goals. In particular the educational institutions have not been used to evolve a democratic culture in the country, managing desirable social changes225 through reforming social institutions and making them compatible with the zeitgeist and above all countering the phenomenon of extremism and terrorism in the name of Islam. The teachers at the educational institutions mostly work there to have a source of income rather than having any national or social purpose to serve while extremely meagre emoluments these teachers get could not develop in them a sense of responsibility as they have to grapple with economic insecurity.

While there is widespread purposelessness among the liberal educational institutes as well as ordinary religious schools, the madrassas having a radical agenda have well-articulated purpose of dominating the society and the state through its graduates or Taliban and imposing a fundamentalist dispensation and doctrine over it.

224 Interview with Abdullah Jamaldini (Quetta, November 2005).

225 Some of these social changes could include transformation of authoritarian, despotic structures of governance into democratically-elected governance structures; achieving enhanced standards of living like increasing per capita income; sustaining high-levels of economic growth; achieving universal literacy rates and so on.
7.6.4 Building the Capacity of Educational Institutions

Now for making best use of the educational institutes to counter terrorism and militancy the government ought to build the capacity of the educational institutions on war footing. In this connection large-scale changes are required in the curricula particularly of schools, imparting special trainings to the teachers giving them result-oriented time-bound tasks. The fight against extremism from educational institutions as a short term objectives have to be launched from universities. For this universities have to be given complete independence of debate, discussion and research rather sponsoring such initiatives.

If at the policy making level it is ensured that the funding which is channelled to madrassas from foreign countries is diverted to the mainstream education system it would definitely go a long way in strengthening the public educational system. Moreover, it would help government better monitor and supervise the outside funding and increase budgetary allocation. Foreign funding to madrassas has a political aspect and an agenda is attached to it. It depends upon the policymakers to control and supervise foreign funding and to make best use of it elsewhere.

7.6.5 Imparting the Concept of The Jihad Holistically & Contextually

The state authorities must ensure through its supervisory and regulatory functions that the concept of *Jihad* should be taught at madrassas in its true sense and in totality along with contextual and contingent factors. It is only the emphasis only on Jihad in religious schools which creates the problem of incomprehension of the concept. Jihad is an inalienable part of Islamic faith and those who think that through modern education it can be scrapped are mistaken. These include both those who are against Jihad and those who have a mistaken understanding of the term. True education can help clarify the concept and how to make the best use of *Jihad* for the attainment of the welfare of the humanity. There is where the role of the educational institutions including madrassas, liberal schools, colleges and universities becomes vital.

7.6.6 Addressing the Madrassa Issue

The dismantling or dilution of the madrassa network through public-private partnership agreement is along term solution. In the shor run Pakistan has to seriously implement its long-drawn and promised reform of the madrassa system as part of its anti-terrorism actions in
fulfilment of UN Security Council Resolution 1373. In this connection there is need to bring more stringent laws under which registration of madrassas, dentification of financers, change in curricula should be made compulsory instead of laws like the Deeni Madaris (Voluntary Registration and Regulation) Ordinance 2002. The solution to the problem of militant and extremist madrassas is that the state has to exercise its writ over the madrassas operators and has to do away with its policy of considering them as strategic partners and assets. In order to ensure this all madrassas irrespective of sectarian links have to be taken immediately into government custody. It is sound to argue that not all the seminaries could have been involved in militancy but it can be safely said that most of the seminaries are being used as source of income by the cleric operators who manipulate sentiments and support terrorism in the name of Islam. This has to be put an end to. The federal and provincial ministries of education should appoint all the operators as government employees. Those who do not agree and try to create trouble should be dealt with an iron hand. Though the use of massive force by the state at Lal Masjid-Jamia Hafsa was undesirable but they have set up a precedent.

As this study finds that madrassas is only part of the whole problem of religious extremism and terrorism in Pakistan therefore, reforming madrassas only or in isolation would not achieve the desired results. In fact, the madrassa issue does not have a simplistic solution. As mentioned in the preceding chapter at the foundations of the process of emergence of thousands of militant madrassas has been political vacuum or crisis of policy and governance. Therefore, no radical change can be introduced in the processes in the ways madrassas influence the society and the state before making fundamental changes in the governance and policy arena (ICG, 2002: 29) In other words the policymaking and governance has to be made fully democratized and liberalized.

7.6.7 Plugging Political Vacuum through Education

Apart from plugging the political vacuum in the country on the strategic level by helping evolve a democratic culture, establishing democratic structures of governance and administration and putting in place a viable, compatible and responsive political system, the problem of political vacuum would have to be addressed by imparting truly liberal education to Pakistani masses. By
having more and more liberally educated people there would be considerable opportunities for society to comprehend the political processes, their importance and enabling participation in these processes.

7.7 COUNTERTERING EXTREMISM-TERRORISM THROUGH ECONOMIC MEASURES

In this dissertation it has also been found that lack of liberal economic institutions and policies in Pakistan have resulted in worst economic problems of Pakistan and that many individuals join militant and terrorist groups operating in the name of Islam due to their respective adverse economic situation. Thus to address the economic deprivation of the masses particularly in the remote and terrorist-infested regions of the FATA, the KP, South Punjab and Balochistan and to prevent their inhabitants from developing extremist religious tendencies and joining extremist-terrorist groups the country ought to formulate and pursue liberal economic policies. This could be one of the important strands of the national counter-extremism and counterterrorist strategy.

