The Relationship between the Public and Print Media Agendas on National Issues in Pakistan

(A Study of the Agenda Setting Role of Print Media in Pakistan)

SAQIB RIAZ
Roll No. Q- 864885

Allama Iqbal Open University
Islamabad
2008
The Relationship between the Public and Print Media Agendas on National Issues in Pakistan

(A Study of the Agenda Setting Role of Print Media in Pakistan)

SAQIB RIAZ
Roll No. Q- 864885

Submitted as fulfillment of the requirements for the Doctor of Philosophy degree in Mass Communication At the Faculty of Social Sciences and Humanities, Allama Iqbal Open University, Islamabad

Supervisor:
Prof. Dr. Miskeen Ali Hijazi
Former Chairman,
Department of Mass Communication, Punjab University,
Lahore, Pakistan

October 2008
Dedication

To my beloved parents

May Almighty Allah live them long and happy
SUPERVISOR’S STATEMENT

This is certified that the work contained in this thesis entitled:

“The Relationship between the Public and Print Media Agendas on National Issues in Pakistan”

(A Study of the Agenda Setting Role of Print Media in Pakistan)

has been carried out under my supervision by Mr. Saqib Riaz and is approved for submission in fulfillment of the requirement for the award of the degree of PhD in Mass Communication.

Prof. Dr. Miskeen Ali Hijazi
Supervisor

October 10th 2008
ABSTRACT

We are living in a media-driven world where we all are influenced by the media messages. Media play an important role in setting the agenda of the public. The agenda setting role of media has been recognized worldwide and a number of research studies have been conducted all over the world to investigate this role of media. Perhaps this study is the first ever research to investigate the agenda setting role of media in Pakistan.

This research project was based on the content analysis as well as survey research. Media agenda was measured through content analysis of the two major national newspapers of the country. The daily Dawn and the daily Jang were selected for the content analysis because the earlier one is the largest widely circulated English newspaper and the later one is the largest widely circulated Urdu newspaper of the country. Six most important issues were identified for the content analysis including the issues of terrorism, Indo-Pak relations, energy crisis, food crisis, judiciary crisis and Lal Masjid (red mosque issue). These issues were selected because of their importance and vast coverage in media throughout the study period of one year.

The public agenda about these issues was measured through the survey research. A comprehensive questionnaire was got filled by the readers of the both newspapers separately. The ranking order of the issues along with their most important source of information about the issue was measured. The results of the survey research (public agenda) were then compared with the findings of the content analysis (media agenda).

According to the results, it was found that the agenda setting theory worked except the issues of the food and energy crises. These two issues got more importance in the public agenda than the media agenda because of the personal suffering of the
audience members because the respondents themselves were facing the problems of the food shortage and power cut-off. It means that the personal problems of the public are not dependent on media agenda to become the public agenda. However, for the remaining issues of the study, there was strong relationship between the media and the public agenda.

Another finding of this study was that the both newspapers had a different set of news agenda except the issue of the food crisis which got fourth position in the frequency as well as length wise measurement of the both newspapers. It was found that the readers of the both newspapers followed the agenda of the newspaper which they read (except the issues of the food and energy crises).

Most of the respondents stated print media as the most important source of information which strengthens the findings of this study that formulation of the public opinion was mainly a result of print media agenda (except the two issues).

The public opinion about the issues of the study has been found having a good relationship with the slant and framing of the issues in these newspapers except the issues of the food and energy crises where the public opinion was found against the media slant. The media slant and framing about these two issues was in favor of the government but the maximum public opinion was found against the government regarding these issues. It means that media could not alter the public opinion about the issues of individuals’ personal problems and sufferings.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to express my deepest appreciation and thanks to all the friends and colleagues who helped me through various stages in this research. The support and guidance provided to me all along in this research by my supervisor Prof. Dr. Miskeen Ali Hijazi, Former Chairman, Department of Mass Communication, Punjab University Lahore, is, indeed, of key significance. (Professor Hijazi died in January 2009 during the very lengthy process of the evaluation of this thesis. May almighty Allah bless his soul.)

I also wish to sincerely acknowledge the valuable advice and inspiration by Prof. Dr. Mahmood H. Butt, Vice Chancellor of AIOU and Prof. Dr. Abdul Hafeez, Dean, Faculty of Social Sciences and Humanities AIOU. My special gratitude is due to Dr. Syed Abdul Siraj, Chairman of the Mass Communication Department who guided and supported me throughout the research. I am very much grateful to him. I find no words to say him thanks. I am also thankful to my international friends associated with different media organizations and universities throughout the Globe who helped me during research process of this thesis.

I would also acknowledge the inspiration and support received from my wife Dr. Rukhsana and my children Talha, Tehniyat and Warda, who are amused at my devoting so much attention to my studies.

SAQIB RIAZ
# Table of Contents

## CHAPTER 1

### INTRODUCTION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Rationale of the Study</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Triangle of Theories</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1 Gate Keeping Theory</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.1 Assumptions of Gatekeeping</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.2 Two Stages of Gatekeeping in Media Organizations</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2 Framing</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.1. Definition and History of Framing Theory</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.2 Relationship of Framing with other Communication Theories</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The Agenda-Setting Role of Mass Communication</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1 Qualities and Powers of Agenda Setting Theory</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2 The Acapulco Typology</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3 Contingent Conditions for Agenda Setting</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4 Levels of Measuring Agenda-Setting effects</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5 New Dimensions in Agenda-Setting Research</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Who sets the media agenda?</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1 Passive and Active Roles of Media</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2 Theoretical Approaches</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3 Individual Media Workers’ influence on Media Content</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4 Influence of Media Routines</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5 Organizational Influences on Media Content</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.6 Influences from outside Media Organizations</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7 Influence of Ideology on Media Content</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. About the newspapers of the study</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1 Daily Dawn</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5.2 Daily Jang ................................................................. 43

6. About the issues of the study ........................................ 44
   6.1 Terrorism ............................................................... 44
   6.2 Indo-Pak Relations .................................................. 45
   6.3 Energy Crisis .......................................................... 47
   6.4 Food Crisis ............................................................. 48
   6.5 Judiciary Crisis ....................................................... 48
   6.6 Lal Masjid Issue ...................................................... 49

7. Objectives of the Study ................................................ 51

8. Research Questions .................................................... 51

CHAPTER 2
LITERATURE REVIEW

1. Beginning of the Agenda-Setting Theory .......................... 53
   1.1 Expansion of the Chapel Hill Study ............................. 53
   1.2 Longitudinal Studies of Agenda Setting ......................... 55
   1.3 Bi-Directional Nature of Agenda-Setting Process .............. 56

2. Determinants of Agenda-Setting effects .......................... 57

3. Time Factor for affective Agenda Setting .......................... 59

4. Agenda setting at local level ......................................... 60

5. Attribute Agenda Setting ............................................. 61
   5.1 Role of Media Tone in Attribute Agenda Setting ............... 63

6. Priming Effects in Agenda Setting ................................... 64
CHAPTER 3

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

1. Research Problem .............................................. 87
2. Research Design ................................................. 87
   2.1 Research Question ......................................... 89
   2.2 Hypotheses .................................................. 89
3. Significance of the Study ......................................... 89
4. Methodology ...................................................... 90
   4.1 Content Analysis ............................................. 90
      4.1.1 Variables of the Content Analysis .................... 91
      4.1.2 Coding Unit of Analysis ............................... 92
      4.1.3 Contextual Unit of Analysis .......................... 93
      4.1.4 Intra-coder and Inter-coder Reliability ................ 93
   4.2 Survey Research ............................................ 93
      4.2.1 Universe and Sampling ............................... 94
      4.2.2 Variables of Survey Research ........................ 95
5. Theoretical Framework ........................................... 96
6. Problems Faced .................................................. 96
7. Categories and Rules for Coding ................................ 98
CHAPTER 4
DATA ANALYSIS

1. Data Analysis of the Content Analysis .......................... 102
2. Frequency of the News Stories published on the Issues ........ 103
3. Length of the News Stories ........................................ 106
4. Slant ............................................................................. 108
   4.1 Slant for the issue of Terrorism ............................... 109
   4.2 Slant for the issue of Indo-Pak Relations ................. 110
   4.3 Slant for the issue of Energy Crisis ......................... 111
   4.4 Slant for the Issue of Food Crisis ......................... 112
   4.5 Slant for the Issue of Judiciary Crisis ................... 113
   4.6 Slant for the Issue of Lal Masjid (Red Mosque) ......... 114
5. Framing of the issues ................................................... 116
6. Sources of Information .................................................. 118
7. Placement of the News Items (regarding the issues of the study) --- 121
   7.1 Placement of the news stories on the issue of Terrorism --- 122
   7.2 Placement of the news stories on the issue of Indo-Pak relations 123
   7.3 Placement of the news stories on the issue of Energy Crisis ---- 124
   7.4 Placement of the news stories on the issue of Food Crisis ------ 125
   7.5 Placement of the news stories about the issue of Judiciary Crisis 126
   7.6 Placement of the news stories on the issue of Lal Masjid ------ 127
8. Results of the Survey Research ........................................ 128
9. Ranking Order of the Public Agenda ................................ 129
   9.1 The Most Important Issue ......................................... 129
   9.2 The Second Most Important Issue ............................. 131
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9.3 The Third Most Important Issue</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.4 The Fourth Most Important Issue</td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.5 The Fifth Most Important Issue</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.6 The Least Important Issue</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Source of Information</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.1 Source of Information for the issue of Terrorism</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.2 Source of Information for the issue of Indo-Pak relations</td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.3 Source of Information for the issue of Energy Crisis</td>
<td>137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.4 Source of Information for the issue of Food Crisis</td>
<td>138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.5 Source of Information for the issue of Judiciary Crisis</td>
<td>139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.6 Source of Information for the issue of Lal Masjid</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Opinion of the Newspaper Readers about the issues of the study</td>
<td>141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.1 Public Opinion on the issue of Terrorism</td>
<td>141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.2 Public Opinion about the issue of Indo-Pak Relations</td>
<td>142</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.3 Public Opinion about the issue of Energy Crisis</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.4 Public Opinion about the issue of Food Crisis</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.5 Public Opinion about the issue of Judiciary Crisis</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.6 Public Opinion about the issue of Lal Masjid</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Discussion with Family and Friends</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.1 Discussion with Family and Friends regarding the issue of Terrorism</td>
<td>146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.2 Discussion with Family and Friends regarding the issue of Indo-Pak relations</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.3 Discussion with Family and Friends regarding the issue of Energy Crisis</td>
<td>148</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
12.4 Discussion with Family and Friends regarding the issue of Food Crisis ................................................. 149
12.5 Discussion with Family and Friends regarding the issue of Judiciary Crisis ........................................... 150
12.6 Discussion with Family and Friends regarding the issue of Lal Masjid .................................................... 151

CHAPTER 5
RESULTS, DISCUSSION, CONCLUSION, AND RECOMMENDATIONS

1. Results and findings of the study ......................................................... 154
2. Discussion on Results ........................................................................ 167
3. Conclusion .......................................................................................... 181
4. Implication .......................................................................................... 182
5. Recommendations .............................................................................. 183
6. Limitations .......................................................................................... 184
7. Areas for Future Research ................................................................. 185

BIBLIOGRAPHY .................................................................................. 186
APPENDICES ....................................................................................... 204

1. Questionnaire ..................................................................................... 205
2. Code Sheet ........................................................................................ 209
LIST OF TABLES

4.1 Slant of the news stories published in the newspapers .......................... 108
4.2 Framing of the issues ............................................................................. 115
4.3 Sources of Information ........................................................................... 119
4.4 Ranking Order of the Public Agenda of the readers of the daily Dawn ---- 130
4.5 Ranking Order of the Public Agenda of the readers of the daily Jang ---- 130
4.6 Opinion of the Newspaper Readers about the issues of the study .......... 142

LIST OF FIGURES

1.1 Conceptual Model of Gatekeeping in media ........................................ 10
1.2 Bass’s double action model of internal news flow ................................. 12
4.1 Frequency of the news stories published in daily Jang ......................... 104
4.2 Frequency of the news stories published in daily Dawn ....................... 105
4.3 Length of news stories published in daily Jang in centimeters per column 107
4.4 Length of news stories published in daily Dawn in centimeters per column 107
4.5 Slant for the issue of Terrorism .............................................................. 109
4.6 Slant for the issue of Indo-Pak relations ................................................. 110
4.7 Slant for the issue of energy crisis .......................................................... 111
4.8 Slant for the issue of food crisis ............................................................. 112
4.9 Slant for the issue of Judiciary crisis ...................................................... 113
4.10 Slant for the Issue of Lal Masjid ........................................................... 114
4.11 Placement of news stories on the issue of Terrorism in daily Dawn ...... 123
4.12 Placement of news stories on the issue of Terrorism in daily Jang ....... 123
4.13 Placement of the news stories on the issue of Indo-Pak relations ......... 124
4.14 Placement of the news stories on the issue of Energy Crisis 125
4.15 Placement of the news stories on the issue of Food Crisis 126
4.16 Placement of the news stories about the issue of Judiciary Crisis 127
4.17 Placement of the news stories on the issue of Lal Masjid 128
4.18 Source of Information for the newspaper readers on the issue of terrorism 136
4.19 Source of Information for the newspaper readers about the issue of
   Indo-Pak relations 137
4.20 Source of Information for the newspaper readers about the issue of
   energy crisis 138
4.21 Source of Information for the newspaper readers about the issue of
   food crisis 139
4.22 Source of Information for the newspaper readers about the issue of
   Judiciary Crisis 140
4.23 Source of Information for the newspaper readers about the issue of
   Lal Masjid 141
4.24 Discussion with Family and Friends regarding the issue of Terrorism 147
4.25 Discussion with Family and Friends regarding the issue of
   Indo-Pak relations 148
4.26 Discussion with Family and Friends regarding the issue of Energy Crisis 149
4.27 Discussion with Family and Friends regarding the issue of Food Crisis 150
4.28 Discussion with Family and Friends regarding the issue of Judiciary Crisis 151
4.29 Discussion with Family and Friends regarding the issue of Lal Masjid 152
CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION
1. Rationale of the Study

We are living in a world where millions of events are taking place simultaneously. Media organizations and institutions have employed thousands of people to observe those events and report them. The news media tell us which issues are important and which ones are not. We have never seen the war situations of Afghanistan, Iraq, Palestine and Kashmir with our own eyes. Even then we have pictures of these disputed areas in our minds. The media’s daily reports inform us about the latest events and changes taking place in the world beyond our reach. As a result of this phenomenon, most of our perceptions about the world are a second-hand reality created by the media organizations. There is no assurance and no guarantee that this reality is an accurate picture of the world.

Media organizations do not just passively broadcast information repeating the words of the official sources or conveying exactly the incidents of an event. They also do not select or reject the day’s news in proportion to reality. Through their selection and display of the news stories, the reporters and the editors focus their attention and influence the public’s perceptions of what are the most important issues of the day. Our pictures of the world are shaped and refined in the way journalists frame their news stories. This function of media is called the agenda-setting function of media (McCombs 2002).

Agenda Setting is one of the most important media theories of the present times. The concept of agenda setting took its name from the idea that the mass media have the ability to carry the salience of items on their news agendas and then transfer it to the public agenda. Usually journalists deal with
the news in several important ways. First of all, they decide which news to cover and which to ignore. Then they assess all of these available reports. In the words of McCombs (2002), in a typical daily newspaper, over 75 percent of the potential news of the day is rejected and never transmitted to the audience (p.4). Newspapers don’t have enough space to print each and everything that is available. There is no way other than choices. These are the first steps in gate-keeping routine. But the news items that pass through the gate of the media organizations do not receive equal treatment when presented to the audience. Some news stories are published in a greater length and prominently displayed. Others receive only brief attention. Newspapers very clearly state the journalistic salience of an item through its page placement, headline and length etc.

Agenda setting claims that audiences obtain this salience of the issues from the news media, incorporating similar sets of priorities into their own agendas. Agenda setting describes the transmission of these saliences as one of the most important aspects of mass communication. The news media not only inform us about the world at large, giving us the major elements for our pictures of the world, they also influence the prominence of those elements in these pictures.

In the 1968 presidential election of the USA the agenda-setting role of the news media was investigated by the two researchers McCombs and Shaw (1972). They simultaneously collected data on the agenda of the news media and the agenda of the public. They argued that any impact of the news media was most likely to be measurable among the undecided voters. In their study, they surveyed undecided voters in Chapel Hill, North Carolina, USA
and analyzed the content of the local and national news media outlets, both print and broadcast, regularly used by these voters. A great degree of relationship between these two agendas of political and social issues established a relationship that became a substantial chain of evidence for an agenda-setting role of the media (McCombs and Shaw, 1972). The research of McCombs and Shaw gave birth to a new mass communication theory which opened new doors of mass media research. This theory can be divided into a couple of dimensions. The first dimension is about the transmission of issue or object salience from the media agenda to the public agenda. The second dimension relates to the media’s role in framing those issues and events in the public minds.

From a general theoretical point of view, the determination of Shaw and McCombs on the cognitive effects of the mass media regarding the awareness and information supplying functions of the media has an important consequence. It provides an explanation and clarification about the broad theoretical paradigm in which the agenda-setting function of the media persists. Hence, the agenda setting becomes one of the processes in which the media in the modern societies participate in the social construction of reality for the people to whom they serve. The authors wrote:

“The agenda-setting function of mass communication clearly falls in this new tradition of cognitive outcomes of mass communication. Perhaps more than any other aspect of our environment, the political arena—all those issues and persons about whom we hold opinions and knowledge is second-hand reality. Especially, in national politics, we have little personal or direct contact. Our knowledge comes primarily from the mass media. For the most
part, we know only those aspects of national politics considered newsworthy enough for transmission through the mass media.” (McCombs and Shaw, 2002, p.5)

Since that initial study till now, more than 350 published studies have proven this influence of the news media. The agenda-setting power of the news media has also been proven experimentally in the laboratory. Iyengar and Kinder (1987) conducted a series of controlled experiments in which participants viewed television news programs that had been designed to highlight some issues, such as national defense or pollution of the environment. When the participants’ ranking of the importance of these experimentally manipulated issues was compared to the salience for them with the other issues of the day, clear agenda-setting effects were found. The issues highlighted in the experimental versions of the newscasts were perceived as more important. The researchers concluded their findings by stating that in some experiments, exposure to a single television news program produced the agenda-setting effects. However, usually the agenda-setting effects were found only after watching a number of newscasts.

Today, we are living in a global village where the mass media are an important source of information about what is going on in the world. This is an obvious fact that the news media organizations seem more interested in some events than in others. This is widely understood and accepted that the material presented by the media organizations is selective. That selectivity is a result of its limited capacity to provide total surveillance. Some factors are imposed on the people who do the gate-keeping (reporters and editors), and some financial limitations and economic pressures are also placed on the media because they
must survive as profit making commercial organizations. These factors play a vital role to decide which stories to select, follow up, emphasize, interpret and manipulate in particular and desired ways.

According to the agenda-setting theory, because of the fact of paying attention to some issues and neglecting and ignoring some others, the mass media will have an effect on public opinion. People will be inclined to know about those issues and things, which are highlighted by the mass media and they adopt the order of priority assigned to different issues. This theory primarily deals with learning and not with attitude or opinion change. Some of the empirical studies of mass communication had confirmed that the most expected effects to occur would be on matters of information. Usually, people learn what the issues are and how these are ordered in importance in the media agenda.

This is important to mention that the most of the agenda-setting research has concerned itself with the election campaigns. In a typical election campaign it has become a common practice to build the ‘image’ of a candidate by association with certain point of view on the important problems and issues of a society and with certain other issues of the candidate’s choice. This is assumed that if voters can be convinced that an issue is important, they will vote for the candidate or the political party which has been projected as the most capable to deal with it.

Some researchers take the Watergate scandal as a result of the agenda-setting function. In the words of Becker (1982), “there was nothing new in uncovering political corruption, but the intense press exposure and the televised US senate hearings that followed, made it topic of the year” (P.521). So it can be
imagined how the media play a significant and vital role in shaping pictures in our heads.

2. Triangle of Theories

Agenda setting theory of media has a very close link with two other theories of mass communication. These are gatekeeping theory and the framing theory. All of these three theories are interlinked with each other. So, before moving onwards, this is important to have a look on the interplay of these three theories.

The gatekeeping theory is one of the most important mass communication theories. This theory says that the “gatekeepers” decide what information will go forward to the public and what will not. Gatekeepers are reporters, news writers, newsroom editorial staff, and news editors etc. Some times politicians and government officials also become gatekeepers while giving information to the reporters. These gatekeepers decide what stories are important to release, thus controlling the news we see, read and hear.

Another essential theory concerning the media’s agenda is theory of framing. Framing is the process of in which attention is obtained to some aspects of reality while concealing and hiding some others. Basically the media do not present the whole story of an issue to the public. This leaves the public to create opinions based on false statements, which can bring more attention to a story than it would have originally had.

There are a number of similarities and commonalities that exist among gatekeeping, agenda-setting and framing theories. In all three theories, the media
have total control. All of these theories suggest that the media have a set agenda, and they transmit only what they want to get across to public.

Now it will be better to have a brief look on the two above-mentioned neighboring theories of agenda setting, which are gatekeeping and framing theories.

2.1 Gate Keeping Theory

We are living in an age of modernization where the world has become a global village. We see pictures of the life through the media. But the media are able to transmit us only a few thousand pictures. We can’t see millions and billions of pictures of the world because this is not possible for media to show us all of them. Media organizations receive thousands of news and photographs every day but can publish or broadcast only a few hundred of them every day. They are not able to publish or broadcast each and every news item and picture they receive. The reporter who decides which news to cover and which one to leave out, and the editor who decides which news to publish and which news to leave out, is called as gatekeeper because their nature of job is just like a gatekeeper who has the powers to allow some one to go through the gate or stop him.

Kurt Lewin (1947) was perhaps the first person to use the term "gatekeeping," which he used to describe a wife or mother as the person who decides which food will be served on the family's dinner table. The gatekeeper is the man (or woman) who decides what shall pass through the gate. Although he applied his idea originally to the food chain, he then added that the gatekeeping process could include a news item released through some communication
channels. This is the argument from which the most gatekeeper studies in communication have been launched. White (1964) was the person who worked on Lewin's comments and changed it firmly toward journalism in 1950. In the 1970s McCombs and Shaw adopted a different direction when they observed the effects of the gatekeepers' decisions. They came to know that the audience learned how much importance to attach to a news item from the emphasis the media placed on it. McCombs and Shaw stated that the gatekeeping concept was related to the newly emerged concept of agenda-setting. (McCombs et al, 1976). The gatekeeping concept is now more than 60 years old and has entered into the area of many disciplines, including the field of mass communication and the media studies.

2.1.1 Assumptions of Gatekeeping

The gatekeeper has the power to decide which information will go forward, and which will not. In other words a gatekeeper decides which of a certain commodity – materials, goods, and information may enter the system. The most important point is that gatekeepers are able to control the public’s knowledge of the actual events by letting some stories pass through the information transmission system but keeping others out. The institutions and the organizations can also play role of the gatekeepers. In a political and a governmental system there are gatekeepers, individuals or institutions, who control access to positions of power and regulate the transmission of information. Gatekeepers exist in many jobs, and they have the potential to influence the mental pictures created in the people’s minds about the events happening in the world around them. In the media organizations, decision-making is usually based on the principles of news values, organizational
routines, institutional structure and common sense. Gatekeeping is vital in communication planning and almost all of the media people play their role in gatekeeping according to their positions and powers in their media organizations.

The gatekeepers’ choices are a result of a complex plethora of influences, preferences, motives and common values. Gatekeeping is inevitable and in some circumstances it can be useful. Gatekeeping can also be dangerous, since it can lead to a misuse of power by deciding what information to discard and what to let pass. However, gatekeeping is often a routine, guided by some set of standard questions.

**Figure 1.1 Conceptual Model of Gatekeeping in media**

![Gatekeeping Diagram](source)

Source: White (1964)

The above figure is called as the White’s model of gatekeeping that was published in Journalism Quarterly, 27 (1950) and latterly reproduced in Communication Models for the Study of Mass Communications (Uk:2nd Edition, 1993) by Denis McQuail and Swan Windahi. According to this model, a number of news items (N) go through the process of selection. In the media organization (which is a gate), the sub-editor (Mr. Gate) selects some news items considered of sufficient interest and importance to be passed through to the next process of news production. Thus some news stories like N2 and N3 have been selected and have gone through the first stage of transformation. On
the other hand, some other news items N1 and N4 have been rejected in the gatekeeping process.

Some other researchers criticized the White’s model of gatekeeping arguing that it does not give the criteria for selection and rejection of news stories. It also does not acknowledge the fact that in the general process of negotiation there are many gates. In these gates gatekeeping is just one form which is taking place at all levels and at each stage of the news production process. In 1959, J.T. McNelly presented a model of news flow, which shows the multi-gated reality of news processing. It also states that every news story is modified when it passes through each gate. At every stage in the news production process, the media managers and reporters decide not only about what events to cover, but how these might be covered.

Broadly speaking, we all are gatekeepers in our daily life. All the time when we decide to say something to another person, our comments pass through the gate of our mind. Sometimes, we may decide not to say any thing and to be silent; or we need to summarize the message, this is also gatekeeping in a broader sense.

