# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract ........................................................................................................................................ix  
List of Tables ..................................................................................................................................x  
List of Abbreviations ................................................................................................................xii  
List of Appendices ..................................................................................................................xiii  

Chapter One  
INTRODUCTION TO STUDY ....................................................................................................1-30  

1.1 Introduction .........................................................................................................................1  
1.2 Grade Retention: An Overview .........................................................................................1  
   1.2.1 Grade Retention and Primary Education System in Pakistan ....................................7  
      1.2.1.1 The Basic Structure of Primary Education System .................................................8  
      1.2.1.2 Major Providers of Primary Education .................................................................9  
   1.2.2 Grade Retention and Education Policies in Pakistan ..................................................11  
   1.2.3 Grade Retention and Development Plans in Pakistan ..............................................14  
   1.2.4 Contemporary Promotion Policy in Punjab ...............................................................15  
1.3 Statement of the Problem ....................................................................................................20  
1.4 Objectives of the Study .......................................................................................................21  
1.5 The Research Hypotheses ..................................................................................................21  
1.6 The Research Questions ......................................................................................................22  
1.7 Significance of the Study .....................................................................................................23  
1.8 Definitions of the Terms used ............................................................................................24  
1.9 The Delimitations of the Study ..........................................................................................25  
1.10 The Research Design ..........................................................................................................26  
1.11 An Overview of the Remaining Thesis Chapters ..............................................................28  
1.12 Summary of the Findings ....................................................................................................29
Chapter Two

THE LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 Introduction 31

2.2 Pedagogical Significance of Grade Retention 31

2.2.1 Factors contributing to Grade Retention 36

2.2.1.1 Student related Factors 38

2.2.1.1.1 Demographic Characteristics 38

2.2.1.1.2 Absenteeism 39

2.2.1.1.3 Frequent shifting from one School to another 40

2.2.1.1.4 Personal Weaknesses 40

2.2.1.1.4 Child Labor 41

2.2.1.2 School related Factors 41

2.2.1.2.1 Teacher 42

2.2.1.2.2 Administration 43

2.2.1.2.3 Public vs Private Schools 44

2.2.1.2.4 School Facilities 44

2.2.1.2.5 Curriculum and Textbooks 45

2.2.1.2.6 Method of Examinations 45

2.2.1.2.7 Student-teacher Ratio 46

2.2.1.2.8 Language of Instruction 46

2.2.1.2.9 Corporal Punishment 47

2.2.1.3 Family related Factors 48

2.2.1.3.1 Socioeconomic Background 49

2.2.1.3.2 Migrant Families 51

2.2.1.3.3 Parental Support 52

2.2.1.3.4 Family Problems 55
2.2.1.4 Government Policies and Community related Factors 56

2.2.2 Grade Retention and wasteage in Education 57

2.2.3 Grade Retention and Dropout 59

2.2.4 Cost Effectiveness of Grade Retention 61

2.2.5 Automatic Promotion: An Alternative to Grade Retention 63

2.3 The Impact of Grade Retention on the Self-Esteem of the Students 67

2.3.1 The Theoretical Perspective of Self-Esteem 67

2.3.1.1 The Self 67

2.3.1.2 The Definitions of self-Esteem 69

2.3.1.3 The Origin of the Idea of Self-Esteem 70

2.3.1.4 The Domains of Self-Esteem 71

2.3.2 Factors affecting Self-Esteem 73

2.3.2.1 Academic Performance 73

2.3.2.2 Failure in School 74

2.3.2.3 Student Identity 75

2.3.2.4 Physical Abuse 75

2.3.2.5 Sexual Abuse 76

2.3.2.6 High-Quality Friendship 76

2.3.2.7 Parent-Child Affection 77

2.3.2.8 Changes in Social Situations 78

2.3.2.9 Economic Hardships 78

2.3.2.10 Provision of Educational Facilities in Home and School 79

2.3.2.11 Narcissism 80

2.3.2.12 Delinquency 80

2.3.2.13 Depression 80
Chapter Two

2.3.3 Consequences of low self-Esteem 81
2.3.4 Grade Retention and Self-Esteem 83
2.3.5 Self-Esteem and Academic Performance 85