In this study it has also been discovered that the ruling elite economic interest have had compelled its members to perpetuate their power base, which in turn necessitated their connivance with the clerics to use Islam. Therefore, as long as the economic base of the ruling elite remains intact and checks are not placed on the newest part of the ruling elite—the clergy—now being referred to as religious elite, no counterstrategy could work. The best way to dislodge the economic base of the traditional ruling elite and that of the religious elite in the shape of mosque-madrassa nexus, is to work for the creation of genuine middle class in Pakistan. For this to be effective the foremost measure is land reforms by the state in which more than a specific size of land possessed by individuals or families should be forfeited by the state. (Saigol, 2009: 61) The wealth thus generated could be invested in productive activities and this would provide employment to a huge number of unemployed or underemployed people particularly youths which in turn could produce a strong middle class. “Once the feudal structures, in parts of Pakistan, are dismantled, it is hoped that larger numbers of the middle class would enter the legislative assemblies and make laws that do not just benefit one class.” (Saigol, 2009: 61) It is also necessary that military especially army generals and other high officials must not escape the state’s wealth redistribution measures as the institution on the one hand has transformed into a
key landowning body while on the other hand it has billions of dollars of stakes in the country’s corporate enterprises. (Siddiqa, 2007)

To effectively counter extremism in Pakistan economic and financial centralization has to be done away with and provincial and territorial economic rights in case of the FATA, Balochistan, the KP and the South Punjab and the Federally Administered Northern Areas (FANA) to be given on emergency basis. The case of the KP is particularly interesting. The KP has a claim of over Rs 500 billion ($ 5 billion) outstanding towards the federal government only in terms of unpaid net hydroelectric profits earned from the projects and dams constructed in the province. Provided this outstanding amount is paid to the KP it could go a long way in rebuilding the collapse provincial economy and could create employment opportunities that would suffice for the residents of the province as well as the adjoining FATA besides eliminating large-scale poverty, the two main contributory factors to the phenomenon of extremism and terrorism in Pakistan.

In order to adroitly address the issue of religious extremism and terrorism the financial sponsors of fundamentalists and terrorists need to be identified and curbs on their sources of income have to be placed to limit their capacity to fund extremism. The very reason that certain economic magnets and mafia groups have been financing Talibanization in Pakistan is that under Taliban or clerical governance structures, as was witnessed in Taliban era in Afghanistan, the former greatly benefit of illegal economic activities. In other words in Talibanization, which in other words means non-institutionalized administration and lack of state writ, economic mafia groups have a vested economic interest. In the light of this understanding de-Talibanization of the economy in the KP and the FATA needs to be carried out. This will require a commitment by the Pakistani government to stop the exploitation of religion for resource accumulation by clerical groups. It will also require commitment from Western governments and aid agencies to

Rubina Saigol has defined the phenomenon of Talibanization in this way: the increasing tendency to use a peculiar brand of religion, as the justification for conquest and control over territory, populations and resources, and the establishment of specific forms of judicial and social systems by the use of force. Unbridled violence, including gruesome murder, decapitation, lashing and cutting off of limbs and similar tactics, comprise a salient feature of these new phenomena. The creation of intense fear seems to underlie the formation of such social and political systems. Fear is engendered to maintain control and ensure compliance with the dictates of the leaders. (Saigol, 2009: 37)
help government of Pakistan in providing business and employment opportunities to its people especially in the backward areas.

7.8 EXPLOITING IDEOLOGICAL AND PHYSICAL SHORTCOMINGS OF TERRORIST GROUPS

According to De la Corte, “First, no individual or collective actor is really able to anticipate perfectly or realize *a posteriori* the complete sum of consequences that could be produced by their own actions. Therefore, many of the forecasts and assessments conducted by terrorists will not be completely accurate.” (De la Corte, 2006) This has been the very reason for the setting of unrealistic and over-exaggerated goals for themselves by groups like the TTP and the Punjabi Taliban, which consider that through isolated, albeit huge, terrorist attacks they could bring down the whole state edifice and win supporters and terrorize the opponents across Pakistan eventually to impose their own system on the state and society.

Pakistan counterterrorism policy and counterterrorism authorities must keep ideological and physical shortcomings like these of the terrorist groups into consideration while dealing with them. For instance, terrorist often justify their activities by citing fatwas. “*Fatwas* means getting the counsel of Shariah. For this no centralized system is needed.”227

However, the authenticity of the fatwas could be questioned by using the explanation of revered Islamic authorities.

Unfortunately, in our society a strange culture of issuing and soliciting *fatwas* has evolved at the official level. But all fatwas issued by some unknown clerics residing in remote areas which call upon the Muslims to kill foreigners to avenge the killing of the Muslims anywhere in the World are illegal. These are neither *fatwas* nor they have any association with Shariah. If some foreigner comes to your country, his or her safety is mandatory on a Muslim state and all its citizens. If someone attacks a foreigner, it is akin to treason. 228

---

227 Interview with Mufti Ghulamur Rahman (Peshawar, October 2005)

228 Interview with Mufti Ghulamur Rahman (Peshawar, October 2005)
The above-mentioned statements from Islamic scholars could go a long way in outwitting extremism and terrorism using the name of Islam.

The authorities must understand that as more and more time would elapse without the terrorist groups able to achieve what it is vowing to attain, they would lose support of the followers. This would also create disenchantment among the members of the terrorist groups and gradually the process of decay would set in culminating into the vanishing of these outfits. However, this may not happen automatically; Pakistani counterterrorism authorities would have to catalyze the process. One important strategy in this regard could be to launch an articulated and intelligible counterterrorism and counterinsurgency propaganda.