2.1.2 Two Stages of Gatekeeping in Media Organizations

The selection procedure of news takes place at every stage of the news manufacturing process. However, the procedure varies in its nature and treatment. On the basis of his research A.Z. Bass (1969) presented a ‘double action’ model of news flow in a typical media organization. His model is described in the following figure.
Figure 1.2 Bass’s double action model of internal news flow

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Stage 1</th>
<th>Stage 2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Raw News</td>
<td>News Gathering</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Writers, Editors, Reporters etc.</td>
<td>Translators etc.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

This model describes two stages of news production. The first stage is news collection and the second stage is news processing. In the first stage, reporters and photographers gather raw news stories directly, or at least more directly than editors, news editors and sub-editors sitting at the media organizations. Usually, they remain busy on one news story at a time but this is not a practice all the time. Being present on the actual location, they have a degree of choice on what aspects of an event they will select, and in which slant they will report them. Then their news story reaches to the newsroom where it again passes through a number of processes of selection. Here in the central newsroom, the editorial staff has many news stories to deal with. They have to balance the demands of different news stories against each other. They have to work in accordance with their organization’s standards and values. The persons of the editorial staff are influenced in their decision making even more than the reporters in the field. In the words of Shoemaker and Reese (1996), the media content is influenced by the personal attitudes and orientations of media workers; professionalism; corporate policies, corporate ownership patterns, the economic environment; advertisers; and ideological influences (p.1).

The very recent phenomenon of ‘embedded journalism’ can also be called as one of the products of the gatekeeping theory. Usually, this phenomenon is used by the media organizations during wartime when they are
allowed only to record and show some selected areas and pictures desired by the authorities. They are not at all allowed to report any side of the picture against the policy of the defence authorities by whom they are paid. Although the phenomenon exists for a long time in different shapes, but it got famous during the recent Iraq war when the US military used media to show the one-sided picture of the Iraq war. The reporters are hired to write their news stories in a desired way because they are highly paid and facilitated by the authorities. For example they may be asked by the military officers to print the pictures of their success and not the pictures of their defeat or death of their soldiers.

2.2 Framing

The other closely interlinked theory, with the theory of agenda setting, is the theory of Framing. The concept of framing is related to the agenda-setting theory but expands the research by focusing on the real meaning of the issues. Framing theory states that the media focus attention on certain events and then places them within a specific field of meaning. Framing is an important area in media studies because it can have a big influence on media audience.

2.2.1. Definition and History of Framing Theory

The beginning of the Framing theory may be traced in Walter Lippman’s book, *Public Opinion* (1922). As a newspaper columnist, Lippmann was perhaps first person to express concern about media influence on public attitudes. He presented his theory that the mass media create our pictures of the world. However, he also stated that these pictures of the world were most of the time incomplete.

There were some more developments in the research on framing when Robert Entman (1993) joined the team of Tuchman and Goffman as a pioneer of
the framing research. He tried to improve a fractured model of framing research through a unified understanding of Goffman’s original concepts of frames, framework, and framing.

There are two types of frames: episodic and thematic. The episodic frame elaborates the public issues in terms of solid instances or specific events. It may be an accident of a vehicle, the event of a suicide bombing, a demonstration or protest against the government policies, etc. On the other hand, thematic news framing is its contrast and it usually takes the form of a detailed report aimed to achieve general objectives. It places public issues in some general or theoretical context. It may be about some social or political grievances of certain groups of a society, or consequences of the change in foreign policy etc. By its nature episodic framing is visually appealing because usually it depends on live coverage. On the other hand, thematic coverage needs interpretive analyses. It can be said that the coverage of political issues in our country is heavily episodic.

2.2.2 Relationship of Framing with other Communication Theories

Framing theory has a close relationship with the theories of agenda setting, gatekeeping and priming. In developing the basis for agenda-setting theory, McCombs and Shaw (1972) assumed that the mass media will set the agenda for political campaigns, influencing public attitudes toward desired issues. Through their research, McCombs and Shaw focused on the effect of the media on people's perceptions and priorities specially their thinking about the political content.

Agenda-setting theory is based on the idea that media sources shape the way people think about the issues while framing plays its role behind the screen in highlighting certain attributes of these issues. The difference between
framing and agenda-setting theory appears in terms of the scope of influence, as well as in the salience of issues.

There are two levels of influence within agenda-setting. The first level is about the ranking of issue importance in the presentation of information in the media, while the second level relates with the framing of those issues. The framing of those objects on the media agenda can also influence the pictures of those objects in our heads. That is the second level of agenda setting (McComb, 1999, p.11).

While setting the media agenda and framing, media organizations must first decide which news stories will be provided to the public. From a lot of potential news items incoming daily from news agencies, reporters, correspondents and other sources, the media have to reject those news stories that are not fit for public presentation. This is the function of gatekeepers because each medium whether print or electronic, only has a limited space or time daily for broadcast of the news content. Media organizations have their own criteria to decide which stories to publish or broadcast and which stories to reject. Therefore, very few media professionals (editors, news editors, and other journalists) take the roles of gatekeepers, having a control on public knowledge of actual events in the process of meeting the needs of the news medium.

McCombs (1997) stated that there was a great need for both framing and agenda-setting in successful news reporting. Gatekeeping, agenda-setting, and framing, all of them play their role in shaping the media agenda which becomes public agenda after some time. After having a detailed discussion on the neighboring theories, now we again come back to the agenda setting role of mass communication.
3. The Agenda-Setting Role of Mass Communication

News media organizations are not just passive transmitters of information, repeating the words of official sources or conveying exactly the events in a way as they happened. Through their daily selection and presentation of the news, editors and reporters focus attention of the public’s perceptions about the most important issues of the day. Hence, our attention is further focused and our pictures of the world are shaped and reproduced by the way journalists frame their news stories.

It was Lippmann’s theory that the mass media create our pictures of the world. However, he understood that the pictures provided by the media were often incomplete and unclear. We can see only reflections of reality (not reality itself) in the news media. Yet, those reflections provide the basis for our pictures (Lippman, 1922).

The notion that the news media influence the “pictures in our heads” was put to an empirical test in 1972. Two researchers Maxwell McCombs & Donald Shaw from the University of North Carolina thought whether the topics selected by the news media to represent the world outside limited the kinds of events that people used to interpret the world. They also thought whether the public’s perception of reality depended on the topics highlighted by the news media or not (McComb & Shaw, 1972).

During the 1968 presidential election of the USA, McCombs and Shaw conducted the first test of Lippmann’s theory in Chapel Hill, NC. At that time, the existing theory was that the mass media had only limited effects on the public. Earlier studies conducted by some scholars stated that exposure to campaign information had little influence on the public’s voting behaviors.
According to this limited effects model, voters relied on social groups and their perceptions to guide their voting decisions. The news media only supported and to some extent reinforced voters’ preference for some particular politician or party.

It was a tremendous beginning of a new mass communications theory, which can be divided into two aspects. The first aspect relates to the transmission of issue or object salience from the media agenda to the public agenda. The second aspect tells us about the news media’s role in framing those issues and objects in the minds of people.

McCombs and Shaw (1972) tested the notion that the mass media influence public perception about the important issues of the day through their daily selection and display of the news in their news bulletin etc. Especially, they believed that with the passage of time the priority issues of the news media organizations would become the priority issues of the public. The media audience can easily feel the priorities of the news agenda. In newspapers the size of the headlines, the length of the news story, and the page placement where the story appears indicate the prominence of the news story. In television broadcasts the position of an item in the newscast and the length of the story can determine its importance. These signals help the audience in making their priorities among a small number of issues selected for attention in the daily news broadcasts and outlets.

The alternative approach is the closed ended question which has some other advantages. Use of a closed ended or short question in which respondents are asked to rank a series of issues provides a more detailed picture of the public
agenda. This practice can provide a comparison of agenda on a variety of issues’ importance.

The content of the news media was the independent variable in the Chapel Hill study. The researchers compared responses of their open-ended survey questions with a content analysis of the nine major news sources used by the voters of that particular area. Television, radio, newspapers, and news magazines were included in the sources. As a result of the open-ended survey question five major issues of importance were found to the voters of Chapel Hill. These issues were foreign policy, law and order, fiscal policy, civil rights, evaluation of the news coverage across three weeks of the last presidential campaign (McCombs & Shaw, 1972). The public agenda of the issues of the study was rank-ordered according to the number of voters naming an issue. These five issues were rank-ordered on the news agenda according to the percentage of news coverage on the issues falling into each category. There was a strong and significant relationship between the public’s and the media’s agenda about the issues. This transfer of salience from the media agenda to the public agenda was called as the agenda-setting role of mass communication.

The basic purpose of the McCombs and Shaw’s study was to investigate a link between the content of the news agenda and the public agenda. The researchers tried to avoid the misleading idea of possible effects, which occurs when only media content is studied. For example, it cannot be assumed that people watching televised violence will repeat the same act of violence in their real lives. Only after analyzing television content and the public’s reactions the researchers can say that a correlation exists. Secondly, McCombs and Shaw wanted to examine effects on people that resulted from some specific content of
the media messages. Earlier media effects studies did not attempt to establish a link between the effects and specific media content. This study tried to determine a relationship between media and public regarding acceptance of media messages.

The Chapel Hill research study provides a methodological ground for the agenda-setting research. However, there is some criticism on this study. Some people argue that a content analysis of the media joined with public opinion surveys provides only one approach to media influence on the pictures in our minds. It might be better for the researchers to arrange a field, or a laboratory experiment to find out the existence of agenda setting in mass communication.

3.1 Qualities and Powers of Agenda Setting Theory:

Agenda-Setting theory has its beginning in a scientific background. It predicts that if people use the same media for information, they will place importance on the same issues. According to Chaffee & Berger’s (1997) criteria for scientific theories, agenda-setting is a good theory for a number of reasons.

- This theory has an explanatory power because it explains why people prioritize certain issues.
- It’s predictive power is also recognized because it predicts the priorities of the media audience according to the news media content.

3.2 The Acapulco Typology

The comparison of the media agenda with the public agenda has been operationalized in four different categories. The researchers of the agenda-setting theory call these kinds of designs as the Acapulco typology (McCombs,
1981). This typology was first presented at the International Communication Association convention in Acapulco, Mexico. So this is the reason why this typology is called as Acapulco typology.

1. The first type of this typology compares the news coverage for a set of major issues to the aggregate public agenda. The original Chapel Hill study is the best example of Type I design in the agenda-setting literature.

2. The second type also examines the media agenda (defined in terms of a set of issues), but shifts the units of analysis for the public agenda from the aggregate population to the individual. In such situations, the rank-order of an agenda of issues is determined for each person on individual basis.

3. The third type determines the relationship between the media coverage of a single issue and the public opinion about this issue over a period of time. The study of Winter and Eyal (1981) is an example of this type of Design.

4. Type four investigates the relationship between the media coverage of a single issue and the salience of that issue on an individual agenda. The research design of the laboratory experiment is also used in this type and it complements the field research. For example, Iyengar and Kinder (1987) conducted their research on agenda-setting effects repeatedly in a series of laboratory experiments. During the laboratory experiments, the participants watched actual television programs to enhance the salience of certain issues. The result was according to the expectations of the researchers and an increased level of concern was found for the desired issues.

Perhaps there is only one study that has undertaken the vastness of examining simultaneously all four types of the agenda-setting designs. This study was conducted in Taiwan. In his analysis of Taiwan’s first fully contested
legislative election in more than 40 years, King (1994) found some evidence of agenda setting with all four designs. The strongest results emerged from a Type one analysis of the newspaper agenda.

Now, we take a brief overview of this typology. Opposite to the three other versions of the public agenda, Type 2 studies highlight individual difference of the audience. An issue agenda is constructed for each individual. Obviously, the items making up these individual agenda must be the same across all of the individuals.

Type 1 and Type 2 use the symbol of an agenda in a real manner. In these situations, the agenda is a set of rank-ordered issues. In contrast, Type 3 and Type 4 designs focus on a single issue, testing the hypothesis that variations in the salience of an issue on the public agenda reflect variations in the news coverage of that issue. The difference between Type 3 and Type 4 is that the Type 3 study verifies the agenda setting influences of news coverage on a population while Type 4 study examines the agenda setting influence of news coverage on an individual.

It can be summarized that there are four different research designs for agenda setting research. These designs are based on the key theoretical and methodological decisions that define the Acapulco typology.

3.3 Contingent Conditions for Agenda Setting

A number of research studies including the original Chapel Hill study investigated the basic agenda-setting hypothesis that news coverage patterns influence public opinion about the important issues of the day. However, some contingent conditions may increase or reduce the influence of the agenda-setting of news media. These contingent conditions include the psychological concept
of need for orientation, comparative roles of news media organizations, and the role of interpersonal communication channels in the process of mass communication.

Traditional media research about the effects of mass communication considers audience members as passive receivers of the media messages. This approach gave birth to the basic agenda-setting hypothesis “the media agenda affects the public agenda.” On the other hand, there is another approach called as “the uses and gratifications approach” which assumes that people are not at all the passive receivers of the media messages; rather they are active mass media users who select certain media content to fulfill their particular needs. Therefore, the second phase of agenda setting research relates with psychological explanations for agenda setting.

Furthermore, the media factor is not the only determinant of the public agenda. The agenda setting theory does not negate the basic statement of democracy that the people themselves have sufficient wisdom and knowledge to determine the pathway of their nation, their state, and their local communities. The people are quite able to decide the basic relevance of the issues and attributes presented by the news media. The media set the public agenda only when people perceive their news stories as relevant.

We all have a need for orientation. Each and every person living in this world has a need to understand the environment around him. Whenever we find ourselves in a new situation, a new state or a new country, we feel an uncomfortable psychological situation until we walk around at least some of the surrounding areas. This natural need for orientation also exists in the political and governmental matters, especially in those elections where citizens are faced with
unfamiliar candidates in the election. In all these situations people feel a need for orientation.

As we all know, the degree of need for orientation varies greatly from one person to another. For some people in some situation, there is a high need for orientation. For some other persons, there is little or no need for orientation at all. Need for orientation has two integral components: relevance and uncertainty. Relevance is the primary condition that determines the level of need for orientation for each person. If a topic is perceived as irrelevant or very low in relevance, then the need for orientation is low. Usually, people in these situations give little or no attention to news media reports, thus producing weak agenda-setting effects.

On the other hand, for persons among whom the relevance of a topic or issue is high, their degree of uncertainty about the topic or the issue determines the level of need for orientation. If the level of this uncertainty is low the people feel that they basically understand the topic, then the need for orientation is moderate. These people will watch the media for new developments and perhaps some times for some additional background information. Agenda-setting effects among this group are modest.

Finally, among persons for whom both the relevance and their uncertainty about certain situation are high, need for orientation is high. These individuals normally are committed consumers of the news, and usually strong agenda-setting effects are found among these individuals.

3.4 Levels of Measuring Agenda-Setting effects

Some researchers extended the measurement of the public agenda on the basis of their research studies. In a research study, McLeod, et al. (1974) presented an idea of measuring agenda-setting effects by three different level
public agendas. According to his theory, the first public agenda is an intrapersonal or self public agenda. The question asked in the survey of the Chapel Hill study (“What are you most concerned about these days?”) and the question asked in most of the surveys (“What is the most important problem facing this country?”) are actually operational definitions of the intrapersonal agenda. These questions provide a psychological measurement of asking people what they talk about with family and friends. Then comes the second public agenda, which is called as an interpersonal public agenda and it comes when people talk about certain issues with their family members and friends. The third public agenda is about the apparent community public agenda. This agenda appears when people explain what others in the society regard as the most important issues.

3.5 New Dimensions in Agenda-Setting Research

News media coverage influences our personal perceptions and opinions about the most important issues and topics of the day. From that simple beginning, now the boundaries of the theory have been expanded manifold. In the earlier studies of agenda-setting research both the media agenda and the public agenda had consisted of a set of objects or public issues. However, public issues are not mere a set of objects. Communication is a vast process covering each and every aspect of our life. Media can affect public perceptions in a number of ways. Today, we are living in a media-driven global village where almost each and every aspect of our lives is being influenced by the agenda-setting function of media.

There is another dimension of the agenda-setting role of media. Each of the objects portrayed by media has numerous attributes, and these attributes
open doors for another agenda. Just like things (objects), the attributes of these things vary in salience. The selection of things for attention and the selection of attributes, (which is also called as framing), is simultaneously powerful agenda setting roles. News media agenda and its daily set of objects provide different aspects that media people and then general public think about each object. These perspectives of the news media draw attention of their audience to certain attributes and keep them away from others.

How media frames influence and affect the public agenda is the second dimension of agenda setting. The first dimension, of course, was the transmission of issue salience from the media agenda to the public agenda. In the second dimension, the communication of attribute salience is being examined.

While exploring other aspects of agenda-setting research, many scholars have found presence of frames in media content. For example, during a research on complex environmental issues, the development of a huge man-made lake in central Indiana revealed a level of correspondence between the picture in people’s minds and the frames in local newspaper coverage of that issue (Cohen, 1975). This is a transfer of focus from an agenda of objects (things) to an agenda of attributes.

The research study conducted by Iyengar and Kinder (1987) not only supported the agenda-setting hypothesis, but there was also a proof of the existence of both framing and priming in the news media. Priming is a psychological process in which media emphasis on certain issues not only increases the salience of those issues, but it motivates in people’s memories previously obtained information about those issues. That information is then
used in making opinions about persons, groups, or institutions associated with the issues.

Agenda setting analysis is opening new dimensions in mass communication research. In most of the research till now, the comparison has been made between the media agenda and the public agenda. But there also are comparisons of different media agendas, of numerous political agendas with the media agenda, and a number of agendas with policy agendas. In addition to this, researchers have started thinking beyond the original domain of an agenda of issues to find new dimensions in the traditional agenda-setting research. In the coming years of agenda-setting research, hopefully, scholars will be exploring numerous new dimensions of the news agenda.

4. **Who Sets the Media Agenda?**

   We believe on the basis of worldwide research that to a greater extent the media set the agenda of the public. But there emerges another important question, if the media set the public agenda, then who sets the media agenda? This question is important in the sense that it transforms the agenda-setting research from independent variable to dependent variable. A number of factors inside and outside media organizations play an important role in setting the media agenda by influencing the media content. The personal attitudes and orientations of media workers, professional routines, commercial policies, ownership patterns, economic policies, advertisers, and the governments influence media content. Media content is necessarily manipulated when events are relocated and reproduced into news.
4.1 Passive and Active Roles of Media

The research studies of earlier times considered media as channel, suggesting the media as nothing more than pipes through which bits and parts of information flow. In these studies media were considered as the neutral transmitters of information, linking senders to receivers. This model states that nothing important happens to the message while it is in the communication channel. The neutral journalist theory and the null effects model support the passive role of media. The null effects model presented by Young (1981) states that mass media provide a good representation of reality with little or no changing.

The research of modern age (Shoemaker & Reese, 1996) doesn’t accept the approach of the passive role of mass media. Modern researchers believe that media content is necessarily manipulated when events are relocated and reproduced into news. News media content establishes a symbolic environment by giving greater attention (in the shape of more time, more prominence etc) to certain events, people or group of people than others. So the modern research believes in the active role of media and takes media as the active part of the society.

4.2 Theoretical Approaches

While discussion on the influences on media content, the following theoretical approaches are important in this regard.

a. Mass media content is influenced by media workers’ socialization and attitudes. Their professional training, personal and political attitudes and affiliations lead them to produce a social reality.
b. Media content is influenced by media routines. These routines are the ways in which media workers and their organizations perform their work. For example to write a news story before a deadline time or to write it in inverted pyramid are two media routines.

c. News media content is influenced by the ideology of those who are in power in the society. Mass media follow an ideology consistent with those motives and interests, which helps ensure that society will continue in its present form.

d. Media content is influenced by other social institutions and forces. This approach suggests that economic and cultural factors and audience members determine content. (Shoemaker & Reese, 1996).

Now we describe these influences on media content in detail.

4.3 Individual Media Workers’ influence on Media Content

Media content is influenced by media workers including reporters, editors, correspondents, news producers, etc. Their personal attitudes, values, beliefs, affiliations, educational and social background, working environment, professional background influences media content. Their professional experiences shape their roles and ethics. These professional roles and ethics have a direct effect on media content. The working environment of media organizations, facilities provided to journalists and especially the salary structure of the media workers influence media content. The content of the elite newspapers greatly differs from the content of small newspapers having poor working conditions.

The personal political attitudes and religious affiliations of the journalists also have an effect on the news production process. In the US, a
survey was conducted to investigate the wire journalists’ influence on news content. Eleven percent of the sample population of the Wire journalists accepted to adding a personal slant to facts of the news story all of the time, 46.4% took a more careful approach, only admitting to it "often", and a huge number of them (92.5%) stated that they added a new angle to the news items at least sometimes. In addition, 72.3% said they "sometimes took information from press releases to support their own angle, 20% told they did this "very rarely" and 5.3% said they never did this. Most amazingly, 89.2% of those interviewed journalists tended to interpret and/or significance of the information for their readers, whereas only 10.4% presented information without adding anything. (Leyland 1999).

4.4 Influence of Media Routines

Media workers perform their duties within a sphere of routines. For example gatekeeping is a routine. Meeting the deadlines is another routine. Reliance on official sources for news is yet another routine. Dependence of media organizations on each other (for news etc.) is also another routine. These routines ensure that the media system will respond in a predictable manner. Media content is influenced by these routines. These routines affect the social reality depicted by media. Journalists usually rely on sources for news but these sources can have their own personal interests and while giving the information to the reporters, they will definitely protect their vested interests. In the same way news agencies and wire services have a very strong influence on media content. Usually newspapers accept each and every important news item released by the news agencies.
Media organizations also set each other’s agenda. These organizations carefully monitor each other’s coverage and display of news stories. If some newspaper’s staff find something interesting in some other newspaper, they reprint such news items for their own readers. Newspapers usually publish a number of news stories broadcast by radio stations and TV channels. In the words of Shoemaker and Reese (1996), Hence, a news item published or broadcast once is published and broadcast again and again by the other media organizations.

Usually, Pakistani media observe each other very carefully to win the maximum audience. If some newspaper breaks a news story exclusively, the other media also carry it and repeat its broadcast and/or publication. This is because of a close competition among media to win the maximum number of audience. The media organizations can’t afford to lose their readers and viewers. This is the reason why the media organizations depend heavily on each other for news. Hence they play a pivotal role in setting each other’s agenda.

4.5 Organizational Influences on Media Content

Media organizations have their own aims and objectives. Throughout the world, most of the media organizations are owned by non-media owners. The majority of them are owned by the huge business groups like the General Electric Company that owns a number of TV channels, radio stations and newspapers in the USA.

For most of the media organizations (in developed as well as in the developing countries), the primary goal is to earn money. Profit maximization is their ultimate goal. The words of public service don’t exist in the dictionary of business, commerce and stock exchange. The person who spends millions and billions of
rupees aims to earn some profit, so media organizations usually don’t compromise on profit and it remains their first priority. These economic considerations become constraints on news work putting an indirect influence on editorial decisions.

With the increasing complexity of the corporate organizational structure of the media organizations, concerns have risen about the journalistic autonomy and freedom of the media in almost the whole world. In the newspapers organizations editors have become managers. They control both the editorial and business sections of the paper. However, the relative power of the journalistic section is less. Appointing managers in positions formerly filled by media personnel makes a strong impact on media content. It is also clear that the final organization-level power lies with owners, who set the media agenda.

4.6 Influences from Outside Media Organizations

A number of sources from outside the media organizations influence media content.

In the developing countries like Pakistan, perhaps the strongest external influence on media content comes from the governments and advertisers. It becomes almost impossible for media organizations to survive without the financial support of the governments and advertisers. The theory of “pay the piper” works here and as a return of economic benefits, media organizations produce most of their content in favor their financers (governments and advertisers). Modern multinational companies have enough power to suppress public messages they do not like. In addition to these factors, the public relations campaigns launched by different organizations (public as well as private organizations) and the pressure groups of the society put a heavy
influence on media content. Hence these factors from outside the media organizations play a pivotal role in setting the news media’s agenda.

**4.7 Influence of Ideology on Media Content**

Ideology also plays an important role in setting the agenda of the news media. In the words of Becker, “an ideology is an integrated set of frames of reference through which each of us sees the world and to which all of us adjust our actions” (Becker, 1984, p.69). What is the basis of ideology in a country like Pakistan? Obviously the ideology of Islamic values governs as a supreme ideology. So the media have to respect and regard the ideology of Islamic values. But at the same time there is another theory that the media obey and that is the ideology of those who are in power in certain society. The Pakistani media are depicting the same picture in their daily broadcasts and publications. It seems that the media are obeying the ideology of the rulers all the time.

After a detailed discussion on the influences on media agenda, now a brief description on the newspapers of the study is being presented in the following lines.

**5. About the Newspapers of the Study**

**5.1 Daily Dawn:**

Daily Dawn is the largest widely circulated English newspaper of Pakistan being published from Karachi, Lahore and Islamabad simultaneously. The newspaper is published by the Herald Publications. The newspaper started its publication as a weekly from Delhi but soon it became daily in 1942. Qauid-e-Azam Muhammad Ali Jinnah, the founder of Pakistan was its first managing trustee. Dawn shifted its office from Delhi to Karachi in 1947, soon
after the creation of Pakistan. It is a newspaper of international standard which is highly recognized at the international level because of its high professional standard.