2.4 The Impact of Grade Retention on the Academic Performance of the Students 87

2.4.1 Factors affecting Academic Performance of the Repeaters 91

2.4.1.1 Repeaters Age 91
2.4.1.2 Teacher’s Attention 91
2.4.1.3 Repeaters’ Personal Efforts 92
2.4.1.4 Interventions offered by the School 92
2.4.1.5 Student’s Previous Achievement 92

2.5 Summary 92

Chapter Three

METHODOLOGY 94-122

3.1 Introduction 94

3.2 Conceptual Framework of the Study 94

3.3 Quantitative Aspect of the Study 96

3.3.1 Instruments for the Quantitative Data Collection 98

3.3.1.1 Adaptation of Self Esteem Scale 98

3.3.1.1.1 Factor Analysis of the Scale 99
3.3.1.1.2 Validity of the Scale 100
3.3.1.1.3 Reliability of the Scale 100

3.3.1.2 Development of Achievement Tests 101

3.3.1.2.1 Validity of the Test Items 102
3.3.1.2.2 Pilot Testing 102
3.3.1.2.3 Item Analysis 103

3.3.1.2.3.1 Difficulty Index 103
4.4.2.3 Hypothesis No.3: 144
4.4.2.4 Hypothesis No.4: 146
4.5 Summary 148

Chapter Five

QUALITATIVE ANALYSIS ................................................................. 150-189

5.1 Introduction 150
5.2 The Process of Data Collection 150
5.3 The Analytic Procedure 152
5.4 Teachers’ Perceptions regarding main Factors of Grade Retention 153
5.4.1 Family 154
  5.4.1.1 Parental Support 155
  5.4.1.2 Relationship of Parents 159
  5.4.1.3 Family Structure 161
  5.4.1.4 Non-Literate Parents 162
  5.4.1.5 Financial Problems 165
5.4.2 School 168
  5.4.2.1 Teacher 169
  5.4.2.2 Discipline in Schools 172
  5.4.2.3 Accountability by the Department 175
  5.4.2.4 Difficult Syllabus 176
5.4.3 Student 176
  5.4.3.1 Personal Weaknesses 177
  5.4.3.2 Family Engagements 179
5.5 Teachers’ Perceptions regarding Attitude of the Repeaters 180
  5.5.1 Attitude towards Studies 182
The Impact of Grade Retention

5.5.2 Attitude towards Teachers 185

5.5.3 Attitude towards Fellow Students 187

5.6 Summary 189

Chapter Six

TRIANGULATION .......................................................... 190-210

6.1 Introduction 190

6.2 An Overview of Triangulation Process 190

6.3 The Contextual Scenario of Quantitative and Qualitative Data 193

6.4 Triangulation of the quantitative and qualitative Findings 195

6.4.1 The Self-Esteem of Repeaters 196

6.4.2 The Similarities and Differences between Quantitative and Qualitative data with respect to Self-Esteem of the Repeaters 202

6.4.3 The Academic Performance of Repeaters 204

6.4.4 The Similarities and Differences between Quantitative and Qualitative data with respect to Academic Performance of the Repeaters 209

6.5 Summary 210

Chapter Seven

CONCLUSION .......................................................... 211-243

7.1 Introduction 211

7.2 An Overview of the Study 212

7.3 The Objective-Wise Conclusion 214

7.3.1 The Major Factors of Grade Retention of Students 214

7.3.2 The Impact of Grade Retention on the Self-Esteem 218

7.3.3 The Impact of Grade Retention on the Academic Performance 219

7.3.4 The Immediate Impact of Failure 221

7.3.5 The Relationship between Self-Esteem and Academic Performance... 221
7.5 Contributions of the Study 226

7.5.1 Awareness-Raising among Education Policy-Planners and Administrators 228

7.5.2 Awareness-Raising among Primary Teachers 230

7.5.4 Awareness-Raising among Future Researchers 230

7.5.5 Considerations for Improving Teacher Education and Training Programs 231

7.5.6 Use of Mixed Methods in the Discipline of Education in Pakistan 232

7.6 Recommendations of the Study 232

7.6 Suggestions for the Future Research 257

7.7 Summary 241

REFERENCES 244-261

APPENDICES 262-271