Sometimes terrorists cannot calculate the negative public reaction which their brutal and lethal attacks might generate particularly among the actual or potential supporters. There are chances they may underestimate the reaction. (Bandura, 2003) The attacks by the TTP, the LI, the Punjabi Taliban and other have created large-scale hatred for them among Pakistanis. This needs to be managed and exploited by the counterterrorism authorities of Pakistan. The authorities must launch counterterrorist propaganda to increase this hatred especially by amplifying the negative impact of the brutal terrorist acts. This can be done by showing the gory scenes which terrorist attacks produced through visual media. Stories of the agonies of the family members of those who got killed or maimed in these terrorist attacks must be repeatedly shown through media. Efforts must be done to portray the perpetrators of violence as inhumane.

7.9 COUNTERTERRORISM THROUGH CULTURE AND BEHAVIOUR CHANGE INITIATIVES

In this study it has been found that the existing tribal structure in the FATA with deeply sentimental Islamic social attitudes and ultraconservative worldview have had provided inviting conditions for the militant clerics to come and have sway in the FATA. Yet another important change which the tribal structure has experienced under militant-clerical commanders is the alliance among various tribal clerics. The TTP has been its biggest manifestation. The backwardness of the tribal society with a large number of idle youths, who already were expert
in the use of guns due to the training they have had of using arms as part of their socialization process, made them as perfect recruits for the religious extremist and militant groups. Militant leaders like Baitullah Mahsud made various sub-tribes to contribute fighters by exploiting the conditions there. For the tribal youths clerical militancy called euphemistically by its perpetrators *Jihad* at least bring some change in the listless and routine tribal life. So chang in the FATA social structure is extremely important.

The foremost measure in diluting the tribal structure is to have such physical and social structures in place in FATA that could effectively lead the process of social change there. These physical and social structures could take root and thrive only in a conducive environment. Since no such environment exists there, it has to be introduced from without. This could most effectively be done by establishing as many cities as possible in the tribal belt of Pakistan, which could go a long way in changing the sociopsychological make-up of the inhabitants of the region.

To begin with, four sizable cities could suffice. These cities should have well-laid infrastructure and well-protected and delimited boundaries in order to effect change in tribal areas rather than getting tribalised reversely, as has happened to many areas of the KP. The foundations of these proposed cities in tribal areas obviously could not be laid immediately on industries due to logistical problems and inexisten industrial infrastructure there. But these cities could be made fully functional and economically viable by letting the services sectors thrive. For instance, the services of education, transport, construction, telecommunication, health and media could be instrumental in raising and sustaining these cities. The growth of services sector instead of industries could save the crucial time available for developing the FATA. Already rudimentary service sector exists across the FATA and the need is to build on it and fashioned it on modern lines.

The gradual development of these sectors would make the cities self-sustaining. The newly established mega towns would definitely draw educated, skillful people from not only FATA but also from outside. Thus within these cities and towns would evolve a work and need-based professional environment. Such a social milieu due to its outright impersonal and individualistic nature directly challenges the deeply personalized and collectivist tribal social structure.
This may sound strange that people from outside or from other parts of FATA would come to a particular tribal area for purely professional engagements. But we have the example of Darra Adam Khel, the town well-known for its crude arms industry. When production of arms was in full swing, most of the workmen and craftsmen working there were from outside the tribal areas including Karachi and Punjab. Moreover, by virtue of being a big arms market, Darra used to be frequented by visitors from all over Pakistan. Even the master craftsmen of Darra on occasions got contracts from Hollywood companies for providing copies of old type of guns to be used in shooting of films. However, official Pakistani planners could not foresee to capitalise on this potential of the town to make it as a symbol of development in the whole tribal region.

By bringing together the educated and skillful professionals, the proposed new cities could initiate the much-needed social change in the FATA that has to culminate in transforming the social complexion of the tribesmen and women. This change could be changed rather snowballed by helping evolve social institutions of modern family, liberal education, non-subsistence market economy, secular political affiliations and above all by the non-tribal religious institutions.

Obviously, in the would-be cities in FATA, with professional, non-agrarian and somewhat urban environment the families, which would take up residence in these cities, would have no other choice but to sever their tribal links and bonds to survive in the new social settings. Overthrowing the tribal identities and bonds indeed would be indispensable for the families to be functional in the new settings of a city. This foundation of a new family that is nuclear in structure having parent and their children or at the most grandparents could be laid. If the new cities in FATA and their planners and governors are able to manage the situation a large number of such tribal families could be implanted in these proposed cities.

Consequently, children from the FATA undergoing their socialization in a non-tribal and hence non-violent and tolerant milieu would be broadminded in approach and modern in outlook besides having tolerant social behaviour. This would significantly curtail the level of extremism in the tribal society, which by that time expectedly would no longer be a tribal one. “[Already]
the people in Northern FATA are more pliant because they have dealings with Peshawar [the main urban centre in the entire KP and FATA].” 229

7.10 COUNTERING EXTREMISM-TERRORISM THROUGH PSYCHOLOGICAL INTERVENTIONS

The nature and dynamics of extremism and terrorism in the name of Islam are such that the phenomena could only be effectively countered by a collective response. Once the aggressor is convinced that he is directly going to face the consequences it could create a balance of terror. This balance has got greatly disturbed due to various factors.