5.2 Daily Jang:

Daily Jang is the largest widely circulated Urdu newspaper of Pakistan being published by Jang Group of Newspapers, simultaneously from Karachi, Lahore, Rawalpindi Islamabad, Multan, Quetta and London. The paper started its publication in 1940 in the United India seven years before the establishment of Pakistan. Mir Khalil-ur-Rehman was its founder editor (and the owner too) who died in January 1992. Now his son Mir Shakeel-ur-Rehman is the chief editor of the newspaper. The Jang group also publishes the second largest English newspaper “The News” and the largest widely circulated Urdu weekly magazine “Akhbar-e-Jehan” and an English weekly “Mag.” This newspaper is famous for its high professional standard. Its credibility is accepted countrywide and seldom a news item published in this newspaper is denied. However, keeping in view its political economy, the paper donates a major portion of its space to advertisements and serious readers complain about this issue that they hardly find some news to read because the major portion of the newspaper contains advertisements.

At this stage, this is important to have a brief overview of the six issues of the content analysis as well as the survey research of this study.
6. About the Issues of the Study

Following is a brief description about the issues of this study.

6.1 Terrorism

This is one of the dangerous and controversial terms we hear and use several times a day. The term was rarely heard before the sad incident of 9/11. The authors of “The Fine Art of Propaganda” termed terrorism as name calling which is one of the seven propaganda devices stated by the authors of the book (Lee, A.M. & E. B. Lee. 1939). Furthermore, Christopher Hitchens (1989), the then Executive Director of the Institute of Terrorism, USA stated this term in these words:

“Can I provide a universally acceptable definition of terrorism? I fear I have to say I can not. There is no universal agreement about who is terrorist. What do we mean by terrorism? The term, unfortunately, has no precise or widely accepted definition” (pp.148-149).

However, after the sad incident of 9/11, the world has almost accepted the official definition of the term as it is defined by the White House. The governments and the media of Pakistan are also following the same definition. According to this view, every activity of violence aimed to destabilize the efforts of the US government and military operations in different parts of the world to maintain peace is called “terrorism.” In other words, all the activities of resistance against the US and/or its allies launched by Taliban and Al-Qaeda are also included in terrorism.

Being the neighbor of Afghanistan, one of the most dangerous places on the globe, Pakistan is suffering a lot of problems. The most important problem is terrorism. Pakistan has unluckily a 2000 kilometer boundary with
Afghanistan. People on the both sides of the border have the same culture, language, dress, etc. They frequently cross the border several times a day. There is no mechanism to stop their movement. As per the claim of the US government, most of the Taliban and Al Qaeda leaders are living and operating their activities from the tribal areas of Pakistan. These areas are being attacked again and again by the American forces, as a result of which the general public opinion of the Pakistani people has become against the US.

Being a major partner of the US on war against terrorism, Pakistan is paying the highest cost in the world. A huge wave of terrorist activities has destabilized the country manifolds. Thousands of military personnel have been killed in these activities in last seven years. Thousands of innocent people of Pakistan lost their lives in bomb blasts and militants’ attacks. Even thousands of military people and innocent citizens have been killed by American and NATO forces and these events were later on termed as “technical mistake.” The country’s economy is facing a huge deficit as a result of terrorist activities. The people of Pakistan gave their lives in this wave of terrorism. Due to importance of this issue, it has been included in the list of the issues of this study.

6.2 Indo-Pak Relations

Friends can be changed but neighbors can’t. Pakistan came into being on 14th August 1947 but India did not accept its creation. Two major wars have been fought in 1965 and 1971 between two countries and a number of other small wars have been taken place including the war of Kargil in 1997. Both countries spent more than 80% of their annual budget on defense instead of spending this money for the prosperity of the people. Kashmir is the major
dispute between two countries, the major portion of which is under the 
occupation of India. India has deputed a major portion of its army in the 
occupied Kashmir to curb the freedom movement of Kashmiri people. It is not 
willing to go for a plebiscite according to the resolution of the United Nations.

A few years ago, with the intervention of some international powers it 
was realized by the both countries that they should start a new journey of 
bilateral relations including trade relations, cricket diplomacy and visits of 
delegations from both sides. This move is still on its way. Officials of the both 
sides also meet to discuss and resolve different issues on government levels. 
The release of each others’ prisoners is also a step in this regard. Several 
suggestions are being considered to resolve the Kashmir dispute. One of the 
sensitive points is that both India and Pakistan are atomic powers and a war 
between them can lead to a major world disaster which must be avoided at any 
cost. Yet, the Pakistani people are of two opinions about relations with India. 
One opinion is in favor of bilateral relations to make the region safe for the 
future generations and to reduce defense budgets for the prosperity of the 
people. But the other people don’t accept these arguments saying that India 
can’t be our friend. India is our enemy for ever and we should not trust on the 
enemy.

Keeping in view the importance of the issue, it was included in the study.

6.3 Energy Crisis

Pakistan is passing through the worst ever situation of the energy crisis 
nowadays. According to an official report, the country is currently facing a 
shortage of 3000 Mega Watt electricity. The report says that the actual
consumption of the electricity is 14500 MW while the current production is only 11500 MW (Daily Dawn Islamabad May 13th 2008).

Because of this shortfall, the daily life cycle of the people in Pakistan has badly disturbed. Residential and commercial units, industries, government and private offices, markets all of them are facing a huge problem of power cut-off. Usually the power supply is suspended for six intervals of one hour each in a day.

The reason for this problem lies in the weaknesses of the governments who did not take any action well in time to overcome the problem. The population of the country has increased manifold but no arrangement has been done for their energy needs. The two major dams, Tarbela and Mangla, have been filled with silt and their storage capacity has been decreased sharply. This situation resulted in low production of the electricity. No big dam has been constructed to meet the needs of the nation. Billions of dollars have been invested on the feasibility report of Kalabagh dam, but now this project has been closed due to political reasons. The present government has announced construction of small dams but worries persist there that this arrangement will not be sufficient to meet the needs of the nation. This issue is very much important because each and every person is facing this problem. This is the reason of the inclusion of this issue in this study.

6.7 Food Crisis

The other problem is that an agricultural country like Pakistan is suffering a huge shortage of food items, especially wheat. The price of wheat and its flour has been increased. Even then wheat flour is not easily available
to people. There are certain reasons for this crisis. First, the population of the country has increased manifold and the need for food has also increased. Secondly, the water level in the rivers has decreased which resulted in less production of wheat. Thirdly, a major portion of our wheat is exported or smuggled to Afghanistan because this problematic country is dependent on Pakistan for every thing including food. They have no agriculture, no industry, no seaport, no jobs, no business, and they are dependent on Pakistan for all these things. The other neighboring countries of Afghanistan have closed their borders and the only open border is Pakistan.

Due to these factors, Pakistan is facing a great problem of food shortage and the media donate a reasonable space and time to this issue.

6.8 Judiciary Crisis

One of the most important issues of Pakistan is judiciary crisis. The issue has become a focal point after the establishment of new democratic government. The issue started on March 9th 2007 when President General Pervez Musharraf dismissed the Chief Justice of the Supreme Court of Pakistan Justice Iftikhar Muhammad Chodhary. A huge wave of protest was started by the members of the civil society and lawyers of the country for the restoration of the Chief Justice. On 20th July 2007, the Supreme Judicial Council made the historic decision of the restoration of the Chief Justice. The lawyers celebrated their victory throughout the country. The general public also welcomed the decision. But on the 3rd of November 2007, President Mr. Pervez Musharraf used his special powers and dismissed all the judges of the Supreme Court of Pakistan including the Chief Justice. He appointed new judges and the Chief Justice of Supreme Court with his orders. Again a huge
protest was started by the lawyers and the civil society throughout the country. The issue of the restoration of the judges of the Supreme Court became the major issue of the national elections of 2008. The political parties used this slogan to gain the sympathies of the voters. The new coalition government had promised several times to restore the judiciary. One major political party of the coalition government Muslim League N has a strong stand on the issue and it was not ready to compromise. The actual ruling party, Pakistan Peoples Party was not willing to restore the judiciary; as a result Muslim League N resigned from the government and joined the opposition benches in the parliament. Later on some deposed of judges took a fresh oath while the new president of the country and the Co-Chairperson of the ruling party Mr. Asif Ali Zardari is not willing to restore the Chief Justice of the Supreme Court.

6.9 Lal Masjid Issue

It was a sad incident that happened in Islamabad in June and July 2007 (during the study period of this research project) in which thousands of innocent boys and girls were killed by the armed forces of the country. Lal Masjid (red mosque) is one of the old mosques in the federal capital of the country spreading religious education for decades. A residential seminary named as Jamia Hifza was also attached with the mosque. The administration of the mosque and the seminary was in the hands of two brothers Abdul Aziz and Rasheed Ghazi who were also religious scholars. More than five thousand female students were enrolled in the seminary while a greater number of male students were also enrolled separately in the boys section of the seminary. The dispute emerged between the mosque administration and the government when a portion of the seminary was demolished by the city administration that was
built on some illegally occupied land. As a protest the students of the seminary occupied the nearby children’s library. They demanded to build the demolished part of the seminary that was not acceptable to the city authorities. The government warned the seminary administration to leave the illegal occupation of the library but they did not. Suddenly some reports appeared in the media that some militant activities were happening there. The seminary people also indulged in some illegal activities and took the law in their own hands. They burnt shops of CDs and music and also raided on a Chinese massage center and a center of adultery in Islamabad and kidnapped some women. The government received information from its own sources that weapons were being collected in the premises of the mosque. In this situation the government deployed army troops all around the mosque and the seminary in the last week of June 2007.

A fierce gun battle started on 3rd July 2007 between the seminary students and the military forces. Curfew was imposed in the surrounding areas. The battle lasted for almost two weeks but it took thousands lives of poor children who had come there from all over the country for religious education. Some military personnel and common citizens were also killed in this battle. The main cleric Abdul Aziz was arrested while his younger brother Rasheed Ghazi was killed in the battle. According to some reports the most dangerous chemicals and gases including phosphorus were used during the military operation. The issue remained a hot burning topic of discussion in media as well as in the society. It was included in the current study due to its huge media coverage and its impact on society.
7. Objectives of the Study:

The role of media and especially, print media has been accepted throughout the globe. We can’t live without media. We perceive the picture of the world, as the media present to us. We have some specific pictures of the world issues in our minds because of media. The major objective of this study was to investigate whether and to what extent print media play role to influence public regarding the major important issues of the country and how the media agenda becomes the public agenda with the passage of time.

8. Research Questions

R.Q. 1 Whether and to what extent the print media agenda influences the public agenda in Pakistan?

R.Q. 2 What is the relationship between the public agenda and the print media agenda on the issues of terrorism, Indo-Pak relations, energy crisis, food crisis, judiciary crisis and Lal Masjid?
CHAPTER 2

LITERATURE REVIEW
1. Beginning of the Agenda-Setting Theory

The idea of the agenda-setting role of media has its roots in an old book, *Public Opinion* Written by Walter Lippmann (1922). The author titled his first chapter as “The World Outside and the Pictures in Our Heads.” Lippmann was the person who presented the theory that the mass media make our pictures of the world and inform us about the world events. However, he anticipated that the pictures provided by the media were most of the time incomplete and distorted. People can see only reflections of reality (not reality itself) in the news media. However, those reflections provide the basis for our perceptions about the world.

In 1972, Two researchers McCombs & Shaw conducted an empirical study to investigate the idea that the news media organizations influence our perceptions of the world. As described in the first chapter of this dissertation two researchers from the University of North Carolina thought whether the topics accepted by the news media to represent the outer world reduced the types of events that people used to think about the world. They also thought whether the public’s perception of reality depended on the topics the news media covered or it was not the case (McCombs & Shaw, 1972).

It was a tremendous beginning of a new mass communications theory, which can be divided into two aspects. The first aspect relates with the transmission of issue or object salience from the media agenda to the public agenda. The second aspect relates with the role of news media in framing those issues and things in the minds of masses.
1.1 Expansion of The Chapel Hill Study

A number of researchers and media experts replicated and expended this methodological approach. For instance, a researcher Funkhouser (1973) analyzed news coverage of the issues and public opinion about the most important problem facing the USA across the decade, of 1960s. He reached on the conclusion that a considerable relationship between the media and public agendas existed.

The other research study was conducted by Shaw and McCombs in 1977. They arranged a panel study of the agenda-setting function of the news media. In addition to replicating the basic agenda-setting function, it was found in this study that the increasing media campaign exposure resulted in raising the voters’ interest in politics. It was also found that the influence of agenda setting on different categories of voters was a product of their exposure to media, specific type of medium, political interest of the general public, their need for orientation, and the patterns of the interpersonal communication of the audience members of a society.

Two other researchers Palmgreen and Clark (1977) examined whether differences existed in the media’s agenda-setting role for local and national issues. The most important problem was asked in the question to measure the public agenda of the respondents of the study. The media agenda was measured by content analyses of the three national network newscasts and local television news coverage. They found that the media’s agenda-setting impact is weaker at the local level than at the national level. The researchers suggested that contingent conditions, such as interpersonal communications and personal observation, at the local level might have weakened the media’s agenda-setting ability.
Salwen (1988) replicated the basic agenda-setting hypothesis with a particular focus on how long a set of issues must be in the news to have the best impact on the public agenda. His media and public agendas considered to seven environmental issues. It was found that the initial evidence of significant agenda setting needs five to seven weeks of news coverage. However, the peak impact on the public agenda appeared after eight to ten weeks of news coverage.

1.2 Longitudinal Studies of Agenda Setting

Some researchers examined a specific issue (or issues) over a long period of time. These longitudinal studies also strengthen the agenda-setting function of mass media. A brief summary of such studies is discussed below. Two researchers Winter and Eyal conducted a study in 1981 and discovered that the national concern about civil rights from 1954 to 1976 was a reflection of the rise and fall of news coverage during those years. The percentage of the citizens of US naming civil rights as the most important problem faced by the country ranged form 0% to 52% in the 27 Gallup Polls conducted during the period of 23 years.

Smith (1987) conducted a research study of the relationship between newspaper coverage and public opinion about local issues. He conducted a series of 22 surveys from 1974 to 1981. The media agenda was measured by a content analysis of the *Louisville Times*. Agenda-setting effects were found for such local issues as crime and the environment. Definitely, not all the issues covered in the news consequently had high salience on the public agenda. It gave birth to further questions regarding the “contingent conditions” that enhance or reduce agenda setting.

1.3 Bi-Directional Nature of Agenda-Setting Process
A research study was conducted by Shanto Iyengar and Adam Simon (1991) in USA to find the agenda setting effects regarding the news coverage of the Gulf crisis of 1990. From August 1990 to March 1991, the Gulf crisis was the subject of the extensive news coverage in print as well as in electronic media. This event provided a powerful “natural experiment” for examining the effects of news on the development of public opinion. Framing, priming and agenda setting effects were studied in the research to examine which news coverage shaped the public’s response to the Gulf crisis. Respondents were provided with a choice between military or diplomatic response to the crisis. It was hypothesized that increased exposure to television news would be associated with increases in support for the military response. As per the results of the study, significant agenda setting effects were found - the more the informed respondents and respondents who watched the news more frequently were more apt to favor a military response. There were statistically significant results of the expected relationship. Exposure to episodic news programming strengthened, albeit modestly, support for a military resolution of the crisis (Iyengar & Simon, 1991).

The researchers of the study presented the idea of the unidirectional and bi-directional nature of the agenda setting process. Unidirectional effects of news coverage mean that increases in the news coverage are thought to bring about increases in the salience of particular issues or events. The results of the study provided some bi-directional nature of the agenda-setting process. The emergence of the Gulf as the most important national problem was accompanied by a sudden decline in the prominence of drugs and the budget deficit. The researchers called this phenomenon as the “Hydraulic pattern.”
2. **Determinants of Agenda-Setting Effects.**

What are the determinants of the agenda setting theory? This is an important question of debate among the scholars of Mass Communication. Different scholars presented their views in different ways. Basically, the determinants of the agenda setting effects of media are the factors that play their role in setting the public agenda. Different determinants produce different agenda setting results in different situations. Following are the most agreed determinants of the agenda setting effects.

1. **Media exposure:** Earlier it was considered that media credibility and reliance on the media are the most important determinants of the agenda setting effects. But Wanta & Ghanem (2006) described that exposure was a stronger determinant than media credibility or media reliance, which were unrelated, in a study of Hispanic cable news.

2. **Obtrusiveness:** It refers to the extent that the public has experience with the policy issue. The more unobtrusive an issue, the more the individual may rely on media exposure for orientation. In a research study conducted by Zucker (1978), it was found that salience transfer was maximum for unobtrusive issues.

3. **Need for orientation.** Need for orientation is a function of individual interest in the policy topic combined with issue uncertainty. Weaver (1977) and others found that some persons have greater need for policy orientation and thus are more affected by salience transfer than others.

3. **Time Factor for Affective Agenda Setting**
How much time is required for affective agenda setting and to influence public opinion? This is a point of debate among scholars and researchers. Some of the studies about agenda setting effects have suggested that the ideal time frame for measuring the media effects on public agenda is between two and five months (Winter & Eyal, 1981).

Winter and Eyal state that media emphasis in the month prior to the interview period is the most important time period for media agenda to leave largest impact on the public. The issues which are of importance to the media at the time of the interview period will be having some importance for the public because the public follows the media’s agenda.

4. Agenda Setting at Local level

Agenda-setting effects also have been found at the local level. A number of studies have been conducted to find the agenda setting effects at the local level in different parts of the world. In Spain, two major concerns were unemployment and urban congestion in the state of Pamplona in 1995. Comparisons of all six major concerns on the public agenda with local news coverage in the preceding two weeks found a high degree of relationship (Canel, et al.1996).

Agenda-setting at the community level also proven in the Japanese mayoral election 1986. The voters of Machida City, a residential area of 320,000 residents in the Tokyo metropolitan area, regarded welfare policies, urban facilities, and local taxes as the three most important issues in the election. Comparison of the public agenda, which had seven issues in all, with the coverage across a three-week period of the four major newspapers serving
Machida City yielded a modest, but positive, correlation of +.39 (Takeshita, 1993).

Agenda setting effects were found also in some studies conducted in the countries of South America. In Argentina, agenda-setting effects were found in the 1997 legislative elections in the area of Buenos Aires metropolitan (Lennon, F.R. 1997). Corruption was found prominent on both the public and media agendas throughout the period of research. It was always ranking first or second. But there was some variation in the different months. There was only a reasonable overall relationship (+.43) in September between the public agenda and the combined issue agenda of five major Buenos Aires newspapers. But as Election Day approached in October, the correspondence between the agendas increased to +.80, an increase that indicates a considerable media effect in the closing weeks of the election campaign (Lennon, 1997). Hence it can be said on the basis of the research findings that agenda setting effects of media are not only present at the national level, rather they also exist at the local level and that local communities are also influenced by media effects regarding their local issues.

5. Attribute Agenda Setting

The media not only influence public attention on a particular topic rather they also influence our understanding and perspective on the topics in the news. It also supports the basic assumption of the agenda setting theory that media not only tell what to think about but also tell how to think about. The items that define the agenda are objects. The objects are the things on which the attention of the media and the public are focused. However, these objects have numerous attributes. The attributes are those characteristics and
qualities that describe the object. For each object there also is an agenda of attributes because when the media and the public think and talk about an object, some attributes are emphasized, others are given less attention, and many receive no attention at all. This agenda of attributes is another aspect of the agenda-setting role of the news media (McCombs, 1999).

Media portray the image of the political leaders, election candidates and government officials. The image can be portrayed either in a positive or negative way. This is one aspect of the attribute agenda setting. During the 1996 general election in Spain, the images of the three major party leaders by voters in Navarra city showed considerable correspondence with the media’s presentation of these party leaders (McCombs, 2000).

Attribute agenda setting is not limited to personalities only; rather it includes public issues, too. The aspects of issues selected for attention by the media influence the public’s perception of these issues. During the 2000 presidential election in the U.S., the correspondence between the news media’s presentation of social welfare and the way in which U.S. voters talked about this issue was very high (McCombs, 2000). The results were similar for the issue of environment. For global environmental problems, there was a strong level of correspondence (+.78) between the presentation of this issue in Japanese newspapers and the way that the residents of Tokyo thought about eight different aspects of this issue (Mikami, et al. 1994). Regarding the environmental situation in the U.S., there was also a similarly strong level of correspondence (+.71) between the pictures in people’s minds and local newspaper coverage on six aspects of a project to develop a large man-made lake in central Indiana (Cohen, 1975).
To influence the focus of public attention is a powerful role of media, but influencing the agenda of attributes for an issue or political personality is the peak of political power. Hence, keeping in view the attribute agenda setting power of the mass media, we come to conclude that media have a very strong power to influence audience not only what to think about but also how to think about events, issues and personalities.

5.1 **Role of Media Tone in Attribute Agenda Setting**

The tone of media outlets including newspapers and television news has an important role in agenda setting, especially in attribute agenda setting. The content of mass media messages including the tone of those messages influence the pictures of the world in our minds. They also influence the attitudes and opinions grounded in those pictures.

In Germany, the tone of the news about Helmut Kohl in news magazines and major newspapers influenced public opinion between 1975 and 1984 about his political performance, first, as leader of the opposition and, later, as chancellor (Kepplinger, et al. 1989). According to the research findings, the shifting patterns of positive and negative tone in the media, summed across six attributes of Kohl, prompted significant shifts in his level of approval among the German public.

In the US, a day-by-day observation of the final three months in the 1992 and 1996 presidential elections found that the tone of television news coverage about key campaign events influenced voters’ preference for the candidates. Positive coverage of Republican campaign events on four national television networks increased support for the Republican candidate. On the other hand, favorable coverage of Democrat campaign events decreased
support for the Republican candidate (Shaw, 1999). The difference on the public opinion was a result of media tone.

6. **Priming Effects in Agenda Setting**

By calling attention to some matters while ignoring others, news media influences the standards by which governments, presidents, policies, and candidates in the election campaigns are judged. People depend upon the mass media for information about the world events.

Shanto Iyengar and Donald Kinder (1987), in a series of agenda-setting experiments, produced significant evidence of a priming effect by television news on people’s opinions about the president’s overall performance. Among subjects exposed to extensive news coverage on one or more of five different issues: defense, inflation, arms control, civil rights, and unemployment, their ratings of presidential performance on the issue or issues receiving heavy news coverage influenced their overall opinion about the president’s performance more than among persons not exposed to this news coverage. This influence existed whether or not the news story implied a substantial degree of presidential responsibility for the issue. In subsequent experiments where the degree of presidential responsibility for an issue was explicitly manipulated, the impact of problem performance ratings on opinions about the president’s overall performance was greater when the news stories emphasized presidential responsibility.

Priming effect also occurs for political parties. A research study was conducted in this regard to study the attitude of German voters in 1986. According to the results, political party preference was influenced by the television news agenda. Preference for the Christian Democrats was influenced
by news coverage of two issues, the energy supply and East German situation. Preference for the Social Democratic Party (SDP) was influenced by three issues, East-West relations, environmental protection, and pensions.

7. Interplay of Agenda Setting, Framing and Priming with reference to SARS Coverage

As discussed in the first chapter, agenda setting has a close relationship with its neighboring theories of framing and priming. McCombs and Ghanem (2001) explained the common ground between agenda setting and framing and stated that they both tell us how to think about things. The concepts of framing and priming apply to a great extent to the media coverage of events following epidemics such as the Sudden Acute respiratory Syndrome (SARS) outbreak in China in 2003. Analysis of international news coverage on SARS by Media Tenor between November 2002 & April 2003 indicates that media coverage of SARS on a global scale exceeded the coverage of HIV / AIDS. The study was carried by David and Pavlik at Rutgers University USA in 2003. The study was based on 503 reports on SARS and 37 on HIV/AIDS in three countries (USA, Britain and Germany). Public perception of SARS seemed to be influenced to great extent by media coverage. The research conducted by Media Tenor International found that reporting on SARS seemed to cross the actual and factual information. SARS had led to a decreased economic confidence in Asia. Even sports activities were affected.

8. Agenda Setting as Social learning

Agenda setting is also a process of social learning. People learn about the importance of issues in society through the amount of news media coverage, they receive. The theory of agenda setting assumes that the people
learn about and prioritize the information they receive from the news in proportion to the amount of attention that information is given in media content. For instance, Benton and Frazier (1976) found that agenda setting not only shapes the salience of issues but also the salience of proposed solutions to those issues and the rationales behind those solutions. If media attention results in social learning, this further suggests that people also should hold stronger attitudes as news attention intensifies.

Kiousis and McCombs (2003) conducted a research study in the US to investigate the relationship between agenda setting and attitude strength. It was suggested by the learning model that message dissemination would represent media salience, audience cognition would represent perceived public salience, and audience affect would represent perceived public attitude strength. According to the results of the study strong correlations were found between the amount of attention that the news media pay to political figures and both the public salience and the strength of public attitudes toward these persons. Although all the relationships were found strong, the correlations between media and public salience generally were weaker – a median value of +.58 – than those between media salience and the strength of public attitudes – a median value of +.81 for dispersion and +.70 for polarization.

Communication scholars have found empirical linkages between agenda setting and attitude strength (Kiousis & McCombs, 2004). The version of the traditional hierarchy of effects theory (discussed earlier) offered by Valente et al. (1998) is valuable for this explanation because it includes multiple sequences among the variables.

8. **Role of Interpersonal Communication in Agenda Setting**
Interpersonal communication has also a key role in the process of agenda setting. A number of research studies have been taken place to find the relationship between interpersonal communication and agenda setting.

According to Yang and Stone, Judith Beinstein did a pilot study of opinion formation in 1977 and compared the reported impact of mass media and the interpersonal sources of information among women of different social set ups and societies.

In 1980, Erbring, Goldenberg and Miller “found that interpersonal communication may increase salience by playing an essential role when people want to make sense of new topics reported by the media” (Yang & Stone, 2003, p. 59). It means that talking to others about topics found in the media may make those issues more important for people when they do not understand the issue.