Regarding solution Aly Ahmed said:

We should try to listen to the main causes of terrorists, their difficulties and maybe there is some psychological planning to understand and guide them but not without threat. Psychologists never believe in negative reinforcement i.e. punishment but only mild punishments. Through conversation, counselling one can refocus their attention from this kind of behaviour. Moreover, as terrorism may be defined as a maladjusted behaviour and it is the result of unmitigated stress, there is a need to lessen this stress and psychologists have a big role in the same. One way in our society is to lessen stress is to provide playgrounds and open fields without them the pent up emotions of people cannot find peaceful and socially approved and harmless outlets. Mind you [Sigmund] Freud termed violence as innate and instinctual. So there is a psychological technique sublimation which means to provide some physical, academic activities so they could satisfy their basic, original motive. This not only would lessen terrorism but sexual assault too, which is a kind of violence. 230

229 Interview with Rustam Shah Mohmand (Peshawar, March 2006)

230 Interview with Dr Aly Ahmed (Peshawar, October, 2008)
Yet another way of countering frustration of extremists and terrorists is through the process called displacement, which means redirection of aggression to a target other than the source of the frustration. Generally the new target is a safer or more socially acceptable target.

For rectification of the situation the foremost effort could be to address the roots of frustration and to initiate massive social and economic development initiatives by the government, the US and Western countries. While on the psychological side there is a need of wide-range societal level, government initiated psychological planning to tame this violent behaviour by very clearly putting the message across that the kind of aimless violence the terrorists subscribe to is futile.

In order to have an insight of the psychological condition of the terrorists a full-fledge governmental effort must be launched to study their minds.

**7.10.1 Psychological Reintegration of Terrorists in Society**

Mental reintegration of terrorists and extremists is a critical part of any de-radicalization strategy. This reintegration can be effective if the psychological support terrorists have for each other could be weakened and ultimately diluted. As far as psychological association of terrorists is concerned following is important to note.

Terrorists can confide in and trust only each other. The nature of their commitment cuts them off from society; they inhabit a closed community that is forsaken only at great cost. Isolation and the perception of a hostile environment intensify shared belief and commitment and make faith in the cause imperative. (Crenshaw, 1981: 393)

“A pattern of mutual reassurance, solidarity, and comradeship develops, in which the members of the group reinforce each other's self-righteousness, image of a hostile world, and sense of mission. Because of the real danger terrorists confront, the strain they live under, and the moral conflicts they undergo, they value solidarity highly.” (Gray, 1970)
Therefore, the counterterrorism strategy should focus on reintegrating the terrorists in the society and this could be one of the most effective de-radicalization programmes. Unless the terrorists are psychologically convinced that the society would accept them back into its fold there would be minimal chances of their giving up violent and socially-destructive behaviour. The nature of religious terrorism in Pakistan is such that those youth who have joined the terrorist groups not only have put their lives at stake but for them the reward for their sacrifices is not only worldly but heavenly. In other words if Pakistani religious terrorists are unable or uncertain of getting their worldly goals they are confident enough that they would be rewarded in the Hereafter. This state of mind distinguishes them from ordinary terrorists who mostly aim at purely political goals which are entirely worldly in scope.

On the other hand Pakistan’s overall counterterrorism policy and the de-radicalization strategies within this policy must focus on making the terrorist believe that the perception they have that the environment is hostile towards them is far from reality. They must be convinced that the society does not have any hatred regarding their persons or personalities but loath only that part of their behaviour that has inflicted unimaginable miseries and violence on the people. So if they give up that behaviour they could be accepted back as normal members of the society. This make-believe de-radicalization strategy could fully be targeted at the arrested terrorists but at the same time media could be used for delivering the messages to the actual as well as to potential terrorists.

7.10.2 Overcoming Psychological Gelling Agents of Terrorists before Physical Elimination

The psychological processes within the terrorist group primarily the interplay of dedication, danger, group solidarity, fidelity, remorse and isolation prevent the terrorists from giving up violence. The terrorists are reluctant to shun terrorism even if the objective conditions in which terrorist operate change and they have other options to weigh. However, through psychological interventions the above-mentioned gelling agents of terrorists could be weakened. Nevertheless, terrorism persists until the terrorist group is physically eliminated. This is the fundamental reality which Pakistan counterterrorism strategists must understand. Therefore, no amount of
negotiations, appeasement towards groups like the TTP, the Al Qaeda, the TNSM, the Punjabi Taliban and other so-called Jihadist groups could convince them to give up terrorism. Instead these tools would result in the surrendering of more and more state territory to these outfits where they would create their fiefdoms euphemistically called *Islamic Emirates*. The tools of negotiations and appeasement should only be used to drive wedges within the religious terrorist groups and to isolate non-committed members of the terrorist outfits.

7.11 DEALING WITH NON-HIERARCHICAL CHARACTER OF PAK TERRORIST GROUP

The terrorist organizations are basically of two types. The one is relatively hierarchical and the other is hierarchical merely in name and has decentralized command and control structure. (De la Corte, 2006) Groups falling into the second type operate almost autonomously. Pakistani religious terrorist groups like the TTP can be put into the second category. Likewise the Punjabi Taliban, the LI and TNSM are also of the same type. The terrorist organizations of the second type are very difficult to eliminate and dealing with them is a real problem for the counterterrorism authorities and the security apparatus of the state to deal with these organizations. Pakistani authorities have also been facing such problems. The problem aggravated due to the support to these extremist and terrorist groups initially from the military-intelligence complex and afterwards from elements within it. However, if Pakistani political leadership and civilian authorities have ultimately to deal with the problem of devolved religious extremist groups, they ought to improve the intelligence mechanism to track the commanders of these groups and their source(s) of finances. Only after identification of the leadership and finances then they could be rooted out.

7.12 OUTWITTING EXTREMISTS-TERRORISTS THROUGH EXACT AND HOLISTIC EXEGESIS OF ISLAMIC SCRIPTURE

The most effective way to counter extremism and terrorism in the name of Islam is to argue against the beliefs and mistaken interpretation of holy texts of Islam by the fundamentalists and terrorists through exact and contextualized exegesis of the Holy Quran and *Ahadits* besides other religious books and written material. This can best be done by having a holistic interpretation of
the Islamic scripture. An important aspect of the beliefs and interpretation of holy texts by radicals and terrorists, operating in the name of Islam in Pakistan, is their de-contextualized understanding and interpretation of the scripture. This is due to the selective interpretation of the Quran and \textit{Ahadits} based on taking out and emphasizing only on that part of the text, which suits the agenda and interest of extremists groups and individuals. Countering extremists and terrorists through arguing against their beliefs and interpretation of scripture by using Islamic texts instead of any western concepts and theories could be most effective given the social and national character of Pakistanis, which is highly sentimental regarding Islam. Majority of Pakistanis have a history of believing whatever the extremists and terrorists have presented them with as \textit{Islamic} or \textit{Jihadist}. There are examples in history that a liberal and contextualized interpretation of Islam in the regions comprising Pakistan has had a huge impact in transforming the violent character as well as the fundamentalist religious attitudes, which narrow and de-contextualized interpretation of Islamic texts cultivated in the people. One noteworthy example is of the Khudai Khidmatgar or Red Shirt Movement led by great Pakhtoon politician and social reformer Abdul Ghaffar Khan. Khan did large-scale reinterpretation or liberal interpretation of many Islamic concepts contained in the scripture, which greatly changed the social and political lives and worldview of Pakhtoons (Johansen, 1997: 65-66). “Khan's interpretation of [Islamic faith] was so universal that instead of separating the Muslims from the rest of the world, he tried to make them so that they could cooperate with their fellow-men for the good of all.” (Edib, 1937: 338) Edib further argued that the Khan's “supreme importance lies in his having brought the simplest and truest conception of Islam into the lives of a most elemental people.” (Edib, 1937: 338) Therefore, there is a large scope that Pakistanis would believe if presented with the exact, holistic and contextualized interpretation of Islamic scripture and Muslim history. It this exegesis would be part of the central national discourse and would be led by genuine \textit{Ulema} with the state and society at their backing, there would be a huge potential of success of this strategy.

To tackle this (religious extremism), Pakistan must devise ways to lessen the power and influence of religious extremists in the country and support genuine Islamic scholarship as a counter. Most of Islam is very simple to understand and therefore, needs little interpretation. Mullah scholarship, as it has turned out to be,
moves from the broad to the narrow, emphasizing the arcane over the easily intelligible. By its very nature, therefore, it just resides in narrow crevices and attempt to broaden them into irreconcilable differences. It is in finding and defining such differences that mullah scholarship. As distinct from that of the Sufi (mystic) or a true alim (scholar), gains approval of the multitude, whose gasp with wonder as they are initiated into the intricate world of hairsplitting. The narrow intellectualism of the mullah can only be divisive, exclusive, and intolerant of those whom it excludes, and is antithetical to all that is eclectic and harmonizing. (Abbas, 2005: 240)

An important aspect of this strategy must be to tell the people at large in particular supporters of religious extremists and terrorists as well as the radicals themselves that madrassas, which train their students into militant skills, have nothing to do with Islam as the seminaries are fundamentally meant to impart religious education and to come up with interpretation of questions that emerge due to changing conditions by carrying out research on Islamic texts and Muslim history and nothing else.

The traditional aim of the madrassa was forming a pure society. In Prophet's (SAW) age, the madrassa played its role in the economic, agricultural and diplomatic affairs of the Islamic state through research of the scholars residing within it. In fact the madrassah is solely a place of research and directly has no role in Jihad. 231

The exact interpretation and contextualized exegesis of the concept of Jihad is also very important because the extremists and terrorist justify their self-concieved violence as Jihad.

Jihad is the way to defend Islamic way of life and Muslim territory. The Western understanding of Jihad is biased. I ask whether there would be no one in the US or Britain who would take up arms to defend their motherland if they are attacked? It is unfortunate that in the West madrassa is equated with terrorism but not the Jihad; it is a basic mistake not to make a distinction between the two. Terrorism is

haram (forbidden) in Islam while Jihad is an obligation. Terrorism is an attempt of creating violence and panic in society. In Islam, a Muslim is not allowed even to bruise a non-Muslim or to do him any injustice.\textsuperscript{232}

\textbf{7.13 CARRYING OUT DERADICALIZATION}

In the preceding paragraphs some strategies for deradicalization have been suggested but deradicalization needs to be understood fully and separately in the context of Pakistan. An important rather core component of a counterterrorism policy is the strategy of de-radicalization. De-radicalization is the process of weaning away an extremist outfit from employing violence to attain political objectives. Many strategies of de-radicalization emphasize on having a grasp of the individual or group mental state or psychology as well changing that state of mind through offering incentives in order to enable them to lead a normal life and behave non-violently. There is inconclusive evidence whether offering incentives can be effectual or not. Incentives are most likely to win the most least committed members of the radical groups first leaving the group only with ultra-extremists members. (Bueno De Mesquita, 2008) Any deradicalization programme would only succeed if the country leadership and authorities realize that terrorists are not aliens; “they are our youth. We cannot dismiss them as enemies, except in a short-range approach. In the long range, if we want to stop terrorism, we must understand terrorists.” (Ferracuit, 1982: 140)