Another idea came from James P. Winter in 1981. He summarized the point, saying some researchers reported that interpersonal discussions filtered or reduced media influence, whereas others reported that they enhanced media effects (Yang & Stone, 2003, p.60).

In 1990, Lasorsa and Wanta found that “the more an individual was exposed to political communication interpersonally, the less likely he or she would conform to the media agenda. In other words, interpersonal communication interferes with the media agenda conformity, but only modestly.” (Yang & Stone, 2003, p.60) This same study was repeated in 1992 with Wanta and Wu. They conducted a political opinion survey comparing media sources with personal sources. They found on the basis of their research findings that “interpersonal communication enhanced agenda-setting effects
when the discussions dealt with issues covered in the media. However, when the discussions dealt with issues that received little coverage in the media, interpersonal communication competed with the media in agenda-setting” (Yang & Stone, 2003, p.60). Both studies confirm that interpersonal communication has a key role in the media’s agenda-setting.

10. **Experimental Research on Agenda Setting**

   Most of the studies regarding agenda setting effects are based on a combination of content analyses of news media and surveys of the opinions of the media audiences. Content analysis is used to evaluate the media text while survey methodology is used to know the public opinion about certain issue or issues. Iyengar, Peters and Kinder conducted two experiments to investigate the effects of agenda setting function of media. Experimental research methodology has its own advantages and limitations.

   Shanto Iyengar and his colleagues (1987) conducted their first experiment in November 1980 and the second one in February 1981. The first experiment focused on alleged weaknesses in U.S. defense capability and employed two conditions. One group of participants (N=13) watched several stories about inadequacies in American defense system (four stories totaling eighteen minutes over four days). Participants in the control group watched news stories with no defense-related stories (N=15). In the second experiment, the researchers expanded the test of agenda setting and examined three problems, requiring three conditions. In one group (N=15), participants viewed newscasts emphasizing (as in experiment 1) inadequacies in U.S. defense system (five stories, seventeen minutes). The second group (N=14) watched news stories emphasizing the issue of environmental pollution (five
stories, fifteen minutes). The third group (N=15) viewed news stories with steady coverage of inflation (eight stories, twenty-one minutes). Each condition in the second experiment was characterized not only by a concentration of stories on the appropriate target problem, but also by planned exclusion of stories dealing with the two other problems under investigation.

According to the results of the experimental study conducted by Iyengar and his colleagues (1987), for defense preparedness, the experimental treatment exerted a statistically significant effect. Participants whose news programs were having stories alleging the vulnerability of U.S. defense capability grew more concerned about defense after the six days of the experiment. The effect is significant substantively as well as statistically. On the first day of the experiment, viewers in the experimental group ranked defense sixth out of eight problems, behind inflation, pollution, unemployment, energy, and civil rights. After watching the newscasts during the experiment, they ranked defense as the second most important problem after inflation. On the other hand, the viewers of the control group stated the relative position of defense as before the experiment.

The second experiment also strengthens the classical agenda setting hypothesis. As in the first experiment, participants were randomly assigned to a condition--this time to one of three conditions, corresponding to an emphasis upon defense preparedness, pollution, or inflation. The researchers found that by ignoring some problems and by projecting others the media can play a very vital role in setting the public agenda.
11. **Web Logs (Blogs) and Agenda Setting**

Today the world has become a global village due to the rapid growth of internet. This new paradigm has affected almost each and every aspect of our lives. Theories and concepts have also been influenced by the boom of technology. The increasing trend of the use of blogs and (to some extent) less reliance on the traditional media has also affected the theory of agenda setting. Chaffee and Metzger’s (2001) predicted that “the key problem for agenda-setting theory will change from what issues the media tell people to think about to what issues people tell the media they want to think about” (p.375).

The journalistically focused web logs give us new lines to understand and measure the agenda setting effects. The previous researches on the agenda setting theory have explored issue salience by focusing on audience recall and public opinion but the web logs invite researchers to consider hyperlinks as behavioral indicators of an issue’s perceived importance. Today, the rapid growth of the Internet has dramatically decentralized the communication power of the traditional media. Web blogs are the most recent demonstration of this trend. Simultaneously, traditional media have adopted the potential of the web. Newspaper stories and audiovisual broadcasts are no longer temporary and disposable things. Today, they are archived, indexed, abstracted and fully capable of receiving links.

Web blogs are considered to be situated somewhere between the traditional journalism and the general masses or public. Different communication experts have termed this phenomenon as “pamphleteer journalism” (Gillmor in Lasica, 2002b), “amateur journalism” (Hiler, 2002), and “do-it-yourself journalism” (Halavais, 2002). Blood (2003) describes web
blogs as participatory media forms that engage in something slightly different than journalism. Whatever term is used, it is clear that many web blog authors ask questions about current events and read stories against one another. Although the author’s personal voice is the foundation of every web blog (Lennon, 2003), hyperlinks to external information are also vital to this form of journalism.

The historical intellectual foundations of the field of mass communication may provide some signals about the role of blogs. Katz and Lazarsfeld (1955) suggested in one of their old study that media influence could be conceptualized as a two-step flow in which opinion leaders play their role between journalists and the general public. Two researchers of the mass communication field Brosius and Weimman (1996) linked the two-step flow to agenda setting research, arguing that agenda setting is a process in which influential individuals. This is an excellent description of journalistically-focused web log authors. Web blogs are considered as a part of a broader trend toward the decentralization of communication power of media. Amateur journalism is going to be mature with the passage of time. Web blogs have demonstrated their ability to affect the flow of information between traditional media and audiences. From the agenda setting point of view, the most important thing about web blogs is the way in which they bridge different components of our public life.

12. Political Agenda Setting Power of the Mass Media

The political agenda setting power of the mass media has been recognized worldwide. A reasonable number of research studies support the
political agenda setting power of the mass media. The basic research question in this regard can be asked as “Do the mass media determine the political agenda?” In a precise manner, it can be asked whether and to what extent mass media are able to boost political attention of the people towards some issue. Some researchers have asked this question in these words: “under what specific circumstances are mass media, via their coverage of an issue, able to boost political attention for that issue?” (Walgrave S. & Aelst P.V. 2004, p.1) Different studies regarding political agenda setting power have presented different findings with different methodologies. On the basis of an overview of the available (non-electoral) political agenda setting studies, Walgrave S. & Aelst P.V. (2004) presented a model of six basic design choices. This basic design can be summarized as under:

1- A great majority of the available studies was carried out in the US and focused on the US presidential or congressional agenda. Apart from the US there are only a few political agenda-setting studies.

2- Regarding media agenda, most of the studies conducted relied on the data of Television and/or newspapers. Most of the studies adopted almost similar sampling and coding procedures.

3- Issue selection is perhaps the dimension in which political agenda-setting studies, and agenda-setting in general, have made most progress. Research on different issues provides different results opening different agenda setting dimensions.

4- The choice of research methodology is also an important factor. Political agenda-setting implies a time gap between issue coverage and issue adoption. Some studies relied on time-series designs, because they are
better capable of tapping media effects. Yet some other researches were based on interviews.

5- Different studies were conducted in different time periods. Some of them were campaign studies conducted during election periods while others were conducted in non-election periods. The research studies undertaken during the election and non-election times are fundamentally different in their nature. Because of this fundamental difference both types of studies, electoral and routine times studies, produced different results.

Hundreds of research studies all over the world established solid correlations between the media’s and the public’s priorities (for example McCombs and Shaw 1993; Dearing and Rogers 1996; Ghanem 1996 etc.). The majority of the agenda-setting studies was conducted by the communication scholars and focused on media and public opinion and not on media and politics. The number of studies clearly focusing on the political agenda and the media remains limited (for example Rogers, Dearing et al. 1993; Eilders 1997). However, the studies conducted exclusively to investigate the political agenda setting effects of the mass media also present different findings and results, may be due to different methodologies and different situations. Some studies revealed only modest or even no media effects. According to these scholars, the impact of the media on the political agenda is limited. For example, Walker (1977) pointed out that The New York Times, concerning the three innovative safety laws passed in the US Senate from the 1950s onwards, simply followed the legislative process instead of leading it.

Light followed a similar research track, interviewing the US president’s advisors about whom were the most important agencies fuelling
the domestic agenda. He concluded that the media were not important because they were only seldom mentioned by policy makers (Light 1982). In a study conducted in the Netherlands, Kleinnijenhuis (2003) found only limited media impact on politics and a much stronger reverse impact.

According to the advocates of the limited effects, the limited power of the media may be due to their short attention period always running from one crisis to another hence diluting their attention on the slower workings of democracy (Kingdon 1984; Dearing and Rogers 1996). Another weakness of the media mentioned by Kingdon (1984) is its tendency to highlight the most amazing, prominent and sometimes sensitive stories, while these stories tend to take place at the end of the policy-making process, and not at the beginning.

On the other hand, the majority of the researchers and scholars of the agenda setting theory claimed the existence of strong media effects on the political agenda. Another researcher Trumbo (1995) closely examined the up and down of the global warming issue from 1985 till 1992 and concluded that the media played a considerable role in the policy attention for the issue. Linsky (1986), on the basis of his empirical research among US policy makers, attributes a lot of agenda-setting power to the media. Soroka (2002) came to similar conclusions based on a time series analysis of three issues in Canada. Especially in terms of the environmental issue, the media were setting the agenda of public and politics. On the basis of his longitudinal time-series data, another media scholar Bartels (1996) described that the media have an independent impact on the political agenda. Concerning. Drawing upon an innovative experimental design also Cook and colleagues (1983) found that
policymakers were influenced by watching TV news and considered the covered topic to be more important.

Then there is a huge debate on the impact of time factor in political agenda setting. The research studies on election campaigns have different effects than studies conducted in routine political times. Political agenda setting is inherently contingent on time. Elections have a huge impact on the power and status of political parties and candidates. Election campaigns are considered as a crucial part of electoral system. Furthermore, according to Panebianco (1988) ‘floating’ voters make up their mind in this short period just before the day of election.

13. Interplay of Agenda Setting among Media, Public and Policy makers

Agenda setting plays an important role among media, public and policy makers. These relationships are considered as a focus point in political communication because they inform us about interactions among newspapers, radio and television broadcasts, politicians and the government. Most of the communication researchers remained limited with the investigation of the relationship between the media and the public but they ignored another key element, which are the policy makers. Government officers and bureaucrats, who are ultimate policy makers, are influenced by the media and public agenda. Very little work on the public agenda setting has been done to empirically connect the policy, media and public agendas. Basically, these fields are intimately connected and the investigation about their interrelationship can provide us a more complete and probably more accurate picture of the political interactions in a society. Some of the media scholars
conducted their studies to investigate the relationship between the media, the public and policy makers. Different issues have led to different agenda setting results. Different scholars provided different reasons for this variance. Methodological differences can be one reason. Issue attribute is also an important factor. Zucker (1978) presented his attribute theory stating that the more obtrusive an issue is, the more likely people experience it directly. In such situations, the media have less potential for effects on public opinion. Other scholars have presented additional hypotheses in this regard. For instance:

1- Concrete issues should be more open to media effects than abstract issues. (Yagade & Dozier 1990).

2- Public has limited attention span, therefore issues that are silent for a long period, will eventually offer less opportunity for media influence (Zucker 1978).

3- Issues that involve dramatic events or conflict should have an increased potential for media effects on public opinion (MacKuen & Coombs 1981, Wanta & Hu 1993).

Stuart N. Soroka (2002) conducted a research study in Canada to find the relationship between the media, the public and policy makers regarding three issues inflation, environment and debit/deficit. The study period was over a ten-year duration from 1985 to 1995. The results of the study suggested three different agenda setting dynamics. It was found that differences in agenda setting dynamics were systematically linked to issue attributes. Inflation was found as a real world-driven issue during the study period while environmental issues were found as media-driven. The issue of debit/deficit
was found as policy-driven issue. The media’s role was found stronger for environmental and debit/deficit issues. However, regarding the issue of inflation, it was found that the Canadian public (and policy makers) reacted to real world economic conditions rather than reliance on media content. The results confirmed the idea that there are important and traceable interactions between the media, public opinion, and policy makers. The results also demonstrated the value of an agenda setting framework, a means of modeling media effects and the policy process, and the importance of issue attributes in agenda setting processes.

14. **Media, Specific Events and Agenda Setting**

Modern-day agenda setting researchers are investigating the attributes of culturally specific agendas, although this is a complex process. Each and every society of the world has its own socio-cultural norms, values and traditions. Media usually follow the cultural baseline of a society. The socio-cultural symbols of a society are framed by the media to achieve the goal of agenda setting. Except a few, almost all of the agenda setting studies have been conducted in the western world which is the most advanced and developed part of world. The media are widely dispersed and used in these countries. On the other hand, in the developing countries, the process of media agenda setting is complex because these are not media-dependent societies. In these countries, media coverage and presentation of issues interact with a number of other societal and cultural factors in a net of relationships and interrelationships to produce effects. In countries where the media are not as widely available, certain events, due to their socio-cultural importance, provide people meaning other than from the media. In these circumstances the
socio-cultural context combines powerfully with media presentation/framing to influence the way the audience feels about the issues and events (Protess & McCombs, 1991) and to ultimately cause agenda setting. Socialization and social interaction help people to determine and clarify in their own minds what they think about the world in which they live. Rogers, Hart and Dearing suggest that the original research question of the Chapel Hill Study has been expanded to the following questions:

1- How is the media agenda set?

2- What are the contributions of the theories of social movements and resource mobilization, in which publics are issue centered and very active, to the agenda setting paradigm?

3- Why do real world indicators play a minor role in the agenda-setting process compared to human tragedies and triggering events?

4- What role do priming and framing play in the myriad of human decisions that constitute the agenda setting process? (Rogers et al., 1997, p.235).

Question three and four provide new dimensions for the agenda setting research. Kwamena Kwansah-Aidoo from Monash University Victoria, Australia conducted a comprehensive research study to find the agenda setting effects of media coverage regarding specific cultural events in a Ghanaian context. Although this study was conducted in Ghana, it also provides representation of the other developing countries and societies of the world.

It was assumed by the researcher that cognitive predispositions might be influenced by many different and sometimes varied factors including the socio-cultural and the frames presented to individuals by the media. Hence the
study moved beyond the media agenda - public agenda relationship by investigating other factors that may influence the agenda setting process. Furthermore, it was an attempt to find the second level of agenda setting that can also be called as attribute agenda setting which suggests that media play a significant role in shaping people’s opinions and ways of thinking about issues and events.

The study revolved around the happening of two events in the last decade of the second millennium that played a major role in highlighting the environmental problem in the country. The first event happened on November 5, 1996 when tribal chiefs arranged a huge demonstration against the mining activities in their area Tarkwa. They protested against the degradation of their land and water resources as a result of surface mining activities. The second event happened in Nima, a suburb and slum area of Accra, the capital of Ghana on October 31, 1997 where people caused a traffic jam by putting huge piles of rubbish and garbage on the main highway of their area. This was their protest they could no longer tolerate garbage dumps and piles in their area. The protest drew the attention of the authorities to the collapsing state of waste management in the locality. In the clash between people and police, a young man lost his life. So the event became big news for the media.

Almost all of the TV channels and newspapers of the country covered these two events keeping in view their socio-cultural significance and values of the society. From a theoretical agenda-setting point of view, the two events were different but they have some similarities. Both events were unusual instances in their happening and nature of protest. In a broader context, both of them were linked to environmental issues, which ultimately made them media
issues. Briefly, it was the media coverage that made people aware of the incidents and also of the seriousness of the issues that were represented by the two specific events. Through their extensive coverage media played a vital role in highlighting the environmental issue in Ghana (Kwansah-Aidoo, K. 2003).

The research methodology was based on content analysis of the media reports, public interviews, journalists’ interviews and focus group discussions. The findings of the study show that majority of the respondents stated that specific events covered by the media had influenced them in determining the important environmental issues. The result shows that media framing is significant in making issues appear important to the audience. The two events under study were having a socio-cultural importance but it was simultaneously important how the media represented the symbols and significance attached to them in their coverage that ultimately led the audience to make the environmental connections. Hence, the study proves direct media effects on audience members. The researcher concluded his study with these remarks:

“The specific incidents indicated by the respondents had within them the ability to provoke interest in the audiences. Their socio cultural significance made them unforgettable” (Kwansah-Aidoo, K. 2003, p.61)
CHAPTER 3

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

1. Research Problem

This study aims to find the relationship between the print media agenda and the public agenda in Pakistani society exploring the agenda setting effects.
of mass media. As discussed in the earlier two chapters, almost more than three hundred studies have been conducted to investigate the agenda setting role of media on audience members of different societies. Except a few, almost all of them have been conducted in the advanced and developed countries of the world. In Pakistan, no research study has been conducted on the agenda setting effects of the mass media on society. This research will be perhaps, the first ever study of its kind in the country. The basic purpose of the study is to investigate the relationship of the print media agenda and the public agenda in Pakistan. In other words, the study will focus on the agenda setting role of the print media in Pakistan. Being conducted in a developing country of the third world, hopefully, the results of the study will open some new dimensions in the field of agenda setting research.

2. Research Design

Researchers usually use one method for their research. But good research usually benefits from the use of a combination of methods. Hansen & Cottle (1998) propose that researchers should not only consider which is the most appropriate method for their study or problem but also what combination of research methods might produce a better and deeper understanding of it. The aim should always be to choose those methods, or combination of methods, which can elaborate the most angles and dimensions of what are invariably multidimensional and complex processes and phenomena (Hansen, A. & Cottle, S. 1998).

Keeping in view the nature and requirement of this study, content analysis as well as survey research was adopted to explore and examine the relationship between the public agenda and the print media agenda in Pakistan.
Content analysis of the two national dailies of Pakistan was done on alternate days for one year. These newspapers are the daily Dawn (the largest widely circulated English newspaper) and the daily Jang (the largest widely circulated Urdu newspaper). Coverage for the following six issues was categorically analyzed.

1. **Terrorism**

2. **Indo-Pak relations/ Kashmir issue**

3. **Energy crisis**

4. **Food crisis**

5. **Judiciary crisis**

6. **Lal Masjid (Red Mosque)**

To investigate the relationship between the public agenda and the print media agenda, a survey of three hundred newspapers’ readers from the city of Islamabad was conducted. The questionnaires were filled by the newspapers’ readers. Then the results of the survey research were compared with the results of the content analysis to investigate the relationship between the print media agenda and the public agenda.

### 3. Significance of the Study

The role of media and especially, print media has been accepted throughout the globe. We can’t live without media. We perceive the picture of the world, as the media present to us. We have some specific pictures of the world issues in our minds because of media. This study has been designed to investigate whether and to what extent print media play role to influence public regarding the major important issues of the country and how the media agenda becomes the public agenda with the passage of time. Although a
number of research studies have been conducted in the developed countries on this area, agenda-setting research has rarely been done in the developing parts of the world and it was perhaps the first ever study of its kind and nature in Pakistan.

4. Methodology

Content analysis as well as survey research was adopted for this study.

4.1 Content Analysis

Content of the two newspapers, daily Jang Rawalpindi and daily Dawn Islamabad was analyzed for this study for one year. (From May 1st 2007 to April 30th 2008). The reason for the selection of these newspapers is that the former one is the largest widely circulated newspaper of Urdu in Pakistan while the later one is the largest widely circulated English daily of the country. Both newspapers have a strong professional reputation covering almost all of the important issues of the country as well as the important issues of the world. They have engaged a sufficient number of highly qualified senior and professional journalists in their organizational structures. The main reason for the time period is that the issues of the study remained dominant in the Pakistani print media almost constantly throughout the period of the research study. The content analysis of the front and back pages of the newspapers was done on the alternate days. This method of content analysis is also called as ‘one paper skip or alternate day’ phenomenon. The content analysis of the daily Dawn was conducted of the newspapers published on even dates (2, 4 6, etc.) and the content of the daily Jang was analyzed on the odd dates (1, 3, 5, etc.). Hence the content of a total number of 182 copies of daily Dawn and 183
newspapers of daily Jang was analyzed thoroughly and the news on the issues of the study were counted and their length was measured in centimeters per column.

4.1.1 Variables of the Content Analysis

Frequency and Length

News stories published about the issues of the study on the front and back pages of the sample newspapers were counted and their length was measured in centimeters per column. Here, this is important to mention that the pictures accompanied by the news stories were also measured and space given to them was included in the measurement of the length of the news stories about the issues of the study.

Slant

The slant of the news stories published about the issues was also analyzed in terms of favorable, unfavorable and neutral. The slant was measured by analyzing the coding unit of analysis that is paragraph. Paragraphs were analyzed separately and were coded in the code sheet as favorable, unfavorable and neutral. The detail of the slant can be seen in the Rules of categorization available in this chapter.

Frame

Framing is an important factor in agenda setting effects. It means how a news story was framed. Whether it was depicting US as our friend or foe or neutral etc. The frames of the news stories were measured in terms of friend, foe, neutral, pro government, anti government, and neutral etc. These were
measured on the basis of the contextual unit because the whole news story was a contextual unit.

**Source**

The source of the news stories was also recorded as official, unofficial and others etc. Here, the category of ‘others’ include media reports based on their own analyses, reports from other media etc. This variable has been included because of the vital role of the gatekeepers in the news making process. News sources are basically gatekeepers and they give information to media personnel keeping in view their own interest and benefit. The news stories based on the facts provided by the official channels will have a different slant and frame than the news story coming from the independent or unofficial sources. Ultimately, the news stories coming from two different sources will have different effects on the audience members.

**Placement**

The placement is also a very important factor in agenda setting study. It means where the news story was placed in the newspaper. In this study, the placement was divided into four categories. These are as under:

1- Front Page upper half
2- Front Page lower half
3- Back Page upper half
4- Back Page lower half

Code sheet for the content analysis is attached in the appendices at the end of this thesis.

**4.1.2 Coding Unit of Analysis**
The paragraphs of the news stories were the coding unit of the content analysis. These were counted in terms of favorable, unfavorable and neutral. For example, the paragraphs about the issue of terrorism in favor of the US were considered as favorable. The paragraphs of the news story about the same issue against the US were considered as unfavorable. If the paragraph was having none of the favorable or unfavorable image or a mixed image, the coding unit was considered as neutral.

4.1.3 Contextual Unit of Analysis

The whole news story was the contextual unit of analysis in this study and frames were measured on the basis of this unit. Framing was measured through contextual units of analyses.

4.1.4 Intra-coder and Inter-coder Reliability

For the validity and reliability purpose, an intra coder and inter coder reliability tests were conducted and the results were found as 95% and 85% respectively. The tests provided reliability to the findings of the content analysis.

4.2 Survey Research

A survey of three hundred (300) regular readers of these newspapers (150 readers of each newspaper) was conducted in Islamabad because the researcher is stationed in Islamabad, the federal capital of Pakistan. The list of the regular subscribers was obtained from the management of these newspapers. The sample of 300 respondents was selected equally among the seventeen residential sectors of Islamabad. These sectors are: E-7, E-8, E-9, F-6, F-7, F-8, F-10, F-11, G-6, G-7, G-8, G-9, G-10, G-11, I, 8, I-9 and I-10. The commercial areas, offices and organizational and institutional sectors were not
included. Although the sample was selected from Islamabad and not from the other areas of the country but even then it represents the trend of the whole country. This is also a fact that very few people living in the rural areas read newspapers regularly because of a number of reasons (including financial problems, low literacy rate and logistic hurdles etc.). According to the Newspaper Readership Report of 2008 issued by Gallup Survey of Pakistan, only four percent of the regular newspaper readers live in villages and small towns. Furthermore, Islamabad is not an old city (until 1960 it was a forest) and it represents the people of the whole country who are living here for their jobs, businesses or residential facilities. The residents of this city have come from nooks and corners of the country and they virtually represent the population of the whole country. Keeping in view these facts, it can be said that to a greater extent, the sample of the study represents the newspaper readership of the whole country. The results of the survey research were then compared with the results of the content analysis. The opinion of the readers of the daily Dawn was compared with the results of the content analysis of the same newspaper while the results of the survey of the readers of daily Jang were compared with the findings of the content analysis of the same newspaper.

The questionnaire was administered through a team of the volunteer students of Mass Communication at the Allama Iqbal Open University Islamabad. The whole process was supervised by the researcher of this study. The questionnaire of the survey is attached in the appendices at the end of this thesis.

4.2.1 Universe and Sampling
Newspapers of Pakistan are the universe of the content analysis of this study while the above-mentioned two of the most widely circulated newspapers of Pakistan are the sample of this study. The content of these newspapers was analyzed for one year. On the other hand, newspaper readers are the universe for the survey research while 300 readers were selected in Islamabad as the sample for this study.

4.2.2 Variables of Survey Research

Salience:

The measurement of the salience assigned to the issues under study was the most important variable of this research study. The salience was measured by giving a list of the issues of the study to the correspondents and asking them to give them rank order according to their own perception.

Source of Information:

The respondents were asked to tell the most important source of information for the formulation of their opinion about the salience of the issues. The options were given among print media, electronic media, interpersonal channels and any other source of information.

Formation of Opinion:

Formation of opinion of the newspapers’ readers was also measured though a question and its results were correlated with the slant of the newspaper coverage. This variable was included to strengthen the findings of the study.

Discussions with family and friends:
This is our every day experience that we discuss the important issues of the day with our family members, colleagues and friends. Usually, when we get some information about an issue, we discuss it with our family and friends to strengthen our opinion and perception. Hence it plays an important role in agenda setting. We can call this process as the second level of agenda setting. In the first level audience receive information about an issue from media and then in the second phase they discuss this issue with their family and friends. Hence agenda setting works at its best.