Keeping in view the nature of Pakistani radical groups and individual psychologies of terrorists generally it can be concluded that both the leadership and commanders comprise hardcore terrorists. For instance, none of the TTP main commanders have surrendered to the government by late 2012 after five years of existence of the group despite of continual military operations and the US predator drones attacks as well as financial pressures on the insurgents. Despite apparent busting of his terrorist network by Pakistani security forces Maulana Fazlullah, the

\textsuperscript{232} Interview with Mufti Ghulam-ur-Rahman (Peshawar, August 2004)
leader of the TTP Chapter in Swat, could not be captured or killed and after three years on-the-run he regrouped his militants and restarted staging attacks while vowing to make a comeback. As far as the ordinary members of Pakistani radical groups are concerned most of them have been diehard extremists as is evident from no significant defections from the files of the extremist groups. This has been primarily due to the fear of the ultra-radical commanders who have been using tactics like sending suicide bombers and beheading to eliminate enemies as well as deserters. On the other hand there have been no worthwhile incentives from the government and the military authorities to the members of the radical groups to lead a normal life sans one project of de-radicalizing of imparting vocational training by the military to the captured militants of the TTP in Swat. Otherwise, incentives could have gone a long way in de-radicalizing militant youths. For instance, the strategy of incentive was vividly seemed to be working during the height of Red Mosque crisis. During the crisis tens of terrorists and hundreds of male and female radicalized students of the madrassas started a pitch-battle. In the meanwhile the authorities announced that those who would voluntarily come out of the madrassas would not be harmed and would be set free. Resultantly, hundreds of students and even their head Ghazi Abdul Aziz while shrouding himself in a woman’s veil, reportedly after striking a deal with the authorities, came out. Authorities convinced Aziz and hundreds of students were convinced to renounce militancy through incentives which rendered the Red Mosque radicals a core group of extremists which were eliminated through military action. These included the younger brother of Maulana Aziz, named Ghazi Abdul Rasheed, who refused the incentive. Keeping this in view, there is a need for Pakistani government to have a full-fledge incentive scheme in the light of the understanding of the individual and group psychology of the extremists and terrorists. This can be done by conducting thorough profile analysis of the commanders and whatever information available or could be gleaned regarding members of the religious extremist groups.

7.14 TAKING ADVANTAGE OF STUDIES ON DE-RADICALIZATION

There are some significant studies on de-radicalization of Muslim fundamentalists like the one by (Ashour, 2010). Ashour studied the militant Islamist groups of Egypt and Algeria since the
The purpose of the study was to explore the common factors in both the countries contributing to de-radicalization. The studies expound on several de-radicalization strategies and programmes in Egypt and Algeria and discovered four factors that were instrumental in successful de-radicalization. These factors were: successful leadership, effective state repression, positive external social interactions, and incentives.

**The study The De-Radicalization of Jihadists** identifies the following four independent variables, which explain the initiation and success of the de-radicalization process:

**Leadership:** The religious/spiritual leaders, as opposed to the radical organization leaders, play a crucial role in bestowing legitimacy on de-radicalization. Without a charismatic leadership that controls or strongly influences its followers, the initiation as well as the success of a de-radicalization process is less likely. And, in the case not led by a charismatic leadership, the unsuccessful attempts were followed by fractionalization, splintering, and internal violence.

**State Repression:** Although on one hand, it is a primary cause of radicalization. But on the other hand intense and sustained repression was one factor that led the leadership of armed organizations to rethink the costs of violence.

**External social interaction:** If permitted and is successful, such interaction may positively affect the worldviews of the leadership of the militant outfits going a long way in de-radicalization of these groups.

**Inducements:** The use of incentives to attract the attention of members of the militant organizations can bolster the say and status of those members who support de-radicalization and oppress those who are not.

The findings of Ashour’s study are quite relevant with secular leadership in Pakistan which in its own way has been suffering from violence of Muslim fundamentalists and terrorists. In Pakistan any effective de-radicalization policy could not be formulated let alone implemented because of the absence of any successful leadership both civil and military. This was the result of long-existing political vacuum in the country.

As far as religious leaders support to de-radicalization programme in Pakistan is concerned there has been no such large-scale programme designed by the secular leadership for which religious leaders support could be solicited. The government only has been calling on religious scholars to
condemn terrorist attacks and suicide strikes and termed them *un-Islamic*. In this connection on a few occasions *Ulema* conventions were also organized by the government in which some of the religious leaders mostly from the *sufi* Barelvi sect declared terrorist attacks against the teachings of Islam. However, those belonging to the Deobandi and Wahabi sect as well as the revivalist Jamaat-e-Islami did not collectively declared so. A few of those from these sects and groups, who individually termed terrorist attacks *un-Islamic* did it in the face of severe opposition from their own parties and sects. One of the most influential Deobandi scholars, Maulana Hassan Jan, from the the JUI-F was even brutally killed by ‘unknown’ killers for his very daring stand against suicide attacks whereas another Javed Ghamdi, a renegade of the JI, has to go into exile after receiving threats from the extremists.

In Pakistan state repression has never been the cause of radicalization in the name of Islam instead it has been the state patronage of the process of radicalization and Islamist groups and social and political engineering in this regard for the attainment of military-civilian-intelligence plus pseudo-political ruling elite dictated and articulated state foreign and domestic policy goals, which have been the key causes of the rise and proliferation of religious extremism and terrorism in Pakistan. Positive external social interaction of the terrorists and Islamist extremist has not taken place in Pakistan. The foremost reason for this has been that most of the Islamist terrorist groups, whether national or international, come to base themselves in the FATA, which not only have close social structure but also are located so remotely that radicals, who have been based there cannot have positive external social interaction that could change their worldviews. There they have been living in ossified conditions and always looking towards the past instead the future.

Pakistani authorities have totally failed to offer any inducements to the radicals to wean them away from their ideology and dissuade them from their activities. The only inducement Pakistani authorities have offered to the militants and terrorists in the tribal areas, is compensation for the losses of their life and property in military operations after entering into peace deals. However, these peace deals did not achieve or even initiate a process of de-radicalization and instead have ceded territory to the fundamentalists and terrorists. (Rana A., 2009: 21)

This study has also discovered that in Pakistan a true liberal-democratic culture could not thrive. The lack of such a culture has also largely prevented the liberal and anti-extremist elements to
ideologically and ideationally counter religious extremists. Ideological and ideational counter-extremist discourse could otherwise prove to be the most effective counter-radicalization strategy in the context of Pakistan (discussed elsewhere in this chapter).

**Ascertainment of Causes of Mullah’s Appeal:** To develop a strategy to counter extremists and terrorists through the exact interpretation and exegesis of religious texts sufficient homework is required by the strategists to know the specific causes of the attraction of mullah’s message. In Pakistan a good part of the people have got attracted to the chicanery and demagogy of the mullahs and extremist terrorist groups as the latter pledge them individual and social justice once Shariah is enforced in the country or some particular part of it. The counterterrorism strategy in this light should try to prove this view of the mullah wrong.

**Religious Only In Name:** As mentioned in Chapter 5, Berrebi (2009), in his review of the theory of ‘religion as a motivation ideology for political violence’, discovered that:

> Dealing with religious terrorism can be confusing, since it is difficult to know whether terrorist organizations, which on the face of it are considered religious, are using religion to attract an audience while primarily motivated by secular goals. Further confusing to the outside observer is when political goals are claimed by terrorist organizations in the name of religion, despite the fact that religion was not at the source of these claims.

This study has its own findings on the basis of which it is argued that the above-mentioned conclusion by Berrebi is profoundly relevant to the phenomenon of terrorism in the name of Islam in Pakistan. It has been discovered in this dissertation that the perpetrators have used Islam to attract recruits and followers and to gain sympathy of masses. Otherwise the terrorists operating in the name of Islam have completely secular goals of capturing the state power by overthrowing the existing state structure and eliminating its human operators.

These aims and objectives of the Pakistan terrorist groups need to be understood by the country’s civil and military leadership and above all society’s religious leadership. Only in this way an elaborate, effective and meaningful counterterrorism strategy in the country could be devised.
Specifically in this manner the military and religious leadership, which is largely believed to have been supporting religious extremists and militant groups, could be educated that they cannot use the latter for the attainment of their respective institutional interest because the extremists and terrorists have their own objectives which could only be achieved by ultimately replacing the existing institutions and power configuration within the state and society.

7.14 COUNTERING TERRORISM THROUGH EMPLOYING MEDIA

Whether it is plugging the political vacuum by promoting democratization and politicization, countering extremism and terrorism through reforming education, taking economic measures, initiating through cultural and behavioural change programmes, the role of media especially electronic media is critical. Media could stimulate these multifarious countering extremism and terrorism processes and initiatives. In this respect the following powerful aspects of the media could be instrumental: the extensive reach of media by overcoming the physical bars of time and space; pervasiveness of media messages and consequent unrivalled role of media in informally educating the communities and society by disseminating awareness and knowledge across the board and above all the inherent traditional liberal character of media as well as that of contemporary Pakistani media. The powerful Pakistani media could be greatly used to counter religious extremism and terrorism by doing the exact and contextual interpretation and exegesis of the Quran and other Islamic texts. This could go a long way in meaningfully engage and counter-argue the extremists and terrorists operating in the name of Islam and their interpretation of Islamic scripture.

Moreover, “through its reflection and ‘construction of social reality’, media has a cardinal role in justifying’ the cause of the terrorists and their tactics and winning for them followers or antagonists.” (Sultan & Khan, 2010: 1). Media and terrorism have a symbiotic relationship. Several experts and observers are of the view that Pakistani extremist and terrorist groups are greatly conscious of the importance of media for their cause. In this connection they cite the examples of a number of print publication many militant organizations have been publishing since long and the intimate relationship of the TTP commanders with media representatives. Grabbing attention is critical for extremists and terrorists; therefore, even they resort to
committing and staging such acts and events which would lead to media coverage. (Sultan & Khan, 2010) So from counterterrorism point of view this is very important to understand.