5. Theoretical Framework

Theory of Agenda-setting was the focal point of this research. The whole research revolves around this theory. How the print media influence public agenda and how the media agenda becomes the public agenda? These questions were addressed in this study.

6. Problems faced

To conduct a research study in a developing country like Pakistan is not an easy job where research culture does not exist at all. Except a very few, people are unaware of the importance of the research in a society. To get the answers of a questionnaire from respondents is also not an easy job because most of them feel reluctant and hesitant to give their opinion freely.

All of the content analysis of this study was done manually from the newspapers which was also a very laborious task. No data is available about newspapers’ coverage online. There is no data bank in Pakistan like Lexis and Nexus in the USA. It took several months to complete the task.
Here is no system of proper guidance to the research students. There are only few experts who know about the latest research techniques. Most of the university teachers have grip on the old historic and descriptive research and they don’t have any knowledge of the modern empirical research methods and statistical tests. So the lack of proper guidance was also a problem during this study.

One of the issue of the study was ‘energy crisis’ and this issue badly disturbed the smooth functioning of this research study too. The country is going through a worst kind of the situation of power cut-off and the researcher could not get rid of it.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Categories</th>
<th>Rules</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1- Topics / Issues</td>
<td>Terrorism</td>
<td>Coverage on Terrorism means all of the news related to the aftermath of 9/11.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Indo-Pak Relations</td>
<td>Coverage on Indo-Pak relations means all of the news related to bilateral relations between India and Pakistan.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Energy Crisis</td>
<td>Coverage on the issue of energy crisis means news related to the shortage of electricity and power cut-off.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Food Crisis</td>
<td>Coverage about food crisis means news about the shortage of basic food items especially the wheat flour.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Judiciary Crisis</td>
<td>Coverage on judiciary crisis means news about the issue of termination of the judges of the Supreme court.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lal Masjid</td>
<td>Coverage of the issue of the Lal Masjid means news about the issue of the Lal Masjid.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2- Slant</td>
<td>Favorable for US</td>
<td>Favorable for US coverage means news stories about terrorism giving a positive image of the US. This category includes news on the war against terrorism, official statements of the US government and Pakistan government, official visits, news on Pak-US relations, US aid to Pakistan, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Unfavorable for US</td>
<td>Unfavorable for US coverage means news stories about terrorism giving a negative image of the US. This category includes news against the US policies on terrorism, statements of political and religious leaders, statements of Taliban and Al Qaeda leaders, news showing reaction and revenge to US policies, bomb blasts, attacks on military people etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frame</td>
<td>Description</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Neutral</strong></td>
<td>News stories about terrorism having equal number of paragraphs giving positive and negative image of the US.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Favorable for bilateral relations</strong></td>
<td>News giving a positive image for bilateral relations between India and Pakistan.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Unfavorable for bilateral relations</strong></td>
<td>News giving a negative image for bilateral relations between India and Pakistan.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Neutral</strong> (about bilateral relations)</td>
<td>News having equal paragraphs (favorable and unfavorable) or giving a neutral image for bilateral relations between India and Pakistan.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Favorable for Government</strong> (About energy, food, Judiciary crisis &amp; Lal Masjid).</td>
<td>It means news giving a favorable image of the government on these issues.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Neutral</strong> (About the issues)</td>
<td>News having equal paragraphs (favorable and unfavorable for the government) or giving a neutral image.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>3- Frame</strong></td>
<td>Friend</td>
<td>News giving an image of a friendly country.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Foe</td>
<td>News giving an image of an enemy country.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Pro Government</strong> (About energy, food, Judiciary crisis &amp; Lal Masjid).</td>
<td>Pro-Government frame (on the issues under study) means the news giving a positive image of the government.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Anti Government</strong> (About energy, food, Judiciary crisis &amp; Lal Masjid).</td>
<td>Anti-Government frame (on the issues under study) means news giving a negative image of the government.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4- Frequency</strong></td>
<td>Frequency means number of news stories published on the front and back pages of the newspapers about the issues under study.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>5- Length</strong></td>
<td>Length of the news stories means length in centimeters per column. The standard width of a newspaper column in Pakistan is 4.5 centimeters. Pictures with</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
the text of a news story were also measured in this variable.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>6- Source</th>
<th>Official</th>
<th>Official source means some person or persons giving information to media from inside the government or official set up.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Un-official</td>
<td>Unofficial source means some person giving information to media from outside the government or official set up.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Others</td>
<td>The news story whose source is not identified will be treated as ‘others’. It may contain newspapers’ own analyses etc.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>7- Placement</th>
<th>Front Page Upper (Upper half page)</th>
<th>News published on the upper half portion of the front page will fall here.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Front Page Lower (Lower half page)</td>
<td>News published on the lower half portion of the front page will fall here.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Back Page Upper (Upper half page)</td>
<td>News published on the upper half portion of the back page will fall here.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Back Page Lower (Lower half page)</td>
<td>News published on the lower half portion of the back page will fall here.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER 4
DATA ANALYSIS
1. Data Analysis of the Content Analysis

As described in the earlier chapter, the largest widely circulated English newspaper daily Dawn and the largest widely circulated Urdu newspaper daily Jang were content analyzed for one year on alternate days. The study period was from May 2007 to April 2008. The Dawn was analyzed on even dates (2, 4, 6 and so on) and the Jang was analyzed on odd dates (1, 3, 5 and so on). The news items published about the issues of the study on the front and back pages of these newspapers were counted and their length was measured in centimeters per column. The reason for the selection of the front and back pages was that these are the most important pages in a newspaper and usually most of the people rely on only these two pages and they don’t have enough time to go through the inner pages. The limitations of time and resources also did not allow expanding the content analysis of the study to the inner pages. The slant of the news was measured in terms of favorable, unfavorable and neutral while frames were measured in terms of friend and foe for the issues of terrorism and Indo-Pak relations while the same was measured in terms of pro-government and anti-government for the remaining issues being the internal issues of the country. The source of the news stories was also measured as official, unofficial and others. The placement of the news stories also plays an important role in agenda setting; therefore this was also measured in four categories. These categories were front page upper half, front page lower half, back page upper half and back page lower half. The analysis has been presented on separate basis for both of the newspapers because these newspapers have different agenda setting patterns and ultimately this difference exists in the public agenda setting. The result of the content analysis is described in the coming lines.
This is also important to mention here that for the validity and reliability purpose, an intra coder and inter coder reliability tests were conducted and the results were 95% and 85% respectively. The tests provided reliability to the findings of the content analysis.

2. Frequency of the News Stories published on the Issues

During the study period of one year the daily Jang published 407 news stories on its front and back pages about the issue of judiciary crisis and hence this issue got the largest coverage among the issues of the study. The issue of terrorism got the second position having a number of 316 news stories which were published in the daily Jang. The newspaper published one hundred news stories about the issue of Lal Masjid (Red mosque) and hence the issue got the third position in its coverage during the year of the study. The issue of food crisis remained on fourth position having a score of 65 news items while the fifth position went to the issue of Indo-Pak relations having a score of 52 news stories. The issue of the energy crisis got the minimum coverage in this newspaper during the year and only 45 news items were published on the crisis. Hence the total number of the news stories about the issues of the study published on the front and back pages of the daily Jang (on alternate days) was 985.

On the other hand, the daily Dawn donated the number one coverage to the issue of terrorism by publishing 479 news stories on its front and back pages during the period of one year (on alternate days). Here, the issue of judiciary crisis got the second position having a score of 129 news stories. The issue of Indo-Pak relations got the third maximum coverage having a score of 104 news items. Thirty nine news stories were published about the issue of food crisis and the issue remained on the fourth position just like the coverage of daily Jang. The issue of energy crisis remained on fifth position having a score of 36 news stories while the issue of Lal
Masjid got the minimum coverage in this newspaper because only 31 news stories were published about this issue on the front and back pages of the daily Dawn. Hence the Dawn published a total number of 819 news stories on the issues of this study.

The difference in the media agenda setting can be seen in the following two figures. The figures show two different patterns of the coverage to the most important issues of the time in the two newspapers. The figure 4.1 elaborates the frequency of news stories about the issues of the study published in the daily Jang during the study period of one year while the figure 4.2 depicts the coverage of these issues in daily Dawn in the same period.

**Figure 4.1 Frequency of the news stories published in daily Jang**

![Graph showing frequency of news stories](image-url)
The issue of judiciary crisis got first position in daily Jang while it remained on number two in the daily Dawn. On the other hand, the issue of terrorism got the maximum coverage in the daily Dawn but it remained on number two in the daily Jang. The issue of the Lal mosque remained on number third position in the daily Jang while it got the minimum coverage on the front and back pages of the daily Dawn by publishing only 31 news stories. The only issue which got the same position in the two newspapers was the issue of the food crisis that remained on number four position in the two newspapers. The issue of the Indo-Pak relations remained on fifth position in the daily Jang but stunningly it got the third position in the daily Dawn. The issue of the energy crisis got the last position of number six in the daily Jang while it remained on the second last position in the daily Dawn.

The difference between the coverage of the issues of the study in both the newspapers is significant (chi square = 1094; p.000 for the daily Dawn and chi square = 746; p.000 for the daily Jang).
3. Length of the News Stories

The space (length) given to the news stories about the issues of the study was measured in centimeters per column. The normal width of a column in the Pakistani newspapers is four centimeters. This is important to mention here that the visual coverage of the issues in shape of pictures was also included in the measurement of the length of the news stories. Most of the news items published on the front and back pages of the newspapers carry their remaining parts on the inner pages. The length of the remaining parts of the news stories published on the inner pages was also included in the measurement.

The daily Jang donated a space of 13017 centimeters column to the number one issue of judiciary crisis while it gave 8921 centimeters column to the issue of terrorism. The third issue of the Lal Masjid received coverage of 2637 centimeters while the fourth issue of the food crisis got coverage of 1620 centimeters column. The newspaper gave fifth position to the issue of Indo-Pak relations which received length of 1013 centimeters column while the issue of the energy crisis received coverage of 1273 centimeters. This is pertinent to mention that the sequence of the coverage of the issues remained same as it was in the frequency measurement. However, the issue of the energy crisis which was on the last position in frequency measurement got more coverage than the issue of Indo-Pak relations in its length measurement. The figure 4.3 depicts the picture of the space given to the news stories of the issues by the daily Jang.
The figure 4.4 explains the length of the news stories about the issues of the study published in the daily Dawn. The relationship of the coverage of the issues was the same as it was in the frequency measurement. The world wide issue of terrorism got the largest portion of the newspaper coverage by getting a length of 14372 centimeters column while the judiciary issue received the second largest portion of the newspaper coverage by having 4864 centimeters column. The number three issue Indo-Pak relations got 2451 centimeters column coverage in the daily Dawn while the issue of the food crisis received a space of 1315 centimeters column in this
newspaper. The issue of the energy crisis received 1223 centimeters while the issue of the Lal Masjid got the minimum coverage of 1201 centimeters column in the front and back pages of the daily Dawn (on alternate days) in the whole year of the study period.

The difference in the coverage of the issues of the study in both of the newspapers is significant (chi square = 819; p.000 for the Dawn and chi square = 1566; p.000 for the Jang. The result of the statistical test is same as it was found in the earlier variable of the number of news stories published during the study period in the both newspapers.

4. Slant

The slant of the news stories published about the issues of the study was measured in terms of favorable, unfavorable and neutral. The paragraph was the coding unit of analysis and the slant was measured according to the “Rules of Categorization” already mentioned in the previous chapter.

Table 4.1 Slant of the news stories published in the newspapers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Issues</th>
<th>Daily Jang</th>
<th></th>
<th>Daily Dawn</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Terrorism</td>
<td>678</td>
<td>741</td>
<td>307</td>
<td>1986</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indo-Pak relations</td>
<td>119</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>309</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Energy Crisis</td>
<td>104</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Food Crisis</td>
<td>160</td>
<td>109</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>190</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Judiciary Crisis</td>
<td>382</td>
<td>1582</td>
<td>323</td>
<td>282</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lal Masjid</td>
<td>149</td>
<td>280</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The table 4.1 unveils the slant of the national Pakistani newspapers about the issues of the study. The table depicts the actual number of the paragraphs in terms of favorable, unfavorable and neutral separately in the both newspapers.

**4.1 Slant for the issue of Terrorism**

The figure 4.5 elaborates the slant for the issue of terrorism in the daily Dawn and the daily Jang. The Dawn donated 48 percent news coverage favorable for the issue of terrorism, 32 percent coverage unfavorable for the US and 20 percent neutral.

On the other hand, the daily Jang gave 39 percent coverage favorable for the US, 43 percent slant was given against the US while its 18 percent coverage was neutral. Here we can see a clear difference between the policy of English and Urdu journalism about the issue of terrorism.

*Figure 4.5 Slant for the issue of Terrorism*

Being the largest widely circulated English newspaper of the country, the Dawn gave more coverage in favor of the US policies and less coverage against the policies of the US while the daily Jang gave more coverage against the US policies and the less coverage favorable for the US. The possible reasons of this difference will be discussed later on.
4.2 Slant for the issue of Indo-Pak Relations

The issue of the Indo-Pak relations always remained an important topic in the country for several reasons. Two wars and several battles have been fought between the two countries. Now the Pakistani media is playing its role to change enmity into good relations. The figure 4.6 is evident for this struggle.

As the figure shows, the daily Dawn gave 42 percent slant in favor of the bilateral relations, 37 percent coverage for the slant unfavorable for the relations while 21 percent news coverage was found as neutral. The daily Jang donated its 56 percent slant in favor of the bilateral relations, only 20 percent slant against the Indo-Pak relations while its 24 percent coverage was neutral.

**Figure 4.6 Slant for the issue of Indo-Pak relations**

![Figure 4.6 Slant for the issue of Indo-Pak relations](image)

Most of the news stories favorable for the bilateral relations were about the exchange of delegations, meetings of the officials to discuss the issues, exchange of prisoners, statements of the politicians and ministers for good relations, traveling facilities, visa relaxation etc. The negative news were about the issue of Kashmir, threats to each others, killing of the prisoners, blaming of terrorist activities and bomb explosions on each other, etc.
4.3 Slant for the issue of Energy Crisis

The figure 4.7 shows the ratio of slant for the issue of the energy crisis. The dominant slant was in favor of the government in both newspapers. The Dawn gave 57 percent coverage while the Jang donated 43 percent coverage of this issue in favor of the government. However it was found unfavorable for the government as 31 percent in the Dawn and 38 percent in the Jang.

Most of the news stories in favor of the government were about the government efforts and statements to overcome the shortage of the energy resources and to overcome the power cut-off. Some news items were published about the construction of new dams and import of electricity from some nearby countries.

4.4 Slant for the Issue of Food Crisis

The slant for the issue of the food crisis is evident from the figure 4.8. It can be seen that although the people of Pakistan are suffering from a great shortage of food, the national newspapers of Pakistan follow the official line of the government and they don’t take any care of the real problems faced by the people.
Both newspapers published more news in favor of the government than the news unfavorable for the government about the issue of the food crisis. The Dawn and the Jang published 46 percent and 50 percent news about the issue of the food crisis in favor of the government respectively. However, they published 31 percent and 34 percent news items that were giving an unfavorable image of the government respectively. The percentage of the neutral news items on the issue was 23 in the Dawn and 16 in the Jang.

The news items regarding the government’s efforts to overcome the food shortage, supply of wheat quota to flour mills, incentives to farmers to produce more wheat crop, supply of wheat flour and other food items at subsidized rates at the government run utility stores etc. were included in the category of the news favorable for the government. On the other hand, the unfavorable news about this category included the news stories about the shortage of the wheat flour, news items about the wheat smuggling to Afghanistan, high prices and unavailability of the basic food necessities, etc. were counted as unfavorable for the government.
4.5 Slant for the Issue of Judiciary Crisis

Unlike the other issues, the issue of the judiciary crisis received tremendous slant against the government. It might be a result of a huge movement of the lawyers of the country for the restoration of the judiciary.

The daily Dawn published 24 percent news paragraphs on this issue in favor of the government while it published 57 percent news paragraphs about the issue that were unfavorable for the government. The percentage of the neutral paragraphs was 19. On the other hand the daily Jang allotted 18 percent coverage on the issue of the judiciary crisis in favor of the government while its 69 percent coverage on the above-mentioned issue was unfavorable for the government. The paper published 14 percent neutral paragraphs about the issue.

Figure 4.9 Slant for the issue of Judiciary crisis

The news items about the judiciary issue that were found favorable for the government included the statements of the then President Musharraf, the Attorney General, the ministers etc. while the unfavorable news items included the activities of the lawyers, bar councils and civil society for the restoration of the judiciary, the statements of the lawyers’ leaders specially Aitzaz Ahsan etc.
4.6 Slant for the Issue of Lal Masjid (Red Mosque)

The slant given by the newspapers of the study on the issue of the Lal Masjid is clear from the figure 4.10. It was a very much sensitive issue in which thousands of innocent seminary boys and girls were killed brutally by the armed forces. The Dawn kept a balance during the coverage of the issue by giving almost equal treatment to both sides while the Jang being a popular newspaper of the country donated more coverage against the government because of its brutalities. The Dawn gave 44 percent coverage on the issue of the Lal Masjid in favor of the government and 45 percent coverage against the government while its 11 percent coverage about the issue was neutral.

Figure 4.10 Slant for the Issue of Lal Masjid

We can see different results about the coverage of this issue in the daily Jang. The newspaper gave only 31 percent coverage of the issue in favor of the government while it donated 59 percent coverage of the issue against the government. The neutral slant was only 10 percent in this newspaper’s coverage about the issue of Lal Masjid.

The news stories that presented a favorable position for the government included the statements of the then President Musharraf, ministers of the government, officials etc. On the other hand the dominant news items against the government
included the statements of Ghazi brothers (leaders of the mosque), religious leaders, politicians, news items about the brutalities of the armed forces and killings of the seminary students, reports about the parents of the students, burning of the pages of the Holly Quran, etc.

5.5 Framing of the Issues

Framing was also measured about the issues of the study in terms of friend and foe in case of the issues of terrorism and Indo-Pak relations while the titles for the frames of the other issues were called as pro-government and anti-government. The table 4.2 elaborates the picture of framing for the issues of the study.

Table 4.2 Framing of the issues

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Issues</th>
<th>Daily Dawn</th>
<th></th>
<th>Daily Jang</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Friend /</td>
<td>Foe /</td>
<td>Friend /</td>
<td>Foe /</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pro-Govt.</td>
<td>Anti-Govt.</td>
<td>Pro-Govt.</td>
<td>Anti-Govt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Terrorism</td>
<td>259</td>
<td>220</td>
<td>136</td>
<td>180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indo-Pak relations</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Energy Crisis</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Food Crisis</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Judiciary Crisis</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>334</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lal Masjid</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As apparent from the table 4.2, the Dawn published 259 news items on its front and back pages about the issue of terrorism in which the US was portrayed as a friend of our country while 220 news stories depicted the US as foe or enemy. The ratio was opposite in the daily Jang which published 136 news items showing the US as friend while the newspaper published 180 news stories portraying the US as foe. Here, again a difference can be seen between the policies of the two newspapers. Here
this is important to mention that the readership of the two newspapers is totally different. The Dawn is usually read by the elite class, foreigners, diplomats, etc. while the Jang is the newspaper of the general masses. The reason of the difference of the policies of the newspapers might be a result of their readership. The chi square test between the friend and foe frames for the US shows that there was a significant difference between the two frames in both of the newspapers (chi square = 3.69; p.055 for the Dawn and chi square = 7; p.008 for the Jang).

Regarding the framing of the issue of the Indo-Pak relations, the Dawn published 48 news stories giving India a frame of friend while it was framed as foe and enemy in 56 news items published in the front and back pages during the year of the study. On the other hand, the daily Jang published 36 news items in the frame of friend and 16 news items portrayed India as foe. On the basis of this finding, it can be said that the daily Jang has a tilt towards bilateral relations with India. There was no significant difference between the friend and foe frames for India regarding the bilateral relations but this difference is significant in case of daily Jang (chi square = 7.69; p.006).

Regarding the framing of the issue of the energy crisis, both newspapers are seemed to support the government giving a pro-government frame about the coverage of the energy crisis. The Dawn donated the pro-government frame to 23 news stories on the issue while it gave anti-government frame to 13 news items in this regard. The Jang published 46 news items on the issue of the energy crisis in which 27 news items were having a frame of pro-government and 19 of them were carrying a frame of anti-government. It seems that the newspapers favored the government on this issue. Most of the news items were statements of the ministers and government authorities to overcome the shortage of the electricity. There did not exist a significant difference
between the Pro and the Anti- government frames regarding the issue of the energy crisis in both of the newspapers of the study.

The Dawn published 21 news items on the issue of the food crisis in which the government was favored while 19 news stories were having a frame of anti-government coverage. On the other hand, the daily Jang published 38 news stories on the issue of the food crisis giving a pro-government frame while 27 news items presented an anti-government frame regarding the coverage of the issue. None of the significant difference was found in the pro and the anti government frames about the coverage of the issue of the food crisis in the both newspapers.

Regarding the coverage of the issue of the judiciary crisis, both of the newspapers donated more coverage to anti-government frames. The Dawn published 34 news items giving a pro-government frame while it published 96 news stories against the government giving an anti-government frame. The Jang published 73 news stories with a pro-government frame and 334 news items with an anti-government frame regarding the issue of the judiciary crisis. The newspapers showed a clear policy on this issue and they did not support the government and the then president Musharraf. They gave a huge coverage for the restoration of the judiciary against the wish of the government.

Table 4.9 elaborates the picture of the statistical significance of the pro and the anti government frames regarding the coverage of the issue of the judiciary crisis in both the newspapers of this study. There was quite a significant difference in the both frames regarding the issue of the judiciary crisis (chi square = 28; p. 000 for the daily Dawn and chi square = 167; p.000 for the daily Jang).
Lal Masjid issue was one of the most sensitive issues in which thousands of the seminary students were killed and the general public’s emotions were against the government action. The newspapers also supported the public’s opinion and most of their coverage presented an anti-government frame. The daily Dawn gave anti-government frame to 19 news items and pro-government frame to 12 news stories. The Jang gave anti-government frame to 64 news stories while it gave pro-government frame to 36 news items. There was a significant difference between the pro and the anti government frames regarding the coverage of the issue of the Lal Masjid in the daily Jang (chi square = 7.84; p.005) but it was not significant in the daily Dawn.

6. Sources of Information

News stories are always based on the sources of information. The reporters have to rely on their sources for news. The sources always keep their own interest while giving information to reporters. Hence, the sources of information play a key role in media agenda setting which ultimately results in public agenda setting. During the preparation of the code sheet of the content analysis of this study, the variable of the news sources was also included that was divided into three sub-categories; official, un-official and others. The official sources were taken as the relevant official persons giving the information to media while the un-official sources included the private sources of the reporters. The news items coming from the other media or the analyses of the journalists were included in the third category called as ‘others.’

The table 4.3 elaborates the findings of the content analysis of this study regarding the sources of information. As evident from the table, on the issue of terrorism the Dawn published 348 news items from the official sources while its 112 news items were based on unofficial sources. Eighteen news items were based on
other sources. On the other hand, regarding the same issue the Jang published 200 news stories from the official sources, 106 news stories from the unofficial sources and 10 stories from the other sources. Here, we can see that most of the news items on the issue of terrorism come from the official sources. There might be several reasons for the reliance on the official sources. It might be the case that the media usually follow the official line of the government.

The newspapers also relied heavily on the official sources for the coverage of the issue of the Indo-Pak relations. The Dawn published 85 news items about this issue received from the official sources while it accepted only 16 news stories for publication based on the information received from the unofficial sources. However, three news items were received from other sources. The daily Jang published 30 news items received from official sources and 15 news items received from unofficial sources on the issue of the Indo-Pak relations. The newspaper published only seven news items received from other sources.

Regarding the issue of the energy crisis, again both of the newspapers relied heavily on the official sources. The Dawn published 30 news items on the issue
received from the official sources, five news items from unofficial sources and only one from the other sources. The daily Jang published 20 news stories on the issue received from the official sources, 13 from the unofficial sources and three from the other sources.

While giving coverage to the food crisis issue, the Dawn relied more on the unofficial sources by publishing 10 news items based on the information received from the official sources and 30 items received from the unofficial sources. The Jang relied more on the official sources by publishing 40 news items from the official sources, 19 news stories from the unofficial sources and six news items based on the information received from the other sources.

Unlike the other issues of the study, the coverage of the issue of the judiciary crisis was heavily dependant on the unofficial and private sources by the both newspapers. The Dawn published 85 news stories received from the unofficial sources, 41 news items from the official sources and only three news items from the other sources. The Jang published 290 news items on the issue of the judiciary crisis from the unofficial sources, 100 news items from the official sources and 17 news items from the other sources. The heavily reliance of the newspapers on this issue can be related with the slant and framing results of the content analysis (mentioned above) which were mostly against the government and the official authorities.

The last (but not the least) issue of the content analysis was the coverage of the Lal Masjid issue. The newspapers also relied more on the unofficial sources than the official sources. The daily Dawn published 15 news items about the issue based on the information received from the official sources and 16 news items from the unofficial sources. The daily Jang published 36 news items on the issue received from the official sources and 54 news stories received from the unofficial sources. The paper
published 10 news items from the other sources. The reliance on the unofficial or independent sources led the newspapers to publish more news against the government.

7. Placement of the News Items (regarding the issues of the study)

Placement of a news story is a key function in media gatekeeping which ultimately results in media agenda setting. A news story published on the front page of a newspaper definitely has many times more impact on the readers than a news story which is published in the inner pages. Keeping in view the research methodology of this project, the placement was divided into four categories. These were:

1. Front page upper half
2. Front page lower half
3. Back page upper half
4. Back page lower half

7.1 Placement of the news stories on the issue of Terrorism

As evident from the figure 4.11, the daily Dawn published 29 percent news stories about the issue of terrorism on the upper half portion of its front page, again 29 percent news items on this issue on the lower half portion of its front page, 32 percent news on the upper half portion of the back page and 10 percent news items on the issue on the lower half page of the back page. In other word, the newspaper published 58 percent news on its front page and 42 percent news on its back page. On the other hand, as apparent from the figure 4.12, the Jang published 39 percent news on the issue on the upper half portion of its front page, 16 percent news on its lower half front page, 32 percent news on its upper half back page and 13 percent news on the
lower half portion of its back page. Hence, the Jang published 55 percent news on the issue of terrorism on its front page and 45 percent news on its back page.

**Figure 4.11 Placement of news stories on the issue of Terrorism in daily Dawn**

![Pie chart showing distribution of news stories on terrorism.
Front page upper half: 10%, Front page lower half: 29%, Back page upper half: 32%, Back page lower half: 29%]

**Figure 4.12 Placement of news stories on the issue of Terrorism in daily Jang**

![Pie chart showing distribution of news stories on terrorism.
Front page upper half: 13%, Front page lower half: 39%, Back page upper half: 32%, Back page lower half: 16%]

The ratio of the coverage of the issue of the both newspapers is very close. This similarity might be a result of following the world wide accepted news values by the both newspapers.

**7.2 Placement of the news stories on the issue of Indo-Pak relations**

The figure 4.13 elaborates the placement of the news items relating to the coverage of the issue of the Indo-Pak relations. Here, it again seems a great similarity
in the coverage patterns of the two newspapers. The Dawn and the Jang published 14 and 18 percent news items about the issue on their front page upper half and 14 and 17 percent news about the issue on the lower half part of their front pages respectively.

**Figure 4.13 Placement of the news stories on the issue of Indo-Pak relations**

The Dawn published 47 percent news stories about the issue of the Indo-Pak relations on the upper half portion of its back page while the Jang donated 45 percent space of the total coverage of the issue on the same position. There is only a slight difference in the coverage pattern on the lower half portion of the back page where the Dawn published 25 percent news items about the issue while the Jang published 20 percent news on the issue under study.

In other words, the Dawn published 28 percent news items about the issue on its front page and 72 percent items on the back page while the Jang published 35 percent news stories on its front page and 65 percent news items on its back page about the issue of the Indo-Pak relations.

### 7.3 Placement of the news stories on the issue of Energy Crisis

The figure 4.14 unveils the placement of the coverage given to the issue of the energy crisis by the two national newspapers of Pakistan. The Dawn published 32
percent news items on the issue on the upper half portion of its front page, 28 percent news stories on the lower half of its front page, 33 percent news items on the upper half back page and the remaining seven percent news stories on the lower half portion of the back page. Similarly, the daily Jang published maximum news items (45 percent) about the issue of the energy crisis on the upper half portion of the front page and only seven percent on the lower half front page. However, the newspaper published 44 percent news stories on the issue on the upper half portion of its back page and only four percent news items on the lower half page of its back page. The ratio of the placement of the news items of the issue between the front and back pages remained 60: 40 in the Dawn and 52: 48 in the Jang.

**Figure 4.14 Placement of the news stories on the issue of Energy Crisis**

![Figure 4.14 Placement of the news stories on the issue of Energy Crisis](image)

**7.4 Placement of the news stories on the issue of Food Crisis**

Although both of the newspapers of the content analysis of this study gave a poor coverage to the vital issue of the energy crisis, however, the coverage is spread all over the four categories of the placement. The daily Dawn published 15 percent news items on the issue of the food crisis on the upper half of its front page while the Jang published 28 percent such news on the same position. The earlier newspaper published 36 percent news about the issue of the food crisis on the lower half portion of its front page while the later one published 19 percent news on the same position.
The Dawn printed 31 percent news stories on the issue in the upper half of the back page while the Dawn published 37 percent news items on this position. The issue of the food crisis got 18 percent coverage on the lower half portion of the back page in the daily Dawn while it got 16 percent of its total coverage on the same position in the daily Jang. The ratio of the placement of the news items of the issue between the front and back pages remained 51: 49 in the Dawn and 47: 53 in the Jang. The placement of the news stories about the issue of the food crisis is reflected in the figure 4.15.

Figure 4.15 Placement of the news stories on the issue of Food Crisis

7.5 Placement of the news stories about the issue of Judiciary Crisis

The issue of the judiciary crisis remained a top priority issue for the Pakistani media throughout the year. Both the newspapers of this study gave a tremendous coverage to this issue ignoring all the governmental pressures. As obvious from the figure 4.16, both newspapers gave maximum coverage to this issue on the upper half portion of their front pages which is the most important placement in newspaper coverage. The Dawn published 40 percent news of this issue on the upper half portion of the front page while the Jang published 49 percent of the news of this issue on this placement. The earlier published 28 percent news items on the issue on the lower half
of its front page while the later gave 24 percent coverage to this issue on this position. The Dawn donated 23 percent space to the issue of the judiciary crisis on the upper half part of its back page while the Jang published 22 percent news on this position. The category four got the least coverage of the issue in both of the newspapers. The Dawn published only nine percent and the Jang published only five percent news items about this issue on the lower half portion of their back pages.

**Figure 4.16 Placement of the news stories about the issue of Judiciary Crisis**

![Figure 4.16 Placement of the news stories about the issue of Judiciary Crisis](image)

The ratio of the placement of the news items of the issue between the front and back pages remained 68: 32 in the Dawn and 73: 27 in the Jang. It seems that the Jang gave a little more coverage to the issue on its front page than the Dawn.

### 7.6 Placement of the news stories on the issue of Lal Masjid

This issue remained an important topic for a period of almost two months (June and July 07). The placement of the news stories about this issue is shown in the figure 4.17. Regarding the placement of the news stories on the front pages, there is complete uniformity between the coverage patterns of the two newspapers because both of them published 39 percent news items about the issue on the upper half portion of their front pages. However, the Dawn published 29 percent news items on the lower half of its front page while the Jang published 20 percent news stories on
this position. The Dawn published 19 percent news about the issue of the Lal Masjid on the upper half part of its back page while the Jang published 35 percent news on this position. The earlier newspaper published 13 percent news about this issue on the lower half of its back page while the later published only six percent of these news items on this position.

Figure 4.17 Placement of the news stories on the issue of Lal Masjid

![Bar chart showing the placement of news stories on Lal Masjid issue](image)

As an overall placement position of the news stories about the issue of Lal Masjid, the Dawn published 68 percent news stories on its front page and 32 percent news on its back page while the Jang donated 59 percent coverage of the issue on its front page and 41 percent space on its back page.

8. Results of the Survey Research

Survey research was an integral part of this research project. As described in the chapter of the research methodology, a sample of 300 newspaper readers (150 readers of each newspaper of the study) was selected and interviewed regarding their opinion about the six issues of the study. First of all the most important question was asked about the ranking position of the issues under study. Then three questions were asked from the respondents about each issue regarding their most important source of information, their opinion about the issue, and their discussion with friends and
colleagues. The findings of the survey research are being presented in the coming lines.

9. Ranking Order of the Public Agenda

The first and the most important question of the survey was the ranking order of the issues of the study according to the opinion of the respondents. A clear difference in the opinions of the readers of the two newspapers was found as it was found in the findings of the content analysis. Table 4.4 elaborates the public agenda of the readers of the daily Dawn and the table 4.5 explains the public agenda of the readers of the Jang.

9.1 The Most Important Issue

The readers of the daily Dawn stated the issue of terrorism as the most important issue among the list of the issues given to them while the readers of the daily Jang stated the issue of the judiciary crisis as the most important issue. This result supports the hypothesis of this research project because the Dawn gave maximum coverage to the issue of terrorism while the Jang gave maximum coverage to the issue of the judiciary crisis.

As evident from the table 4.4, 64 percent readers of the daily Dawn declared the issue of terrorism as the most important issue while 11 percent of them declared this issue as the second most important issue. Nine percent readers stated the issue as the third important issue, seven percent of them called it as the fourth important issue, five percent of them stated it as the fifth important issue while only four percent readers of the Dawn ranked the issue of terrorism as the least (sixth) important issue of the country.
Table 4.4 Ranking Order of the Public Agenda of the readers of the daily Dawn

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Issues</th>
<th>1st</th>
<th>2nd</th>
<th>3rd</th>
<th>4th</th>
<th>5th</th>
<th>6th</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Judiciary Crisis</td>
<td>11%</td>
<td>64%</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>7%</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Food Crisis</td>
<td>7%</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>51%</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>11%</td>
<td>12%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Energy Crisis</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>61%</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indo Pak Relations</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>11%</td>
<td>58%</td>
<td>17%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lal Masjid</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>7%</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>63%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.5 Ranking Order of the Public Agenda of the readers of the daily Jang

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Issues</th>
<th>1st</th>
<th>2nd</th>
<th>3rd</th>
<th>4th</th>
<th>5th</th>
<th>6th</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Judiciary Crisis</td>
<td>63%</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>7%</td>
<td>7%</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Terrorism</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>59%</td>
<td>12%</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Food Crisis</td>
<td>7%</td>
<td>11%</td>
<td>56%</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Energy Crisis</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>11%</td>
<td>58%</td>
<td>7%</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lal Masjid</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>63%</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indo Pak Relations</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>7%</td>
<td>11%</td>
<td>71%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

On the other hand, as apparent from the table 4.5 the majority of the readers of the daily Jang (63 percent) declared the issue of the judiciary crisis as the most important issue. However, 13 percent readers stated this issue as the second most important issue, nine percent of them called it as the third important issue, seven percent of them put this issue on the fourth position, again another seven percent readers called this
issue as the fifth important issue and only one percent readers called the issue of the judiciary crisis as the least important issue putting the issue at the sixth position.

9.2 The Second Most Important Issue

The majority of the readers of the daily Dawn (64 percent) stated the issue of the judiciary crisis as the second most important issue while the majority of the readers of the Jang (59 percent) declared the issue of terrorism as the second most important issue of the study. The results again support the hypothesis of this research project because these results correlate with the findings of the content analysis. As obvious from the table 4.4, 11 percent readers of the daily Dawn put the issue of the judiciary crisis at the first position, 10 percent of them kept the issue on the third position, seven percent readers declared it as the fourth important issue, five percent of them called it as the fifth important issue and only three percent readers called the issue of judiciary crisis as the sixth important issue. The table 4.5 shows the picture of the second most important public agenda of the readers of the daily Jang in a way that 15 percent readers of this newspaper declared terrorism as the most important issue, 12 percent of them called it as the third important issue, nine percent of them stated it as the fourth important issue, five percent readers called it as the fifth important issue while there was no body to declare the issue of terrorism as the least (sixth) important issue.

9.3 The Third Most Important Issue

As obvious from the table 4.4 and 4.5, the maximum readers of the both newspapers declared the issue of the food crisis as the third most important issue. Fifty one (51) percent readers of the daily Dawn declared this issue as the third most important issue. However, seven percent of them ranked it as the most important issue, nine percent of them called it as the second important issue, 10 percent of them
ranked the issue of the food crisis at fourth position, 11 percent readers put this issue on number five position while 12 percent of them called this issue as the least important issue putting it at the sixth position. On the other hand 56 percent readers of the daily Jang stated the issue of the food crisis as the third most important issue. However, seven percent of them declared this issue as the most important issue, 11 percent of them ranked this issue as number two; nine percent readers ranked it as number four, 10 percent of them called it as number five and the remaining seven percent declared the issue as the least important among the given list of issues. The result does not correlate with the findings of the content analysis. The reasons will be discussed later on.

9.4 The Fourth Most Important Issue

As the table 4.4 and 4.5 elaborate the ranking order of the fourth most important issue among the given list of six issues, the readers of the both newspapers declared the issue of the energy crisis as the fourth most important issue against the findings of the content analysis (The reasons will be discussed later on).

According to the results of the survey research, 61 percent readers of the Dawn declared the issue of the energy crisis as the fourth most important issue. Six percent readers of the same newspaper termed it as the most important issue, 13 percent of them called it as the second most important issue, nine percent of them ranked this issue at number three position, another six percent of them ranked the issue of the energy crisis at fifth position while the remaining five percent readers stated it as the least important issue among the given list of the issues. On the other hand, the majority (58 percent) readers of the daily Jang declared the issue of the energy crisis as the fourth important issue. However, ten percent of them termed this issue as the most important issue, nine percent of them called it as the second most
important issue, 11 percent of them ranked this issue at number three position, seven percent of them put this issue on number five position while only five percent readers declared it as the least important issue among the given list of the issues.

**9.5 The Fifth Most Important Issue**

As evident from the table 4.4 and 4.5, there is a difference of public agenda in the readers of the both newspapers just like the difference in their content analysis. The results support the hypothesis of the study as the readers of the daily Dawn declared the issue of the Indo-Pak relations more important than the issue of the Lal Masjid because the newspaper gave more coverage to the first issue than the later one. In contrast to this finding, the readers of the Jang declared the issue of the Lal Masjid as more important than the issue of the Indo-Pak relations because the Jang published a greater number of news stories about the issue of the Lal Masjid as compared to the issue of the Indo-Pak relations.

According to the details, majority of the readers of the Dawn (58 percent) declared the issue of the Indo-Pak relations as the fifth most important issue. None of the respondents declared this issue as the most important issue of the study. However, five percent of them declared it as the second most important issue, nine percent of them stated it as the third important issue, 11 percent readers called it as the fourth important issue while the remaining 17 percent readers declared the issue of the Indo-Pak relations as the sixth and the least important issue of the study. On the other hand, the maximum readers of the Jang (63 percent) declared the issue of the Lal Masjid as the fifth most important issue. However, five percent of them called it as the most important issue of the study. Six percent readers of the same newspaper called this issue as the second most important issue, eight percent of them termed it as the third important issue, nine percent of them stated it as the fourth important issue while the
remaining nine percent readers declared the issue of the Lal Masjid as the least important issue among the given list of issues.

9.6 The Least Important Issue

As discussed earlier, the majority of the readers of the daily Dawn declared the issue of the Lal Masjid as the least important issue while the majority of the readers of the daily Jang stated the issue of the Indo-Pak relations as the least important issue among the given list of the issues of the study. As evident from the table 4.4, 63 percent of the readers of the daily Dawn declared the issue of the Lal Masjid as the least important issue. However, as per the opinion of its three percent readers it was the most important issue among the given list of the issues. Five percent of its readers stated this issue as the second most important issue, seven percent of them called it as the third important issue, nine percent of them termed it as the fourth important issue while the remaining 13 percent readers called this issue as the fifth important issue among the given list of the issues.

On the other hand, the table 4.5 elaborates the public agenda of the readers of the daily Jang. As apparent from the said table, the vast majority (71 percent) of its readers stated the issue of the Indo-Pak relations as the least important issue. However, its two percent readers termed it as the most important issue. Three percent of its readers called it as the second most important issue, six percent of them declared it as the third important issue, seven percent of them called it as the fourth important issue while the remaining 11 percent readers declared the issue of the Indo-Pak relations as the fifth important issue among the given list of the issues of the study.

10. Source of Information

Sources of information play a pivotal role in the agenda setting of the public. After investigating the salience of issues from the newspaper readers, they were asked
to tell the most important source of information regarding the issues (for every issue separately). The respondents were given the following four options:

I- Print media
II- Electronic media
III- Interpersonal Communication
IV- Any other

The results about this variable are being presented in the following lines.

10.1 Source of Information for the issue of Terrorism

We can see a similar pattern regarding the source of information among the readers of the daily Dawn and the Jang. As apparent from the figure 4.18, for the majority of the respondents, print media was the most important source of information about the coverage of the issue of terrorism. Fifty nine (59) percent readers of the Dawn and 62 percent readers of the Jang stated the print media as the major source of information regarding the issue of terrorism. However, 33 percent readers of the Dawn and 31 percent readers of the Jang described the electronic media as the most important source of information regarding the said issue. Some eight percent readers of the Dawn and seven percent readers of the Jang stated the interpersonal communication as the major source of information about the issue of terrorism.
10.2 Source of Information for the issue of Indo-Pak relations

The majority of the readers of both of the newspapers again termed the print media as the major source of information for their information about the issue of the Indo-Pak relations. Fifty one (51) percent readers of the Dawn and 52 percent readers of the Jang stated the print media as the most important source of communication. However, 41 percent readers of the Dawn and 39 percent readers of the Jang reported electronic media as the most important source of information. Some eight percent readers of the Dawn and nine percent readers of the Jang informed that the interpersonal communication was the major source of information for them regarding the issue of the Indo-Pak relations. In this case, it is clear that there is a minor difference between the print and the electronic media as the most important source of information. The figure 4.19 elaborates the responses of the respondents regarding their source of information about the issue of the Indo-Pak relations.
10.3 Source of Information for the issue of Energy Crisis

The public opinion seems dispersed regarding the most important source of information about the issue of the energy crisis. Here emerged a new unexpected category because most of the respondents belonging to both groups responded that the energy issue was important for them because they themselves were suffering with the problem mentioned. They were well informed about the issue not because of the print or electronic media but because of the interpersonal channels and their self-suffering.

As the figure 4.20 reveals, only 21 percent readers of the daily Dawn and 18 percent readers of the daily Jang declared print media as the most important source of information about the issue of energy crisis, 19 percent readers of the Dawn and nine percent readers of the Jang declared the electronic media as the most important source of information for the issue, 23 percent readers of the daily Dawn and 24 percent readers of the daily Jang stated the interpersonal communication as the most important source of information while the remaining majority (37 percent of the Dawn readers and 49 percent of the readers of the Jang) ticked the option of ‘any other’ mentioning their self-suffering as the most important reason regarding the issue of the energy crisis.
10.4 Source of Information for the issue of Food Crisis

Although the print and the electronic media were the most important source of information for some people, even then the majority of the newspaper readers declared either interpersonal communication or their self suffering as the most important reason to declare the issue of the food crisis as an important issue. As evident from the figure 4.21, 23 percent readers of the Dawn and 22 percent readers of the Jang declared the print media as the most important source of information while 20 percent readers of the Dawn and 15 percent readers of the Jang stated that the electronic media was the most important source of information for them regarding the issue of the food crisis. However, 28 percent readers of the first newspaper and some 27 percent readers of the second newspaper declared that the interpersonal channels were the most important source of information for them. The remaining 29 percent readers of the Dawn and 36 percent readers of the Jang declared that the issue of the food crisis was an important issue for them because they themselves were facing the problem very much.
10.5 Source of Information for the issue of Judiciary Crisis

The print media were declared as the most important source of information by the maximum readers of the both newspapers, daily Dawn and the Jang regarding the issue of the judiciary crisis. Sixty four (64) percent readers of the Dawn and 71 percent readers of the Jang were of the view that the print media were the most important source of information for them about the issue of the judiciary crisis. Some 25 percent respondents who were readers of the daily Dawn and 19 percent respondents who were readers of the daily Jang stated that the electronic media were the most important source of information for them regarding the issue of the judiciary crisis while 11 percent readers of the Dawn and 10 percent readers of the Jang stated that the interpersonal communication was the most important source of information for them regarding information about the issue of the judiciary crisis. The figure 4.22 describes these results in a more elaborative form.
10.6 Source of Information for the issue of Lal Masjid

According to the results of the survey research about the sources of information, again print media were declared as the most important source of information regarding the issue of the Lal Masjid (Red Mosque) by the maximum number of the respondents. As apparent from the figure 4.23, 51 percent readers of the daily Dawn and 57 percent readers of the daily Jang declared print media as the most important source of information regarding the issue of the Lal Masjid. However, 40 percent readers of the Dawn and 32 percent readers of the Jang stated electronic media as the most important source of information regarding the issue under discussion. Furthermore, nine percent readers of the Dawn and 11 per cent readers of the Jang told that the interpersonal channels were the most important source of information for them regarding the issue of the Lal Masjid.
11. Opinion of the Newspaper Readers about the issues of the study

The slant of the newspapers towards the issues of the study was measured during the content analysis and its results have already been described earlier in this chapter. To investigate the effects of the slant on the newspaper readers, their opinion towards the issues of the study was measured through the survey research. Table 4.14 describes the responses of the respondents in this regard.

11.1 Public Opinion on the issue of Terrorism

As evident from the table 4.6, 58 percent readers of the Dawn were found in favor of the US policies regarding the issue of terrorism. However, 29 percent readers’ opinion was anti US on this issue. Thirteen percent readers were not clear about the issue. On the other hand, the opinion of the majority of the readers of the Jang (52 percent) was anti-US, a reasonable number of people (35 percent) were found as pro-US regarding the issue of terrorism while again 13 percent readers of this newspaper were not clear about their opinion on the issue. The findings of the public opinion of the newspaper readers
strongly correlate with the results of the content analysis of this study, as described earlier (figure 4.5). The slant of the Dawn towards US was found more favorable in the content analysis and as a result its maximum readers showed a pro-US opinion about the issue. Opposite to this, the Jang published more news on the issue of terrorism which were unfavorable for the US, therefore its maximum readers expressed their opinion as anti-US. The finding supports the theory of agenda setting which is the focal point of this study.

11.2 Public Opinion about the issue of Indo-Pak Relations

A great similarity can be seen among the readers of the two newspapers. Fifty two percent readers of the Dawn and 54 percent readers of the Jang were found in favor of the Indo-Pak relations while 27 percent readers of Dawn and 35 percent readers of Jang were found as against the bilateral relations. They might have a number of reservations in this regard. Twenty one percent readers of the Dawn and eleven percent readers of the Jang were found unclear about the issue of the Indo-Pak

Table 4.6 Opinion of the Newspaper Readers about the issues of the study

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Issues</th>
<th>Readers of Dawn</th>
<th>Readers of Jang</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pro-US/ Pro-Govt.</td>
<td>Anti-US/ Anti-Govt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Terrorism</td>
<td>58%</td>
<td>29%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indo-Pak relations</td>
<td>52%</td>
<td>27%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Energy Crisis</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>78%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Food Crisis</td>
<td>18%</td>
<td>76%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Judiciary Crisis</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>85%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lal Masjid</td>
<td>32%</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
relations. These results strongly correlate with the results of the content analysis of the slant about this issue (figure 4.6) which support the hypothesis of this study. During the survey, some of the respondents suggested that we should develop good relations with India but with certain conditions including the solution of the Kashmir issue.

11.3 Public Opinion about the issue of Energy Crisis

This research study has been conducted in a time period, when the country was facing the worst ever shortage of electricity in the history of Pakistan. The people from each and every walk of life were suffering a lot. Because of their personal suffering they were having a great anger on the government who could not manage the issue. Although both of the newspapers published more news and donated more space to the news about the issue in favor of the government than the news against the government (figure 4.7), even then the favorable coverage could not alter the opinion of the public. A huge number of the respondents conveyed their grievance against the government. According to the results of the survey research, 78 percent readers of the Dawn and 71 percent readers of the Jang expressed their opinion as anti government regarding the issue of the energy crisis. Only 13 percent readers of the Dawn and 11 percent readers of the Jang stated that they were in favor of the government on the issue of the energy crisis. Nine percent readers of the Dawn and 18 percent readers of the Jang could not fit them in any category of pro or anti government by stating that they were not clear about the issue. On the basis of these results it can be concluded that the people’s personal needs, desires and problems play more important role than the media agenda setting.

11.4 Public Opinion about the issue of Food Crisis

Just like the issue of the energy crisis, food crisis was also suffering the lives of the common people of Pakistan at the time of the survey research. The media
agenda could not affect the public agenda on the issue of food crisis. As evident from the figure 4.8, both newspapers of the study published more coverage in favor of the government than the news items unfavorable for the government, even then the vast majority of the respondents gave an anti government response about the issue. Seventy six (76) percent readers of the Dawn and 75 percent readers of the Jang expressed their views as anti government regarding the issue of the food crisis. They thought that the government was responsible for the mismanagement and the shortage of the food. However, 18 percent readers of the Dawn and eight percent readers of the Jang were in favor of the government and they were of the view that the government was not responsible for the shortage of food and it was making its best efforts to overcome the situation. Furthermore, six percent readers of the Dawn and 17 percent readers of the Jang were not clear about the issue. We can see a great similarity between the public agendas on the issues of the food crisis and the energy crisis. Both issues have been published in a favorable slant for the government, but even then the public agenda was found totally different.

11.5 Public Opinion about the issue of Judiciary Crisis

The findings of the public opinion correlate with the findings of the content analysis regarding the issue of the judiciary crisis. As obvious from the table 4.14, the opinion of the vast majority of the respondents was found as anti-government regarding the issue of the judiciary crisis. The opinion of 85 percent readers of the Dawn and 91 percent readers of the Jang was found as anti-government regarding the issue of the judiciary crisis. The strongest ever opinion has been found in this issue among the public opinion about the issues of the study. It can be seen how people of the country are keen in restoration of the judiciary. Only six percent readers of the Dawn and Jang were found in favor of the government regarding the issue of the
judiciary crisis. Some nine percent readers of the Dawn and three percent readers of the Jang were found as confused and unclear about their opinion regarding the issue of the judiciary crisis.