From the counterterrorism perspective the intimate relationship of media and terrorism ought to be understood in order to enable the authorities to neutralize and mitigate the threat. Terrorist outfits bank upon media to constantly increase its support base. Knowingly or unbeknownst media fulfils and facilitate various functions for terrorists. The foremost function is to publicize the cause of ‘Jihad’, a sugar-coated term of terrorist to justify their unabashed violence. Through dissemination the messages from the terrorists and by inculcating beliefs, agenda and doctrines of the terrorist groups’ media provide the terrorist outfits the greatest opportunity to recruit members, supporters and sympathizers. Recruitment is indispensable for the survival of a terrorist group. Propaganda maintains the morale of the terrorists and the leadership. (Gunaratna, 2008) In a nutshell publicity is the fuel used by the terrorists to exercise control over the population. Without politicizing, radicalizing and mobilizing the support base, terrorists will fail to raise funds. Without communicating its message, a terrorist group cannot generate support. “In addition to using its own media mechanisms, tapping into the wider mass media is essential for a terrorist group to communicate to its actual and potential support base. The active engagement of the media by the terrorist group is paramount for its survival.” (Gunaratna, 2008)

According to Aly Ahmed:

The extremists and terrorists should be portrayed in especially produced movies and dramas in such a manner as they do not get away flouting the law and instead shown duly punished for their misdeeds. The point is that the terrorists should not become the role models. 233

The most important aspect of countering extremism especially through information media is that media men and owners must realize their ‘social responsibility.’ The social responsibility theory of state-media relationship contends the media ought to use their editorial discretion not to give any information which help extremists disseminate their message, won sympathizers and in any way intimidate society. Moreover, even when the extremist point of view is presented on the

---

233 Interview with Dr. Aly Ahmed (Peshawar, October, 2008)
media the radicals should be engaged in a meaningful dialogue that how can they legitimize their illegal tactics. The dialogue with the extremists should be conducted within a legal and liberal context. However, for this the media has to be capacitated to itself realize extremism and terrorism as critical threats that are so huge that the government alone cannot tackle and defeat them. So the media organizations and personnel instead of remaining neutral must become part of the state and societal efforts to manage the threats. “As every terrorist attack generates severe damage to society, media must play a role to build a norm and an ethic against violence and extremism.” (Gunaratna, 2008)

While covering terrorist and extremist events and incidents the media must ensure the information is verified from different ‘credible’ sources. On the state level the authorities ought to provide security to the local correspondents, prevent unauthorized use of the FM frequencies and immediately close such radio stations, which are radicalizing the society. If physical locating of extremist-terrorist FM radio channels is not possible their frequencies could be jammed. The government also has to sponsor a full-fledge and elaborate media strategy to counter extremism only after it is duly prepared by experts and thoroughly debated by the Parliament.

7.15 COUNTERTERRORISM THROUGH MILITARY AND POLICE OPERATIONS

Despite incorporating all the above strands in the state’s counterterrorism policy extremism and terrorism in Pakistan cannot be effectively eliminated without military operations and police actions against the terrorists and insurgents. However, years of apparently full-scale but actually half-hearted military operations could not counter the threat. The foremost reason for the failure has been that the country has not had any holistic counterterrorism and counter-extremism policy or even an institution for the purpose. Secondly, the military operations and the policy action also failed to relatively blunt the terrorist outfits. One important reason has been that the authorities concerned did not take into consideration the following lessons learnt from other countries. Like any security threat there are three main counter strategies that of deterrence, preemption, and retaliation. However, extremism and terrorism pose a more critical threat to the state and societal security but tools of deterrence, preemption and retaliation take on new forms while applying to counter terrorist threat. Pakistan security forces trained in conventional warfare
and police trained for dealing with ordinary crimes could not understand the meaning of terrorism, extremism, their dynamics and the activities of the perpetrators. It is important to understand that the concept of deterrence rests on rationality as the matter is state to state in nature. However, rationality cannot be applied to non-state actors particularly those using suicide tactics. Similarly, it is very difficult to deter an enemy whose strategy is to let the violence escalate. Moreover, it equally difficult to specify who was behind a given incident as well as identifying the terrorist bases. Terrorists change location frequently making the work of intelligence operatives extremely difficult. Another important strategy of the terrorists is that they easily dilute themselves in the thickly-populated urban areas in order to precipitate government action which results in civilian deaths and thus contribute to the cause of the terrorists of making the counter operations unpopular. (Simon 1987: 112)

In Pakistan the security forces have been found to be lacking knowledge regarding all the above mentioned aspects of terrorism. So in order to increase the capacity of the counterinsurgency authorities and forces they need to be educated regarding these aspects of counterterrorism and counterinsurgency.

The twin phenomena and menace of extremism and terrorism poses existential threat to the survival of Pakistan, therefore, every effort should be made to counter and quarantine the threat because the World, the region and Pakistanis cannot afford the dilution of Pakistan or the falling of the state into the hands of the extremists and terrorists operating in the name of Islam. In such an eventuality it would, as foresaw by the most experienced outside observer and expert on Pakistan, Stephen Cohen, ‘be a multidimensional geostrategic calamity, generating enormous uncertainties’, but ‘it is simply too big and potentially too dangerous for the international community to allow it simply to fail’ (Cohen, 2002: 109, 118 as quoted in Gregory & Fair, 2008: 3-9)
References


Ibbeston, D. ((1970 rept. 1883) (orig. 1916)). *Ibbetson, Denzil, Punjab Castes (being a reprint of the chapter on ‘Races, Castes and Tribes of the People in the Census of 1881’)*. Delhi: Cosmo Publications.


Khan, I. (2008, May 14). Professor of International Relations and Head of FATA Research Cell, University of Peshawar, Pakistan. (Researcher, Interviewer)


Mohmand, G. S. (2008, May 14). Former president Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa Chamber of Commerce & Industries and industrialist belonging to FATA. (Researcher, Interviewer)