11.6 Public Opinion about the issue of Lal Masjid

Although the Dawn maintained a good balance between the coverage of the most sensitive issue of the Lal Masjid (figure 4.10), even then 50 percent of its readers expressed their sympathies with the affected families. In the opinion of these fifty percent people the government did a wrong job to kill the thousands of the innocent seminary children. Thirty two percent readers of the Dawn said that the government was justified for the action while 18 percent people were found as unclear about the issue.

On the other hand, the majority of the readers of the daily Jang (71 percent) expressed their viewpoint that the government did a wrong job to kill the children. However, 16 percent readers of this newspaper stated that the government did a good job while 13 percent respondents were not clear about the issue. The results are consistent with the findings of the slant given by the same newspaper regarding the issue of the Lal Masjid.

12. Discussion with Family and Friends

Discussion with family and friends is also a part of the agenda setting. When we receive some information from the media about an issue and we feel it important, we usually discuss it with our friends, family members and colleagues at our work places. In the first phase, we receive information from media, in the second phase we discuss it with our family and friends, in the third phase they discuss it with their friends and colleagues, and hence agenda setting of the media travels in many phases. When people discuss some issue with their friends and family members, it means that
the issue was important to them among a long list of the other issues. Interpersonal channels also play a more pivotal role in the developing societies of the world like Pakistan where people heavily depend on each other for information, discussion and guidance. Hence they can quench their thirst of information regarding some issue. Keeping in view this social phenomenon, a variable of discussion with friends and family members was included in the survey questionnaire. The results are being presented in the coming lines.

12.1 Discussion with Family and Friends regarding the issue of Terrorism

The figure 4.24 elaborates the responses of the respondents (readers of the both newspapers) regarding their discussion with family members, friends and colleagues on the issue of terrorism. As evident from the figure, 26 percent readers of the Dawn and 27 percent readers of the Jang stated that they discussed the issue of terrorism with their family, friends and colleagues very greatly while 28 percent readers of the Dawn and 25 percent readers of the Jang said that they discussed this issue with their family, friends and colleagues greatly. Some 21 percent readers of the first newspaper and 27 percent of the later newspaper stated that they discussed this issue to some extent while 25 percent readers of the Dawn and 21 percent readers of the Jang stated that they didn’t discuss this issue with any body else.
If we calculate the sum of the first three categories, we come to conclusion that more than 75 percent readers of the newspapers discuss this issue with their family members, friends and colleagues, more or less. The results are also consistent with the results of the content analysis as well as with the results of the ranking order of the issues as described by the respondents. This is a proof that the media agenda setting works regarding the issue of terrorism.

12.2 Discussion with Family and Friends regarding the issue of Indo-Pak relations

Majority of the respondents informed that they did not discuss the issue of the Indo-Pak relations with their friends, family members and colleagues. If we see the results of the content analysis and the ranking order, the result also seems consistent. In both of these results the issue of the Indo-Pak relations was framed at least positions and therefore the people usually don’t discuss this issue very much with the other people. As the figure 4.25 elaborates, 69 percent readers of the Dawn and 65 percent readers of the Jang stated that they did not discuss this issue at all with their friends, family members and colleagues. However, 13 percent readers of the earlier newspaper and 20 percent readers of the later one said that they discussed this issue with these people to some extent. Fifteen percent readers of the Dawn and 12 percent
readers of the Jang stated that they discuss this issue greatly and only three percent readers of the both newspapers said that they discuss the issue of the Indo-Pak relations very greatly with their friends, family members and colleagues.

**Figure 4.25 Discussion with Family and Friends regarding the issue of Indo-Pak relations**

![Bar chart showing discussion levels between Daily Dawn and Daily Jang readers.]

The issue of the Indo-Pak relations was once an issue of great importance for the people of Pakistan but now it seems that with the emergence of a huge horizon of new issues and crises, it is going to be diminished with the passage of time.

**12.3 Discussion with Family and Friends regarding the issue of Energy Crisis**

As it has been explained earlier that in spite of its less media coverage, the issue of the energy crisis has been described as one of the important issues of the study by the majority of the respondents (table 4.11 and 4.12). The reason might be their personal suffering. Perhaps again this is the reason why majority of the respondents stated that they discuss the issue of the energy crisis and power cut-off very frequently with their friends, family members and colleagues. As apparent from the figure 4.26, 73 percent readers of the Dawn and 71 percent readers of the Jang stated that they discuss this issue with their family and friends very frequently. Furthermore, 21 percent readers of the Dawn and 25 percent readers of the Jang told that they discussed this issue greatly while three percent readers of the Dawn and four
percent readers of the Jang stated that they discussed this issue with their family and friends to some extent. The interesting thing is that three percent readers said that they did not discuss this issue at all with any body else. However, there was not even a single person among the readers of the Jang who did not discuss the issue of the energy crisis at all with family, friends, and colleagues.

**Figure 4.26 Discussion with Family and Friends regarding the issue of Energy Crisis**

The results confirm that the issue of the energy crisis was really a public issue that was disturbing the lives of the general public very greatly. The reason might be the self suffering of the people and the interpersonal communication.

**12.4 Discussion with Family and Friends regarding the issue of Food Crisis**

The issue of the food crisis has affected the lives of the common people of the country and just like the issue of the energy crisis the majority of the respondents associated a great importance with the issue of the food crisis because of their personal suffering of the same problem. As evident from the figure 4.27, 64 percent readers of the daily Dawn and 59 percent readers of the daily Jang declared that they discussed the issue of the food crisis very much with their family members, friends and colleagues. Furthermore, twenty five percent readers of the daily Dawn and 17 percent readers of the Jang stated that they discussed this issue greatly with these
people while nine percent readers of the Dawn and 15 percent readers of the Jang said that they discussed this issue with their family and friends to some extent. Only two percent readers of the Dawn and nine percent readers of the Jang said that they did not discuss this issue with their family and friends at all. These few people might be from the elite class who don’t have such problems of food shortage or power cut-off.

**Figure 4.27 Discussion with Family and Friends regarding the issue of Food Crisis**

The result shows that for a greater number of respondents the food crisis was really an important issue therefore they discussed this issue with their family members, friends and colleagues despite of the fact that the media gave a minor coverage to the issue as compared to the other issues.

**12.5 Discussion with Family and Friends regarding the issue of Judiciary Crisis**

The issue of the judiciary crisis remained a hot issue during the study period of this research project and the newspapers of the content analysis of this study gave a tremendous coverage to this issue (figure 4.1 – 4.4). The results of this variable also correlate with the results of the content analysis and survey regarding the ranking order of the issues. As apparent from the figure 4.28, majority of the respondents said that they discussed this issue with their family and friends very greatly. Seventy one percent readers of the Dawn and 75 percent readers of the Jang stated that they
discussed the issue of the judiciary crisis with their friends and family members very greatly. Some other 18 percent respondents from the Dawn readers and 16 percent respondents from the Jang readers said that they discussed this issue with these people greatly.

Figure 4.28 Discussion with Family and Friends regarding the issue of Judiciary Crisis

![Bar chart showing discussion levels](chart.png)

However, seven percent readers of the Dawn and six percent readers of the Jang declared that they discussed this issue with their family and friends only to some extent. Four percent readers of the Dawn and three percent readers from the Jang stated that they did not discuss this issue with any body else.

12.6 Discussion with Family and Friends regarding the issue of Lal Masjid

The issue of the Lal Masjid was the most sensitive issue among the list of the issues of the study. The media had to deal with this issue very carefully. However, the issue remained the hot topic for media only for a period of two months (June and July 2007). The survey of the newspaper readers was conducted in the month of May and June 2008. It might be the reason that most of the respondents from both newspaper readers stated that they discussed the issue of the Lal mosque only to some extent with their family, friends and colleagues. As evident from the figure 4.29, 54 percent readers of the Dawn and 43 readers of the Jang stated that they discussed this issue to some extent with their family, fiends and colleagues. Some 22 percent readers of the
Dawn and 19 percent readers of the Jang declared that they did not discuss this issue at all with any body.

Figure 4.29 Discussion with Family and Friends regarding the issue of Lal Masjid

However, 13 percent readers of each newspaper of the study stated that they discussed this issue very much with their family, friends and colleagues while 11 percent readers of the Dawn and 25 percent readers of the Jang also told that they discussed this issue greatly with their surrounding people. The results of this variable are consistent with the results of the content analysis as well as with the ranking order of the issues stated by the respondents.
CHAPTER 5

RESULTS, DISCUSSION, CONCLUSION & RECOMMENDATIONS
1. Results and Findings of the Study

Following are the major findings of this study.

- The daily Dawn published an overall 818 news stories on all of the issues of the content analysis while the Jang published 985 news items on these issues on their front and back pages in a period of one year on alternate days.

- It was found that both the newspapers of the study had a different agenda on the important issues of the country except the issue of food crisis. It means that the English and the Urdu newspapers of the country have different news agendas with the exception of one issue in common. The daily Dawn gave maximum coverage to the issue of terrorism in terms of number of news stories while the Jang donated maximum coverage to the issue of judiciary crisis. The result of the second most covered issue was reversed; the issue of judiciary crisis got the second position in its coverage in the Dawn while the issue of terrorism got this position in the Jang. The issue of Lal Masjid received third position in terms of the frequency measurement of the news stories in the daily Jang while the issue of Indo-Pak relations received third position in coverage in the daily Dawn. The issue of food crisis got fourth position in media agenda of the both newspapers. The issue of energy crisis remained in the number five position in daily Dawn while this position went to the issue of Indo-Pak relations in the daily Jang. The issue of the Lal Masjid received the least position among the issues of the study in the news media agenda of the daily Dawn while this position went to the issue of energy crisis in the daily Jang.

- The result of the length wise measurement (in centimeters per column) of the issues of the study remained same as it was in the frequency measurement of
the news stories about the issues in both of the newspapers of the study except the issue of energy crisis. This issue was on the last position in its frequency wise coverage in daily Jang but it got more length wise coverage than the issue of Indo-Pak relations which was on fifth position in its frequency wise measurement. It means that the number of news stories about the issue of energy crisis in the Jang was less than the number of news stories about the issue of Indo-Pak relations but its length wise coverage in centimeters per column was greater than the later.

- Regarding the slant of the issue of terrorism, the Dawn gave more favorable coverage for the US than the unfavorable coverage. However, the result of this slant was opposite in the Jang where unfavorable coverage for the US was greater than the favorable slant. Figure 4.5 in the previous chapter elaborates these results.

- Regarding the slant of the issue of Indo-Pak relations, both of the newspapers of the study donated a favorable slant for the issue more than the unfavorable slant. Figure 4.6 in the previous chapter elaborates these results.

- Regarding the slant of the issue of energy crisis, the dominant slant was found in favor of the government in both of the newspapers. Figure 4.7 in the previous chapter elaborates these results.

- Again, regarding the slant for the issue of food crisis, the dominant slant was in favor of the government in both of the newspapers. Figure 4.8 in the previous chapter elaborates these results.

- Unlike the other issues, the issue of judiciary crisis received the dominant slant of anti government in both of the newspapers. Figure 4.9 in the previous chapter elaborates these results.
Regarding the slant for the issue of Lal Masjid, the Dawn maintained a good balance between favorable and unfavorable slant for the government which was almost equal. However, the Jang donated dominant slant against the government on the issue of the Lal Masjid. Figure 4.10 in the previous chapter elaborates these results.

The results of the measurement of the framing variable were same as the results of the slant measurement. As apparent from the table 4.4, US was portrayed as a friend in maximum news stories published in the Dawn about the issue of terrorism but it was depicted as foe in maximum news items published in the Jang. Regarding the issue of Indo-Pak relations, India was given a frame of foe in more news stories in the Dawn but it was treated as friend in more news items in the Jang.

Regarding the framing of the issues of the food and energy crises, both newspapers donated a frame of pro government to the maximum news items published. Table 4.4 explains the results.

Regarding the issues of the judiciary crisis and Lal Masjid, both of the newspapers gave more frames to anti government as compared to pro government. Table 4.4 elaborates these results.

Regarding the source of information for the news stories about the issues of terrorism, Indo-Pak relations and energy crisis, both of the newspapers relied heavily on the official sources. However, regarding the coverage of the issue of food crisis, the Dawn mainly relied on unofficial sources of information while the Jang again heavily relied on official sources. Both newspapers relied heavily on unofficial or private sources for the coverage of the judiciary crisis. Regarding the news about the issue of Lal Masjid, the Dawn accepted almost
equal number of news stories from official as well as unofficial sources. However, the Jang published more stories on the issue from the unofficial sources.

- The placement of the news stories about the issues of the study was another important variable of the content analysis. The coverage of the issue of terrorism has been found spread all over the front and back pages of the both newspapers but the issue got more space on the front pages than the back pages of the newspapers (Figure 4.11 & 4.12).

- Regarding the placement of the news stories about the issue of Indo-Pak relations, it seems a great similarity in the coverage patterns of the both newspapers. The maximum news stories about the issue were published on the upper half portion of the back page in both newspapers (figure 4.13). Both newspapers gave almost equal coverage to the issue on the upper and lower half portions of their front pages while there was just a slight difference on the lower half part of the back page where the issue got slightly more coverage in the Dawn than the Jang (figure 4.13).

- Regarding the placement of the issue of energy crisis, the Dawn published almost equal number of news on its upper and lower half portions of the front page and the upper portion of the back page while the Jang published most of the news stories on this issue on the upper portion of the front and back pages. However, the newspaper published only a few news items on the issue of energy crisis on the lower half portions of the front and back pages (figure 4.14).

- The coverage of food crisis was found spread all over the front and back pages of both newspapers (figure 4.15). However, the Dawn published more news
stories about the issue on the lower half of the front page and the upper half of the back page while the Jang published more news items on the issue of the food crisis on the upper half portion of its back page and a reasonable number of news items on the upper half portion of its front page.

- Regarding the placement of the news stories about the most burning issue of judiciary crisis, both the Dawn and the Jang published more news about the issue in the most prominent space in the newspaper, the upper half portion of the front page. However, the news stories about the issue were also published in the remaining area of the newspapers (figure 4.16).

- The news stories about the issue of Lal Masjid were published also on the all four categories of the page placement in both of the newspapers but the Dawn published maximum news about the issue on the upper and lower half portions of its front page while the Jang published most of these news on the upper half portion of its front and back pages. Here this is important to mention that the lower half portion of the front page in the daily Jang is usually occupied by advertisements. It might be the reason that comparatively less number of news items is found in this placement category in the daily Jang.

- The readers of the two newspapers were separately interviewed and they expressed their own agenda according to the media agenda of the newspaper they read.

- The results of the survey research of both groups of respondents correlate with the results of the content analysis of the both newspapers except for the issues of food and energy crises. The detail is being presented in the discussion part of this chapter.
• The results of the survey research prove that the public agenda about the individual’s personal needs and problems (food and energy crises) is not dependent on the media agenda. The issues of food and energy crises got more importance in public agenda as compared to media agenda.

• For the remaining issues, it was found that the agenda setting theory works and the media set the public agenda.

• Regarding the most important issue among the given list of six issues, the majority of the readers of the Dawn stated the issue of terrorism as the most important issue as it was found as the most widely covered issue in the content analysis of the Dawn. The result supports the hypothesis of the study.

• The majority of the readers of the daily Dawn (64 percent) stated the issue of judiciary crisis as the second most important issue while the majority of the readers of the Jang (59 percent) declared the issue of terrorism as the second most important issue of the study. The results again support the hypothesis of this research project because these correlate with the findings of the content analysis.

• Regarding the ranking order of the third important issue of the public agenda, the majority of readers of the both newspapers declared the issue of the food crisis as the third most important issue although the issue of food crisis was on fourth position in media agenda of the both newspapers. This is a serendipitous finding of this study that the personal needs and requirements play more important role for public agenda than the media agenda. This result may be due to the reason that it was an obtrusive issue. The obtrusiveness of issues will be discussed in the discussion part of this chapter.
• The readers of both newspapers declared the issue of energy crisis as the fourth most important issue against the findings of the content analysis. In the content analysis of the Dawn, this issue was found at the second last position while it was found at the last position in the content analysis of the daily Jang. Just like the issue of food crisis, the issue of energy crisis was also affecting the lives of the common people at the time of survey research, therefore this was the reason why people gave more importance to these two issues than some other issues. Just like the issue of food crisis, it was also an obtrusive issue.

• Regarding the second last (fifth) issue of the ranking order, there was a difference of public agenda in the readers of both newspapers just like the difference in their content analysis. The results support the hypothesis of the study “the greater the coverage of an issue in the newspaper, the greater will be its importance for the public”. The readers of the daily Dawn declared the issue of the Indo-Pak relations more important than the issue of Lal Masjid because the newspaper gave more coverage to the first issue than the later one. In contrast to this finding, the readers of the Jang declared the issue of Lal Masjid as more important than the issue of Indo-Pak relations because the Jang published a greater number of news stories about the issue of Lal Masjid as compared to the issue of Indo-Pak relations.

• Regarding the least important issue among the given list of the issues, the majority of the readers of the daily Dawn declared the issue of Lal Masjid as the least important issue. The majority of the readers of the daily Jang stated the issue of Indo-Pak relations as the least important issue among the given list
of the issues of the study. The results are consistent with the findings of the content analyses of the both newspapers.

- The variable of the most important source of information for the respondents was also included in the survey research. The majority of the newspaper readers of the both newspapers stated that the print media were the most important source of information about the issues of terrorism and Indo-Pak relations. Figures 4.18 and 4.19 show these findings separately.

- The public opinion seems dispersed regarding the most important source of information about the issue of the energy crisis. Here emerged a new unexpected category because most of the respondents belonging to both groups responded that the energy issue was important for them because they themselves were suffering with the problem. They were well informed about the issue not because of the print or electronic media but because of the interpersonal channels and their self-suffering.

- Although the print and the electronic media were the most important source of information for the issue of food crisis for some people, even then the majority of the newspaper readers declared either interpersonal communication or their self suffering as the most important reason to declare the issue of food crisis as an important issue.

- The print media were declared as the most important source of information by the maximum readers of the both newspapers regarding the issues of judiciary crisis and Lal Masjid. In other words, it can be said that in spite of a large growth of the television channels in the country, the print media are the most important source of information for a great majority. Figure 4.22 and 4.23 elaborates these results respectively.
• The public opinion of the respondents about the issues of the study was known through the survey questionnaire to investigate the effects of slant given by the newspapers on their readers. Table 4.14 describes these results.

• Majority of the readers of the Dawn were found in favor of the US policies regarding the issue of terrorism. The findings of the public opinion of the newspaper readers are consistent with the results of the content analysis of this study (figure 4.5). The slant of the Dawn towards US was found more favorable in the content analysis and as a result its maximum readers showed a pro-US opinion about the issue. Opposite to this, the Jang published more news on the issue of terrorism which were unfavorable for the US, therefore its maximum readers showed their opinion as anti-US. The finding supports the theory of agenda setting which is the focal point of this study.

• A great similarity can be seen among the readers of the two newspapers regarding their opinion towards Indo-Pak relations. Fifty two percent readers of the Dawn and 54 percent readers of the Jang were found in favor of the Indo-Pak relations while 27 percent readers of Dawn and 35 percent readers of Jang were found as against the bilateral relations. The results are consistent with the findings of the content analysis of the slant about this issue (figure 4.6) which support the hypothesis of this study.

• Regarding the public opinion on the issue of energy crisis, although both of the newspapers published more news and donated more space to the news about the issue in favor of the government than the news against the government (figure 4.7), even then the favorable coverage could not alter the opinion of the public. A huge number of the respondents showed their grievance against the government. According to the results of the survey
research, a vast majority of the respondents (78 percent readers of the Dawn and 71 percent readers of the Jang) expressed their opinion as anti government regarding the issue of energy crisis.

- Just like the issue of energy crisis, food crisis was also affecting the lives of the common people of Pakistan at the time of the survey research. The media agenda could not affect the public agenda on the issue of food crisis. As evident from the figure 4.8, both newspapers of the study published more coverage in favor of the government than the news items unfavorable for the government, even then the vast majority of the respondents gave an anti government response about the issue.

- The findings of the public opinion were found consistent with the results of the content analysis regarding the issue of judiciary crisis. As obvious from the table 4.14, the opinion of the vast majority of the respondents of the both groups was found as anti-government regarding the issue of judiciary crisis. The strongest ever opinion has been found in this issue among the public opinion about the issues of the study. The finding represents the interest of the Pakistani public in restoration of the judiciary in the country. The results support the hypothesis of the study.

- Although the Dawn maintained a good balance between the coverage of the most sensitive issue of Lal Masjid (figure 4.10), even then 50 percent of its readers expressed their sympathies with the affected families. No significant relationship between the media and the public agenda was found in this case. In the opinion of these people the government did a wrong job to kill thousands of the innocent seminary children. On the other hand, the majority of the readers of the daily Jang (71 percent) expressed their viewpoint that the
government did a wrong job to kill the children. However, some people (16 percent readers of this newspaper) stated that the government did a good job while 13 percent respondents were not clear about the issue. The results were found consistent with the findings of the slant given by the same newspaper regarding the issue of the Lal Masjid.

- The variable of discussion with family and friends, an important factor for the interpersonal communication, was also included in the survey portion of this study. Regarding the response shown by the respondents about the issue of terrorism, if we calculate the sum of the first three categories (very greatly, greatly and to some extent), we come to conclusion that more than 75 percent readers of the newspapers discuss the issue of terrorism with their family members, friends and colleagues, (figure 4.24). The results are consistent with the findings of the content analysis as well as with the results of the ranking order of the issues as described by the respondents. The issue of terrorism got first position in the media agenda of the Dawn and second position in the media agenda of the Jang and their readers associated same importance to the issue in their ranking order. It was an important issue in both agendas (media and public) therefore; maximum number of respondents discussed this issue with other people. This is a proof that the media agenda setting works regarding the issue of terrorism.

- Majority of the respondents responded that they did not discuss the issue of the Indo-Pak relations with their friends, family members and colleagues (figure 4.25). If we see the results of the content analysis and the ranking order, the result also seems consistent. The issue of the Indo-Pak relations was found at the least position in the findings of the content analysis and the survey results,
therefore the people usually did not discuss this issue very much with other people.

- Perhaps due to their personal suffering, the majority of the respondents stated that they discuss the issue of energy crisis and power cut-off very frequently with their friends, family members and colleagues. As apparent from the figure 4.26, 73 percent readers of the Dawn and 71 percent readers of the Jang stated that they discuss this issue with their family and friends very frequently. The results confirm that the issue of energy crisis was really a public issue that was disturbing the lives of the general public very greatly.

- The issue of food crisis has also affected the lives of the common people of the country and just like the issue of energy crisis the majority of the respondents associated a great importance with the issue of food crisis because of their personal suffering of the same problem. As evident from the figure 4.27, the majority of the readers of the daily Jang declared that they discussed the issue of food crisis very much with their family members, friends and colleagues.

- Regarding the discussion about the issue of judiciary crisis, majority of the respondents said that they discussed this issue with their family and friends very greatly (figure 4.28). Seventy one percent readers of the Dawn and 75 percent readers of the Jang stated that they discussed the issue of judiciary crisis with their friends and family members very greatly. Some other 18 percent respondents from the Dawn readers and 16 percent respondents from the Jang readers said that they discussed this issue with these people greatly.

- The issue of Lal Masjid remained the hot topic for media only for a period of two months (June and July 2007). The survey of the newspaper readers was conducted in the month of May and June 2008. It might be the reason that
most of the respondents from both newspaper readers stated that they discussed the issue of Lal mosque only to some extent with their family, friends and colleagues. As evident from the figure 4.29, 54 percent readers of the Dawn and 43 readers of the Jang stated that they discussed this issue to some extent with their family, friends and colleagues. Some 22 percent readers of the Dawn and 19 percent readers of the Jang declared that they did not discuss this issue at all with any body.

2. Discussion on Results

The most important result of the study is that the findings support the basic assumption of the agenda setting theory that the media set the public agenda. But the exception is that the peoples’ personal needs and requirements are not dependent on the media agenda to become the public agenda. The roots of this finding can be traced in the Zucker’s study of obtrusive and unobtrusive issues regarding agenda setting effects. On the basis of his research study, Zucker (1978) stated that agenda setting may take place for unobtrusive issues but not for obtrusive issues. He also suggested that the obtrusiveness of issues is an important factor that should be added in the agenda setting hypothesis. Here, this is important to mention that the issues which are directly experienced by the public, like food crisis, energy crisis, etc. are obtrusive issues. The issues which are not directly experienced by public, like pollution, Indo-Pak relations etc. are unobtrusive issues.

As apparent from the figure 4.1 and 4.2, both the newspapers of the study have different media agendas regarding the issues of the study. The issue of the food crisis was the exception and remained in fourth position in terms of
frequency and length in both of the newspapers examined. The remaining all five issues received different positions in the agenda of these newspapers. One of the major finding is that the readers of the both newspapers ranked the issues according to the media agenda of the newspaper which they read. The majority of the readers of the daily Dawn ranked the issues of the study in this sequence:

**Terrorism, judiciary crisis, Indo-Pak relations, food crisis, energy crisis, and Lal Masjid.**

If we have a look on the results of the media agenda setting (content analysis) of the Dawn, the following pattern emerges:

**Terrorism, judiciary crisis, food crisis, energy crisis, Indo-Pak relations and Lal Masjid.**

Subsequently, the maximum readers of the daily Jang ranked the issues in this sequence:

**Judiciary crisis, terrorism, food crisis, energy crisis, Lal Masjid and Indo-Pak relations.**

If we make a view of the findings of the media agenda of the daily Jang, the following sequence emerges:

**Judiciary crisis, terrorism, Lal Masjid, food crisis, Indo-Pak relations, energy crisis.**

By looking closely on the media agenda and the public agenda of the both newspapers of the study, it is evident that the agenda setting theory is supported except with the issues of the food and the energy crises. The issue of the food crisis was found at fourth position in the results of the content analysis of the both newspapers but the readers stated it as third important issue. Similarly, the issue of the energy crisis was found at the second last position in the content.
analysis of the Dawn and at the least and the last position in the Jang but it was ranked as the fourth important issue by the maximum readers of the both newspapers. It means that the majority of the readers associated more importance with the issues of the food and the energy crises than their media coverage (media agenda setting). In other words, it can be said that the respondents ranked these issues more important than some other issues because of their personal suffering.

As mentioned earlier, the people of Pakistan were suffering the worst kind of shortage of wheat flour and the electricity at the time of the survey of this research. This is the reason why people associated more importance with these issues. Food and the electricity are basic human needs and people can’t live without them. The results of the survey research provided a serendipitous finding that the personal needs and requirements of the public are not dependent on the media agenda setting.

Keeping aside the issues of the food and energy crises, the study shows a strong consistency between the media and the public agenda. The readers of the Dawn stated the importance of the issues as per their coverage in the Dawn and the readers of the Jang ranked the issues according to their coverage pattern in the Jang. The finding strengthens the agenda setting hypothesis because the readers of two different newspapers ranked the issue importance as per media coverage of these issues in the newspaper which they read.

From another viewpoint it can also be said that the national media of Pakistan does not properly give coverage to the real issues of the society. At the time of this study, the food and the energy crises were the real problems of the common people living in Pakistani society but the media gave less coverage to these issues as compared to some other issues.
The study resulted in other findings as well. There is a difference in number of stories covered by each newspaper. For example the daily Dawn published a total number of 818 news stories and the Jang published an overall 985 news stories on the issues of this study. The reason for this difference might be the difference in the layout patterns of the English and the Urdu newspapers in Pakistan. Usually, Urdu newspapers publish a great number of news stories (brief in text) to attract the maximum readership while the English newspapers publish a limited number of news items but cover them more in depth. However, both of the newspapers transfer a reasonable portion of their news content to the inner pages of the newspapers in shape of jump heads.

The slant of the news stories was also an important variable of this study. As evident from the table 4.3, the Dawn published more favorable news stories about the US regarding the issue of terrorism while the Jang published more unfavorable news stories for the same issue. The same case was apparent with the framing of the issue in terms of friend and foe. There is a great difference between the slant and the frames of the US in Urdu and English newspapers. The Dawn being the largest widely circulated English newspaper gave a favorable slant and framed the US as a friend of Pakistan regarding the issue of terrorism while the Jang, the largest widely circulated Urdu newspaper of the country, published more news on the issue by giving an unfavorable slant and a frame of foe to the US. The reason of this difference might lie in the fact that the newspapers reflect the opinion of their readers while publishing some thing. Both the newspapers have different kind of readers. The readers of the English newspapers include foreigners, diplomats, officials of high status, people of elite class etc. while the Urdu newspapers are usually read by the common people of the country.
Both newspapers gave a favorable slant for the Indo-Pak relations in their coverage regarding the issue (table 4.3). It seems that the Pakistani media are playing a positive role in promoting bilateral relations. However, there is a difference in the results of framing (table 4.4). The Jang gave the frame of friend to India in its maximum news items about the issue but the Dawn gave the frame of foe to India in its maximum news stories about the issue of Indo-Pak relations. However, the difference between the friend and the foe frames in this regard was minor.

Both of the newspapers in the study (the Dawn and the Jang) provided a favorable slant for the government regarding the issues of food and energy crises. Both the issues also received a frame of pro government in the coverage of the issues. To some extent, these results are unexpected because the common people of the country were suffering the problem of the food and energy crises but the media were supporting the government point of view. Most of these news items were published about the government efforts to overcome the problem including the statements of the ministers and other government officials in this regard. One of the reasons for the favorable slant and the pro government frame regarding the issues of the food and energy crises might be lying in the fact that the main stream media usually follow the official line of the government for several reasons including monetary benefits.

Unlike the other issues, the issue of the judiciary crisis received maximum unfavorable slant and an anti government framing in both of the newspapers. The issue of the judiciary crisis received maximum unfavorable coverage and the anti government frames in both the newspapers of the study. Definitely, this slant and the framing were an ultimate result of the huge protest of
the general public and the lawyers of the country against the removal of the judges of Supreme Court and High Courts. It was not possible for the media to go against the direction of the will of the general public and the civil society.

Regarding the slant about the issue of Lal Masjid, the Dawn maintained a balance between the favorable and unfavorable slant about the issue but the Jang published more news stories giving an unfavorable slant for the government regarding the issue. Both newspapers gave more space to anti government frames while publishing news about the issue of the Lal Masjid. The reason might be the sensitivity of the issue and the public sympathies with the victims of the event. However, the reason of the balanced slant about the issue in the daily Dawn might be due to the opinion of its readers because the newspaper is also vastly read by the diplomats, foreigners, international community living in the country and the elite class who was in favor of the military operation against the seminary.

Now this is important to have an overview of the sources of the news stories published about the issues of the study in the Dawn and the Jang during the period of this research study. Both of the newspapers relied heavily on official sources for the coverage of the issues of terrorism, Indo-Pak relations and energy crisis (table 4.11). The slant and the framing results might be a result of the fact that the maximum news stories were based on information released by some official sources. However, the slant and the frames given by the Jang to the issue of terrorism is an exception. Although the newspaper relied more on official sources than the unofficial sources, even then it gave more unfavorable slant for the US and a frame of foe. As discussed earlier, its reason might be to follow the emotions of the general public of the country.
Regarding the issue of the food crisis, the Dawn relied more on unofficial sources than the official sources while the Jang used more official sources than the unofficial sources. Surprisingly, there was no prominent difference between the slant and the frames given to the news stories of the issue of the food crisis in both of the newspapers. It can be said that although the Dawn relied mainly on unofficial sources for news about the issue of the food crisis, even then its slant remained in favor of the government.

Both of the newspapers relied heavily on unofficial sources regarding the coverage of the issue of the judiciary crisis and they used very few official sources. The results of the slant and framing of the issue are consistent with this finding because the majority of the news stories have an unfavorable slant and an anti-government frame regarding the issue of the judiciary crisis.

Regarding the issue of the Lal Masjid, the Dawn maintained a balance between the official and unofficial sources which ultimately resulted in a balanced slant about the issue. On the other hand, the Jang relied more on the unofficial sources regarding the issue of the Lal Masjid which resulted in an unfavorable slant against the government.

Now we can have an overview of the placement of the news stories about the issues of the study. As mentioned earlier, the placement was divided into four categories: front page upper half, front page lower half, back page upper half and back page lower half. The coverage of the issue of terrorism has been found spread all over the front and back pages of the both newspapers but the issue got more space on the front pages than the back pages of the newspapers (Figure 4.11 & 4.12). It can be said on the basis of this finding that the newspapers gave great importance to the issue of terrorism in their coverage pattern.
Regarding the placement of the news stories about the issue of Indo-Pak relations, it seems a great similarity in the coverage patterns of the both newspapers. The majority of news stories about the issue were published on the upper half portion of the back page in both newspapers (figure 4.13). Both newspapers gave almost equal coverage to the issue on the upper and lower half portions of their front pages while there was just a slight difference on the lower half part of the back page where the issue got slightly more coverage in the Dawn than in the Jang. It seems that the major newspapers of the country have almost the same media agenda regarding the issue of the Indo-Pak relations.

Both the Dawn and the Jang gave comparatively less coverage to the issues of the food and the energy crises but the news items were found all over the front and back pages. Regarding the placement of the issue of the energy crisis, the Dawn published almost equal number of news on its upper and lower half portions of the front page and the upper portion of the back page while the Jang published most of the news stories on this issue on the upper portion of the front and back pages. On the other hand, the Dawn published the majority of its news stories about the issue of the food crisis on the lower half of the front page and the upper half of the back page while the Jang published the majority of its news items on the issue of the food crisis on the upper half portion of its back page and a reasonable number of news items on the upper half portion of its front page. But in spite of their coverage pattern and placement, the respondents declared the issues of the food and the energy crises more important than some other issues because of the reason that they themselves were the victim of these crises.

The news stories about the issue of the Lal Masjid were published also in the four areas in both of the newspapers but the Dawn published the majority of
its news about the issue in the upper and lower half portions of its front page while the Jang published most of these news on the upper half portion of its front and back pages. Almost both the newspapers have the same pattern of the placement of the news stories about the issue (figure 4.17).

Now this is important to discuss the results of the survey research. The ranking order of the issues by the respondents was the most important variable of the study which has already been discussed earlier. Another variable of the survey research was the most important source of information for the respondents. The majority of the newspaper readers of the both newspapers stated that the print media were the most important source of information about the issues of terrorism and Indo-Pak relations.

As described earlier, for the issues of the food and energy crises, a new category of suffering emerged. Respondents were well informed about the issue not because of the print or electronic media but because of the interpersonal channels and their suffering. The print media were declared as the most important source of information by the majority of readers of both newspapers regarding the issues of the judiciary crisis and the Lal Masjid. In other words, it can be said that in spite of a large growth of the television channels in the country, the print media are still the most important source of information for a great majority. Usually, people in the country watch television for entertainment purpose and they rely mainly on the print media for information.

The public opinion about the issues of the study was an important component of the survey research to check whether there were some effects of the slant and framing of the news stories about the issues given by media agenda on the public agenda. The majority of the readers of the Dawn were found in favor of
the US policies regarding the issue of terrorism. The findings of the public opinion of the newspaper readers strongly correlate with the results of the content analysis of this study (figure 4.5). The slant of the Dawn towards US was found more favorable in the content analysis and as a result the majority of its readers showed a pro-US opinion about the issue. On the other hand, the Jang published more news stories on the issue of terrorism which were unfavorable for the US, therefore the majority of its readers expressed an anti-US opinion. This finding indicates that the respondents followed the agenda of the media.

A great similarity can be seen among the readers of the two newspapers regarding their opinion towards Indo-Pak relations. More than fifty percent readers of the both newspapers were in favor of the Indo-Pak relations while almost one third of the respondents were against the bilateral relations. The results correlate with the findings of the content analysis of the slant about this issue (figure 4.6) which support the hypothesis of this study.

An interesting finding of the study was that there was no effect of the slant and frames given by the media regarding the issues of the food and the energy crises on the public opinion, although both of the newspapers published more news and donated more space to the news about the issues in favor of the government than the news against the government (figure 4.7 & 4.8). The favorable coverage could not change the opinion of the public. A great number of the respondents expressed their unhappiness with the government about these two issues. A great majority of the respondents expressed their opinion as anti government regarding the issues of the food and energy crises. It can be said that the media agenda could not change the public opinion which was established as a result of their personal needs and problems.
The findings of the public opinion correlate with the findings of the content analysis regarding the issue of the judiciary crisis. As obvious from the table 4.13, the opinion of the vast majority of the respondents was found as anti-government regarding the issue of the judiciary crisis. The finding represents the interest of the Pakistani public in the restoration of the judiciary in the country. It also supports the hypothesis that the public agenda is influenced by the media agenda.

The relationship between public opinion and the media slant about the most sensitive issue of the Lal Masjid needs some discussion here. As we have already seen that the Dawn maintained a good balance in the slant of the coverage about this issue and as a result of this balanced coverage almost 50 percent of its readers expressed their views as against the government. On the other hand, the majority of the readers of the daily Jang (71 percent) expressed their viewpoint that the government was wrong in killing the children. Very few respondents opined in favor of the government regarding this issue. The results are consistent with the findings of the slant given by the newspapers of the study regarding the issue of the Lal Masjid.

The media agenda setting works in many phases. When we receive some important information from media, usually we discuss it with our family members and friends. Hence media agenda setting travels in a society. This phenomenon of media effects has its roots in the two-step flow of communication theory presented by Lazarsfeld and Katz (1955). The theory suggests the role of opinion leaders in communication process. According to this theory media messages travel in a society in two steps. In first step media messages travel from media to opinion leaders and in second step, they travel from opinion leaders to
general public. This way, an atmosphere of discussion emerges in a society. Therefore, the variable of discussion was also included in the study to explore these effects. The respondents were asked whether and to what extent they discuss these issues with their family members, friends and colleagues. This is important to mention here that some studies (for example, Zucker, 1978) provide evidence that agenda setting and two-step flow of communication theories may combine in producing media effects.

Regarding the issue of terrorism, a vast majority of the respondents said that they discuss this issue more or less with their family, friends and colleagues. The results are consistent with those of the content analysis as well as with the results of the ranking order of the issues as described by the respondents. Hence, it can be said that the media agenda setting works regarding the issue of terrorism. People usually discuss only those issues with others which they think as important. So the discussion on the issue of terrorism with surrounding people means that they thought the issue as important one.

The media outlets publish thousands of news stories on hundreds of topics but this is not possible for audience members to discuss each and every topic with others. They usually discuss topics of interest or topics of great concern or importance for them. The majority of the respondents of this study indicated that they did not discuss the issue of the Indo-Pak relations with their friends, family members and colleagues (figure 4.25). Taking a quick look on the results of the content analysis and the ranking order, this result also seems consistent. In both of these results the issue of the Indo-Pak relations was found at the least position and therefore the people usually did not discuss this issue very much with other people. It might be a result of several factors. The issue remained a topic of
concern for media and people as well for more than half century and now they might want to get rid of it. The other possible factor might be that a number of emerging issues of today has diminished the importance of the issue of Indo-Pak relations.

As discussed earlier, perhaps due to their personal suffering the majority of the respondents stated that they discussed the issues of the energy crisis and the food crisis very frequently with their friends, family members and colleagues. As apparent from the figure 4.26, a great majority of the respondents belonging to both groups (readers of the Dawn and the Jang) stated that they discussed the issue of the energy crisis with their family and friends very frequently. The figure 4.27 depicts that the majority of the readers of the both newspapers declared that they discussed the issue of the food crisis frequently with their family members, friends and colleagues. The results confirm that the issues of the energy and food crises were really public issues that were greatly disturbing the lives of the general public. Hence it can be said that for such issues media does not play a role in the public agenda rather personal involvement with the issue set the public’s agenda.

Regarding the discussion about the issue of judiciary crisis, a great majority of the respondents said that they discussed this issue with their family and friends frequently (figure 4.28). The finding is very much consistent with the result of the content analysis as well as with the result of the ranking order. The issue got the top position in media agenda of the daily Jang and public agenda of its readers. Similarly, the issue received second position in the content analysis of the Dawn and the same position in its ranking order by its readers. It means that the issue of the judiciary crisis was really an issue of great importance for which
the media set the public agenda and the public discussed this issue very greatly. The finding supports the hypothesis of this study.

The issue of the Lal Masjid remained a topic for media coverage only for a period of two months (June and July 2007). The survey of the newspaper readers was conducted in the month of May and June 2008. It might be the reason that most of the respondents from both newspaper readers stated that they discussed the issue of the Lal mosque only to some extent with their family, friends and colleagues. Almost one fifth of the respondents declared that they did not discuss this issue at all with any body. This is an inherent limitation of the agenda setting research that the public agenda does not remain constant all the time; rather it changes with the passage of time and with the change in media agenda. If the survey would be conducted during the military operation against the seminary, the result of the public opinion would be different.

3. Conclusion

On the basis of the findings of this study, it can be concluded that there is a strong relationship between the public and the print media agenda except for issues of the individuals’ personal sufferings. A strong relationship has been found between the public and the print media agenda on the four out of six issues of the study. These issues are terrorism, judiciary crisis, Indo-Pak relations and Lal Masjid. There was no relationship between the two agendas regarding the issues of the food and the energy crises. Both of the issues received higher position in public agenda as compared to media agenda. The reason of giving more importance to these issues by the respondents was definitely their personal suffering because they themselves were facing a worst kind of the shortage of the basic food items especially the wheat flour and the long intervals of the power cut-
off. Both the issues received less coverage in the newspapers of the study, even then, their readers associated more importance with these issues. The other important finding related to this result is that the slant of the media did not affect the opinion of the respondents because the media’s slant about these two issues was in favor of the government while the public opinion was found to be against the government.

Another important finding was that both of the newspapers had a different agenda on the issues of the study. Their readers also followed the same agenda as it was the newspaper’s agenda except the issues of the food and the energy crises (already discussed). The public opinion about the issues of the study was also found consistent with the media slant and framing of the issues except these two issues. It can be said on the basis of this finding that the media not only tell us what to think about, but also tell us how to think about.

It can also be concluded that usually, where the media relied on official sources, it resulted in a pro government slant and frame which ultimately resulted in a pro government public opinion (except the issues of food and energy crises). But where the media relied on unofficial sources, the coverage mainly resulted in an unfavorable slant and framing which ultimately resulted in an anti government opinion.

The placement of the news stories about the issues also played an important role in setting the public agenda. The issues which got good placement received a good score on the public agenda and vise versa (except the issues of the food and energy crises).

4. Implication
The newspaper industry in Pakistan can use the findings of the present study to make decisions about their policy agenda. Daily Dawn and the daily Jang can now see a generalized view of how they reported about the important issues of the country. These newspapers can now make better decisions about their policy.

Additionally, society can look at this study to see how the most popular newspapers reported about the issues of the society.

Overall, the present study is useful to the newspaper industry and society as a whole because it gives both groups an objective, general picture of the most important issues of the day. This result is important because the media had a great deal of power in shaping public opinion. The results of the study provide important findings about the relationship between the public and the print media agenda in Pakistan.

5. Recommendations

Keeping in view the findings of this study, the following are the recommendations by the researcher.

- While giving coverage to certain issues, media organizations should keep the agenda setting theory in mind. They should realize that their agenda (media agenda) will ultimately become the public agenda which can benefit or damage the public interest of the society at large.

- Media organizations should properly cover the issues of concern to the public. It has been seen in this research that although newspapers gave good coverage to national and international issues but they ignored the real problems of the public by giving them very poor coverage. The real issues of general public like food and energy crises should be given proper coverage in the newspapers.
• The media coverage of the controversial and the sensitive issues need special care from the media organizations. A little carelessness can create serious problems and discomfort in the masses. Sometimes, publishing a viewpoint can damage the feelings of another group. Such news items should not be published. The issue of Lal Masjid was also the most sensitive issue of the study which needed a balanced and careful reporting. Both of the papers gave a balanced coverage to the issue. Such issues should be given special concentration by the media organizations.

• Today is the age of media economy and the media organizations prefer economic benefits while setting their agenda, even then the basic journalistic principle of objectivity should be observed in its true spirit. Actual and factual reporting of the issues and events should be practiced. Some of the media organizations in the country usually don’t take care of objectivity for their vested interests.

• Balanced reporting of the issues and events should be mandatory by the media organizations. The Dawn maintained a good balance between the news stories about the sensitive issue of the Lal Masjid. It can be concluded that it is a better paper.

6. Limitations

This study is limited to investigate the influence of media agenda on the public agenda only. The influence of public agenda on the media agenda is another aspect which is not the domain of this research project. It has been left for some future research.

Due to the limitations of time and resources, the research study was limited to the content analysis of the Rawalpindi Islamabad editions of the sample newspapers. Furthermore, only front and back pages of the newspapers were content analyzed. The reason for the selection of the front and back pages was that
these are the most important pages in a newspaper and usually most of the people rely on only these two pages and they don’t have enough time to go through the inner pages. The limitations of time and resources also did not allow expanding the content analysis of the study to the inner pages.

The survey was also limited to the newspapers’ readers residing in Islamabad. However, the results represented the trends of the newspapers’ readers living in the country due to reasons mentioned above.

7. Areas for Future Research

The study opens doors for a number of future research projects. This is the first ever study on agenda setting in Pakistan which provides a solid base for research projects in future. Mass communication research is rapidly growing in the universities of the country and the researchers can explore new dimensions from this study for their own research projects. This study analyzed the content of print media. Future research can address the content analysis of electronic media and its effect on public agenda. The rapid growth of television channels provides a base for such research.

Another limitation of this study is that it investigated the media effects in an urban society. Another project of this kind can be launched to investigate these effects in a rural set-up. Longitudinal studies can also be launched to investigate the relationship of the public and the print media agenda. It can help to investigate whether the change in the media agenda affects the public agenda with the passage of time. In this study, a given set of issues was provided to the respondents. However, in some future study, they can be asked an open ended
question: “What issue do you think the most important in the country?” Then second one, then third one and so on.

This study focused on mainstream national media while thousands of small newspapers are also being published from the nooks and corners of the country. Their media agenda and the public agenda of their readers can also be measured in some future research. Another interesting area for the future research might be to investigate the difference of the agenda setting effects between the media users and nonusers. Some research study can also be conducted to find the combined results of the media agenda setting and two-step flow of communication phenomenon.
Bibliography


22. Daily Dawn Islamabad May 13th 2008


http://www2.chass.ncsu.edu/garson/pa765/agendasetting.htm (February 25, 2008)


APPENDICES
Questionnaire for Survey

Qualification:_____________  Male / Female ________

Please tick one

**Occupation:**
- Government Service
- Private Service
- Own Business
- Student
- Others

**Age Group:**
- 20 yr or below
- 21 yr to 40 yr
- Above 40 yr

Q.1: Which newspaper do you read?
- i- Daily Dawn
- ii- Daily Jang
- iii- Both of them
- iv- Any other

Q.2 Please rank the following issues according to your opinion. You may mention
the most important issue as no. 1, then the second one as 2, and so on.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S. No.</th>
<th>Issues</th>
<th>Your opinion</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Terrorism</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Indo-Pak relations</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Energy crisis</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Food Crisis</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Judiciary Crisis</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Lal Masjid</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Q.3. Which one of the following is the most important source of information for you
regarding the issue of Terrorism?
Q. 4. How do you think about the issue of terrorism? (Tick one from the following options).

   i- We should support the policy of the US government.
   ii- We should not support the policy of the US government.
   iii- Not clear

Q. 5. To what extent do you discuss this issue with your colleagues and friends? (Tick one).

   i- Very greatly
   ii- Greatly
   iii- To some extent
   iv- Not at all

Q. 6. Which one of the following is the most important source of information for you regarding the issues of Indo-Pak relations?

   i- Print Media
   ii- Electronic Media
   iii- Interpersonal Communication
   iv- Any other

Q. 7. How do you think about the issue of Indo-Pak relations? (Tick one from the following options).

   i- We should develop good relations with India.
   ii- We should not develop good relations with India.
   iii- Not clear

Q. 8. To what extent do you discuss this issue with your colleagues and friends? (Tick one).

   i- Very greatly
   ii- Greatly
   iii- To some extent
   iv- Not at all

Q. 9. Which one of the following is the most important source of information for you regarding the issue of Energy crisis?

   i- Print Media
   ii- Electronic Media
   iii- Interpersonal Communication
Q. 10. How do you think about the issue of energy crisis? (Tick one from the following options).

i- Favorable for the government
ii- Unfavorable for the government
iii- Not clear

Q.11. To what extent do you discuss this issue with your colleagues and friends? (Tick one).

i- Very greatly
ii- Greatly
iii- To some extent
iv- Not at all

Q.12. Which one of the following is the most important source of information for you regarding the issue of Food crisis?

i- Print Media
ii- Electronic Media
iii- Interpersonal Communication
iv- Any other

Q. 13. How do you think about the issue of food crisis? (Tick one from the following options).

i- Favorable for the government
ii- Unfavorable for the government
iii- Not clear

Q.14. To what extent do you discuss this issue with your colleagues and friends? (Tick one).

i- Very greatly
ii- Greatly
iii- To some extent
iv- Not at all

Q.15. Which one of the following is the most important source of information for you regarding the issue of Judiciary crisis?

i- Print Media
ii- Electronic Media
iii- Interpersonal Communication
iv- Any other

Q. 16. How do you think about the issue of judiciary crisis? (Tick one from the following options).
i- Favorable for the government
ii- Unfavorable for the government
iii- Not clear

Q. 17. To what extent do you discuss this issue with your colleagues and friends? (Tick one).
   i- Very greatly
   ii- Greatly
   iii- To some extent
   iv- Not at all

Q. 18 Which one of the following is the most important source of information for you regarding the issue of Lal Masjid?
   i- Print Media
   ii- Electronic Media
   iii- Interpersonal Communication
   iv- Any other

Q. 19 How do you think about the issue of Lal Masjid? (Tick one from the following options).
   i- Government did a good job.
   ii- Government did a wrong job.
   iii- Not clear

Q. 20. To what extent do you discuss this issue with your colleagues and friends? (Tick one).
   i- Very greatly
   ii- Greatly
   iii- To some extent
   iv- Not at all
## Code Sheet for Content Analysis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Newspaper</th>
<th>Topics/Issues</th>
<th>Length in centimeters per column</th>
<th>Slant</th>
<th>Frame</th>
<th>Source</th>
<th>Placement</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>F</td>
<td>UF</td>
<td>N</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Key**

**Newspaper:** Dawn 1, Jang 2.

**Topics:** Terrorism 1, Indo-Pak relations 2, Energy crisis 3, Food crisis 4, Judiciary crisis 5, Lal Masjid 6.

**Slant:** Favorable, Unfavorable, Neutral (Actual Number of paragraphs).

**Frame:** Friend 1, Foe 2, Pro Govt. 3, Anti Govt. 4.

**Source:** Official 1, Unofficial 2, Others 3.

**Placement:** Front page Upper 1, Front page Lower 2, Back page Upper 3, Back page Lower 4.